

E.C. No. 1416

FOURTH REPORT

**ESTIMATES COMMITTEE
(2004-2005)**

(FOURTEENTH LOK SABHA)

**MINISTRY OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT
(DEPARTMENT OF SECONDARY AND HIGHER EDUCATION)**

‘ALL INDIA COUNCIL FOR TECHNICAL EDUCATION’

**Action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the
Nineteenth Report of Estimates Committee (Thirteenth Lok Sabha) on
the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of
Secondary and Higher Education) – ‘All India Council for Technical
Education’**

**S
E
A
L**

Presented to Lok Sabha on 2.12.2004

**Lok Sabha Secretariat
New Delhi**

December , 2004/Agrahyana , 1926

CONTENTS

PAGE

COMPOSITION OF THE ESTIMATES COMMITTEE(2004-2005)(iii)

INTRODUCTION (v)

CHAPTER I Report

APPENDICES

- I. Minutes of Sitting of the Estimates Committee held on 14th October, 2004**
 - II. Analysis of the action taken by Government on the recommendations/observations contained in the 19th Report of Estimates Committee (Thirteenth Lok Sabha)**
-

Shri C. Kuppusami - Chairman

2. Shri A. Sai Prathap
3. Shri B. Vinod Kumar
4. Shri Chander Kumar
5. Shri Lalmuni Chaubay
6. Shri Adhir Ranjan Chowdhury
7. Shri Anant Gudhe
8. Shri Jai Prakash
9. Shri N.N. Krishnadas
10. Shri Samik Lahiri
11. Shri Bhartruhari Mahatab
12. Shri Sunil Kumar Mahato
13. Shri Sanat Kumar Mandal
14. Shri Zora Singh Mann
15. Shri Prabodh Panda
16. Shri Mahendra Prasad Nishad
17. Shri Sukhdeo Paswan
18. Shri Annasaheb M.K. Patil
19. Shri Harikewal Prasad
20. Prof. M. Ramadass
21. Shri K.S. Rao
22. Shri Iqbal Ahmed Saradgi
23. Shri Jyotiraditya Madhavrao Scindia
24. Shri Manabendra Shah
25. Shri Laxman Singh
26. Shri Sartaj Singh
27. Shri M.A. Kharabela Swain
28. Shrii Akhilesh Yadav
29. Shri V. Kishore Chandra Deo
30. Shri Vijay Krishan

1.	Shri John Joseph	-	Additional Secretary
2.	Smt. P.K. Sandhu	-	Joint Secretary
3.	Shri A.K. Singh	-	Principal Chief Parliamentary Interpreter
4.	Shri Cyril John	-	Under Secretary

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairman of the Estimates Committee, having been authorised by the Committee to submit the Report on their behalf, present this Fourth Report on action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the Nineteenth Report of Estimates Committee (Thirteenth Lok Sabha) on the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Secondary and Higher Education) – ‘All India Council for Technical Education’.

2. The Nineteenth Report (Thirteenth Lok Sabha) was presented to Lok Sabha on 4th February, 2004. The Government furnished their replies indicating action taken on the recommendations contained in that Report on 3rd September, 2004 . The Draft Report was considered and adopted by the Estimates Committee(2004-2005) at their sitting held on 14th October, 2004.
3. The Report has been divided into the following Chapters:-
 - I. Report ;
 - II. Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by Government;
 - III. Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of Government's replies;
 - IV. Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of Government have not been accepted by the Committee; and
 - V. Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of Government are still awaited.
4. An analysis of action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the Nineteenth Report of Estimates Committee (13th Lok Sabha) is given in Appendix II.

It would be observed therefrom that out of 25 observations/recommendations made in the Report, 14 recommendations, i.e. 56% have been accepted by Government. Replies of Government in respect of 6 recommendations, i.e. 24% have not been accepted by the Committee and replies in respect of 5 recommendations, i.e. 20% are still awaited.

