

PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (1968-69)

FORTY-FOURTH REPORT

(FOURTH LOK SABHA)

**[Action taken by Government on the recommendations
of the Public Accounts Committee contained
in their 18th Report (Fourth Lok Sabha)
on Audit Report (Civil) 1967 relating to the
Ministry of Transport & Shipping
(Border Roads Organisation)]**



LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

NEW DELHI

March, 1969/Phalguna, 1890 Saka

Price Rs. 0.55

336.3951A
K8

LIST OF AUTHORISED AGENTS FOR THE SALE OF LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT PUBLICATIONS

Sl. No.	Name of Agent	Agency No.	Sl. No.	Name of Agent	Agency No.
ANDHRA PRADESH			12.	Charles Lambert & Company, 101, Mahatma Gandhi Road, Opposite Clock Tower, Fort, Bombay.	30
1.	Andhra University General Cooperative Stores Ltd., Waltair (Visakhapatnam)	8	13.	The Current Book House, Maruti Lane, Raghunath Dadaji Street, Bombay-1.	60
2.	G.R. Lakshmipathy Chetty and Sons, General Merchants and News Agents, Newpet, Chandragiri, Chittoor District.	94	14.	Deccan Book Stall, Ferguson College Road, Poona-4.	65
ASSAM			15.	M/s. Usha Book Depot, 585/A, Chira Bazar, Khan House, Girgaum Road, Bombay-2 BR.	5
3.	Western Book Depot, Pan Bazar, Gauhati.	7	MYSORE		
BIHAR			16.	M/s. Peoples Book House Opp. Jaganmohan Palace, Mysore-1.	16
4.	Amar Kitab Ghar, Post Box 78, Diagonal Road, Jamshedpur.	37	RAJASTHAN		
GUJARAT			17.	Information Centre, Government of Rajasthan, Tripolia, Jaipur City.	38
5.	Vijay Stores, Station Road, Anand.	35	UTTAR PRADESH		
6.	The New Order Book Company Ellis Bridge, Ahmedabad-6.	63	18.	Swastik Industrial Works, 59, Holi Street, Meerut City.	2
HARYANA			19.	Law Book Company, Sardar Patel Marg,, Allahabad-1.	48
7.	M/s. Prabhu Book Service, Nai Subzimandi, Gurgaon. (Haryana).	14	WEST BENGAL		
MADHYA PRADESH			20.	Granthaloka, 5/1, Ambica Mookherjee Road, Belgharia, 24 Parganas.	10
8.	Modern Book House, Shiv Vilas Palace, Indore City.	13	21.	W. Newman & Company Ltd., 3, Old Court House Street, Calcutta.	44
MAHARASHTRA			22.	Firma K.L. Mukhopadhyay, 6/1A, Banchharam Akkur Lane, Calcutta-12	82
9.	M/s. Sunderdas Gianchand, 601, Girgaum Road, Near Princess Street, Bombay-2	6	23.	M/s. Mukherji Book House, 8B, Duff Lane, Calcutta-6.	4
10.	The International Book House (Private) Limited, 9, Ash Lane, Mahatma Gandhi Road, Bombay-1.	22			
11.	The International Book Service, Deccan Gymkhana, Poona-4.	26			

CORRIGENDA TO THE FORTY FOURTH REPORT OF
P.A.C. (1968-69) PRESENTED TO LOK SABHA
ON 25-3-1969.

Page	Para	Line	For	Read
(iii)	-	S.No. 20	Shri G.H.V. Momin	Shri G.H.V. Momin*
	-	S.No. 21	Shri N.R.M. Swamy*	Shri N.R.M. Swamy
(v)	1 6	2 6.	Forty Four (Border Road Organi- sation)	Forty Fourth (Border Roads Organisation)
2	-	3-5	These statis- tics quired by Govt Departments without critical- ly are symptoma- tic of the manner in which medici- nes are ac-	The statistics are symptomatic of the manner in which machines are acquired by Govt Deptts without critically
		9	high powered committee	High Powered Committee
3		17	high powered committee	High Powered Committee
5	1.8	4	Delete the word "annual" appearing before the word "utilisat- ion".	
6	1.13	9	Border Road Organisation	Border Roads Organisation
	1.14	2	delete the word 'that'	
31	1.14	1	delete the word 'that' and insert , ' after the word 'organisation'.	

CONTENTS

	PAGE
COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (1968-69)	(iii)
INTRODUCTION	(v)
CHAPTER I—Report	1
CHAPTER II—Recommendations/Observations that have been accepted by Government	8
CHAPTER III—Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies of Government	22
APPENDICES :	
I. Utilisation of Minor Machines	24
II. Utilisation of Machines with Hour Meters	25
III. Utilisation of Machines with Hour Meters	26
IV. Utilisation of Machines without Hour Meters	27
V. Summary of Main Conclusions/Recommendations	29

PA
 (L
 On
 Acc
 Date

30.9.69
 1-4-69

3363951R
 KS

PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE

(1968-69)

CHAIRMAN

Shri M. R. Masani.

MEMBERS

2. Shri Syed Ahmed Aga
3. Shri K. Anirudhan
4. Shri S. M. Banerjee
5. Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya
6. Shri K. G. Deshmukh
7. Shri V. Krishnamoorthi
8. Shri D. K. Kunte
9. Shri N. R. Laskar
10. Shri K. K. Nayar
11. Shrimati Sushila Rohatgi
12. Shri Narendra Kumar Salve
13. Shri Ram Awtar Sharma
14. Shrimati Tarkeshwari Sinha
15. Shri Tayappa Hari Sonavane
16. Shri A. P. Chatterjee
17. Shri K. Damodaran
18. Shri Shanti Kothari
19. Shri S. S. Mariswamy
20. Shri G. H. V. Momin
21. Shri N. R. M. Swamy*.
22. Shri Tarkeshwar Pandey

SECRETARIAT

Shri Avtar Singh Rikhy—*Joint Secretary.*

Shri K. Seshadri—*Under Secretary.*

*Declared elected on 19th August, 1968 vice Shri M. M. Dharla who resigned from the Committee.

INTRODUCTION

1, the Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee, as authorised by the Committee, do present on their behalf this Forty-four Report on the action taken by Government on the recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee contained in their 18th Report (Fourth Lok Sabha) on Audit Report (Civil) 1967 relating to the Ministry of Transport & shipping (Border Road Organisation).

2. On 12th June, 1968, an "Action Taken" Sub-Committee was appointed to scrutinise the replies received from Government in pursuance of the recommendations made by the Committee in their earlier Reports. The Sub-Committee was constituted with the following Members:

1. Shri D. K. Kute—*Convener*.
2. Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya
3. Shri K. K. Nayar
4. Shri Narendra Kumar Salve
5. Shrimati Tarkeshwari Sinha
6. Shri N. R. M. Swamy

3. The draft Report was considered and adopted by the Sub-Committee at their sitting held on 7th February, 1969 and finally adopted by the Public Accounts Committee on 3rd. March 1969.

4. For facility of reference the main conclusions|recommendations of the Committee have been printed in thick type in the body of the Report. A statement showing the summary of the main recommendations|observations of the Committee is appended to the Report (Appendix V).

5. The Committee place on record their appreciation of the assistance rendered to them in this matter by the Comptroller and Auditor General of India.

