

FUNCTIONING OF DIRECTORATE OF ESTATES

[Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee contained in their 41st Report (17th Lok Sabha)]

**PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2023-24)**

SIXTY – SEVENTH REPORT

SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

SIXTY- SEVENTH REPORT

PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2023-24)

(SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA)

FUNCTIONING OF DIRECTORATE OF ESTATES

MINISTRY OF HOUSING AND URBAN AFFAIRS

[Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee contained in their 41st Report (17th Lok Sabha)]



Presented to Lok Sabha on: 25-07-2023

Laid in Rajya Sabha on: 25-07-2023

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI

July, 2023 /Sravana, 1945 (Saka)

CONTENTS

		PAGE
COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2023-24)		(iii)
INTRODUCTION		(iv)
CHAPTER I	Report	
CHAPTER II	Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government	
CHAPTER III	Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government.....	
CHAPTER IV	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration	
CHAPTER V	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies	
APPENDICES		
I	*Minutes of the 3 rd Sitting of the Public Accounts Committee (2023-24) held on 18 th July, 2023	
II	Analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee contained in their Forty-first Report (17 th Lok Sabha)	

*Not attached

Composition of the Public Accounts Committee (2023-24)

Shri Adhir Ranjan Chowdhury - Chairperson

MEMBERS

LOK SABHA

2. Shri Thalikkottai Rajuthevar Baalu
3. Shri Subhash Chandra Baheria
4. Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab
5. Shri Jagdambika Pal
6. Shri Vishnu Dayal Ram
7. Shri Pratap Chandra Sarangi
8. Shri Rahul Ramesh Shewale
9. Shri Gowdar Mallikarjunappa Siddeshwara
10. Shri Brijendra Singh
11. Shri Rajiv Ranjan Singh *alias* Lalan Singh
12. Dr. Satya Pal Singh
13. Shri Jayant Sinha
14. Shri Balashowry Vallabbhaneni
15. Shri Ram Kripal Yadav

RAJYA SABHA

16. Shri Shaktisinh Gohli
17. Dr. K. Laxman
18. Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Ray
19. Shri Tiruchi Siva
20. Dr. M. Thambidurai
21. Shri Ghanshyam Tiwari
22. Dr. Sudhanshu Trivedi

Secretariat

1. Shri T.G. Chandrasekhar - Additional Secretary
2. Smt. Bharti S. Tuteja - Director
3. Ms. Malvika Mehta - Under Secretary

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairperson, Public Accounts Committee (2023-24), having been authorised by the Committee, do present this Sixty-seventh Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their Forty-first Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on '**Functioning of Directorate of Estates**' relating to the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs.

2. The Forty-first Report was presented to Lok Sabha/laid on the Table of Rajya Sabha on 8th December, 2021. Replies of the Government to the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Report have been received. The Committee considered and adopted the Sixty-seventh Report at their Sitting held on 18 July, 2023. Minutes of the Sitting of the Committee are given at Appendix-I.

3. For facility of reference and convenience, the Observations and Recommendations of the Committee have been printed in **bold** in the body of the Report.

4. The Committee place on record their appreciation of the assistance rendered to them in the matter by the Committee Secretariat and the office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India.

5. An analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Forty-first Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) is given at *Appendix-II*.

NEW DELHI:
24 July, 2023
2 Sravana 1945 (*Saka*)

ADHIR RANJAN CHOWDHURY
Chairperson,
Public Accounts Committee

CHAPTER – I REPORT

This Report of the Public Accounts Committee deals with action taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their Forty-first Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on 'Functioning of Directorate of Estates' relating to Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs.

2. The Forty-first Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) was presented to the Parliament on 08.12.2021. It contained ten Observations/Recommendations. Action Taken Notes have been received from the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs in respect of all the Observations/Recommendations and are broadly categorised as follows:-

- | | |
|--|---|
| (i) Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government
Para Nos. 1, 4, 6-10. | Total: 07
Chapter II |
| (ii) Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government
NIL | Total: Nil
Chapter III |
| (iii) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration
Para Nos. 2-3. | Total:02
Chapter IV |
| (iv) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies
Para No. 5 | Total:01
Chapter V |

3. The detailed examination of the subject by the Committee had revealed that there has been persistent shortage of accommodation for Government servants in Delhi; no proper record of the housing stock available; inequitable augmentation of housing stock in the various pools; inadequate or partial functioning of the Licence Fee Collection and Monitoring System thereby resulting in DoE not being able to monitor the receipt of the Licence Fee; delays in the reflection of vacancy position of houses in the GAMS database owing to DoE and CPWD databases not being interlinked; possessing incorrect or inaccurate details of houses which are declared as unsafe or dangerous; poor quality of database in the Government Accommodation Management System (GAMS) etc.

4. Based on the examination of the subject, some of the important Observations/Recommendations made by the Committee in their Forty-first Report were as under:-

- The Detailed Project Reports of all the projects may be reviewed; specific time frames prescribed for each task to be carried out and appropriate measures taken urgently for expediting all necessary approvals. The Committee may be apprised of the steps taken in this regard, project-wise, along with the timelines for augmenting the housing stock on priority. The Committee would also like to be apprised of the provisions pertaining to imposition of liquidated damages on contractors /sub-contractors of CPWD in cases of delays in adhering to timelines.
- The reasons for the variation in the number of houses to be added as stated at different points of time, that too at short intervals. Action taken by the DoE to cater to the requests received from various 'departmental pools' seeking an increase in allotment of houses. An estimate of the number of houses that might be needed in the next 5-10 years and thereafter planning the required increase in the housing stock accordingly. The accommodation requirement of employees at the lower rung of the hierarchy i.e. employees of Group 'B' and 'C' categories may be assessed first and efforts made to provide accommodation to them on priority.
- Physical verification of the housing stock may be done urgently by DoE in co-ordination with CPWD in a time bound manner, and the Committee apprised thereof. All the properties of DoE may be geo-tagged so as to enable regular monitoring and updating of the stock on real time basis. Physical verification of housing stock be carried out at regular intervals.
- Measuring 'satisfaction levels' should not only be based on mapping of availability of houses vis-à-vis the demand, but should also include aspects such as the actual level of satisfaction of residents and the quality of construction/ repair and services being offered by the maintenance agencies concerned.
- Periodic appraisal of the performance of agencies such as CPWD/NBCC may be done so as to enable in improving the services provided by them. Appropriate action may be taken against the officials found responsible for negligence on the basis of the appraisal and penalties imposed on the contractors/ sub-contractors for 'unsatisfactory work' that may have been executed.
- An assessment may be made for ascertaining the costs incurred on providing accommodation to the Government employees vis-a-vis the efficiency and care with which 'housing stock' is being maintained.
- The remaining DDOs be integrated with the GPRA in a time bound schedule.
- DoE may earnestly pursue the Damage Recovery Cases filed under Section 14 of the Public Premises Act 1971 that have been forwarded to the Collectors. 'Age-wise-breakup' of the total outstanding Licence Fee may be provided to Audit.

- CPWD may first take necessary action to ensure that the houses are repaired/renovated as per the stipulations of the Maintenance Charter. The Committee also recommended that in case of non-adherence to the stipulations, accountability should be fixed on the officials responsible for delays.
- The Ministry may review all cases to ensure that there are no instances of double occupation. The process of linking eAwas with PFMS may be expedited and completed within a time bound period.
- DoE and CPWD may take urgent steps to ensure that uninhabitable and dangerous houses are vacated at the earliest and they are repaired/renovated.
- All the relevant information and facilities for booking of venues etc. may be made available on the e-sampada portal at the earliest. The Committee also desire to be apprised of the user feedback on the new site.
- The Ministry may make the required records/documents available to Audit.

5. The Action Taken Notes submitted by the Ministry on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their Twenty- fifth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) have been reproduced in the relevant Chapters of this Report in the succeeding paragraphs. The Committee will now deal with the Action Taken by the Government on some of their Observations/Recommendations made in the original Report which require reiteration/merit comments.

6. The Committee desire the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs to furnish Action Taken Notes in respect of Observations/ Recommendations contained in Chapter I and Chapter V within six months of the presentation of the Report to the House.

Recommendation at Para No. 1- Augmentation of Housing Stock

7. *The Committee had observed that maintenance of housing stock has been one of the primary responsibilities of the Directorate of Estates. The Committee had observed that there has been a persistent and acute shortage of 36-37 percent in housing stock of General Pool Residential Accommodation. This was despite the fact that actual demand for houses had gone down from 98789 in 2008 to 82803 in September 2020. The Committee had been intrigued by the inability of the Directorate of Estates (DOE)/ Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs (MOHUA) in augmenting the much-needed housing stock. The Committee had noted from the action taken notes submitted in this regard in 2016 that with a view to increasing the housing stock, redevelopment and construction projects were initiated at various locations across Delhi, for raising the number of dwelling units to approximately 24,000 by the year 2022. However, on examining the status of various redevelopment projects, the Committee had found that there have been delays mainly on account of encumbrances pertaining to vacation of schools, markets, community centres, CGHS dispensaries, Kendriya Bhandars, IGL Gas pipelines etc., and also due to encroachments; as also delays in*

obtaining approvals for re-plantation of trees from Delhi Forest Department as well as other agencies involved, and PILs filed in NGT and Delhi High Court. The Committee had felt that due to lack of proper planning on the part of the Ministry, there had been an impasse. They were of the view that when such developmental/construction projects are taken up where schools, market places, Community Centres, CGHS Dispensaries etc. need to be shifted/re-located, preparatory works should have been initiated simultaneously in order to ensure that the project was executed in an unhindered manner. The Committee had, therefore, recommended that the Detailed Project Reports of all the projects be reviewed and specific time frames prescribed for each task to be carried out and appropriate measures taken urgently for expediting all necessary approvals. The Committee had desired to be apprised of the steps taken in this regard, project-wise, alongwith the timelines for augmenting the housing stock on priority. The Committee had also desired to be apprised of the provisions pertaining to imposition of liquidated damages on contractors /sub-contractors of CPWD in cases of delays in adhering to timelines.

The Committee had been perplexed to note that the figures pertaining to number of houses to be added was being constantly revised by the DoE. While in August 2020, the Ministry had informed that a total of 4599 houses had been added and approximately 30000 more were in pipeline, in July 2021, it was stated that 6254 houses have been added and approximately 26000 more houses are to be added. The Committee had, therefore, wished to be apprised of the reasons for the variation in the number of houses to be added as stated at different points of time, that too at short intervals. The Committee desired to be apprised of the requests received from various 'departmental pools' seeking an increase in allotment of houses and the action taken by the DoE to cater to the needs expressed. The Committee had further recommended that the DoE may seek from all the Ministries/ Departments /Organisations that they are servicing, an estimate of the number of houses that might be needed in the next 5-10 years and thereafter plan the required increase in the housing stock accordingly. The Committee had also recommended that the accommodation requirement of employees at the lower rung of the hierarchy i.e. employees of Group 'B' and 'C' categories may be assessed first and efforts made to provide accommodation to them on priority.

8. The Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs furnished the following action taken replies to the recommendation of the Committee:-

"The position of demand and availability for general pool residential accommodation is as on 04-03-2022. The overall percentage of satisfaction is 79.62%.

The government has taken various steps to bridge the gap between demand and availability by construction of new residential units or redevelopment of existing government colonies. Six colonies (Netaji Nagar, Kasturba Nagar, Sarojini Nagar, Srinivaspuri, Thyagraj Nagar, Mohammadpur) are currently under construction or redevelopment and after redevelopment, total number of quarters in these colonies will increase from 12970 to 25667. After completion of all projects, 100% satisfaction may be achieved.

Further, the project of redevelopment of four GPRA colonies is governed by the stipulations in the note for cabinet approval and MoU thereof. Though there was some delays in shifting of social infra-structure which are mainly owned/operated by other municipal / statutory bodies, the major delays are due to :-

- i) The stay imposed on the work by Hon'ble NGT and Hon'ble high court of Delhi. Further Hon'ble high court of Delhi, while vacating the stay, directed to obtain fresh approvals to the revised proposals which were prepared to reduce the number of trees affected on the direction of the court.
- ii) Due to the 1st and 2nd wave of COVID 19 pandemic, not only the ongoing works were affected but also had serious setbacks due to returning of migrant labourers.
- iii) The project is of self-sustainable finance model and the cost of construction is to be met by sale of commercial BUA (Built up Area). Due to the subdued real estate market and Covid-19 pandemic, the sale of commercial BUA and thereby cash flow of the project is affected. This has led to taking up the work in phases.

CPWD has been appointed as implementing agency for four GPRA colonies – Mohammadpur, Thyagraj Nagar, Srinivaspuri and Kasturba Nagar. Action taken on various points raised by committee are as follows:

I. Vacation of Social Infrastructure and Shifting of Public Amenities: Extensive meetings and follow ups have been made with concerned department for vacation of social infrastructure and shifting of amenities.

- i) **Mohammadpur:** All social infrastructures have been vacated and demolished.
- ii) **Thyagraj Nagar:** All social infrastructures have been vacated and demolished.
- iii) **Srinivaspuri:** Various meetings have and follow ups have been held with concerned parties and department / authorities of SDM for vacation / shifting of various social infrastructures like market, school etc. It is planned to construct the new social infrastructure like market, Barat Ghar, School etc. before their shifting.
- iv) **Kasturba Nagar:** Various meetings have and follow ups have been held with concerned parties and department / authorities of SDM for vacation / shifting of various social infrastructures like market, school etc. It is planned to construct the new social infrastructure like market, Barat Ghar, School etc. before their shifting.

Further issue of Shifting of public amenities like IGL Pipe line, Sewer lines etc. have been raised with concerned authorities and demands raised towards the

same is being deposited from time to time. The shifting works is getting delayed in Kasturba Nagar by the BSES & DJB.

II. Removal of Encroachment: Various meeting / correspondence have been done with L&DO, MoHUA and Delhi Urban Shelter Improvement Board (DUSIB).

