

103

**CENTRAL POLLUTION CONTROL
BOARD—AUDIT REVIEW**

**MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT
AND FORESTS**

HUNDRED AND THIRD REPORT



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

HUNDRED AND THIRD REPORT
PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(1994-95)

(TENTH LOK SABHA)

CENTRAL POLLUTION CONTROL BOARD—
AUDIT REVIEW

MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS

*[Action Taken on 65th Report of Public Accounts Committee
(10th Lok Sabha)]*



Presented to Lok Sabha on 28.04.1995
Laid in Rajya Sabha on 28.04.1995

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI

April, 1995/Vaisakha, 1917 (Saka)

P.A.C. No. 1479

Price : Rs. 26.00

© 1995 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

Published under Rule 382 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha (Seventh Edition) and Printed by the Manager, P.L. Unit, Government of India Press, Minto Road, New Delhi.

LS1793

CONTENTS

	PAGE
COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (1994-95)	(iii)
INTRODUCTION.....	(v)
CHAPTER I Report	1
CHAPTER II Recommendations/observations which have been accepted by Government.....	11
CHAPTER III Recommendations/observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in the light of the replies received from Government.....	30
CHAPTER IV Recommendations/observations replies to which have not been accepted by the Com- mittee and which require reiteration	48
CHAPTER V Recommendations/observations in respect of which Government have furnished interim replies.....	53
APPENDIX I Conclusions and Recommendations	54
PART II Minutes of the sitting of Public Accounts Com- mittee (1994-95) held on 25.4.1995	57

**COMPOSITION OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(1994-95)**

Shri Bhagwan Shankar Rawat — Chairman

MEMBERS

Lok Sabha

2. Shri Bandaru Dattatraya
3. Shri Anil Basu
4. Shri Dileep Singh Bhuria
5. Sqn. Ldr. Kamal Chaudhry
6. Dr. K.V.R. Chowdary
7. Shri Sharad Dighe
8. Shri Jagat Veer Singh Drona
9. Smt. Krishnendra Kaur (Deepa)
10. Smt. Geeta Mukherjee
11. Shri Mrutyunjaya Nayak
12. Shri V. Krishna Rao
13. Shri Magunta Subbarama Reddy
14. Shri Mohan Singh
15. ~~Shri S.B.~~ Thorat

Rajya Sabha

16. Shri S.S. Ahluwalia
17. Shri Somappa R. Bommai
18. Shri Triloki Nath Chaturvedi
19. Miss Saroj Khaparde
20. Shri Murasoli Maran
21. Smt. Jayanthi Natarajan
22. Shri G.G. Swell

SECRETARIAT

- | | | |
|-----------------------|---|------------------------|
| 1. Shri S.N. Mishra | — | <i>Addl. Secretary</i> |
| 2. Shri G.C. Malhotra | — | <i>Joint Secretary</i> |
| 3. Smt. P.K. Sandhu | — | <i>Director</i> |
| 4. Shri P. Sreedharan | — | <i>Under Secretary</i> |

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee, as authorised by the Committee, do present on their behalf, this Hundred and Third Report on Action Taken by Government on the recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee contained in their 65th Report (10th Lok Sabha) regarding Central Pollution Control Board—Audit Review.

2. In their earlier Report, the Committee had observed that as of December, 1993, 1003 of 1541 units which had been identified as falling within the 17 categories that caused maximum pollution in the country in the large and medium sector, had provided the requisite pollution control equipments to comply with the standards and others were in the process of installing the same. The Committee had desired that concerted efforts should be made to pursue the remaining units also to comply with the standards and instal the requisite equipments. In this Report, while observing that 319 such units are yet to comply with the standards, the Committee have desired that concrete efforts should be made to persuade the remaining units also to comply with the standards and instal the requisite equipments so that extreme punitive action like closure of units, having social and economic ramifications, were avoided.

3. The Committee in this Report have reiterated that while enforcing the Pollution Control Law the authorities concerned should also be in a position to provide the necessary aid/technical advice to the industrial units about the details of the suitable cost effective equipments which the units could afford to instal. Government should also formulate and implement an attractive package of fiscal incentives and disincentives to encourage the polluting units to instal pollution control devices.

4. In their earlier Report the Committee had noted with grave concern that adequate steps were not taken by Government over the years despite several recommendations made by several Committees to effectively prevent and control and preservation of historical monuments in the Agra-Mathura region. They had made several specific recommendations in this regard for suitable implementation. In this Report, the Committee have noted that subsequent to presentation of their Report Government have taken various steps to adequately protect the historical monuments at Agra-Mathura region from further deterioration due to the damages caused by pollution. The Committee have desired that the Ministry of Environment and Forests should coordinate with other concerned Ministries/Departments and continuously follow up the implementation of the various measures and for initiating further necessary action so as to effectively deal with the threat caused by pollution to the world famous historical monuments.

5. The Report was considered and adopted by the Public Accounts Committee at their sitting held on 25 April, 1995. Minutes of the sitting form Part-II of the Report.

6. For facility of reference and convenience the recommendations of the Committee have been printed in thick type in the body of the Report and have also been reproduced in a consolidated form in Appendix-I to the Report.

7. The Committee place on record their appreciation of the assistance rendered to them in the matter by the office of Comptroller and Auditor General of India.

NEW DELHI;
25 April, 1995

5 Vaisakha, 1917 (*Saka*)

BHAGWAN SHANKAR RAWAT,
Chairman,
Public Accounts Committee.

CHAPTER I

REPORT

This Report of the Committee deals with the action taken by the Government on Committee's recommendations and observations contained in their Sixty-Fifth Report (10th Lok Sabha) on Paragraph 4.1 of the Report of C&AG of India for the year ended 31 March, 1992 (No. 2 of 1993), Union Government (Scientific Departments) relating to "Central Pollution Control Board — Audit Review".

2. The Sixty-Fifth Report which was presented to Lok Sabha on 25 April, 1994 contained 34 recommendations. Action Taken Notes have been received in respect of all the recommendations and these have been categorised as follows:

- (i) Recommendations/observations which have been accepted by the Government:**

Sl. Nos. 1-4, 6-7, 15, 18-24, 27 and 33-34.

- (ii) Recommendations/observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in the light of replies received from Government:**

Sl. Nos. 5, 8-14, 17, 25 and 29-32.

- (iii) Recommendations/observations, the replies to which have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration:**
Sl. Nos. 16, 26 and 28.

- (iv) Recommendations/observations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies:**

Sl. Nos. -Nil-

3. In their 65th Report (10th Lok Sabha), the Committee had identified certain vital areas relating to pollution control in general and the functioning of Central Pollution Control Board (CPCB) in particular requiring immediate governmental attention. Briefly, these were:—

- (i) incomplete composition of CPCB**
- (ii) delay in making standards developed by CPCB mandatory**
- (iii) shortcomings in the functioning of monitoring stations**
- (iv) inadequacies in the monitoring of quality of water**
- (v) delay in completing river basin studies and preparation of action plans for abatement of river water pollution**
- (vi) failure to achieve the objectives of the project 'Biological monitoring and ecotoxicological studies of river Yamuna'**
- (vii) discontinuance of a project meant for preventing coastal pollution without achieving the results involving expenditure of sizeable magnitude**

- (viii) delay in commissioning of equipments
- (ix) delay in making air quality stations operative
- (x) inadequacies in the enforcement of pollution control measures
- (xi) need for providing aid/technical advice to industries particularly the small scale units
- (xii) delay in initiating steps to prevent and control pollution of the historical monuments in Agra-Mathura region particularly the Taj Mahal
- (xiii) lack of adequate coordination between CPCB and State Pollution Control Boards
- (xiv) financial, administrative and other irregularities in CPCB.

4. Summing up their examination, the Committee in paragraph 152 of the report had observed:-

"The Committee's attention has been drawn in this connection to Government of India's 'Policy statement for abatement of pollution 1990-92' which seeks to lay emphasis towards actual implementation. The Committee consider that the Central Pollution Control Board being the premier organisation on the subject has an increasingly important role to play in prevention and control of pollution. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the facts stated in this report should be thoroughly examined and appropriate remedial / corrective measures taken with a view to streamlining the functioning of the Central Pollution Control Board so that it acts not only as an advisory agency but also as an effective promotional body in abatement of pollution for preventing deterioration of the environment."

5. The action taken replies furnished by the Ministry of Environment & Forests on the various recommendations / observations of the Committee are reproduced in the relevant Chapters of this Report. In the succeeding paragraphs the Committee will, however, deal with the action taken on some of their recommendations.

Enforcement of Pollution Control in highly polluting industries

(S. No. 15—Paragraph 134)

6. In January 1991, the Ministry of Environment and Forests had identified 17 categories of industries that caused maximum pollution in the country and 1541 industrial units were asked through a Notification to instal pollution control equipments by 31 December, 1993 and bring down emissions in air and water to the standards prescribed. The Committee in para 134 of their earlier Report had observed that as of December, 1993, 1003 of 1541 units in the large and medium sector had provided the requisite pollution control equipments to comply with the standards and

others were in the process of installing the same. The Committee had desired that concerted efforts should be made to persuade the remaining units also to comply with the standards and instal the requisite equipments so that extreme punitive action like closure of units, having social and economic ramification, were avoided.

7. The Ministry of Environment & Forests have in their action taken note stated that pursuant to the discussion held in a meeting with State Environmental Secretaries and Chairmen of Central and State Pollution Control Boards/Union Territories in January 1994, wilful defaulters had been identified and the Central Board issued directions to the State Boards for taking action against each of those units as a case by case review basis. According to the information furnished by the Ministry, as on 30.6.1994, 319 units (29 in Central Public Sector, 91 in State Public Sector, 63 in Cooperative Sector and 136 in Private Sector) were yet to comply with the standards.

8. The Committee trust that concrete efforts will be made to persuade the remaining units also to fall in line with the others in complying with the standards and installing the requisite equipments so that the extreme punitive action like closure of units, having social and economic ramification are avoided. The Committee would also like to be informed of the latest position of enforcement of pollution control in the identified highly polluting industries.

Need for aid/advice in the installation of pollution control devices

(S. Nos. 16 & 26 — Paras 135 and 145)

9. The Committee in paragraph 135 and 145 of their earlier report had found that the State Board were unable to provide the necessary aid/technical advice to the units in the installation of pollution control devices. They had recommended that while enforcing the pollution control law, the authorities concerned should also be in a position to provide sufficient technical advice to the industrial units about the details of the suitable cost effective equipments which the units could afford to instal. They had desired that Government should also formulate and implement an attractive package of fiscal incentives and disincentives to encourage the polluting units to instal pollution control devices.

10. In their action taken note, the Ministry of Environment and Forests stated that while evolving pollution control standards, comprehensive documents were carefully studied and published for wide circulation to all State Boards free of cost and to all other interested at prescribed cost.

11. The Committee are not satisfied with the action taken reply. In their opinion, the responsibility of the Central Pollution Control Board in the matter of providing necessary aid/technical advice does not merely end with publication and circulation of printed literature. They wish to point out that in a case on the issue related to the Agra-Mathura region, the Supreme

Court had observed that the State Board was not in a position to advise the industry as to which type of air pollution device was to be given. The Committee, therefore, are of the view that the CPCB has to play a more effective role in providing suitable guidance to the State Boards in the matter. The Ministry in the action taken reply have also not elaborated adequately on the precise package of fiscal incentives and disincentives formulated by Government in pursuance of the recommendation of the Committee. The Committee, therefore, reiterate their earlier recommendation and would like to be informed of the action taken thereon.

Pollution threat to the historical monuments in Agra-Mathura region (S. Nos. 18 to 24—Paragraphs 137 to 143)

12. In their 65th Report (10th Lok Sabha) the Committee had extensively dealt with threat caused by pollution to the world famous historical monuments in Agra-Mathura Region particularly the Taj Mahal and the related issues. The Committee had noted with grave concern that adequate steps were not taken by Government over the years despite several recommendations made by several Committees to effectively prevent and control pollution and preservation of those historical monuments. They had observed that currently the major polluting sources in Agra, apart from emission from Mathura refinery, were foundry, rubber factory, engineering industries, chemical and other industries, motor vehicles etc. The Ministry of Environment & Forest had during the course of examination stated that from the view-point of pollution control, the best desirable option would be to shift the polluting units from the area. However, since this had not happened, the other alternatives were evolved in the form of a package of measures needed for pollution control in Agra. These included *inter alia*:-

- (i) fiscal incentives and other benefits for shifting of the polluting units;
- (ii) dedicated/uninterrupted power/gas supply, industries/commercial activities to discourage the use of DG sets;
- (iii) priority for provision of clean fuel (LPG) to the residents of Agra from the Mathura refinery;
- (iv) use of battery/CNG operated vehicles within the specified area of Agra; and
- (v) construction of an outer ring road at Agra to divert the traffic from the three national highways.

13. Agreeing with the point of view of taking the package of measures mentioned above for pollution control, the Committee had pointed out that since many of these industries were shifted from their original site to the newly constructed Foundry Nagar in Agra in the year 1975 onwards, further shifting of those industries will have grave social and economic consequences including mass unemployment of the people directly or

indirectly depending on these industries. They had desired that in order to check vehicular pollution, the electrification of railway tracks in Taj Trapezium area and introduction of local electrical trains service should be considered for expeditious implementation. The Committee had also pointed out that since Mathura refinery was a major source of pollution it was essential that immediate measures were taken to minimise pollution from the refinery by installation of latest equipments and other measures. They had recommended that the package of measures and various other suggestions should be considered for expeditious implementation in a time-bound manner so that the historically important priceless monuments are adequately protected from further pollution.

14. The Committee had also desired in paragraph 143 of the report that Government should take measures on priority basis for pollution control in other areas which have been identified as environmentally sensitive from the historically important point of view or due to other considerations.

