

HUNDRED AND TWELFTH REPORT

PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (1987-88)

(EIGHTH LOK SABHA)

EXCESSIVE PROCUREMENT OF CAMERAS— INADEQUATE UTILISATION

MINISTRY OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING

[Action Taken on 74th Report (8th Lok Sabha)]



*Presented to Lok Sabha on 29 March, 1988
Laid in Rajya Sabha on 29 March, 1988*

**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

March, 1988/Phalgun. 1909 (Saka)

Price : Rs. 13.00

CORRIGENDA TO 112TH REPORT OF PUBLIC
ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (EIGHTH LOK SABHA)

<u>Page</u>	<u>Para</u>	<u>Line</u>	<u>For</u>	<u>Read</u>
3	8	4	divisod	devised
3	10	9-10	judiciously	judiciously
5	-	9	of fered	offered
7	-	5	throughly	thoroughly

CONTENTS

	PAGE
COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE ...	(iii)
INTRODUCTION	(v)
CHAPTER I Report	1
CHAPTER II Recommendations and Observations that have been accepted/noted by Government ...	4
PART II Minutes of the Thirty-Seventh sitting of the Public Accounts Committee (1987-88) held on 9-3-1988	10
APPENDIX Conclusions/Recommendations ...	12

PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(1987-88)

CHAIRMAN

Shri Amal Datta

MEMBERS

Lok Sabha

2. Shri S.M. Bhattam
3. Shri Mohd. Ayub Khan
4. Shri Y.S. Mahajan
5. Shri Ajay Mushran
6. Shri K. Ramamurthy
7. Shri Balwant Singh Ramoowalia
8. Shri Navinchandra Ravani
9. Shri S. Jaipal Reddy
10. Shri Chiranji Lal Sharma
11. Shri Pratap Bhanu Sharma
12. Genl. R.S. Sparrow
13. Dr. Chandra Shekhar Tripathi
14. Shri Vir Sen
15. Shri Yogeshwar Prasad Yogesh

Rajya Sabha

16. Shri A.K. Antony
17. Shri Nirmal Chatterjee
18. Shri Bhuvnesh Chaturvedi
19. Shri M.S. Gurupadaswamy
20. Shrimati Manorama Pandey
21. Shri B. Satyanarayan Reddy
22. Shri T. Chandrasekhar Reddy

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri K.H. Chhaya—*Joint Secretary*
2. Shri B.D. Duggal—*Chief Financial Committee Officer*
3. Shri S.M. Mehta—*Senior Financial Committee Officer*

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairman of Public Accounts Committee as authorised by the Committee, do present on their behalf this Hundred and Twelfth Report on action taken by Government on the recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee contained in their Seventy Fourth Report (Eighth Lok Sabha) on Excessive procurement of Cameras – Inadequate utilisation.

2. In their 74th report, the Committee had examined a case of excessive procurement of cameras by the Photo Division of the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting for the "Asiad 1982" and their inadequate utilisation. In this report, the Committee have noted that in pursuance of their recommendations, the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting have issued directions to the Photo Division to ensure that in future, before placing orders for equipments involving substantial expenditure, the Photo Division should make a realistic assessment of its capabilities both in terms of manpower and equipment for coverage of prestigious occasions; impart adequate training to the staff so that they remain abreast of the development in the field; keep the number of equipments to be imported at a minimum and dispose of the unutilised equipments, imported or otherwise judiciously and expeditiously. The Committee have expressed their hope that the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting will ensure through proper monitoring that such instructions are faithfully followed.

3. The Committee considered and adopted this Report at their sitting held on 9 March, 1988. Minutes of the sitting form Part II of the report.

4. For facility of reference and convenience, the recommendations and observations of the Committee have been printed in thick type in the body of the Report, and have also been reproduced in a consolidated form in the Appendix to the Report.

(vi)

5. The Committee place on record their appreciation of the assistance rendered to them in the matter by the Office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India.

