

## LOK SABHA DEBATES

13421

13422

### LOK SABHA

Monday, April 27, 1959/Vaisakha 7,  
1881 (Saka)

The Lok Sabha met at Eleven of the  
Clock.

[MR SPEAKER in the Chair]

### ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

#### Border Raids

Shri Assar:  
Shri Radha Raman:  
Shri Ram Krishan Gupta:  
Shri Pangarkar:  
Shri Rameshwar Tantia:  
Pandit D. N Tiwary:  
Shrimati Ila Palchoudhuri:  
Shri S. M. Banerjee:  
Shri Tangamani:  
Shri A. K. Gopalan:  
Shri Ajit Singh Sarhadi:  
Shri Sadhan Gupta:  
Shri Raghunath Singh:  
Shri Warior:  
Shri D. C. Sharma:  
\*2049. { Dr. Ram Subhag Singh:  
Shri Bibhanti Mishra:  
Shri Anrobindo Ghosal:  
Shri Vajpayee:  
Shri U. C. Patnalk:  
Shri Padam Dev:  
Shri Mohan Swarup:  
Shri Hem Raj:  
Shri Bimal Ghose:  
Shri Hem Barua:  
Shri N. R. Munisamy:  
Shri R. S. Tewari:  
Shri Koratkar:  
Shri P. C. Borooah:  
Shri S. A. Mehdi:

Will the Prime Minister be pleased to lay a statement on the Table of the House showing:

(a) the details of border incidents which have taken place since the

83(A1) LSD

last statement was laid on the Table by him on the 8th December, 1958;

(b) the extent of loss in life and property suffered, and

(c) the steps taken by Government in the matter?

The Deputy Minister of External Affairs (Shrimati Lakshmi Menon): (a) and (b) Two statements giving details of incidents which took place on the Indo-Pakistan border during the period from the 9th December, 1958, to 20th April, 1959, are laid on the table of the House [See Appendix VII annexure No 44]

(c) Apart from the Government of India and the State Governments taking necessary steps for the defence of Indian territory and for protection of the border people, the Government of India have expressed their serious concern to the Government of Pakistan against the continued occurrence of border incidents which are in clear violation of letter and spirit of the Joint Communiqué issued after the Prime Minister's meeting of September, 1958. They have further requested the Government of Pakistan to issue immediate and effective instructions to the border authorities concerned for the stoppage of aggressive activities in the interests of maintaining peaceful conditions on the border.

Shri Assar: May I know in how many cases compensation from Pakistan has been claimed and in how many it has actually been paid by Pakistan?

The Prime Minister and Minister of External Affairs (Shri Jawaharlal Nehru): All I can say is that the only case in which compensation was paid was in the Western border where some of our people were shot down. Of course, they did not call it compensation. But they did pay Rs. 1 lakh to the victims, those who had suffered.

**Shri Assar:** Is there any proposal to distribute fire-arms to the people on the border region for their self-defence?

**Shri Jawaharlal Nehru:** No, I do not think fire-arms are distributed indiscriminately. But they are distributed to selected people or defence corps or something like that. It is considered not an act of ensuring security but possibly of endangering security by an indiscriminate distribution of fire-arms.

**Shri S. M. Banerjee:** From the statement, it appears that there were 229 incidents and 14 people have been killed and 36 kidnapped. May I know from the hon. Prime Minister how many people have been taken back by us from among those who were kidnapped?

**Shrimati Lakshmi Menon:** The total number of people kidnapped is 155, out of which 84 have been released, and 71 are now still in detention.

**Shri S. M. Banerjee:** What is the condition in which these 74 or 71 people have been placed in Pakistan and what steps have been taken by the Government of India to get them released?

**Shrimati Lakshmi Menon:** Every step has been taken by our Deputy High Commissioner in Dacca, and steps are also taken by our High Commissioner in Karachi. We have repeatedly pointed out to the Pakistan Government that it is a human problem and there is no reason why these people should be kept in detention, just because they crossed the border or have been involved in what they call smuggling.

**Shri Hem Barua:** May I know whether it is a fact that Tukurgram, which is illegally held by Pakistan, is often used as a theatre of operation for some of these firings and border incidents? If so, what steps have Government taken so far either to neutralise or recapture Tukurgram in order to avoid further border incidents?