NEW DELHI:
March 11, 1969
Phalguna 20, 1890 (Saka)

M. R. MASANI,
Chairman,
Public Accounts Committee.

CHAPTER I

REPORT

This Report of the Committee deals with Action Taken by Government on the recommendations contained in their 18th Report (Fourth Lok Sabha) on Audit Report (Civil) 1967 relating to the Ministry of Transport and Shipping (Border Roads Organisation), which was presented to the House on 21st February, 1968.

1.2. The Action taken notes/statements on the recommendations of the Committee contained in this Report have been categorised under the following heads:—

- (i) *Recommendations/observations that have been accepted by Government:*

Sl. Nos. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 7, 8 and 9.

- (ii) *Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies of Government.*

S. No. 6

1.3. The Committee will now deal with action taken on some of the recommendations.

Non-utilisation of Construction plant and machinery-Paragraphs 1.66 and 1.67 (S. No. 4 of Appendix II) of 18th Report (Fourth Lok Sabha).

1.4. On 31st May, 1966, the Border Roads Organisation had 596 earth-moving machines (e.g. excavators, tractors), 958 construction plants (e.g. concrete mixers, road rollers), 903 drilling equipment (e.g. rock drills, air-compressors) and 265 other tools and plants (e.g. pumping sets, refrigerators). The book value of 2,722 machines, most of which were procured from the trade, totalled Rs. 14.18 crores. These figures exclude equipment under overhaul/repairs in Base Workshops (as also certain other equipment e.g. given on loan).

1.5. In paragraphs 1.66 and 1.67 of their 18th Report (Fourth Lok Sabha), the Committee had commented upon non-utilisation and under-utilisation of some of the construction plant and machinery. In this connection they had made the following observations:—

“1.66. The Committee are constrained to observe that as many as 289 machines valued at Rs. 70 lakhs had not been utilised ever since their purchase/receipt from workshops after over-

haul and that two-thirds of 1,037 earth moving and construction machines valued at Rs. 4.5 crores were utilised for less than the optimum hours fixed for them. These statistics quired by Government Departments without critically are symptomatic of the manner in which machines are ac- examining whether it is essential to purchase them and whether these will be put to optimum use. The Committee note that Government have taken some action now to constitute a high-powered committee consisting of the Secretary, Ministry of Defence, the Chief of the Army Staff and the Director-General of Border Roads to go into the matter. They hope that this high-powered Committee will critically review the existing inventory of machinery available with the Border Roads Organisation and lay down guide-lines to ensure optimum utilisation of the existing machinery and to avoid purchases of excess machinery in future."

"1.67. The Committee feel that Government should arrange for a thorough expert investigation of the problems of inventory control and materials management in the Defence Services with a view to effect economy."

1.6. In their reply dated 29-10-1968, the Ministry of Transport and Shipping (Border Roads Development Board) had explained the position in regard to utilisation of these machinery as under:

Para 1.66.

"As already explained to the Committee at their sitting held on the 5th August, 1967 the available data do not lead to the conclusion that all the 289 machines were not utilised at all ever since their purchase. Para 1.55 of the Eighteenth Report of the Public Accounts Committee (Fourth Lok Sabha) refers. Out of these 289 machines, 219 Nos. were not fitted with hour/milo-meters. In some of the census returns submitted by units, the relevent column was not filled. The position regarding the utilisation of the 219 machines not fitted with hour/milo-meters and the remaining 70 machines fitted with hour/ milo-meters, as could be gathered from readily available data is as under:—

219 machines not fitted with hour/milo-meters:

Definite information regarding utilisation is available in respect of 49 out of these 219 machines and the extent of their utilisation is shown in *Appendix I*. In respect of the remaining 170 machines in this category information is being collected and the same is expected to be available by November, 1968. The same will be furnished on receipt.

70 Machines fitted with hour/milo-metres:

Out of these 70 machines definite information regarding utilisation of 14 machines is readily available and the extent of their utilisation is as shown in *Appendix II*. 10 machines have been issued on loan to State PWDs since 8th March, 1965 for which hire charges are being recovered. In respect of the remaining 46 machines under this category information is being collected and the same is expected to be available by November, 1968. The available information will be furnished on receipt.

2. The high powered Committee consisting of Secretary, Ministry of Defence and Chief of Army Staff which was assisted by the Director General Border Roads Secretary, Border Roads Development Board and Additional Financial Adviser considered the question of streamlining the procedure for improving the efficiency and effectiveness of the Organisation and various proposals made by Director General, Border Roads in this connection.

3. On the recommendations of the above high powered Committee it has been decided to entrust to the Director of Scientific Evaluation, Ministry of Defence, a works study of output/efficiency of plant and machinery. On receipt of the recommendations of the Director of Scientific Evaluation, Ministry of Defence, the above Committee would decide what further measures should be taken to ensure maximum/optimum utilisation of plant, machinery and equipment etc. in the Border Roads Organisation.

4. In order to exercise greater and more effective control, Director General, Border Roads has now reviewed the form and content of the census return and replaced it by a 'Utilisation Return'.

5. In the past, indents for purchase of equipment had been initiated by Director General, Border Roads keeping in view the programme and priorities of projects entrusted to General Reserve Engineer Force, the terrain in which work would be carried out. As construction of motorable roads in the Himalayas at the required speed had not been undertaken in the past, the assessment both of number and nature of equipment purchased in the initial period had to be made largely on the basis of best available technical advice and experience in other countries. As experience was gained, the utility and actual capacity of equipment used had been taken into account before deciding on further investment in machinery and equipment. In all these cases, there had been detailed discussions on each case in consultation with Finance Ministry. The observations of the Public Accounts Committee will however be kept prominently in view while considering proposals for further purchase of equipment for Border Roads Organisation."

Para 1.67

"As indicated to the Committee, the question regarding entrusting a works study of the output/efficiency of units, plant and machinery deployed in the Border Roads Organisation to a specialist agency, had been under the active consideration of the Government for some-time past. Director General, Border Roads had proposed that this study should be entrusted to the National Productivity Council. The Council initially showed interest in the project. However after further examination they felt that keeping in view their resources and other commitments, they would not be in a position to undertake a work of such magnitude. It has therefore been decided to entrust the proposed works study to the Director of Scientific Evaluation of Ministry of Defence. The work has commenced on 11th June, 1968 and the final report is expected in March, 1969. The high powered committee consisting of the Secretary, Ministry of Defence and Chief of the Army Staff will go into the report of the Director of Scientific Evaluation and will advise the Government on further measures which should be taken to ensure optimum utilisation of the machinery resources of the Organisation."

1.7. In a further reply dated 24th December, 1968, the Border Roads Development Board have stated:—

"As a result of further check up on the ground the following position has emerged—

- (i) Total number of machines reported in the Audit Report as not having been utilised

at all	311
--------	-----

Less utilised	21
---------------	----

Balance	290
---------	-----

- (ii) 290 Nos. of machines can be broken up as under:—

(a) Machines with hour/milo meters.	71 (this is one more than previously reported to PAC)
-------------------------------------	---

(b) Machines not fitted with hours/milo meters.	219
---	-----

	290
--	-----

- (iii) Out of 71 Nos. *vide* clause (ii) (a) above information in respect of 24 machines have been furnished already. The infor-

mation in respect of 39 machines is enclosed in Appendix III 19 Nos. of them (39) had not been utilised at all. Details in respect of balance (No. 8) are awaited.