NEW DELHI
11 March, 1988

21 Phalguna, 1908 (Saka)

AMAL DATTA
Chairman,
Public Accounts Committee

CHAPTER I

REPORT

This Report of the Committee deals with action taken by Government on the Committee's recommendations/observations contained in their report* on Excessive Procurement of Cameras—Inadequate utilisation by the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting (Photo Division).

2. The Committee's report contained five recommendations. Action Taken Notes have been received from Government in respect of all the recommendations/observations. All of them have been accepted by the Government. In the following paragraphs, the Committee deal with the action taken by Government on some of their recommendations and observations.

Need to check unnecessary import and inadequate utilisation of cameras.....

3. The Committee had examined a case of excessive procurement of cameras by the Photo Division of the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting for the "Asiad 1982" and their inadequate utilisation.

4. The Photo Division was entrusted with the photo coverage of "Asiad 1982" and Rs. 22.25 lakhs were sanctioned by the then Ministry of Education and Culture and placed at the disposal of the Photo Division to meet the expenditure on salaries, equipments, consumable stores, etc. The Photo Division estimated that they would need 54 photographers and 108 Cameras. As 16 photographers and 18 cameras were available with the Division, they decided to recruit 38 additional Photographic Officers and to import 90 cameras and the proposals to this effect were brought forward in December, 1980. In August, 1981, the Photo Division requested the Centre/State Publicity/Information Departments to nominate their experienced Photographic Officers for the occasion for a period of three months on deputation basis. It failed to secure a positive response and the proposal was given up. The Photo

*Seventy-Forth Report (Eighth Lok Sabha) on Paragraph 26 of the Report of the Comptroller & Auditor General of India for the year 1983-84, Union Government (Civil).

Division then sought to recruit the photographers from the open market through advertisement. Meanwhile, the Special Organising Committee took a view in the meeting held on 5 September, 1982 that the Photo Division did not possess expertise to provide coverage of such a prestigious event according to international standards. So 19 top notch photographers were engaged on contractual basis to cover only selected events in Semi-finals and final. The original idea of covering all events was given up.

5. Commenting on the failure of Photo Division to make a realistic assessment of the capabilities, both in terms of manpower and equipment for coverage of such prestigious occasions, the Committee had observed that with more careful planning and by offering a more attractive remuneration by way of a package as was done at the last moment, it should have been possible to engage competent and adequate number of photographers well in time. In the opinion of the Committee, had this been done, it would have been possible to cover each and every event adequately as was originally planned, instead of only covering the selected events of the semi-finals and finals of Asiad 82.

6. The Committee had further observed that out of the 90 cameras imported by the Photo Division on the eve of Asiad 82, only 27 cameras could actually be put to use. The photographers engaged on contractual basis preferred to make use of their own cameras and the 63 imported cameras costing Rs. 14.82 lakhs could not be put to use for the purpose for which they were imported. Eventually, these cameras were disposed of by the Photo Division after considerable delay. In the opinion of the Committee, the number of cameras to be imported could have been reduced to the minimum had the right type of photographers been engaged in the beginning.

7. The Committee recommended that the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting and the Photo Division should have adequate number of personnel who are thoroughly trained and equipped to handle the most sophisticated cameras available and have expertise in photography in all fields.

8. In their action taken note furnished on 21 October, 1987, the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting have stated that the Photo

Division has been directed to ensure that in future it makes a realistic assessment of its capabilities both in terms of manpower and equipment for coverage of such prestigious occasions. According to the Ministry, suitable training programmes will be devised for the officers of the Photo Division so that they remain abreast of the developments in the field. The comments of the Committee regarding delay in the disposal of the cameras have also been noted by the Government for future guidance.

9. The action taken notes furnished by the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting are reproduced in Chapter II of the Report.

10. The Committee note that in pursuance of their recommendations, the ministry of Information and Broadcasting have issued directions to the Photo Division to ensure that in future, before placing orders for equipments involving substantial expenditure, the Photo Division should make a realistic assessment of its capabilities both in terms of manpower and equipment for coverage of prestigious occasions; impart adequate training to the staff so that they remain abreast of the development in the field; keep the number of equipments to be imported at a minimum and dispose of the unutilised equipments, imported or otherwise judiciously and expeditiously. The Committee trust that the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting will ensure through proper monitoring that such instructions are faithfully followed.

