

**COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE
(2022-23)**

SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA

119

ONE HUNDRED AND NINETEENTH REPORT

**[Delay in laying the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Victoria Memorial Hall (VMH),
Kolkata under the administrative control of the Ministry of Culture.]**

(Presented to Lok Sabha on 03.04.2023)



सत्यमेव जयते

**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI
March 2023/ Chaitra 1945 (Saka)**

CONTENTS

PAGE

COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE (2022-23)	(iii)
INTRODUCTION	(iv)
REPORT	
Delay in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Victoria Memorial Hall, Kolkata under the Administrative control of the Ministry of Culture	01

APPENDICES

Appendix-I	The year-wise grant provided to the Victoria Memorial Hall, Kolkata during 2016-17 to 2020-21	09
Appendix -II	Statement showing the date of laying of the Audited Accounts of the Victoria Memorial Hall, Kolkata for the years 2015-16 to 2020-21.	10
Appendix-III	The chronological sequence in respect of finalization of Audited Accounts of the National Bal Bhavan, New Delhi for the years 2015-16 to 2020-21.	11
Appendix-IV	The Extracts of the Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 20thDecember, 2021	14
Appendix-V	The Extracts of the Minutes of the fourth sitting of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table (2022-2023) held on 29.03.2023.	-

COMPOSITION OF COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

LOK SABHA

(2022-23)

Shri Girish Chandra - **Chairperson**

MEMBERS

2. Shri Shafiqur Rahman Barq
3. Dr. A. Chellakumar
4. Shri Pallab Lochan Das
5. Shri Choudhury Mohan Jatua
6. Choudhary Mehboob Ali Kaiser
7. Dr. Amol Ramsing Kolhe
8. Shri Bharat Ram Margani
9. Shri Jamyang Tsering Namgyal
10. Smt. Aparupa Poddar
11. Shri T.N. Prathapan
12. Shri Sellaperumal Ramalingam
13. Shri Saptagiri Sankar Ulaka
14. Shri Devendrappa Y
15. Shri Ashok Kumar Yadav

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri Vinay Kumar Mohan - Joint Secretary
2. Shri Naval K. Verma - Director
3. Shri Uttam Chand Bharadwaj - Additional Director

INTRODUCTION

I, Chairperson of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table of the House (2022-23), having been authorized by the Committee to present this Report on their behalf, present this 119th Report in respect of the delays in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Victoria Memorial Hall (VMH), Kolkata under the administrative control of the Ministry of Culture.

2. In terms of the recommendations of the First Report (5th Lok Sabha) of the Committee, presented to the House on 8th March, 1976 and the Second Report (5th Lok Sabha) of the Committee, presented to the House on 12th May, 1976 and the Second Report (6th Lok Sabha) of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table, presented to the House on 22nd December, 1977, the Annual Report and Audited Accounts of the all Statutory/Autonomous/Institutes/Companies/Public Undertakings/Corporations/Joint Ventures/Societies, etc. are required to be laid on the Table of the House within nine months of the closure of accounting year i.e. by 31 December.

3. The scrutiny by the Committee revealed that the requisite documents of the Victoria Memorial Hall (VMH), Kolkata for 2015-2016 to 2020-21 were presented to Lok Sabha with continuous delays. The Committee considered the matter of delays in laying the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Victoria Memorial Hall (VMH), Kolkata and took oral evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Culture at their sitting held on 20th December, 2021.

4. The Committee considered and adopted the Report at their sitting held on 29.03.2023

5. The Committee wishes to express their thanks to the officers of the Victoria Memorial Hall (VMH), Kolkata and the Ministry of Culture, Government of India for furnishing the written replies and other material/information for being placed before the Committee.

6. The Committee places on record their appreciation of the valuable assistance rendered to them by the officials of the Lok Sabha Secretariat attached to the Committee.

7. The Observations/Recommendations of the Committee have been printed in bold letters at the end of the Report.

**New Delhi
29 March 2023
Chaitra 8, 1945 (Saka)**

**Girish Chandra
Chairperson
Committee on Papers Laid on the Table
Lok Sabha**

Report

Delay in laying the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Victoria Memorial Hall (VMH), Kolkata under the administrative control of the Ministry of Culture.