15. The Ministry of Environment & Forests have reported the following action in respect of the recommendations/observations of the Committee mentioned above:-

- (i) pursuant to the directions of the Supreme Court of India, an expert Committee under the chairmanship of Dr. S. Varadarajan has been appointed to undertake the survey of the Taj Trapezium environmental area and to make a report regarding the sources of pollution in the Trapezium and the measures to be adopted control the same. The expert committee will also identify the polluting industries in the Taj Trapezium;
- (ii) as directed by the Supreme Court on 11.4.1994, the Ministry have set up a cell for the purpose of developing green belt around Taj Mahal as suggested by the National Environmental Engineering Research Institute (NEERI) in its report. The cell has also sanctioned an amount of Rs. 14 lakhs to the Government of Uttar Pradesh for initiation of plantation.
- (iii) the shifting of industries in the Agra-Mathura Trapezium is placed before the Supreme Court and would not probably be decided till the Dr. Varadarajan Committee submits its report;
- (iv) the supply of uninterrupted power to the agra-Mathura region was taken up with the Ministry of Power. The Ministry of Power have examined the matter in consultation with the Central Electricity Authority and have informed that the U.P. State Electricity Board has proposed to augment the capacity of the spccial station in Agra by installing one more unit in addition to the existing 3×100 MVA 220/1320 KV unit.
- (v) regarding supply of clean fuel (LPG) to the residents of Agra, the Ministry of Petroleum & Natural Gas have recently announced a

10-point programme in which it has been mentioned that LPG connection shall be given on priority to Agra residents. There will not be any waiting list within six months for LPG gas connection in Agra region. This will reduce the pollution due to burning coal/coke/cow dung as a domestic fuel. The additional measures included unleaded/low lead petrol, preferential allocation of LPG for industries, low hydro diesel for transport, intensification on environment management by Mathura refinery, natural gas for industries, compressed natural gas (CNG for vehicles), clean fuel for Mathura refinery, hydro cracking technology for Mathura refinery, identification of alternative strategies for environmental management in consultation with Asian Development Bank etc.

- (vi) regarding electrification of railway tracks, the recommendations of the PAC have been brought to the notice of the Chairman, Railway Board for implementation and this was being followed up by the Ministry of Environment & Forests
- (vii) emission of So 2 from Mathura refinery varies from 600 to 700 KG per hour against the stipulated standard of 1000 KG per hour. Mathura refinery is in the process of installation of hydrocracker unit, which will further, reduce So 2 emissions.
- (viii) regarding installation of pollution control equipment and upgradation of Cupola design in Agra-Mathura region it has been reported by UP Pollution Control Board that most of the industries including foundries have installed the requisite pollution control equipment and are making the emission standards prescribed by the Board.

16. In their action taken note the Ministry further stated that the action taken by Central Pollution Control Board to control air pollution in Agra-Mathura region was as follows:-

- (i) five ambient air quality monitoring stations have been installed at Agra in collaboration with Uttar Pradesh State Board
- (ii) ambient monitoring stations maintained at IOC at Farah, Sikandra, Bharathpur and Mathura are periodically checked by Central Pollution Control Board/SPCB to ascertain the status of air quality
- (iii) evolved standards for particulate matter from foundries, based on expert group recommendation
- (iv) evolved standards for glass industries, based on study by NPC, A publication containing possibilities and option for pollution control in glass industries has been brought out by Central Pollution Control Board
- (v) a detailed package containing options for effective control of pollution in the Trapezium has been prepared and submitted to the Ministry of Environment & Forests for implementation

- (vi) industrial units in the Trapezium were surveyed for on the spot assessment and a number of pollution control options were suggested to the units
- (vii) several training programmes were organised, where training has been provided to SPCB officials and industry personnel for effective pollution control management
- (viii) experts of Central Pollution Control Board have represented several forums in the country and shared various techniques and experiences with the industry personnel and pollution control authorities regarding effective pollution control measures applicable to this region.

17. As regards measures taken on priority basis for pollution control in other areas which have been identified as environmentally sensitive from the historically important point of view or due to other considerations, the Ministry in their action taken note *inter alia* stated:-

"The Ministry of Environment & Forests has constituted a consultative group to prepare a draft policy paper on approach to conservation of man-made heritage from the environment angle. The terms of reference of the group shall be as under:-

- (i) to prepare a draft policy paper on approach to conservation of man-made heritage from an environment angle;
- (ii) to advise the Ministry of Environment & Forests on preserving and developing the aesthetic quality of heritage areas, while maintaining their interaction with the community; and
- (iii) to advise the Ministry of Environment & Forests on the legal control required to conserve the heritage area in accordance with the National Conservation Strategy."

18. The Committee note that subsequent to presentation of their report Government have taken various steps to adequately protect the historical monuments at Agra-Mathura region from further deterioration due to the damages caused by pollution. The Committee desire that the steps initiated should be pursued to the logical conclusions and trust that the Ministry of Environment & Forests would co-ordinate with other concerned Ministries/ Departments and continuously follow-up the implementation of the various measures and for initiating further necessary action so as to effectively deal with the threat caused by pollution to the world famous historical monuments.

19. The Committee further note that the Ministry of Environment & Forests have constituted a consultative group to prepare a draft policy paper and advise the Ministry on the approach to conservation of man made heritage from the environmental angle. The Committee would like to be informed of the progress made by the group in fulfilling the task assigned to them.

Listing of Pollution sources
(S. No. 27—Paragraph 146)

20. Commenting on the delay in the preparation and updating of industrial inventory and completing listing of pollution sources the Committee in paragraph 146 of their Report had recommended:—

“The Committee find that in 1984, CPCB prepared an industrial inventory to assess pollution status in major and medium polluting industries. With rapid industrial development, CPCB felt it essential to update the inventory every five years. In June, 1987 a reorganisation plan was prepared under which CPCB was to complete by 1990, inventorisation of all major and minor industries for Air and Water Pollution, upgradation of sanitation state in class I and Class II cities and status of vehicular pollution in metropolitan cities. Unfortunately, inventory reports for Punjab and Gujarat have only been prepared and published so far. The delay in publishing reports relating to the rest of the States has been attributed to lack of response and timely supply of information from the State Boards. This is, thus, yet another area requiring close cooperation and better coordination between CPCB and the State boards. The Committee therefore, desire that effective steps should be taken to update inventory and complete listing of all major, medium and small scale industries which are relevant to air and water pollution with a view to making an overall scientific assessment of pollution status in the industries for taking up pollution control measures.”

21. In their action taken note, the Ministry of Environment and Forests have stated:—

“With regard to inventory of large and medium polluting industries, the Central Board has decided to send a team of Central Pollution Control Board officials to various State Pollution Control Boards for collecting and compiling the details of the national inventory of industries. The inventorisation of SSI shall be initiated after completing the inventorisation of large & medium industries. Central Pollution Control Board has made the target to complete the work by the end of this financial year (1994-95). Regarding the updation of sanitation status of Class I and Class II cities, the work has already been assigned to Environment Protection Training and Research Institute, Hyderabad.”

22. The Committee hope that the steps taken to update the industrial inventory and of the sanitation status of Class I and Class II cities would be expeditiously completed within the targetted period for facillitating an overall scientific assessment of pollution status.

Preparation of Comprehensive Industry Documents (COINDS)
(S. No. 28—Paragraph 147)

23. Pointing out certain lapses in the publication of certain documents, the Committee in paragraph 147 of the 65th Report (10th Lok Sabha) had recommended:—

“The Committee note that CPCB, as part of the functions assigned to them by the Water and Air Acts, brought out 30 publications (25230 copies) Comprehensive Industry Documents (COINDS) out of which 3234 copies were sold. 3867 copies were issued as complimentary and 18129 copies were lying in the stores. The Committee take a serious view of the fact that an expenditure of Rs. 18 lakhs was incurred for the publication of 25230 copies out of which only 7101 copies were issued with the remaining copies valuing Rs. 9.81 lakhs lying unsold. Further the work of preparation of other COINDS entrusted to outside agencies which was to be completed during the Sixth Plan period continued till Eighth Five Year Plan even after incurring an expenditure of Rs. 34.80 lakhs as consultancy fee. All these are indicative of the inadequate assessment of the requirement of publications and absence of control and monitoring on the part of the CPCB on the work assigned to outside agencies. In the latter case, the Ministry also failed to exercise control since the work was entrusted to the outside agency after their prior approval. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the matter should be enquired into and responsibility fixed for the lapses. The Ministry should also ensure that proper steps are taken by CPCB in dissemination of information.”

24. In their action taken reply, the Ministry *inter-alia* stated:—

“An enquiry was held in the matter and the observations & recommendations of the enquiry are as under:

1. That special efforts be made to improve the distribution system of the publications, so that the information contained in the document could be disseminated to the user.
2. Wide publicity be given to these documents to create mass awareness.
3. More sales outlet needs to be opened.
4. More realistic estimates need to be made for the number of copies to be printed.

Necessary steps have been taken on the basis of above recommendations/observations. Now, while publishing any document, estimates are made in respect of prospective users, which includes the State Boards, Industrial Associations, Institutions, Consultants, R&D Associations, important libraries. For offset printing, there is a limitation on the minimum number of copies which is cost effective.

To increase the volume of sale of publications, CPCB has since entered into an understanding with Confederation of Indian Industries (CII), State Boards. Publications are also now sold through CPCB stalls in the exhibitions. To disseminate the information regarding publications, CPCB has also initiated a drive through advertisements in newspapers & magazines."

25. The Committee regret to point out that the action taken reply is completely silent about the fixation of responsibility for the lapses in undertaking proper assessment of the requirement of publications and in exercising control and monitoring on the part of CPCB which resulted in sizeable number of publications worth Rs. 9.81 lakhs lying unsold and the inordinate delay in getting documents prepared through outside agencies involving payment of consultation fees of Rs. 34.80 lakhs. They, therefore, reiterate their earlier recommendation and would like to be apprised of the concrete action taken in the matter.

Comprehensive legislation on pollution control
(S. No. 34—Paragraph 153)

26. In their earlier report, the Committee had observed that the Ministry of Environment and Forests have initiated an exercise to integrate the various major Central Acts on environment with the object of protecting environment, implementing international decisions and consolidating and amending major Central Acts on the subject. They were informed that the Indian Law Institute which had been given that assignment have given their report that was now being examined by the Ministry.

While updating the latest position, the Ministry of Environment and Forests in their action taken note stated:

"The Indian Law Institute had submitted a report delineating a detailed Scheme on comprehensive legislation which was circulated to the States/UTs, concerned Ministries and NGOs for their views/comments. A project to draft a bill has also been sanctioned to the Indian Law Institute which also envisages a workshop for obtaining wider participation. It is expected that this exercise will be completed in a year's time. The Ministry intends to appoint a committee of legal experts, and an officer having field experience of pollution control to oversee the drafting of the comprehensive legislation. The Indian Law Institute will have a representative in the Committee, and will draft the legislation in time with the guidelines evolved by the Committee."

28. The Committee would like to be apprised of the precise progress made in bringing forth the proposed comprehensive legislation on pollution control.

CHAPTER II

RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY GOVERNMENT

The need for prevention and control of environmental pollution had engaged serious attention of the country atleast since the 1970's. In March, 1974 Parliament enacted the Water (Prevention and Control of Pollution), Act, which required Central Government to constitute a Board to be called "Central Board for the Prevention and Control of Water Pollution" under the then Ministry of Works and Housing, to perform the functions assigned the exercising the powers conferred under Act. The Board was subsequently brought under the Ministry of Environment and Forests in 1981. Consequent upon enactment of Air (Prevention and Control of Pollution) Act, 1981, the Board was entrusted with, additional responsibilities from March, 1981 in regard to air pollution. It was renamed as Central Pollution Control Board (CPCB) in October, 1988 and noise pollution also was brought in the ambit of its activities. The Audit Para is based on test check of activities of the Central Pollution Control Board during the Seventh Five Year Plan (1985—1990) and the Annual Plans for 1990-91 and 1991-92. The various aspects arising out of the examination of the Audit Paragraph, are dealt within the succeeding paragraphs.

Action Taken by the Government

This para is a statement of facts and therefore does not require any further action taken note.

Recommendation

The Central Pollution Control Board is the national apex body aimed at prevention and control of water and air pollution. It coordinates activities of the State Boards in nation-wide programmes of water and air pollution control. As per the provisions of Water Act, besides Chairman, Member Secretary and five members each representing Central Government and State Boards. Central Pollution Control Board was also to comprise of three non-officials representing interests of Agriculture, Fisheries, Industry, Trade or any other interest and two members to represent Central Govt. Companies, Corporations. The Board was last constituted on 2nd December, 1991. The Committee are surprised to note that none of the three non-officials nominated by the Government belonged to the specified fields, but represented public health, media and technical education. Further, presently, apart from Chairman, the Board consists of only six other members as against 17 members as per provisions of the Water Act. Referring to the present incomplete composition of the Board, the Ministry of Environment and Forests simply stated that the, Ministry are

taking necessary action for filling vacant posts. The Committee wonder as to how an incomplete Board could effectively supervise the pollution control activities at national level. The Committee regret to note the delay in filling up the vacancies in the Board and recommend that Government should take early action to complete the composition of the Board and ensure proper representation to eminent people from the relevant discipline as prescribed so that they can make useful contribution in prevention and control of pollution.

[Sl. No. 2 of Appendix IV, Para No. 121 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

The present composition of Central Pollution Control Board was notified vide S.O. No. 814(E), dated 2.12.1991 for three years. Six vacancies of the Board have been filled up recently vide S.O. No. 712(E) dated 27-9-94. The Central Board will be reconstituted on 2.12.1994, in which there will be proper representation to eminent people from relevant disciplines as prescribed in the Water Act of 1974.

Audit comments on vetting of ATN

121 Reconstitution of the Central Board promised for 2.12.1994 has not been done.

Reply: The Central Board has been reconstituted, vide Notification No. SO 75(E), dated 1st February, 1995.