Mohammadpur, Thyagraj Nagar, Srinivaspuri & Kasturba Nagar:

i) Jhuggies:

Various meeting / correspondence have been done with L&DO, MoHUA, DUSIB etc. A meeting under the chairmanship of Director (UD) was held on 29.10.2021 in presence of NBCC, CPWD, L&DO and DUSIB Officials. It was directed that DUSIB and representative from L&DO shall inspect and determine the eligibility of Jhuggies for alternate accommodation as per DUSIB Policy. The sites have been visited by the DUSIB officials.

ii) Encroachments:

Various correspondences have been made with L&DO for removal of encroachment from the colonies.

III. Status of Statutory Approvals:

- i) **Mohammadpur:** Approvals from all the statutory authorities have been obtained.
- ii) **Thyagraj Nagar:** Approvals from all the statutory authorities have been obtained.
- iii) **Srinivaspuri:** The project has been divided in three phases. All Statutory Approvals have been obtained except for Tree Transplantation/felling permission from forest Department, GNCTD.
- iv) **Kasturba Nagar:** The project has been divided in two phases. All Statutory Approvals have been obtained. Tree Transplantation/felling permission obtained for phase-1.

IV. Time lines for housing stock:

The work of Srinivaspuri and Kasturba Nagar are being taken up in phases. Tentative timeline for their completion is as follows:

Sl. No.	Colony	No. of GPRA units	Tentative Timeline
1.	Mohammadpur	745	March 2025
2.	Thyagraj Nagar	740	March 2025
3.	Kasturba Nagar	3678	March 2025

4.	Sriniwaspuri	4994	March 2025
----	--------------	------	------------

V. Physical and Financial Progress:

Sl. No.	Colony	Physical Progress	Financial Progress
1.	Mohammadpur	65%	40%
2.	Thyagraj Nagar	75%	48%
3.	Kasturba Nagar	3%	2%
4.	Sriniwaspuri	2%	2%

New Moti Bagh: Project was completed in the year 2012, almost ten year back. Now NBCC India Limited is looking after the maintenance work of NMB and so far there are no any major issues of leakage and seepage observed.

East Kidwai Nagar:

To address the complaints & feedback of the residents, NBCC has in place a CMS (Complaint Management System) through which any resident can register their complaint telephonically /physically. As per the nature of complaints, the maintenance agency/ contractor resolve the issues at the earliest.

The redressal of complaints/ feedback of the residents are dealt with as per the terms and conditions of the agreement between NBCC & Maintenance Agency/Contractor.

Redevelopment of seven GPRA colonies:

Redevelopment of seven GPRA colonies project is governed by the stipulations in the note for cabinet approval and MoU thereof. Though there was some delays in shifting of social infra structure which are mainly owned/operated by other municipal/statutory bodies, the major delays are due to:-

- The stay imposed on the work by Hon'ble NGT and Hon'ble high court of Delhi. Further, Hon'ble high court of Delhi, while vacating the stay, directed to obtain fresh approvals to the revised proposals which were prepared to reduce the number of trees affected on the direction of the court.
- Due to the 1st and 2nd wave of Covid 19 pandemic, not only the ongoing works were affected but also had serious setbacks due to returning of migrant labourers.
- The project is of self sustainable finance model and the cost of construction is to be met by sale of commercial BUA. Due to the subdued real estate market and Covid 19 pandemic, the sale of commercial BUA and thereby cash flow of the project is affected. This has led to taking up the work in phases.

NBCC has been appointed as implementing agency for 3 GPRA colonies - Nauroji Nagar, Sarojini Nagar & Netaji Nagar and CPWD has been appointed as implementing agency for 4 GPRA colonies- Mohammadpur, Thyagraj Nagar, Srinivaspuri and Kasturba Nagar. Action taken on various points raised by committee are as follows:

I. **Vacation of Social Infrastructure and Shifting of Public Amenities:-**

Extensive meetings and follow ups have been made with concerned department for vacation of social infrastructure and shifting of amenities.

- **Nauroji Nagar** - All social infrastructures have been vacated and demolished.
- **Netaji Nagar & Sarojini Nagar** – Various meetings have and follow ups have been held with concerned parties and department/authorities of NDMC for vacation/ Shifting of various social Infrastructures like market, School etc. It is planned to construct the new social infrastructure like market, Barat Ghar, School etc before their shifting.

Further issue of Shifting of public amenities like IGL Pipe line, Sewer lines etc have been raised with concerned authorities and demands raised towards the same is being deposited by NBCC from time to time. The shifting works have been taken up by the respective organizations.

- **Mohammadpur** – All social Infrastructures have been vacated and demolished.
- **Thyagraj Nagar** – All social infrastructures have been vacated and demolished.
- **Srinivaspuri & Kasturba nagar** - Various meetings and follow ups have been held with concerned parties and department/authorities of SDMC for vacation/ Shifting of various social Infrastructures like market, School etc. It is planned to construct the new social infrastructure like market, Barat Ghar, School etc before their shifting.

Further issue of Shifting of public amenities like IGL Pipe line, Sewer lines etc have been raised with concerned authorities and demands raised towards the same is being deposited by CPWD from time to time. The shifting works is getting delayed in Kasturba Nagar by the BSES & DJB.

II. **Removal of Encroachment-** Various meeting /correspondence have been done with L&DO, MoHUA , DUSIB and concerned division.

- **Nauroji Nagar** – Encroachments have been partly shifted and is being persuaded with L&DO and religious committee.
- **Netaji and Sarojini Nagar:**

Jhuggies: Various meetings / correspondence have been done with L&DO, MoHUA, DUSIB etc. A meeting under the chairmanship of Director (DD) was held on 29.10.2021 in presence of NBCC, CPWD, L&DO and DUSIB Officials. It was directed that DUSIB and representative from L&DO shall inspect and determine the eligibility of Jhuggies for alternate accommodation as per DUSIB Policy. DUSIB has conducted the site visit on 09.11.2021. However the report is awaited.

Encroachments: Various correspondences have been made with concerned division for removal of encroachment at Pillanji Village. Last demolition drive was scheduled on 23.11.2021 but not happened due to non-availability of adequate police force. L&DO was intimated and requested to coordinate with DDA for further action on 23.11.2021.

o **Mohammadpur, Thyagraj Nagar, Srinivaspuri & Kasturba Nagar**

Jhuggies: Various meetings / correspondence have been done with L&DO, MoHUA, DUSIB etc. A meeting under the chairmanship of Director (DD) was held on 29.10.2021 in presence of NBCC, CPWD, L&DO and DUSIB Officials. It was directed that DUSIB and representative from L&DO shall inspect and determine the eligibility of Jhuggies for alternate accommodation as per DUSIB Policy. The sites have been visited by the DUSIB officials.

Encroachments: Various correspondences have been made with L&DO and concerned division for removal of encroachment from the colonies.

III. Status of Statutory Approvals

- o **Nauroji Nagar** - Approvals from all the statutory authorities have been obtained
- o **Netaji Nagar-**
 - All Statutory Approvals obtained except for Tree Transplantation/ felling from Forest Dept, GNCTD.
 - Revised application for tree transplantation has been submitted phase wise. Approval for one package has been obtained.
- o **Sarojini Nagar-**
 - All Statutory Approvals obtained except for Tree Transplantation/ felling from Forest Dept, GNCTD.
 - Revised application for tree transplantation has been submitted in five phases. Approval obtained for two phases/packages. Approvals for other phases are in consideration at forest dept.

- **Mohammadpur** - Approvals from all the statutory authorities have been obtained
- **Thyagraj Nagar** - Approvals from all the statutory authorities have been obtained
- **Sriniwaspuri**- The project has been divided in three phases. All Statutory Approvals have been obtained except for Tree Transplantation/ felling permission from forest Dept, GNCTD.
- **Kasturba nagar** - The project has been divided in two phases. All Statutory Approvals have been obtained. Tree Transplantation/ felling permission obtained for phase-1

IV. **Time lines for housing stock:** The work of Netaji Nagar, Sarojini Nagar, Sriniwaspuri and Kasturba Nagar are being taken up in phases. Tentative timeline for their completion is as follows:

SI No	Colony	No of GPRA units	Tentative Timeline
1	Nauroji Nagar	NIL	31.03.2023
2	Netaji Nagar	4,855	March 2025
3	Sarojini Nagar	10,655	March 2025
4	Mohammadpur	745	March 2025
5	Thyagraj Nagar	740	March 2025
6	Kasturba Nagar	3,678	March 2025
7	Sriniwaspuri	4,994	March 2025

V. **Physical and Financial Progress:**

SI No	Colony	Physical Progress	Financial Progress
1	Nauroji Nagar	37%	40%
2	Netaji Nagar	5%	5%
3	Sarojini Nagar	5%	5%
4	Mohammadpur	65%	40%
5	Thyagraj Nagar	75%	48%
6	Kasturba Nagar	3%	2%

7	Sriniwaspuri	2%	2%
---	--------------	----	----

Provision of compensation for delay of work is made in the Clause 2 of General Condition of Contract of CPWD.

The provision of compensation for delay in contract agreement with contractor is kept @ 1% per month, subject to 10% of Contract Value.

NBCC and CPWD have well defined contract provision for imposition of liquidated damages on contractors /sub-contractor for delay attributable to them.

East Kidwai Nagar project: The provisions of LD in contract agreement with contractor were kept but since the project was completed on 30.11.2020 and no LD have been levied to any of contractor.

Motibagh: As stated above, the Project had been completed in the year 2012, However, liquidated damages had been imposed on some contractors.

Redevelopment of seven GPRA colonies:

NBCC: The provision of LD in contract agreement with contractor is kept @ 0.5% per week, subject to maximum of 10% of Contract value.

CPWD: The provision of compensation for delay in contract agreement with contractor is kept @ 1 % per month, subject to maximum of 10% of Contract value.

With respect to the information sought on the issue of variation in the number of houses to be added at different points of time, it is mentioned that housing stock available or in pipeline is extremely dynamic in nature as it gets affected by numerous factors like:

1. Addition of new housing stock.
2. Demolition of unsafe housing stock.
3. Changes in status of house in e-Sampada like unsafe, major repair etc.
4. Change of pool of houses like transferred to and from Departmental Pools.

As a result, the housing stock, due to its fluid character, is impacted by several causes acting at the same time or at separate periods.

It is mentioned that while taking over 120 Type-VII flats at DDU Marg recently, 34 nos. of the flats have been placed in Lok Sabha Pool vide this Directorate's OM No. 23011/2/2022-Pol.III dated 07.02.2022 on the basis of request received from them. Similar request has also been received from Rajya Sabha Sectt. for placing 30 houses.

The information in respect of the requests received from various 'Departmental Pools' seeking an increase in allotment of houses and action taken by DoE to cater to the needs expressed.

The issue of assessment of demand of houses for next 5-10 years is dynamic in nature. As it is not possible to find out how many of the persons joining the Central Government opt for Govt Accommodation. There is increasing demand due to inflow of Government servants to the National Capital Territory for taking up new assignments and also new offices are formed, new posts are created and the existing strength of the organizations also increase which increases the demand.

Government of India is undertaking the process of augmentation of housing stock under GPRA viz. Construction of new residential units and redevelopment of existing general pool residential colonies etc. continuously. The redevelopment projects in Kidwai Nagar (East) and the seven other colonies i.e. Sarojini Nagar, Nauroji Nagar, Netaji Nagar, Kasturba Nagar, Thyagraj Nagar, Srinaivaspuri, and Mohammadpur have been taken up which will increase the available number of units to approx 15,000 units and proposed construction of new units at Ghitorni etc. would increase the number of dwelling units to around 24,000 in the coming years. Among these houses, major share is of Type IV and below type houses meant for Group B and C Categories employees.”

9. Audit made the following observations:-

“PAC observed that there had been a persistent and acute shortage of 36-37 percent in housing stock of GPRA. The Committee also noted that redevelopment and construction projects initiated to increase the housing stock were delayed. It recommended that the DPRs of all the projects be reviewed and specific time frames prescribed for each task to be carried out and appropriate measures taken urgently for expediting all necessary approvals.

As per ATR, approval in case of some of the colonies was still pending while in case of some others, approval had been obtained. Tentative timeline in respect of seven colonies has been given by the DoE.

Documents in support of social infrastructures vacated and demolished, meetings held with various authorities, and approval of all the statutory authorities referred to in the reply were not produced to Audit. Therefore, Audit could not substantiate the facts.

The satisfaction level is still very low and redevelopment/construction projects are still under progress, hence PAC may be apprised of updated position at regular intervals.

Final outcome is still awaited; updated position may be intimated to PAC.”

10. The Ministry gave the following response to audit remarks:-

“NBCC has been appointed as implementing agency for 3 GPRA colonies – Nauroji Nagar, Sarojini Nagar & Netaji Nagar and CPWD has been appointed as implementing agency for 4 GPRA colonies – Mohammadpur, Thyagraj Nagar, Srinivaspuri and Kasturba Nagar. Updated status is as follows:

I. **Removal of Encroachment** – Various meeting /correspondence has been done with L&DO, MoHUA, DUSIB and concerned division. Matter is currently Sub-Judice.

A. Jhuggies

* **Nauroji Nagar -**

- 4 unauthorised Jhuggies have been removed from the project site. However they have camped outside the boundary and have filed writ petition.
- Next date of hearing is 21.11.2022

* **Sarojini Nagar:**

- All 146 Jhuggies were found ineligible under Rehabilitation policy.
- Eviction notice issued by L&DO.
- Petitioner approached Hon'ble Supreme Court.
- Court appointed nodal officer from L&DO for verification of documents.
- Out of 146 numbers Jhuggies only 136 petitioners approached L&DO with requisite details.
- Out of these 136 numbers Jhuggies, 135 numbers were physically verified at site and one structure was not found existing in the area.
- DUSIB (Delhi Urban Shelter Improvement Board) was requested to conduct EDC (Eligibility Determination Committee) for survey done on site. DUSIB informed that these Jhuggies are not covered under Rehabilitation & Relocation Policy, 2015.
- The matter is currently sub-judice. Next date of hearing is 05.12.2022 (not listed).