- (iv) Out of 219 machines *vide* clause (ii) (b) above particulars in respect of 49 machines have already been furnished to the Committee.

Information is awaited in respect of 54 machines. 4 machines which came with army units taken on loan have gone back to army on reversion of the units. Information in respect of the balance (112 Nos.) is given in Appendix IV."

1.8. The Committee note from the information furnished by Government, that 70 out of 289 items* of machinery with the Border Roads Organisation have not been utilised at all. In respect of the machinery used, the annual utilisation of as many as 102 items was less than 1,000 hours as compared to the annual usage rate of 1,200/1,500 hours fixed by the organisation and 2,500 hours laid down by the Central Water and Power Commission. It is obvious that there is a heavy accumulation of inventories with the organisation and that purchase of machinery and equipment has not been planned on the basis of actual requirements of projects in hand. Since the cost of the machinery and equipment gets debited to the projects on the basis of a usage rate, which has not been realised in practice, it is also evident that the under-utilisation| non-utilisation of machinery has resulted in needlessly inflating the cost of projects undertaken by the organisation.

1.9. The Committee cannot resist the impression that the organisation has been resorting to fresh purchase of machinery to overcome difficulties caused by a substantial proportion of their existing machinery remaining under repairs for a long time.

1.10. In this connection, the Committee would like to draw Government's attention to the observation made in para 2.11 of Forty-Second Report (Fourth Lok Sabha) pointing out that the percentage of earth moving and construction machines under repairs was 23 per cent against the Department's normal allowance of 10 per cent and that one third of such machines and equipment have been held up for repairs in workshops for periods ranging from one to three years.

1.11. The Committee have further pointed out in that Report that 263 indents for spares valued at Rs. 1,603 lakhs are pending with various authorities like Director General of Supplies and Disposals, Director General, Ordnance Factories etc. for one to three years.

*The figure has since been revised as 290.

1.12. It is evident that if the Border Roads Organisation are able to expedite repairs to the machinery and equipment, it should be possible to put back into service a substantial number of earth moving and construction machines and thus obviate to that extent the purchase of new machinery and equipment.

1.13. The Committee understand that major repairs to machinery| equipment are at present being carried out in two base workshops located at Pathankot and Tejpur. Considering the fact that the equipment and machinery in the Border Road Organisation are deployed in areas, most of which are inaccessible, the Committee would like Government to consider whether the location of the base workshops need to be shifted. In any case it would appear to be necessary to organise field parties to visit work sites to carry out repair jobs which can be done on the spot. This would obviate the need for moving machinery and equipment over long distances and also help to get the repairs speedily done.

1.14. In view of the heavy inventories with Border Roads Organisation that the Committee would go to the extent of suggesting fresh purchases of machinery and equipment for road construction should be made only after it has been verified that it is not possible to meet the demand from the existing stock of surplus or under-utilised machinery with the Border Roads Organisation. The Committee also suggest that in respect of Machinery and equipment which are neither in use nor likely to be gainfully employed in future in the Border Roads Organisation, Government should consider whether these should be transferred, in the overall interests of economy to the Union or State agencies engaged in road construction or Government projects, public undertakings etc. requiring them.

1.15. The Committee hope that the Director of Scientific Evaluation of the Ministry of Defence would not only suggest in his study ways and means of securing optimum use of machinery and equipment but also suggest measures to eliminate avoidable purchases of excess machinery and equipment in future.

1.16. The Committee note from the report of the High-powered Committee which has been furnished to them that the General Reserve Engineer Force at present remains under-used during the slack season (monsoon period in the Eastern region and winter in the Western Region). The Committee note that ways and means of maximising their use by taking up any projects of construction of technical and domestic accommodation are under study. The Committee have been informed in a note furnished by the Border Roads Development Board that no final decision has yet been taken by Government and that the matter is under examination in consultation with Army Headquarters and Defence Ministry.

1.17. The Committee are distressed to note that the General Reserve Engineer Force remains underutilised during slack season. From the Report of the High-powered Committee, it is observed that the question of utilising this slack capacity has been under consideration since October, 1966. It is unfortunate that Government have still not been able to reach a final decision, though over two years have elapsed. The Committee hope that the matter will be finalised without further delay.

CHAPTER II

RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS THAT HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY GOVERNMENT

Recommendation

The Committee are surprised to find that these two roads, the construction of which was taken up on a priority basis in May, 1964, were given second priority in December, 1964, and a decision to abandon their construction was taken in March, 1965. It appears that the General Staff did not examine the necessity of the two roads in all its aspects before requesting the Border Roads Organisation to take up their construction. They did not also subsequently assess the requirements with reference to a change in the operational needs, if any and inform the Border Roads Organisation in time not to incur any further expenditure on these roads. This has resulted in an expenditure of Rs. 19.63 lakhs without serving any operational or economic purpose.

[Sl. No. 1 of Appendix II Para No. 1.13 of PAC's Eighteenth Report (Fourth Lok Sabha) 1967-68.]

ACTION TAKEN

The construction of roads/tracks in the Himalayan region with a view to sustain the forces defending the borders is an essential requirement of the General Staff. This requirement varies from time to time depending on the plans and strategy of the General Staff. In certain areas, these tracks are constructed by army sapper units as operational works under arrangement of the army.

2. The army authorities needed the two roads in question shortly after the Chinese aggression from the point of view of security and defence of Ladakh. Instead of inducting army sapper units in Leh area the General Staff felt that the already available resources of the General Reserve Engineer Force could be used. Accordingly the Board approved the inclusion of these roads initially for survey and later for construction.

3. The strategy of General Staff is reviewed from time to time. This depends on many imponderable and unforeseeable factors. As a result of review, conducted in December 1964, these two roads were downgraded to lower priority by General Staff. By the time it was decided that these roads need not be developed further, certain works had already been actually carried out.

4. While such revision of plans may become unavoidable the Government considered in consultation with COAS as to how these cases could be avoided as far as possible. It was agreed that while putting forward proposals for construction of roads General Staff should invariably look 2 to 3 years ahead i.e. the period required for construction of a road.

5. Ministry of Finance (Defence/Border Roads) and Director of Audit (Defence Services) have seen.

[Ministry of Transport and Shipping Border Road Development Board
U.O. No. F1 (10) |BRDB|67-68|PAC dated 17-10-1968]

Recommendation

"The Committee suggest that the Jammu and Kashmir Government may again be approached to take over the two roads before their condition deteriorates due to non-use."

[Sl. No. 1 of Appendix II para 1.14 of PAC's Eighteenth Report (Fourth Lok Sabha) 1967-68.]

ACTION TAKEN

Jammu and Kashmir Government were again approached on 15th September, 1967, for taking over the two roads in the summer of 1968. The State Government intimated in May, 1968 that "since the roads in question do not connect any important villages, taking over and maintaining them without any benefit to the public, would be meaningless". Therefore the State Government are not interested in taking over these roads, at present. They have further stated that they "do not like to construct the road Leh to Digarla (Ganglas-Digarla) as their purpose of linking Nubra is served by the construction of a road via Khardungla, and even if it is desired to be constructed, it will be taken only after 1971-72" by which date the construction of all roads taken in hand is expected to be completed.