CHAPTER II
RECOMMENDATIONS AND OBSERVATIONS WHICH
HAVE BEEN NOTED/ACCEPTED BY GOVERNMENT

Recommendation

The prestigious assignment of photo coverage of the international sports event of a magnitude and importance unparalleled in the history of the nation both in black and white and in colour of the IX Asiad, 1982 at 18 different venues at Delhi, Bombay and Jaipur for Press publicity and historical records was entrusted in May, 1980, to the Photo Division of the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting with the expectation that quality of work would conform to the highest international standards. Such a high level of efficiency expected of the Division necessitated meticulous planning. The Committee regret to observe that the Photo Division was not able to rise to occasion.

[Sl. No. 1 (Para 31) of the Appendix to 74th Report of the
Public Accounts Committee (8th Lok Sabha)].

Action Taken

The observations of the Committee have been noted. Photo Division has been directed to ensure that in future it makes a realistic assessment of its capabilities both in terms of manpower and equipment for coverage of such prestigious occasions (as in Annexure 'A').

[Ministry of I&B O.M. No. G-250211/3/83-Acctts (Pt. II)/PD
dated 21 October, 1987.]

Recommendation

After taking into consideration the availability of manpower and equipment, the Photo Division estimated that they would need 54 photographers and 108 cameras. As sixteen photographers and 18 cammeras were available with the Division they decided to recruit 38

additional photographic officers and to import 90 cameras. Proposals to this effect were brought forward in December, 1980. A feeble effort was made in August, 1981 when the Photo Division requested the Central/State Publicity/Information Departments to nominate their experienced Photographic Officers for the occasion for a period of three months on deputation basis. This was soon given up as it failed to secure a positive response. It was then sought to recruit the photographers from the open market through advertisement. However, neither the qualification prescribed nor the remuneration offered could attract the competent photographic personnel. It was then only that Special Organising Committee (SOC) realised that the Photo Division did not possess expertise to provide coverage required for the ASIAD. A fresh attempt was made and 19 Top Notch Photographers were engaged on contractual basis. It is, therefore, surprising that the Photo Division who are supposed to be the premier institution, ought to have anticipated the inadequacy of photographic personnel and the calibre required and it ought to have planned for the required personnel even at the time when it placed orders for sophisticated foreign cameras, had no idea of the type of personnel required for the occasion. It is clear in retrospect that with a little more careful planning and by offering a more attractive remuneration by way of a package as was done at the last moment it should have been possible to engage the right kind of sport photographers and in adequate number in the very beginning. Had this been done it would have been possible to cover each and every event adequately as was originally planned. On account of this failure only selected events of the semi-finals and finals of Asiad '82 were covered.

[Sl. No. 2(Para 32) of the Appendix to 74th report of the Public Accounts Committee (8th Lok Sabha)].

Action Taken

The Ministry accepts the observations of the Committee. Photo Division has been instructed to make a note of these observations so that in future a realistic estimate of the requirement of professionals is made with due regard to inhouse facilities. Suitable training programmes will also be devised for the officers of the Photo Division so

that they remain abreast of the developments in this field, and the hon'ble Public Accounts Committee shall be kept posted of further developments on this front.

[Ministry of I&B O.M. No. G-25011/3/83-Acctts (Pt. II)/PD,
dated 21 October, 1987.]

Recommendation

Another consequence of this failure and with which the Audit objection is more directly related is that out of 90 cameras imported by the Photo Division on the eve of Asiad '82, only 27 cameras could really be put to use. Thus, 63 imported cameras costing Rs. 14.82 lakhs could not be put to use for the purpose for which these had been imported. The photographers engaged for the job preferred to make use of their own cameras. The number of cameras to be imported could have been reduced to the minimum had the right type of photographers been engaged in the beginning.