The Victoria Memorial Hall (VMH) was erected in Calcutta, then capital of British India, principally through the efforts of Lord Curzon, Viceroy of India from 1899 to 1905, who intended it to be a period museum in memory of Queen Victoria with particular emphasis on Indo-British history. The VMH was declared an institution of National importance by the Government of India Act of 1935. At present the VMH is an autonomous organization under the administrative control of the Ministry of Culture, Government of India, with a Board of Trustees that is chaired by the Governor of West Bengal and includes leading personalities from the government, judiciary, academia and the arts world.

The VMH is currently India's largest museum of modern Indian history, and its most-visited museum, with nearly 40 lakh visitors each year. In 2017, Trip advisor rated the VMH as the most-loved museum in India, and one of Asia's top ten in terms of popularity. Its 57 acres of well-maintained gardens – which earned it the 'Cleanest Monument in India' Award from the Hon'ble Prime Minister of India under the India Today Safaigiri Awards scheme in 2015 – sustains a rich biodiversity. In 2021, the VMH also launched a one-of-its-kind, state-of-the-art 3D Projection Mapping show on the grand eastern in the of the VMH building. The VMH is the only museum under the Ministry of Culture to hold three top international accolades together – the Tripadvisor 'Most-loved museum in India', 'Top Choice' from Lonely Planet, and 'Fodor's Choice' from Fodor's.

2. The Committee asked the Ministry to mention the Act, Rule, Regulation under which papers of the VHM, Kolkata are being laid on the Table of the House. The Ministry of Culture (MoC), in its written reply, submitted that:

" Victoria Memorial Hall is an autonomous organization under the administrative control of the Ministry of Culture. As per the GOI OM No. 8(11)/E. II-A)/09 dated 17th November 2009, the Annual Accounts of each financial year along with the Audit Report of autonomous bodies should be placed in Parliament by 31st December."

3. With regard to the question of the pattern of funding to the VHM by the Government of India, they submitted that the Grant in Aid is received from the Ministry of Culture under various Heads during the last five years is given in **Appendix-I**.

4. In terms of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table (5th Lok Sabha) contained in the First Report presented to the House on 08 March, 1976; the Second Report, presented to the House on 12 May, 1976; and also in the Second Report (6th Lok Sabha), presented to the House on 22nd December, 1977, the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Organisations/Corporations/PSUs are required to be laid on the Table within 9 months of the closure of the accounting year. To comply with the requirement, a proper time schedule should be laid down for compilation of the Annual Report and Audited Accounts and their auditing. The Committee felt that normally a period of three months would be sufficient for compilation of the Audited Accounts and their submission for Audit; the next six months might be given for auditing of accounts, printing of the Report and sending it to Government for laying. If for any reason, the Annual Report and Audited Accounts of the Organisations/Corporations/PSUs could not be laid within the prescribed period of nine months, the Ministry concerned should lay a statement within 30 days of the expiry of the aforesaid period or as soon as the House assembles, whichever is later, explaining the reasons as to why the documents could not be laid.

5. The Committee on Papers Laid on the Table, Lok Sabha scrutinized the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Victoria Memorial Hall (VMH), Kolkata that were laid before the Parliament (Lok Sabha) by the Ministry of Culture. The examination of these papers revealed that the requisite documents of VMH, Kolkata for the year 2015-2016 were laid on 18.12.2017 with delays of 11 months 18 days; for the year 2016-2017 on 07.01.2019 with delays of 12 months 07 days; for the year 2017-2018 on 09.12.2019 with delays of 11 months 09 days; for the year 2018-2019 on 13.02.2021 with delays of 13 months 13 days; for the year 2019-2020 on 20.12.2021 with delays of 11 months 20 days and for the year 2020-2021* the documents were laid on 21.03.2022 with delays of 02 months 21 days. The statement showing the actual dates of laying of the Annual Reports/Audited Accounts of the VHM, Kolkata alongwith the extent of delay is placed at **Appendix-II**.

