

**19**

**STANDING COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND URBAN AFFAIRS  
(2022- 2023)**

**SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA**

**MINISTRY OF HOUSING AND URBAN AFFAIRS**

**[Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Eighteenth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) of the Standing Committee on Housing and Urban Affairs (2022-23) on, 'Demands for Grants (2023-24) of the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs']**

**NINETEENTH REPORT**



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT  
NEW DELHI**

**August, 2023/ Sravana 1945 (Saka)**

**NINETEENTH REPORT**

**STANDING COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND URBAN AFFAIRS**

**(2022-2023)**

**(SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA)**

**MINISTRY OF HOUSING AND URBAN AFFAIRS**

[Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Eighteenth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) of the Standing Committee on Housing and Urban Affairs (2022-23) on, 'Demands for Grants (2023-24) of the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs']

**Presented to Lok Sabha on 03.08.2023**

**Laid in Rajya Sabha on 03.08.2023**



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT**

**NEW DELHI**

**August, 2023/ Sravana 1945 (Saka)**

H.U.A. No.137

Price: Rs. ....

(C) 2022 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

Published under Rule 382 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha (Seventeenth Edition) and printed by .....

(i)

## CONTENTS

	PAGE
Composition of the Committee	(ii)
Introduction	(iii)
<b>CHAPTER I</b> Report	1 – 7
<b>CHAPTER II</b> Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government	8 – 26
<b>CHAPTER III</b> Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the Government's replies	27 – 30
<b>CHAPTER IV</b> Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and require reiteration	31 – 33
<b>CHAPTER V</b> Observations/Recommendations in respect of which final replies of the Government are still awaited	34

## ANNEXURES

I.	Minutes of the 9 <sup>th</sup> Sitting of the Committee held on 01.08.2023	35-36
II.	Analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Eighteenth Report (17 <sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha)	37

(ii)

**COMPOSITION OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE  
ON HOUSING AND URBAN AFFAIRS (2022-23)**

**Shri Rajiv Ranjan Singh *alias* Lalan Singh - Chairperson**

**MEMBERS**

**LOK SABHA**

2. Adv. A. M. Ariff
3. Shri Sanjay Kumar Bandi
4. Shri Shrirang Appa Barne
5. Shri Benny Behanan
6. Shri Ramcharan Bohra
7. Shri Hibi Eden
8. Shri Gautam Gambhir
9. Shri Syed Imtiaz Jaleel
10. Shri Shankar Lalwani
11. Smt. Hema Malini
12. Shri Hasnain Masoodi
13. Shri P.C. Mohan
14. Shri C.R. Patil
15. Shri S. Ramalingam
16. Shri Adala Prabhakara Reddy
17. Smt. Aparajita Sarangi
18. Shri M V V Satyanarayana
19. Shri Sudhakar Tukaram Shrangare
20. Shri Sunil Kumar Soni
21. Sadhvi Pragya Singh Thakur

**RAJYA SABHA**

22. Shri Subhasish Chakraborty
23. Shri R. Girirajan
24. Smt. Jebi Mather Hisham
25. Shri Ram Chander Jangra
26. Shri Kumar Ketkar
27. Dr. K. Laxman
28. Ms. Kavita Patidar
29. Shri S. Niranjana Reddy
30. Dr. Kalpana Saini
31. Shri Sanjay Singh

**SECRETARIAT**

1. Shri Raju Srivastava - Joint Secretary
2. Ms Archana Pathania - Director
3. Ms Swati Parwal - Deputy Secretary
4. Shri Abhishek Kumar - Under Secretary

(iii)

## INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairperson of the Standing Committee on Housing and Urban Affairs (2022-23) having been authorized by the Committee, present this Nineteenth Report (17<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) on action taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the Eighteenth Report (17<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) of the Committee on, 'Demands for Grants (2023-24) of the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs'.

2. The Eighteenth Report was presented to Lok Sabha on 20 March 2023 but had been laid on the table of Rajya Sabha on 17 March 2023. The Action Taken Replies of the Government to all the recommendations contained in the Report were received on 19 June 2023.

3. The Committee considered and adopted this Report at their sitting held on 01 August, 2023.

4. An analysis of the action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Eighteenth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee is given at Annexure-II.

5. For the facility of reference and convenience, the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee have been printed in bold letters in the body of the Report.

**NEW DELHI;**

**01 August, 2023**  
**10 Saravana, 1945 (Saka)**

**Shri Rajiv Ranjan Singh**  
***alias* Lalan Singh**  
**Chairperson,**  
**Standing Committee on Housing and Urban Affairs**

# REPORT

## CHAPTER I

This Report of the Standing Committee on Housing & Urban Affairs (2022-23) deals with the action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in their Eighteenth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on Demands for Grants (2023-24) which was presented to Lok Sabha on 20 March, 2023.

1.2 Action Taken Notes have been received from the Government in respect of all the 17 recommendations contained in the Report. These have been categorized as follows:-

- (i) Recommendations/Observations, which have been accepted by the Government:  
  
Recommendation Serial Nos. 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 8, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16 and 17  
  

(Total – 14)  
(Chapter-II)
- (ii) Recommendations/Observations, which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of Government's replies:  
  
Recommendation Serial No. 9  
  

(Total – 01)  
(Chapter-III)
- (iii) Recommendations/Observations, in respect of which replies of Government have not been accepted by the Committee:  
  
Recommendation Serial Nos. 4 & 7  
  

(Total – 02)  
(Chapter-IV)
- (iv) Recommendations/Observations, in respect of which final replies of the Government are still awaited:  
  
Recommendation Serial No. Nil  
  

(Total – 00)  
(Chapter-V)

**1.3 The Committee desire that specific replies to the comments of the Committee as contained in Chapter – I may be furnished to them at the earliest and in any case, not later than three months from the presentation of this Report.**

1.4 The Committee will now deal with the action taken by the Government on some of their recommendations in the succeeding paragraphs.

#### **Recommendation No. 4**

#### **Stressing the need of appointing full-time Managing Director in a Metro Corporation**

1.5 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*“The Committee have observed from the data provided by the Ministry that the physical and financial progress of some of the metro projects particularly in Patna, Surat, Agra, Bhopal and Indore is very tardy. The Committee acknowledge that metro is a complex subject and progress of the Metro projects depends upon various factors such as land acquisition, finalization of financial tie ups with external agencies, Statutory clearances, etc. The Committee are, therefore, of the opinion that the role of leadership in various metro projects become utmost important and crucial to understand, resolve, negotiate, facilitate and monitor these complex issues. However, the Committee are surprised to note that some of the Metro Corporations / Projects, namely Gujarat Metro Rail Corporation (GMRC) Limited, Mumbai Metro Line 3, Noida Metro Rail Corporation, Patna Metro Rail Project, Madhya Pradesh Metro Rail Corporation Limited are operating without any full time / dedicated Managing Director. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry should stress upon the need of appointing full-time Managing Director in all the Metro Corporations / Projects and take up the matter with various State Governments at the earliest. The Committee also recommend that frequent transfers of Managing Directors of various metro corporations / projects may also be avoided to ensure constant and continued focus.”*

1.6 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:-

*“Ministry has requested State Governments, vide letter dated 24.4.2023, to appoint full time Managing Directors for their respective Metro Rail Corporations at the earliest for smooth implementation of the Metro Projects.”*

**1.7 The Committee appreciate that the Ministry has promptly initiated further consequential action on the recommendation and impressed upon the State Governments to appoint full time Managing Director(s) in all the Metro Corporations. However, the Committee are not aware as to whether their recommendation regarding**



avoidance of frequent transfers of Managing Directors of various Metro Corporations have also been communicated to the State Governments. Considering that unhindered continuance at the highest level is vital for timely implementation of metro project(s), the Committee stressed the need of full time Managing Director, preferably having a reasonable tenure. The Committee, therefore, desire specific information on the tangible steps taken by the Ministry in ensuring that the Managing Directors of various Metro Corporations are not frequently transferred.