**Shri Jawaharlal Nehru:** I think I have answered the question more than two or three times. I can add nothing to my previous answer.

**Shri Tangamani:** How many of these 74 persons still in detention have been convicted, and for what terms?

**Shrimati Lakshmi Menon:** I want notice.

**Shri Tangamani:** Some of them have been sentenced to long terms of imprisonment and they are being subjected to very severe treatment inside Jail.

**Shri Jawaharlal Nehru:** It is very difficult for us to say that all the 71—or whatever the number is—are innocent people who have been wrongly taken away. They may be smugglers, they may be all kinds of people. We sometimes capture smugglers and punish them. It is very difficult for us to make any general statement about all. As my hon. colleague said, we have laid stress on this that whatever has to be done has to be done quickly from a humanitarian point of view. If proper action is to be taken in courts of law, let them take it. Let it be inquired into properly. We cannot just say that every man who is taken must necessarily be innocent.

**Shri T. K. Chaudhuri:** May I draw the attention of the hon. Prime Minister to item 15 in the statement on incidents in the West Bengal-East Pakistan border, where it has been mentioned that Pakistan forces continued to fire from 6th March to 13th March? But there was also one case of kidnapping. That was mentioned in this House and was the subject matter of an adjournment motion. As far as I remember, our Deputy High Commissioner who went to Dacca after this incident, made a statement that this particular man, Shri Makhan Mandal, would be released. Upto now he has not been released. Neither has the Prime Minister made a mention of that fact, nor is it indicated in the

statement. Would he throw some light on that?

**Shrimati Lakshmi Menon:** He has not been released till now

**Shri Jaipal Singh:** In his previous replies and statements, the Prime Minister has indicated that the question of the recapture of Takergram would involve a major operation. Are we to understand that so long as that situation persists, the impasse continues?

**Shri Jawaharlal Nehru:** Questions like this can only be solved by diplomatic methods, not by major warlike operations. We are not looking forward, and we do not propose, to take a step which might be called a major military operation.

**Dr Ram Subhag Singh:** The hon. Deputy Minister in her reply to the first supplementary has said that a communication has been addressed to Pakistan to issue instructions to stop border violations. May I know whether this is the first communication addressed to Pakistan or whether similar communications were addressed to them before? Also, how soon is the reply expected?

**Shrimati Lakshmi Menon:** Every time there is a firing, the local authorities inform their counterparts on the other side of the border to stop the firing. They come to a cease-fire agreement. So many times cease-fire agreements have been arrived at between the border authorities. Then these matters are taken up again by the Central Governments of each State. But I am very sorry that these agreements are not respected.

**Shri Barman:** As regards the recent border incident in Cooch-Bihar in West Bengal, it appeared in the newspapers that on the 20th of this month the sub-divisional officer of Dinhatta and the sub-divisional officer of Kuregram in Pakistan were to meet and decide upon the extent of damages and also the compensation

that would be paid. Have Government any further knowledge about it?

**Shrimati Lakshmi Menon:** We have no further knowledge about it.

**Pandit D. N. Tiwary:** Even after all this, the Pakistan Press has always been coming out with statements that it is India which violates the borders and causes these border incidents. May I know whether Pakistan has given any figure of her losses to the Government of India and whether that has been repudiated?

**Shri Jawaharlal Nehru:** There is no Parliament in Pakistan where questions can be put and answers obtained.

**Shri D. C. Sharma:** Our attempts at the High Commissioners' level have not borne much fruit. May I know whether, in view of the fact that Gen. Ayub has made a long statement that Pakistan wants to be friendly with India, the Prime Minister will try to have negotiations at a higher level than that of the High Commissioners?

**Mr. Speaker:** It is a suggestion.

**Shri Jawaharlal Nehru:** It is a suggestion which the hon. Member makes. We are always keeping various aspects of these questions in view.

**Shri Tyagi:** Could the House have an idea of the Defence arrangements obtaining in the eastern front, particularly as to whether there is any border police on the lines of the one which exists in the western front?

**Shri Jawaharlal Nehru:** Sorry, Sir, I am unable to answer that question, partly from lack of knowledge and partly from prudence.

**Shri Assar:** One more question, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** I am not going to allow I have already allowed a number of questions.