2. Ministry of Finance (Def/BR) and Director of Audit (Defence Services) have seen.

[Ministry of Transport and Shipping Border Road Development Board U.O. No. F.1 (10) /BRDB/67-68/PAC, dated 10th September, 1968.]

Recommendation

"The Committee are distressed to note that an infructuous expenditure of Rs. 7.60 lakhs was incurred on account of changes that had to be made in the alignment of roads after commencement of their construction. They feel that with proper planning and co-ordination between the State P.W.D., the Railways and the Border Roads Organisation, this infructuous expenditure could have been avoided".

"The Committee note that the Border Roads Organisation is completely dependant on the data furnished by the State P.W.D. and do not make their own assessment. The result of this is that the work of construction which was stated on the alignment prepared by the State P.W.D. had to be changed later on in these two cases. It is evident that the present procedure requires improvement. The Committee feel that in order to avoid such a situation, it will be appropriate if the Chief Engineers of the Directorate General Border Roads, make an independent general survey of the area before according technical sanction."

[Sl. No. 2 of Appendix II Para 1.27 and 1.28 of PAC's Eighteenth Report (Fourth Lok Sabha) 1967-68.]

ACTION TAKEN

The recommendations of the Committee in Para 1.27 have been noted. In order to exercise greater technical scrutiny of proposals involving construction and development of roads entrusted to P.W.D. without in any way blurring the respective responsibilities of Chief Engineer P.W.D. and D.G.B.R., Director General Border Roads has laid down that P.W.D. should, in future, submit reco report bringing out technical suitability of the proposed alignment. In the case of roads undertaken for improvement, this report should bring out the difficulties experienced in the maintenance of the existing alignment by way of floods, slips and other phenomena inherent in the existing alignment so that *ab initio* consideration to the feasibility of existing alignment could be given before the proposals estimates for their improvement/realignment are progressed. In certain cases, Director General Border Roads is detailing a Senior Officer to examine the problem in consultation with Officers of the State P.W.D. before finalising his recommendations to the Government.

2. Ministry of Finance (Del BR) and Director of Audit (Defence Services) have seen.

[Ministry of Transport and Shipping Border Road Development Board U.O. No. F. 1(10)/BRDB/67-68/PAC dated 10.9.68.]

Recommendation

"They also trust that, as assured by the representative of the Ministry of Defence, the Border Roads Programme will be fully co-ordinated with similar programmes of the State Governments and the Railways so that they profit from one another's technical data and experience. Such co-ordination would make not only for economy but also ensure

better topographical management to obviate problems of soil erosion at a later date".

[Sl. No. 2 of Appendix II Para 1.29 of PAC's Eighteenth Report (Fourth Lok Sabha) 1967-68.]

ACTION TAKEN

In pursuance of the recommendation of the Committee suitable instructions have been issued on 13th June, 1968 by the Directorate General Border Roads to Chief Engineers of GREF and PWDs. (A copy of the same is enclosed.) *

2. Ministry of Finance (Def/BR) and Director of Audit (Defence Services) have seen.

[Ministry of Transport and Shipping Border Road Development Board U.O. No. F. 1(10)/BRDB/67-68/PAC, dated 10th September, 1968.]

Recommendation

"The Committee regret to note that an infructuous expenditure of Rs. 31 lakhs was incurred due to the disbandment of units or the delay in raising or despatching of units to the work site. It is all the more regrettable that an expenditure of Rs. 8 lakhs (out of these Rs. 34 lakhs) was incurred on 15 units which were disbanded at the base itself. According to the Ministry's own note, "with better planning and control on the part of Directorate, the retention of these personnel could have been considerably avoided".

[Sl. No. 2 of Appendix II Para 1.29 of PAC's Eighteenth Report (Fourth Lok Sabha) 1967-68.]

"The Committee are sorry to note that due to a lapse on the part of the office of the Director of Personnel (D.G.B.R.) in not scrutinising properly the monthly statements furnished by the General Reserve Engineer Force Centres, proper administrative control was not kept on the raising, despatch and retention of units. They trust that in future administrative control in the office of the Director of Personnel will be tightened so that delay in the raising and despatch of units is strictly avoided".

[Sl. No. 3 of Appendix II Para 1.46 of PAC's Eighteenth Report (Fourth Lok Sabha) 1967-68.]

ACTION TAKEN

As already indicated to the Committee *vide* para 1.37 of the Report, a working rule has been adopted that the period of stay of any unit in the General Reserve Engineer Force Centre will not exceed two months. If it is likely to exceed two months, Director General Border Roads will be informed, who will satisfy himself of the reasons for delay. If the raising of a unit cannot be completed within four months, Director General Border Roads will report the matter to the Government.

2. In implementation of the above recommendations of the Committee, Director General Border Roads has issued in 4/68 comprehensive written instructions prescribing a drill to be followed by the officers in his Headquarters to watch the progress of raising units and ensure their despatch at the earliest.

3. Since 1966, there has been no case of delay in raising or despatch of units. It is hoped that with the measures adopted, such cases will not ordinarily recur.

4. Ministry of Finance (Def|BR) and Director of Audit (Defence Services) have seen.

Ministry of Transport and Shipping (Border Road Development Board)
U.O. No. F. 1 (10) |BRDB|67-68|PAC dated 10-9-68.]

Recommendation

"Another disquieting aspect of this case is that the delay in raising and despatch of units to project sites came to the notice of the Department only when it was pointed out by Audit in Audit Report (Civil), 1966. The Committee feel that this should have come to the notice of officers of the Department themselves before it was pointed out by Audit if they had kept proper administrative control. The Committee also hope that with the measures adopted by the Border Roads Organisation, the requirements of the units will be assessed realistically and there will not be any delay in the raising or despatching of units to the work site in future."

[Sl No. 3 of Appendix II Para 1.47 of PAC's Eighteenth Report (Fourth Lok Sabha) 1967-68.]

ACTION TAKEN

In accordance with the existing procedure, Director General, Border Roads is required to assess and forward to Government each year his requirement of units with reference to the planned construction pro-

gramme of the year. These are examined and accepted by Government. This represents the ceiling. The raising of new units and the timing are left to Director General, Border Roads. This flexibility is given to ensure that units are raised only when they are required with reference to the construction season which varies from sector to sector. The observations of the Committee are being kept in view while assessing annually the requirement of units.

2. Ministry of Finance (Def/BR) and Director of Audit (Defence Services) have seen.

[Ministry of Transport and Shipping (Border Road Development Board)
U.O. No. F. 1(10)/BRDB/67-68/PAC dated 10-9-68].

Recommendation

"The Committee are constrained to observe that as many as 289 machines valued at Rs. 70 lakhs had not been utilised ever since their purchase/receipt from workshops after overhaul and that two-thirds of 1,037 earth moving and construction machines valued at Rs. 4.5 crores were utilised for less than the optimum hours fixed for them. These statistics are symptomatic of the manner in which machines are acquired by Government departments without critically examining whether it is essential to purchase them and whether these will be put to optimum use. The Committee note that Government have taken some action now to constitute a high powered Committee consisting of the Secretary, Ministry of Defence, the Chief of the Army Staff and the Director General Border Roads to go into the matter. They hope that this high powered Committee will critically review the existing inventory of machinery available with the Border Roads Organisation and lay down guide-lines to ensure optimum utilisation of the existing machinery and to avoid purchases of excess machinery in future."