6. The Committee desired to know the reasons for delay in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of VMH, Kolkata for the years 2015-2016 to 2019-2020. The Ministry of Culture submitted that:-

"The Internal Auditors are independent Auditors and usually take around 2 months for the internal audit and submission of their Internal Audit Report, and the C&AG takes around 4 months from the date of submission of Accounts to them, till submission of Final Audit Report.

Sometimes where no Executive and Finance Committee/Board of Trustees meeting could be held in the intervening period the approval of the members were obtained through circulation basis which becomes more time consuming. Such a scenario, which is beyond VMH's control, and compelled by the lack of an adequate number of Non-Ex-Officio Trustees has undermined the efforts of obtaining the statutory approvals necessary for the auditing process several times between 2015 and 2019."

* The requisite documents for the year 2021-22 have been laid on 20.03.2023.

7. On being asked whether the delays in laying the documents indicate that due importance was not given to the timely laying of the papers before the Parliament and things were taken in a casual manner. The Ministry of Culture, in their written reply, submitted as under: -

"Efforts have always been made for timely submission of the Annual Report before the Parliament but the various stages after preparation of the Accounts involving internal audit of the Accounts, approval of Accounts by E&FC/BoT, C&AG Audit, approval of Audit Report and Annual Activities Report by E&FC/BoT lead to consequent delay in laying of the Report before the Parliament."

8. The Committee asked the Ministry to furnish the information in respect of finalization of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of VMH, Kolkata and the time taken by the Ministry at each stage for the years 2015-2016 to 2020-2021. The statement showing the dates of laying the Annual Report and Audited Accounts of VMH, Kolkata is placed at **Appendix-III**.

9. The Committee desired to know whether the Ministry of Culture and the VMH, Kolkata have identified the stages in which delays have occurred during all these years and, if so, how does the Ministry propose to curtail the same. The Ministry replied that:-

"The Annual Accounts after compilation are to be internally audited by a Chartered Accountant firm as laid down in the V.M Act. The Internal Auditors are independent Auditors and usually take around 2 months for the internal audit and submission of their Internal Audit Report. This time may be reduced to 1½ month.

The Annual Accounts after internal audit are then approved by the Executive and Finance Committee / the Board of Trustees. The holding of the meeting of the Executive and Finance Committee is dependent on the availability of the members which involves some time. Where a meeting could not be conducted, the approval is obtained by circulation.

*The holding of the meeting of the Board of Trustees has been a challenge for VMH since the year 2015. This was due to the reason that there were 7 vacancies (total composition of Board = 14 members) in the Board of Trustees and there were only 7 ex officio members on the Board including the Chairman (Hon'ble Governor of West Bengal) with **no non ex officio members**. Due to this reason, scheduled Board meetings could not be held due to lack of quorum a number of times.*

Sometimes in this intervening period, where successive attempts to hold a Board of Trustees meeting failed due to administrative reasons beyond VMH's control, the approval of the members had to be obtained through circulation basis as a last resort, which became very time consuming. Consequently, the approval of the Annual Accounts, Separate Audit Report and the Annual Report for these years was substantially delayed. Hence there was a delay in submission of the minutes of the approved Accounts to CAG, and thereafter delayed approval of SAR and Annual Report led to delayed submission of Annual Report to the Ministry for placing in both the Houses of Parliament.

In order to curtail the delay the procedure of obtaining approvals of the Annual Accounts, Separate Audit Report and Annual Report should be made simplified and expeditious."

10. The Committee further, desired to know from the Ministry of Culture and the VMH, Kolkata, whether they had faced any problem in connection with the translation of the documents into Hindi and subsequent printing thereof, the Ministry in its written reply submitted that :-

"Very occasionally, there may be a delay on the part of the Printer in submitting the proofs, designing and printing of the Annual Report. Henceforth, to avoid delay at the end of the printer, a specific timeline will be provided to them from the date of supplying of the material until submission of the printed copies, failing which penal steps will be taken and this clause will be included in the Tender Notice."

