

## **MINISTRY OF TRIBAL AFFAIRS**

### **TRIBAL WELFARE SCHEMES**

[Action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Twenty First Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on Estimates]

### **COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES** **(2013-2014)** **THIRTY FIRST REPORT**

---

**(FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA)**



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT**  
**NEW DELHI**

# **THIRTY FIRST REPORT**

**COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES  
(2013-2014)**

**(FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA)**

**MINISTRY OF TRIBAL AFFAIRS**

## **TRIBAL WELFARE SCHEMES**

[Action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Twenty First Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on Estimates]

**Presented to Hon'ble Speaker, Lok Sabha on 04 January, 2014**

**Presented to Lok Sabha on 05 February, 2014**



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT  
NEW DELHI**

**December, 2013/ Agrahayana, 1935 (Saka)**

## **CONTENTS**

PAGE NO.

COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES (2013-14) (ii)

INTRODUCTION (iii)

CHAPTER I	Report	1
CHAPTER II	Recommendations/observations which have been accepted by the Government	10
CHAPTER III	Recommendations/observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of Government's reply	26
CHAPTER IV	Recommendations/observations in respect of which Government's replies have not been accepted by the Committee	27
CHAPTER V	Recommendations/observations in respect of which final replies of Government are still awaited	33

### **ANNEXURES**

I.	Statement showing the amount released to States/NGOs under the Central Sector Scheme of development of Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups ((PTGs) during 2007-08 to 2012-13	37
II.	State-wise Physical Achievement under CCD plan for XI Plan period	38
III.	Quick Statistics pertaining to STs	45
IV.	List of beneficiary from 2010-11 to 2012-13 as per Physical Progress Report submitted by State Governments	57
V.	Findings of the Independent Evaluation Agency	58
VI.	Findings and Recommendations of the Monitoring Agency in the 1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> Report	63

VII	State-wise information regarding discipline in which Vocational Training is provided by Ministry of Tribal Affairs	68
VIII	List of Vocational Training Centre funded by Ministry of Tribal Affairs.	78
<b>APPENDICES</b>		
I	Minutes of Fifteenth Sitting of the Committee on Estimates held on 23.10.2013.	80
II	Minutes of Second Sitting of the Study Group of the Committee on Estimates held on 18.12.2013.	83
III	Minutes of Twenty First Sitting of the Committee on Estimates held on 18.12.2013	85
IV	Analysis of the action taken by Government on the recommendations/observations contained in the Twenty First Report of Committee on Estimates (Fifteenth Lok Sabha)	87

## **COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES (2013-14)**

**Shri Francisco Sardinha - Chairman**

### **MEMBERS**

- 2 Smt. Harsimrat Kaur Badal
- 3 Smt. Bijoya Chakravarty
- 4 Shri Harish Chaudhary
- 5 Shri Khagen Das
- 6 Shri Pralhad Joshi
- 7 Shri Bapi Raju Kanumuru
- 8 Shri Chandrakant Khaire
- 9 Dr. Thokchom Meinya
- 10 Dr. Sanjeev Ganesh Naik
- 11 Kum. Meenakshi Natrajan
- 12 Shri Prabodh Panda
- 13 Dr. Vinay Kumar Pandey "Vinnu"
- 14 Shri Jagdish Singh Rana
- 15 Shri R. Sambasiva Rao
- 16 Shri Subodh Kant Sahai
- 17 VACANT
- 18 Shri S. Semmalai
- 19 Shri Arjun Charan Sethi
- 20 Shri M.I. Shanavas
- 21 Shri Adhi Sankar
- 22 Shri Rajiv Ranjan (Lalan) Singh
- 23 Shri Neeraj Shekhar
- 24 Shri Ganesh Singh
- 25 Shri Ijyaraj Singh
- 26 Shri Jagada Nand Singh
- 27 Shri Radha Mohan Singh
- 28 Smt. Annu Tandon
- 29 Shri Mukul Wasnik
- 30 Shri Om Prakash Yadav

### **SECRETARIAT**

1. Shri A. Louis Martin - Joint Secretary
2. Smt. Anita B. Panda - Director
3. Shri Srinivasulu Gunda - Additional Director
4. Shri U. C. Bharadwaj - Deputy Secretary
5. Shri Ajitesh Singh - Committee Officer

## **INTRODUCTION**

I, the Chairman of Committee on Estimates (2013-14) having been authorized by the Committee to present the Report on their behalf, present this Thirty First Report on action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Twenty First Report of the Committee (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) on 'Tribal Welfare Schemes' pertaining to the Ministry of Tribal Affairs.

2. The Twenty-First Report of the Committee (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) was presented to Lok Sabha on 23 April, 2013. The Ministry of Tribal Affairs furnished their replies indicating action taken on the recommendations contained in the Twenty First Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) on 21 October, 2013. As replies given by the Ministry to a number of recommendations/ observations were not specific, the Committee held discussion with the representatives of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs on 23 October, 2013. Further, subsequent to this supplementary replies on a number of Recommendations were furnished by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs on 21 November, 2013. The draft report was considered and approved on 18 December, 2013 by the Study Group of the Committee on Estimates, constituted to consider the action taken replies furnished by the Government. Thereafter, the Report was adopted by the Committee on the same day.

3. An analysis of action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Twenty First Report of Committee on Estimates (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) is given in Appendix III.

**NEW DELHI;**  
**19 December, 2013**  
**Agrahayana 28 ,1935(Saka)**

**FRANCISCO SARDINHA,**  
**CHAIRMAN,**  
**COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES.**

## **CHAPTER - I**

### **REPORT**

This Report of the Committee deals with the action taken by the Government on the Recommendations/Observations contained in the Twenty First Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) on the subject 'Tribal Welfare Schemes' pertaining to the Ministry of Tribal Affairs.

1. 2. The Committee's Twenty First Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) was presented to Lok Sabha on 23.04.2012. It contained 19 Recommendations/ Observations. Action Taken Notes in respect of all the Recommendations / Observations were received from the Ministry of Tribal Affairs on 21.10.2013. As replies given by the Ministry to a number of recommendations/ observations were not specific, the Committee held discussion with the representatives of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs on 23.10.2013. Thereafter, Ministry of Tribal Affairs furnished written replies on 21.11.2013 to the specific points raised by the Committee.

1.3 Replies to the Recommendations / observations contained in the Report have broadly been categorized as under:

- (i) Recommendations/Observations that have been accepted by the Government  
Sl. No. 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 9, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18 & 19

(Total 12)

(Chapter-II)

- (ii) Recommendation/Observation which the Committee do not desire to pursue  
in view of the Government's reply

Nil

(Total Nil)

(Chapter-III)

(iii) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee

Sl. No. 1, 8, 12 & 13

(Total 4)

(Chapter IV)

(iv) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of the Government are still awaited

Sl. No. 4, 10 & 11

(Total 3)

(Chapter V)

**1.4 The Committee desire that response to comments contained in Chapter-1 and final replies to the recommendations contained in Chapter V of this Report should be furnished expeditiously.**

1.5. The Committee will now deal with the action taken by the Government on some of their recommendations.

**A. Delay in formulation of a Comprehensive National Policy for Tribals.**

**Recommendation / Observation (Sl. no. 1)**

1.6 Pointing out that socio economic status of Scheduled tribes had not improved to the desired level despite existence of Constitutional provisions and Statutes for upliftment of tribal population, the Committee had recommended that the National Policy for Scheduled Tribes, being formulated by the Ministry, should be drawn up expeditiously and specific targets and time lines drawn for socio economic development of tribal population.



1.7. The Ministry of Tribal Affairs, in its action taken reply dated 21.10.2013, stated *inter-alia* that earlier attempts on policy formulation appeared inadequate to meet the challenges facing STs. In the meantime several measures like the Scheduled Tribes and Other Traditional Forest Dwellers (Recognition of Forest Rights) Act, 2006, the Food Securities Act, 2013, Right to Fair Compensation and Transparency in Land Acquisition, Rehabilitation and Resettlement Act, 2013 etc. have been enacted. Hence, the policy formulation process is going on through consultation with experts. Once, the consultation process is over, it would be kept in the public domain seeking further views / objections before its finalizing.

1.8. As the Ministry's reply was silent on the Committee's recommendation for expeditious formulation of National Tribal Policy and specifying targets and drawing up of timelines for socio economic development of tribal population, the Ministry were asked to furnish specific replies to the same. Accordingly, the Ministry *vide* their OM dated 21.11.2013, provided further information as under:

"Comments/views from the members of the Expert Group constituted by this Ministry have been received for revision of the draft National Tribal Policy. A meeting to discuss the various aspects of the draft National Tribal Policy under the Chairmanship of the Hon'ble Minister for Tribal Affairs was held with the members of the Expert Group. In the meantime the Government has constituted a High Level Committee (HLC) in August, 2013 to process a position paper on the present socio-economic, health and educations status of STs and suggest a way forward. The Committee has to submit its report within nine months. The report would have bearing on the tribal policy. Hence, the National Tribal Policy will be finalized taking into consideration the recommendations of the High Level Committee (HLC)."