* **Netaji Nagar:**

- All 65 Jhuggies were found ineligible under Rehabilitation policy.
- Eviction notice issued by L&DO.
- Petitions filed in the Hon'ble High Court.
- Stayed by the Hon'ble High Court.
- Matter is currently sub-judice with next date of hearing on 14.03.2023.

* **Mohammadpur:**

- 7 numbers Jhuggies removed on 12.04.2022.

* **Thyagraj Nagar, Srinivaspuri & Kasturba Nagar.**

- DUSIB identified 113 numbers Jhuggies as eligible for alternative accommodation.

- CPWD requested DDA to provide 113 numbers flats for allotment with total approx. cost of Rs. 2 Cr.
- DUSIB completed process of draw on 15.07.2022. Possession letter to be issued after completing documentation.
- Jhuggies dwellers approached Hon'ble High Court of Delhi in case of Kasturba Nagar and the District & Session Judge (South) Saket Court in case of Srinivaspuri.
- Matter is sub-judice. Next date of hearing is 21.12.2022 for Kasturba Nagar and 21.12.2022 for Srinivaspuri.

B. Religious Structure:

- Total 53 numbers religious structure found in these colonies. Religious Committee has recommended removal of 45 numbers of religious structure and the same is forwarded to the Hon'ble LG through Minister.
- In the case of 6 structures, as per recommendation of religious committee, the Land owing agency organized meeting involving all stake holders and notice sent to area MP/MLA/Councilor and local police.
- Meeting of religious committee under chairmanship of the Secretary (Home) GNCTD held on 11.10.2022 with all stakeholders. Religious committee recommended removal of these 6 structures and agreed to forward the same to the Hon'ble LG through Minister provided land owing agency provides 250 sqm area for accommodating these religious structures.
- In the case of balance 2 structures, there is no religious nature of structure and religious committee recommended removal of the same.

II. Status of Statutory Approvals

* **Nauroji Nagar:-** Approvals from all the statutory authorities have been obtained.

* **Netaji Nagar:**

- All Statutory approvals obtained except for Tree Transplantation / felling from Forest Department, GNCTD.
- Revised application for tree transplantation has been submitted phase wise. Approval for one package has been obtained.
- For all other packages, consent needs to be obtained from court for increased numbers of trees.
- Joint survey of affected trees at Netaji Nagar, Kasturba Nagar and Srinivaspuri has been completed by Forest Department on 17.06.2022.
- Joint affidavit for transplantation of trees has been filed in the Hon'ble High Court.
- 1st hearing held on 31.08.2022 followed by 26.09.2022. Next date of hearing is on 28.11.2022.

* **Sarojini Nagar:**

- All Statutory approval obtained except for Tree Transplantation felling from Forest Department, GNCTD.
- Revised application for tree transplantation has been submitted in five phases. Approval obtained for two phase/packages. Approvals for other phases are in consideration with Forest Department.

* **Mohammadpur**– Approvals from all the statutory authorities have been obtained.

* **Thyagraj Nagar** – Approvals from all the statutory authorities have been obtained.

* **Srinivaspuri& Kasturba Nagar:**

- All Statutory approvals have been obtained except for Tree Transplantation felling permission from Forest Department, GNCTD.
- Consent needs to be obtained from court for increased number of trees.
- Joint survey of affected trees at Netaji Nagar, Kasturba Nagar and Srinivaspuri was completed by Forest Department on 17.06.2022.
- Joint affidavit for transplantation of trees has been submitted in High Court.
- 1st hearing held on 31.08.2022 followed by 26.09.2022. Next date of hearing is 28.11.2022.

III Timelines for Housing Stock: The work of Netaji Nagar, Sarojini Nagar, Srinivaspuri and Kasturba Nagar are being taken up in phases. Tentative timeline for their completion is as follows:

Sl	Colony	Tentative Timeline
1	Nauroji Nagar	30.06.2023
2	Netaji Nagar	30.06.2025
3	Sarojini Nagar	31.12.2025
4	Mohammadpur	30.09.2022
5	Thyagraj Nagar	30.09.2022
6	Kasturba Nagar	31.12.2024
7	Srinivaspuri	31.12.2024

IV Physical and Financial Progress:

Sl	Colony	Physical Progress	Financial Progress
1	Nauroji Nagar	60%	58%
2	Netaji Nagar	12%	8%
3	Sarojini Nagar	16%	8%

4	Mohammadpur	100%	98%
5	Thyagraj Nagar	100%	96%
6	Kasturba Nagar	9%	6%
7	Srinivaspuri	2%	2%

NBCC and CPWD have well defined contract provision for imposition of liquidated damages on contractor / sub-contractor for delay attributable to them.

NBCC: The provision of LD in contract agreement with contractor is kept @ 0.5% per week, subject to 10% of Contract value.

CPWD: The provision of compensation for delay in contract agreement with contractor is kept @ 1% per month, subject to 10% of Contract value.

Documents in support of approval of the statutory and other authorities are enclosed."

11. Observing that there were delays in redevelopment and construction projects for augmenting the housing stock, the *Committee* had recommended reviewing the Detailed Project Reports of all the projects; prescribing specific time frames for each task and taking appropriate measures for expediting all necessary approvals. The Committee had desired to be apprised of the steps taken in this regard, project-wise, alongwith the timelines for augmenting the housing stock on priority. The Committee had also desired to be apprised of the provisions pertaining to imposition of liquidated damages on contractors /sub-contractors of CPWD in cases of delays in adhering to timelines.

Further, observing that the figures pertaining to number of houses to be added was being constantly revised, the Committee had wished to be apprised of the reasons for the variation in the number as stated at different but short intervals of time. The Committee had also desired to be apprised of the requests received from various 'departmental pools' seeking an increase in allotment of houses and the action taken by the DoE to cater to the needs expressed. The Committee had recommended that the DoE may seek from all the Ministries/ Departments /Organisations that they are servicing, an estimate of the number of houses that might be needed in the next 5-10 years and accordingly, plan the required increase in the housing stock. The Committee had also recommended that the accommodation requirement of employees at the lower rung of the hierarchy i.e. employees of Group 'B' and 'C' categories may be assessed first and efforts made to provide accommodation to them on priority.

The Committee note from the reply of the Ministry that NBCC has been appointed as the implementing agency for 3 General Pool Residential Accommodation (GPRA) colonies - Nauroji Nagar, Sarojini Nagar & Netaji Nagar and CPWD has been appointed as the implementing agency for 4 GPRA colonies- Mohammadpur, Thyagraj Nagar, Srinivaspuri and Kasturba Nagar. As for the progress of the project, the Committee note that all statutory approvals have

been taken for the seven sites except for the one pertaining to tree transplantation / felling from forest department, GNCTD and the matter is sub-judice. With regard to removal of Encroachments viz. jhuggies and religious structures, the matters are sub-judice for all colonies except Mohammadpur (encroachment has been removed in the colony). The Committee note in this regard that various meetings/correspondence have been undertaken between the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs, Land and Development Office (L&DO); Delhi Urban Shelter Improvement Board (DSUIB) and other agencies concerned. Nevertheless, the Committee are of the opinion that surveys of sites for removal/transplantation of trees and planning for removal of encroachments/religious structures in a project of such large magnitude should have been done at the initial stage of planning itself. This would have obviated the delays that the project has faced in the last many years. Apart from causing inconvenience to the government employees who have been relocated, the Directorate would have also lost a substantial amount in terms of licence fee owing to the delay in completion of the projects. The Committee, therefore, recommend that DOE may henceforth, give proper attention to the various aspects of planning for a project before putting the same into execution. The Committee desire the Ministry to give exclusive attention to completion of these projects and help in resolving bottlenecks. The Committee recommend that the timelines prescribed for completion of housing units in all the sites may be scrupulously adhered to and steps taken for early resolution of matters. The Committee desire to be apprised of the number of housing units constructed / to be constructed in Nauroji Nagar.

As regards seeking an estimate of houses that might be needed in the near future from Ministries/ Departments /Organisations that the DOE is servicing, the Committee are disconcerted with the vague reply of the Ministry which essentially states that the requirement of houses is dynamic in nature and that it is not possible to find out how many houses will be needed despite the understanding that there will be an increased demand. The Committee also note that the DOE is planning to construct housing units in Ghitorni. The Committee are of the considered opinion that instead of building houses merely in anticipation of increase in demand, objectively estimating the number of houses that various Departments / Ministries would need, can contribute towards better management of the accommodation requirements.

Recommendation at Para No. 2 - Physical Verification of housing stock

12. *Physical verification of housing stock available with DOE was to be carried out by CPWD. The Committee had noted that while physical verification was carried out in 2008, according to DOE, it was not of much use as it was not executed and furnished in the desired format with the requisite details. The Committee had observed that a comprehensive physical verification drive of the housing stock was to be carried out from April, 2020, which was put on hold due to COVID-19 pandemic. Instead, as an alternative, digital enumeration of housing stock had been completed by reconciling the*

databases of eAwas and CPWD. As one of the premier managers of public real estate assets, it was imperative that DoE maintain an accurate record of housing stock which may be updated at regular intervals. The Committee had been of the view that physical verification of the housing stock was needed to be done urgently by DoE in co-ordination with CPWD in a time bound manner, and the Committee apprised thereof. The Committee had also been of the view that all the properties of the DoE need to be geo-tagged so as to enable regular monitoring and updating of the stock on real time basis. The Committee had also desired that physical verification of housing stock be carried out at regular intervals.

13. The Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs in their Action Taken Notes have submitted as under:

“As per the Observation of the PAC physical verification of the housing stock needs to be done urgently by DoE in coordination with CPWD in a time bound manner. However, due to Covid/Omicron conditions prevailed no such physical verification has been conducted so far in coordination with CPWD. However, some physical verification of houses are being conducted by DoE wherever required. Further, it is a time consuming process and it will take time to get it done with limited staff who have other daily work and in coordination with the staff of CPWD.

Further, a proposal is under consideration in geo-tagging of the properties of DoE in Computer Cell DoE. If that is materialized, there is little need for physical verification of house.”

14. Audit in their vetting comments have stated the following:-

“Physical verification may be got conducted and geo-tagging done. Progress may be intimated to PAC.”

15. The Ministry have submitted the following in response to Audit observations:-

“In respect of Geo-Tagging project, NIC has submitted its proposal regarding Geo-Tagging of properties of DOE. A detailed scrutiny of financial and operational aspects and its implications of proposal are currently underway.”

16. The Committee had desired that physical verification of the housing stock may be carried out urgently by DoE in co-ordination with CPWD in a time bound manner and the practice continued at periodic intervals. The Committee had also desired that all the properties of the DoE may be geo-tagged so as to enable regular monitoring and updating of the stock on real time basis. The Committee are disappointed to note the reply of the Ministry which states that no physical verification of their housing stock has been conducted yet and the process will take time to be completed, particularly due to limited staff. The core service of

Directorate of Estates being to administer the allotment of Government Residential Accommodation to officers/officials of eligible offices of Government of India; the importance of maintaining an accurate record of the housing stock cannot be emphasized enough. Without having a regularly updated record of their housing stock, DOE would not be able to carry out their main responsibility. The Committee note from the reply of the Ministry wherein it has been stated that since a proposal for geo-tagging of properties of DoE is under consideration, there is little need for physical verification of houses. The Committee further note that a detailed scrutiny of financial and operational aspects and implications of NIC's proposal of geo tagging of properties of DOE is underway. The Committee feel that physical verification of the housing stock needs to be taken up urgently as the proposal for geo tagging is only under consideration as of now. The Committee also feel that it would be much easier to geo-tag the properties with latest and accurate record of housing stock in hand. Further, physical verification will not only help in assessing the numbers but also in ascertaining the actual condition and usage of the properties of DoE. The Committee, therefore, reiterate their earlier recommendation that the work of verification may be taken up on warfooting. The Committee also desire to be apprised of the steps taken to rationalise the utilisation of existing staff in DOE. The Committee urge the Ministry to expedite the scrutiny of the proposal of geo-tagging and implement the same within a crisp time-frame. The Committee desire that once geo-tagging is put in practice the newly built houses be geo-tagged as soon as completion certificate is given.

Recommendation at Para No. 3- Satisfaction levels

17. *The Committee had noted that satisfaction level for each type of accommodation refers to availability position of residential accommodation for the Central Government Employees vis-à-vis the demand for housing. The Committee had noted that a Prioritization Committee set up in the MoHUA prescribed a satisfaction level of 50% in cities other than Delhi and 70 % in Delhi. The Committee had observed that for the biggest pool i.e. GP (General pool), the satisfaction level which was already much less than the prescribed level at 44% in 2011, further declined to 31% in 2014 whereas for TN (Tenure Pool) pool, it declined further from 33% in 2011 to 27% in 2014. The Committee were aware that for addressing this issue, the MoHUA/DoE were striving to increase the number of housing units to approximately 24,000. The Committee had been of the view that since the purpose of creation of 'exclusive pools' was to lessen the waiting time and ensure easy availability of houses to identified categories of applicants, the 'pools' needed to be managed in such a way as to keep the 'satisfaction levels' in all the 'pools' at comparable levels. The Committee, while noting the wide variation in the 'satisfaction levels' which results in longer waiting time for GP, TN, LM and LS pools had desired that corrective measures be taken by way of timely exchange of houses amongst the pools as well as augmentation of the housing stock. The Committee had also been of the opinion that measuring the 'satisfaction levels' should not only be*

based on mapping of availability of houses vis-à-vis the demand, but should also include aspects such as the actual level of satisfaction of residents and the quality of construction/ repair and services being offered by the maintenance agencies concerned.

The Committee, while noting that a number of complaints are being received regarding seepage or wear and tear in newly built houses, had desired that periodic appraisal of the performance of agencies such as CPWD/NBCC be done so as to enable in improving the services provided by them. The Committee had also desired that appropriate action be taken against the officials found responsible for negligence on the basis of the appraisal and penalties imposed on the contractors/ sub-contractors for 'unsatisfactory work' that may have been executed. The Committee had desired to be apprised of the steps taken in this direction.