Recommendation

The Committee note that as on 31st March 1992, Central Pollution Control Board had 83 scientific, 138 technical and 172 Ministerial staff against sanctioned strength of 94, 186 and 205 respectively. Thus 21% of the sanctioned strength of scientific/technical posts remained vacant. Explaining the reasons for vacancies lying unfilled for a considerable length of time, the representatives of the Ministry and the Central Pollution Control Board stated during evidence that after the reorganisation plan undertaken in 1987, the recruitment rules were required to be approved by the Ministry of Environment and Forests and the Department of Personnel and Training. While the Rules have been finalised by the Board and the Ministry, they are still awaiting clearance of the Department of Personnel and Training. The Committee consider the delay unfortunate and desire that Government should look into the matter so that the pollution control activities of the Board are not hampered due to non-availability of requisite scientific and technical personnel.

[Sl. No. 3 of Appendix IV, Para No. 122 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Sub-section (3A) of Section 12 of Water (Prevention & Control of Pollution) Act, provides that the method of recruitment and terms & conditions of service, etc. of the officers (other than Member Secretary) and other employees of the Central Pollution Control Board shall be such as may be determined by regulations made by the Central Board. Proviso below sub-section (3A) of Section 12 of the Act provides that no regulation made under the said sub-section shall take effect unless the regulations made by the Central Board, are approved by the Central Government.

The Central Board for Prevention and Control of Water Pollution [Method of Recruitment and Terms & Conditions of the service including scales of pay of Officers (other than member Secretary) and other employees] Regulations, 1980 were made in exercise of the powers conferred by sub-section (3A) of Section 12 of the Act vide notification No. F/21/1/78-A&R dated 28.7.1980. Sub-regulation (ii) of regulation (I) of these regulations provides that the regulation shall come or be deemed to have come into effect, in full or in part, on such date as may be prescribed by the Central Board. These regulations were got approved from the Central Government, (the erstwhile Ministry of Works and Housing and now Ministry of Urban Development). It is unfortunate that regulations were never brought into force by any notification as envisaged in sub-regulation (ii) of regulation (I) of 1980 regulations by the Central Pollution Control Board.

When the question of further amending the 1980 regulations which contained recruitment rules also, came up for considerations, it was noticed that the regulation had never been brought into force and therefore it would be necessary to bring them into force before amendments could be carried out. This lapse came to notice only recently, when the matter was referred to the Ministry of law for amending the Recruitment Rules.

This Ministry is now contemplating the formulation of CPCB regulations afresh in consultation with DOPT and the Ministry of Law as advised by the latter. However, the clearance from Department of Personnel and Training on draft Recruitment Rules of CPCB, has since been received. As soon as these Rules are vetted by the Ministry of Law, they will be notified through a Gazette Notification and thereafter these vacant posts will be filled up by the Central Pollution Control Board.

Audit comments on vetting of ATN

122 Gazette Notification of the Recruitment Rules was yet to be issued.

Reply: Recruitment Rules have been Gazette Notified.

Recommendation

As per the Water Act, 1974, and the Air Act, 1981, Central Pollution Control Board was required to lay down standards for quality of water and air. The Central Pollution Control Board directed its efforts towards

development of Minimal National Standards (MINAS) only for trade effluents and sewages discharged. According to the Ministry of Environment and Forests, Central Pollution Control Board has so far formulated and laid down MINAS for 32 categories of industries (liquid effluent standards). Similarly, emission regulations were laid down in respect of 29 categories of industries and development of standards were stated to be in an advanced stage of finalisation in respect of 18 categories of industries and expected to be finalised in 1994. The Committee would like to be informed of the progress made by Central Pollution Control Board in the development of standards in respect of 18 items which are expected to be completed in 1994.

[Sl. No. 4 of Appendix IV, Para No. 123 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Central Pollution Control Board has developed ambient air quality standards for sensitive industrial and residential & other areas.

Similarly, Central Pollution Control Board had also developed ambient-river water quality criteria/standards depending on the various designated best uses of river stretches. Accordingly, two reports entitled "Scheme on Zoning & Classification of Indian Rivers, Estuaries & Coastal Waters (Part I, Sweet Waters; ADSORBS/3/78-79)" and "River Basin Atlas (ADSORBS/13/84-85)" have been brought out indicating the water quality criteria required to sustain the various designated best uses.

Besides above, the Central Board is also formulating the minimal national standards for effluent/emissions which are being notified by the Ministry of Environment and Forests under the Environment (Protection) Rules. The list of 18 categories of industries in respect of which the standards are expected to be finalised in 1994 is as follows:

1. Soda Ash
2. Pencil and Slate
3. Explosive Manufacturing
4. Flour Mills
5. Brick Kiln
6. Ink & Printing Ink
7. Standards for quality of Soil and various purposes and areas
8. Gas Based Power Plants
9. Battery Manufacturing Industry
10. Noise standards for Industrial Machines
11. H/G Acid

12. Emission standard for SO₂ in Coupola Furnace
13. Small Boilers emission standards (Revision)
14. Dairy industry
15. National Ambient Air Quality Standards
16. Starch (Maize products)
17. Coke oven and Brequette
18. Oil drilling and gas extraction

Audit comments on vetting of ATN

123 **Specific progress in the development of standards in respect of 18 items has not been indicated in the ATN**

Reply: The Central Pollution Control Board had taken up development of standards in respect of the following 18 categories of industries during 1994:

1. Soda Ash
2. Pencil and Slate
3. Explosive Manufacturing
4. Flour Mills
5. Brick Kiln
6. Ink & Printing Ink
7. Standards for quality of Soil and various purposes and areas
8. Gas Based Power Plants
9. Battery Manufacturing Industry
10. Noise standards for Industrial Machines
11. H/G Acid
12. Emission standard for SO₂ in Coupola Furnace
13. Small Boilers emission standards (Revision)
14. Dairy industry
15. National Ambient Air Quality Standards
16. Starch (Maize products)
17. Coke oven and Brequette
18. Oil drilling and gas extraction

Out of the above-noted 18 categories of industries, the work in 15 categories have been completed, and in the remaining 3 at S.Nos. 3,6 & 7, work is at an advance stage of completion and is expected to be completed during 1995.

Recommendation

As part of water pollution control, it was decided to establish monitoring stations for monitoring quality of water every month with reference to 19 significant parameters, subsequently enlarged to 22. The monitoring data are sent to Central Pollution Control Board by the State Boards who are paid at a prescribed rate for each sample depending on the number of parameters. The Committee note that out of 480 Water Quality Monitoring stations established upto March 1992, 42 stations could not supply any data and remained non-operational for periods ranging from one to five years. These stations were not operational as the State Boards were not responsive to the request either to activate or to relocate these stations. Some of the stations sanctioned even three years back are still non-functional mainly due to the delay in identifying alternate sites. What has surprised the Committee is that even in the light of non-response, Central Pollution Control Board did not deem it necessary to issue directions to the State Boards under Section 18 of Water Act, 1974. The Committee, therefore, desire that the Ministry of Environment and Forests should look into the matter with a view to ensuring proper coordination between Central Pollution Control Board and the State Boards so that all the water monitoring stations are made operational and a proper monitoring is done about the quality of water.

[Sl. No. 6 of appendix IV, para No. 125 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

The Water Quality Monitoring Stations are in fact, locations from where samples are manually collected for analysis in the laboratory. Non-operation of 42 stations is mainly due to location-specific problems, like approachability of the point in the river, mode of transportation for samples and their preservation. However, the entire water quality monitoring network were reviewed during 1993-94. Out of 480 Monitoring Stations, 478 are monitored regularly and remaining two are in the process of being activated. It was found that seven water quality monitoring stations were non-operational. These stations are relocated. At present, five of them are in operation and the remaining two are in the offing. The Central Pollution Control Board has been asked to watch the functioning of the Stations regularly and send quarterly progress reports to Ministry of Environment and Forests.

Audit comments on vetting of ATN

125 The date/period upto which the remaining two water quality Monitoring Stations were belief to become operational has not been indicated as also the mechanism introduced to ensure proper coordination between CPCB and the State Boards.

Reply: The remaining two stations are also made operational with effect

from June, 1994 and monitoring is being done on monthly frequency basis. All the data have been received. For proper coordination, periodical reviews and meetings are held with the State Boards.

Recommendation

The Global Environment Monitoring Scheme (GEMS) under World Health Organisation has a network of surface water quality stations all over the world, of which India is also a participating country with Central Pollution Control Board as the nodal coordinating agency. Each country is required to send water quality data on annual basis to WHO collaborating centre in Canada which is the central data depository. The Committee regret to note that the reports for the period from 1985 to 1987 were sent only in 1990 and for the period from 1988 to 1991 were sent after November, 1992. The report for 1992 has not been sent as yet. The Ministry have not offered any convincing explanation for the delays. The Committee recommend that Central Pollution Control Board should evolve a foolproof mechanism to ensure that in future, that reports are sent regularly on annual basis so that the available advantages by participation in the scheme are made use of in time. The Committee would also like to be informed about the latest position in submission of reports.

[Sl. No. 7 of Appendix IV, Para No. 126 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

The Central Pollution Control Board has sent the water quality monitoring data for GEMS stations to WHO-Canada Centre till December 1993. The acknowledgement of the data has been received in April, 1994.

Arrangement has been made in the Central and State Boards for transmission of data through satellite system in collaboration with National Informatics Centre(NIC). The system has been stabilised and it has been ensured that there would not be any delay on communication of data (under the GEMS scheme to WHO).

Recommendation

The Committee find that in January, 1991 Ministry of Environment and Forests identified 17 categories of industries that caused maximum pollution in the country and 1541 industrial units were asked through a Notification to instal pollution control equipments by 31 December, 1993 and bring down emissions in air and water to the standards prescribed. According to the information furnished by the Ministry to Committee in December, 1993, 1003. of the 1541 units in the large and medium sector have provided the requisite pollution control equipments to comply with the standards and others are in the process of installing the same. The Ministry also stated that State Pollution Control Boards have been directed

to monitor regularly the progress in these units and also take strict action against the defaulting units. The Committee desire that concerted efforts should be made to persuade the remaining units also to comply with the standards and instal requisite equipments so that extreme punitive action like closure of units, having social economic ramifications, are avoided. They would like to be apprised of the latest position of the compliance by the units including the Public Sector Undertakings. The Committee would also like to be informed of the steps being taken to enforce standards in other polluting industries in addition to the 17 where they have been made mandatory.

[Sl. No. 15 of Appendix IV, Para No. 134 of 65th Report of PAC
(10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

A review of the status of pollution control of 17 categories of highly polluting industries was taken by Ministry of Environment & Forests in a meeting with State Environmental Secretaries and Chairmen of Central and State Pollution Control Boards/Union Territories on January 6-7, 1994. The matter of taking action against the wilful defaulters was discussed. Accordingly, wilful defaulters were identified and the Central Board issued directions (Annexure I) to the State Boards for taking action against each of these on a case by case review basis. In this connection, the detailed information including the Public Sector Units is provided as follows.

Annexure II : Category-wise summary Status of the pollution control in 17 categories of industries (As on 30.6.1994)

Regarding the steps being taken in the industries which fall in the category of other than 17 identified categories including small scale industrial sector for control of pollution, it is to be mentioned that the standards notified by the Government for various categories of industries are also applicable to the small scale industries in the identified 17 categories and other categories, and the State Boards are expected to ensure compliance of standards in these units as well. The information regarding the steps taken by the State Boards and the status of compliance in the small scale sector and also in other categories, is being collected and complied by the Central Pollution Control Board.

Recommendation

The threat caused by pollution to the world famous historical monuments in Agra-Mathura region particularly the Taj Mahal has over the years agitated the minds of the public at large. The Committee in this connection find that subsequent to the decision of the Government of India to set up a large oil refinery in the Mathura region to meet the petroleum products demand of the north-west region, apprehensions were raised about the possible adverse effects on the monuments in the Agra-Mathura region as a result of gaseous effluents to be discharged from the refinery. Taken this into consideration Government of India constituted an expert Committee under the Chairmanship of Dr. S. Varadarajan on 16th July, 1974 to advise project authorities on the measures to be taken keeping the pollution effect to the absolute minimum. The Varadarajan Committee was not only to guide Mathura refinery project in planning and implementing effective pollution measure but also to advise the Ministry in the pollution aspects of other ancillary and downstream units. The expert Committee while expressing its deep concern for the preservation of the priceless monuments in Agra, particularly the Taj Mahal made several recommendations for consideration of the Government with a view to reducing the existing level of pollution substantially and forestalling in future sources of pollution. It had also subsequently stated that there was urgent need for continuous study and the investigations so as to ensure prevention of monuments from exposure to further threats from pollutants or any other cause. Various other studies / surveys / committees have since then reported upon the matter. These included a series of reports of National Environmental Engineering Research Institute (NEERI) under the Council for Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR), Process and Product Development Central (PPDC), NML, M/s. TECHNECO, etc. A Joint Committee of Parliament on the Air (Prevention and Control of Pollution) Bill, 1978 under the Chairman of Dr. Karan Singh had also in their report, presented to the House on 18th May, 1979, dealt with the issue. The joint Committee were of the opinion that in order to save Taj Mahal and other monuments in Agra and Brij Mandal from the ill effects of air pollutants, the Government apart from taking urgent and effective steps for prevention of existing air pollutants from other sources in Agra as per recommendations of the expert committee should also look into the refinery problem afresh and examine the feasibility on a shifting atleast the most polluting units of the refinery to the Etawah region.

[Sl. No. 18 of Appendix IV, Para No. 137 of 65th Report of PAC
(10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Pursuant to the directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India, an expert Committee under the Chairmanship of Dr. S. Varadarajan has been appointed to undertake the survey of the Taj Trapezium environmental

area and to make a report regarding the sources of pollution in the Trapezium, and the measures to be adopted to control the same. The expert committee will also identify the polluting industries in the Taj Trapezium.