**1.9. The Committee had recommended that a National Policy for Scheduled Tribes should be drawn up expeditiously and specific targets and timelines drawn for socio-economic development of tribal population. The Ministry of Tribal Affairs, initially**

informed in the action taken reply that the policy formulation is going on through consultation with experts. The Committee were informed in a subsequent reply that the Government has constituted a High Level Committee (HLC) in August, 2013, to process a position paper on the present socio-economic, health and educational status of STs and suggest a way forward. The HLC is expected to submit its report within nine months. The Ministry of Tribal Affairs has neither given the composition of the HLC nor has given the rationale for giving nine months time to process a position paper. It is strange that the Ministry of Tribal Affairs which has been in existence for the last one and half decade had not bothered to ascertain the status of STs and woken up to ascertain their status only after the Committee's exhortation for expeditious formulation of a tribal policy. This reflects poorly on the functioning of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs. The Committee hope that the HLC will complete the task within the given time. The Committee urge that there should be no further delay in formulation of the policy on receipt of report from HLC.

#### **B. Measures required to improve the functioning of Ashram Schools**

##### **Observation/ Recommendation (Sl.no. 8)**

1.10. As there was no Ashram Schools in Left Wing Extremism (LWE) effected districts of Andhra Pradesh, the Committee had recommended the Government for considering the possibility of setting up of an Ashram School in Paderu near Vishakhapatnam. With a view to improving the functioning of Ashram Schools, the Committee had recommended that the Ministry of Tribal Affairs should take up with the State Governments of Gujarat, Uttarakhand, Madhya Pradesh, Karnataka and Uttar Pradesh, the question of filling up of the vacant teacher posts of the Ashram Schools located in these States. Further, the Committee had also recommended that there should be sufficient incentives to attract teachers to work in schools in tribal areas. To address the shortage of teachers in ashram Schools, the Committee had suggested appointment of qualified teachers on ad

hoc basis, subject to clearing the Teacher eligibility test within 5 years of joining and regularization thereafter. The Committee had also desired remedial measures after ascertaining the reasons for low enrolment of students in ashram schools in Madhya Pradesh, and Chhattisgarh.

1.11. The Ministry of Tribal Affairs, in its action taken reply, have stated *inter alia* that despite so many Ashram Schools having been sanctioned to the State Governments of Madhya Pradesh (242 Ashram Schools) and Chhattisgarh (134 Ashram Schools), the number of students enrolled remained comparatively low primarily because sizeable number of the sanctioned Ashram Schools are still remaining incomplete for various reasons viz. problems in acquisition of land, incomplete tendering process, inhospitable terrain, Left Wing Extremism and inadequate number of teachers/ teachers who can teach in the local language. Further, the State Governments were being repeatedly requested to adhere to the time schedules for completing construction. Some State Governments have also issued suitable directives to ensure that adequate number of teachers are appointed from among the locals.

**1.12 The action taken reply furnished by the Ministry does not contain any specific response to the Committee's recommendations regarding (i) setting up of Ashram School in Paderu near Vishakhapatnam in Andhra Pradesh, (ii) filling up of vacancies of teachers, (iii) provision of incentives to teachers to work in schools in tribal areas; and (iv) appointment of teachers on ad hoc basis initially and regularizing them at a later date subject to fulfilling specified conditions. The Committee reiterate that action on these aspects should be taken without delay and the Committee be informed of the position.**

**C. Policy on Integration of Jarawa Tribe with the main Society**

**Observation/ Recommendation (Sl.no. 11)**

1.13 According to the 'Policy on Jarawa Tribe of Andaman Islands, 2004', no attempts will be made to bring them to the mainstream society against their conscious will. The Committee felt that no community should be deprived of the benefits of economic development and desired to know whether any efforts were made to ascertain the will of Jarawas regarding their integration with the main society, and if so, when and with what results.

1.14 The Ministry of Tribal Affairs, in its action taken replies, has stated that as per recommendation of the "Expert Committee under the Chairpersonship of Secretary, Tribal Affairs for preparation of policies for various PTGs of A&N Islands", the A&N Administration, vide letter dated 23-7-2013 had furnished a project study report carried out by experts namely, Prof. Vishwajit Pandya and Shri Manish Chandy and Director (TW), A&NI and Officers of AAJVS titled 'A Fieldwork Based Report - Jarawa Movements in relation to time and space'. The Ministry has further stated that the A&N Administration had also informed that the second phase of the work on the Jarawa study would be carried out to access the freewill of the tribe. This work is expected to be completed by the end of March, 2014. After receipt of the report of the second phase of the work, the issue will be examined. Moreover, the A&N Administration is carrying out ethnographic study to understand the Jarawa issues and forwarded research report entitled "Kangapo" (Stitched Garment in Jarawa Language) prepared by Prof. Dr. Vishwajit Pandya, the Expert Member of Andaman Admi Janjati Vikas Samiti (AAJVS). The Research Advisory Board of Andaman Nicobar Tribal Research & Training Institute in its meetings held on 23<sup>rd</sup> & 24<sup>th</sup> August, 2013 carefully evaluated the report and recommended for its implementation by A&NI Administration. The strategy for

implementation of the recommendations of the report is to be addressed by A&N Administration.

**1.15 The Committee are glad to note that a project study report titled “A Fieldwork based Report-Jarawa Movement in relation to time and space” has been submitted in July, 2013 and the second phase of the work on the Jarawa study will be carried out to assess the freewill of the tribe (as to their integration with the main Society) as recommended by the Committee. The work is expected to be completed by March, 2014. The Committee will await the outcome of the study.**

#### **D. Special Central Assistance to Tribal Sub Plan (SCA to TSP)**

##### **Observation/ Recommendation (sl. no. 12)**

1.16 The Committee, in their original report, expressing concern over the lack of data as to what was achieved out of the funds given under the scheme “Special Central Assistance to Tribal Sub Plan”, had desired that the Ministry of Tribal Affairs must develop a system of compiling State-wise information regarding achievements under this scheme. The Committee further desired to be apprised of the outcome at least for the last two years.

1.17 The Ministry of Tribal Affairs, in its action taken reply, merely stated as under:

“ As per the progress reports submitted by State Governments, the total no. of ST beneficiaries for which funds were released under SCA to TSP during last two years is 18,59,504 (individuals) and 8,08,212 (families) (approximately), respectively as per the list enclosed at **Annex- I.**”

**1.18 The Committee had desired development of compiling State-wise information regarding achievements under Special Central Assistance (SCA) to Tribal Sub Plan. The Government's reply merely provides the number of beneficiaries during last two years which received financial assistance under the scheme. What the Committee desired was the impact on the livelihood/living conditions of the Scheduled Tribes as a result of the assistance extended under the SCA to Tribal Sub Plan. The Committee would expect the Ministry of Tribal Affairs to evolve a system to assess the impact of its schemes and the Committee be informed of the outcome.**

#### **E. Grants under Article 275 (1) of the Constitution of India**

##### **Observation/Recommendation (sl. no. 13)**

1.19 Taking note of the fact that the Ministry of Tribal Affairs do not have details of outcome of funding extended under Special Area Programmes – Grant under Article 275(1) of the Constitution of India, the Committee urged the Ministry to periodically collect details of work done under the Programme for information of the Parliament.

1.20 The Ministry, in its action taken reply, have only provided the procedure under the scheme *as* under:

“Under the programme, Grants are released to 26 States, having ST population for raising the level of Administration in Scheduled Areas and for the welfare of tribal people. Funds are released to States based on proposals received from the State Governments depending on the felt needs of ST population to bridge the gap in infrastructure activities in sectors like roads, bridges, education, health and irrigation etc. and for setting up of Eklavya Model Residential Schools (EMRSs). State Governments submit Proposals and Progress Report in prescribed format in which activities are mentioned for which funds have been released and used.

Further, guidelines clearly mention indicative type of activities for which funds may be released.”