### Recommendation No.7

#### Setting of timeline for completion of pending/ongoing projects under Atal Mission for Rejuvenation & Urban Transformation (AMRUT) 1.0

1.8 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*“The Committee note that the financial outlay of the AMRUT 1.0 was Rs.1 lakh crore with Central Assistance of Rs.50,000 crores (50% of total outlay) over 05 years, i.e., from 2015-16 to 2019-20. The total approved plan size of the mission was Rs.77,640 crore covering 500 cities. The Mission was subsumed in AMRUT 2.0 and extended till March, 2023 to complete the ongoing projects. The Committee have been informed that out of 5,883 grounded projects, 4,764 projects have been completed. Physical works worth Rs.68,730 crore, i.e. 88% of the approved plan size has been completed so far. As regards funding, as per AMRUT 2.0 Mission Guidelines, Rs.10,000 crore central funding is allocated for AMRUT projects till March 2023. The clarification for delay in completion of AMRUT 1.0 projects furnished by the Ministry is that the projects under AMRUT are large infrastructure projects with long gestation period and take significant time for completion. The delay is largely because of COVID-19 pandemic, delayed approvals / NOCs from concerned departments. The Ministry has submitted that the ongoing AMRUT projects will take another 6 months to one year for completion. The Committee observe that even after completion of the extended period of AMRUT 1.0 Mission, the projects taken under the Mission are yet to be completed. Moreover, the Ministry has launched AMRUT 2.0 in October, 2021 and subsumed the pending projects of AMRUT 1.0 in AMRUT 2.0 while keeping separate funding. The Committee are of the view that gestation period forms the very basis of setting timelines in any project and it can be inferred from the submission of the Ministry, gestation period involved in the various projects submitted by the State / UTs to MoHUA under AMRUT was not taken into account while sanctioning of projects. The Committee, therefore, recommend that –*

- (i) *The Ministry should set timeline for completion of the pending projects and all the pending/ongoing projects undertaken under AMRUT 1.0 must be completed within*

*that stipulated timeline; and*

- (ii) *The Ministry should ensure completion of projects under first phase of any Scheme/Mission before launching any subsequent phase."*

1.9 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:-

*"AMRUT Mission has been extended beyond 31.3.2023 till 31.3.2024 for completion of ongoing AMRUT projects. No further extension of time would be considered and any spill over liability would be borne by the respective State Governments.*

*AMRUT Division is making all out efforts to fast-track implementation of AMRUT projects. Progress of projects is regularly reviewed and monitored through video conferences, webinars, workshops and site-visits etc. Progress of projects is regularly updated by States/UTs on a dedicated AMRUT portal. Hand holding is also provided to States/UTs/ULBs to resolve issues as and when required.*

*AMRUT Mission was launched in June 2015 with focus on providing household tap connections in select major 500 cities of the country. Subsequently, in September 2015, Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) of United Nations were accepted by major countries. SDG-6 targets reliable water supply and sanitation for all citizens by 2030. In order to achieve SDG-6 in a time bound manner it is imperative to take up water supply and sanitation services in all towns across the country. Therefore, AMRUT 2.0 was launched in October, 2021 without waiting for completion of ongoing AMRUT projects."*

**1.10 The Committee appreciate that with a view to achieving SDG-6 of reliable water supply and sanitation for all citizens by 2030 in a time bound manner, AMRUT 2.0 was launched without waiting for completion of ongoing AMRUT projects. However, the recommendation of the Committee was not aimed at a specific scheme but to serve as general Guidelines to ensure timely completion of targets sought to be achieved through various scheme(s) of the Ministry. The Committee are of the considered opinion that steps such as launching of subsequent phase of the Scheme without completion of projects under the first phase, merging the incomplete projects of the first phase with the subsequent phase and extending the time period for completion of the projects from time to time gives legitimacy to the lackadaisical approach of the States/various other implementing Agencies. As regards setting up of timelines for AMRUT projects, the Committee feel that keeping in view the endeavor of the Ministry to achieve SDG-6 by 2030, it becomes all the more important to set timelines and adhere to those timelines for completion of the various projects under AMRUT and AMRUT 2.0. The Committee would**

therefore, reiterate their recommendation.

### Recommendation No.14

#### Introducing fourth tranche of loan of Rs.1 lakh under PM SVANidhi Scheme.

1.11 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*“This Committee in their Tenth Report on PM SVANidhi had suggested MoHUA to explore the possibility of extending the Scheme beyond March, 2022 as it directly benefits the street vendors and has been received well. The Committee are pleased to note that PM SVANidhi scheme has been extended beyond March, 2022. Accordingly, loaning under the Scheme shall continue till December, 2024 and the disbursement of interest subsidy @7% till Financial Year 2027-28 with total outlay of Rs.2187.49 crore. Accordingly, Rs.433.94 crore under RE for the FY 2022-23 was made available only in end of December, 2022 to the Ministry and by 01.02.2023, the Ministry was able to utilize only 37.36 % of the allocated funds. However, the Ministry has submitted before the Committee that it is expected that the remaining amount shall also be utilized by the end of the financial year 2022-23.*

*In the Financial Year 2023-24, the proposed allocation is Rs.468 crore against which a target of 8 lakh vendors has been fixed. On the observation of the Committee that loan target proposed for the Financial Year 2023-24 has been reduced vis-à-vis the targets set for the previous Financial Years, the Ministry explained that as per the approval accorded by the Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs (CCEA), the targets for loan disbursal for 1st, 2nd and 3rd tranches of loans of Rs. 10,000, Rs. 20,000 and Rs.50,000 respectively are 42 lakh, 12 lakh and 3 lakh respectively till December 2024. As such, the total loans to be disbursed till December 2024 is 57 lakh, out of which 41.6 lakh loans have already been disbursed. Out of the remaining loans a target of 8 lakh which includes both ban to the new Street Vendors and to the Street Vendors who wants to avail higher loan after repayment of earlier loans, has been kept for the Financial Year 2023-24.*

*The Committee believe that with the extension of the Scheme, the availability of funds is not an issue under PM SVANidhi. As the Scheme played a vital role in empowering the lowest rung of the society, i.e., the street vendors by making financial assistance available to them, incentivizing regular payment and has successfully brought vendors in the formal banking system, the Committee urge the Ministry to consider introducing a fourth tranche of loan of Rs.1 lakh under PM SVANidhi for those interested vendors*

*whose credit rating is good and intend to expand their business. The Committee would also like the Ministry to conduct an 'Impact assessment Study' of the PM SVANidhi Scheme and report to the Committee."*

1.12 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:-

*"Initially PM SVANidhi Scheme was launched to facilitate working capital loan up to ₹10,000 till March 2022. Considering requirement of enhanced loans, the second loan up to ₹20,000 was introduced on 09.4.2021. Further, the Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs (CCEA) in its meeting held on 27.6.2022 approved provision of 3<sup>rd</sup> loan of up to ₹50,000 with a term of 36 months. Ministry of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (M/o MSME) has launched Udyam Assist Portal, as an extension of providing benefits to Street Vendors beyond PM SVANidhi, by providing them MSME status. With the Udyam Assist Certificate, Street Vendors can access loans from lending institutions under Priority Sector Lending. The credit history of the PM SVANidhi beneficiaries will help them avail higher loans from the formal credit channel. The Ministry has assigned a quick assessment study of the scheme to Indian School of Business, Hyderabad and the report is to be submitted to the Ministry for its consideration."*

**1.13 The Committee desire that the outcome of the assessment study being conducted by the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs should be intimated to them in the right earnest.**

### **Recommendation No.15**

#### **Need for extension of Deendayal Antyodaya Yojana – National Urban Livelihoods Mission (DAY-NULM)**

1.14 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*"The Committee note that the Scheme is primarily aimed at reducing poverty of urban households by enabling them to access self employment and skilled wage employment opportunities, building strong grassroots level institutions of Urban Poor etc. The period of the Scheme is ending on 31st March, 2023.*

*From the data furnished by the Ministry, the Committee have observed that since 2018-19, there has been more than 97% utilisation of funds. The Committee also note that under this Scheme placement of around 70% of the skilled persons has been achieved. The Committee appreciate that the Ministry has started a path-breaking skilling initiative for the largely unorganized labour force in the construction sector named 'National Initiative for Promotion of Upskilling of Nirman Workers' (NIPUN) w.e.f. 20.06.2022 to*

*bring positive impact in the lives of more than one-lakh construction workers in partnership with the National Skill Development Corporation (NSDC) under Ministry of Skill Development and Entrepreneurship (MoSDE).*

*The Committee are of the view that large rural population who are often unskilled migrate to our cities in search of employment opportunities. With the increasing use of technology and machines in various spheres of life, acquiring skills is of paramount importance for their employability, a fact that has also been underlined by various industries from time to time. In view of the fact that skill based training programmes are necessary for sustainable growth of cities, the Committee feel that there is need to continue the programme in future also and recommend that the period of the Scheme may be extended beyond 31st March, 2023."*

1.15 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:-

*"Expenditure Finance Committee (EFC) has considered the proposal for Deendayal Antyodaya Yojana – National Urban Livelihoods Mission 2.0 (DAY-NULM 2.0) on 08.7.2022 and appraised the same for further approval of Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs (CCEA). Pending the approval of CCEA, Ministry of Finance vide their O.M. dated 10.3.2023 have conveyed the extension of DAY-NULM scheme beyond March, 2023 till 30.9.2023 within the sanctioned outlay of Budget Estimates / Revised Estimates of FY 2023-24."*

**1.16 The Committee observe that only an interim extension till 30.09.2023 has been granted to Deendayal Antyodaya Yojana – National Urban Livelihoods Mission. The Committee, therefore reiterates its earlier recommendation and desire that the decision for extension of the scheme beyond 30.09.2023 should be expedited and adequate budget be provided to the Scheme in the current financial year so that there shall be no interruption in the Scheme. The Committee also desire to be updated about the status of extension and financial allocation made to the Scheme.**