Audit comments on vetting of ATN

137 It may be stated whether the terms of the Varadarajan committee cover the areas indicated in the report of the Joint Committee of Parliament

Reply: The terms of the Vardarajan Committee are as follows:

1. To undertake the survey of the Taj Trapezium environmental area and to make a report regarding the sources of pollution in the Trapezium.
2. To identify the polluting industries in the Taj Trapezium.
3. To suggest long-term and short-term measures to be adopted to control such pollution which causes damage to the Taj Mahal.

The terms of reference of the Varadarajan Committee do not cover the shifting of the most polluting units of the refinery to the Etawah region as indicated in the report of the Joint Committee of Parliament.

Recommendation

The committee note with grave concern that adequate steps were not taken by Government over the years despite several recommendations made by several Committees to effectively prevent and control pollution and preserve those historical monuments. As regards the current status, the Ministry of environment & forests identified the major polluting sources in Agra apart from emission from Mathura Refinery, foundry, rubber factory, engineering industries, chemical and other industries, motor vehicles etc. The Committee have been informed that based on the findings of the different studies/expert groups etc., an area in the form of a trapezium in-and around Agra-Mathura region has been identified as environmentally sensitive air pollution protection area. For regulating the pollution from industrial growth in this area industries have been broadly classified into three categories *viz.*, (i) those to be prohibited to come up within the air pollution protection area; (ii) those which may be permitted to come within the area only with adequate environmental control measures; (iii) industries that may be permitted to come up within the area. According to the Ministry from the view point of pollution control the best desirable option will be to shift the Polluting units from the area. However, since this has not happened the other alternatives were evolved in the form of a package of measures needed for, Pollution control in Agra. These included *inter alia* (i) fiscal incentives and other benefits for

shifting of the polluting units (ii) dedicated/uninterrupted power/gas supply to the industries/commercial activities to discourage the use of DG sets; (iii) Priority for provision of clean fuel (LPG) to the residents of Agra from the Mathura Refinery; (iv) Use of battery/CNG operated vehicles within specified area of Agra; and (v) Construction of an outer ring road at Agra to divert the traffic from the three national Highways. The Committee agree with the point of view of taking a package of measures for pollution control as many of these industries were shifted from their original site to the newly constructed Foundry Nagar in Agra in the Year 1975 onwards and further shifting of those industries will have grave social and economic consequences including mass unemployment of the people directly or indirectly dependent on these industries.

[Sl. No. 19 of Appendix IV, Para No. 138 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Besides the steps referred to by the Committee for control of pollution in the Agra-Mathura Region, a Committee under the Chairmanship of Dr. S. Varadarajan has been appointed under the directions of the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India to undertake the survey of the Taj Trapezium environmental area and to make a report regarding the sources of pollution in the trapezium, and the measures to be adopted to control the same. The expert committee will also identify the polluting industries in the Taj Trapezium.

The Hon'ble supreme Court, *vide* its order dated 11.4.94, had directed the Ministry of Environment and Forests for setting up of a Special Cell for the purpose of developing green belt around Taj Mahal as suggested by the NEERI in its report. A special cell has been set up in this Ministry under the Chairmanship of Ms. Amarjeet Kaur Ahuja, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Environment and Forests, National Afforestation and Eco-Development Board. The Cell has also sanctioned an amount of Rs. 14.0 lakhs to the Government of Uttar Pradesh for initiation of plantation. The shifting of industries in the Agra-Mathura Trapezium is before the Hon'ble Supreme Court and would not probably take a decision till the Dr. Varadarajan Committee submits its report.

The actions taken by Central Pollution Control Board to control air pollution in Agra-Mathura region are as follows:

- i. Five ambient air quality monitoring stations were installed at Agra in collaboration with Uttar Pradesh State Board.
- ii. Ambient monitoring stations maintained by IOC at Farah, Sikandra, Bharatpur and Mathura are periodically checked by Central Pollution Control Board/SPCB to ascertain the status of air quality.
- iii. Evolved standards for particulate matter from foundries, based on expert group recommendation.

- iv. Evolved standards for glass industries, based on study by N.P.C. A publication containing possibilities and option for pollution control in glass industries has been brought out by Central Pollution Control Board.
- v. A detailed package containing options for effective control of pollution in the Taj trapezium has been prepared and submitted to Ministry of environment and Forests for its implementation.
- vi. Industrial units in the trapezium were surveyed for on-the-spot assessment and a number of pollution control options were suggested to the units.
- vii. Several training programmes were organised, where training has been provided to SPCB officials and industry personnel for effective pollution control management.
- viii. Experts of Central Pollution Control Board have represented several forums in the country and shared various techniques and experience with the industry personnel and pollution control authorities regarding effective pollution control measures applicable to this region.

Recommendation

In regard to supply of gas to industries located in Taj Trapezium area which is considered as one of the important measures to control air pollution, the Committee find that in reply to question in Parliament on 24 February, 1994 regarding Extension of HBJ pipeline to Taj Trapezium area the Government have stated that it has not been considered feasible as allocation of gas along the HBJ are in excess of the availability of gas. In this connection the Committee find that. As far back as August, 1989 the Ministry had directed GAIL to allot the required gas to the UPSIDC for Ferozabad-Agra region. The Committee regret to note that the commitment made four years back is not being fulfilled. The Committee are also surprised to find that there are different figures in regard to availability of gas. On the one hand according to ONGC the availability of gas was to the extent of 19.19 MMSCMD while according to GAIL the quantity of gas available for supply through HBJ pipeline is of the order of 15 MMSCMD against the requirement of about 23 MMSCMD. It is, to say the least, indicative of the reluctance to meet the commitment and the lack of coordination between various wings of Government. Considering the fact that the whole region has been identified as environmentally sensitive air pollution protection area, the Committee desire that the question of supplying of dedicated/uninterrupted gas and power on priority basis to the industries using coal/diesel needs to be urgently looked into. They also desire that in order to check vehicular pollution electrification of railway tracks in Taj Trapezium area and introduction of local electric trains service should be considered for expeditions implementation.

[Sl. No. 20 of Appendix IV, Para No. 139 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

The Ministry of Environment and Forests has already written to the Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas to supply natural gas/LPG to the industries/commercial organisations. The matter is being followed up with the Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas.

The Hon'ble Minister of the State for Environment and Forests has also taken up this matter with Minister of State for Petroleum and Natural Gas who informed that his Ministry would work out a plan to provide gas to the industries/commercial organisations.

Audit comments on vetting of ATN

139. Action Taken Note is confined to action taken towards supplying gas only. The questions regarding uninterrupted power supply and electrification of railway tracks have not been covered.

Reply: The matter of supply of uninterrupted power to the Agra-Mathura Region was taken up with the Ministry of Power. The Ministry of Power has examined the matter in consultation with the Central Electricity Authority and have informed that the U.P. State Electricity Board has proposed to augment the capacity of the sub-station in Agra by installing one more unit in addition to existing 3×100 MVA, 220/132 KV unit.

Regarding electrification of railway tracks, the recommendations of the PAC has been brought to the notice of the Chairman, Railway Board for implementation. This is being followed up.

Recommendation

In this connection the Committee's attention has also been drawn to a memorandum jointly signed and submitted by 103 Members of Parliament addressed to the Prime Minister pointing out the extent of threat of pollution to the Taj and urging to initiate certain specific measures included in the memorandum. The Committee desire that the same should be taken up for expeditious implementation.

[Sl. No. 21 of Appendix IV, Para No. 140 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

In the representation, main points were:

- (i) Supply of natural gas to the industries in the Agra-Mathura Region.
- (ii) Supply of uninterrupted power to this region; and
- (iii) Control of pollution in the Mathura Refinery.

Regarding supply of natural gas, this Ministry has taken up the matter

with the Ministry of Petroleum and Natural Gas and that Ministry has conveyed that they would work out a plan to provide gas to the industries/ commercial organisations in the Agra-Mathura Region.

Regarding supply of uninterrupted power to this region, this matter has been taken up with Ministry of Power.

Mathura Refinery is conforming to the standards of the Uttar Pradesh Pollution Control Board. Moreover, they are setting up hydro-cracker unit, which will further reduce the SO_2 load in the emission.

Audit comments on vetting of ATN

140 Process evolved to monitor the position/progress periodically may be indicated.

Reply: This Ministry interacts periodically with the concerned sectoral Ministries to monitor the position and progress. The Ministry of Petroleum & Natural Gas have initiated steps for the supply of natural gas in the area amongst several other steps to control pollution in the area and its effect on the Taj Mahal.

Further, a programme for introducing unleaded petrol and low sulphur diesel is under way. This would improve the air quality and minimise the deleterious effect on the Taj Mahal and other monuments of the area.

Recommendation

The Committee have been informed that the impact of SO_2 (Sulphur Dioxide) emission from Mathura Refinery to Taj (Agra) is about 1.0 ug/m^3 . They have also been informed that this impact can be further reduced by reduction of SO_2 emission from refinery by increasing the efficiency of S.R.U. and blending of high sulphur crude with low sulphur crude before distillation. In their inspection Report, NEERI have also suggested various measures which have the potential to abate the Sulphur Dioxide releases from the Mathura Refinery from the current levels by over 90 per cent. As pointed out by the committee earlier, since Mathura Refinery is a major source of pollution, it is essential that immediate measures be taken to minimise pollution from the Refinery by installation of latest equipments and other measures. The Committee would, therefore, like to be informed of the action taken in this regard to reduce the impact of pollution caused by Mathura Refinery.

[Sl. No. 22 of Appendix IV, Para No. 141 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Emission of SO_2 from Mathura refinery varies from 600 to 700 kg/hr against the stipulated standard of 1000 kg/hr. Mathura refinery is in the process of installation of hydrocracker unit, which will further reduce SO_2 emissions.

Recommendation

As regards implementation of the package of measures, the Committee have been informed that a meeting was taken in July, 1993 by the Minister of Environment & Forests with the representatives of Indian Meteorological Department, Department of Tourism, Archaeological Survey of India, Ministry of Industry, Central Pollution Control Board, Indian Oil Corporation, National Environment Engineering Research Institute, etc. for identifying action points to be taken to control pollution in Agra-Mathura region. The Ministry of Environment & Forests assured the Committee that they are continuously monitoring developments for implementation of the suggestions made by different experts to save the Taj Mahal. The Committee cannot remain contented merely with this assurance. They recommend that the package of measures and various other suggestions should be considered for expeditious implementation in a time-bound manner so that the historical important, priceless monuments are adequately protected from further pollution. Considering the impact of air pollution on the Taj, the hazard to the health of human being in the region can be well imagined. The Committee would like to be informed of the specific actions taken on the package of measures evolved for pollution control in TPZ area.

[Sl. No. 23 of Appendix IV, Para No. 142 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Under the direction of the Hon'ble Supreme Court, the Ministry of Environment and Forests had appointed an Expert Committee under the Chairmanship of Dr. S. Varadarajan to make investigations/report on the source of pollution in the Agra-Mathura Trapezium and the measures to be adopted to control the same.

Under the direction of the Hon'ble Supreme Court, the Ministry of Environment and Forests has also set up a special cell under the Chairmanship of Ms. Amarjeet Kaur Ahuja, Joint Secretary, Ministry of Environment and Forests, National Afforestation and Eco-development Board, for the purpose of developing green belt around the Taj Mahal.

An amount of Rs. 14.0 lakhs has also been released on 14.7.94 to the U.P. Government for this work.

Recommendation

The Committee desire that Government should take measures on priority basis for pollution control in other areas which have been identified as environmentally sensitive from the historically important point of view or due to other considerations.

[Sl. No. 24 of Appendix IV, Para No. 143 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Central Pollution Control Board has evolved ambient air quality standards for SPM, SO², NO and CO for sensitive areas way back in 1982 and has revised these standards recently. However, it is in the purview of State Government and CPCB to define any specific area as sensitive, for which guidelines were circulated to all SPCBs.

The Ministry of Environment and Forests has constituted a Consultative Group to prepare a draft policy paper on approach to conservation of man-made heritage from the environmental angle. The terms of reference of the Group shall be as under:

- (i) To prepare a draft policy paper on approach to conservation of man-made heritage from an environmental angle.
- (ii) To advise the Ministry of Environment and Forests on preserving and developing the aesthetic quality of heritage areas, while maintaining their interaction with the community; and
- (iii) To advise the Ministry of Environment and Forests on the nature of legal control required to conserve the heritage area in accordance with the National Conservation Strategy.

Recommendation

The Committee find that in 1984, Central Pollution Control Board prepared an industrial inventory to assess pollution status in major and medium polluting industries. With rapid industrial development, Central Pollution Control Board felt it essential to update the inventory every five years. In June, 1987 a re-organisation plan was prepared under which Central Pollution Control Board was to complete by 1990, inventorisation of all major and minor industries for Air and Water Pollution, upgradation of sanitation state in Class I and Class II cities and status of vehicular pollution in metropolitan cities. Unfortunately, inventory reports for Punjab and Gujarat have only been prepared and published so far. The delay in publishing reports relating to the rest of the States has been attributed to lack of response and timely supply of information from the State Boards. This is, thus, yet another area requiring close cooperation and better coordination between Central Pollution Control Board and the State Boards. The Committee, therefore, desire that effective steps should be taken to update the inventory and complete listing of all major, medium

and small scale industries which are relevant to air and water pollution with a view to making an overall scientific assessment of pollution status in the industries for taking up pollution control measures.

[Sl. No. 27 of Appendix IV, Para No. 146 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

With regard to inventory of large and medium polluting industries, the Central Board has decided to send a team of Central Pollution Control Board officials to various State Pollution Control Boards for collecting and compiling the details of the national inventory of industries. The inventorisation of SSI shall be initiated after completing the inventorisation of large & medium industries. Central Pollution Control Board has made the target to complete the work by the end of this financial year (1994-95). Regarding the updation of sanitation status of Class I and Class II cities, the work has already been assigned to Environment Protection Training the Research Institute, Hyderabad.