NEW DELHI;
December 1, 2004
Agrahayana 10 ,1926(S)

C. KUPPUSAMI
Chairman
Committee on Estimates

CHPATER I

REPORT

1.1 This Report of the Committee deals with the action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in their Nineteenth Report(Thirteenth Lok Sabha) on the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Secondary and Higher Education) – ‘All India Council for Technical Education’.

1.2 The Committee’s Nineteenth Report (Thirteenth Lok Sabha) was presented to Lok Sabha on 4th February, 2004. It contained 25 observations/recommendations. Action Taken Notes on all these observations/recommendations have been received from the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Secondary and Higher Education).

1.3 Replies to the observations and recommendations contained in the Report have broadly been categorised as under:-

- (i) Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by Government:**

S.No. 1,4,6 to 12,15,20 to 22 and 24
(Total 14, Chapter II)

- (ii) Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of Government’s reply:**

S.No. NIL
(Total NIL, Chapter III)

- (iii) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which Government’s replies have not been accepted by the Committee:**

S. No. 16 to 19, 23 and 25
(Total 6, Chapter IV)

(iv) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of Government are still awaited:

S. No. 2,3,5,13 and 14

(Total 5, Chapter V)

1.4 The Committee will now deal with the action taken by Government on some of the recommendations.

Teacher-student ratio

Recommendation/Observation (Sl. Nos. 16 & 17 Para No. 8.16 & 8.17)

1.5 Commenting on the teacher-student ratio, the Committee had stated as under:-

“The Committee note that in several institutions, particularly the newly established technical and management institutions, the prescribed teacher-student ratio is not being maintained. The Committee are not satisfied with the Ministry’s evasive reply that shortage of faculty is a common problem and that fulfillment of exact teacher-student ratio cannot be strictly insisted upon as appointment of teachers is a post approval activity. The Committee, therefore, insist that teacher-student ratio should be made a very important indicator in the accreditation process of programmes and compliance of prescribed teacher-student ratio should be ensured in all the institutions.

It has come to the notice of the Committee that in places where a number of institutions are located, faculties of those institutions have the same staff. This is done mainly to satisfy the requirement of the AICTE Act, which stipulates that there should be required number of qualified teachers. There is a general tendency amongst the newly set up colleges not to engage qualified and experienced staff to minimize expenditure. To reduce expenditure they engage part-time teachers, thereby seriously compromising on the quality of teaching standards. The Committee also expect that AICTE would evolve a suitable mechanism to avert such malpractices with respect to teaching faculty. The Committee, therefore, recommend that AICTE should take all necessary steps to ensure prescribed teacher-student ratio in all the technical institutions in their purview.”

1.6 In the action taken reply, the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Secondary and Higher Education) has stated as under:-

“The National Board of Accreditation duly recognizes the importance of the staff-student ratio. In the accreditation process, the human resources: faculty and student component is assigned 200 marks and teaching & learning skills is awarded 350 marks. Each discipline under accreditation is required to get a minimum score under human resources. When a discipline fails to secure the specified marks under this, it is not awarded the Accredited Status, even if the total number of points exceeds 650.

The Council takes cognizance of the student staff ratio while granting extension of approval/ introduction of new courses / programmes, etc.”

1.7 It goes without saying that the quality of technical education in the country cannot be improved without ensuring well qualified and experienced teaching staff in the institutions. The Committee are deeply concerned about the non-compliance of prescribed teacher-student ratio in several technical and management institutions in the country. Engaging of part-time and non-qualified teachers has tremendous adverse effect on the quality of education imparted by institutions. The reply given by the Ministry that AICTE takes cognizance of the student-staff ratio in the accreditation process and while granting extension of approval/introduction of new courses/programmes, etc. is not fully satisfactory. The Committee, therefore, again recommend that AICTE should evolve a suitable mechanism to ensure compliance of prescribed teacher-student ratio and to avert malpractices resorted to by technical and management institutions such as, engaging part-time and inexperienced teachers to reduce the salary bill. AICTE should take stringent measures to identify such erring institutions and to have penal measures initiated against them so as to ensure that all technical and management institutions scrupulously comply with the prescribed norms by ensuring qualified and experienced teaching faculty.