**1.21 The Ministry of Tribal Affairs has not bothered to take action as recommended by the Committee to collect details of outcome/assessment of the impact of the grants given under Article 275(1) of the Constitution of India. The Committee take a serious exception to the casual manner in which their recommendation has been handled by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs. The Committee urge the Secretary, Tribal Affairs to personally look into the matter and ensure that appropriate methods and systems are developed to assess the impact of the funds given by the Ministry under different schemes and the Committee be informed of the outcome.**

## **CHAPTER – II**

### **RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT**

#### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 2)**

The Committee observes that there are ten Central Sector Schemes, five centrally sponsored Schemes and two Special Area Programmes which are implemented by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs for the welfare and development of Scheduled Tribes. The Committee find that there has been gross under-utilisation of Plan Expenditure particularly, during the years 2008-09 and 2009-10. The shortfall in utilisation of Plan allocation was as much as ₹ 1208 crore in 2009-10 and ₹ 315 crore in 2008-09. Though there has been marked improvement in utilisation of funds in the subsequent years, the Committee cannot brush aside the Ministry's past lapses which impacted the welfare of tribal people. The under-utilisation came down to ₹68.50 crore in 2010-11 and ₹ 101 crore in 2011-12. The Committee hope that the Ministry of Tribal Affairs will learn from past failures and improve its performance through innovative measures. Non-receipt of utilisation certificates and shortcomings in project proposals of State Governments have been cited as the reasons for under utilisation of funds. The Committee feel that these problems can be overcome through e-Governance both at the Centre and States and periodical co-ordination meetings through video-conferencing. The Committee, in this connection, recommend that the Central Plan Scheme Monitoring System (CPSMS) initiated by the Comptroller General of Accounts should be fully implemented expeditiously which would provide online information of fund deployment/utilisation vertically under each scheme down to the implementing agencies.

#### **Reply of the Government**

The Central Plan Scheme Monitoring System (CPSMS) initiated by the Comptroller General of Accounts is already implemented in the Ministry.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated 21.10.2013]**



### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 3)**

The Committee observe that Budgetary allocation for the Scheme 'Vocational Training Centers in Tribal Areas' has varied between ₹ 8 crore and ₹ 13.72 Crore during each of the last five years. However, even this allocation was not fully utilized in any year. The utilisation was abysmally low in the year 2009-10 which stood at ₹ 2 crore as against the budgetary target of ₹ 13.72 crore. Even the success rate of students under 'Coaching for STs' scheme relating to 07 coaching centers during 2009-10 was just 27.8 per cent i.e only 96 out of 345 students were successful in competitive examinations. Considering the poor performance of this scheme, the Committee would like the Ministry to evaluate the scheme with a view to making it effective and result-oriented.

### **Reply of the Government**

While the Scheme for Vocational Training in Tribal Areas will be subsumed in the Umbrella Scheme for education of Tribal children, its fundamental nature is set to change. The country has recently seen a major shift in the way vocational education and training are perceived, and MHRD has formulated a National Vocational Education Qualifications Framework (NVEQF). The objective is to set common principles and guidelines for a nationally recognized qualification system covering secondary schools, vocational education institutes and institutes of higher education with qualifications ranging from secondary to doctorate level, leading to international recognition of national standards.

Accordingly, under the proposed Umbrella Scheme on Education of ST children, while the component of vocational education will be taken care of in the Ashram Schools, support will be provided for work education at the elementary stage, and vocational education at the secondary stage in all Ashram Schools established/sanctioned with financial support from MoTA subject to the condition that the NVEQF norms are adhered to.

The schemes implemented by NGOs were subject to concurrent monitoring and evaluation by an independent external agency. During the first year, 6 projects of

Vocational Training Centres and 8 projects of Coaching Centres ST were covered. At Vocational Training Centres, 50% of the respondents interviewed said that the project was a good programme to earn livelihood and the other half said that it bestowed a sense of pride among the STs. Similarly, in the second year of monitoring, 5 projects of Vocational Training Centres and 2 projects of Coaching Centres for STs were covered. It was found that better machines and equipment for training are required. In terms of infrastructure it is required that the number of rooms should be increased.

The observations of the monitoring agency have been sent to the concerned State Governments and NGOs.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated 21.10.2013]**

### **Subsequent reply of the Government**

“The scheme of Vocational Training in Tribal Areas is intended to be implemented through State Governments as well as NGOs. The State-wise information regarding disciplines in which vocational training is provided by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs and number of beneficiaries in each trades is given at **Annex- VII**

This is a demand-driven scheme and at present grants-in-aid is being provided to nine NGOs only. The trades in which vocational training is provided are selected by the implementing agency as per the employment potential of the areas. Further, the Vocational Training Centre (VTC) is required to be recognized/affiliated under Modular Employable Skills (MES) from Regional Directorate of Apprenticeship Training of the State/UT Government, or under Craftsmen Training Scheme (CTS) from National Council of Vocational Training (NCVT) under Directorate General of Employment & Training (Ministry of Labour and Employment). The Authority who gives the recognition/affiliation also approves the trades of the Vocational Training Centre. The details of Vocational Training Centres (VTC) along with the name of trades in which Vocational Training is provided is at **Annex- VIII**.

(ii) The State Governments are required to submit physical and financial progress with regard to previous grants, before further grants under the scheme of Vocational Training in Tribal Areas are released to them

The grants-in-aid is considered based on the Inspection Report of the District Collector and recommendation of the State Level Committee. The Utilization Certificate (UC) and physical progress report of earlier releases is ensured before further release.

Each of the VTCs are required to provide the list of beneficiaries. The work of the concurrent monitoring of these projects was given to an independent external agency. Where scheme specific observations are made, the funds are released subject to compliance report from the State Government.

All the sanction orders are uploaded in the website of this Ministry.

The accounts of grantee institutions are open for inspection by representatives/officers from the office of Comptroller and Auditor General of India, Government of India, or concerned State Government at any time.

(iii) The Ministry has awarded the work of evaluation of the scheme to an external agency, Development Research Services (P) Ltd. (DRS). It is submitted that efforts of Voluntary Organisations in the area of Skill Development is a very small component”.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated  
21.11.2013]**

#### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 5)**

The Committee note from the deposition of the Ministry that the Scheme of ‘Top Class Education for ST Students’, introduced from the year 2007-08 with 625 scholarships per year is stated to have never achieved the targets in any year. The maximum figure reached was 425 scholarships in 2011-12. Parents’ income ceiling of ₹ 2 lakh per annum prescribed under the Scheme is said to be the reason for poor performance of the Scheme. The Committee have been informed that a proposal to raise the income ceiling to ₹ 4.5 lakh per annum is under consideration. The Committee urge that a decision on the proposal be taken without delay with a view to achieving the objective of the scheme.

### **Reply of the Government**

The proposal for raising parental income ceiling from ₹2 lakh to ₹4.5 lakh per annum in this scheme has already been considered by the Cabinet in its meeting held on 11<sup>th</sup> July, 2013.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated 21.10.2013]**

### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 6)**

Scheme of National Overseas Scholarships (NOS) provides financial assistance to meritorious students belonging to STs for pursuing higher studies abroad in specified fields of Master level courses, Ph.D. and Post-Doctoral research programmes, in the field of Engineering, Technology and Science. The Committee note that the scheme provides for award of 15 scholarships annually covering tuition fee, maintenance grant, travel expenses for pursuing higher studies abroad, in specified fields of Master level courses and above, and four annual "Passage Grants" to such candidates who are in receipt of merit scholarship without passage grant. However, the number of awardees of scholarship has never crossed 10 and passage grant has never been awarded to anyone. Admission criteria abroad, being very stringent, are stated to be the reason for shortfall in grant of scholarships.

The Committee feel that given that there is a separate scheme for coaching of ST students to compete in competitive examinations, hopefully the number of ST students getting admission abroad for higher studies will go up. What appears to be lacking is awareness about the schemes of Ministry of Tribal Affairs among ST students. There is need for adequate publicity about the scholarship/coaching schemes in all universities and colleges having Engineering/ Technology/ Science disciplines and also through electronic media to reach the targeted beneficiaries.

### **Reply of the Government**

The Ministry is in the process of revising the Scheme for continuation during 12<sup>th</sup> Plan Period and that some of the suggestions of NIRD viz., wide publicity among universities through advertisement, coaching facility for TOEFL/GRE/ GMAT, revision of scholarship amount etc. are being incorporated in the Scheme guidelines. In the SFC meeting a number of decisions have already been taken to make the Scheme more attractive so as to draw more applicants. The decisions so taken inter-alia include letters to be sent to all the National institutions and Central Universities for having the Scheme details posted on their notice boards. This will be over and above the established practice of advertising the Scheme in the leading dailies, Employment News and hosting on the Ministry's web-site.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated 21.10.2013]**

### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 7)**

The Committee note that the new scheme of 'Pre-Matric Scholarship for ST Students', for which ₹50 crore was allocated in 2011-12, was not implemented during the year due to delay in getting approval for the scheme. The scheme is targeted to benefit 22 lakh students. The Committee would like to be apprised of the actual number of beneficiaries under the scheme during 2012-13.