Recommendation

The facts stated in the foregoing paragraphs clearly identify certain vital areas relating to pollution control in general, and the functioning of Central Pollution Control Board, in particular requiring immediate governmental attention. Briefly these areas were, incomplete composition of Central Pollution Control Board, delay in making standards developed by Central Pollution Control Board mandatory, shortcomings in the functioning of monitoring stations and inadequacies in monitoring the quality of water, delay in completing river basin studies and preparation of Action Plans for abatement of river water pollution, delay in commissioning of equipments, and in making air quality stations operative, inadequacies in the enforcement of pollution control measures, need for providing aid/technical advice to industries/units particularly the small scale ones, delay in initiating steps to prevent and control pollution of Taj Mahal, lack of adequate coordination between Central Pollution Control Board and the State Pollution Control Boards etc. There had also been several financial, administrative and other irregularities. The Committee's attention has been drawn in this connection to Government of India's "Policy statement for abatement of Pollution 1992" which seeks to lay emphasis towards actual implementation. The Committee consider that the Central Pollution Control Board being the premier organisation on the subject has an increasingly important role to play in prevention and control of pollution. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the facts stated in this Report should be thoroughly examined and appropriate remedial/corrective measures taken with a view to streamlining the functioning of the Central

Pollution Control Board so that it acts not only as an advisory agency but also as an effective promotional body in abatement of pollution for preventing deterioration of the environment.

[Sl. No. 33 of Appendix IV, Para no. 152 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

It is agreed that Central Pollution Control Board should not act only as an advisory body but also as an effective promotional body in prevention, abatement and control of the environmental pollution. The Central Pollution Control Board is promoting the idea of the best practicable means of controlling pollution from industries through publication of industry—specific comprehensive documents and training of industry personnel to achieve the standards for effluents/emissions.

In order to educate the industries, CPCB also promoted the idea of environmental audit, a useful alternative to command and control, which is the self regulatory mechanism by the industries to promote conservation of resources which otherwise, go waste as pollutant.

As regards social awareness, a separate NGO Cell has been developed and through this means the idea of environmental management is transmitted to the public. Hence, from the beginning, the idea of promotion is very much at the core of the activities of CPCB and in future, it will be more intensified as the mechanism of inspection by control authorities does not always furnish fruitful results. CPCB is also promoting the idea of clean technology, upgradation of present technology to small scale sector, the installation of common effluent treatment for the SSI units, etc., through the cooperation of industrial associations.

Recommendation

The Committee note that the Ministry of Environment have initiated an exercise to integrate the various major Central Acts on environment with the object of protecting environment, implementing international decisions and consolidating and amending major Central Acts on the subject. The Committee have been informed that the Indian Law Institute who had been given that assignment have given their report which was now being examined by the Ministry. The Committee desires to be informed of the further progress made in the matter.

[Sl. No. 34 of Appendix IV, Para no. 153 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

The Indian Law Institute had submitted a report delineating a detailed Scheme on comprehensive legislation which was circulated to the States/UTs, concerned Ministries and NGOs for their views/comments. A project to draft a Bill has also been sanctioned to the Indian Law Institute which also envisages a workshop for obtaining wider participation. It is expected that this exercise will be completed in a year's time. The Ministry intends to appoint a Committee of legal experts, and an officer having field

experience of pollution control to oversee the drafting of the comprehensive legislation. The Indian Law Institute will have a representative in the Committee, and will draft the legislation in time with the guidelines evolved by the Committee.

CHAPTER III

RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT DESIRE TO PURSUE IN THE LIGHT OF THE REPLIES RECEIVED FROM GOVERNMENT

Recommendation

A disquieting feature observed by the Committee was that even though it was known that the standards developed by Central Pollution Control Board were not binding on the State Boards in term of the provisions of the Water and Air Acts, No action was taken by the Ministry to make them legally mandatory on the State Boards. It was only on 19 May 1993, i.e. after the the Audit Paragraph appeared, that the Ministry of Environment and Forests vide their notification issued on 19 May, 1993, made the Minimal National Standards (MINAS) legally binding on the State Boards. According to the ministry, the State Boards have now been empowered to make the standards more stringent where situation so demands but they are not permitted to relax the standards. The Committee consider the delay unfortunate. They recommend that Central Pollution Control Board should constantly monitor the standards developed by the State Boards and oversee the steps taken to ensure their enforcement.

[Sl. No. 5 of Appendix IV, Para No. 124 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

National Ambient Air Quality Standards developed by Central Pollution Control Board are binding on the State Boards as per the provisions of the Air Act. These can not be relaxed. Similar is the case with ambient water quality standards, particularly, Inter-State rivers, under the provisions of water Act, wherein Central Pollution Control Board has been empowered to evolve standards in consultation with State Governments.

Emissions standards are developed by Central Pollution Control Board under Section 17(1) (g) of the Air Act in consultation with the State Boards. These standards can be made stringent depending on local conditions but cannot be relaxed. However, in respect of industrial effluent standards, the standards (MINAS) developed by Central Pollution Control Board form the basis for notification under the Environment (Protection) Rules, 1986, which cannot be relaxed during the implementation by State Boards.

The Ministry would like to resubmit the legal position as regards the standards notified by the Government vide Notification dated 19th May,

1993. As a matter of fact, the Central Government has initially notified the standards for Effluent/Emission, under Environment (Protection) Rules, 1986 vide Notification No. S.O. 844(E) framed pursuant to the Environment (Protection) Act, 1986. As per sub-rule 2 of rule 3 of the above said rules, the Central Board or State Board have been statutorily empowered to specify more stringent standards than those specified under the Environment (Protection) Rules, 1986.

The Central Government, subsequently notified the General Standards, vide notification dated 19th May, 1993 (revised standards) with a view that these may be minimal standards irrespective of the category of industries for which the standards have not been notified specifically.

Central Pollution Control Board is constantly monitoring the standards adopted by State Boards both for emission and effluent, and also monitoring the implementation of standards.

Recommendation

A Memorandum of Understanding (MOU), on Environmental Cooperation was signed, in January, 1988 between the Government of India and the Government of Netherlands and a project called "Biological Monitoring and Ecotoxicological Studies of river Yamuna was prepared for carrying out a pilot study on practicability of using, biological parameters to evaluate the ecological quality of fresh water rivers in India. As per MOU, contribution of the Indian Government was to be Rs. 43.28 lakhs and the Netherlands Government was to provide Rs. 950 lakhs in the form of expert assistance, equipment, consultancy etc. The primary objective of the project was to develop a biomonitoring methodology to assess pollution load and to generate biological and chemical data on ecological systems in order to properly manage the rivers. The work was to be carried out in two phases jointly by Central Pollution Control Board and Industrial Toxicological Research Centre (ITRC), Lucknow. Mid-term evaluation reports submitted by a team of the Govt. of Netherlands in February and November 1990, however, revealed that a substantial amount of expenditure in the first year had been incurred on manpower, purchase of vehicles etc. It further disclosed that the work plan was not completely carried out as project, contractual obligation of ITRC was not well defined, Central Pollution Control Board had failed in eliciting involvement of ITRC and that the project was carried out without setting, the strategy and was reduced to transfer of technology relevant to developed countries without taking into account the ground realities. The evaluation conducted in November, 1990, also pointed out that the main objective of creating early warning system and bioaccumulation, monitoring had not been achieved. The Committee recommend that the reasons for the non-

achievement of the objectives of the project should be enquired into and responsibility fixed for the lapses.

[Sl. No. 8 of Appendix IV, Para No. 127 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

A Memorandum Of Understanding (MOU) on Environmental Cooperation was signed in January, 1988 between the Govt. of India and the Govt. of Netherlands under which a Projects proposal entitled "Biological monitoring and ecotoxicological studies of river Yamuna" was prepared for carrying out a study on biological parameters to evaluate the ecological quality of fresh water river in India.

As Per MOU, contribution of the Indian Government was to be Rs. 30,86,000/- (and not Rs. 43,28,000/-) as mentioned in Audit Para and that of the Netherlands Government was Dfl 9,75,000/- which was equivalent to Rs. 63,37,500/- @ Rs 6.50 per Dfl (prevaleant conversion rate) and not Rs. 950,00,000/- as mentioned in Audit Para.

The primary objective of the project was to develop biomonitoring methodology to assess pollution load and to generate biological and chemical data on ecological systems in the rivers.

The project has since been completed according to the work plan and the report is finalised.

The development of early warning system is the objective of another project under Indo-Dutch Bilateral Programme i.e. 'Automatic Water Quality Monitoring Stations' project. Bioaccumulation studies were conducted during the initial project period. Level of Bioaccumulation of pollutant was found insufficient and hence, further studies were not taken up. The project has achieved the targeted objectives, i.e. development of methodology for biomonitoring of Indian rivers. This methodology is now being tested in other rivers in the country, namely Tungabhadra in Karnataka and Chalyar in Kerala.

The project has achieved the targeted objectives, i.e. development of biomonitoring methodology for Indian rivers. Though contribution from I.T.R.C. was not forthcoming as proposed in the first year of the project, subsequently three reports were received from the ITRC as per schedule. The results provided by ITRC proved that the micro pollutant level in the Yamuna. (which was main work of ITRC) was not much significant. Hence, ITRC's contribution has not affected the final objective of the project.

Recommendation

As part of the Indo-Dutch bilateral collaborative programme, two water quality monitoring and sampling stations were also to be installed on river Yamuna in Delhi at Wazirabad (upstream) and Okhla (downstream) barrage. The objective of the project was to obtain a continuous insight into the basic parameters of the intake of water from Yamuna river for drinking purposes. The stations were installed during August, 1991. While

the Wazirabad station functioned satisfactorily, Okhla station had to be closed as the extremely bad quality of water (sewage) was destructive of some of the measuring electrodes of the station besides being a health hazard to the operators and had to be shifted to Haiderpur (upstream) water works. The change of site resulted in delay in programme, non-monitoring of the pollution generated by the city and also an infructuous expenditure of Rs. 1.88 lakhs. The Ministry of Environment and Forests have attempted to justify their action by stating that the automatic water quality monitoring stations have been installed on experimental basis to ascertain their suitability under Indian conditions. The Committee are not inclined to agree with this view. The fact that important considerations like quality of water, health hazards etc. had been overlooked by Central Pollution Control Board while selecting the site would clearly indicate that the precommissioning survey was totally inadequate. The Committee desire that the Ministry should thoroughly enquire into the reasons for inadequate survey and apprise them of the results.

[Sl. No. 9 of Appendix IV, Para No. 128 of 65th report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Adequate survey was conducted for selection of site for installation of the Automatic Water Quality Monitoring Stations on river Yamuna by the Dutch experts along various stretches of the river. Water quality data arising out of manual monitoring of the Yamuna at Wazirabad and Okhla were also provided to the Dutch expert before final selection of the stations / location. Since the station is based on a container which could be shifted from one place to the another depending on the need, shifting of the station from Okhla (due to unabated discharge of untreated city sewage into the Yamuna causing high deterioration of water quality) to Haiderpur involved very nominal expense due to its mobility. Monitoring of water quality at Okhla was also not hampered due to existence of manual monitoring.

The prime objective of the programme has been all the more served in shifting one of its monitoring location from Okhla to Haiderpur water intake point where quality is often threatened due to discharge of industrial waste into the Western Yamuna Canal (one of the water sources for Delhi) in Haryana. An amount of Rs. 1,88,000/- was spent for providing infrastructural facilities which may not be termed as wasteful expenditure, as in any developmental project, a lot of vital information is gathered which can be utilised in future projects.

Central Pollution Control Board have neither the necessary expertise for undertaking survey for site selection for setting of Automatic water quality monitoring stations, nor the pre-requisites required for installation of such system were known to Central Pollution Control Board. Such continuous monitoring stations are being used in Netherlands for several years. As the

required expertise for selection of site for installation of water quality station was available with the Dutch, a request was made by Central Pollution Control Board to the Dutch side for conducting survey and selecting appropriate site for installation of the water quality monitoring station on river Yamuna. After intensive survey and study of the water quality monitoring data, the Dutch experts selected the two sites, i.e. Wazirabad and Okhla, for installation of continuous water quality monitoring stations. As details about the probes / electrodes installed in the station were not known, Central Pollution Control Board was not in a position to judge their suitability for monitoring the quality of water at Okhla.

Recommendation

The Committee note that nine Automatic Water Quality Monitoring stations on selected points on the river Ganga were proposed to be set up as a research project of Central Pollution Control Board to determine the river quality on a continuous basis and for use of the data for water quality modelling and assessment of impact of sewage / treatment effluents plants. The Ganga Project Directorate provided Rs. 50 lakhs for the programme including installation of the proposed automatic monitoring stations. According to Audit, the programme which was to be completed by June, 1989 had not been completed till January, 1993 and the expenditure incurred thereon was yet to yield any benefit. The Ministry of Environment and Forests have stated that out of the nine stations, six have since been commissioned and an expenditure of Rs. 59.68 lakhs have been incurred on the same. In the light of the Audit objection that the system was yet to yield any benefit, the Committee desire the Ministry to look into the matter and ensure that the expenditure incurred was commensurate with the gains achieved and apprise the Committee of the progress made in completing the project.

[Sl. No. 10 of Appendix IV, Para No. 129 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

The setting up of Automatic Water Quality Monitoring Stations (AWQMS) on river Ganga was taken up with a view to gather continuous data on river water quality at sensitive locations of river Ganga and to carry out Water Quality Modelling requiring statistical data information. The Monitoring Station consists of two main parts viz., automatic monitoring system and the floating platform on which the system is installed.

The Thames Water International under ODA Programme provided the technical specifications for design of AWQMS. The design for the floating platform was outlined by Ocean Engineering Centre, IIT, Madras. It was originally proposed to set up 9 AWQMS at an estimated cost of Rs. 72 lakhs for stations and Rs. 44 lakhs for the floating platforms.