Payment of Salary

Recommendation/Observation (Sl. No. 18, Para No. 8.18)

1.8 On the payment of salary to the teaching staff by privately run technical and management institutions, the Committee had observed as under:-

“The Committee express their concern over the flouting of norms and guidelines with respect to payment of salaries as per prescribed pay scales to the teaching staff by the private run technical and management institutions. This is despite the fact that AICTE had notified revised pay scales for all technical institutions in the country. The Committee are told that in case of private self-financing institutions the visiting Expert Committee examines pay scales and salaries given to staff members by checking salary record registers and cases of non-compliance are brought to the notice of the State Government and the institution concerned for initiating remedial measures. According to the AICTE there is a “Malpractice Cell” in the Council, which looks into complaints regarding non-payment of pay scales and salaries in consultation with respective State Governments. The Committee note with concern that despite well laid down guidelines and norms regulating payment of salaries to teaching staff, these norms are being flouted by a number of institutions. The Committee, therefore, recommend that AICTE should constantly monitor the cases regarding violation of payment of salaries according to prescribed pay scales and should doggedly pursue the matter with concerned State Governments and also impose stringent penal measures against those institutions violating the norms. The Council should also ensure that salaries to the teaching staff should be paid only by cheque and the Vigilance Cell during their inspection should cross-check from the Bank account whether the payments have been debited in full as per the prescribed pay scales.”

1.9 In the action taken reply, the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Secondary and Higher Education) has stated as under:-

“AICTE visiting expert committees which visit institutions for various purposes such as grant of extension of approval /accreditation are entrusted with the responsibility of verifying the authenticity of payment of AICTE scales of pay to the teaching staff. Institutions have been directed to maintain TDS Certificates against the salary of Faculty.”

1.10 While taking note of the steps taken by AICTE to check flouting of norms and guidelines with regard to payment of salary as per prescribed pay scales to the teaching staff by the private run technical and management institutions, the Committee have the impression that these measures are not adequate to fully check the existing malpractices. Despite the notification on revised pay scales for all technical institutions in the country, the norms are being flouted by many private run technical and management institutions. The Committee had recommended that AICTE should constantly monitor the cases regarding violation of payment of salaries according to prescribed pay scales and should earnestly pursue the matter with concerned State Governments and also impose stringent penal measures against those institutions violating the norms. There is need to deal with the problem more stringently. The Committee, therefore, would like to stress once again that the Council should ensure that salaries to the teaching staff is paid only by cheque and the vigilance cell during their inspection will cross check from the bank account that payments have been

debited in full as per the prescribed pay scales. Further, the AICTE should constantly monitor cases of violation in payment of salaries to staff according to prescribed pay scales so as to ensure that private run institutions do not flout the norms and guidelines in this regard.

Research and Development

Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 19, Para No. 8.19)

1.11 The Committee, while commenting on the pace Research and Development in the field of technical education had recommended as under:-

“The Committee are unhappy with the slow pace of Research & Development in the field of technical education in the country. There is a gradual decline in RID funds allocated for various research schemes. The decline in RID funds was attributed to the fact that unlike in the initial stages when all technical institutions were given funds for RID activities, AICTE presently gives funds only to Government and accredited technical institutions. It has also been stated that since R&D is a specialised activity, only small range of institutions possessing necessary infrastructure are given funds. The Committee are of the view that R&D in the field of technical education has gained paramount importance with rapid growth of new technologies in the field of Telecom and Information Technology. Therefore budgetary outlay for RID should be increased and more number of institutions should be encouraged to undertake research in technical education in the country.”

1.12 In the action taken reply, the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Secondary and Higher Education) has stated as under:-

“Within the available funds, the Council would make optimum utilization towards promoting R&D in technical institutions.”