The Committee are shocked to note that Pre-Matric Scholarship is provided only to Class IX and above Scheduled Tribes students.

### **Reply of the Government**

During the year 2012-13, the actual number of beneficiaries under the scheme of 'Pre-Matric Scholarship for ST Students' was 20.12 lakhs.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated 21.10.2013]**

### **Subsequent reply of the Government**

(i) The Pre-Matric Scholarship is a newly launched scheme during 2012-13 w.e.f. 01-07-2012. The objective of the Scheme is to support ST students for education in Classes IX and X so that the incidence of dropout, especially in transition from the elementary to secondary and during secondary stage of education, is minimized and to improve enrolment of ST students in Classes IX and X so that they perform well and have a better chance of progressing to Post-Matric stages of education.

(ii) In view of limited resources of this Ministry, at present there is no such proposal under contemplation. However, the enactment of the Right to Education Act now provides the right to free and compulsory education to children from the age of 6 to 14 year including ST children.

(iii) The proposals of the State Govt./UT Administrations are based on 'Anticipated Expenditure and coverage of students' and as such, target is fixed tentatively.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated 21.11.2013]**

### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 9)**

The Committee are unhappy to note that only 15 States/UT out of 18 having identified Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups (PTGs) have received funds under this scheme during the last four years. The Committee are perturbed to note that Andaman & Nicobar Islands having considerable PTGs did not receive any fund for three years and received just ₹ 1.84 crore for one year during 2010-11. Similarly, Uttarakhand and West Bengal also did not receive any fund under this scheme during the last three years. It appears that it is entirely left to the States/UT to prepare Conservation-cum-Development (CCD) Plan for availing proportionate flow of resources under the scheme. Consequently, six States have not prepared the CCD Plans for implementation during XII Plan. The Committee feel that the Ministry of Tribal Affairs should be pro-active and ensure CCD Plans are prepared by all States/UT in time. The Committee would like to be apprised of the outcome of CCD plans during the XI Plan period.

### **Reply of the Government**

Conservation-cum-Development (CCD) Plans are prepared by each State/UT for five year plan period, aimed at planning the socio-economic development of the PTG population in a holistic manner by adopting habitat development approach and intervening in all spheres of their social and economic life so that the quality of life of PTGs is improved and visible impact is made. This scheme gives flexibility by allowing every State/UT to concentrate on areas that they consider is relevant to their PTGs and their socio-economic environment.

The CCD plans are examined by an Expert Committee under the chairpersonship of Secretary (Tribal Affairs).

During the 12<sup>th</sup> Plan, all the concerned States/UT have submitted their CCD plan. The plans were discussed (except Manipur & Uttarakhand) by the Expert Committee. Plans of Six States/UT (Andaman & Nicobar, Bihar, West Bengal, Bihar, Uttar Pradesh and Uttarakhand) were not approved by the Expert Committee and were asked to submit the revised proposals. Andaman & Nicobar, Uttar Pradesh and Uttarakhand have submitted the revised proposals. This Ministry is making continuous efforts to expedite the pending CCD plans from the State Governments. The State Governments have been addressed in this regard periodically in review meetings taken up with the Principal Secretaries/Secretaries of States.

The status of financial releases during the 11<sup>th</sup>& 12<sup>th</sup> Plan Period is at **Annex-I**.

During the XI Plan period, infrastructure like road connectivity, housing, irrigation etc has been developed. Educational, medical and drinking water facility has also been extended. In some states, lands have been provided to the landless PTGs. They are also covered under the Janashree Bima Yojana. Physical progress report of various State Governments is at **Annex-II**.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated 21.10.2013]**

### **Subsequent reply of the Government**

“Proposal for CCD Plans were submitted by all concerned States/UTs. As per the modalities, representatives of Manipur and Uttar Pradesh were also to be present in the meeting to put up their proposals and discuss. However, as there were no representatives of these two States, their proposals could not be discussed in the meeting.

Subsequently, Joint Secretary, MoTA, had a meeting with Addl. Chief Secretary, Manipur, and thereafter Government of Manipur had submitted their revised CCD plan. The plan was examined and Chairperson of the Expert Committee approved the plan. Accordingly, ₹ 1.00 crore was released to the Government of Manipur during the year 2012-13.

The CCD Plan of Uttarakhand had been discussed by the Expert Committee and a sum of ₹ 4.00 crore was released to State Government of Uttarakhand for undertaking priority activities/work proposed in the CCD Plan for Development of Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups for the year 2012-13.

In fact, the CCD Plan of Uttar Pradesh had not been discussed, and inadvertently, instead of “Uttar Pradesh”, “Uttarakhand” was mentioned in the Action Taken Report. The proposal received from Government of Uttar Pradesh was examined and the State was asked to submit a revised proposal based on base line survey. The revised proposal has been received on 30.10.2013 and is being examined.”

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated 21.11.2013]**

### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 14)**

The Committee observe that under the Grants-in-aid to Tribal Research Institutes (TRIs), at present there are 18 Tribal Research Institutes located in 18 States/UT. It is observed from the data contained in the Ministry’s Annual Report that four TRIs including the one in Andaman & Nicobar Islands have not received any Grants-in-aid from the Centre for the past five years. Himachal Pradesh and Maharashtra did not receive fund under the scheme for four out of five years. Given this state of affairs, one more TRI is reportedly being set up in Uttarakhand. The Ministry of Tribal Affairs have also now identified TRIs of Odisha, Maharashtra, Madhya Pradesh and Assam as



“Nodal TRIs” with a mandate to provide policy inputs, among other things. The Committee feel that it is high time that the Ministry of Tribal Affairs review the causes for as many as six TRIs not receiving funds from the centre and how these TRIs are run in the absence of Central funds. The Committee would await the outcome of the review and the action taken thereon.

### **Reply of the Government**

The Ministry has reviewed the scheme to ensure effectiveness and smooth functioning of the TRIs. As per the proposed scheme, Grant-in-Aid to TRIs will be a Central Sector Scheme. Other features of the revised scheme include:-

- (i) TRIs would work in collaboration with Nodal TRIs, the Centres of Excellence and Universities/ institutions in place of working in isolation.
- (ii) Training programmes undertaken by the TRIs would be linked with Grants under Article 275(1).
- (iii) Capacity building and skill up gradation of Gram Sabha, Gram Panchayats in collaboration with State Level Training Institutes and linkage with programme undertaken by the Ministry of Rural Development and Panchayati Raj.
- (iv) TRIs would undertake research work according to their core competency.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated 21.10.2013]**

### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 15)**

To assess the impact of the programmes conducted by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs, third party monitoring and independent evaluation has been initiated by the Ministry. The Committee have been informed that the work of third party monitoring and integrated evaluation of the schemes of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs run through NGO Projects have been outsourced for a three year period from 2010-11 to 2012-13. It has

been stated that the preliminary report of the third party monitoring and evaluation would be ready by March 2013 and final report by March 2014. The Committee would like to be apprised of the findings of the preliminary report and action taken thereon.

### **Reply of the Government**

Evaluation – An evaluation report has been received for the purpose the Expenditure Finance Committee (EFC) memo of the schemes. The observations have been included in the Expenditure Finance Committee Memo for the XII Plan period and the scheme guidelines. A brief of the preliminary evaluation report is at **Annex-V**. State Governments are addressed in this regard.

Monitoring - The schemes implemented by NGOs are subject to concurrent monitoring by an independent external agency. The main objectives are:

1. Monitoring of Physical and financial performance
2. Ascertaining of the compliance of guidelines by stakeholders
3. Ascertaining value, utilization, and effectiveness of services rendered and assets created if any, under the scheme(s)
4. Understanding the sustainability of services rendered and assets created and its implication on success of activities chosen under the schemes.

The methodology, coverage, sampling, scoring and recommendations etc. are at **Annex-VI**. The first and second monitoring reports have been received. The final monitoring report is awaited.

The independent agency in their report has raised actionable points. Some of the actionable points are generic where as some are scheme specific. The issues have been communicated to the State Governments/NGOs for sending compliance report. Releases to funds to these NGOs are being considered (in case of scheme specific actionable points) only on receipt of satisfactory compliance report from the concerned State Government.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated  
21.10.2013]**

### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 16)**

In Committee's view, monitoring of Tribal Welfare Programmes left much to be desired. At the instance of the Committee, the Ministry of Tribal Affairs took up with the Ministry of Rural Development, which is stated to have agreed that all the programmes of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs shall be reviewed by District level Vigilance and Monitoring Committees (V & MCs). The Committee, however, regret to note that action to put in place a co-ordination mechanism to effectuate monitoring by V & MCs is yet to be taken. Hence, V&MCs have not undertaken any review of programmes of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs so far. The Committee urge the Ministry of Tribal Affairs to take necessary action in this regard and ensure that reviews of the Ministry's programmes is undertaken by V&MCs without any further delay.