The Committee had also desired that an assessment may be made for ascertaining the costs incurred on providing accommodation to the Government employees vis-a-vis the efficiency and care with which 'housing stock' is being maintained.

18. The Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs in the Action Taken Notes have submitted as under:

"As of 04-03-2022, the current level of satisfaction for General Pool Residential Accommodation is 79.62% for New Delhi, which is much higher than 70%.

In order to maintain comparable levels of different 'exclusive pools' such as TN, TP and GP Pool, Policy Division has issued guidelines vide DoE's OM No. 12035/11/2002-Pol.II (Vol. IV)(Part 1) dated 07.09.2020 As per these guidelines, TP houses not opted by TP Pool Officers for 2 months continuously shall be transferred first to TN Pool for bidding through ASA, further if these houses are not opted by TN Pool officers for 2 months continuously, then they will be transferred to GP Pool for bidding through ASA.

All houses / buildings constructed under CPWD are handed over to the clients / maintenance units after removal of all defects, including attending to seepage etc. Further, any defects noticed during defect liability period are also got rectified from the contractor who constructed the houses / buildings. As per contract provisions Security Deposit is released only after defects liability period is over.

The project of redevelopment of seven GPRA colonies at Delhi (Nauroji Nagar, Mohammad Pur, Netaji Nagar, Thyagraj Nagar, Kasturba Nagar, Srinivaspuri and Sarojini Nagar) is still under construction phase. However suitable precautionary measures are being taken in the projects.

Regarding newly built flats in Kidwai Nagar East, General Pool Residential Accommodations of East Kidwai Nagar had been handed over in phased manner starting from 2018 to 2020. It was completely handed / taken over on 30.11.2020.

There are 4608 flats comprising of 13,472 toilet/bathrooms, 4608 kitchens and many water points in the society.

During this period, the seepages / leakage and other issues were taken up with the deployed agencies and same were rectified. These defects were minor in nature and rectified and thus required no disciplinary action against Engineers/Employees. During the Defect Liability Period (DLP) period (30.11.2020 to 30.11.2021), the contractors / agencies attended all the observed points of seepages / leakages. Now, this GPRA colony of East Kidwai Nagar is under maintenance of NBCC. The day to day issues related to seepages / leakages are being attended by the maintenance agency. NBCC attends and resolves all the complaints received from the residents on priority basis. These are also recorded in the data base on daily basis in order to review on daily / weekly and monthly basis depending on the nature of complaints. Suitable steps are taken to rectify the same at earliest. Additionally, reviews and inspections of site are also done on weekly basis to ensure the preventive maintenance. NBCC has also circulated the feedback forms to the residents. The suggestions / complaints received through these feedback forms, NBCC acts accordingly to improve the services.

Provision regarding action to be taken against the officials found responsible for negligence on the basis of the appraisal and penalties imposed on the contractors/ sub-contractors for 'unsatisfactory work' that may have been executed, is already made in CPWD works manual 2019 under chapter – 7. The Quality Assurance of Technical Audit Wing conducts the inspection of works time to time as per CPWD Work Manual 2019 Chapter-7 and suitable penalty is recommended by it against the officials found guilty for unsatisfactory work.

Redevelopment of seven GPRA colonies:

The project of redevelopment of seven GPRA colonies is still under construction phase. However suitable precautionary measures are being taken in the projects. East Kidwai Nagar: GPRA East Kidwai Nagar was being handed over in phased manner starting from 2018 to 2020. It was completely handed /taken over by 30.11.2020.

During this period the seepage /leakage and other issues were taken up with the deployed agencies and same were rectified. These defects were minor in nature and rectified which requires no disciplinary action against Engineers/Employees. During DLP period (30.11.2020 to 30.11.2021) the contractors / agencies also attended all the observed points of seepages/leakages. Now this GPRA colony of East Kidwai Nagar is under maintenance. The day to day issues related with seepages/ leakages are being attended by the maintenance agency.

Total incurred cost Rs. 4015 Cr. (approx.). for GPRA Kidwai Nagar (East) which includes Social Infrastructure Buildings and comprising of different Type of flats

(from Type II to Type VII.): There are 780 flats/Type II, 1025 flats/Type III, 1472 flats/Type IV, 1078 flats/Type V, 192 flats/Type VI, & 61 flats/Type VII (Total flats 4608 nos.) have been developed including all External Development works.

The Maintenance of GPRA Kidwai Nagar (East) started in phased manner as per handing over of the flats / towers since 2018. Till date total incurred cost on maintenance is Rs. 54.8 Cr (this cost on maintenance is for 4 years approximately.)

The maintenance works of this GPRA Colony is being looked after by NBCC. All the points/complaints raised by the occupants are being attended in a time bound manner through Community App and telephonically up to the satisfaction of the occupants. Thus proper care is being taken as maintenance works is carried out by NBCC."

19. Audit have given the following observations:-

"DoE stated that as on 04/03/2022 level of satisfaction for GPRA is 79.62 per cent and in order to maintain comparable levels of different 'exclusive pools' such as TN, TP and GP Pool, Policy Division has issued guidelines dated 07/09/2020. As per these guidelines, TP houses not opted by TP Pool Officers for 2 months continuously shall be transferred first to TN Pool for bidding through ASA, further if these houses are not opted by TN Pool officers for 2 months continuously, then they will be transferred to GP Pool for bidding through ASA.

However, the DoE has not explained how it has helped to reduce the variation in satisfaction level and to what extent.

DoE has not furnished any further action taken in this regard.

The reply that, defects were minor in nature and rectified at the earliest and required no disciplinary action against Engineers/Employees should be seen in the light that during verification of response of Ministry, it was seen that many complaints of seepages were lodged through various modes. This is indicative of deficient workmanship and sub standard quality of execution.

However, DoE has furnished details in respect of only one colony that is GPRA Kidwai Nagar (East).

It stated that total incurred cost Rs. 4015 crore (approximately) for GPRA Kidwai Nagar (East) which includes Social Infrastructure Buildings and comprising of different Type of flats that have been developed including all External Development works. Till date total incurred cost on maintenance is Rs. 54.8 Cr (this cost of maintenance is for 4 years approximately.)

No further comments"

20. The Ministry have submitted the following in response to Audit observations:-

“Such types of minor defects of leakages/seepages are the teething issues noticed during the initial phase of occupancy, which normally happens in any newly constructed structure. Further, same has been promptly attended and rectified during the Defect Liability period.”

21. Observing that the satisfaction levels with the accommodation with respect to the prescribed norms was low, the Committee had desired that corrective measures be taken by way of timely exchange of houses amongst the ‘pools’ as well as augmenting the housing stock. The Committee had also been of the opinion that measuring the ‘satisfaction levels’ should not only be based on mapping of availability of houses vis-à-vis the demand, but should also include aspects such as the actual level of satisfaction of residents and the quality of construction/ repair and services being offered by the maintenance agencies concerned. The Committee had, therefore, recommended that periodic appraisal of the performance of agencies such as CPWD/NBCC be done so as to enable in improving the services provided by them. The Committee had also recommended that appropriate action be taken against the officials found responsible for negligence on the basis of the appraisal and penalties imposed on the contractors/ sub-contractors for ‘unsatisfactory work’ that may have been executed.

The Committee note from the response of the Ministry in this regard that Policy Division has issued relevant guidelines for transfer of houses amongst pools. The Committee, however, note from the observation of the Audit that the satisfaction levels continue to be very low. The Committee, while noting from the reply of the Ministry that the satisfaction level is 79.62% desire to be apprised of the extent of increase in satisfaction levels as a corollary to exchange of houses between ‘pools’. The information may be given in tabular form for the last five years.

Regarding alternative methods of measuring satisfaction levels, the Committee observe that NBCC circulates feedback forms to residents in Kidwai Nagar East (which is the only site that has been allotted to occupants) and acts accordingly to improve the services. The Committee are, however, disappointed to note that no information has been provided on appraisal of performance of maintenance agencies. Since the satisfaction of the public being serviced by these agencies is paramount, the Committee wish to be apprised of the mechanism by which the Ministry/ DOE review the performance of NBCC; assess the actual level of satisfaction of residents and the quality of construction/ repair and services being offered by these maintenance agencies. The Committee also desire to be apprised of the manner of assessment of services offered by CPWD.

As regards, action against officers/ contractors for shoddy work, the Committee observe that all houses / buildings constructed under CPWD are handed over to the clients / maintenance units after removal of all defects, including attending to seepage etc. and any defects noticed during defect liability period are also rectified by the contractor. As per contract provisions Security Deposit is released only after defects liability period is over.

The Committee further note from the reply of the Ministry that in Kidwai Nagar East, defects of seepage/leakage etc were minor in nature and were rectified and thus no disciplinary action was required against Engineers/Employees and that During the Defect Liability Period (DLP) period (30.11.2020 to 30.11.2021), the contractors / agencies attended to all the points of seepages / leakages that came to notice. The Committee, however, note the Audit's submission on the matter that during verification of response of Ministry, it was seen that many complaints of seepage were lodged through various modes. The Committee are, therefore, inclined to disapprove of the reply of the Ministry that such type of defects of leakages/seepages are teething issues noticed during the initial phase of occupancy and normally happen in any newly constructed structure. Seepages in newly constructed houses particularly when extensive may be indicative of deficient workmanship and sub standard quality of execution of work. The Committee, therefore, reiterate that appropriate action may be taken against the officials found responsible for negligence on the basis of penalties imposed on the contractors/ sub-contractors for execution of unsatisfactory and inferior work.

CHAPTER II**OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT****Observation/Recommendation****Augmentation of Housing Stock**

The Committee note that maintenance of housing stock is one of the primary responsibilities of the Directorate of Estates. The Committee observe that there has been a persistent and acute shortage of 36-37 percent in housing stock of General Pool Residential Accommodation. This is despite the fact that actual demand for houses had gone down from 98789 in 2008 to 82803 in September 2020. The Committee are intrigued by the inability of the Directorate of Estates (DOE)/ Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs (MOHUA) in augmenting the much-needed housing stock. The Committee note from the action taken notes submitted in this regard in 2016 that with a view to increasing the housing stock, redevelopment and construction projects were initiated at various locations across Delhi, for raising the number of dwelling units to approximately 24,000 by the year 2022. However, on examining the status of various redevelopment projects, the Committee find that there have been delays mainly on account of encumbrances pertaining to vacation of schools, markets, community centres, CGHS dispensaries, Kendriya Bhandars, IGL Gas pipelines etc., and also due to encroachments; as also delays in obtaining approvals for re-plantation of trees from Delhi Forest Department as well as other agencies involved, and PILs filed in NGT and Delhi High Court. The Committee feel that due to lack of proper planning on the part of the Ministry, there has been an impasse. They are of the view that when such developmental/construction projects are taken up where schools, market places, Community Centres, CGHS Dispensaries etc. need to be shifted/re-located, preparatory works should have been initiated simultaneously in order to ensure that the project is executed in an unhindered manner. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Detailed Project Reports of all the projects be reviewed and specific time frames prescribed for each task to be carried out and appropriate measures taken urgently for expediting all necessary approvals. The Committee may be apprised of the steps taken in this regard, project-wise, alongwith the timelines for augmenting the housing stock on priority. The Committee would also like to be apprised of the provisions pertaining to imposition of liquidated damages on contractors /sub-contractors of CPWD in cases of delays in adhering to timelines.

The Committee are perplexed to note that the figures pertaining to number of houses to be added is being constantly revised by the DoE. While in August 2020, the Ministry had informed that a total of 4599 houses had been added and approximately 30000 more were in pipeline, in July 2021, it was stated that 6254 houses have been added and approximately 26000 more houses are to be added. The Committee, therefore, desire to be apprised of the reasons for the variation in the number of houses to be added as stated at different points of time, that too at short intervals. The Committee would like to be apprised of the requests received from various 'departmental pools' seeking an increase in allotment of houses and

the action taken by the DoE to cater to the needs expressed. The Committee further desire the DoE to seek from all the Ministries/ Departments /Organisations that they are servicing, an estimate of the number of houses that might be needed in the next 5-10 years and thereafter plan the required increase in the housing stock accordingly. The Committee also desire that the accommodation requirement of employees at the lower rung of the hierarchy i.e. employees of Group 'B' and 'C' categories may be assessed first and efforts made to provide accommodation to them on priority.

**[Recommendation No. 1 of the 41st Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(17th Lok Sabha)]**

Action Taken

The position of demand and availability for general pool residential accommodation is as on 04-03-2022. The overall percentage of satisfaction is 79.62%.

The government has taken various steps to bridge the gap between demand and availability by construction of new residential units or redevelopment of existing government colonies. Six colonies (Netaji Nagar, Kasturba Nagar, Sarojini Nagar, Srinivaspuri, Thyagraj Nagar, Mohammadpur) are currently under construction or redevelopment and after redevelopment, total number of quarters in these colonies will increase from 12970 to 25667. After completion of all projects, 100% satisfaction may be achieved.

Further, The project of redevelopment of four GPRA colonies is governed by the stipulations in the note for cabinet approval and MoU thereof. Though there was some delays in shifting of social infra-structure which are mainly owned/operated by other municipal / statutory bodies, the major delays are due to :-

- iv) The stay imposed on the work by Hon'ble NGT and Hon'ble high court of Delhi. Further Hon'ble high court of Delhi, while vacating the stay, directed to obtain fresh approvals to the revised proposals which were prepared to reduce the number of trees affected on the direction of the court.
- v) Due to the 1st and 2nd wave of COVID 19 pandemic, not only the ongoing works were affected but also had serious setbacks due to returning of migrant labourers.
- vi) The project is of self sustainable finance model and the cost of construction is to be met by sale of commercial BUA (Built Up Area). Due to the subdued real estate market and Covid-19 pandemic, the sale of commercial BUA and thereby cash flow of the project is affected. This has led to taking up the work in phases.