11. Regarding any procedural difficulties associated with convening the meeting of the Competent Authority for getting approval of the documents of the Organization? If so, please spell out the same? The Ministry, in their written reply has submitted as under :-

*"The holding of the meeting of the Board of Trustees has been a challenge for VMH since the year 2015. This was due to the reason that there were 7 vacancies (total composition of Board = 14 members) in the Board of Trustees and there were only 7 ex officio members on the Board including the Chairman (Hon'ble Governor of West Bengal) with **no non ex officio members**. Due to this reason, scheduled Board meetings could not be held due to lack of quorum a number of times.*

Sometimes in this intervening period, where successive attempts to hold a Board of Trustees meeting failed due to administrative reasons beyond VMH's control, the approval of the members had to be obtained through circulation basis as a last resort, which became very time consuming. Consequently, the approval of the Annual Accounts, Separate Audit Report and the Annual Report for these years was substantially delayed. Hence there was a delay in submission of the minutes of the approved Accounts to CAG, and thereafter delayed approval of SAR and Annual Report led to delayed submission of Annual Report to the Ministry for placing in both the Houses of Parliament."

12. The Committee then asked the Ministry of Culture as to whether, the organization had any Internal Auditing mechanism to ensure timely compilation of Accounts and also to minimize the audit queries at the time of auditing. The Ministry in its written reply has submitted that:-

"VMH does not have an Internal Audit wing and the internal audit is done by a Chartered Accountant firm."

13. The Committee also enquired whether any time schedule has been laid down either by the organization or by the Ministry indicating normative time for completion of the task of each stage involved in finalization of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts. The Ministry submitted that:-

"A timeline is provided for completion of Accounts, auditing of Accounts and laying of the Annual Report and Audited Accounts in Parliament for each financial year, by 31st December"

14. The Committee also asked the Ministry of Culture as to whether there is any mechanism in the Ministry to monitor the progress of work in this regard to ensure timely laying of documents. The Ministry in its written reply submitted that:-

“Every year MoU is signed between Ministry and organizations concerned with a view to achieve the organization goal by optimum use of funds available and proper functioning of the organization which inter-alia include timely completion of the AR/AA and audit through C&AG and submission to Ministry. The Ministry regularly monitors the status of laying of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts through emails/letters/telecom/ meetings etc.”

15. The Committee asked the Ministry whether any remedial measures have been taken or proposed to be taken by them to ensure timely laying of the documents before Parliament within the prescribed period of nine months from the close of the accounting year. The Ministry in its written reply submitted that:

“All efforts are being made to expedite the preparation of the Annual Accounts and carry out the internal audit. However, the multiple layers of approval involved, including the approval of Accounts by the Executive & Finance Committee/ Board of Trustees, conduction of the C&AG Audit, and again approval of the Final Audit Report by the Executive & Finance Committee/ Board of Trustees in a time bound manner, is a great challenge.

It is proposed that the selected Printer of the Annual Report may be given a maximum time limit of 1 month for completing the proof submission and final printing of the Annual Report and Audited Accounts, failing which strict action will be taken against them.”

16. It is pertinent to mention here that the delay in laying of the requisite documents of the VMH is not recent origin. The Committee had earlier examined the reasons for delays in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the VMH for the years 1991-1992 to 1995-1996 and again for the years 2002-2003 to 2014-2015 and took oral evidence on the subject on 02.06.2000 and 17.01.2014 respectively. The matter for delays for those years were also reflected in the 10th Report (13th Lok Sabha) and 6th Report (16th Lok Sabha). However, no improvement has been seen in laying of the documents, therefore, the Committee again examined the reasons for delays for the years 2015-2016 to 2019-2020.

17. The Committee on Papers Laid on the Table (Lok Sabha) took oral evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Culture and the Victoria Memorial Hall, Kolkata on 20th December, 2021 to further examine the reasons of delays in laying of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of VMH, Kolkata for the years 2015-2016 to 2019-2020.

18. During the oral evidence, the representative of the Victoria Memorial Hall, Kolkata made the following submissions:

“...the main reason why the delay occurs is this. We have two-stage approvals, both before and after our central audit. So, first, we prepare our accounts and then a Chartered Accountant firm prepares the internal audits. Then, the internally audited accounts have to be approved by the Executive and Finance Committee and then by the Board of Trustees before inviting the central audit. Once the central audit gives us their SAR, which takes about 4 ½ to 5 months, then again before being printed into annual accounts and annual reports, they have to be again approved by the Executive and Finance Committee and the Board of Trustees. Once we made a presentation before COPLOT. According to the recommendations received at that meeting, we have already started doing our internal accounts and the internal auditing concurrently. We are going to place an agenda item on simplifying this process. It is because instead of this two plus two on either side of the central audit, we would like to have either no approval before inviting central audit or only one and one. Ideally, this is the agenda item that has been placed.”