### **Reply of the Government**

Vigilance and Monitoring Committee (VMCs) of Ministry of Rural Development monitor the programmes of Ministry of Drinking Water & Sanitation, Ministry of Panchayati Raj, Ministry of Tribal Affairs and Rajiv Gandhi Grameen Vidyutikaran Yojana (RGGVY) of Ministry of Power in addition to the programmes of Ministry of Rural Development.

To ensure proper monitoring of programmes of other Ministries by VMCs the Ministry of Rural Development has taken the following measures recently for consideration improvement on this front:-

- (a) All States and UTs have been requested to advise the Member Secretary of all district level VMCs in their State/UT to forward recommendations of the VMCs relating to other Ministries directly to those Ministries for follow up action;
- (b) All State Governments have been requested to instruct Member Secretary of the district level VMCs to, inter-alia, upload proceedings of the meetings on the website of the State Government;
- (c) The district level Vigilance & Monitoring Committees (VMCs) may take up issues with the State Government and if the State Government so desires, may refer

such issues directly to the Union Ministry concerned, in case State Govt. requires intervention of the Union Government.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated 21.10.2013]**

### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 17)**

The Committee note that the Ministry of Tribal Affairs, being the nodal Ministry for the welfare of Scheduled Tribes, has an obligation to institute an effective co-ordination mechanism to ensure programmes of health, sanitation and drinking water, women empowerment, etc., in relation to tribal population are implemented by the concerned Central Ministries effectively. The Committee would like to be informed of the details co-ordination mechanism, system of follow-up and system of resolution of problems evolved by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs in this regard.

### **Reply of the Government**

Coordination Committee has been constituted on 25/27.04.2011 under the Chairmanship of Secretary (TA) and is meeting regularly to monitor the planning and progress of the schemes/programmes being implemented by the line Ministries for the overall development of Scheduled Tribes and also to identify the critical gap and work to bridge the gap. State-wise reviews are being done by conducting workshops and national priorities are being listed out in the Planning Commission's guidelines. Last meeting of Coordination Committee was held on 01.08.2013. Hon'ble Minister for Tribal Affairs has also reviewed the progress in the meeting of Coordination Committee held on 11.03.2013.

In order to have a focused strategy with regard to STs through Tribal Sub Plan (TSP) guidelines issued in respect of State Governments and Central Ministries are being revised by Inter-Ministerial Group in the Planning Commission and revised guideline are likely to be finalized shortly. The revision of guidelines provide for

institutional mechanism required for effective coordination and implementation of TSP and other interventions.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated  
21.10.2013]**

### **Subsequent reply of the Government**

The Planning Commission of India appraises and approves State plan outlays annually including that of Tribal Sub Plan. Planning Commission has constituted an Inter-Ministerial Committee (IMC) to prepared guidelines for effective implementation of the SCSP and TSP Ministry of Tribal Affairs has submitted its recommendations. This Committee has held 4 meetings and revision of guidelines is under consideration of the Planning Commission. No time limit has been intimated by Planning Commission for revision of said guidelines.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated  
21.11.2013]**

### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 18)**

The Committee are distressed to learn that 12.69 lakh titles with an average of about 3.5 acres of land per head have been distributed till 31st August 2012 under the Scheduled Tribes and Other Traditional Forest Dwellers (Recognition of Forest Rights) Act, 2006. Incidence of rejection of claims as on the aforesaid date was also high and stood at around 15 lakh.

The Committee appreciate that in order to ensure effective implementation of the Forest Rights Act, the Ministry of Tribal Affairs issued comprehensive guidelines and amended the rules last year. The Committee would like to know as to what extent, the revision of rules and guidelines have helped expeditious disposal of claims and benefitted the intended beneficiaries.

### **Reply of the Government**

The comprehensive guidelines issued by the Ministry on 12.7.2012 and the Forest Rights Amendment Rules, 2012, notified on 6.9.2012 require the State/ UT Governments to take several actions, like, (i) reconstitution of Forest Rights Committee (FRCs) with atleast two-third members belonging to STs to address the problem of FRCs being dominated by non-tribal people; (ii) reduction in the quorum of Gram Sabha meetings from two-third to a more realistic one-half of all members to avoid adjournment of Gram Sabha meetings for want of quorum; (iii) identification of hamlets or habitation, unrecorded or unsurveyed settlements etc. formally not part of any revenue or forest villages and their inclusion as villages for recognition and vesting of rights in such hamlets/ habitations; (iv) modification of the transit permit regime in relation to transportation of minor forest produce and issue of transit permits by a committee constituted by the Gram Sabha for empowerment of Gram Sabhas; (v) facilitating filing of claims and vesting of habitats rights of the Primitive Vulnerable Tribal Groups (PVTGs) by District Level Committees; (vi) ensuring quarterly meetings of the State Level Monitoring Committees (SLMCs) to monitor the process of recognition and vesting of rights and to take stock of the field level problems; (vii) provision of post claims support and handholding to forest rights holders for their upliftment etc.

In order to explain and discuss the amended Rules and orient the key Departments responsible for the implementation of the Act, the Ministry also organized five regional workshops, nation-wide, during the period September-November, 2012, followed by a National review-cum-orientation meeting with all States on Forest Rights Act, 2006 on 3<sup>rd</sup> December, 2012 at New Delhi, wherein the final Action Plans presented by the States for implementation of the Act were discussed and the State Governments were directed to make special efforts to create awareness about community rights so that more claims are finalized and recognized.

The Ministry is also organizing theme-based consultations across the country on various issues which impeded the implementation of the Forest Rights Act, 2006. A consultation on the theme "Issues in implementation of Community Rights with a focus

on Management and Governance of Community Forest Rights (CFR)” was recently held on 23<sup>rd</sup> and 24<sup>th</sup> September, 2013 at Bhubaneswar. Prior to this, a consultation was also organized at Ranchi to review implementation of the Forest Rights Act, 2006 in LWE affected areas. The Ministry is also proposing to hold two more consultations – one at Gangtok (Sikkim) with focus on “Implementation of Forest Rights Act in North-East” and the second at Gandhinagar (Gujarat) with focus on “Habitats Rights to Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups” during the period October-December, 2013.

As per the information collected from the State/ UT Governments till 30<sup>th</sup> September, 2013, a total number of 35,39,793 claims have been filed and a total number of 14,06,971 titles have been distributed under the Act. Further, 18,299 titles were ready for distribution. A total number of 30, 78,483 claims have been disposed of (86.96%).

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated 21.10.2013]**

### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 19)**

The Committee have been informed that a Central Sector Scheme of Minimum Support Price (MSP) for Minor Forest Produce (MFP) covering 13 items like Tendu, Honey, Wax, is being worked out. The proposed scheme would enable tribals and other forest dwellers to sell their MFPs with assured return. The Committee hope that the scheme will be finalised and implemented expeditiously for the benefit of the intended beneficiaries.

### **Reply of the Government**

The Government has approved a Centrally Sponsored Scheme of “Mechanism for marketing of Minor Forest Produce (MFP) through Minimum Support Price (MSP) and Development of Value Chain for MFP”. To start with, the scheme covers eight States namely, Andhra Pradesh, Maharashtra, Odisha, Chhattisgarh, Madhya Pradesh,

Jharkhand, Rajasthan, and Gujarat for 12 MFP namely, (i) Tendu, (ii) Bamboo, (iii) Mahuwa Seed, (iv) Sal Leaf, (v) Sal Seed, (vi) Lac, (vii) Chironjee, (viii) Wild Honey, (ix) Myrobalan, (x) Tamarind, (xi) Gums (Gum Karaya) and (xii) Karanj, which are not nationalized by the State Government concerned. The scheme seeks to establish a system to ensure fair monetary returns for the MFP collected by the STs and other forest dwelling communities by fixing Minimum Support Price. It also supports primary value-addition of MFP, provide for supply chain infrastructure like cold storage, warehouses etc. and emphasizes on scientific harvesting of MFP.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated 21.10.2013]**

#### **Subsequent reply of the Government**

(i) Procurement and marketing operation of Minor Forest Produce (MFP), according to the scheme, will be undertaken by the agencies designated by the state government concerned. Collectors of MFP are free to sell the produce to the designated states agencies or in the open market.

(ii) The scheme has been launched in the current financial year. Any proposal to include or exclude MFP into the existing list would be made after mid-term assessment and evaluation of the scheme.