CPWD has been appointed as implementing agency for four GPRA colonies – Mohammadpur, Thyagraj Nagar, Srinivaspuri and Kasturba Nagar. Action taken on various points raised by committee are as follows:

I. Vacation of Social Infrastructure and Shifting of Public Amenities: Extensive meetings and follow ups have been made with concerned department for vacation of social infrastructure and shifting of amenities.

v) **Mohammadpur:** All social infrastructures have been vacated and demolished.

vi) **Thyagraj Nagar:** All social infrastructures have been vacated and demolished.

vii) **Srinivaspuri:** Various meetings have and follow ups have been held with concerned parties and department / authorities of SDM for vacation / shifting of various social infrastructures like market, school etc. It is planned to construct the new social infrastructure like market, Barat Ghar, School etc. before their shifting.

viii) **Kasturba Nagar:** Various meetings have and follow ups have been held with concerned parties and department / authorities of SDM for vacation / shifting of various social infrastructures like market, school etc. It is planned to construct the new social infrastructure like market, Barat Ghar, School etc. before their shifting.

Further issue of Shifting of public amenities like IGL Pipe line, Sewer lines etc. have been raised with concerned authorities and demands raised towards the same is being deposited from time to time. The shifting works is getting delayed in Kasturba Nagar by the BSES & DJB.

II. Removal of Encroachment: Various meeting / correspondence have been done with L&DO, MoHUA and Delhi Urban Shelter Improvement Board (DUSIB).

Mohammadpur, Thyagraj Nagar, Srinivaspuri & Kasturba Nagar:

iii) **Jhuggies:**

Various meeting / correspondence have been done with L&DO, MoHUA, DUSIB etc. A meeting under the chairmanship of Director (UD) was held on 29.10.2021 in presence of NBCC, CPWD, L&DO and DUSIB Officials. It was directed that DUSIB and representative from L&DO shall inspect and determine the eligibility of Jhuggies for alternate accommodation as per DUSIB Policy. The sites have been visited by the DUSIB officials.

iv) **Encroachments:**

Various correspondences have been made with L&DO for removal of encroachment from the colonies.

III. Status of Statutory Approvals:

v) **Mohammadpur:** Approvals from all the statutory authorities have been obtained.

vi) **Thyagraj Nagar:** Approvals from all the statutory authorities have been obtained.

- vii) **Sriniwaspuri:** The project has been divided in three phases. All Statutory Approvals have been obtained except for Tree Transplantation/felling permission from forest Department, GNCTD.
- viii) **Kasturba Nagar:** The project has been divided in two phases. All Statutory Approvals have been obtained. Tree Transplantation/felling permission obtained for phase-1.

IV. Time lines for housing stock:

Sl. No.	Colony	No. of GPRA units	Tentative Timeline
1.	Mohammad pur	745	March 2025
2.	Thyagraj Nagar	740	March 2025
3.	Kasturba Nagar	3678	March 2025
4.	Sriniwaspuri	4994	March 2025

The work of Sriniwaspuri and Kasturba Nagar are being taken up in phases. Tentative timeline for their completion is as follows:

V. Physical and Financial Progress:

Sl. No.	Colony	Physical Progress	Financial Progress
1.	Mohammadpur	65%	40%
2.	Thyagraj Nagar	75%	48%
3.	Kasturba Nagar	3%	2%
4.	Sriniwaspuri	2%	2%

New Moti Bagh: Project was completed in the year 2012, almost ten year back. Now NBCC India Limited is looking after the maintenance work of NMB and so far there are no any major issues of leakage and seepage observed.

East Kidwai Nagar:

To address the complaints & feedback of the residents, NBCC has in place a CMS (Complaint Management System) through which any resident can register their complaint telephonically /physically. As per the nature of complaints, the maintenance agency/ contractor resolve the issues at the earliest.

The redressal of complaints/ feedback of the residents are dealt with as per the terms and conditions of the agreement between NBCC & Maintenance Agency/Contractor.

Redevelopment of seven GPRA colonies:

Redevelopment of seven GPRA colonies project is governed by the stipulations in the note for cabinet approval and MoU thereof. Though there was some delays in shifting of social infra structure which are mainly owned/operated by other municipal/statutory bodies, the major delays are due to:-

- The stay imposed on the work by Hon'ble NGT and Hon'ble high court of Delhi. Further, Hon'ble high court of Delhi, while vacating the stay, directed to obtain fresh approvals to the revised proposals which were prepared to reduce the number of trees affected on the direction of the court.
- Due to the 1st and 2nd wave of Covid 19 pandemic, not only the ongoing works were affected but also had serious setbacks due to returning of migrant labourers.
- The project is of self sustainable finance model and the cost of construction is to be met by sale of commercial BUA. Due to the subdued real estate market and Covid 19 pandemic, the sale of commercial BUA and thereby cash flow of the project is affected. This has led to taking up the work in phases.

NBCC has been appointed as implementing agency for 3 GPRA colonies - Nauroji Nagar, Sarojini Nagar & Netaji Nagar and CPWD has been appointed as implementing agency for 4 GPRA colonies- Mohammadpur, Thyagraj Nagar, Srinivaspuri and Kasturba Nagar. Action taken on various points raised by committee are as follows:

VI. **Vacation of Social Infrastructure and Shifting of Public Amenities:-** Extensive meetings and follow ups have been made with concerned department for vacation of social infrastructure and shifting of amenities.

- **Nauroji Nagar** - All social infrastructures have been vacated and demolished.
- **Netaji Nagar & Sarojini Nagar** – Various meetings have and follow ups have been held with concerned parties and department/authorities of NDMC for vacation/ Shifting of various social Infrastructures like market, School etc. It is planned to construct the new social infrastructure like market, Barat Ghar, School etc before their shifting.

Further issue of Shifting of public amenities like IGL Pipe line, Sewer lines etc have been raised with concerned authorities and demands raised towards the same is being deposited by NBCC from time to time. The shifting works have been taken up by the respective organizations.

- **Mohammadpur** – All social Infrastructures have been vacated and demolished.

- **Thyagraj Nagar** – All social infrastructures have been vacated and demolished.
- **Srinivaspuri & Kasturba nagar** - Various meetings and follow ups have been held with concerned parties and department/authorities of SDMC for vacation/ Shifting of various social Infrastructures like market, School etc. It is planned to construct the new social infrastructure like market, Barat Ghar, School etc before their shifting.

Further issue of Shifting of public amenities like IGL Pipe line, Sewer lines etc have been raised with concerned authorities and demands raised towards the same is being deposited by CPWD from time to time. The shifting works is getting delayed in Kasturba Nagar by the BSES & DJB.

II. Removal of Encroachment- Various meeting /correspondence have been done with L&DO, MoHUA, DUSIB and concerned division.

- **Nauroji Nagar** – Encroachments have been partly shifted and is being persuaded with L&DO and religious committee.
- **Netaji and Sarojini Nagar:**

Jhuggies: Various meetings / correspondence have been done with L&DO, MoHUA, DUSIB etc. A meeting under the chairmanship of Director (DD) was held on 29.10.2021 in presence of NBCC, CPWD, L&DO and DUSIB Officials. It was directed that DUSIB and representative from L&DO shall inspect and determine the eligibility of Jhuggies for alternate accommodation as per DUSIB Policy. DUSIB has conducted the site visit on 09.11.2021. However the report is awaited.

Encroachments: Various correspondences have been made with concerned division for removal of encroachment at Pillanji Village. Last demolition drive was scheduled on 23.11.2021 but not happened due to non-availability of adequate police force. L&DO was intimated and requested to coordinate with DDA for further action on 23.11.2021.

- **Mohammadpur, Thyagraj Nagar, Srinivaspuri& Kasturba Nagar**

Jhuggies: Various meetings / correspondence have been done with L&DO, MoHUA, DUSIB etc. A meeting under the chairmanship of Director (DD) was held on 29.10.2021 in presence of NBCC, CPWD, L&DO and DUSIB Officials. It was directed that DUSIB and representative from L&DO shall inspect and determine the eligibility of Jhuggies for alternate accommodation as per DUSIB Policy. The sites have been visited by the DUSIB officials.

Encroachments: Various correspondences have been made with L&DO and concerned division for removal of encroachment from the colonies.

III. Status of Statutory Approvals

- **Nauroji Nagar** - Approvals from all the statutory authorities have been obtained
- **Netaji Nagar-**
 - * All Statutory Approvals obtained except for Tree Transplantation/ felling from Forest Dept, GNCTD.
 - * Revised application for tree transplantation has been submitted phase wise. Approval for one package has been obtained.
- **Sarojini Nagar-**
 - All Statutory Approvals obtained except for Tree Transplantation/ felling from Forest Dept, GNCTD.
 - Revised application for tree transplantation has been submitted in five phases. Approval obtained for two phases/packages. Approvals for other phases are in consideration at forest dept.
- **Thyagraj Nagar** - Approvals from all the statutory authorities have been obtained
- **Sriniwaspuri-** The project has been divided in three phases. All Statutory Approvals have been obtained except for Tree Transplantation/ felling permission from forest Dept, GNCTD.
- **Kasturba Nagar** - The project has been divided in two phases. All Statutory Approvals have been obtained. Tree Transplantation/ felling permission obtained for phase-1

IV. **Time lines for housing stock:** The work of Netaji Nagar, Sarojini Nagar, Sriniwaspuri and Kasturba Nagar are being taken up in phases. Tentative timeline for their completion is as follows:

SI No	Colony	No of GPRA units	Tentative Timeline
1	Nauroji Nagar	NIL	31.03.2023
2	Netaji Nagar	4,855	March 2025
3	Sarojini Nagar	10,655	March 2025
4	Mohammadpur	745	March 2025
5	Thyagraj Nagar	740	March 2025
6	Kasturba Nagar	3,678	March 2025
7	Sriniwaspuri	4,994	March 2025

V. Physical and Financial Progress:

SI No	Colony	Physical Progress	Financial Progress
1	Nauroji Nagar	37%	40%
2	Netaji Nagar	5%	5%
3	Sarojini Nagar	5%	5%
4	Mohammadpur	65%	40%
5	Thyagraj Nagar	75%	48%
6	Kasturba Nagar	3%	2%
7	Sriniwaspuri	2%	2%

Provision of compensation for delay of work is made in the Clause 2 of General Condition of Contract of CPWD.

The provision of compensation for delay in contract agreement with contractor is kept @ 1% per month, subject to 10% of Contract Value.

NBCC and CPWD have well defined contract provision for imposition of liquidated damages on contractors /sub-contractor for delay attributable to them.

East Kidwai Nagar project: The provisions of LD in contract agreement with contractor were kept but since the project was completed on 30.11.2020 and no LD have been levied to any of contractor.

Motibagh: As stated above, the Project had been completed in the year 2012, However, liquidated damages had been imposed on some contractors

Redevelopment of seven GPRA colonies:

NBCC: The provision of LD in contract agreement with contractor is kept @ 0.5% per week, subject to maximum of 10% of Contract value.

CPWD: The provision of compensation for delay in contract agreement with contractor is kept @ 1 % per month, subject to maximum of 10% of Contract value.

With respect to the information sought on the issue of variation in the number of houses to be added at different points of time, it is mentioned that housing stock available or in pipeline is extremely dynamic in nature as it gets affected by numerous factors like:

5. Addition of new housing stock.
6. Demolition of unsafe housing stock.
7. Changes in status of house in e-Sampada like unsafe, major repair etc.
8. Change of pool of houses like transferred to and from Departmental Pools.

As a result, the housing stock, due to its fluid character, is impacted by several causes acting at the same time or at separate periods.

It is mentioned that while taking over 120 Type-VII flats at DDU Marg recently, 34 nos. of the flats have been placed in Lok Sabha Pool vide this Directorate's OM No.

23011/2/2022-Pol.III dated 07.02.2022 on the basis of request received from them. Similar request has also been received from Rajya Sabha Sectt. for placing 30 houses.

The information in respect of the requests received from various 'Departmental Pools' seeking an increase in allotment of houses and action taken by DoE to cater to the needs expressed.

The issue of assessment of demand of houses for next 5-10 years is dynamic in nature. As it is not possible to find out how many of the persons joining the Central Government opt for Govt Accommodation. There is increasing demand due to inflow of Government servants to the National Capital Territory for taking up new assignments and also new offices are formed, new posts are created and the existing strength of the organizations also increase which increases the demand.

Government of India is undertaking the process of augmentation of housing stock under GPRA viz. Construction of new residential units and redevelopment of existing general pool residential colonies etc. continuously. The redevelopment projects in Kidwai Nagar (East) and the seven other colonies i.e. Sarojini Nagar, Nauroji Nagar, Netaji Nagar, Kasturba Nagar, Thyagraj Nagar, Srinaivaspuri, and Mohammadpur have been taken up which will increase the available number of units to approx 15,000 units and proposed construction of new units at Ghitorni etc. would increase the number of dwelling units to around 24,000 in the coming years. Among these houses, major share is of Type IV and below type houses meant for Group B and C Categories employees.

Audit's vetting comments on Ministry's ATN

PAC observed that there had been a persistent and acute shortage of 36-37 percent in housing stock of GPRA. The Committee also noted that redevelopment and construction projects initiated to increase the housing stock were delayed. It recommended that the DPRs of all the projects be reviewed and specific time frames prescribed for each task to be carried out and appropriate measures taken urgently for expediting all necessary approvals.

As per ATR, approval in case of some of the colonies was still pending while in case of some others, approval had been obtained. Tentative timeline in respect of seven colonies has been given by the DoE.

Documents in support of social infrastructures vacated and demolished, meetings held with various authorities, and approval of all the statutory authorities referred to in the reply were not produced to Audit. Therefore, Audit could not substantiate the facts.

The satisfaction level is still very low and redevelopment/construction projects are still under progress, hence PAC may be apprised of updated position at regular intervals.

Final outcome is still awaited; updated position may be intimated to PAC.

Ministry's further submission

NBCC has been appointed as implementing agency for 3 GPRA colonies – Nauroji Nagar, Sarojini Nagar & Netaji Nagar and CPWD has been appointed as implementing agency for 4 GPRA colonies – Mohammadpur, Thyagraj Nagar, Srinivaspuri and Kasturba Nagar. Updated status are as follows:

I. Removal of Encroachment – Various meeting /correspondence has been done with L&DO, MoHUA, DUSIB and concerned division. Matter is currently Sub-Judice.