The 1st set of AWQMS was installed in the midstream near Shuklaganj and upstream Kanpur on river Ganga on 12th Aug. '91. Subsequently, 3 more stations were commissioned till March '92. The Instruments took time to get stabilized. Besides others, two main problems encountered and differing from those experienced by Thames Water International for river Thames were that of high flow of river Ganga and excessive silt load. These lead to shifting of stations to more appropriate places. Frequent cleaning of the probe was required as the heavy silt caused choking of Probes. These resulted in prolonging of the stabilization time for AWQMS.

In view of the difficulties encountered, it was decided to commission only 6 out of the originally proposed 9 stations. The stations have since stabilised and data on water quality on chosen parameters is received on regular basis. Provisions have also now been made to directly receive the Water Quality Data from AWQMS at the Ganga Project Directorate through NIC's network and analysis of this data is being made.

Five Automatic water quality monitoring stations on river Ganga have been commissioned viz., at Kannauj, Shuklaganj, (Upstream Kanpur), Baksar, (Downstream Kanpur), Varanasi and Patna. The floating platform for the sixth station is ready. The monitoring instruments, which are to be installed in the station is yet to be delivered by the supplier. The station will be installed as soon as the delivery of the instruments is made. Now the data from the five stations are transferred through NICNET to Ganga Project Directorate from the National Informatics Centre district Centre, Kanpur. The unloaded cartridge which contains the data from outstation automatic water quality monitoring stations were brought to the Zonal office of Central Pollution Control Board, Kanpur and unloaded using a data transfer unit into a floppy and then transferred from NIC, Kanpur to GPD.

In order to avoid delay due to sending the cartridge from Varanasi and Patna to Kanpur, it was decided to have more data transfer unit for each executing agency so that the data could be downloaded and transferred through the respective district centres of NIC.

The principal aim of setting up of these automatic water quality monitoring stations is to gather continuous data of the river quality at sensitive points on river Ganga. All the five stations installed are at sensitive areas. For example, the Kannauj station is located in downstream of the confluence of Kali river which brings effluent from Muzaffarnagar, Daurala industrial area, Modipuram industrial area paper mills at Saini & Meerut, Hapur industrial area, Modinagar industrial area etc. The continuous monitoring of the river water quality, therefore, provides the information on the impact of the effluents coming through the Kali river. Similarly, monitoring of water quality at Kanpur upstream and downstream provides the impact of the effluent discharged from Kanpur city. In

addition to this, the automatic water quality monitoring also can be used to assess the impact of sewage treatment plant, to be set up in future, on the river water quality. Similar is the case with the Patna station. The Varanasi station, which is located downstream at Bhopauli, provides the impact of the effluent discharge from the city as well as the effect of mass bathing at the holy ghats on the water quality. Hence the automatic water quality monitoring stations located on river Ganga have yielded sufficient information on water quality.

Audit Comments on Vetting of ATN

129. Expected date of installation of data transfer unit for each executing agency may be indicated.

Reply: Date is yet to be confirmed by the supplier of the data transfer unit.

Recommendation

The Committee also feel concerned about the slow progress made in the implementation of Ganga Action Plan Phase I and II and desire that the matter should be looked into with a view to accelerating its progress.

[Sl. No. 11 of Appendix IV, Para No. 130 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

The Ganga Action Plan was approved in April 1985 as a 100% centrally sponsored scheme with the primary objective of improving the water quality by checking pollution caused by point and non-point sources. 25 Class I cities are being covered under Phase-I of the programme with a total of 261 sanctioned schemes.

In the initial period, formulation of schemes by the implementing agencies in the States of Uttar Pradesh, Bihar & West Bengal were slow. The basic reasons were that the States were not equipped in terms of technical expertise to handle works of this type. Further, interception, diversion and treatment of waste water on such a large scale was undertaken for the first time in the country. Inadequate knowledge and experience as well as non-availability of suitable contractors contributed to delay the project further. In addition, due to inability to fully anticipate the requirements some of the schemes had to undergo change in scope and variation in rates.

Physical & financial progress of the schemes are being regularly monitored by the Steering Committee and the Monitoring Committee. The Central Ganga Authority chaired by the Prime Minister also overviews the implementation.

Of the 261 sanctioned schemes, 237 have since been reported to be completed as per the communications received from the States. As for the balance 24 schemes, it is expected that they would be completed by 1996-97.

In financial terms, an expenditure of 369 crores out of the total state-wise component of Rs. 426 crores has been incurred.

As far as GAP Phase-II is concerned, works in respect of Yamuna Action Plan are in progress.

Recommendation

In order to ascertain the quality of river water consistent with human activities, Central Pollution Control Board planned to prepare an Action Plan to control pollution and maintain or restore the wholesomeness of rivers. In this connection, comprehensive river basin studies were to be undertaken in respect of 14 major rivers by Central Pollution Board, out of which nine studies were to be completed and published between November, 1988 to December, 1991. The Committee regret to note that three of these studies are yet to be completed and reports in respect of six rivers basin studies have not been published so far. Similarly, on the basis of river basin studies, Action Plans for abatement of river water pollution were required to be prepared. In the action plan of Central Pollution Control Board for 1991-91, preparation of Action Plan for five major rivers was to be taken up. However, while Action Plans for three rivers were prepared belatedly, the Action Plan for two rivers were yet to be completed. The Committee take a serious view of the delays and desire that the Ministry should make concerted efforts to ensure that all river basin studies are completed and published and that the action Plans are prepared expeditiously. The Committee would like to be apprised to the progress made in this direction and the steps taken for the implementation of the Action Plans.

[Sl. No. 12 of Appendix IV, Para No. 131 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

A. Central Board has published the following seven major river basin reports:

1. (a) Ganga [Main], (b) Ganga [Yamuna Sub-Basin];
2. Sabarmati;
3. Subarnarekha;
4. Krishna;
5. Brahmani Baitarni;
6. Tapi; and
7. Narmada

B. The river basin reports prepared and under printing are:

8. Mahanadi; and
9. Cauvery

C. Report has been prepared and printing is to be taken up for the river:

10. Godavari

D. Reports for the following rivers are under preparation:

11. Mahi;
12. (a) Indus [Part II-Jammu and Kashmir part];
13. Pennar; and
14. Brahmaputra

E. Action Plan preparations have been initiated for the river basins of:

15. Sabarmati;
16. Subarnarekha; and
17. Godavari

G. Comprehensive studies for the following medium river basins are in progress:

18. Ulhas;
19. Chaliyar; and
20. Rushikulya

Recommendation

The Committee note that a project named "Monitoring of Indian Coastal Waters" was sanctioned by the Ministry in 1987 to established a monitoring network covering the critical stretches of coastal waters with a view to preventing coastal pollution. Under this project, a network of 173 inland, coastal, off shore and high-sea monitoring stations were to be established and monitored by the respective State Boards. The project which was initially to be completed by 1990 had been extended till March, 1992 reportedly due to bad weather conditions, high cost of hiring of vessels, inadequate funds etc. Eventually, the project was discontinued, without completing required rounds of monitoring after April, 1992 due to financial constraints. At the time of terminating the project, while the other executing agencies had completed 15-17 rounds of monitoring, the Tamil Nadu Pollution Control Board had completed only 5 rounds. Still it was not proposed to undertake the balance monitoring now as it will not serve any useful purpose. The Committee take a serious view of the fact that even after the lapse of a period of six years and releasing funds of Rs.115 lakhs against the sanctioned amount of Rs.108 lakhs the project remained incomplete, what is more surprising is the fact that despite the inadequate monitoring, Central Pollution Control Board has prepared a software for an analysis of coastal data in order to prepare a Report on coastal water quality. The Committee wonder how the data which is not complete could be useful for preparing the Report on coastal water quality and recommend that the reasons for not completing the monitoring in full as required within the specified period and incurring an excess expenditure 39 over the sanctioned amount be investigated and the Committee apprised of the outcome.

[Sl. No. 13 of Appendix IV, Para No. 132 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

The Software developed for coastal water quality data analysis by Central Pollution Control Board is used for the statistical analysis of the data generated under the project "Monitoring of Indian Coastal Waters". Most of the executing agencies (litoral State Boards) have completed 15.17 rounds of monitoring, except the Tamil Nadu State Pollution Control Board. The data generated can be statistically analysed by using the software. Even the limited data for Tamil Nadu coast can also be analysed by the same software. The report on coastal water quality statistics is under finalisation. This report will be useful, as baseline information, to all those concerned with coastal water quality management in the country.

Inadequacy of proper sea-going vessels, the weather and climatic conditions and the local ethnic problems were the reasons for not completing the required rounds of monitoring by some of the agencies. At times, the monitoring had to be abandoned midway through the round because of inclement weather. Owing to the above, the project which was to be completed in 1990 was extended to March, 1992. The additional expenditure is because of the extension of the project till March, 1992.

Recommendation

The Committee note that in 1986-87, the Department of Ocean Development (DOD) started a project entitled "Survey of Environmental Pollution in Seas around India" which was aimed at seasonal monitoring/ measurement of pollution in marine coastal areas upto 5kms. off-shore along the country's entire coastline. The steering Committee of DOD reviewed and modified the project in June, 1990 and redefined the length and width of study stretches and renamed it as "Coastal Monitoring and Prediction System (COMPAS)". The Zonal Office, C.P.C.B. Calcutta, was one of the units among the eleven units identified for undertaking the work. Out of the 29 laboratory equipments, Zonal Office Central Pollution Control Board, Calcutta could commission only one. The Committee regret to note that even after the lapse of more than 3 years, Central Pollution Control Board have not been able to complete even the commissioning of the equipments. They recommend that the Ministry should ensure that the Commissioning work of the equipment is expedited so that the work of monitoring of pollution of marine coastal areas can be taken up without further delay.

[Sl. No. 14 of Appendix IV, Para No. 133 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Regarding the remaining 28 items of instruments/equipment of the DOD's approved list, all the items except only the 'Total Organic Carbon (TOC) Analyser' has since been procured and are under use. The import of the TOC analyser, like other imported instruments, has been under processing

in the Central Board's Head Office. There has been repeated attempts for importing the TOC analyser during the projection duration of three years through Global Tender. But, unfortunately, every time a single tender was received which the Central Board did not approve for placement of purchase order. However, the order has since been placed for procurement of the TOC Analyser following usual procedure.

Recommendation

The Committee note that in 1984, National Ambient Air Quality Monitoring (NAAQM) project was initiated by Central Pollution Control Board as a part of pollution management programme for which it identified three parameters for monitoring, namely Sulphur Dioxide, Nitrogen Dioxide and suspended particulate matter. By March, 1992 Central Pollution Control Board established 290 stations in the country. For establishing of NAAQM stations, Central Pollution Control Board had incurred an expenditure of Rs. 261.63 lakhs during the Seventh Plan period (1985-90) and Rs. 176.45 lakhs during the years 1990-91 and 1991-92 out of its Annual Plans. Out of the 290 stations, 50 stations are not in operation because of delay in procurement of instruments, non-availability of trained persons on daily wages, access to public buildings and electricity connections etc. Significantly, Central Pollution Control Board had incurred expenditure amounting to Rs. 35 Lakhs on these stations. According to the Ministry, the State Boards have been asked to expedite the operation of these stations or refund the grants. The fact that Central Pollution Control Board have not been able to make the monitoring stations operative and secure the necessary data through the State Boards even after one to eight years of their setting up clearly indicates absence of proper monitoring and close cooperation between the Central Pollution Control Board and the State Boards. The Committee, therefore, desires that the Ministry should look into the matter and ensure that all the monitoring stations are made operative and the data generated thereon are analysed and effectively used in improving the quality of air.

[S. No. 17 of Appendix IV, Para No. 136 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by The Government

During the financial year 1993-94, additional 26 stations were made operational and data is being received regularly. Efforts are continued to pursue to relocate the remaining stations and made them operational. The data so generated are analysed and published in the form of reports and for identifying the locations which are violating the ambient air quality standards. These reports are made available to the State Boards and user agencies to help them in drafting the environmental improvement plans.

Audit Comments on Vetting of ATN

136. Excepted date by which remaining 24 stations would become operational may be indicated.

Reply: Expected date of commissioning of the 24 NAAQM stations is September, 1995.

Recommendation

The Committee note that a writ petition relating to pollution of Taj Mahal is currently pending before the Supreme Court. The Supreme Court in their orders dated 27th August, 1993 and 3 December, 1993 ordered immediate closure of 312 industrial units in Taj Trapezium including 212 Small Scale Factories in Agra for not having installed the necessary pollution control devices. These factories were mainly foundries, glass manufacturers and some chemical industries. The Committee have been informed that as on 17 February, 1994, 125 units had got installed suitable pollution control devices after the orders of Supreme Court and obtained suspension of the closure orders. The fact that several units had demonstrated their willingness to comply with the legal requirements after the intervention of Supreme Court clearly indicates that the pollution control authorities were earlier not every serious in eliciting cooperation from the units and enforcing the pollution control measures in a persuasive and decisive manner. The Committee are unhappy over this. They desire that the Ministry should look into this matter for appropriate action plan for the implementation of various measures needed for pollution control throughout the country.

[Sl. No. 25 of Appendix IV, Para No. 144 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by The Government

Every industry is required to take consent to establish and operate and conform to the prescribed standards laid down in various environment legislations. It is the duty of the industry to obey the rules and regulations framed for control of pollution. The Uttar Pradesh Pollution Control Board has a regional office in Agra and this office looks after pollution control in the Agra-Mathura Region. The Uttar Pradesh Pollution Control Board, forwarded the case of industries which did not conform to the standards and failed to curtail pollution.

The Ministry of Environment and Forests, with the active cooperation of Central Pollution Control Board has suggested various options for control of pollution from the industries in Agra-Mathura Region. The Foundries have been requested through the Government of Uttar Pradesh to change process and metal to coke ratio for better pollution control.

The Ministry of Environment and Forests is constantly following up the matter of pollution control in the Agra-Mathura Region with the concerned authorities.

