

**Mr. Speaker:** The Question hour is over.

**Shri A. M. Tariq:** The next question No. 768 is a very important question, Sir.

**Mr. Speaker:** I am not going to allow it.

**Shri A. M. Tariq:** That is a very important question.

**Mr. Speaker:** Let it be. What shall I do? Whichever questions reach will reach; otherwise, not. We have no time. Short notice question.

### SHORT NOTICE QUESTIONS

#### Treatment of Indian Policemen by Chinese Troops

+

S.N.Q. 5. { **Shri Supakar:**  
**Shri Ram Krishan Gupta:**  
**Shri Vajpayee:**  
**Shri Hem Barua:**

Will the Prime Minister be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that Shri Karam Singh, Deputy Superintendent of Police, who was captured along with nine other Indian policemen by Chinese Troops on the 21st October, 1959 in Ladakh has given a detailed account to the Government of the way in which he and his companions were treated by their captors;

(b) whether Government have studied the account;

(c) if so, the nature of the treatment given to them;

(d) whether it is also a fact that reply to his letter protesting against the treatment meted out to these policemen has been received from the Peking Government; and

(e) if so, the contents of the letter?

**The Deputy Minister of External Affairs (Shrimati Lakshmi Menon):** (a) to (e). Shri Karam Singh gave a statement of facts in regard to the ill-treatment given by the Chinese to him and other policemen captured by

them. A protest was thereupon made to the Chinese Government who have replied to say that the treatment they gave was generous and friendly.

**Shri Karam Singh** is still under treatment in a Jammu hospital for severe frost bite. After he has recovered and can come to Delhi, a fuller statement of facts will be obtained from him.

**Shri Supakar:** In view of the fact that the report of his statement extracted by the Chinese reveals a gross violation of Article 17 of the relevant Geneva Convention, are the Government contemplating any steps more serious than mere protest?

**Shrimati Lakshmi Menon:** The course of action to be taken will be decided after a fuller report is received and after Shri Karam Singh has recovered from his wounds and has come to Delhi.

**Shri Hem Barua:** May I know whether the statement made by Shri Karam Singh where he alleges ill-treatment to our captured policemen in Ladakh, has been forwarded to the Government in Peking and at the same time, his lying in the hospital was brought to their notice, and if so, whether they still say that the treatment meted out to the policemen was polite?

**Shrimati Lakshmi Menon:** The reply received was in answer to the letter that we have sent stating the way Shri Karam Singh was treated by the Chinese soldiers.

**Shri Hem Barua:** When he was lying in the hospital?

**Shri Vajpayee:** Is it a fact that during their captivity the Indian prisoners were forced to make a statement that they were properly treated by the Chinese?

**Shrimati Lakshmi Menon:** Yes, Sir.

**Shri Supakar:** It is now nearly two months since Shri Karam Singh and his associates were captured and he has not fully recovered. May I know

what is the medical report and the time by which Shri Karam Singh will fully recover and be able to make a statement about his actual treatment by the Chinese?

**Shrimati Lakshmi Menon:** I have no information how long he will take to recover. The medical report is that he is suffering from frost bite which is very serious.

**Shri Vajpayee:** May I know if any further protest has been lodged with the Chinese after their reply that our prisoners were well treated?

**Shrimati Lakshmi Menon:** I want notice for that.

**Shri Vajpayee:** May I point out, Sir, that in part (d) this question has been specifically put?

**Shrimati Lakshmi Menon:** I have already stated that the Chinese Government, on the 28th of November, categorically rejected our protest and maintained that the prisoners were treated well. After that, I do not think we have written to them, again.

**Shri Ram Krishan Gupta:** May I know whether it is a fact that a photo was taken while he was being given an injection to show to the world that good medical treatment was given to him?

**Shrimati Lakshmi Menon:** Unless I see the photograph, how can I say? There have been reports that photographs were taken showing the Chinese attending to his wounds, perhaps, for propaganda purposes. I cannot tell you whether it is true or not.

**Dr. Ram Snhag Singh:** May I know whether the Government have enquired from Shri Karam Singh as to how he developed frost-bite, whether he was made to sit by the Chinese on snow during night time or not?

**Shrimati Lakshmi Menon:** I think the Prime Minister did make a statement that there was no adequate warm clothing for the prisoners and they were put in a tent which was not properly protected against inclement weather. All this seems to have caused the frost-bite.

**Mr. Speaker:** The question is whether Shri Karam Singh has said that he was deliberately kept on snow, leave alone protection.

**Shrimati Lakshmi Menon:** I do not think he has said that.

#### Unidentified Planes seen in West Bengal

S.N.Q. 6. { <sup>+</sup> Shri P. G. Deb:  
Shri S. A. Mehdi:

Will the Prime Minister be pleased to state:

(a) whether some unidentified planes passed over Siliguri and Jalpaiguri on the 28th November, 1959 while coming from the sides of Himalayas;

(b) if so, the details of the same;

(c) why the Bagdora Air Control failed to ascertain their real identity; and

(d) the arrangements made to intercept such foreign planes?

**The Deputy Minister of External Affairs (Shrimati Lakshmi Menon):**

(a) to (d). Enquiries made in the matter indicate that one of our own planes flew over Siliguri and Jalpaiguri on the 28th November, 1959.

**Shri P. G. Deb:** May I know how many air space violations have taken place so far from the northern side of the Himalayas since March, 1959?

**Mr. Speaker:** That does not arise out of this.

**Shri Vajpayee:** May I know why this question has not been replied to by the Defence Minister?

**Mr. Speaker:** How does it belong to the portfolio of the hon. Prime Minister?

**Shri Vajpayee:** The question concerns the defence of the country.

**Mr. Speaker:** It does not relate to External Affairs. It relates to Defence. How does it happen that it has been set down against the Prime Minister?

How did they put the question?