A. Jhuggies

*** Nauroji Nagar -**

- 4 unauthorised Jhuggies have been removed from the project site. However they have camped outside the boundary and have filed writ petition.
- Next date of hearing is 21.11.2022

*** Sarojini Nagar:**

- All 146 Jhuggies were found ineligible under Rehabilitation policy.
- Eviction notice issued by L&DO.
- Petitioner approached Hon'ble Supreme Court.
- Court appointed nodal officer from L&DO for verification of documents
- Out of 146 numbers Jhuggies only 136 petitioners approached L&DO with requisite details
- Out of these 136 numbers Jhuggies, 135 numbers were physically verified at site and one structure was not found existing in the area
- DUSIB (Delhi Urban Shelter Improvement Board) was requested to conduct EDC (Eligibility Determination Committee) for survey done on site. DUSIB informed that these Jhyggies are not covered under Rehabilitation & Relocation Policy, 2015.
- The matter is currently sub-judice. Next date of hearing is 05.12.2022 (not listed).

*** Netaji Nagar:**

- All 65 Juggies were found ineligible under Rehabilitation policy.
- Eviction notice issued by L&DO.
- Petitions filed in the Hon'ble High Court
- Stayed by the Hon'ble High Court.
- Matter is currently sub-judice with next date of hearing on 14.03.2023.

*** Mohammadpur:**

- 7 numbers Jhuggies removed on 12.04.2022.

*** Thyagraj Nagar, Srinivaspuri & Kasturba Nagar.**

- DUSIB identified 113 numbers Jhuggies as eligible for alternative accommodation.

- CPWD requested DDA to provide 113 numbers flats for allotment with total approx. cost of Rs. 2 Cr.
- DUSIB completed process of draw on 15.07.2022. Possession letter to be issued after completing documentation.
- Jhuggies dwellers approached Hon'ble High Court of Delhi in case of Kasturba Nagar and the District & Session Judge (South) Saket Court in case of Srinivaspuri.
- Matter is sub-judice. Next date of hearing is 21.12.2022 for Kasturba Nagar and 21.12.2022 for Srinivaspuri.

B. Religious Structure:

- Total 53 numbers religious structure found in these colonies. Religious Committee has recommended removal of 45 numbers of religious structure and the same is forwarded to the Hon'ble LG through Minister.
- In the case of 6 structures, as per recommendation of religious committee, the Land owing agency organized meeting involving all stake holders and notice sent to area MP/MLA/Councilor and local police.
- Meeting of religious committee under chairmanship of the Secretary (Home) GNCTD held on 11.10.2022 with all stakeholders. Religious committee recommended removal of these 6 structures and agreed to forward the same to the Hon'ble LG through Minister provided land owing agency provides 250 sqm area for accommodating these religious structures.
- In the case of balance 2 structures, there is no religious nature of structure and religious committee recommended removal of the same.

II. Status of Statutory Approvals

- * **Nauroji Nagar** :- Approvals from all the statutory authorities have been obtained.
- * **Netaji Nagar:**
 - All Statutory approvals obtained except for Tree Transplantation / felling from Forest Department, GNCTD.
 - Revised application for tree transplantation has been submitted phase wise. Approval for one package has been obtained.
 - For all other packages, consent needs to be obtained from court for increased numbers of trees.
 - Joint survey of affected trees at Netaji Nagar, Kasturba Nagar and SriNivaspuri has been completed by Forest Department on 17.06.2022.
 - Joint affidavit for transplantation of trees has been filed in the Hon'ble High Court.
 - 1st hearing held on 31.08.2022 followed by 26.09.2022. Next date of hearing is on 28.11.2022.
- * **Sarojini Nagar:**

- All Statutory approval obtained except for Tree Transplantation felling from Forest Department, GNCTD.
- Revised application for tree transplantation has been submitted in five phases. Approval obtained for two phase/packages. Approvals for other phases are in consideration with Forest Department.
- * **Mohammadpur** – Approvals from all the statutory authorities have been obtained.
- * **Thyagraj Nagar** – Approvals from all the statutory authorities have been obtained.
- * **Sriniwaspuri& Kasturba Nagar:**
 - All Statutory approvals have been obtained except for Tree Transplantation felling permission from Forest Department, GNCTD.
 - Consent needs to be obtained from court for increased number of trees.
 - Joint survey of affected trees at Netaji Nagar, Kasturba Nagar and Sriniwaspuri was completed by Forest Department on 17.06.2022.
 - Joint affidavit for transplantation of trees has been submitted in High Court.
 - Joint affidavit for transplantation of trees has been submitted in High Court.

III. Timelines for Housing Stock: The work of Netaji Nagar, Sarojini Nagar, Sriniwaspuri and Kasturba Nagar are being taken up in phases. Tentative timeline for their completion is as follows:

SI	Colony	Tentative Timeline
1	Nauroji Nagar	30.06.2023
2	Netaji Nagar	30.06.2025
3	Sarojini Nagar	31.12.2025
4	Mohammadpur	30.09.2022
5	Thyagraj Nagar	30.09.2022
6	Kasturba Nagar	31.12.2024
7	Sriniwaspuri	31.12.2024

IV Physical and Financial Progress:

SI	Colony	Physical Progress	Financial Progress
1	Nauroji Nagar	60%	58%
2	Netaji Nagar	12%	8%
3	Sarojini Nagar	16%	8%
4	Mohammadpur	100%	98%
5	Thyagraj Nagar	100%	96%
6	Kasturba Nagar	9%	6%
7	Sriniwaspuri	2%	2%

NBCC and CPWD have well defined contract provision for imposition of liquidated damages on contractor / sub-contractor for delay attributable to them.

NBCC: The provision of LD in contract agreement with contractor is kept @ 0.5% per week, subject to 10% of Contract value

CPWD: The provision of compensation for delay in contract agreement with contractor is kept @ 1% per month, subject to 10% of Contract value.

Documents in support of approval of the statutory and other authorities are enclosed as Annexure-I.

Observation/Recommendation

Delay in computerization of data on Licence Fee collection

The Committee note that manual system of collection of Licence Fee was prevalent till June 1992. The system was revised in 1992 by merging the functions of Allotment of houses and Recovery of Licence fee which were earlier being done separately. In the new system, the allotment sections were also required to send the requisite form (Form J) to the Accounts Compilation Section, indicating 'Cash Summary for the month' which includes 'Opening Balance', 'Assessment', 'Recovery' and 'Closing Balance'. The Committee observe with utter dismay that computerization of 'rent work', which was scheduled to be carried out in 1992 was completed only in the year 2016-17 i.e. after 24 long years. This is indicative of sheer apathy on the part of the MoHUA as well as DoE in regard to undertaking measures towards improving their functioning.

The Committee also note that out of Rs. 2.94 crore that was outstanding prior to July, 1992, Rs.1.24 crore was received in cash upto 30.06.1992; the untraceable amount of Rs.0.46 crore was posted in the ledger of Arrear Clearance Section and approximately Rs.1.24 crore was added for recovery in the rent accounts of allottees who continue to occupy the General Pool Residential Accommodation. The Committee note in this regard that Rs.44.88 lakh of the outstanding amount has been recovered, and the balance amount would be recovered before the retirement of the occupants. The Committee trust that the needful would be done, and DoE would effectively monitor the recovery of the outstanding amount. The Committee would also like to be apprised of the action taken in regard to recovery of Rs.0.46 crore lying in the ledger of Arrear Clearance Section.

The Committee note that following the computerisation of the Rent wing, all calculations on rental dues are done through the 'system'. The Committee also note that as the salaries of most Central Government employees are now disbursed through PFMS portal, the same is being integrated with the GPRA portal so as to post the recoverable licence fee in the rent account of the allottees of GPRA automatically. The Committee are, however, disconcerted to note that out of 2989 Drawing and Disbursing Offices (DDOs) in Delhi, only 432 DDOs have been integrated in the system so far. The

Committee desire that the remaining DDOs be integrated with the GPRA in a time bound schedule and the Committee be apprised of the progress thereof.

**[Recommendation No. 4 of the 41st Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(17th Lok Sabha)]**

Action Taken

The details of all the outstanding dues for the period upto 30.06.1992 has already been uploaded on the website of the Directorate of Estates and added in rent accounts of Allottees. Rs. 0.46 Crores was the amount which was already deducted by DDOs and was updated in the ledgers of Arrear Clearance Section after 30.06.1992 and before the computerization of rent accounts. The No Demand Certificate to the retiring Allottees are only given after the clearance of the Total Outstanding, the balance, if any, will be recovered at the time of the issue of NDC.

As on 08.03.2022, total 954 DDOs have been integrated with PFMS and integration of 391 DDOs is under process. The DDOs pending will be integrated within 6 months or deactivated.

Remaining DDOs cannot be integrated as they are not processing the salaries of their employees on PFMS portal like offices of Ministry of Defence and Armed Forces, Ministry of Railways, Cabinet Sectt., Para Military Forces, State Govts., PSUs, Autonomous and Constitutional bodies, courts etc.

Audit's vetting comments on Ministry's ATN

DoE replied that Rs. 0.46 Crores was the amount which was already deducted by DDOs and was updated in the ledgers of Arrear Clearance Section after 30.06.1992 and before the computerization of rent accounts.

DoE has furnished status of DDOs integration and stated that remaining DDOs could not be integrated as they were not processing the salaries of their employees on PFMS portal.

No supporting documents in respect of Rs. 0.46 crore deducted by DDOs and integration of DDOs were produced to Audit. Hence, Audit could not substantiate the facts. Updated position may be intimated to PAC.

Ministry's further submission

The entries in respect of Rs. 0.46 Crores deducted by DDOs are available in several hundred old rent ledgers which are kept in record rooms. It is not practicably feasible to provide all the registers. However, any specific Ledger can be provided.

Also, as on 16.11.2022, total 905 DDOs including 224 IDs merged and deactivated and integration for 326 DDOs is under process. The continuous efforts being made to approach the remaining DDOs through phone, emails Pops ups on e-Samapda portal to

get them integrated. A copy of the list of 905 DDOs integrated and 326 DDOs under process are enclosed herewith as Annexure-II.

Observation/Recommendation

Inordinate delay in taking possession of habitable houses

The Committee note that a test check of houses shown as habitable for the period January 2011 to September 2013, reveals delays ranging from 90 days to more than two years in taking possession of as many as 579 houses by the allottees. The Committee note from the reply of DoE that the time taken in handing over a house to an allottee is dependent upon the condition of the house. However, the Committee note with consternation that DoE did not give specific reasons for delays of one to two years in some cases and even delays of more than two years which have been pointed out by Audit. The Committee observe that as per the present practice, on allotment of an accommodation, the allottee has to give his acceptance within 8 days and Technical Occupation is to be taken after a further period of 5 days. Now, a provision has been made in e-Awas that in case the allottee does not take Technical Occupation within this period, the allotment stands cancelled. Further, a check point has been provided in the system to monitor whether the allottee has taken Physical possession. If Physical possession is not taken owing to the house not made habitable by CPWD, CPWD is requested to expedite the work towards making the house habitable. However, if the house is habitable and possession is not taken, the allotment is cancelled. The Committee further note that as per the Maintenance Charter of CPWD, the stipulated time given for renovation of Quarters after vacation by the previous allottee of Type I to Type IV houses is 60 days and for Quarters of Type V and above categories it is 75 days. In cases where no renovation is required, physical possession is handed over immediately. Any delay in the timelines mentioned above are due to the additional time taken by CPWD to make the dwelling unit habitable. The Committee do not find merit in the logic extended in including a house for allotment without carrying out the necessary maintenance/ repair work following the vacation of the house. In order to avoid delays in possession, the Committee desire that once a house is vacated, its habitability should be immediately assessed by CPWD. If the house is habitable, only then should it be demarcated for allotment. In case repairs/ renovation are required, CPWD may first take necessary action to ensure that the houses are repaired/ renovated as per the stipulations of the Maintenance Charter. The Committee also recommend that in case of non-adherence to the stipulations, accountability should be fixed on the officials responsible for delays.

**[Recommendation No. 6 of the 41st Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(17th Lok Sabha)]**

Action Taken

The delay was on the part of CPWD/NBCC and the allottee. However,, to avoid such cases in future the DoE vide its OM No. 2012/1/2018-Pol.III (Pt.) dated 21.02.2022 issued instructions related to delay in handing over physical possession GPRA restricting to 75 days for making it habitable and generate habitability certificate and communicate to DoE and allottee directly. If the allottee fails to take possession of the house within 5 working days from the date of issue of the Habitability Certificate and allotment shall be cancelled automatically and the allottee shall be debarred as per Rule 17 of the CGGPRA Rules, 2017.

An OM dated 21.02.2022 mentioned above has been issued and CPWD has been asked to take action as per their OM No. 711312015-VVII/DG/695 dated 25.07.2015. NBCC has been asked to develop similar mechanism to fix responsibility by issuing an OM.

The reason for delay in occupation for more than one year in r/o following Sl. No. is as under:

64-Ty II-MB Rd Sec3/MS/Qtr No. 1380- As per CPWD Sewa Portal the date of PO is 9.6.2011. LF is also being deducted since June, 2011. As such, no delay.

359-3/1047, RK Puram – As per record, this Qtr was under upgradation work upto 15.11.2012 and was taken physical possession on 30.04.13.

CPWD has been requested to provide the reasons for delay in respect of following Qtrs., input awaited from them and once it is received, it will be sent for vetting:

205-Ty III-3/306, SadiqNgr –

207-17/930, Lodi Colony -

Major reason for delay in handing over the physical possession of quarters to allottees by CPWD is due to number of requirements submitted by allottee and request for up-gradation as per latest norms. This is particularly alarming in case of higher type of quarters, where frequent changes are demanded during execution of work.

Similarly field staff is not able to upgrade the quarter due to acute shortage of funds, non up-gradation of the quarter to the aspiration of the allottee and refusal / delay by allottee to accept the quarter for one or other reason.