Audit Comments on Vetting of ATN

144 The ATN does not indicate any action plan for the implementation of measures needed for pollution control throughout the country.

Reply: Details of the action plan on industrial pollution control in the identified 17 categories of industries are given below:—

In order to take priority for control of industrial pollution, the Government have identified 17 categories of highly polluting industries in the country in consultation with the Central and State Pollution Control Boards (SPCBs). The Government have also issued a Gazette notification according to which all the polluting units were required to comply with the prescribed standards by December 31, 1993.

As per the information received so far from the States, out of the total of 1551 units identified in the medium and large scale sectors, 1125 units have provided adequate facilities to comply with the standards. 107 units have been reported to be closed either on their own or due to action by the SPCBs and 319 units are reported to be at various stages of installing the requisite pollution control devices.

According to the direction issued by the Central Pollution Control Board in January 1994 to all the State Pollution Control Boards and Pollution Control Committees of the Union Territories, they were asked to review all these 319 units on a case to case basis and identify the *bona-fide* units who have taken considerable measures to instal the requisite pollution control facilities and give them the minimum time required to complete their pollution control programmes. Simultaneously, they have to take legal action against the defaulting units, who have not taken such steps to instal pollution control devices.

Further, the Government have issued a notification on 28 January, 1994 wherein 29 polluting categories of industries, including foundries, are required to submit an Environmental Impact Assessment report to the Ministry of Environment & Forests and obtain environmental clearance after a proper appraisal of the proposed project. This ensures that the deleterious effect from putting up the plant would be kept to a minimum.

Recommendation

Central Pollution Control Board had sought to develop mobile laboratories for surveillance, planning and control of pollution under the Laboratory Development Programme. The Committee note that three chassis were received in June, 1990 incurring an expenditure of Rs. 25.03 lakhs for developing mobile laboratories at Bangalore, Chandigarh and Shillong offices. These remained idle for more than three years.

Subsequently, it was decided that two chassis will be used for remounting the GTZ Automatic Air Quality Monitoring Systems and the third was proposed to be given to Rajasthan Board. However, as the Rajasthan Board managed to get a laboratory fabricated through other sources, it was sent to the Central Pollution Control Board Zonal Office (South) Bangalore for development of mobile laboratory. The Committee recommend that the reasons for procurement of equipment without undertaking proper assessment and its usage for purposes for which it was not intended should be thoroughly enquired and steps taken to obviate recurrence of such cases in future.

[Sl. No. 29 of Appendix IV, Para No. 148 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

The instruments, procured for the mobile laboratories are being used in the existing Head Office and Zonal Office laboratories of Central Pollution Control Board including stationery and mobile laboratories. The mobile laboratories, if procured, would have helped in conducting monitoring and certain activities of Central Pollution Control Board in a smoother manner. However, in the absence of these mobile laboratories, above activities were carried out by collecting the samples and transporting them to the nearest laboratories. Though there were some constraints but the laboratory schedule of Central Pollution Control Board was not hampered. The equipment were purchased considering the three mobile laboratories will be developed. Further due to change in policy to close down the two offices of Central Pollution Control Board at Chandigarh and Pondicherry, the equipment purchased could not be utilised as planned.

Audit comments on vetting of ATN

148 The ATN does not indicate the steps taken or proposed to be taken to obviate recurrence of such cases in future.

Reply: The chassis and instruments were procured for constructing mobile laboratories for Bangalore, Chandigarh and Pondicherry offices of CPCB. But due to constitution of Pollution Control Committees in UT's by the Central Government, the Central Board offices in these areas were wound up. This being a subsequent development after procurement of the chassis & instrument, which could not be foreseen earlier. However, the two chassis were used for mounting of the GTZ Automatic Air Quality Monitoring Systems and the third is transferred to ZO-Bangalore for construction of mobile laboratory for local survey & monitoring purpose. The instruments were used in the existing H.O. & Z.O.'s laboratories of CPCB.

Recommendation

The Committee are concerned to note that equipments and instruments worth Rs. 48.19 crores received from foreign countries under international collaborative projects were not reflected in the annual accounts of the Board. Further; no registers regarding assets worth more than rupees five crores were maintained. What has further disturbed the Committee is that even though the statutory auditors had pointed out as far back as November, 1991 that the procedure for physical verification of assets was not adequate, no action was taken by Central Pollution Control Board to streamline the system. This, in the opinion of the Committee, clearly shows laxity on the part of the officers responsible for maintenance of the books of accounts. The Ministry have sought to explain that the entire system of accounting in this regard is under review and expected to be revamped during the year. The Committee are not satisfied by this explanation. They desire that the reasons for non-maintenance of proper accounts should be enquired into and responsibility fixed for the lapses. They would also like to be informed of the action taken to streamline the accounting systems and procedure.

[Sl. No. 30 of Appendix IV, Para No. 149 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government.

Proper register and accounts of the equipment, received as gift under international collaborative project, are now maintained in the Laboratories. The stock register is verified from time to time by the officers, nominated by the Chairman and Member Secretary. The list of the equipment, received as gift under various collaborative projects at the Head Office Laboratory is enclosed. (Annexure-III), and this provides all necessary details as now received from donor agencies.

Audit comments on vetting of ATN

149 The ATN does not indicate the results of enquiry made, if any, into the reasons for non-maintenance of proper accounts of the equipments and instruments and the responsibility fixed for the lapses

Reply: The matter has been enquired into the observations of the enquiry are as under:

That record has been maintained by each laboratory of CPCB regarding the gifted equipment from time to time but at some places the cost of the gifted equipment is not recorded as the same was not provided to CPCB by the donor agency. However details of the equipment received is

available in the register. Some cross reconciliation of the items of gift equipment with the Zonal Offices of CPCB was in arrear.

Now all the information regarding cost, wherever, it was not previously available have been obtained from the donor agency & record updated. Reconciliation with the Zonal Offices have also been completed. There was no lapse on the part of staff because of negligence etc. as the record was incomplete with respect to some instruments for only cost details which were not earlier made available by the donor agency.

Recommendation

The Audit has pointed out several other irregularities in Central Pollution Control Board. Briefly they were, diversion by Central Pollution Control Board of the money granted by Ganga Project Directorate (GPD) for monitoring Ganga Water under Ganga Action Plan for other purposes; improper maintenance of records; incorrect procedure adopted in purchases resulting in avoidable outflow of foreign exchange (valuing Rs. 3.39 lakhs); irregular transfer and disposal of assets; failure to take action to get equipment repaired/replaced; additional expenditure incurred (Rs. 29.15 lakhs) in the execution of work on account of inadequate planning; slackness in supervision; non-enforcement of clauses in the contracts; missing of books in the library (costing Rs. 1.42 lakhs), etc. These cases have been described in detail elsewhere in the Report. The Committee deplore the laxity on the part of Central Pollution Control Board authorities which had resulted in the extra expenditure and occurrence of large scale irregularities. They recommend that the above mentioned cases should be thoroughly enquired into and responsibility fixed for the lapses. The Committee would like to be informed of the action taken in the matter.

[Sl. No. 31 of Appendix IV, Para No. 150 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

It is submitted that the maintenance of records for stock entries has now been Centralized. The equipment purchased, are first taken on the stock register and thereafter the same are issued to the indentors. Thus the Centralized maintenance of records will reveal the complete information of purchase and issue of equipments.

Diversion of Funds

It is submitted that as temporary measure and on a few occasions, funds were transferred from one bank account in which GPD funds were kept in Central Pollution Control Board's main account to meet the urgent Plan/ Non-Plan expenditure for short durations, where sanction for instalment of grant-in-aid was issued by the Ministry but the cheque had not been received. This had been necessitated purely as a temporary measure, and as soon as the funds were received, the amount was repatriated to GPD

A/c. The funds for GPD project not required immediately were kept in Fixed Deposits to earn interest and the interest amounting to Rs. 2,21,779/- so accrued were deposited in the GPD Account. After the observation of Audit, no funds have been transferred as a temporary measure. The funds for GPD project not required immediately have been kept in short term deposit with the bank. Hence, there is no loss of interest in this regard.

The lapses pointed out have occurred due to deficiencies in the existing systems. Steps have been initiated to correct and improve the system so that in future such lapses do not recur.

The procedure for physical verification, as suggested by Audit, has been improved upon by forming a Committee for annual verification by taking various officials from different sections and also instructions have been issued for adopting uniform method of valuation of closing stock by all offices of Central Pollution Control Board.

Other Issues

The import of scientific equipment of CIF basis has since been discontinued on receipt of instructions from the Ministry of Surface Transport. The import of scientific instruments is now being made on FOB basis. Thus, this will save foreign exchange on insurance and freight.

Improper maintenance of records

A Committee has been constituted, *vide* office order No. C—49012/01/90—Material/3110, dated 01 June 94, to examine obsolete, surplus and unserviceable items. The above Committee will consider all such items and will make its recommendations for disposal of these items. An inventory of the dead stock as per the guidelines laid down in GFR 112 will be maintained. All the Zonal Offices have also been requested to maintain dead stock register, *vide* Central Pollution Control Board circular No. C-49012/01/90—Materials/6849 dated 26 May, 1994. The reconciliation of stores is in progress.

Execution of works

The additional expenditure as pointed out by the Audit has already been got approved by the Ministry of Environment & Forests, *vide* their letter No. G—20011/3/88—CPW, dated 28.12.88. Hence, the additional expenditure has been regularised. Regarding excess expenditure of Rs. 29.15 lakh, it is submitted that the expenditure was essentially towards the escalation of the rates of material and labour which is payable to them as per the contract clauses. It is further submitted that there was no slackness on the part of Central Pollution Control Board in supervision and execution as regular fortnightly meetings were taken at site by the Building Committee in which Chairman and Member Secretary of Central Pollution Control Board are also members.

Recommendation

The Committee find that during the period 1985-92, a total budget allocation of only Rs. 1685.50 lakhs, was made of which Central Pollution Control Board spent Rs. 1667.60 lakhs. The Committee desire that considering the magnitude of the problem steps should be taken by Government to ensure that adequate funds are allocated for environmental protection. The Ministry should also ensure that the funds provided to Central Pollution Control Board are efficiently utilised by it for the prevention and control of pollution.

[Sl. No. 32 of Appendix IV, Para No. 151 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

The shortfall of expenditure amounting to Rs. 22.49 lakhs during the VII Plan period, *i.e.* 1985-92 was on construction of building complex for Central Pollution Control Board. The above noted amount could not be released to the contractors due to delay in certification of bills and acceptance of measurements by the contractors for the work already completed. Further, the excess expenditure of Rs. 4.59 lakhs during the period 1990-91 was for spill over project expenditure. The Ministry is periodically monitoring the expenditure to ensure that the funds provided to CPCB are efficiently utilised for prevention and control of pollution.

CHAPTER IV

RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS REPLIES TO WHICH HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE COMMITTEE AND WHICH REQUIRE REITERATION

Recommendation

The Committee consider it imperative that while developing standards for the quality of water and air and enforcing them on industrial units aid/technical advice is given to the industries/units particularly the small scale units in the installation of pollution control equipments. The Committee's attention in this connection had already been drawn to the complaints by such units that the State Boards were unable to provide the necessary help in the matter. The Committee, therefore desire that Government should look into the matter and take necessary steps in extending all possible help to the units in complying with pollution control measures.

[Sl. No. 16 of Appendix IV, Para No. 135 of 65th Report (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Industry-specific standards are developed based upon comprehensive study for the respective industries. The documents are then published and circulated to all pollution control authorities and are also available at Central Pollution Control Board at prescribed cost. These documents contain all the relevant information on pollution control options and process technologies, and are available for almost all major polluting industries, barring a few, where studies are on.

Ministry of Environment and Forests

Recommendation

Another aspect which engaged the attention of the Committee in the case of Agra was that the aggrieved units had pleaded before the Supreme Court that the State Pollution Control Boards did not possess the requisite competence and were not well-equipped to guide them in the installation of the necessary pollution control devices. The Committee regret to note that despite it being one of their functions, Central Pollution Control Board woefully failed in providing the requisite technical assistance to the State Boards and the Industrial Units. The Committee consider this as an extremely important aspect requiring urgent attention of the Government. They recommended that while enforcing the pollution control law the authorities concerned should also be in a position to provide sufficient technical advice to the industrial units about the details of the suitable cost effective equipments which the units could afford to instal. The Government should also formulate and implement an attractive package of

fiscal incentives and disincentives to encourage the polluting units to instal pollution control devices.

[Sl. No. 26 of Appendix IV, Para No. 145 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by the Government

Central Pollution Control Board has published a comprehensive document on pollution control status and options in glass industry, and based upon the comprehensive study by N.P.C. and Central Glass and Ceramic Research Institute, Central Pollution Control Board has evolved standards for glass industry.

- Several such comprehensive documents on almost all the highly polluting categories of industries were completed and standards were evolved by Central Pollution Control Board. Comprehensive documents for small scale units, particularly brick kilns, lime kilns, DG sets, small boilers etc., are under preparation.
- On several occasions, officials of Central Pollution Control Board visited industrial units in the trapezium to have an on-the-spot assessment of pollution status in these industries. The officials interacted with the units and suggested all options available and applicable to these units.
- Several training courses were organised by Central Pollution Control Board which provide opportunity to State Board officials and industry personnel to have an exposure to various pollution control technology options. Two workshops were held with the industrialists—one in Agra and the other in Firozabad to familiarize the industrialists with cost effective control technologies.
- It is respectfully clarified in respect of the recommendation that, while enforcing the pollution control law the authorities concerned should be in a position to provide sufficient technical advice to the industrial units about the details of suitable cost-effective equipment which the units could afford to instal, that while evolving pollution control standards, comprehensive documents were carefully studied and published for wide circulation to all State Board free of cost and to all other interested at prescribed cost.