[Sl. No. 3 (Para 33) of the Appendix to 74th report of the
Public Accounts Committee (8th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

Observations of the Committee have been noted and Photo Division has been advised (as per Annexure 'A') that in future a more realistic estimate of their requirements in term of expert manpower and equipment be made.

[Ministry of I&B O.M. No. G-25011/3/83-Acctts.(Pt.II)/PD,
dated 21 October, 1987.]

Recommendation

As regards the disposal of 90 cameras, the Committee have been informed that as on 7th April, 1986 out of 90 cameras, 37 cameras are in use in the Photo Division and as many as 29 have been transferred to other departments on payment. Requests for transfer of remaining cameras which were stated to have been received from other departments were being examined. Though the disposal of these cameras has been considerably delayed, the Committee are now informed that all the remaining cameras have since been disposed of by the Photo Division.

[Sl. No. 4 (Para 34) of the Appendix to 74th report of the
Public Accounts Committee (8th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

No comments are needed. The observations regarding delay in disposal of the cameras have been noted for future guidance.

[Ministry of I&B's O.M. No. G-25011/3/83-Accts. (Pt.II)/
PD, dated 21 October, 1987.]

Recommendation

For the future, the Committee would like the Ministry of Information & Broadcasting and the Photo Division to have adequate personnel who are thoroughly trained and equipped to handle the most sophisticated cameras available and expertise in photography in all fields. Incidentally, the Government must also consider the possibility of developing indigenous manufacture of cameras and other photographic equipment.

[Sl. No. 5 (Para 35) of the Appendix to 74th report of the
Public Accounts Committee (8th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

The Ministry accepts the view of the Committee and suitable training programmes will be devised for the officials of Photo Division to improve their skills and expertise and also to provide for specialisation and will be brought to the notice of the Committee.

The observation of the Committee in regard to the possibility of developing indigenous manufacture of cameras and other equipment have been brought to the notice of Ministry of Industry and the hon'ble Committee shall be informed of the further progress in this regard from time to time.

[Ministry of I&B O.M. No. G. 25011/3/83/Accounts (Pt.II) PD
dated 21 October, 1987]

NEW DELHI ;
11 March, 1988

21 Phalgun, 1909 (Saka)

AMAL DATTA
Chairman,
Public Accounts Committee

ANNEXURE 'A'

No. G-25011/3.83—Acctts (pt. II)

Government of India
Ministry of Information & Broadcasting

— — — —
Dated : New Delhi, the 8th October, 1987

OFFICE MEMORANDUM

Subject : Action taken notes on the Recommendations/observations of the PAC in their 74th Report (8th Lok Sabha) on excessive procurement of cameras inadequate utilisation.

The undersigned is directed to state that the PAC in its 74th Report (8th Lok Sabha) on inadequate utilisation of cameras has viewed with grave concern the manner in which an international sports event has been covered by the Photo Division. It has expressed regret at the inability of Photo Division to rise to the occasion. On the basis of its recommendations the Photo Division is hereby directed :—

- (i) to ensure that in future, it makes a realistic assessment of its capabilities both in terms of manpower and equipment for coverage of such prestigious occasions ;
- (ii) in future cases, when orders involving huge expenditure are placed, due regard should also be given to the type and calibre of photographic personnel required and adequate planning should be done at the stage of placing orders ;
- (iii) to initiate action to conduct or otherwise, arrange for its photographic staff suitable training programmes so that they remain abreast of the developments in their field ;
- (iv) to ensure that in future, the amount of equipment imported should be kept at a minimum and the right type of personnel engaged from the very beginning ; and
- (v) disposal of unutilised equipment, imported or otherwise should be done judiciously and expeditiously.

Sd/-

(S.S. Sharma)

Deputy Secretary to the Govt. of India

ANNEXURE 'B'

**No. G.—25011/3/83—Accts (Pt. II)
Government of India
Ministry of Information & Broadcasting**

Dated : New Delhi, the 8th October, 1987

**The Under Secretary,
Ministry of Industry,
(Department of Industrial Development)
Udyog Bhavan,
NEW DELHI**

Subject : Manufacture of sophisticated cameras and other photographic equipment.