In view of above, following suggestions are given by CPWD for approval by this Directorate.

1. For Type I, II, III & IV quarters,

I) Where major repair and renovation is not involved, 30 days period is required for repair, painting/finishing, cleaning etc. After completion of the works these quarters will be uploaded on e-Awas portal of DoE by CPWD for the allotment.

II) For quarters requiring major repair or upgradation / renovation as per latest norms, all works like necessary repairing, renovation, upgradation, rectification of defects in electrical lines, water supply & sanitary installation, fixtures, painting / finishing, cleaning etc. to be completed within 60 days after vacation and there after house is put on the e-Awas for allotment by the DoE.

2. For quarters/houses of Type V and above

I) For quarters not requiring major repair or upgradation / renovation, works like repair, rectification of defects in electrical lines, water supply & sanitary installation, fixtures etc will be completed within 30 days after vacation. These houses will be put on the e-Awas for allotment by DoE. On taking over technical possession by the allottee, necessary painting/ finishing/ cleaning and other minor works will be carried out in next 15 days to the satisfaction of the allottees. This system will avoid wastage of resources on finishing works as some time number of quarters remain un-allotted for a long period due to various reasons. The allottee wants finishing works afresh before taking physical possession of the house. (Total time : 45 days)

II) For quarters requiring major repair, upgradation, renovation as per latest norms: all works like repairing, renovation, upgradation, rectification of defects in electrical lines, water supply & sanitary installation, fixtures etc to be completed within 60 days after vacation. These houses will be put on the e-Awas for allotment by DoE. On taking over the technical possession by the allottee, necessary painting/finishing/cleaning and other minor works are carried out within 15 days to the satisfaction of the allottees. (Total time : 60+15 = 75 days)

According to above, period of handing over the physical possession after technical possession should be as follows:

- i) Type I, II, III & IV quarter : 5 days
- ii) Type V and above : 15 days

Details of year of upgradation of each quarter as per norms of 2008 or 2018 should be available on e-Awas portal for information of the applicants.

Ministry's further submission

The matter is related to maintenance of Government Accommodation which is looked after by Central Public Works Department (CPWD). The CPWD in its reply has stated that because the matter is 10 years old, so they are not able to trace the exact reasons of delay for handing over the physical possession of 205-Type-III, 3/306, Sadiq Nagar and 207-17/930, Lodhi Colony. However, they have informed that instructions are being

issued to field units of CPWD for ensuring to complete and handover quarters within the stipulated time.

Observation/Recommendation

Occupation of Multiple houses by allottees

The Committee note that for the period January 2011 to July 2014, Audit found that 536 allottees were occupying more than one accommodation for which various explanations were advanced by DoE, such as, allotments made for compulsory shifting, 'vacant possession' not being reflected in the system, non-handing over of house. In cases of change of accommodation, there would be allottees who are in occupation of two houses during the intervening period. The Committee observe from Audit's findings that during a test check of 12 registration numbers in 10 cases, double occupation was indicated even after a gap of years following the allottee occupying the second unit. The Committee note that now, if an allottee is found in physical occupation of two or more houses beyond 15 days, market rent is charged. The Committee also note that following computerization of records, it is easy to identify cases of double occupation in the automated system since, in such cases, licence fee in respect of only one flat will be received, and the fee in respect of the other flat will not be received. The Committee further observe that DoE has initiated linkage of eAwas with Public Financial Management System (PFMS) which would eliminate the possibility of multiple occupation of Government accommodation. The Committee desire to be apprised of the action taken by the MoHUA in the 10 cases of double occupation of Government accommodation pointed out by the Audit. Since Audit had done only a test check, the Committee exhort the Ministry to review all such cases to ensure that there are no instances of double occupation. The Committee further desire that the process of linking eAwas with PFMS may be expedited and completed within a time bound period. They would also like to be apprised of the status and the impact of the same on eliminating double occupancy in toto.

**[Recommendation No. 7 of the 41st Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(17th Lok Sabha)]**

Action Taken

In pursuance of decision of CCA meeting held on 18.06.2021, this Directorate vide OM No.12035/16/2021-Pol.II dated 06.08.2021 has issued instructions to ensure that no individual/officer is allotted more than one unit of GPRA under any circumstances to address the issue of double occupation of GPRA Accommodation.

There is only one case in Type – 5A in Higher Type i.e., House NO. 134, Asian Games Village (Reg. No. 10000358). This is not a double occupation as the house was never allotted to Shri Sutapa Majumdar. As per CPWD records Sh. Sanjiv Jain was residing in the said accommodation since 02.02.2006. Sh. Sutapa Majumdar was allotted D-II/179, Kaka Nagar, New Delhi on 17.07.2012 and the same was vacated on 11.11.2019.

The information regarding the cases of Double Occupation in lower & higher type quarters is enclosed.

An exercise regarding the reviewing of the cases of double occupation has been done and rectified the cases come to the notice.

This Directorate has integrated Public Financial Management System (PFMS) with e-Sampada portal w.e.f. 01.09.2020 in accordance with OM No.18011/1/2020-Pol.III dated 01.09.2020.

Audit's vetting comments on Ministry's ATN

As per ATR, DoE has reviewed only those cases which came to notice rather than review all cases as desired by PAC

Ministry's further submission

All the cases of double occupation are being monitored continuously and action has been taken for vacation of double occupation, by issuing notices.

Observation/Recommendation

Maintenance of dangerous and unsafe houses by CPWD

While noting the stipulation that once a residential house is declared unsafe, it cannot be allotted to any person until it is declared safe by the competent authority, the Committee observe that an analysis of GAMS database revealed that 2,035 houses which were declared unsafe were allotted. The Committee find that in 106 cases where the houses were declared unsafe, these were allotted within 50 days of being declared as unsafe. The Committee, in this regard take note of DoE's reply that with the linking of e-Awas and e-Sewa such houses, once declared unsafe by CPWD would automatically go out of the process of being allotted, and only following the receipt of the report from CPWD, that the house has been made habitable, the same would be included in the process of bidding for allotment. The Committee also note that DoE monitors the status of uninhabitable houses and holds periodic meetings with CPWD officers to turn them habitable. In this regard, the Committee, during oral evidence, had indicated an instance of flats in a particular Area in New Delhi that had been declared dangerous and unsafe, but, were not being vacated. While noting that the list of unsafe flats has been sent to DoE for cancellation of allotment and eviction, the Committee desire that DoE and CPWD take urgent steps to ensure that uninhabitable and dangerous houses are vacated at the earliest and they are repaired/ renovated.

**[Recommendation No. 8 of the 41st Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(17th Lok Sabha)]**

Action Taken

There was no concrete system in GAMS database for obtaining data of UNSAFE houses from CPWD Sewa resulting in allotment of unsafe houses also. Policy division of this Directorate is taking up this matter with CPWD to fetch the details of such houses through e-Sampada portal.

This Directorate vide OM No.2012/1/2018-Pol.III(pt.) dated 21.02.2022 has issued necessary guidelines regarding vacation of the unsafe/dangerous houses and their renovation. All concerned field units have been directed by CPWD to take proactive action to ensure repair / renovation of inhabitable and dangerous houses at the earliest. Any request received from CPWD regarding unsafe houses, the same are removed from bidding and re-entered only after receiving habitable report from CPWD authorities. The allottees of these unsafe houses are allowed to bid in the next bidding and priority allotments are made to them automatically through e - Sampada ASA.

As per the Public Premises (Eviction of Unauthorised Occupants) Act, 1971, litigation section opens referred cases received from the concerned sections/units at the earliest and sends 3 days show cause notice to the allottee to appear for hearing within prescribed time and two more hearing notices send consequently. Accordingly, Eviction Order will be passed.

Litigation Section of this Directorate has directed that eviction of flats that have become inhabitable and dangerous may be referred to litigation section to take eviction action on urgent basis.

Audit's vetting comments on Ministry's ATN

PAC in their observation stated that "DoE and CPWD take urgent steps to ensure that inhabitable and dangerous houses are vacated at the earliest and they are repaired/renovated."

In their reply DoE stated that "The Directorate vide OM dated 21/02/2022 has issued necessary guidelines regarding vacation of the unsafe/dangerous houses and their renovation. All concerned field units have been directed by CPWD to take proactive action to ensure repair/ renovation of inhabitable and dangerous houses at the earliest."

DoE has not intimated the plan envisaged to ensure the implementation of instructions/guidelines issued. This may be intimated to PAC now.

Ministry's further submission

Rule 21 of CGPRA Rule, 2017 contains necessary provisions regarding providing of alternate accommodation to the allottee in case an accommodation is declared unsafe/dangerous.

Further, the OM No. 2012/1/2018-Pol.III(pt.) dated 21.02.2022 was issued thereby requesting CPWD and NBCC to take necessary steps to vacate the allottee and repair/renovate such houses at the earliest. CPWD issues necessary certificate declaring house as dangerous/inhabitable to the allottee to enable him apply for another

house on priority basis. All concerned field units have been directed by CPWD to take proactive action to ensure repair/renovation of inhabitable and dangerous houses at the earliest. After issue of the OM, efforts have been made for smooth and effective implementation of instructions contained in the said OM in active coordination with officials of NIC, DOE, NBCC and CPWD. NIC has carried out necessary changes in e-Sampada in accordance with the OM.

Observation/Recommendation

Web Portal services

The Committee note that there were 4 different portals viz. <http://estates.nic.in> for information regarding government accommodation available for the applicants/allottees and public in addition to circulars, policy orders, compendium, information about booking of Vigyan Bhawan /Holiday Homes etc.; www.gpra.nic.in, the frontend of GAMS database used by applicants/allottees etc. to get information about the housing stock, vacancies, allotments and waiting list etc.; www.eawas.nic.in which was developed for internal work of DoE and online license fee posting by Drawing and Disbursing Officers (DDOs); and www.cpwdsewa.nic.in (e-Sewa), web based software developed by CPWD for management of maintenance, for online vacancy reporting etc. The Committee note that all 'Web applications' have been merged into one and a web portal and mobile app named e-sampada has been launched in December, 2020 which aims to provide a 'One Nation, One System' method. With the launch of e-sampada, the four websites (eawas.nic.in, gpra.nic.in, holidayhomes.nic.in and states.gov.in) and the two mobile apps (m-Awas and m-Ashoka5) of the Directorate of Estates have been integrated into one, paving the way for accessing all the services on the same platform. The new application aims to provide a single window for all the services which includes office space allotment to government organizations in 45 office complexes in 28 cities, allotment of over one lakh government residential accommodation, booking of the building at 5, Ashoka Road, New Delhi and 1,176-holiday homes for social functions, etc. *However, on logging into the site, it can be seen that many features and facilities such as booking of holiday homes, Touring Officers' Hostels etc. are not available as yet, for certain categories of employees even after 6 months of launch of the web portal. The Committee desire that all the relevant information and facilities for booking etc. may be made available on the portal at the earliest.* The Committee also desire to be apprised of the user feedback on the new site.

**.[Recommendation No. 9 of the 41st Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(17th Lok Sabha)]**

Action Taken

The booking of Holiday Homes, Touring Officers Hostel, 5 Ashoka Road and other venues, and allotment of General Pool Residential Accommodation is being done smoothly through the e-Sampada web portal.

Feedbacks received through e-sampada can be seen.

Audit's vetting comments on Ministry's ATN

No further comments.

Ministry's further submission

No further comments.

Observation/Recommendation**Furnishing records/documents to Audit**

The Committee are dismayed to note that details of meetings of the Prioritisation Committee and copies of minutes thereof; minutes of the meetings of the Standing Committee; information regarding outstanding Licence Fee in respect of other types of accommodation etc. were not provided to Audit. The Committee are disappointed to note that the Ministry, instead of replying has referred the query regarding non-submission of documents to Audit to CPWD for furnishing the reply thereto. The Committee enjoin upon the Ministry to henceforth, make available the required records/documents to Audit and also desire the Ministry to explain the reasons for not providing the documents requisitioned by the Audit.

**[Recommendation No. 10 of the 41st Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(17th Lok Sabha)]**

Action Taken

All possible steps are taken to provide information to the possible extent. There are some difficulties in providing information / document as all was in physical form and not easy to retrieve readily. Now, the records are digitized and the situation is improved to great extent.

Audit's vetting comments on Ministry's ATN

No further comments.

Ministry's further submission

No further comments.

CHAPTER III

**OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT
DESIRE TO PURSUE IN VIEW OF THE REPLIES RECEIVED FROM THE
GOVERNMENT**

-Nil-

CHAPTER IV

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE COMMITTEE AND WHICH REQUIRE REITERATION

Observation/Recommendation

Physical Verification of housing stock

Physical verification of housing stock available with DOE is to be carried out by CPWD. The Committee note in this regard that while physical verification was carried out in 2008, according to DOE, it was not of much use as it was not executed and furnished in the desired format with the requisite details. The Committee understand that a comprehensive physical verification drive of the housing stock was to be carried out from April, 2020, which has been put on hold due to COVID-19 pandemic. Instead, as an alternative, digital enumeration of housing stock has been completed by reconciling the databases of eAwas and CPWD. As one of the premier managers of public real estate assets, it is imperative that DoE maintain an accurate record of housing stock which is updated at regular intervals. The Committee are of the view that physical verification of the housing stock needs to be done urgently by DoE in co-ordination with CPWD in a time bound manner, and the Committee apprised thereof. The Committee are also of the view that all the properties of the DoE need to be geo-tagged so as to enable regular monitoring and updating of the stock on real time basis. The Committee also desire that physical verification of housing stock be carried out at regular intervals.

**[Recommendation No. 2 of the 41st Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(17th Lok Sabha)]**

Action Taken

As per the Observation of the PAC physical verification of the housing stock needs to be done urgently by DoE in coordination with CPWD in a time bound manner. However, due to Covid/Omicron conditions prevailed no such physical verification has been conducted so far in coordination with CPWD. However, some physical verification of houses are being conducted by DoE wherever required. Further, it is a time consuming process and it will take time to get it done with limited staff who have other daily work and in coordination with the staff of CPWD.