1.13 It is distressing to note that Government has not taken the recommendation of the Committee with the seriousness it deserved. Undoubtedly, Research and Development in the field of technical education has gained utmost importance with the rapid growth of new technologies. The Committee note that recognising the urgent need to ensure coordinated and integrated development of technical education in the country, the National Policy on Education, 1986 had stipulated that “The AICTE will be vested with statutory authority for planning, formulation and maintenance of norms and standards, accreditation, funding of priority areas, monitoring and evaluation, maintaining parity of certification and awards and ensuring coordinated and integrated development of technical and management education.” As such, the onus for ensuring integrated development of technical education in the country and funding of priority areas lie with AICTE. The declining trend in the allocations made by AICTE for Research and Institutional Development (RID) Schemes is a matter of serious concern to the Committee. The Committee, therefore, recommend that AICTE should draw up a long term plan for accelerated Research & Development in the field of technical and management education. They also recommend that allocations for RID

Schemes should be suitably increased and more number of institutions be encouraged to undertake research in technical education in the country.

Redressal of Grievances of Lady Officers

Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 23, Para No. 8.23)

1.14 Taking note the complaints made by women employees working in AICTE, the Committee had recommended as under:-

“The Committee are distressed to learn that some lady officers working in AICTE were subjected to sexual and mental harassment by certain senior officer in AICTE. Though an Internal Complaints Committee was constituted by AICTE at the direction of the National Commission for Women (NCW), it is learnt that the Committee was ineffective and unresponsive as it was not impartial. The Committee recommend that the Ministry of Human Resource Development should constitute an Enquiry Committee comprising of lady members to look into the entire episode and initiate disciplinary action against the person concerned, if found guilty. The Committee are of the view that such instances will have an unholy effect on the institution and also denigrate the prestige of the institution.”

1.15 In the action taken reply, the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Secondary and Higher Education) has stated as under:-

“The AICTE will ensure protection and redressal of grievances of women employees through appropriate measures.”

1.16 The Committee express their displeasure at the manner in which a specific recommendation made by the Committee on a very sensitive issue like sexual and mental harassment of women employees by a senior officer in AICTE has been dealt with. The matter was brought to the notice of the Committee during examination of the subject. It was also pointed out that an Internal Complaints Committee constituted by AICTE on the directions of the National Commission for Women was not effective and responsive to the problem as it did not function impartially. It was after considering these factors that the Committee had recommended that the Ministry of Human Resources Development should constitute an Enquiry Committee comprising of lady members to look into the entire episode and initiate disciplinary action against the officer concerned, if he is found guilty. The Committee deplore the inaction on the part of the Ministry despite the recommendation made by them. The Committee, therefore, desire that a proper inquiry be conducted into the episode and the guilty be punished. The Committee would like to be apprised of the findings of the enquiry and the action taken thereon. They also desire

that in order to investigate the matters of harassment of women employees, a permanent Committee should be constituted by AICTE.

Management Courses to be looked after by a separate body

Observation/Recommendation (Sl.No. 25, Para No. 8.25)

1.17 Stressing on the need to set up a separate body to look after management courses, the Committee had recommended as under:-

“According to the AICTE Act, the main objectives and functions of AICTE are to ensure planned and coordinated development of technical education, promotion of qualitative improvement and regulation and proper maintenance of norms and standards in the area of technical education. Since management education is entirely different from technical education and also given the fact that AICTE is over-burdened with the work relating to granting of approval, recognition, accreditation of programmes of technical education, etc. the Committee are of the considered view that AICTE should be divested of the responsibility relating to grant of approval and recognition to management courses. The powers relating to grant of approval and recognition of management courses and programmes and their regulation should, therefore, be entrusted to a separate body.”

1.18 In the action taken reply, the Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Secondary and Higher Education) has stated as under:-

“As per the AICTE Act, 1987 the definition of technical education includes management education. However, in view of the Estimates Committee’s recommendation, the Government has decided to consult the major stakeholders on the issue.”