[Sl. No. 4 of Appendix II (Para No. 1.66) of PAC's Eighteenth Report (Fourth Lok Sabha) 1967-68.]

ACTION TAKEN

As already explained to the Committee at their sitting held on the 5th August 1967 the available data do not lead to the conclusion that all the 289 machines were not utilised at all ever since their purchase. Para 1.55 of the Eighteenth report of the Public Accounts Committee (Fourth Lok Sabha) refers. Out of these 289 machines, 219 Nos. were not fitted with hour/ mile-meters. In some of the census returns submitted by units, the relevant column was not filled. The position re-

garding the utilisation of the 219 machines not fitted with hour/milo-meters and the remaining 70 machines fitted with hour/milo meters, as could be gathered from readily available data is as under:—

219 machines not fitted with hour/milo meters:

Definite information regarding utilisation is available in respect of 49 out of these 219 machines and the extent of their utilisation is shown in Appendix I. In respect of the remaining 170 machines in this category information is being collected and the same is expected to be available by November 1968. The same will be furnished on receipt.

70 machines fitted with hour/milo meters:

Out of these 70 machines definite information regarding utilisation of 14 machines is readily available and the extent of their utilisation is as shown in Appendix II. 10 machines have been issued on loan to State PWDs since 8th March, 1965 for which hire charges are being recovered. In respect of the remaining 46 machines under this category information is being collected and the same is expected to be available by November, 1968. The available information will be furnished on receipt.

2. The high powered Committee consisting of Secretary, Ministry of Defence and Chief of Army Staff which was assisted by the Director General Border Roads, Secretary, Border Roads Development Board and Additional Financial Adviser considered the question of streamlining the procedure for improving the efficiency and effectiveness of the Organisation and various proposals made by Director General Border Roads in this connection.

3. On the recommendations of the above high powered Committee it has been decided to entrust to the Director of Scientific Evaluation, Ministry of Defence, a works study of output/efficiency of plant and machinery. On receipt of the recommendations of the Director of Scientific Evaluation, Ministry of Defence, the above Committee would decide what further measures should be taken to ensure maximum optimum utilisation of plant, machinery and equipment etc. in the Border Roads Organisation.

4. In order to exercise greater and more effective control, Director General Border Roads has now reviewed the form and content of the census return and replaced it by a 'Utilisation Return.' A copy of the instructions issued by Director General Border Roads is enclosed*.

5. In the past, indents for purchase of equipment had been initiated by Director General Border Roads keeping in view the programme and priorities of projects entrusted to General Reserve Engineer Force, the terrain in which work would be carried out. As construction of motorable roads in the Himalyas at the required speed had not been undertaken in the past, the assessment both of number and nature of equipment purchased in the initial period had to be made largely on the basis of best available technical advice and experience in other countries. As experience was gained, the utility and actual capacity of equipment used had been taken into account before deciding on further investment in machinery and equipment. In all these cases, there had been detailed discussions on each case in consultation with Finance Ministry. The observations of the Public Accounts Committee will however be kept prominently in view while considering proposals for further purchase of equipment for Border Roads Organisation.

6. Ministry of Finance (Def|BR) and Director of Audit (Defence Services) have seen.

[Ministry of Transport and Shipping (Border Road Development Board)
U.O. No. F 1(10) BRDB|67-68|PAC dated 29-10-68].

Recommendation

The Committee feel that Government should arrange for a thorough expert investigation of the problems of inventory control and materials management in the Defence Services with a view to effect economy.

[Sl. No. 4 of Appendix II Para 1.67 of PAC's Eighteenth Report (Fourth Lok Sabha) 1967-68.

ACTION TAKEN

As indicated to the Committee, the question regarding entrusting a works study of the output/efficiency of units, plant and machinery deployed in the Border Roads Organisation to a specialist agency, had been under the active consideration of the Government for sometime past. Director General Border Roads had proposed that this study should be entrusted to the National Productivity Council. The Council initially showed interest in the project. However after further examination they felt that keeping in view their resources and other commitments, they would not be in a position to undertake a work of such magnitude. It has therefore been decided to entrust the proposed works study to the Director of Scientific Evaluation of Ministry of Defence. The work has commenced on 11-6-68 and the final report is expected in March 1969. The high powered committee consisting of the Secretary, Ministry of Defence and Chief of the Army Staff will go into the report of the

Director of Scientific Evaluation and will advise the Government on further measures which should be taken to ensure optimum utilisation of the machinery resources of the Organisation.

2. Ministry of Finance (Def/BR) and Director of Audit (Defence Services) have seen.

[Ministry of Transport and Shipping (Border Road Development Board)
U.O. No. F. 1(10) (BRDB) 67-68/PAC dated 10-9-68.]

FURTHER INFORMATION

- (i) A statement showing data about utilisation of 170 machines not fitted with hour/milo meters;
- (ii) A statement showing data about utilisation of 46 machines fitted with hour/milo meters;
- (iii) Decision taken on para 14 of the Report of the High Powered Committee regarding utilisation of GREF resources during slack season;

PLEASE FURNISH THE FOLLOWING INFORMATION

- (i) and (ii)

As a result of further check up on the ground the following position has emerged:-

- i Total number of machines reported in the Audit Report as not having been utilised at all 311
Less utilised 21

Balance 290
- ii 290 Nos. of machines can be broken up as under:-
 - (a) Machines with hour/milo meters. 71 (this is one more than previously reported to PAC.)
 - (b) Machines not fitted with hours milo meters 219

290
- (iii) Out of 71 Nos. vide clause (ii) (a) above information in respect of 24 machines have been furnished already. The information in respect of 39 machines is enclosed in Appendix III 19 Nos. of them (39) had not been utilised at all. Details in respect of balance No. (8) are awaited.

- (iv) Out of 219 machines *vide* clause (ii) (b) above particulars in respect of 49 machines have already been furnished to the Committee.

Information is awaited in respect of 54 machines. 4 machines which came with army units taken on loan have gone back to army on reversion of the units. Information in respect of the balance (112 Nos.) is given in Appendix IV.

- (v) No final decision as such has yet been taken by Government. The matter is under examination in consultation with Army HQrs. and Defence Ministry.

Recommendation

The Committee regret to note that the 12 Slat Conveyors purchased by the Border Roads Organisation were lying idle since their receipt and that it was now proposed to convert them into belt conveyors. The Committee desire that this costly equipment should be suitably utilised and, if necessary, the Indian Airlines Corporation may be contacted again for the transfer of this equipment."

[Sl. No. 5 of Appendix II (Para No. 1.76) of PAC's Eighteenth Report (Fourth Lok Sabha) 1967-68.]

ACTION TAKEN

Six slat conveyors have so far been converted into belt conveyors. After reviewing his requirement of belt conveyors, Director General, Border Roads has concluded that he does not need any more by conversion of Slat Conveyors. Out of the remaining six, four only are in working condition. They are again being offered to the Indian Airlines Corporation. DGBR has proposed that the two damaged Slat Conveyors should be disposed of through the DGS&D. This is under examination.