(iii) There is no programme/scheme in Ministry of Tribal Affairs to provide compensation to STs who lost their land consequent to the declaration of area as National park/Sanctuaries. The wildlife conservation and 'The Wildlife (Protection) Act, 1972' are allocated subjects of Ministry of Environment and Forests.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated 21.11.2013]**



### **CHAPTER – III**

**RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT  
DESIRE TO PURSUE IN VIEW OF THE GOVERNMENT REPLY**

**NIL**

## **CHAPTER – IV**

### **RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH THE GOVERNMENT'S REPLIES HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE COMMITTEE**

#### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 1)**

The Committee note with concern that though the Scheduled Tribes account for 8.2% of the total population of the country and there are Constitutional provisions and Statutes for upliftment of tribal population, the Committee feel that their socio-economic status has not improved to the desired level. In order to address the multifarious issues concerning Scheduled Tribes, there is a need for National Policy for the Scheduled Tribes. Lately, the Ministry of Tribal Affairs has realised this need and is in the process of formulating a National policy. The Committee desire that the National Policy for Scheduled Tribes should be drawn up expeditiously and specific targets and time lines drawn for socio-economic development of tribal population.

#### **Reply of the Government**

Formation of National Tribal Policy is a complex process. It needs to cater to diversities amongst STs; their uniqueness. The policy prescriptions while helping enhance socio-economic status of STs should help in maintaining their socio-cultural identities and ways of life.

Earlier attempts on policy formulation appeared inadequate to meet the challenges facing STs. In the meantime several measures like the Scheduled Tribes and Other Traditional Forest Dwellers (Recognition of Forest Rights) Act, 2006, the Food Securities Act, 2013, Right to Fair compensation Transparency in Land Acquisition, Rehabilitation and Resettlement Act, 2013 etc. have been enacted. Hence the policy formulation process is going on through consultation with experts. Once, the

consultation process is over, it would be kept in the public domain seeking further views / objections before its finalizing.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated  
21.10.2013]**

### **Subsequent reply of the Government dated**

Comments/views from the members of the Expert Group constituted by this Ministry have been received for revision of the draft National Tribal Policy. A meeting to discuss the various aspects of the draft National Tribal Policy under the chairmanship of the Hon'ble Minister for Tribal Affairs was held with the members of the Expert Group. In the meantime the Government has constituted a High Level Committee (HLC) in August, 2013 to process a position paper on the present socio-economic, health and education status of STs and suggest a way forward. The Committee has to submit its report within nine months. The report would have bearing on the tribal policy. Hence, the National Tribal Policy will be finalized taking into consideration the recommendations of the High Level Committee (HLC)."

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated  
21.11.2013]**

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see Paragraph No. 1.9 of Chapter – I)

### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 8)**

Ashram Schools were established by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs in Tribal Sub-Plan (TSP) Area to promote and extend educational facilities to Scheduled Tribe students including particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups (PTGs). The Committee notes that 579 Ashram Schools in TSP Areas were sanctioned since 2002-03. These schools provide education with residential facilities to STs & particularly Vulnerable Tribal

Groups (PTGs). Among of five States having Left Wing Extremist (LWE) Districts viz. Andhra Pradesh, Chhattisgarh, Madhya Pradesh, Maharashtra and Odisha, there is not even a single Ashram School in Andhra Pradesh. Among the remaining four LWE States, there are 80 Ashram Schools. The Committee desire that necessary action should be taken to establish Ashram Schools in the LWE Districts of Andhra Pradesh, possibility of setting up a school in Paderu near Visakhapatnam may also be considered.

Further, the committee have been informed about vacancies of teachers in Ashram Schools in Gujarat, Uttarakhand, Madhya Pradesh, Karnataka and Uttar Pradesh. Though the Ministry of Tribal Affairs have regularly taken up the matter with concerned State Governments, the Committee feel that the matter should be vigorously pursued with State Governments to ensure proper education to ST students. There should be sufficient incentives to attract teachers to schools in tribal areas. In order to address the problem of shortage of teachers in Ashram school, the Committee suggest that Government should consider appointing qualified teachers on ad hoc basis subject to clearing the Teacher Eligibility Test within 5 years after joining the service. Thereafter their service may be considered for regularization.

The Committee also desire that reasons for low enrolment of students in Ashram Schools - in Madhya Pradesh where there are only 16,320 students in 136 schools, and Chandigarh where there are only 2265 students in 51 schools - be ascertained for taking remedial measures under intimation to the Committee.

### **Reply of the Government**

As per records available in the Ministry a total number of 862 Ashram Schools have so far been sanctioned by MoTA since 2002-03. The number of Ashram Schools sanctioned by the Ministry in LWE States was also indicated. This clearly showed that in the State of Madhya Pradesh 242 Ashram Schools have so far been sanctioned and in Chhattisgarh 134 Ashram Schools have been sanctioned with a capacity of 6695 seats.

Despite so many Ashram Schools having been sanctioned to the State Governments of Madhya Pradesh (242 Ashram Schools) and Chhattisgarh (134 Ashram Schools), the number of students enrolled remains comparatively low primarily

because a sizeable number of the sanctioned Ashram Schools are still incomplete for various reasons ranging from problems in acquisition of land, tendering process not yet complete, inhospitable terrain, problems of Left Wing Extremism, as also not fully functional owing to inadequate number of teachers/ teachers who can teach in the local language.

The State Governments are repeatedly requested to adhere to the time schedules for completing construction. Some State Governments have also issued suitable directives to ensure that adequate number of teachers are appointed from among the locals.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated  
21.10.2013]**

#### **Subsequent reply of the Government**

The Ministry holds periodical review meetings with State/UTs to discuss and sort out all outstanding issues pertaining to this Ministry including the problems hampering completion of construction of the sanctioned Ashram Schools. The Planning Commission also holds periodical meeting with States affected by Left wing Extremism where problems faced by these States and ways and means of resolving them are discussed. The Ministry also impresses upon the States concerned through letters etc as well as during visits of senior officers to the State to sort out these problems and complete construction of the sanctioned Ashram Schools. No further grants are released by the Ministry unless the concerned State/UT Administration furnish Utilization Certificate for previous grants released.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated  
21.11.2013]**

#### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see Paragraph No. 1.12 of Chapter – I)

### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 12)**

The Committee observe that the objective of the 'Special Central Assistance to Tribal Sub Plan' scheme is to boost the demand based income generational programmes with special focus on specific income generation activities like, skill training, storage, small-scale trading inputs, etc. and connectivity to markets, service delivery centres, etc. The Committee are glad to note that the amount released under the scheme, which stood around ₹ 497 crore in each year during the three year period from 2008-09 to 2010-11, has doubled to ₹ 962 crore in 2011-12 and targeted to reach ₹ 1200 crore in 2012-13.

### **Reply of the Government**

As per the progress reports submitted by State Governments, the total no. of ST beneficiaries for which funds were released under SCA to TSP during last two years is 18,59,504 (individuals) and 8,08,212 (families) (approximately), respectively as per the list enclosed at **Annex-IV**.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated 21.10.2013]**

### **Subsequent reply of the Government**

"This Ministry releases funds to the user agencies that fulfill codal formalities and schemes guidelines, the, like utilization of funds released earlier; completion of activities for the funds released etc. The Ministry through regular meetings with Principal Secretaries/Secretaries of State Govts./UTs has impressed upon usage of funds allocated to them and to provide utilization certificate. In addition, subsequent fund releases have been linked to providing utilization of earlier funds released. This has resulted in reduction of unspent balance to ₹ 830.02 crores as on 31.03.2013."

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated 21.11.2013]**

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see Paragraph No.1.18 of Chapter – I)

### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No.13)**

The Committee are also happy to note that the annual release of funds for Special Area Programmes – Grant under Article 275(i) of the Constitution of India has been almost tripled in the year 2010-11 from about ₹ 340 crore in 2008-09 and 2009-10 to ₹ 1000 crore in 2010-11. The amount released under this programme in 2011-12 was ₹ 1085 crore with a target of ₹ 1317 crore in 2012-13. The Committee find that in this case too, the Ministry of Tribal Affairs do not have details of outcome of funding given to States and Union Territories. The Committee urge the Ministry of Tribal Affairs to periodically collect details of work done under this Programme for information of Parliament.

### **Reply of the Government**

Grants under Article 275(1) of the Constitution: Under the programme, Grants are released to 26 States, having ST population for raising the level of Administration in Scheduled Areas and for the welfare of tribal people. Funds are released to States based on proposals received from the States Governments depending on the felt needs of ST population to bridge the gap in infrastructure activities in sectors like roads, bridges, education, health and irrigation etc. and for setting up of Eklavya Model Residential Schools (EMRSs).