## CHAPTER II

### OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT

#### Recommendation No.1

#### Need to Increase Budgetary allocation of Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs

2.1 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*"The Committee appreciate that the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs (MoHUA) has been able to utilize more than 99 percent of the funds allocated during the last two financial years i.e. 2020-21 and 2021-2022. The Committee, however, note with concern that even though the total expenditure budget of the Government has increased by more than 5.5 Lakh Crore, the allocation to Ministry has been reduced from Rs.76,549.46 crore (1.94% of total expenditure budget) in 2022-23 to Rs.76,431.60 crore (1.70% of total expenditure budget) in 2023-24. The Committee further note that the percentage share of allocation of the Ministry in Centrally Sponsored Schemes and Central Sector Schemes has also been reduced from 10.23% in FY2022-23 to 9.68% in FY2023-24 and from 2.33% in FY2022-23 to 1.80% in FY2023-24 respectively.*

*The Committee are of the opinion that such reduced allocation to the Ministry is in stark contrast to the rapid urbanisation and rising aspirations of Urban India whose contribution in India's Gross Domestic Product is estimated to be more than 60% and whose population is projected to reach 55 Crores in 2030 from 37.71 Crore in 2011.*

*The Committee feel that in order to meet the challenges of urbanisation and realise the full potential of human capital in our cities, comprehensive development of Physical, Institutional, Social and Economic Infrastructure is required and the various schemes / missions of the Ministry are contributing towards achievement of this goal. The Committee are of the view that the budgetary support for the Ministry is required to be in tune with the entrusted responsibility of comprehensive urbanization. The Committee therefore recommend the Ministry to take up the matter with Ministry of Finance and impress upon the need to increase the Budgetary allocation of the Ministry for funding urban infrastructure requirement to make our cities sustainable, safe, resilient and inclusive."*

2.2 In their written reply, the Ministry has stated as under:-

*"Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs (MoHUA) would like to highly appreciate the*

concerns raised by the Hon'ble Committee regarding the need for increasing Budgetary allocations for funding urban infrastructure requirements to make out cities sustainable, safe, resilient and inclusive.

In order to meet the challenges of growing urbanization and realize the full potential of human capital in our cities, MoHUA has formulated different schemes, policies and programmes; catering the needs of different urban sectors, such as urban transport, urban housing, urban infrastructure and urban livelihood etc. In this direction several Centrally Sponsored and Central Sector schemes have been launched by MoHUA from time to time, namely Mass Rapid Transit System & Metro Projects, Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana – Urban (PMAY-U), Atal Mission for Rejuvenation and Urban Transformation (AMRUT), Swachh Bharat Mission-Urban (SBM-U), Smart Cities Mission (SCM), Deendayal Antyodaya Yojana-National Urban Livelihoods Mission (DAY-NULM) and Pradhan Mantri Street Vendor Atmanirbhar Nidhi (PMSVANidhi). MoHUA has always strived for availability of sufficient funds of these schemes / programmes so that schemes could be implemented in accordance with the approved allocation and timeline.

Ministry would like to submit that requirement of funds is projected to Ministry of Finance on the basis of pace of expenditure and demand from States / Union Territories (UTs) / Implementing Agencies under various scheme/ projects. However, Ministry-wise allocations are made by Ministry of Finance on the basis of resource assessment of the Government, the available fiscal space and other related factors.

Details of Budgetary allocations provided for schemes of MoHUA during the FY 2022-23 and FY 2023-24 is given as under:-

(₹ crore)				
Sl. No.	Name of Schemes	BE 2022-23	RE 2022-23	BE 2023-24
	1	2	3	4
1.	MRTS & Metro Projects	23,875.00	20,401.08	23,175.01
2.	PMAY(Urban)	28,000.00	28,708.01	25,103.03
3.	AMRUT	7,300.00	6,500.00	8,000.00
4.	Mission for 100 Smart Cities	6,800.00	8,800.00	8,000.00
5.	Swachh Bharat Mission-Urban	2,300.00	2,000.00	5,000.00
6.	DAY-NULM	900.00	550.00	0.01
7.	CPWD (Scheme)	3,474.00	3,374.02	2,799.96
8.	PM SVANidhi	150.00	433.94	468.00
9.	PHE Sector Development	2.00	2.00	2.00
	<b>Total:</b>	<b>72,801.00</b>	<b>70,769.05</b>	<b>72,548.01</b>

It may be seen that adequate funds have been made available for these schemes for the financial year (FY) 2023-24. Budgetary Estimates (BE) of FY 2023-24 in respect of

*AMRUT 2.0, SBM-U 2.0, SCM and PM SVANidhi schemes have increased vis-à-vis BE of these schemes for FY 2022-23. Although, overall allocation for schemes of MoHUA has come down for the FY 2023-24 against that of FY 2022-23, it may be observed that only token provision for DAY-NULM scheme has been made as Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs (CCEA)'s approval to the proposal for DAY-NULM 2.0 is awaited. Further, against estimated requirement of ₹30,196.44 crore under PMAY-U scheme for FY 2023-24, an allocation of ₹25,103.03 crore have been made for the time being. Additional funds would be sought at RE 2023-24 stage or through supplementary grant at appropriate stage based on the physical and financial progress achieved under the Scheme.*

*Besides the grants in support from the Central Governments for supporting the rapid pace of urbanization, other sources of funding, such as funding through extra budgetary resources, Public Private Partnership (PPP) and municipal bonds etc. are also being encouraged.*

*Ministry would also like to assure the Hon'ble Committee that Ministry will continue to demand additional funds, if required, at the stage of Revised Estimates/ Supplementary Demand for Grants during 2023-24 based on the physical and financial progress achieved under various schemes. Ministry reiterates its commitment to the vision of developing urban areas with distinct identity providing ease of living, responsive governance, clean and sustainable environment, rapid economic growth and livelihood opportunities for the citizens."*

## **Recommendation No. 2**

### **Utilisation of funds under various Scheme(s)**

2.3 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*"The Committee have observed that there has been gross underutilization of funds under some Major Scheme(s) during the financial year 2022-23 till January, 2023. Responding to the Committee's apprehension about the utilization of remaining amount within the period of less than 02 months, the Ministry submitted that they are hopeful to spend almost the entire funds made available under various schemes in the Revised Estimate (RE). The Ministry informed that one of the reasons for under-utilization of funds till January, 2023 was introduction of revised procedure of Ministry of Finance for flow of Central Share (CS) through Public Finance Management System (PFMS), wherein the States / UTs have to realign their systems to comply with the mandatory requirements of the revised system. Most of the States were not ready for this and most of the States took time for compliance. In the absence of the mandatory compliance of Ministry of*



Finance (MoF)'s instructions, CS funds couldn't be released even though funds were concurred by Finance Division. This resulted in the low quantum of CS fund release in spite of the fact that sufficient proposals from the States/UTs were already received and approved by the Ministry.

The Committee have observed from the scheme-wise utilization details furnished by the Ministry that as on 01.02.2023, in some Schemes/Mission more than 70% of allocation has been utilized viz. PMAY-74.35%, AMRUT-84.85%, MRTS & Metro Projects-87.64%, whereas, it is less than 50% of RE in others, viz., Swachh Bharat Mission-46.90%, DAY-National Urban Livelihood Mission-21.21%, PM Svanidhi Mission-37.35%. The Committee, therefore, do not agree with the submission of the Ministry.

The Committee are of the view that rush of expenditure at the fag end of the financial year is against the principles of financial propriety and a violation of the prescribed guidelines issued by Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance. While impressing upon the needs to follow the principles of financial propriety of even utilization of funds throughout the financial year, the Committee recommend the Ministry to take all necessary steps to utilize the balance of allocated funds of the current financial year."

2.4 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:-

"As recommended by the Hon'ble Committee, Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs (MoHUA) has taken all necessary steps to ensure even utilization of funds throughout the financial year. Divisions of MoHUA, which are responsible for implementation of schemes/projects, took necessary action to speed up the implementation of schemes / projects so that allocated funds could be fully utilized. Measures such as, close monitoring of progress under schemes/projects through periodical review meetings and site visits, handholding of State/UTs/Urban Local Body (ULB) functionaries and removal/simplification of procedural hurdles etc. have been resorted to in order to expedite the implementation of schemes/projects.