Audit comments on vetting of ATN

145 The ATN does not indicate the fiscal incentive and disincentives designed to encourage the polluting units to instal pollution control devices.

Reply: The Government of India has a scheme for the following fiscal incentives. The same is also available to industries in Agra:—

- (i) Excise duty and customs duty exemption on pollution control equipment which have been notified.
- (ii) 100% depreciation allowance on pollution control equipment.
- (iii) Exemption from tax on capital gains to encourage industries to shift from congested areas to conforming industrial areas.
- (iv) The Water (Prevention and Control of Pollution) Cess Act, 1977 provides for a rebate in water for industries which conform to the stipulated standards on effluent quality and norms for water consumption.
- (v) The Environment (Protection) Act, 1986 provides for punishment with imprisonment for a term which may extend to five years with fine which may extend to one lakh rupees, or with both, and in case the failure or contravention continues, with additional fine which may extend to five thousand rupees for every day during which such failure or contravention continues after the conviction for the first such failure or contravention.

Recommendation

The Committee note that Central Pollution Control Board, as part of the functions assigned to them by the Water and Air Acts, brought out 30 publications (25230 copies) of the Comprehensive Industry Documents (COINDS) out of which 3234 copies were sold. 3867 copies were issued as complimentary and 18129 copies were lying in the stores. The Committee take a serious view of the fact that an expenditure of Rs. 18 lakhs was incurred for the publication of 25230 copies out of which only 7101 copies were issued with the remaining copies valuing Rs. 9.81 lakhs are lying unsold. Further the work of preparation of other COINDS entrusted to outside agencies which was to be completed during the Sixth Plan period, continued till Eighth Five Year Plan even after incurring an expenditure of Rs. 34.80 lakhs as consultancy fee. All these are indicative of the inadequate assessment of the requirement of publications and absence of control and monitoring on the part of the Central Pollution Control Board on the work assigned to outside agencies. In the latter case, the Ministry also failed to exercise control since the work was entrusted to the outside agency after their prior approval. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the matter should be enquired into and responsibility fixed for the lapses. The Ministry should also ensure that proper steps are taken by Central Pollution Control Board in dissemination of information.

[Sl. No. 28 of Appendix IV, Para No. 147 of 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken by The Government

A drive has been taken up to boost the sale of publications. Advertisements were inserted during June, 1993 in various newspapers, through DAVP to have nation-wide publicity. It has shown its results. During the year 1992-93, sale of Central Pollution Control Board publications was amounting to Rs. 74,000/- (Rupees seventy four thousand only), whereas it has been increased to Rs. 2,16,000/- during the financial year 1993-94. The sale has gone up by 200%. During the year 1994-95, a rise in sale of publications is expected. Out of thirty COINDS published, eight have become out of print, two were got reprinted (out of which one turned out to be out of print again). As such, nine publications are out of print under COINDS series since, demand of the publications from various users is received and met with from time to time. So far, thirty five documents have been printed under the COINDS series and eleven documents are under preparation. During 1993, thirty publications of COINDS were available for sale. Five more documents got prepared and printed. The work is in progress for rest of the documents. Print order has been restricted to a maximum of 300 copies (500 copies at a time, in exceptional cases). It is being strictly adhered to.

Audit comments on vetting of ATN

147 The ATN does not indicate the results of enquiry made, if any, into the lapses pointed out by the recommendations of the Committee.

Reply: An enquiry was held in the matter and the observations & recommendations of the enquiry are as under:

1. That special efforts be made to improve the distribution system of the publications, so that the information contained in the document could be disseminated to the user.
2. Wide publicity be given to these documents to create mass awareness.
3. More sales outlet needs to be opened.
4. More realistic estimates need to be made for the number of copies to be printed.

Necessary steps have been taken on the basis of above recommendations/observations. Now, while publishing any document, estimates are made in respect of prospective users, which includes the State Boards, Industrial Associations, Institutions, Consultants, R&D Associations, important libraries. For offset printing, there is a limitation on the minimum number of copies which is cost effective. To increase the volume of sale of publications, CPCB has since entered into

an understanding with Confederation of Indian Industries (CII), State Boards. Publications are also now sold through CPCB stalls in the exhibitions. To disseminate the information regarding publications, CPCB has also initiated a drive through advertisements in newspapers & magazines.

CHAPTER V

RECOMMENDATIONS / OBSERVATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH GOVERNMENT HAVE FURNISHED INTERIM REPLIES

— NIL —

NEW DELHI;
25 April, 1995

5 Vaisakha, 1917 (*Saka*)

BHAGWAN SHANKAR RAWAT,
Chairman,
Public Accounts Committee.

APPENDIX I
Recommendations / Observations

Sl. No.	Para No.	Concerned Ministry / Deptt.	Recommendations / Observations
1	2	3	4
1.	8	Environment & Forests	The Committee trust that concrete efforts will be made to persuade the remaining units also to fall in line with the others in complying with the standards and installing the requisite equipments so that the extreme punitive action like closure of units, having social and economic ramification are avoided. The Committee would also like to be informed of the latest position of enforcement of pollution control in the identified highly polluting industries.
2.	11	-do-	The Committee are not satisfied with the action taken reply. In their opinion, the responsibility of the Central Pollution Control Board in the matter of providing necessary aid/technical advice does not merely end with publication and circulation of printed literature. They wish to point out that in a case on the issue related to the Agra-Mathura region, the Supreme Court had observed that the State Board was not in a position to advise the industry as to which type of air pollution device was to be given. The Committee, therefore, arc of the view that the CPCB has to play a more effective role in providing suitable guidance to the State Boards in the matter. The Ministry in the action taken reply have also not elaborated adequately on the precise package of fiscal incentives and disincentives formulated by Government in pursuance of the recommendation of the Committee. The Committee, therefore, reiterate their earlier recommendation and would like to be informed of the action taken thereon.

1	2	3	4
3.	18	Environment and Forests	<p>The Committee note that subsequent to presentation of their report Government have taken various steps to adequately protect the historical monuments at Agra-Mathura region from further deterioration due to the damages caused by pollution. The Committee desire that the steps initiated should be pursued to the logical conclusions and trust that the Ministry of Environment & Forests would co-ordinate with other concerned Ministries/Departments and continuously follow-up the implementation of the various measures and for initiating further necessary action so as to effectively deal with the threat caused by pollution to the world famous historical monuments.</p>
4.	19	-do-	<p>The Committee further note that the Ministry of Environment & Forests have constituted a consultative group to prepare a draft policy paper and advise the Ministry on the approach to conservation of man made heritage from the environmental angle. The Committee would like to be informed of the progress made by the group in fulfilling the task assigned to them.</p>
5.	22	-do-	<p>The Committee hope that the steps taken to update the industrial inventory and of the sanitation status of Class I and Class II cities would be expeditiously completed within the targetted period for facilitating an overall scientific assessment of pollution status.</p> <p>"An enquiry was held in the matter and the observations & recommendations of the enquiry are as under:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. That special efforts be made to improve the distribution system of the publications, so that the information contained in the document could be disseminated to the user. 2. Wide publicity be given to these documents to create mass awareness.

1	2	3	4
---	---	---	---

3. More sales outlet needs to be opened.

4. More realistic estimates need to be made for the number of copies to be printed.

Necessary steps have been taken on the basis of above recommendations/observations. Now, while publishing any document, estimates are made in respect of prospective users, which includes the State Boards, Industrial Associations, Institutions, Consultants, R&D Associations, important libraries. For offset printing, there is a limitation on the minimum number of copies which is cost effective. To increase the volume of sale of publications, CPCB has since entered into an understanding with Confederation of Indian Industries (CII), State Boards. Publications are also now sold through CPCB stalls in the exhibitions. To disseminate the information regarding publications, CPCB has also initiated a drive through advertisements in newspapers & magazines."

6. 25 Environment The Committee regret to point out that the
and Forests action taken reply is completely silent about
the fixation of responsibility for the lapses in
undertaking proper assessment of the
requirement of publications and in exercising
control and monitoring on the part of CPCB
which resulted in sizeable number of
publications worth Rs. 9.81 lakhs lying unsold
and the inordinate delay in getting documents
prepared through outside agencies involving
payment of consultation fees of Rs. 34.80 lakhs.
They, therefore, reiterate their earlier
recommendation and would like to be apprised
of the concrete action taken in the matter.

7. 28 -do- The Committee would like to be apprised of
the precise progress made in bringing forth
the proposed comprehensive legislation on
pollution control.
-

PART-II

MINUTES OF THE TWENTY-SEVENTH SITTING OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (1994-95) HELD ON 25 APRIL, 1995

The Committee sat from 1500 hrs. to 1540 hrs. on 25 April, 1995 in Room No. 53, Parliament House, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Shri Bhagwan Shankar Rawat — *Chairman*

MEMBERS

Lok Sabha

2. Shri Bandaru Dattatraya
3. Shri Dileep Singh Bhuria
4. Sqn. Ldr. Kamal Chaudhry
5. Shri Jagat Veer Singh Drona
6. Shrimati Krishnendra Kaur (Deepa)
7. Shrimati Geeta Mukherjee

Rajya Sabha

8. Shri Triloki Nath Chaturvedi

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

- | | | |
|-------------------------------|---|------------------------|
| 1. Shri G.C. Malhotra | — | <i>Joint Secretary</i> |
| 2. Smt. Paramjeet Kaur Sandhu | — | <i>Director</i> |
| 3. Shri P. Sreedharan | — | <i>Under Secretary</i> |

REPRESENTATIVES OF AUDIT

- | | | |
|-----------------------------|---|--|
| 1. Shri B. M. Oza | — | <i>Dir. General of Audit
(Central Revenue)</i> |
| 2. Shrimati Pravin Tripathi | — | <i>Pr. Director (Railways)</i> |
| 3. Dr. A. K. Banerjee | — | <i>Pr. Director (Direct Taxes)</i> |
| 4. Shri Vikram Chandra | — | <i>Pr. Director (RC)</i> |
| 5. Shri K. S. Menon | — | <i>Pr. Director (Scientific
Department)</i> |

2. The Committee considered the following draft reports and adopted the same without any modification/amendment:

- | | | | | |
|------|------|-----|-----|-----|
| (i) | **** | *** | *** | *** |
| (ii) | **** | *** | *** | *** |

(iii) Central Pollution Control Board—Audit review [Action Taken on 65th Report of PAC (10th Lok Sabha)]

(iv) *** *** *** ***

3. The Committee authorised the Chairman to finalise these draft reports in the light of the comments of audit arising out of factual verification and also to present the same to the House.

**** *** **** ****

The Committee then adjourned.

LIST OF AUTHORISED AGENTS FOR THE SALE OF LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT PUBLICATION

Sl. No.	Name of Agent	Sl. No.	Name of Agent
ANDHRA PRADESH		UTTAR PRADESH	
1.	M/s. Vijay Book Agency, 11-1-477, Mylargadda, Secunderabad-500 306.	12.	Law Publishers, Sardar Patel Marg, P.B. No. 77, Allahabad, U.P.
BIHAR		WEST BENGAL	
2.	M/s. Crown Book Depot, Upper Bazar, Ranchi (Bihar).	13.	M/s. Madimala, Buys & Sells, 123, Bow Bazar Street, Calcutta-1.
GUJARAT		DELHI	
3.	The New Order Book Company, Ellis Bridge, Ahmedabad-380 006. (T.No. 79065)	14.	M/s. Jain Book Agency, C-9, Connaught Place, New Delhi, (T.No. 351663 & 350806)
MADHYA PRADESH		15.	M/s. J.M. Jaina & Brothers, P. Box 1020, Mori Gate, Delhi-110006. (T.No. 2915064 & 230936)
4.	Modern Book House, Shiv Vilas Place, Indore City. (T.No. 35289)	16.	M/s. Oxford Book & Stationery Co., Scindia House, Connaught Place, New Delhi-110 001. (T.No. 3315308 & 45896)
MAHARASHTRA		17.	M/s. Bookwell, 2/72, Sant Nirankari Colony, Kingsway Camp, Delhi-110 009. (T.No. 7112309).
5.	M/s. Sunderdas Gian Chand, 601, Girgaum Road, Near Princes Street, Bombay-400 002.	18.	M/s. Rajendra Book Agency, IV-DR59, Lajpat Nagar, Old Double Storey, New Delhi-110 024. (T.No. 6412362 & 6412131).
6.	The International Book Service, Deccan Gymkhana, Poona-4.	19.	M/s. Ashok Book Agency, BH-82, Poorvi Shalimar Bagh, Delhi-110 033.
7.	The Current Book House, Maruti Lane, Raghunath Dadaji Street, Bombay-400 001.	20.	M/s. Venus Enterprises, B-2/85, Phase-II, Ashok Vihar. Delhi.
8.	M/s. Usha Book Depot, Law Book Seller and Publishers' Agents Govt. Publications, 585, Chitra Bazar, Khan House, Bombay-400 002.	21.	M/s. Central News Agency Pvt. Ltd., 23/90, Connaught Circus, New Delhi-110 001. (T.No. 344448, 322705, 344478 & 344508).
9.	M & J Services, Publishers, Representative Accounts & Law Book Sellers, Mohan Kunj, Ground Floor, 68, Jyotiba Fule Road Nalgaum, Dadar, Bombay-400 014.	22.	M/s. Amrit Book Co., N-21, Connaught Circus, New Delhi.
10.	Subscribers Subscription Service India, 21, Raghunath Dadaji Street, 2nd Floor, Bombay-400 001.	23.	M/s. Books India Corporation Publishers, Importers & Exporters, L-27, Shastri Nagar, Delhi-110 052. (T.No. 269631 & 714465).
TAMIL NADU		24.	M/s. Sangam Book Depot, 4378/4B, Murari Lal Street, Ansari Road, Darya Ganj, New Delhi-110 002.
11.	M/s. M.M. Subscription Agencies, 14th Murali Street, (1st Floor), Mahalingapuram, Nungambakkam, Madras-600 034. (T. No. 476558)		