They further submitted :

“...for the year 2020-21, central audit has already been done and the draft audit report has already been replied to. So, we are waiting for the final audit report which will come around late January or early February. Then, we will seek the Board of Trustees’ approval by circulation. We will print it and we will submit it by March, 2022. As you said, from an average of a delay of one year, we will be down to three months for 2020-21. From 2021-22, we will get up to speed.”

Observations/Recommendations

19. The Committee note that the Victoria Memorial Hall (VMH), Kolkata and Ministry of Culture (MoC) have not adhered to the provisions of Rule 237(iii) of the General Financial Rules(2017) of the Government of India, regarding laying of the Annual Report and Audited Accounts of the VMH, Kolkata on the Table of the House within nine months of the closure of the Financial/accounting year. The Committee is disappointed to note that the Ministry of Culture (MoC) also has not adhered to the stipulated time frame in laying of these documents. The requisite documents of the VMH for the year 2015-16 were laid on 18.12.2017 with delays of 11 months 18 days, for the year 2016-17 on 07.01.2019 with delays of 12 months 07 days, for the year 2017-18 on 09.12.2019 with delays of 11 months 09 days, for the year 2018-19 on 13.02.2021 with delays of 13 months 13 days, for the year 2019-20 on 20.12.2021 with delays of 11 months 20 days and the documents for the year 2020-21* on 21.03.2022 with delays of 2 months 21 days.

20. The Committee note that the delay in laying the VMH documents by the MOC is not of recent-origin. The Committee noted and considered the matter of delays in laying the documents of VMH for the years from 1991-92 to 1994-95 in its 10th Report (13th Lok Sabha), presented to the Lok Sabha on 8 May, 2002 and again in 6th Report (16th Lok Sabha) for the years from 2002-2003 to 2014-2015, presented to the Lok Sabha on 16 March, 2016 which prove the Ministry's failure to adhere to the time of laying the said documents of the VMH.

21. While examining the reasons for delays for laying the documents of the VMH, Kolkata, as furnished by the organisation, the Committee are dismayed to note that the delay had occurred at the Internal Audit level. The submission of their Internal Audit Report took around 2 months and the C&AG also took around 4 months, till submission of Final Audit Report (FAR). As per the reply, the delay has been further compounded due to non- convening of the meeting of the Executive and Finance Committee/Board of Trustees at regular intervals and lack of coordination between the Ministry and VMH.

Further, the Ministry of Culture, has apparently not been able to put in place an effective monitoring mechanism to ensure laying of documents of the VMH, Kolkata on the Table of the House/Parliament within the stipulated time. The Ministry need to makes all efforts to ensure that henceforth these documents are laid within the stipulated time. The Committee shall be apprised of the compliance of these directions and also measures taken by the Ministry to avoid delays in future. The

* The requisite documents for the year 2021-22 have been laid on 20.03.2023.

Committee expect that, after all these efforts, reportedly made by the Ministry, the requisite documents of the VMH, Kolkata are laid within the stipulated time, in future.

22. The Committee, also recommend that the Ministry of Culture should prepare a 'Portal' wherein the updated position/progress regarding laying of the requisite documents of all the organisations under their administrative control could be ensured by putting an automatic alert system which would alert the Institutions one week before the deadline for the completion of their work at each stage as per the time schedule given. The Committee would like to be informed of the action taken by the Ministry in this regard.

23. The Committee also impress upon the Ministry that henceforth the latter must issue, a statement explaining the reasons as to why the requisite documents of all other organisations under their administration control could not be laid within the prescribed period on the Table of the House within 30 days or as soon as the House meets, whichever is later.