The Ministry continued to maintain its track record of optimum utilization of allocated funds during the previous year and utilized 99.8 per cent of allocated funds at RE 2022-23. Scheme-wise details of allocation and utilization of funds during the financial year (FY) 2022-23 are as under:-

(₹ in crore)					
Sl.No.	Scheme	Budgetary Estimate (BE) 2022-23	Revised Estimate (RE) 2022-23	Actual Expenditure 2022-23	Percentage Expenditure with respect to RE 2022-23
1.	Metro Projects	23,875.00	20,401.08	20,392.27	99.96%

2.	Atal Mission for Rejuvenation and Urban Transformation (AMRUT)	7,300.00	6,500.00	6,499.90	100.00%
3.	Mission for 100 Smart Cities (SCM)	6,800.88	8,800.00	8,799.65	100.00%
4.	Swacch Bharat Mission – Urban (SBM-U)	2,300.00	2,000.00	1,935.79	96.79%
5.	Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana – Urban (PMAY-U)	28,000.00	28,708.01	28,652.75	99.81%
6.	Deendayal Antyodaya Yojana-National Urban Livelihoods Mission (DAY-NULM)	900.00	550.00	548.99	99.82%
7.	Pradhan Mantri Street Vendor Atmanirbhar Nidhi (PMSVANidhi)	150.00	433.94	406.42	93.66%
8.	Central Public Works Department (CPWD)	3,474.02	3,388.82	3,424.28	101.49%
	<b>Total:</b>	<b>72,799.90</b>	<b>70,781.85</b>	<b>70,660.05</b>	<b>99.83%</b>

*As may be seen from details of utilisation of funds under major scheme/ projects of MoHUA, 99.83 per cent allocation provided at RE 2022-23 have been utilised. Thus by the end of the FY 2022-23, allocation for schemes/ projects have been optimally utilised, except PM SVANidhi schemes where somewhat less expenditure is observed.*

*It may be submitted with regard to PM SVANidhi scheme that its duration was up to March, 2022 only. Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs (CCEA) in its meeting held on 27.4.2022 approved the proposal of extension of the scheme till FY 2027-28 with the total outlay of ₹2,187.49 crore, which includes ₹507.93 crore as outlay for FY 2022-23. As extension was awaited, Budgetary allocation for the scheme for FY 2022-23 was kept at ₹150 crore. Additional allocation of ₹283.94 crore could be made available at RE 2022-23 stage only i.e. by the end of December, 2022. Thereafter, MoHUA took sincere steps to utilise the funds allocated under RE and finally the expenditure around 93.66% could be achieved.*

*The recommendation of the Committee has, however, been noted and due care as well as necessary steps will continue to be taken to utilise the allocated funds during the current financial year in accordance with the instructions/guidelines issued by Ministry of Finance."*

### **Recommendation No. 3**

**Exercising financial prudence in utilization of allocated funds under Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojna (Urban) [PMAY(U)] to meet the financial commitment under the Scheme**

2.5 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*"The Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojna (Urban) was introduced in 2015 with the estimated investment of Rs.8.31 lakh crore wherein the Central Assistance is limited to 24%, i.e., Rs.2.03 lakh crore, in overall expenditure. In 2022-23, the Scheme had the highest Budgetary allocation which was 36.6% of the overall Budgetary allocations, i.e. Rs.28,000/- crore and was subsequently upwardly revised to Rs.28,708.01 crore at the RE stage. The Committee have been apprised that to meet requirement towards release of interest subsidy, Rs.5,500.00 crore was sought in RE 2022-23 over and above BE allocation. However, the scheme got Rs.708.00 crore additional in RE 2022-23 and balance would be re-appropriated from other heads of the scheme. As on 01.02.2023, the expenditure under the Scheme stands at 74.35% of the allocated funds.*

*In the ensuing Financial Year also, the proposed Budgetary allocation to PMAY(U) is highest, that is, 33% of the total BE. As per the Ministry's submission, out of approved Central Assistance of Rs.2.03 lakh crore, a total of Rs.1.39 lakh crore has already been released to States /UTs /CNAs as on 15.02.2023 which will reach up to Rs.1.44 lakh crore by the end of current financial year. Further, after adding the budget allocation of FY 2023-24, the total release of Central Assistance under the scheme would be Rs.1.68 lakh crore. The Committee have also been informed that the Ministry is reviewing the progress of implementation of PMAY-U with States /UTs regularly for early completion of all compliances for timely release of Central Assistance and in view of the progress being made by the States /UTs, it is expected to seek additional funds at appropriate stage in FY 2023-24 itself to meet a considerable portion of the demand.*

*The Committee apprehend that the utilization of remaining balance commitment for the Scheme i.e. Rs.35,000 crore (approx.) in the Financial Year 2024-25 that too by 31st December, 2024 to meet the target of 1.23 lakh houses will be a challenging task. The Committee feel that since this is a demand driven scheme, the Ministry needs to work in a mission mode to get the early completion of formalities from States / UTs to ensure timely utilization of funds and therefore, desire the Ministry to take immediate steps in the direction. The Committee hope that after channelizing the State / UTs, the Ministry will be able to utilize the budgetary allocations for the year 2023-24 and can seek additional funds at RE stage to make the objective 'Housing for all' achievable."*

2.6 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:-

*"PMAY - During Financial Year 2023-24, an allocation of ₹25,103.03 crore has been provided for Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana-Urban (PMAY-U) at BE stage. The Ministry is reviewing the progress of PMAY-U periodically with States / UTs through Monthly Review Meetings as well as Central Sanctioning & Monitoring Committee meetings wherein they*

*have been persuaded for early grounding of all the remaining housing projects so that these could be completed well within the extended scheme period. States/UTs have also been urged to launch a special drive /campaign to complete all the ongoing work at the grounded houses/projects sites and submit claims for release of subsequent instalments of Central Assistance along with other compliances as stipulated in the scheme guidelines so that funds could be released and utilized timely. They have also been advised to focus on utilizing funds for completion/closure of houses/projects and set a judicious limit in the PFMS in a manner that ULBs with faster progress are able to utilize funds commensurate with their performance, to enable faster completion of houses and ensure that their progress is not hampered due to lack of funds.*

*Thus, the Ministry is taking all necessary measures for early utilization of allocated budget so that additional funds could be sought at RE stage or through Supplementary Demand for Grants in the FY 2023-24 itself reducing the burden for release of Central Assistance in FY 2024-25 considerably."*

### **Recommendation No. 5**

#### **Urban Transport Planning & Capacity Building Scheme**

2.7 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*"The Urban Transport Planning & Capacity Building Scheme was formulated in August, 2008 for taking up Transportation and Traffic related studies. The Committee note that in line with National Urban Transport Policy 2006, this Scheme aims to promote Comprehensive and Integrated Urban Transport Planning, Integration of usage of land and transport by means of preparing Comprehensive Mobility Plans (CMPs) / Detailed Project Reports (DPRs) / Transportation Studies; adoption of Intelligent Transport Systems; launching of awareness campaigns etc.. The current tenure of the scheme is up to 31.3.2023.*

*The Committee feel that most of the cities in the country are grappling with congestion and traffic related issues. Hence, this scheme can immensely contribute in preparation of comprehensive mobility plan and Integrated Urban Transport Planning leading to efficient, comfortable and fast mobility in urban areas which can have a multiplier effect on productivity, sustainability and livability of our cities. The Committee have also observed that there has been a rising tendency to announce metro projects without proper study of their need/feasibility taking into account the population density, area of the city and other relevant factors which results in poor ridership and under utilization of valuable resources which could have been utilised elsewhere more judiciously and productively. Against this background, the role of Urban Transport Planning & Capacity*

*Building Scheme become all the more critically important in sanctioning of such capital intensive projects.*

*The Committee, therefore, recommend the Ministry to review the tenure of Urban Transport Planning & Capacity Building Scheme and consider its extension as its competence in the area of transportation and traffic related issues can have a lasting effect in urban planning reforms and making our cities 'sustainable cities of tomorrow'."*

2.8 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:-

*"In-principle approval of the competent authority has been obtained for extending the Urban Transport Planning & Capacity Building Scheme for another 3 years or till the commencement of the 16<sup>th</sup> Finance Commission and preparation of a "Note for consideration of Standing Finance Committee (SFC)" is under finalization."*

### **Recommendation No. 6**

#### **Augmentation of City Bus Services Including Associated Infrastructure and Green Urban Mobility Initiatives**

2.9 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*"In the Budget Speech 2021-22, the Finance Minister announced the launching of a new scheme at a cost of ₹18,000 crores to support augmentation of public bus transport services. It was stated that the scheme will facilitate deployment of innovative PPP models to enable private sector players to finance, acquire, operate and maintain over 20,000 buses. Since the announcement, the Committee in their 5<sup>th</sup> Report (17<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) on Demands for Grants (2021-22) and their 12<sup>th</sup> Report (17<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) on Demands for Grants (2022-23) enquired about the non-implementation of the Scheme so far and stressed upon the need to implement the Scheme on a Mission mode. In the half-yearly statement by the Minister of Housing and Urban Affairs regarding the status of implementation of the recommendations contained in the 12<sup>th</sup> Report of the Committee, the Ministry submitted that the draft Cabinet Note of the proposed scheme, which was sent to the Ministry of Finance on 17.5.2022 for their approval, has since been approved. Regarding the latest status of this Scheme, the Ministry have informed that the approval of Hon'ble Finance Minister on the draft cabinet note has been obtained on 05.12.2022 and submitted for the consideration and approval of the Cabinet.*

*The Committee are surprised to note that though this is the third Financial Year since the announcement of this Scheme, yet it is at approval stage and even in budgetary allocation for the financial year 2023-24, no provision has been made for this scheme.*

*The Committee, therefore, recommend that on receiving the Cabinet approval for the Scheme, the necessary financial allocation may be sought from the Ministry of Finance and may be briefed about the modalities finalized for the implementation of the Scheme at the earliest."*

2.10 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:

*"The recommendation of the Committee has been noted for compliance."*

### **Recommendation No. 8**

#### **Regular monitoring and reviewing of sanctioned projects under AMRUT 2.0 and seeking additional Budgetary allocation in coming years**