2. DGBR has since indicated that the six Slat Conveyors converted into Belt Conveyors will be kept as reserve for the 26 Belt Conveyors to be retained for use. Of the 6 Slat Conveyors converted into Belt Conveyors, two have been issued to projects and the remaining four are kept as DGBR's reserve in the Beacon Base Depot.

[Ministry of Transport and Shipping (Border Road Development Board)
U.O. No. of 1 (10)/BRDB/67-68/PAC dated 29-10-68.]

FURTHER INFORMATION

As stated in para 1 of the action taken note dated 29-10-68 in respect of this recommendation of the Public Accounts Committee forwarded to the Lok Sabha Secretariat under U.O. No. F. 1 (10)/BRDB/67-68/PAC, dated 29-10-68, the slat conveyors were again offered to the Indian Airlines Corporation. They have since intimated that these conveyors are not found suitable for their use. DGBR has intimated that 5 slat conveyors are in usable condition and 1 slat conveyor (unmodified) is unserviceable and beyond economical repairs. Accordingly, Director General, Border Roads has been authorised to arrange for the speedy disposal of 5 slat conveyors through the Director General, Supplies and Disposals.

[Ministry of Transport and Shipping Border Road Development Board
U.O. No. F. 1 (1)/BRDB/67-68/PAC dated 7-2-69.]

Recommendation

"The Committee deplore the way in which procurement of a large quantity of bitumen in excess/advance of requirements was made. This had not only resulted in the locking up of public money but also involved the risk of loss through leakage and other factors. The Committee would like to know what disciplinary action has been taken against the officers concerned and the quantum of loss suffered if any."

[Sl. No. 7 of Appendix II (Para 1.91) of PAC's Eighteenth Report
(Fourth Lok Sabha) 1967-68.]

ACTION TAKEN

The disciplinary aspect of the case has been examined by Government. Of the two Chief Engineers, who were responsible for authorising the purchase of bitumen, one retired from service on 22.7.67. The other officer, who is still in service, has been informed that his conduct in this case was blameworthy and that he should be more circumspect in future in making advance purchase of stores.

2. Director General, Border Roads has reported that the entire quantity of bitumen procured has been consumed in the works and that there has been no loss.

3. Ministry of Finance (Def/BR) and Director of Audit (Defence Services) have seen.

[Ministry of Transport and Shipping (Border Road Development Board)
U.O. No. F. 1 (10)/BRDB/67-68/PAC, dated 10-9-68.]

Recommendation

"As the minus balances in the stores accounts are indicative of defective maintenance of accounts, the Committee trust that the Border Roads Organisation will take necessary steps to bring these accounts to a satisfactory level and to take adequate remedial measures in consultation with audit to avoid such minus balances in the accounts in future."

[Sl. No. 8 of Appendix II (Para No. 1.96) of PAC's Eighteenth Report (Fourth Lok Sabha) 1967-68].

ACTION TAKEN

The various factors contributing to the 'minus balances' were examined by Government in detail in consultation with Controller General of Defence Accounts and Director General, Border Roads. It was found that the 'Minus balances' were caused mainly by the following factors:—

- (i) Levy of departmental charges.
- (ii) Delay in receipt of debit vouchers in respect of centrally purchased stores.
- (iii) Delay in receipt of debits for stores purchased centrally.
- (iv) Variation between purchase and issue rates of POL.

The action taken to rectify the above defects are:

- (i) It was found that in the absence of a 'set off' arrangement the 'minus' debit on account of levy of overheads at 5.3 per cent on the stores issued by the Base Depots remained unneutralised in Base Depot Accounts. This figure mounted up. To overcome this difficulty in accounting, a 'set off' arrangement for neutralising the minus debits on account of levy of overheads, as stated above, has been prescribed and orders were issued on 11th December, 1967.
- (ii) and (iii). Suitable instructions have been issued by the Controller of Defence Accounts laying down a time limit for scheduling the central purchase vouchers. It is expected that as the various purchase vouchers become available these will be adjusted and the minus balances gradually liquidated.
- (iv) Minus balances have also been caused by debiting the works at the SC rates for POL, whereas the same was procured from trade at varying rates. The method by which this can be overcome and the minus balances reduced/liquidated was examined. Instructions have been issued by the Director General, Border Roads to the Chief Engineers Projects laying

down that POL obtained from trade should be priced on the basis of procurement cost plus departmental charges like any other category 'B' stores.

2. The previous and latest position of the minus balances in the three projects mentioned in para 1.93 of the Eighteenth Report of PAC (Fourth Lok Sabha) are given below:—

(in lakhs of rupees)

	Balance at the end of 1964-65	1965-66	Balance as on 31-3-68
Project 'A' (—)	80.29	(—) 119.64	(—) 50.20
'B' (—)	13.85	(—) 17.14	(—) 4.77
'C' (—)	9.36	(—) 14.00	(+) 10.76
	(—) 103.50	(—) 150.78	(—) 44.21

3. A watch is being kept on the positive results obtained after implementation of the various orders referred to above. If necessary, the position will be reviewed and further remedial measures will be taken.

4. Ministry of Finance (Def/BR) and Director of Audit (Defence Services) have seen.

[Ministry of Transport and Shipping (Border Road Development Board)
U.O. No. F. 1 (10)/BRDB/67-68/PAC, dated 20-10-68.]

Recommendation

The Committee are unhappy that the raising of units and the utilisation of man power by the Border Roads Organisation have not been undertaken in an effective and co-ordinated manner and have led to infructuous expenditure of Rs. 34 lakhs.

It has also come to notice that, while a large number of machines involving an outlay of Rs. 11 crores were purchased, many of them were either not utilised at all since their purchase or there were delays of one to three years in their utilisation after receipt from workshops.

The Committee would like Government to look into the various aspects of the working of the Border Roads Organisation and to take suitable steps to gear its machinery and put it on a thoroughly sound footing so that it can meet any eventuality effectively and efficiently. The Committee would

like to be informed of the measures taken by Government to bring about the desired improvement in the Border Roads Organisation."

[Sl. No. 9 of Appendix II (para 1.97) of PAC's Eighteenth Report (Fourth Lok Sabha) 1967-68.]

ACTION TAKEN

Before 1960, there was no organisation in the country for departmental construction of roads and no experience whatsoever for intensive use of machinery in construction of roads in the Himalayas. There were few engineers—civil and military—who had even attempted to build tracks on motorable gradient in the Himalayan region. In 1960, the Board set up a new Organisation and set a task which involved construction of 2,500 miles of new roads and improvement of 1,500 miles of existing roads/tracks. The organisation had to recruit technical and supervisory personnel, decide on the range and quantity of equipment required and simultaneously launch on construction at various points with meagre logistic cover. Despite all efforts to induce the countrymen to offer their services to Border Roads Organisation, there was acute shortage of technical and supervisory personnel. It took some time to learn the technique of balanced use of men and machines. The observation of the Committee relate by and large to the period when the organisation was trying to settle down despite the set back caused in 1962 by the Chinese aggression and in 1965 by the Pakistani aggression.

Sub Paras 2 and 3.

2. However, as stated in the 'action taken notes' in respect of paras 1.66 and 1.67 of the report the Government are fully alive to the problems which face the organisation. Various measures have been taken. These include works study of the output/efficiency of units, plant, machinery etc. As soon as the results of the study are available, suitable steps will be taken keeping the objectives set out by the Public Accounts Committee.