New Delhi
29 March 2023
Chaitra 8, 1945 (Saka)

Girish Chandra
Chairperson
Committee on Papers Laid on the Table
Lok Sabha

Appendix-I
vide para 03 of the Report

**Statement regarding Grant in Aid is received from the Ministry of Culture
under various Heads during the last five years**

(Rs. In lakhs)

Year	Plan Grant	Non-Plan Grant	Total
2016-17	361.00	734.00	1095.00

Year	Head				Total
	Salaries	CCA	General	SAP-General	
2017-18	810.00	0.00	683.13		1493.13
2018-19	846.45	0.00	1400.00	2.70	2246.45
2019-20	796.45	1500.00	1275.00	3.00	3574.45
2020-21	844.24	0.00	1500.00	1.20	2345.44

”.

Appendix-II
vide para 05 of the Report

Statement showing the dates of laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Victoria Memorial Hall (VMH), Kolkata for the years 2015-2016 to 2020-2021.

Financial Year	Date by which Annual Reports and Audited Accounts were required to be laid	Actual Date of laying of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts	Extent of delay
2015-2016	31.12.2016	18.12.2017	11 months 18 days
2016-2017	31.12.2017	07.01.2019	12 months 07 days
2017-2018	31.12.2018	09.12.2019	11 months 09 days
2018-2019	31.12.2019	13.02.2021	13 months 13 days
2019-2020	31.12.2020	20.12.2021	11 months 20 days
2020-2021*	31.12.2021	21.03.2022	02 months 21 days

* The requisite documents for the year 2021-22 have been laid on 20.03.2023.

Appendix-III
vide para 8 of the Report

The chronological sequence in respect of finalization of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Victoria Memorial Hall (VMH), Kolkata for the years 2015-2016 to 2020-2021.

Sub-Question	Points	Financial Years					
		2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20	2020-21
7 (i)	Date of approach to the Audit Authorities	01.06.2016 (Internal Auditor)	01.06.2017 (Internal Auditor)	01.06.2018 (Internal Auditor)	03.06.2019 (Internal Auditor)	06.08.2020 (Internal Auditor)	18.06.2021 (Internal Auditor)
	Time taken after the closure of Accounting year	2 months	2 months	2 months	2 months	4 months	2 ½ months
7(ii)	Date of appointment statutory auditors	The annual accounts of VMH are audited under Section 20(1) of the Comptroller & Auditor General's (Duties, Powers and Condition of Services) Act, 1971 and their current appointment is valid up to FY 2022-23.					
	Time taken after the approaching the audit authorities for appointment of auditors	N.A	N.A	N.A	N.A	N.A	N.A
7(iii)	Date of compilation of annual accounts	31.05.2016	31.05.2017	31.05.2018	31.05.2019	31.07.2020	15.06.2021
	Time taken after the closure of the accounting year	2 months	2 months	2 months	2 months	4 months (delayed due to COVID Pandemic)	2 ½ months
7(iv)	Date of submission of annual accounts to auditors	22.11.2016 (date of submission to C&AG after internal audit and approval of Accounts by the competent authorities)	20.12.2017 (date of submission to C&AG after internal audit and approval of Accounts by the competent authorities)	22.01.2019 (date of submission to C&AG after internal audit and approval of Accounts by the competent authorities)	07.11.2019 (date of submission to C&AG after internal audit and approval of Accounts by the competent authorities)	07.12.2020 (date of submission to C&AG after internal audit and approval of Accounts by the competent authorities)	The approved Annual Accounts have been submitted to the O/o the D G Audit on 01.10.2021 with a request for undertaking Audit
	Time taken after closure of respective accounting year	7 ½ months	8 ½ months	9 ½ months	7 ½ months	8 ½ months	
7(v)	The date and duration for auditing the annual accounts by statutory auditors	29.11.2016 to 02.01.2017 (<1 month)	02.01.2018 to 25.01.2018 (1 month)	04.02.2019 to 04.03.2019 (1 month)	27.11.2019 to 30.12.2019 (<1 month)	06.01.2021 to 04.02.2021 (1 month)	