2.11 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*"Regular monitoring and reviewing of sanctioned projects under AMRUT 2.0 and seeking additional Budgetary allocation in coming years The Committee appreciate that AMRUT 2.0 is a paperless online mission which has significantly improved the process of project approval and so far projects amounting to Rs. 1.29 lakh crore has been approved by the Ministry. However, the data furnished by the Ministry show that only 202 projects worth Rs.2787 crore has been grounded and 10 projects worth Rs.90 crore has been completed. As regards financial progress, out of committed Central Assistance of Rs.76,760 crore, only around Rs.5800 crore of Central Assistance has been released so far. The Committee have also observed that 6 States / UTs are still in the process of submission of first tranche of State Water Action Plan (SWAP). The Committee, therefore, feel that the physical and financial progress is very negligible despite the fact that the Mission is in the Second phase and various stakeholders, viz., the States and ULBs are likely to be more aware of the modalities of the Scheme. With this pace, the Committee apprehend that like the first phase of AMRUT, it will be difficult to achieve the projected targets within the 05 year period of the Mission. The Committee also feel that since 6,527 projects worth Rs.1,29,000 crore have already been sanctioned by the Ministry, the demand for funds under the Scheme is likely to increase substantially in the future. The Committee, therefore, recommend that:-*

- (i) MOHUA may constantly monitor and review the physical and financial progress of the Scheme and engage with the States / ULBs to ensure timely completion of sanctioned projects; and*
- (ii) The Ministry may seek enhanced Budgetary allocation for the Scheme in the*

*coming years to meet the likely increase in requirement of funds so that projects sanctioned under the scheme may not languish due to paucity of funds."*

2.12 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:-

*"In order to fast-track the implementation of AMRUT, the progress is periodically reviewed & monitored through regular video conferences/webinars/workshops/site-visits etc. by Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs (MoHUA) with the States/UTs/ULBs. There is a dedicated collaborative Technology Platform for tracking the progress of various activities associated with projects implementation. Hand-holding is provided to the States/UTs/ULBs, where required.*

*Initially, it takes time to prepare Detailed Project Reports (DPRs), appraise DPRs and plan tender action for projects. Progress of project implementation is now improving rapidly. DPRs for 2,793 projects costing ₹56,200.03 crore have been prepared and Notice Inviting Tenders (NITs) for 1,619 projects of worth ₹30,979.07 crore have already been issued. Progress is likely to improve further and accordingly demand of funds will be regulated."*

### **Recommendation No. 10**

#### **Setting of Annual Physical and Financial Targets under Swachh Bharat Mission (Urban) [SBM (U)]**

2.13 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*"The Committee have been apprised that as such no Annual Plans were finalized under the Swachh Bharat Mission (Urban). Under SBM(U) 1.0, total mission allocation was Rs.14,622.73 crores. Under SBM (U) 2.0, launched on 1st October, 2021, mission allocation of Rs.36,465 crores was provided for the mission period 2021-2026. The Mission is implemented for the five year Mission period, the physical targets were decided accordingly for entire period. There are no yearly physical and financial targets and hence the question of co-relation between yearly targets – physical and financial and variations or reasons therefore do not arise. According to the Ministry, this is so because various States / UTs are free to draw any quantum of Central Sector fund (from the allocation made to them for the Mission period) at any time during the currency of the Mission as per their requirement, and their state of administrative readiness to undertake and execute the projects at ground. The Cities prepare the Action Plans, which are aggravated by the State Governments and thereafter, placed for approval of the National Advisory and Review Committee (NARC). However, the Output and Outcome targets are decided with subsequent yearly targets for the entire mission period.*

*The Committee are not convinced with the argument forwarded by the Ministry because under other Missions of the Ministry, namely, Smart City Mission, AMRUT or PM SVANidhi, total outlay and committed Central Assistance is decided at the launching of the Mission but then to monitor and proper implementation of the Mission, Annual financial and physical targets are set and strived for. The Committee are of the opinion that the absence of Annual physical and financial targets leaves the Mission without any accountability till the Mission period ends. The Committee are of the view that a realistic budgetary allocation can be sought on the basis of annual targets, and therefore, recommend that under SBM (U) 2.0 the Ministry should both set financial and physical targets from the Financial Year 2023-24 onwards."*

2.14 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:-

*"In compliance of the Recommendations of the Hon'ble Committee and in accordance with the latest instructions of Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance, the financial targets in the form of an annual action plan for the year 2023-24 is being incorporated in the Public Finance Management System (PFMS). The physical targets for the year 2023-24 have already been fixed and incorporated in the Output-Outcome monitoring framework."*

### **Recommendation No. 11**

#### **Need for optimal utilization of funds allocated under Information Education and Communication (IEC) and Capacity Building (CB) heads of Swachh Bharat Mission (Urban) [SBM (U)].**

2.15 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*"The Committee understand that under Swachh Bharat Mission (Urban) [SBM(U)], behavioural change, spreading awareness and capacity Augmentation for Urban Local Bodies (ULBs) are critical components to spread the importance of sanitation and cleanliness. However, as per the information provided by the Ministry, the expenditure on Information, Education and Communication (IEC) in most of the States is almost 'nil'. As regards, Capacity Building (CB) also, the expenditure is also minimal. About the funds released under these component, the Ministry submitted that under SBM(U), for IEC Rs.1010.67 crore, for CB Rs.277.59 crore and under SBM2.0, Rs.141.17 crore for IEC and Rs.123.88 crore for CB have been released so far.*

*The Committee feel that Swachhta is a concept which is required to be followed constantly and continuously throughout the year by all the stakeholders. Further, public*



awareness and people's participation is most crucial ingredient for spreading the importance and benefits of cleanliness and safe sanitation. The Committee appreciate that the Ministry has launched certain application and portal related to Swachhta for people's participation in this Mission. At the same time, the Committee are of the view that unless the general public is informed and made aware regarding the usage of these applications/portal, the desired outcomes will be difficult to attain and for the purpose, the role of IEC and CB activities throughout the year is crucial. Taking note of the fact that under this Scheme better performing States are the ones which are utilizing the funds under this head optimally, the Committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry should encourage all the States and UTs to optimally utilize the funds allocated under IEC and CB heads of SBM (U) 2.0 and ensure compliance by all the States/UTs to achieve lasting impact of the Mission."

2.16 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:

"In compliance of the recommendations of the Committee, the States/UTs are being constantly advised to submit their Action Plans under Information, Education, Communication & Behaviour Change (IEC & BC), Capacity Building and Skill Development & Knowledge management component (CB, SD & KM). Out of Mission Allocation of ₹3,040.35 crore under IEC & BC component and ₹1,535.80 crore under Capacity Building (CB) component, Action Plans of ₹1,829.75 crore under IEC component and ₹916.32 crore under CB component have been approved so far."

### **Recommendation No. 12**

#### **Operation and Maintenance (O&M) of Public Toilets (PT) / Community Toilets (CT).**

2.17 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

"The Operation and Maintenance of Public Toilets/Community Toilet are essential for sustainability of the Swachh Bharat Mission (Urban). In this regard, the Ministry has informed that the operation and maintenance of these assets remains a responsibility of the State Government which delivers it through their own funds and they have the liberty to operate any model for operation and maintenance of Community/Public Toilets which also include levying of user charges. However, under SBM-U 2.0, the States/UTs have to fulfill compliance of certain entry level conditions which inter alia also include levying of user charges by the Urban Local Bodies (ULBs) for the use of public toilets to be eligible for claim of Central Assistance under various components. However, the States/UTs have the relaxation period of two years (the first two years of SBM-U 2.0 Mission) for levying of the user charges. The Ministry apart from 3rd party certification, facilitates O&M through steps like Swachh Survekshan, Swachhata App that enables citizens to

register sanitation related complaints including those pertaining to Public Toilets, mapping all CT/PTs on Google maps and providing feedback and rating facilities of public toilets etc. The Committee note that one of the Mission objectives of SBM(U) was to augment capacity of ULBs to create an enabling environment in CAPEX (capital expenditure) and OPEX (operation and maintenance) and accept that in this direction levying of user charges plays a pivotal role.

The Committee, therefore, stress that under SBM (U) 2.0, even though operation and maintenance of Public Toilets (PC) and Community Toilets (CT) is the State governments' responsibility but since assets have been created with central assistance and outcome of the Mission should not be restricted to mere creation of physical assets. There is a need for constant monitoring over operation and maintenance of PTs and CTs otherwise the assets created under the Mission and public money invested in them will go wasted."