Sir,

I am directed to enclose a copy of the recommendations/observations of the Public Accounts Committee (8th Lok Sabha) made in their 74th Report about the Photo Division of the Ministry of Information & Broadcasting. The Public Accounts Committee has recommended that the Government should consider the possibility of developing manufacture of indigenous cameras and other photographic equipment.

It is requested that further necessary action may kindly be taken keeping in view observations of PAC and the Ministry of Information & Broadcasting be kept informed of the action taken.

**Yours faithfully,
(H.S. Sharma)**

**Under Secretary to the Govt. of India
Tele : 384597**

PART — II

**MINUTES OF THE 37TH SITTING OF PUBLIC
ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE HELD ON 9TH MARCH, 1988**

The Committee sat from 15.30 hrs. to 16.30 hrs. in Committee Room No. 50, Parliament House.

PRESENT

- | | |
|----------------------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Shri Amal Datta | — <i>Chairman</i> |
| 2. Shri Mohd. Ayub Khan | } — <i>Members</i> |
| 3. Shri Ajay Mushran | |
| 4. Shri Balwant Singh Ramoowalia | |
| 5. Genl. R.S. Sparrow | |
| 6. Shri Nirmal Chatterjee | |
| 7. Shri M.S. Gurupadaswamy | |
| 8. Shri T. Chandrasekhar Reddy | |

SECRETARIAT

- | | |
|------------------|--|
| Shri B.D. Duggal | — <i>Chief Financial
Committee Officer</i> |
|------------------|--|

REPRESENTATIVES OF AUDIT

- | | |
|---------------------------|---|
| 1. Shri G.M. Mani | — <i>Addl. Dy. C&AG</i> |
| 2. Shri S.B. Krishnan | — <i>Director (Reports Central)</i> |
| 3. Shri S.S. Roy Choudhry | — <i>DACRI</i> |
| 4. Shri M.M.B. Annavi | — <i>DADS</i> |
| 5. Shri S.C. Singhal | — <i>DA (P&T)</i> |
| 6. Mrs. Anjana Dass | — <i>DDA (P&T)</i> |
| 7. Shri R. Ramanathan | — <i>Director of Receipt
Audit II</i> |
| 8. Shri S.K. Gupta | — <i>Jt. Director</i> |

2. The Committee took up for consideration of the following

draft reports :

- | | | | | |
|-------|---|---|---|---|
| (i) | * | * | * | * |
| (ii) | * | * | * | * |
| (iii) | * | * | * | * |
| (iv) | * | * | * | * |

(v) Action Taken on 74th Report (8th Lok Sabha) relating to Excessive Procurement Cameras-Inadequate utilisation.

- | | | | | |
|------|---|---|---|---|
| (vi) | * | * | * | * |
|------|---|---|---|---|

3. The Committee adopted the reports subject to certain modifications/amendments shown in Annexures* I to IV.

- | | | | | |
|----|---|---|---|---|
| 4. | * | * | * | * |
|----|---|---|---|---|

5. The Committee further authorised the Chairman to incorporate in the reports other minor modifications/ amendments arising out of factual verification of the same by Audit. The Committee also authorised the Chairman to present these reports in the House.

The Committee then adjourned

* Not printed.

APPENDIX

Conclusions/Observations

S. No.	Para No.	Ministry/ Department concerned	Conclusion Recommendations
1	2	3	4
1	10	Ministry of Information and Broadcasting	The Committee note that in pursuance of their recommendations, the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting have issued directions to the Photo Division to ensure that in future, before placing orders for equipments involving substantial expenditure, the Photo Division should make a realistic assessment of its capabilities both in terms of manpower and equipment for coverage of prestigious occasions ; impart adequate training to the staff so that they remain abreast of the development in the field ; keep the number of equipments to be imported at a minimum and dispose of the unutilised equipments, imported or otherwise judiciously and expeditiously. The Committee trust that the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting will ensure through proper monitoring that such instructions are faithfully followed.

12