7(vi)	The date of queries raised by auditors during auditing/after completion of the Annual Accounts	29.11.2016 to 02.01.2017	02.01.2018 to 25.01.2018	04.02.2019 to 04.03.2019	27.11.2019 to 30.12.2019	06.01.2021 to 04.02.2021	
	Time taken by auditors in raising the queries during auditing/after completion of the Annual Accounts to Audit Authorities	1 ½ months	1 -1 ½ months	1 ½ months	1 ½ months	2 months	
7(vii)	The date on which the replies to the audit queries were furnished in the Auditors	29.11.2016 to 02.01.2017	02.01.2018 to 25.01.2018	04.02.2019 to 04.03.2019	27.11.2019 to 30.12.2019	06.01.2021 to 04.02.2021	
	The time taken to resolve the queries	1 ½ months	1 -1 ½ months	1 ½ months	1 ½ months	2 months	
7(viii)	The date on which draft Audit Report was issued by Audit Authorities	23.12.2016	13.02.2018	26.02.2019	29.01.2020	01.02.2021	
	Time taken after auditing of the annual accounts	1 month	1 ½ months	1 month	<2 months	1 month	
7(ix)	The date on which the final Audit Report received by Organization	06.02.2017	26.03.2018	11.04.2019	18.03.2020	26.03.2021	
	Time taken after issue of draft report	1 ½ months	1 ½ months	1 ½ months	1 ½ months	2 months	
7(x)	Total time taken by the audit authorities after receiving of the annual accounts to furnishing the final audit report to the organisation	2 ½ months	3 ½ months	2 ½-3 months	4 ½ months	4 months	
7(xi)	Date of finalization of the annual report	06.02.2017	26.03.2018	11.04.2019	18.03.2020	26.03.2021	
	Time taken after the closure of the financial year; and also	10 months	11 ½ months	12 ½ months	11 ½ months	11 ½ months	
	Time taken after the receipt of the final audit report	N.A	N.A	N.A	N.A	N.A	
7(xii)	The date on which documents were got approved from the Competent Authority	14.07.2017	05.10.2018	12.07.2019	01.07.2020	22.09.2021	
	Time taken after finalization of Annual Report	5 ½ months	6 ½ months	3 months	3 ½ months	6 months	
	Time taken after receipt of final audit report	5 ½ months	6 ½ months	3 months	3 ½ months	6 months	

7(xiii)	The date on which documents were taken up for translation&printing	18.05.2017	11.06.2018	10.04.2019	03.03.2020	24.08.2021	
	The time taken for completing the task at each stage.	2 months	4 months	3 months	8 ½ months (delay by Printer due to lockdown during the COVID Pandemic)	Work in progress at the printer	
7(xiv)	The date for sending the documents to the Ministry for being laid in the House after the completion the task at each stage.	20.07.2017	12.10.2018	15.07.2019	28.12.2020	Pending	
	Time taken by the Organizations in sending the documents to the Ministry	6 days from date of approval of competent authority	7 days from date of approval of competent authority	3 days from date of approval of competent authority	5 months (delay by Printer due to lockdown during the COVID Pandemic)		
7(xv)	The date of laying the documents in the House.	18.12.2017 (LS) 20.12.2017 (RS)	07.01.2019 (LS) 07.01.2019 (RS)	09.12.2019 (LS) 10.12.2019 (RS)	09.02.2021 (LS) 13.02.2021 (RS)	Pending	
	Time taken after receipt of the documents from the Organisation.	5 months	3 months	5 months	1 ½ months		

Committee on Papers Laid on the Table (2021-2022)

**The Extracts of the fourth sitting of
the Committee Papers Laid on the Table (2021-22) held on 20/12/2021.**

The Committee sat on Monday, 20th December 2021 from 16:00 hours to 16:50 hours in Committee Room "C", Parliament House Annexe, New Delhi.

Present

Shri Ritesh Pandey - ***Chairperson***

Members

2. Shri Pallab Lochan Das
3. Choudhary Mehboob Ali Kaiser
4. Shri Raja Amareshwara Naik
5. Shri Saptagiri Sankar Ulaka
6. Shri Ashok Kumar Yadav

Secretariat

1. Smt. Suman Arora - Joint Secretary
2. Shri Munish Kumar Rewari - Additional Director
3. Smt. ManjinderPubbi - Under Secretary

Witnesses

xx xx xx xx xx

Ministry of Culture

1. Ms. Lily Pandeya - Joint Secretary
2. Shri Abhishek Narang - Deputy Secretary
3. Shri S.C. Mondal - Under Secretary

Victoria Memorial Hall (VMH), Kolkata

Dr. Jayanta Sengupta - Secretary & Curator, VMH

2. At the outset, the Chairperson welcomed the Members of the Committee to the sitting and apprised them about the agenda.