2.18 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:-

"Sanitation being a State subject, it is the responsibility of the State Government/ULBs to decide upon any plan for Operation and Maintenance of community and public toilets constructed under Swachh Bharat Mission (Urban) [SBM-U]. In accordance with the Para-4.1.2 of the Guidelines of the SBM-U 2.0, the States have to mandatorily notify the provisions relating to levy and collection of user charges for services such as community/public toilets, to recover operational costs. Further, as per Para 5.2.7.3 of the guidelines, the States/UTs have been advised to submit all such proposals for construction of Community Toilets (CT)/Public Toilets (PTs) along with their Operation and Maintenance Plan for a period of 5 years to maintain their functionality duly approved by State Level Technical Committee (SLTC). As per Para 5.2.6, of the guidelines, the States are also advised to use a Digital system for capturing user feedback on regular basis, multiple times per day, for each CT / PT, with each feedback tagged to a Unique user ID. Additionally, the Swacchta App is to be used to provide feedback/register complaints regarding poor maintained or non functional CTs/PTs. As such, the National Mission Directorate of SBM-U at MoHUA has made enabling provisions under the scheme to ensure Operation and Maintenance of the assets created out of SBM-U funds. In addition, the operation, maintenance and functionality of these toilets are also monitored regularly through periodic third party assessment under annual Swachh Survekshan Survey and through Swachh Certification protocols."

### **Recommendation No. 13**

**Promotion of Indore as a Model City under SBM (U) in achieving cleanliness and Solid Waste Management**

2.19 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*“The Committee during their Study Visit to the city of Indore which has won the ‘Most Clean City’ status in the Swachh Survekshan Awards, consecutively for the last six years, were informed that people’s participation in the Swachhta Abhiyan (Cleanliness Drive) is the most significant factor in achieving the ‘most clean city’ status by Indore. It was also informed that since the beginning of the Mission, the city focused on one particular theme during the period of 01 year and the theme was reinforced through hoarding, billboards, local radio, continuous announcements in public transport system etc. which created awareness amongst the residents of Indore. As a result, the entire city of Indore is undertaking six way segregation of waste at source which not only improves the quality of waste but also the quality of output after its processing. The efficient segregation of waste at source also makes the processing faster and easier. The Committee desire that Indore city should be promoted as a ‘Model City’ under SBM (U) in Solid Waste Management & cleanliness and all the other Cities should be encouraged to emulate and adopt the ‘Indore model of cleanliness’.”*

2.20 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:-

*"As recommended by the Committee, all the success stories under SBM-U including Indore are given wide publicity at various forum across the country so that these are replicated in other parts of the country."*

#### **Recommendation No. 14**

#### **Introducing fourth tranche of loan of Rs.1 lakh under PM SVANidhi Scheme.**

2.21 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*"This Committee in their Tenth Report on PM SVANidhi had suggested MoHUA to explore the possibility of extending the Scheme beyond March, 2022 as it directly benefits the street vendors and has been received well. The Committee are pleased to note that PM SVANidhi scheme has been extended beyond March, 2022. Accordingly, loaning under the Scheme shall continue till December, 2024 and the disbursement of interest subsidy @7% till Financial Year 2027-28 with total outlay of Rs.2187.49 crore. Accordingly, Rs.433.94 crore under RE for the FY 2022-23 was made available only in end of December, 2022 to the Ministry and by 01.02.2023, the Ministry was able to utilize only 37.36 % of the allocated funds. However, the Ministry has submitted before the Committee that it is expected that the remaining amount shall also be utilized by the end of the financial year 2022-23.*

*In the Financial Year 2023-24, the proposed allocation is Rs.468 crore against which a target of 8 lakh vendors has been fixed. On the observation of the Committee that loan target proposed for the Financial Year 2023-24 has been reduced vis-à-vis the targets set for the previous Financial Years, the Ministry explained that as per the approval accorded by the Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs (CCEA), the targets for loan disbursement for 1st, 2nd and 3rd tranches of loans of Rs. 10,000, Rs. 20,000 and Rs.50,000 respectively are 42 lakh, 12 lakh and 3 lakh respectively till December 2024. As such, the total loans to be disbursed till December 2024 is 57 lakh, out of which 41.6 lakh loans have already been disbursed. Out of the remaining loans a target of 8 lakh which includes both ban to the new Street Vendors and to the Street Vendors who wants to avail higher loan after repayment of earlier loans, has been kept for the Financial Year 2023-24.*

*The Committee believe that with the extension of the Scheme, the availability of funds is not an issue under PM SVANidhi. As the Scheme played a vital role in empowering the lowest rung of the society, i.e., the street vendors by making financial assistance available to them, incentivizing regular payment and has successfully brought vendors in the formal banking system, the Committee urge the Ministry to consider introducing a fourth tranche of loan of Rs.1 lakh under PM SVANidhi for those interested vendors whose credit rating is good and intend to expand their business. The Committee would also like the Ministry to conduct an 'Impact assessment Study' of the PM SVANidhi Scheme and report to the Committee."*

2.22 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:-

*"Initially PM SVANidhi Scheme was launched to facilitate working capital loan up to ₹10,000 till March 2022. Considering requirement of enhanced loans, the second loan up to ₹20,000 was introduced on 09.4.2021. Further, the Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs (CCEA) in its meeting held on 27.6.2022 approved provision of 3<sup>rd</sup> loan of up to ₹50,000 with a term of 36 months. Ministry of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (M/o MSME) has launched Udyam Assist Portal, as an extension of providing benefits to Street Vendors beyond PM SVANidhi, by providing them MSME status. With the Udyam Assist Certificate, Street Vendors can access loans from lending institutions under Priority Sector Lending. The credit history of the PM SVANidhi beneficiaries will help them avail higher loans from the formal credit channel. The Ministry has assigned a quick assessment study of the scheme to Indian School of Business, Hyderabad and the report is to be submitted to the Ministry for its consideration."*

2.23 For comments please see para No. 1.13 of Chapter-I of the Report.

## Recommendation No. 15

### Need for extension of Deendayal Antyodaya Yojana – National Urban Livelihoods Mission (DAY-NULM)

2.24 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*"The Committee note that the Scheme is primarily aimed at reducing poverty of urban households by enabling them to access self employment and skilled wage employment opportunities, building strong grassroots level institutions of Urban Poor etc. The period of the Scheme is ending on 31st March, 2023.*

*From the data furnished by the Ministry, the Committee have observed that since 2018-19, there has been more than 97% utilisation of funds. The Committee also note that under this Scheme placement of around 70% of the skilled persons has been achieved. The Committee appreciate that the Ministry has started a path-breaking skilling initiative for the largely unorganized labour force in the construction sector named 'National Initiative for Promotion of Upskilling of Nirman Workers' (NIPUN) w.e.f. 20.06.2022 to bring positive impact in the lives of more than one-lakh construction workers in partnership with the National Skill Development Corporation (NSDC) under Ministry of Skill Development and Entrepreneurship (MoSDE).*

*The Committee are of the view that large rural population who are often unskilled migrate to our cities in search of employment opportunities. With the increasing use of technology and machines in various spheres of life, acquiring skills is of paramount importance for their employability, a fact that has also been underlined by various industries from time to time. In view of the fact that skill based training programmes are necessary for sustainable growth of cities, the Committee feel that there is need to continue the programme in future also and recommend that the period of the Scheme may be extended beyond 31st March, 2023."*

2.25 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:-

*"Expenditure Finance Committee (EFC) has considered the proposal for Deendayal Antyodaya Yojana – National Urban Livelihoods Mission 2.0 (DAY-NULM 2.0) on 08.7.2022 and appraised the same for further approval of Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs (CCEA). Pending the approval of CCEA, Ministry of Finance vide their O.M. dated 10.3.2023 have conveyed the extension of DAY-NULM scheme beyond March, 2023 till 30.9.2023 within the sanctioned outlay of Budget Estimates/Revised Estimates of FY 2023-24."*

2.26 For comments please see para No. 1.16 of Chapter-I of the Report.

### **Recommendation No. 16**

#### **Utilisation of Budgetary allocation of the Public Health Engineering (PHE) Sector Development Scheme**

2.27 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*"The Committee note that the erstwhile PHE Training programme was converted as PHE Sector Development Scheme a Central Sector Scheme, with a dedicated budget head. Under the Scheme, Central Public Health and Environmental Engineering Organisation (CPEEHO) which is the technical wing of MOHUA provides training in the field of Water Supply and Sanitation Sector to in-service engineers and para- engineering staff of the various State Public Health Engineering Departments, Water Supply and Sewerage Boards, Urban Local Bodies etc.*

*The Committee further note that the Budget under PHE Sector Development Scheme is Rs. 2 Crore. However, in the FY2022-23, nothing has been spent by the Ministry. Taking note of the fact that one of the roadblocks in implementation of various scheme related to AMRUT, SBM(U) is lack of technical expertise among various State Government Departments, ULBs etc., the Committee feel that a substantial amount of work is required to be done in capacity building, training etc. to fully equip various civic agency working under State Government and ULBs to maximise the benefits of the various Scheme(s) implemented by MOHUA. However, it is ironical that on one hand MOHUA is underlining the need to improve technical expertise of State Government departments/ULBs implementing various scheme(s) of the Ministry and on the other hand the budget meant for said training is not being fully utilised by them.*

*The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry may devise and conduct suitable training programme(s) for various State Government Departments/ULBs and other stakeholders involved in various Scheme(s) of MOHUA so that the available funds may be utilised meaningfully."*

2.28 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:

*"In compliance with the revised procedure by Ministry of Finance (MoF) in March 2022 for flow of funds through Public Finance Management System (PFMS), the PHE Sector Development Scheme with annual budget of less than ₹500 crore is to be operated through Central Nodal Agency (CAN) Model-2. The Ministry has already designated National Institute of Urban Affairs (NIUA) as the CNA to release funds. As a next step all*

*institutes were also requested to open the Zero Balance Subsidiary Accounts (ZBSAs) and to forward the fresh request for mapping of their institutes with PHE Sector Development Scheme so as to release the admissible payment. After compliance of MoF's instructions, proposals for release of funds were examined and approved to utilize the fund allotted during financial year 2022-23. However, funds could not be released due to last hour rush in spite of the fact that sufficient proposals from the institutes for PHE training and Research and Development activities were already received and approved by the Ministry. Focus under the scheme is to strengthen the PHE Training by empanelling additional academic and research institutions and also PHE Training Institutes to provide suitable training to in-service Engineers at State/ULB level."*

### **Recommendation No. 17**

#### **Providing of Login Credentials of Performance Monitoring Dashboards of various Mission and Projects to all the Members of Parliament**

2.29 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*"During the examination of various Schemes/Missions of the Ministry, it was brought to the knowledge of the Committee that for better monitoring of various Schemes, such as PMAY(U), SBM (U), AMRUT, etc., the Ministry after consultation with all the stakeholders have launched 'Performance Tracking Dashboards' carrying the State/UT-wise information related to progress of projects, fund released, Utilization pending, project timelines, graphical view of various -stages of execution etc. It will also have information, viz., timeline of project, sanction orders, UC, etc. The above Dashboards have been developed because providing crucial, important and timely information is an instrument in successful implementation of any scheme especially when the project is of immense national importance and which cater to aspiration of public at large.*

*The Committee, therefore, recommend that Login credentials for all such Dashboards created by the Ministry may be created and provided to all the Members of Parliament for enabling them day-to-day monitoring of status of execution of projects in districts, cities falling in their respective constituencies."*

2.30 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:-

*"The performance under Swachh Bharat Mission (Urban) [SBM-U] may be accessed through the following links:*

(i) SBM-U portal link: <https://sbmurban.org/>

- (ii) Safai Mitra Suraksha - <https://sss.sbmurban.org/>
- (iii) Swachh Survekshan 2022 - <https://sbmurban.org/ss-2022-result-dashboard>
- (iv) Legacy dumpsite remediation dashboard - <https://sbmurban.org/swachh-bharat-mission-progress>

*For Pradhan Mantri Aawas Yojana (Urban) [PMAY(U)], Ministry has already provided access of Dashboard to all Members of the Parliament by providing login and password so that they can also see and overview status of execution of projects under PMAY(U) in districts/cities falling in their respective constituencies. The Dashboard provides all information related to States/UTs-wise sanctioned houses, execution/occupation stages, fund released, Utilisation Certificate pending, project-wise fund sanction orders, project timelines, graphical view of various stages of execution, details of beneficiaries etc. The Dashboard also provides State, District and City-wise execution of each project, its present status, data of beneficiaries, fund status, its utilisation etc. State(s)/UTs were also requested to share all related information about the projects with elected representatives from local bodies, Legislative Assemblies and Members of Parliament of the concerned ward/constituency.*

*The webpage <https://smartcities.gov.in/cities-profiles> provides the publicly available city-wise profile of the 100 smart cities. The webpage is being updated to provide the information on the projects undertaken by the smart city and the financial details. In addition to this webpage, each of the 100 smart cities has its own website. These webpages/websites require no authentication."*

\*\*\*\*\*



## CHAPTER III

### RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT DESIRE TO PURSUE INVIEW OF THE REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT

#### Recommendation No. 9

#### Ensuring completion of Projects within the extended period of the Smart City Mission (SCM)

3.1 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*"The Committee note that the last round of selection under Smart City Mission was made in January 2018 and hence the stipulated period of 05 years has completed. As regards financial allocation made by the Ministry, out of overall financial support of Rs.48,000 crore to the Mission, Rs.36,561 crore has been released and Rs 33,012 crore (90% of total released) have been utilized by the Smart Cities. The Committee further note that 100 Smart Cities have proposed projects worth Rs.2,05,018 crore under the Mission. Out of which 7821 projects worth Rs.1,81,349 crore have been taken up. So far, 5343 projects worth Rs.1,00,450 crore could be completed. However, the city-wise physical progress of projects taken up under the Smart City Mission shows that there is a contrasting difference in the performance of various Cities. On the one hand, 32 Smart Cities have completed more than the number of Projects planned for implementation under SCM in some cases even four times more than the actual target. On the other hand, remaining 68 Smart Cities are yet to meet the project completion targets wherein the performance of some cities is quite dismal. Therefore, the total number of completed Projects gives a misleading picture because it also takes into account the excess projects accomplished by 32 performing Smart Cities. The Committee are of the opinion that if the number of 'excess projects' is removed from the total completed projects then the actual number of projects completed under the Mission would be far less than projected as on 31.01.2023. The fact remains that as on 31.01.2023, 68 Smart Cities have not achieved their physical targets under the Mission. The Mission period has been extended till June, 2023 to complete these projects and the Ministry has submitted before the Committee that all the Smart Cities are expected to complete their projects within the stipulated time.*

*The Committee while acknowledging the multiple challenges on-ground, including COVID-19 pandemic scenario, multi-sectoral projects, local challenges related to land, labour etc., stress that –*

(i) *the Ministry should rigorously pursue with the lagging Smart Cities and ensure*

*that both the physical and financial targets are actually achieved within the extended time period, i.e., June, 2023; and*

- (ii) *no further extension of time should be granted without a detailed assessment and addressing of reasons leading to such inordinate delay in completion of these projects."*

3.2 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:-

*"Being adaptive and agile in pivoting their initial plans to account for emerging challenges is one of the key characteristics of a Smart City. Smart City Plans (SCPs) with projects worth ₹2,05,018 crore were initially prepared by Smart Cities during the Challenge stage of the Mission. The objective of this SCP was to capture citizen needs and aspirations while drafting the overall vision, goals, and projects that the city would champion as part of the Mission.*

*Subsequent to selection of the city, the SPV was established, Board of the SPV constituted and human resources including the CEO, key managerial staff and project engineers etc. were hired. This team took on the task of actioning the initial SCP. The implementation of SCM at the City level is done by SPVs created for the purpose. These SPVs are entities registered under The Companies Act, 2013 with 50:50 ownership of Urban Local Bodies and respective States. They plan, implement, operate, and monitor their development projects. It was, at this stage, that on-ground implementation challenges in the form of land availability, litigations, regulatory challenges, financial difficulties, technology selection issues were encountered in few projects. Continuous deliberations within SCAF and on-going citizen engagement also brought forward new priorities. Further, the COVID pandemic led to reprioritization in most cities, forcing them to include components of health, education, active living, walking, cycling and placemaking to name a few areas in their plans.*

*Further, as per SCM Guidelines, Government of India will provide financial support to the extent of ₹48,000 crore over five years i.e., on an average ₹ 100 crore per city per year. An equal amount on a matching basis will be contributed by the State Government/ Urban Local Body (ULB), except for North-eastern and Hilly States where the sharing ratio was revised to 90:10.*

*The Ministry issued Advisory No. 13, dated 21.01.2019, titled "Policy for Managing Variation in the projects in the Smart City Proposal". This Advisory provided flexibility to Smart Cities to undertake changes in the SCP, without disturbing the spirit of the Challenge process to ensure that the core value of the Mission, that of being citizen-centric, could be adhered to, and that hurdles encountered in few projects were*

overcome by either modifying them or replacing them with alternate ones meeting similar objectives. Accordingly, the Boards of the Smart Cities SPV may have revised the projects to be taken up under the Smart Cities Mission. Thus, the number and cost of projects under the SCPs could be different from the actual projects undertaken by the SPV of Smart Cities. As on 26.5.2023; 7,862 projects worth ₹1,80,107 crores have been undertaken by the 100 Smart Cities out of which 5,762 projects (73%) worth ₹1,07,403 crore have been completed. Hence, the above status shows the satisfactory progress of the projects taken up by the Smart Cities.

It has been assessed that few projects in some Smart Cities have been delayed due to various reasons, such as:

- Delay has been witnessed in Convergence projects where there is an involvement of executing agency other than Smart City.
- Projects, where there are instances of resettlement/rehabilitation of local population such as housing and market re-development; and
- Integrated projects like Smart Roads and Complete streets where there is requirement for underground cabling and laying of all utilities, etc.
- Local factors such as climatic conditions, availability of resources, etc.

Based on the detailed deliberations with the respective Smart Cities on completion of ongoing projects, the Mission period for Smart Cities Mission has been extended up to June 2024 for completion of the ongoing 2,100 projects worth ₹72,704 crore.