3. Ministry of Finance (Def/BR) and Director of Audit (Defence Services) have seen.

[Ministry of Transport and Shipping (Border Road Development Board)
U.O. No. F. 1 (10)/BRDB/67-68/PAC, dated 10-9-68.]

CHAPTER III

RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT DESIRE TO PURSUE IN VIEW OF THE REPLIES OF GOVERNMENT

Recommendation

"The Committee are unhappy to note that 33.5 per cent of belt conveyors are in class 'C' condition. They are also surprised to note that a good number of them have been inoperative since long. The Committee need hardly emphasise that the upkeep of machinery should be the first concern of any field organisation. They desire that, consistent with requirements, all efforts should be made to repair the belt conveyors without any further delay."

[Serial No. 6 of Appendix II (Para No. 1.80) of PAC's Eighteenth Report (Fourth Lok Sabha) 1967-68].

ACTION TAKEN

Having regard to the actual surfacing output of General Reserve Engineer Force during the last 3 years, and owing to certain limitations on account of terrain in regard to the use of mechanical devices like belt conveyors, Director General, Border Roads has now assessed that his future requirement of belt conveyors would be 26.

2. As against the above requirement, the present holdings are:—

	In working condition	In class 'C' condition (requiring overhaul)
Belt Conveyors	26	22
Slat Conveyors converted into belt conveyors	6	—
	32	

3. In view of the above, no immediate overhauling of the twenty two belt conveyors (in class 'C' condition) is being undertaken. Director General, Border Roads has therefore not submitted any indent for spares for overhauling belt conveyors.

4. DGBR has proposed that the twenty two belt conveyors in class 'C' condition might be offered to the DGS & D for disposal. This is under consideration of Government. A further note in regard to the disposal of these belt conveyors will be submitted as soon as a final decision is taken.

5. Ministry of Finance (Def/BR) and Director of Audit (Defence Services) have seen.

[Ministry of Transport and Shipping (Border Road Development Board)
U.O. No. F. 1 (10)/BRDB/67-68/PAC, dated 29-10-68.]

FURTHER INFORMATION

As stated in para 4 of the action taken note dated 29th October, 1968 in respect of this recommendation of the Public Accounts Committee, forwarded to the Lok Sabha Secretariat under U.O. No. F. 1 (10)/BRDB/67-68/PAC dated 29th October, 1968, the question regarding disposal of the 22 belt conveyors in class 'C' condition was examined in detail. The Indian Air Lines Corporation was approached. They do not consider the equipment as suitable for their requirement. It has therefore been decided that these should be disposed of to the best advantage of the State through the Director General, Supplies and Disposals. Director General, Border Roads is accordingly taking necessary action in this regard.

2. Ministry of Finance (Def/BR) and Director of Audit (Defence Services) have seen.

[Ministry of Transport and Shipping—Border Road Development Board
U.O. No. F. 1 (10)/BRDB/67-68/PAC, dated 7-2-1969.]

NEW DELHI;
March 11, 1969
Phalguna 20, 1890 (Saka)

M. R. MASANI,
Chairman,
Public Accounts Committee.

[Reference para 1.6 of the Report]

Project	Description	EM No.	Hours run	Project	Description	EM No.	Hours run
CHETAK	Electrolux Refrigerator	LA 500 7412	16800	SEWAK	Rock Drills	M-25506 M-28454 M-25507 M-28440 M-28456 M-28441 M-28435 M-28482 M-28443 M-25446 M-25444 M-28450	417 484 422 451 340 434 351 318 112 367 302 378
VARTAK	Sheep Foot Rollers	P 522 P 523 P 524 P 525	93 94 134 95			M-25517 M-25527 M-28438 M-25510 M-28455 M-28448 M-28436 M-23413 M-25529 M-23392 M-24330	302 397 309 212 290 326 210 85 168 137 84
	Pumping Set	1045	21				
	Rock Drill	50	3335				
DANTAK	Rock Drill	31893 51774	47 50				
	Tar Boiler	343/64	1250				
DEEPAK	Belt Con-veyor	5431	25				
SEWAK	Rock Drills	M-25520 M-25500 M-28451 M-25522 M-28439 M-28437 M-25433 M-25496 M-28434 M-28433 M-25518 M-25508 M-25452 M-28442 M-28449	203 217 222 352 316 217 149 238 427 335 319 244 356 297 397				
					TOTAL	49	

APPENDIX II

[Reference Para 1.6 of the Report]

UTILISATION OF MACHINES WITH HOURS METERS

Project	EM	Hrs. Run	Project	Road Rollers	Remarks
Beacon	21801	1561	Sewak	6167	On loan with PWD.
	15488	108		6241	Authority DGBR
	32814	654		6240	No. 68099-Q/
	32644	1425		6160	Assam/DGBR/DTP
	287	1831		6168	dated 8 Mr. 65.
	277	9185		6753	Hence no utilisation
	276	1067		6238	returns received.
				(1501)	PWDs are paying
	279	1178		6166	hire charges for
	286	1703		6144	these machines.
	117	608		6238	
				(1469)	
	38727	4137			
	38870	4557			
	39157	2105			
	38691	3404			
TOTAL . . .				24	

APPENDIX III

[Reference Para 1.7 of the Report]

UTILISATION OF MACHINES WITH HOUR METERS

Sr. No.	Project	Description	FM No.	Hours run
1.	Sewak	Tractors/Dozers	5833	1,025
2.	"	"	13390	3,000
3.	"	"	1044	98
4.	Beacon	"	32854	623
5.	"	"	39156	1,856
6.	Sewak	Air Compressor	6148	421.5
7.	Beacon	"	11719	20.00
8.	"	Snow Blast	373026	4.999
9.	Sewak	Stone Crusher	6240	231
10.	"	"	6213	121
11.	Beacon	"	700	365
12.	"	"	N 125	85
13.	Cherak	Road Roller	EMR 7003	900 (assessed)
14.	"	"	EMR 7020	622
15.	"	Air Compressor	EMC 7000	500
16.	"	"	FMC 7036	2,047
17.	"	"	EMC 7002	1,800 (assessed)
18.	"	"	EMC 7037	2,716
19.	Sewak	Road Roller	EM 6157	265

SUMMARY

Total as above	---	10
Utilised but hours run not indicated	---	1
Not utilised	---	19
Grand Total		39

APPENDIX IV

[Reference Para 1-7 of the Report]

UTILISATION OF MACHINES WITH OUT HOUR METERS

Sr. No.	Project	Description	EM No.	Hours Run
1.	Dantak	Pumping Sets	764265	100
2.	Sewak	Concrete Mixer	6171	1,495
3.	Vartak	Refrigerators	P 78	8,400
4.	"	"	P 571	7,000 (assessed)
5.	Dantak	Tar/Bitumen boilers	346/64	80
6.	"	"	345/64	223
7.	"	"	350/64	105
8.	"	"	340/64	60
9.	Vartak	"	3338	1,716
10.	"	"	4093	2,280
11.	"	"	3387	36
12.	"	"	1009	604
13.	"	"	1012	488
14.	"	"	1022	183
15.	"	"	1024	103
16.	Beacon	Wagon Drills	621	152
17.	"	"	631	45
18.	"	"	694	264
19.	"	"	678	425
20.	"	"	711	760
21.	Dantak	Rock Drills	22850	3
22.	"	"	23186	12
23.	"	"	23211	105
24.	"	"	51773	780 (assessed)
25.	"	"	51749	740 Do.
26.	"	"	1457	157 Do.
27.	"	"	1406	160 Do.
28.	"	"	1431	190 Do.
29.	"	"	31870	189 Do.
30.	"	"	31860	186 Do.
31.	"	"	31872	163 Do.
32.	"	"	31900	166 Do.
33.	"	"	994214	173 Do.
34.	"	"	31854	179 Do.
35.	"	"	14625	201 Do.
36.	"	"	31891	160 Do.