3. to 11. xx xx xx xx xx

12. The Committee, thereafter, took up the matter of the delays in laying the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Victoria Memorial Hall (VMH), Kolkata for the years 2015-2016 to 2019-2020. The representatives of the Ministry of Culture and the Victoria Memorial Hall (VMH), Kolkata were called in to tender oral evidence before the Committee.

13. The Chairperson welcomed the representatives of the Ministry of Culture and the VMH to the sitting of the Committee and informed them about the agenda of the sitting. The Chairperson also informed the witnesses about the provisions of Direction 58 of Directions by the Speaker, Lok Sabha, regarding the confidentiality of the proceedings.

14. The Chairperson, thereafter, pointed out about the delays made at regular intervals in laying the requisite documents of the VMH for the years 2015-2016 to 2019- 2020. The representative of the Ministry submitted that the accounts of VMH have to be approved by the Executive Council and Finance Committee and then by the Board of Trustees, both, before and after the central audit, which consumes a lot of time. The representative submitted that they had pointed out this issue and had decided to take up the matter in the next meeting of the Board of Trustees. The Chairperson enquired about the issues with regard to printing. The representative apprised the Committee that, now, all the issues regarding printing and translation had been sorted out and, assured that the requisite documents for 2020-21 would be laid by March 2022 and, for the subsequent years would be laid within time.

15. Shri Pallab Lochan Das, MP and member of the Committee, suggested to the Ministry/VMH to rectify its mechanism and also to have a timeline to achieve the desired goal.

16. The Chairperson, thereafter, suggested to the representatives of the Ministry/VMH to prepare a software wherein updated position regarding laying of the documents of the all organisations under their administrative control could be made available by them and an automatic reminders might be sent by the Ministry to the VMH, in case of delay. The Chairperson asked the representatives of the Ministry and the VMH to submit the timeline and plan of action with regard to preparation of a dashboard/software.

17. The Hon'ble Chairperson also thanked the representatives of the Ministry and the VMH for their free and frank views in connection with the examination of the subject.

The witnesses then withdrew.

Copy of the verbatim proceedings of the sitting is kept

The Committee then adjourned.

The Extracts of the Minutes of the fourth sitting of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table (2022-2023) held on 29.03.2023.

Committee On Papers Laid On The Table (2022-23)

The Committee sat on Thursday, 29th March, 2023 from 15:00 hours to 16:00 hours in Committee Room 'C', Parliament House Annexe, New Delhi.

Present

Shri Girish Chandra - ***Chairperson***

***Members
(Lok Sabha)***

2. Shri Shafiqur Rahman Barq
3. Shri Choudhury Mohan Jatua
4. Smt. Aparupa Poddar
5. Shri T.N. Prathapan

Secretariat

1. Shri Vinay Kumar Mohan - Joint Secretary
2. Shri Naval K. Verma - Director
3. Shri Uttam Chand Bharadwaj - Additional Director

2. At the outset, the Chairperson welcomed the Members of the Committee to the sitting and apprised them of the agenda.

4. Thereafter, the Committee took up the following six draft Reports and six Action taken Reports for consideration and adoption:-

1. x x x x x;

2. Delay in laying the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Victoria Memorial Hall, Kolkata;

3. x x x x x;

4. x x x x x;

5. x x x x x;

6. x x x x x;

- 7. x x x x x.
- 8. x x x x x;
- 9. x x x x x;
- 10. x x x x x
- 11. x x x x x
- 12. x x x x x

The above mentioned six Reports and six Action Taken Reports were unanimously adopted by the Committee and the Chairperson was authorized by the Committee to finalize and present Reports to the Lok Sabha.

xx	xx	xx	xx
xx	xx	xx	xx

(A Copy of the verbatim proceedings of the sitting is kept.)

The Committee then adjourned.