So as to ensure the completion before June 2024 of the ongoing projects including those in laggard cities, few key steps being undertaken going forward are:

- (i) Regular monthly meetings with State officials like Chief Secretaries/senior Secretaries and Chairpersons / CEOs of SPVs for 20 most lagging cities are being taken at the level of Secretary, MoHUA.
- (ii) The Mission Director reviews the bottom 40 cities every month at his level with senior State and city officials.
- (iii) Nominee Directors of MoHUA on the Boards of SPVs in cities where project performance is a concern have been directed to visit slow moving projects in June 2023; ensure quarterly visits post that; ensure speedy de-bottlenecking of such projects, etc.

- (iv) *Peer-learning workshops on various aspects are being conducted regularly to ensure cities facing problems learn from front-runner cities and are subsequently able to shore up their project performance.*
- (v) *At State level, Mission implementation is being coordinated by the State level High Powered Steering Committee (HPSC). At the National level, implementation of SCM is monitored by an Apex Committee headed by Secretary, Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs (MoHUA).*
- (vi) *Smart Cities are being assessed on various parameters including, but not limited to, project implementation and utilization of funds through the Real Time Online Geospatial Management Information System (GMIS)."*

\*\*\*\*\*

## CHAPTER IV

### OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE COMMITTEE AND WHICH REQUIRE REITERATION

#### Recommendation No.4

#### Stressing the need of appointing a full-time Managing Director in a Metro Corporation

4.1 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*"The Committee have observed from the data provided by the Ministry that the physical and financial progress of some of the metro projects particularly in Patna, Surat, Agra, Bhopal and Indore is very tardy. The Committee acknowledge that metro is a complex subject and progress of the Metro projects depends upon various factors such as land acquisition, finalization of financial tie ups with external agencies, Statutory clearances, etc. The Committee are, therefore, of the opinion that the role of leadership in various metro projects become utmost important and crucial to understand, resolve, negotiate, facilitate and monitor these complex issues. However, the Committee are surprised to note that some of the Metro Corporations/Projects, namely Gujarat Metro Rail Corporation (GMRC) Limited, Mumbai Metro Line 3, Noida Metro Rail Corporation, Patna Metro Rail Project, Madhya Pradesh Metro Rail Corporation Limited are operating without any full time/dedicated Managing Director. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry should stress upon the need of appointing full-time Managing Director in all the Metro Corporations/Projects and take up the matter with various State Governments at the earliest. The Committee also recommend that frequent transfers of Managing Directors of various metro corporations/projects may also be avoided to ensure constant and continued focus."*

4.2 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:-

*"Ministry has requested State Governments, vide letter dated 24.4.2023, to appoint full time Managing Directors for their respective Metro Rail Corporations at the earliest for smooth implementation of the Metro Projects."*

4.3 For comments please see para No. 1.7 of Chapter-I of the Report.

## Recommendation No. 7

### Setting of timeline for completion of pending/ongoing projects under Atal Mission for Rejuvenation & Urban Transformation (AMRUT) 1.0

4.4 The Committee had recommended, in their original Report, as under:-

*"The Committee note that the financial outlay of the AMRUT 1.0 was Rs.1 lakh crore with Central Assistance of Rs.50,000 crore (50% of total outlay) over 05 years, i.e., from 2015-16 to 2019-20. The total approved plan size of the mission was Rs.77,640 crore covering 500 cities. The Mission was subsumed in AMRUT 2.0 and extended till March, 2023 to complete the ongoing projects. The Committee have been informed that out of 5,883 grounded projects, 4,764 projects have been completed. Physical works worth Rs.68,730 crore, i.e. 88% of the approved plan size has been completed so far. As regards funding, as per AMRUT 2.0 Mission Guidelines, Rs.10,000 crore central funding is allocated for AMRUT projects till March 2023. The clarification for delay in completion of AMRUT 1.0 projects furnished by the Ministry is that the projects under AMRUT are large infrastructure projects with long gestation period and take significant time for completion. The delay is largely because of COVID-19 pandemic, delayed approvals / NOCs from concerned departments. The Ministry has submitted that the ongoing AMRUT projects will take another 6 months to one year for completion. The Committee observe that even after completion of the extended period of AMRUT 1.0 Mission, the projects taken under the Mission are yet to be completed. Moreover, the Ministry has launched AMRUT 2.0 in October, 2021 and subsumed the pending projects of AMRUT 1.0 in AMRUT 2.0 while keeping separate funding. The Committee are of the view that gestation period forms the very basis of setting timelines in any project and it can be inferred from the submission of the Ministry, gestation period involved in the various projects submitted by the State / UTs to MoHUA under AMRUT was not taken into account while sanctioning of projects. The Committee, therefore, recommend that –*

- (i) *The Ministry should set timeline for completion of the pending projects and all the pending / ongoing projects undertaken under AMRUT 1.0 must be completed within that stipulated timeline;*
- (ii) *The Ministry should ensure completion of projects under first phase of any Scheme / Mission before launching any subsequent phase."*

4.5 In their written Reply, the Ministry has stated as follows:

*"AMRUT Mission has been extended beyond 31.3.2023 till 31.3.2024 for completion of*

*ongoing AMRUT projects. No further extension of time would be considered and any spill over liability would be borne by the respective State Governments.*

*AMRUT Division is making all out efforts to fast-track implementation of AMRUT projects. Progress of projects is regularly reviewed and monitored through video conferences, webinars, workshops and site-visits etc. Progress of projects is regularly updated by States/UTs on a dedicated AMRUT portal. Hand holding is also provided to States/UTs/ULBs to resolve issues as and when required.*

*AMRUT Mission was launched in June 2015 with focus on providing household tap connections in select major 500 cities of the country. Subsequently, in September 2015, Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) of United Nations were accepted by major countries. SDG-6 targets reliable water supply and sanitation for all citizens by 2030. In order to achieve SDG-6 in a time bound manner it is imperative to take up water supply and sanitation services in all towns across the country. Therefore, AMRUT 2.0 was launched in October, 2021 without waiting for completion of ongoing AMRUT projects.”*

4.6 For comments please see *para No. 1.10* of Chapter-I of the Report.

\*\*\*\*\*

## CHAPTER V

RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH FINAL REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT ARE STILL AWAITED

"Nil"

New Delhi

01 August, 2023  
10 Sravana, 1945 (Saka)

RAJIV RANJAN SINGH  
ALIAS LALAN SINGH  
Chairperson,  
Standing Committee on Housing and Urban Affairs



**STANDING COMMITTEE ON HOUSING AND URBAN AFFAIRS**  
**Minutes of the Ninth Sitting of the Standing Committee on Housing and Urban Affairs held on Tuesday, 01 August, 2023**

The Committee sat from 1500 hours to 1600 hours in Main Committee Room, Ground Floor, Parliament House Annexe Building, New Delhi.

**PRESENT**

Shri Rajiv Ranjan Singh *alias* Lalan Singh - Chairperson

**Members**

**Lok Sabha**

2. Shri Sanjay Kumar Bandi
3. Shri Benny Behanan
4. Shri Shankar Lalwani
5. Shri P.C. Mohan
6. Sadhvi Pragya Singh Thakur

**Rajya Sabha**

7. Shri Subhasish Chakraborty
8. Shri R. Girirajan
9. Smt Jebi Mather Hisham
10. Shri Ram Chander Jangra
11. Shri Kumar Ketkar
12. Dr. K. Laxman
13. Ms. Kavita Patidar
14. Dr. Kalpana Saini

**Secretariat**

3. Ms Swati Parwal Deputy Secretary

**Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs**

1. Shri Satinder Pal Singh Additional Secretary
2. Shri Ravi Kumar Arora Joint Secretary

**National Buildings Construction Corporation Limited**

1. Shri P.K. Gupta Chief Managing Director
2. Shri K.P. Mahadeva Swamy Director (Commercial)
3. Shri Saleem Ahmad Director (Projects)

2. At the outset, Hon'ble Chairperson welcomed Members of the Standing Committee on Housing and Urban Affairs to the Sitting of the Committee and thereafter took up for consideration the Draft Report on Action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Eighteenth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) of the Standing Committee on Housing and Urban Affairs on the Demands for Grants (2023-24) of the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs and adopted the Draft Report without any modification.

3. \*\*\*\* \*  
\*\*\*\* \*  
\*\*\*\* \*  
4. \*\*\*\* \*  
\*\*\*\* \*  
\*\*\*\* \*

*The Committee then adjourned.*

\*\*\*\*\*

*[Vide para 4 of the Introduction]*

**ANALYSIS OF THE ACTION TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT ON THE RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS CONTAINED IN THE TWELTH REPORT (SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA) ON DEMANDS FOR GRANTS (2023-24).**

<b>I.</b>	<b>Total number of recommendations</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>II.</b>	<b>Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government:</b>	<b>14</b>
	Recommendation Nos. 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 8, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16 & 17	
	Percentage to total recommendations	(82.36 %)
<b>III.</b>	<b>Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of Government's replies:</b>	<b>01</b>
	Recommendation No. 9	
	Percentage to total recommendations	(5.88 %)
<b>IV.</b>	<b>Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee:</b>	<b>02</b>
	Recommendation Nos. 4 & 7	
	Percentage to total recommendations	(11.76 %)
<b>V.</b>	<b>Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of the Government are still awaited</b>	<b>Nil</b>
	Percentage to total recommendations	(0 %)