State Governments submit Proposals and Progress Report in prescribed format in which activities are mentioned for which funds have been released and used. Further, guidelines clearly mention indicative type of activities for which funds may be released.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated  
21.10.2013]**

### **Subsequent reply of the Government**

“The Ministry of Finance carries out budgetary exercise which involves utilization of funds under various schemes/programmes and as per prevalent fiscal policies including apportionment of funds at Revised Estimate stage. These funds are released subject full filing codal formalities by the user agencies like utilization certificate, progress report, and certificate of funds transferred etc.

Further, efforts of the Ministry are to release the funds to the user agencies based on its availability in respect of proposal received that are complete in all respect i.e. with regard

to codal formalities and scheme guidelines that include utilization certificate, physical progress report etc. It may not be out of place to mention that the funds allocated by this Ministry are additive or gap filling and would normally supplement the efforts of State Governments and other central Ministries for welfare of the Scheduled Tribes.”

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated  
21.11.2013]**

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see Paragraph No.1.21 of Chapter – I)



## **CHAPTER – V**

### **RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS OF WHICH FINAL REPLIES OF GOVERNMENT IS STILL AWAITED**

#### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 4)**

The Scheme “Strengthening Education among ST Girls in Low Literacy Districts” was introduced in the year 1993-94 and was revised in 2008-09 for ST girls in low literacy pockets. The primary objective of the Scheme was promotion of education among tribal girls in the identified low literacy districts of the country. The scheme also aimed to improve the socio-economic status of the poor and illiterate tribal population through the education of women. The programme is implemented as a Central Sector Scheme and the Ministry of Tribal Affairs provides 100% funding as a gender specific scheme. The educational complexes were established in rural areas of identified districts and have classes I to V with a provision for upgradation up to class XII, provided there is sufficient accommodation for classrooms, hostel, kitchen, gardening and for sports facilities. The educational complexes impart not only formal education to tribal girls but also train the students in agriculture, animal husbandry, other vocations and crafts to make them economically strong.

While examining the impact of the scheme, the committee note that budgetary allocation for Strengthening of Education among ST girls has steadily been reduced from ₹ 60 crore in 2008-09 to ₹ 40 crore in 2012-13. What is more distressing is that utilisation of fund, under the scheme has been way below ₹ 40 crore during each of the last three years. However, the committee find that the Scheme has not received sufficient focus considering that the tribal female literacy rate is below 35 per cent (as per 2001 Census). The Committee desire to know the latest information regarding female literacy rate among tribals.

Further, the Committee emphasise that serious efforts should be made to rejuvenate the scheme with enhanced funding and positive realisation of the objective and urge the Ministry to revise the scheme expeditiously under intimation to them.

### **Reply of the Government**

The latest information on female literacy rate among tribals is awaited from the Registrar General of India. RGI has intimated that district-wise female literacy rate among ST as per 2011 Census is in the process of finalization.

Due to the focused approach of this Ministry under the scheme of “Strengthening education among ST girls in low literacy Districts”, about 50% of the total allocation of 2013-14 has been expended up to the month of September, 2013 benefitting 6869 beneficiaries in 34 projects.

Revision of the schemes shall be completed by the end of the Financial Year 2013-14.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated 21.10.2013]**

### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 10)**

The Committee note with concern that no Human Development Index (HDI) has been constructed so far in respect of Scheduled Tribes to evaluate the socio-economic development of the Scheduled Tribes population. It is only after the matter has been taken up by the Committee that the Ministry of Tribal Affairs has proposed to build a new composite HDI like Social Index and has approached the National Sample Survey Organisation, Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation to conduct a Survey exclusively focusing on tribals. The Committee desire to be apprised of the progress made in this regard.

### **Reply of the Government**

The matter has been taken with the Ministry of Statistics & Programme Implementation (MoSPI) to conduct a baseline survey on Situation Assessment Study and Collection of data on the STs in the country. MoSPI has informed that if it is decided

to devote one round for the subject, it would happen only after June, 2015. However living conditions of the STs as revealed in the Census 2011 has been worked out and a comparative picture vis' a vis general population has been given in the **Annex-III**

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated 21.10.2013]**

### **Observation/Recommendation (Sl. No. 11)**

Giving due attention to primitive tribes of Andaman & Nicobar Islands, the Committee desired to know the various welfare measures/initiatives taken by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs to facilitate slow and smooth transition of primitive tribes particularly Jarawas .

The Committee were informed that as per the 'Policy on Jarawa Tribe of Andaman Islands, 2004' maximum autonomy is being given to the Jarawas with minimum and regulated interventions by A&N Administration there is no interventions in cultural life of the Jarawas and they are left to develop according to their own genius and at their own pace. No attempts to bring them to the mainstream society against their conscious will at this stage of their social development will be made. The Committee feel that no community should be deprived of the benefits of economic development. The Committee would like to know whether any efforts were made to ascertain the will of Jarawas regarding their integration with the main society, and if so, when and with what result.

### **Reply of the Government**

As per recommendation of the meeting of the "Expert Committee under the Chairpersonship of Secretary, Tribal Affairs for preparation of policies for various PTGs of A&N Islands" held on 2-2-2012, the A&N Administration, vide letter dated 23-7-2013 had furnished a project study report carried out by experts namely, Prof. Vishwajit Pandya and Shri Manish Chandy and Director (TW), A&NI and Officers of AAJVS titled 'A Fieldwork Based Report - Jarawa Movements in relation to time and space'. The

A&N Administration has also informed that the second phase of the work on the Jarawa study will be carried out to access the freewill of the tribe. This work is expected completion by the end of March, 2014. After receipt of the report of the second phase of the work, the issue will be examined.

The A&N Administration, vide letter dated 12-9-2013 has informed that the Administration is carrying out ethnographic study to understand the Jarawa issues and forwarded research report entitled “Kangapo” (Stitched Garment in Jarawa Language) prepared by Prof. Dr. Vishwajit Pandya, the Expert Member of AAJVS. The Research Advisory Board of Andaman Nicobar Tribal Research & Training Institute in its meeting held on 23<sup>rd</sup> & 24<sup>th</sup> August, 2013 carefully evaluated the report and recommended for its implementation by A&NI Administration. The strategy for implementation of the recommendations of the report is to be addressed by A&N Administration.

**[ref: Ministry of Tribal Affairs, OM no. F.No. 16015/04/2013-PC&V dated  
21.10.2013]**

#### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see Paragraph No. 1.15 of Chapter – I)

**NEW DELHI;  
19 December, 2013  
Agrahayana 28 ,1935(Saka)**

**FRANCISCO SARDINHA,  
CHAIRMAN,  
COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES.**

## Annexure-I

STATEMENT SHOWING THE AMOUNT RELEASED TO STATES/NGOs UNDER THE CENTRAL SECTOR SCHEME OF DEVELOPMENT OF PARTICULARLY VULNERABLE TRIBAL GROUPS (EARLIER KNOWN AS SCHEME OF DEVELOPMENT OF PRIMITIVE TRIBAL GROUPS PTGs) (PTGs) DURING 2007-08 TO 2012-13									
									(Rs. in Lakh)
S.No.	Name of the State/UT	Name of Implementing Agency States/NGOs	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11	2011-12	2012-13	2013-14 (as on 30-09-2013)
1	Andhra Pradesh	1) Govt. of Andhra Pradesh	860.000	985.000	0.000	2292.400	2292.400	2000.000	3000.000
2	Andaman & Nicobar Islands	1) Andaman Adim Janjati Vikas Samiti, A & N Islands	149.000	0.000	0.000	184.000	0.000	0.000	75.000
3	Bihar	1) Govt. of Bihar	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	
4	Chattisgarh	1) Govt.of Chattisgarh	700.000	615.330	0.000	2244.790	1655.390	2000.000	1400.000
		2) VISHWAS, Narayanpur, Distt. Bastar	1.951	0.000	10.696	7.486	0.000	6.864	8.560
		3) Ramakrishna Mission Ashram, Naryanpur, Distt. Bastar	0.000	0.000	6.893	5.330	4.380	4.830	
5	Gujarat	1) Govt. of Gujarat	500.000	1943.220	0.000	0.000	2035.200	700.000	1000.000
6	Jharkhand	1) Govt.of Jharkhand	0.000	1068.000	0.000	0.000	2000.000	630.540	
		2) Bharat Sewa Ashram Sangha, Sonari, Jamshedpur	174.261	165.885	168.595	155.856	363.566	0.000	229.937
		3) Bharat Sevahsram Sangha, Pakur, WB	25.645	28.265	53.436	31.893	38.481	0.000	35.289