Further, a proposal is under consideration in geo-tagging of the properties of DoE in Computer Cell DoE. If that is materialized, there is little need for physical verification of house.

Audit's vetting comments on Ministry's ATN

Physical verification may be got conducted and goe-tagging done. Progress may be intimated to PAC **Ministry's further submission**

In respect of Geo-Tagging project, NIC has submitted its proposal regarding Geo-Tagging of properties of DOE. A detailed scrutiny of financial and operational aspects and its implications of proposal are currently underway.

Observation/Recommendation

Satisfaction levels

The Committee note that satisfaction level for each type of accommodation refers to availability position of residential accommodation for the Central Government Employees vis-à-vis the demand for housing. The Committee note that a Prioritization Committee set up in the MoHUA prescribed a satisfaction level of 50% in cities other than Delhi and 70 % in Delhi. The Committee observe that for the biggest pool i.e. GP (General pool), the satisfaction level which was already much less than the prescribed level at 44% in 2011, further declined to 31% in 2014 whereas for TN (Tenure Pool) pool, it declined further from 33% in 2011 to 27% in 2014. The Committee are aware that for addressing this issue, the MoHUA/DoE are striving to increase the number of housing units to approximately 24,000. The Committee are of the view that since the purpose of creation of 'exclusive pools' is to lessen the waiting time and ensure easy availability of houses to identified categories of applicants, the 'pools' need to be managed in such a way as to keep the 'satisfaction levels' in all the 'pools' at comparable levels. The Committee, while noting the wide variation in the 'satisfaction levels' which results in longer waiting time for GP, TN, LM and LS pools desire that corrective measures be taken by way of timely exchange of houses amongst the pools as well as augmentation of the housing stock. The Committee are also of the opinion that measuring the 'satisfaction levels' should not only be based on mapping of availability of houses vis-à-vis the demand, but should also include aspects such as the actual level of satisfaction of residents and the quality of construction/ repair and services being offered by the maintenance agencies concerned.

The Committee, while noting that a number of complaints are being received regarding seepage or wear and tear in newly built houses, desire that periodic appraisal of the performance of agencies such as CPWD/NBCC be done so as to enable in improving the services provided by them. The Committee also desire that appropriate action be taken against the officials found responsible for negligence on the basis of the appraisal and penalties imposed on the contractors/ sub-contractors for 'unsatisfactory work' that may have been executed. The Committee may be apprised of the steps taken in this direction within three months of the presentation of this Report to Parliament.

The Committee desire that an assessment may also be made for ascertaining the costs incurred on providing accommodation to the Government employees *vis-a-vis* the efficiency and care with which 'housing stock' is being maintained.

**[Recommendation No. 3 of the 41st Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(17th Lok Sabha)]**

Action Taken

As of 04-03-2022, the current level of satisfaction for General Pool Residential Accommodation is 79.62% for New Delhi, which is much higher than 70%.

In order to maintain comparable levels of different 'exclusive pools' such as TN, TP and GP Pool, Policy Division has issued guidelines vide DoE's OM No. 12035/11/2002-Pol.II (Vol. IV)(Part 1) dated 07.09.2020 As per these guidelines, TP houses not opted by TP Pool Officers for 2 months continuously shall be transferred first to TN Pool for bidding through ASA, further if these houses are not opted by TN Pool officers for 2 months continuously, then they will be transferred to GP Pool for bidding through ASA.

All houses / buildings constructed under CPWD are handed over to the clients / maintenance units after removal of all defects, including attending to seepage etc. Further, any defects noticed during defect liability period are also got rectified from the contractor who constructed the houses / buildings. As per contract provisions Security Deposit is released only after defects liability period is over.

The project of redevelopment of seven GPRA colonies at Delhi (Nauroji Nagar, Mohammad Pur, Netaji Nagar, Thyagraj Nagar, Kasturba Nagar, Srinivaspuri and Sarojini Nagar) is still under construction phase. However suitable precautionary measures are being taken in the projects.

Regarding newly built flats in Kidwai Nagar East, General Pool Residential Accommodations of East Kidwai Nagar had been handed over in phased manner starting from 2018 to 2020. It was completely handed / taken over on 30.11.2020. There are 4608 flats comprising of 13,472 toilet/bathrooms, 4608 kitchens and many water points in the society.

During this period, the seepages / leakage and other issues were taken up with the deployed agencies and same were rectified. These defects were minor in nature and rectified and thus required no disciplinary action against Engineers/Employees. During the Defect Liability Period (DLP) period (30.11.2020 to 30.11.2021), the contractors / agencies attended all the observed points of seepages / leakages. Now, this GPRA colony of East Kidwai Nagar is under maintenance of NBCC. The day to day issues related to seepages / leakages are being attended by the maintenance agency. NBCC attends and resolves all the complaints received from the residents on priority basis. These are also recorded in the data base on daily basis in order to review on daily / weekly and monthly basis depending on the nature of complaints. Suitable steps are taken to rectify the same at earliest. Additionally, reviews and inspections of site are also done on weekly basis to ensure the preventive maintenance. NBCC has also circulated the feedback forms to the residents. The suggestions / complaints received through these feedback forms, NBCC acts accordingly to improve the services.

Provision regarding action to be taken against the officials found responsible for negligence on the basis of the appraisal and penalties imposed on the contractors/ sub-

contractors for 'unsatisfactory work' that may have been executed, is already made in CPWD works manual 2019 under chapter – 7.

The Quality Assurance of Technical Audit Wing conducts the inspection of works time to time as per CPWD Work Manual 2019 Chapter-7 and suitable penalty is recommended by it against the officials found guilty for unsatisfactory work.

Redevelopment of seven GPRA colonies:

The project of redevelopment of seven GPRA colonies is still under construction phase. However suitable precautionary measures are being taken in the projects.

East Kidwai Nagar: GPRA East Kidwai Nagar was being handed over in phased manner starting from 2018 to 2020. It was completely handed /taken over by 30.11.2020.

During this period the seepage /leakage and other issues were taken up with the deployed agencies and same were rectified. These defects were minor in nature and rectified which requires no disciplinary action against Engineers/Employees.

During DLP period (30.11.2020 to 30.11.2021) the contractors / agencies also attended all the observed points of seepages/leakages. Now this GPRA colony of East Kidwai Nagar is under maintenance. The day to day issues related with seepages/ leakages are being attended by the maintenance agency.

Total incurred cost Rs. 4015 Cr. (approx.). for GPRA Kidwai Nagar (East) which includes Social Infrastructure Buildings and comprising of different Type of flats (from Type II to Type VII.): There are 780 flats/Type II, 1025 flats/Type III, 1472 flats/Type IV, 1078 flats/Type V, 192 flats/Type VI, & 61 flats/Type VII (Total flats 4608 nos.) have been developed including all External Development works.

The Maintenance of GPRA Kidwai Nagar (East) started in phased manner as per handing over of the flats / towers since 2018. Till date total incurred cost on maintenance is Rs. 54.8 Cr (*this cost on maintenance is for 4 years approximately.*)

The maintenance works of this GPRA Colony is being looked after by NBCC. All the points/complaints raised by the occupants are being attended in a time bound manner through Community App and telephonically up to the satisfaction of the occupants. Thus proper care is being taken as maintenance works is carried out by NBCC.

Audit's vetting comments on Ministry's ATN

DoE stated that as on 04/03/2022 level of satisfaction for GPRA is 79.62 per cent and in order to maintain comparable levels of different 'exclusive pools' such as TN, TP and GP Pool, Policy Division has issued guidelines dated 07/09/2020. As per these guidelines, TP houses not opted by TP Pool Officers for 2 months continuously shall be transferred first to TN Pool for bidding through ASA, further if these houses are not

opted by TN Pool officers for 2 months continuously, then they will be transferred to GP Pool for bidding through ASA.

However, the DoE has not explained how it has helped to reduce the variation in satisfaction level and to what extent.

DoE has not furnished any further any further action taken in this regard.

The reply that, defects were minor in nature and rectified at the earliest and required no disciplinary action against Engineers/Employees should be seen in the light that during verification of response of Ministry, it was seen that many complaints of seepages were lodged through various modes. This is indicative of deficient workmanship and sub standard quality of execution.

However, DoE has furnished details in respect of only one colony that is GPRA Kidwai Nagar (East).

It stated that total incurred cost Rs. 4015 crore (approximately) for GPRA Kidwai Nagar (East) which includes Social Infrastructure Buildings and comprising of different Type of flats that have been developed including all External Development works. Till date total incurred cost on maintenance is Rs. 54.8 Cr (this cost of maintenance is for 4 years approximately.)

No further comments

Ministry's further submission

Improvement in overall satisfaction level of GPRA is linked to addition of more units of houses into existing housing stock which is only possible after redevelopment work of various GPRA colonies is completed. The purpose of OM dated 07.09.2020 is for optimum utilization of un-allotted houses of one pool to other pool/GP by carry forwarding the vacancies for use by the needy allottees. This has been done keeping in mind that no unused houses in any pool remain unutilized.

Such types of minor defects of leakages/seepages are the teething issues noticed during the initial phase of occupancy, which normally happens in any newly constructed structure. Further, same has been promptly attended and rectified during the Defect Liability period.

CHAPTER V

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH THE GOVERNMENT HAVE FURNISHED INTERIM REPLIES

Observation/Recommendation

Outstanding Licence Fee from various allottees

The Committee observe that a total of Rs. 10.19 crore was outstanding as on December 2012 and March 2013 against various categories of allottees including, allottees of Type 5 and higher categories of houses, and in respect of Hostels and Type 4 special categories. While noting that Rs.3.337 crore out of the total outstanding has been recovered, the Committee desire that DoE may earnestly pursue the Damage Recovery Cases filed under Section 14 of the Public Premises Act 1971 that have been forwarded to the Collectors. The Committee hope that with the disbursement of salaries through PFMS portal and the consequent posting of the status in regard to licence fee in the rent account of the allottees, the problem of overdues will be resolved in near future. The Committee also note with disappointment that 'age-wise-breakup' of the total outstanding Licence Fee was not provided to Audit and desire that the same may be provided.

**[Recommendation No. 5 of the 41st Report of the Public Accounts Committee
(17th Lok Sabha)]**

Action Taken

Allotment Section of this Directorate may refer cases of damage / licence fee recovery on Damage Recovery Cases Module on e-Sampada, launched recently.

For the period from 2012 to 2013, 78 DRCs were opened by litigation section and payment orders were issued and sent to the Competent Authority for damage recovery.

- (i) DRC case of Late Shri Buta Singh, a former allottee of Type –VII bungalow was sent to Dev. Commissioner, Jam Nagar House, New Delhi for recovery of pending dues on 14-04-2021 with a copy to Distt. Collector, South Delhi for taking necessary action in the matter at the earliest.

However, as per provisional rent assessment of Late Buta Singh, till date this Directorate has not received any payments.

- (ii) Damage recovery matter (Rs. 3,76,268/-) in respect of Shri A.P. Pathak, a former allottee of Type VB quarter, has been furnished to the Court of Asstt. Collector, Delhi Cantt. Shri Pathak has been served upon a notice by the

Collector office on 03-06-2021 for making early payments of outstanding damages. Barring an amount of Rs. 9485/- (in respect of which, he has sought some clarifications) Shri Pathak has cleared all the dues.

(iii) Others outstanding cases of licence fee and damages are also in pipeline.

Reminders on Damage Recovery Cases, sent to Collectors for recovery are being given regularly. However, the dues are yet to be recovered.

Pending Rent Assessment generated from 2014-15 to 2021 in respect of Higher types. The details of outstanding received as on 31.03.2022 is as under:

(Rs. In Crores)

Section Name	2019-20	2020-21	2021-22
O&M Section	0.6	7.7	2.93

Copy of FRBM report of the last five years is enclosed

Audit's vetting comments on Ministry's ATN

Action plan of DoE to recover the outstanding license fee and damages was not produced to Audit.

DoE has provided amount of outstanding received during 2019-20 and 2020-21 instead of 'age-wise-breakup' of the total outstanding Licence Fee as desired by PAC. Correct information may be provided to PAC now.

Ministry's further submission

Recovery of Licence Fee/Damage Charges in arrears is a continuous process, whereas, procedure is already in place and is followed rigorously by this Directorate to recover them from the serving/retired allottees and their families as well, in the case of deceased allottees, by online and offline follows up through SMS, Emails and Letters already incorporated in e-sampada portal.

Moreover, easy access is already provided to the respective allottees to clear the outstanding dues in a seamless and transparent manner through online and offline mode of payments by the respective DDOs or individually as applicable to them. Accordingly, No Dues Certificates /Clearance Certificates are issued by the Allotment Sections.

It is also stated that the allottees failing to adhere to the requisite timelines of clearing the dues are again rigorously followed up by way online and offline mode as stated above and Cancellations are done followed by DRC (Damage Recovery Case). Further, the action is taken by Litigation Section(s) against the respective allottees under section 7 of the Public Premises (Eviction of Unauthorised) occupants Act, 1971.

The age-wise break-up of the licence fee dues during last five years is being worked out by the concerned Sections of this Directorate.

NEW DELHI;
24 July, 2023
02 Sravana, 1945 (*Saka*)

ADHIR RANJAN CHOWDHURY
Chairperson,
Public Accounts Committee

APPENDIX-II
(Vide Paragraph 5 of Introduction)

**ANALYSIS OF THE ACTION TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT ON THE
OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
CONTAINED IN THEIR FORTY- FIRST REPORT (SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA)**

(i)	Total number of Observations/Recommendations	10
(ii)	Observations/Recommendations of the Committee which have been accepted by the Government: Para Nos. 1, 4, 6-10	Total : 07 Percentage: 70%
(iii)	Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the reply of the Government: Para No. Nil	Total : Nil Percentage: 0%
(iv)	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration: Para Nos. 2-3	Total : 02 Percentage: 20%
(v)	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies: Para No. - 5	Total : Nil Percentage: 10%