1.19 The Committee note that AICTE was established in 1945 keeping in view the need for planning technical education on all India basis and to ensure uniform and speedy growth of technical education for bringing about necessary industrial development. Primarily the role of AICTE is to promote technical education throughout the country, maintain high standards and constantly update course curricula in consonance with rapid developments in the fields of science and technology and teaching standards. It is a fact that as per the AICTE Act, 1987 the definition of technical education includes management education also . However, with the recent growth in the number of institutions imparting technical education and expansion of operations of AICTE, the Council is over-burdened with the work relating to granting of approval, recognition, accreditation, etc. In view of these factors, the Committee had recommended that AICTE should be divested of the responsibility relating to granting of approval, recognition, accreditation, etc. of management courses. The Committee stress that the recommendation should be given due weightage and considered at the highest level before arriving at a

conclusion. The Committee would like to be apprised of the decision taken in the matter.

Implementation of Recommendations

1.20 The Committee would like to emphasise that they attach greatest importance to the implementation of recommendations accepted by the Government. They would, therefore, urge that the Government should keep a close watch so as to ensure expeditious implementation of the recommendations accepted by them. In case it is not possible to implement the recommendations in letter and spirit for any reason, the matter should be reported to the Committee with reasons for non-implementation.

1.21 The Committee desire that replies in respect of the recommendations contained in Chapter V of the Report may be finalised and final replies of the Government furnished to the Committee within three months from the date of presentation of the Report.

**MINUTES OF SITTING OF THE ESTIMATES COMMITTEE
(2004-2005)**

SIXTH SITTING

The Committee sat on Thursday, the 14th October, 2004 from 1100 to 1200 hours.

Present

Shri C. Kuppusami - Chairman

Members

2. Shri Anant Gudhe
3. Shri Sunil Kumar Mahato
4. Shri Sanat Kumar Mandal
5. Shri Zora Singh Mann
6. Shri Prabodh Panda
7. Shri Mahendra Prasad Nishad
8. Shri Harikewal Prasad
9. Shri K.S. Rao
10. Shri Iqbal Ahmed Saradgi
11. Shri Sartaj Singh
12. Shri M.A. Kharabela Swain
13. Shri Vijoy Krishna

Secretariat

1. Smt. P.K. Sandhu - Joint Secretary
2. Shri A.K. Singh - Principal Chief Parliamentary Interpreter
3. Shri Cyril John - Under Secretary
4. Shri M.K. Madhusudhan - Assistant Director

2. The Committee considered and adopted the following draft Reports with/without modifications :-

(i) XX XX XX

(ii) Report on action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the Nineteenth Report of Estimates Committee (13th Lok Sabha) on Ministry of Human Resource Development (Department of Secondary and Higher Education)-‘All India Council for Technical Education’(with minor modification as indicated in the Annexure).

3. The Committee authorized the Chairman to finalise the Reports in the light of modifications and also to make verbal and other consequential changes, if any, arising out of factual verification by the Ministry and present the same to the House.

4. XX XX XX

The Committee then adjourned

ANNEXURE

Modification made by the Estimates Committee in the Draft Report on action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the Nineteenth Report of Estimates Committee (13th Lok Sabha) on Ministry of Human Resource Development(Department of Secondary and Higher Education) – ‘All India Council for Technical Education’

Para No.	Line	Modification
1.21	At the end	For: The Committee.....expeditiously. Read: The Committee desire that replies in respect of the recommendations contained in Chapter V of the Report may be finalised and final replies of the Government furnished to the Committee within three months from the date of presentation of the Report.

APPENDIX II

(Vide Introduction to Report)

ANALYSIS OF THE ACTION TAKEN BY GOVERNMENT ON THE RECOMMENDATIONS CONTAINED IN THE NINETEENTH REPORT OF THE ESTIMATES COMMITTEE (THIRTEENTH LOK SABHA)

(i)	Total Number of Recommendations/Observations	25
(ii)	Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by Government:	
	(Nos. 1, 4, 6 to 12, 15, 20 to 22 and 24)	14
	Percentage	56%
(iii)	Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of Government's reply:	
	NIL	
	Percentage	NIL
(iv)	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which Government's replies have not been accepted by the Committee:	
	(Nos. 16 to 19, 23 and 25)	6
	Percentage	24%
(v)	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of Government are still awaited:	
	(Nos. 2,3,5, 13 and 14)	5
	Percentage	20%