Sr. No.	Project	Description	EM No.	Hours Run
37.	Dentak	Rock Drills	31877	855 assessed
38.	"	"	51751	820 Do.
39.	Varatak	"	P 179	252
40.	"	"	P 109	341
41.	"	"	P 141	284
42.	"	"	EM 17	1,729 (assessed)
43.	"	"	23	1,729 Do.
44.	"	"	25	1,729 Do.
45.	"	"	29	1,729 Do.
46.	"	"	30	1,729 Do.
47.	"	"	35	1,729 Do.
48.	"	"	36	1,729 Do.
49.	"	"	37	1,729 Do.
50.	Swastik	"	18	983
51.	"	"	1462	459
52.	"	"	31885	94
53.	Sewak	"	28453	453
54.	"	"	28447	479
55.	Chetak	Pumping Set	756870	2,150 (assessed)

SUMMARY

Total as above	—55
Utilised but hours run not indicated	—6
Not utilised	—51
Grand Total	112

APPENDIX V

Summary of Conclusions/Recommendations

Sl. No. 1	Para No. of Report 2	Ministry/Deptt. concerned 3	Conclusions/Recommendations 4
I	1 8	Ministry of Transport & Shipping (Border Road Development Board).	<p>The Committee note from the information furnished by Government, that 70 out of 289 items of machinery with the Border Roads Organisation have not been utilised at all. In respect of the machinery used, the utilisation of as many as 102 items was less than 1,000 hours as compared to the annual usage rate of 1,200 1,500 hours fixed by the organisation and 2,500 hours laid down by the Central Water and Power Commission. It is obvious that there is a heavy accumulation of inventories with the organisation and that purchase of machinery and equipment has not been planned on the basis of actual requirements of projects in hand. Since the cost of the machinery and equipment gets debited to the projects on the basis of a usage rate, which has not been realised in practice, it is also evident that the under-utilisation non-utilisation of machinery has resulted in needlessly inflating the cost of projects undertaken by the organisation.</p>
	1 9		<p>The Committee cannot resist the impression that the organisation has been resorting to fresh purchase of machinery to overcome difficulties caused by a substantial proportion of their existing machinery remaining under repairs for a long time.</p>
	1 10		<p>In this connection, the Committee would like to draw Government's attention to the observation made in para 2.11 of Forty Second Report</p>

(Fourth Lok Sabha) pointing out that the percentage of earth moving and construction machines under repairs was 23 per cent against the Department's normal allowance of 10 per cent and that one third of such machines and equipment have been held up for repairs in workshops for periods ranging from one to three years.

I 11 Ministry of Transport
 & Shipping
(Border Road Development Board)

The Committee have further pointed out in that Report that 263 indents for spares valued at Rs. 1,603 lakhs are pending with various authorities like Director General of Supplies and Disposals, Director General, Ordnance Factories etc. for one to three years.

I 12

It is evident that if the Border Roads Organisation are able to expedite repairs to the machinery and equipment, it should be possible to put back into service a substantial number of earth moving and construction machines and thus obviate to that extent the purchase of new machinery and equipment. ३

I 13

The Committee understand that major repairs to machinery/equipment are at present being carried out in two base workshops located at Pathankot and Tejpur. Considering the fact that the equipment and machinery in the Border Roads Organisation are deployed in areas, most of which are inaccessible, the Committee would like Government to consider whether the location of the base workshops need to be shifted. In any case it would appear to be necessary to organise field parties to visit work sites to carry out repair jobs which can be done on the spot. This would

obviate the need for moving machinery and equipment over long distances and also help to get the repairs speedily done.

I-14

In view of the heavy inventories with Border Roads Organisation that the Committee would go to the extent of suggesting fresh purchases of machinery and equipment for road construction should be made only after it has been verified that it is not possible to meet the demand from the existing stock of surplus or under-utilised machinery with the Border Roads Organisation. The Committee also suggest that in respect of machinery and equipment which are neither in use nor likely to be gainfully employed in future in the Border Roads Organisation, Government should consider whether these should be transferred, in the overall interests of economy to the Union or State agencies engaged in road construction or Government projects, public undertakings etc. requiring them.

31

I-15

The Committee hope that the Director of Scientific Evaluation of the Ministry of Defence would not only suggest in his study ways and means of securing optimum use of machinery and equipment but also suggest measures to eliminate avoidable purchases of excess machinery and equipment in future.

2

I-17

The Committee are distressed to note that the General Reserve Engineer Force remains underutilised during slack season. From the Report of the High-powered Committee, it is observed that the question of utilising this slack capacity has been under consideration since October, 1966. It is unfortunate that Government have still not been able to reach a final decision, though over two years have elapsed. The Committee hope that the matter will be finalised without further delay.

Sl. No.	Name of Agent	Agency No.	Sl. No.	Name of Agent	Agency No.
DELHI			33.	Oxford Book & Stationery Company, Scindia House, Connaught Place, New Delhi—1.	68
24.	Jain Book Agency, Connaught Place, New Delhi.	11			
25.	Sat Narain & Sons, 3141, Mohd. Ali Bazar, Mori Gate, Delhi.	3	34.	People's Publishing House, Rani Jhansi Road, New Delhi.	76
26.	Atma Ram & Sons, Kashmere Gate, Delhi-6.	9	35.	The United Book Agency, 48, Amrit Kaur Market, Pahar Ganj, New Delhi.	88
27.	J. M. Jaina & Brothers, Mori Gate, Delhi.	11	36.	Hind Book House, 82, Janpath, New Delhi.	93
28.	The Central News Agency, 23/90, Connaught Place, New Delhi.	15	37.	Bookwell, 4, Sant Narakari Colony, Kingsway Camp, Delhi-9.	96
29.	The English Book Store, 7-L, Connaught Circus, New Delhi.	20	MANIPUR		
30.	Lakshmi Book Store, 42, Municipal Market, Janpath, New Delhi.	23	38.	Shri N. Chaoba Singh, News Agent, Ramlal Paul High School Annexe, Imphal.	77
31.	Bahree Brothers, 188 Lal-patrai Market, Delhi-6.	27	AGENTS IN FOREIGN COUNTRIES		
32.	Jayana Book Depot, Chapparwala Kuan, Karol Bagh, New Delhi.	66	39.	The Secretary, Establishment Department, The High Commission of India India House, Aldwych, LONDON W.C.—2.	99

© 1969 BY THE LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT.

PUBLISHED UNDER RULE 382 OF THE RULES OF PROCEDURE AND CONDUCT OF
BUSINESS IN LOK SABHA (FIFTH EDITION) AND PRINTED BY THE GENERAL
MANAGER, GOVERNMENT OF INDIA PRESS, MINTO ROAD, NEW DELHI.