		4) Bharat Sevashram Sangh, Barajuri, Via-Ghatsila, Jharkhand	39.460	37.829	50.000	30.932	62.006	8.367	
		5) Bharat Sevashram Sangha, Deogarh, Jharkhand	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	6.770	7.070	
<b>7</b>	<b>Kerala</b>	1) Govt. of Kerala	0.000	960.000	10.000	0.000	1210.000	0.000	
<b>8</b>	<b>Karnataka</b>	1) Govt. of Karnataka	200.000	3227.000	0.000	6000.000	1225.608	659.460	
		2) Swami Vivekanada Youth Movement, Hanchipura Road, Saragur, Tal. - H.D. Kote, Distt. - Mysore - 571 121, Karnataka	0.000	19.275	20.474	0.000	0.000	47.912	
<b>9</b>	<b>Madhya Pradesh</b>	1) Govt. of Madhya Pradesh	1000.000	3754.900	5067.800	5428.200	6546.320	4350.000	4500.000
		2) Bonded Liberation Fund, New Delhi (H.Qrs.)	12.661	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	
		3) Sewa Bharathi, Bhopal	31.921	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	
<b>10</b>	<b>Maharashtra</b>	1) Govt. of Maharashtra	497.000	2007.980	556.125	3459.835	0.000	0.000	
		2) Maharogi Sewa Samiti, Warora (Lok Biradari Prkalp), Hemalkasa, PO-Bhamragad, Distt-Gadchiroli, Pin - 442710, M.S.	49.776	0.000	28.194	27.772	0.000	28.300	
<b>11</b>	<b>Manipur</b>	1) Govt. of Manipur	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	100.000	
<b>12</b>	<b>Odisha</b>	1) Govt. of Orissa	1000.000	1243.000	1228.700	1226.680	1224.728	3260.000	2000.000
<b>13</b>	<b>Rajasthan</b>	1) Govt. of Rajasthan	0.000	1120.490	0.000	1280.280	2677.000	1500.000	
<b>14</b>	<b>Tamil Nadu</b>	1) Govt. of Tamil Nadu	0.000	673.000	0.000	476.000	1075.940	1400.000	2000.000

		2) Nilgiris Adiwasi Welfare Association, Kotagiri, Nilgiris	59.217	52.870	61.663	77.581	85.107	46.658	
<b>15</b>	<b>Tripura</b>	1) Govt. of Tripura	185.000	403.000	461.800	315.700	627.400	700.000	950.000
<b>16</b>	<b>Uttar Pradesh</b>	1) Govt of Uttar Pradesh	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	
<b>17</b>	<b>Uttrakhand</b>	1) Govt. of Uttrakhand	0.000	0.000	100.140	0.000	0.000	400.000	
<b>18</b>	<b>West Bengal</b>	1) Govt. of West Bengal	300.000	901.740	537.235	0.000	0.000	0.000	
		<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>	<b>5785.892</b>	<b>19206.784</b>	<b>8361.751</b>	<b>23244.735</b>	<b>23130.296</b>	<b>17850.000</b>	<b>15198.786</b>

**State-wise Physical Achievement under CCD plan for XI Plan period****ODISHA**

S.No	Name of PTG	XI Plan	
		Activities/	Achievements
1	Bonda	Connectivity, Drinking-Water, Housing, irrigation and land development, projection of tradition, Education, Health	State Government land distributed to 2966 Hose Holds including 595 landless households. All 18562 families have been covered under Janshree Bima Yojana. 1021 new Firepoof have been constructed and provided to house holds. All weather connectivity with main roads have been extended to 221 villages. Drinking water problem of 116 villages have been solved.180 irrigation projects created. 71 villages electrified and 102 villages given solar lights in 96 villages.17 educational complexes established for 17 micro projects.
2	Chuktia Bhunjia		
3	Didayi		
4	Dongria Kondh		
5	Hill Kharia		
6	Mankirdia		
7	Birhor		
8	Juang		
9	KutiaKondh		
10	LanjiaSaora		
11	Lodha		
12	PauriBhujia		
13	Saora		



### A&N ISLANDS

S.No	Activity	Target	Achievement
1	Construction of 20 bed ward for Onges	Rs. 108.00 lakhs	Rs. 108.00 lakhs
2	Construction of Guest House at Onges settlement Dugong Creek	Rs. 102.15 lakhs	Rs. 105.15 lakhs
3	Construction of eco-friendly huts at Jarawa Tribal Area	Rs. 0.97 lakhs	Rs. 0.97 lakhs
4	Internal electrical work for Great Andamanese Houses	Rs.5.60 lakhs	Rs.5.60 lakhs
5	Internal electrical work for Onges houses	Rs. 5.98 lakhs	Amount released to forest department i.e. PWD and Forest Department. The amount has been utilized for the purpose for it was released.
6	Repair of Staff quarters at Kadamatala	Rs. 3.55 lakhs	-do-
7	Repair of Jarawa ward at Kadamatala	Rs. 3.28 lakhs	Rs. 3.28 lakhs
8	Internal Electrical work of AAJVS Office building	Rs. 1.41 lakhs	Rs. 1.41 lakhs
9	Renovation of AAJVS Office building	Rs. 5.65 lakhs	Rs. 5.65 lakhs
10	Construction of Jarawa ward at Baratang	Rs. 13.03 lakhs	Amount released to forest department i.e. PWD and Forest Department. The amount has been utilized for the purpose for it was released.
11	Implementation activities for the primitive tribes including supply of iron tools, implements, hospitalization etc.	Rs. 86.93 lakhs	Rs.86.93 lakhs

### **Chattisgarh:**

Physical achievement 2007-08 to 2011-12 as under:-

- i. Rate of success in agriculture and Horticulture sector is 89.76%.
- ii. Rate of success in activities related with irrigation, fertilizer and pesticides is 79.22%  
Rate of success in activities of Aawas nirman, solar lamp distribution, health camps and self employment is almost 100

### **TRIPURA:**

#### **PHYSICAL ACHIEVEMENT (2007-08 TO 2011-2012)**

SL. No.	Activity	Target	Achivement
I	II	III	IV

#### **2007-2008**

1	Education Awareness	107 hamlets	107 hamlets
2	Agriculture (Horti & Fish cultivation, Const. of check dam irrigation & land Dev. Etc.	76 hamlets	34 hamlets
3	Vocational training (tailoring carpentry) etc.	54 hamlets (500 ben..)	54 hamlets (400 ben..)
4	Model Village covering 131 families etc.	1 Village	1 Village
5	Other economic activities	57 families	47 families
6	Piggery & Goatery Farming	12 hamlets	6 hamlets
7	Reang Toursim etc.	10 hamlets	1 hamlets
8	Health care awareness	24 hamlets	24 hamlets
9	Infrastructure dev. (Hojagiri dance academy etc.)	1 No	1 No
10	J.B.Y. Scheme.	5000 family	5000 family

<b>2008-2009</b>			
1	Renewal of JBY Scheme	5000 families	5000 families
2	Education Awareness	122 hamlets	110 hamlets
3	Rubber cultivation including nursery raising	132 families	132 families
4	Other Economic activities	59 hamlets	59 hamlets
5	Infrastructure Development (Housing)	125 families	120 families
6	Health care awareness	25 hamlets	25 hamlets
7	Reang Tourism etc.	9 hamlets	9 hamlets

<b>2009-2010</b>			
1	Renewal of JBY Scheme	1000 families	1000 families
2	Health care awareness	25 hamlets	25 hamlets
3	Infrastructure Development (Housing)	125 families	125 families
4	Rubber cultivation	180 families	180 families
5	Other Economic activities	59 hamlets	59 hamlets
6	Education coaching of PTG students	107 hamlets	107 hamlets
7	Piggery & Goatery	90 families	90 families
8	Skill-up-gradation	500 PTG beneficiaries	500 PTG beneficiaries
9	Resident accommodation for PTG students	2 No.	2 No.
10	Hori plantation & check dam etc.	10 hamlets	10 hamlets

11	Reang Tourism & Conservation of culture & heritage	9 hamlets	9 hamlets
----	----------------------------------------------------	-----------	-----------

2010-2011			
1	Infrastructure Development (Housing)	125 families	100 families
2	Construction of residential accommodation of PTG students	1 No.	1 No.
3	Education awareness/ coaching	107 hamlets	107 hamlets
4	Rubber cultivation	180 hamlets	180 hamlets
5	Other Economic activities	59 hamlets	59 hamlets
6	Piggery & Goatery Farming	90 hamlets	80 hamlets
7	Skill-up-gradation	518 PTGs	518 PTGs
8	Agri. Horti etc.	260 families	220 families
9	Conservation of reag culture etc.	9 hamlets	4 hamlets
10	Health care awareness	25 hamlets	25 hamlets

## RAJASTHAN:

### Physical Achievement:

S.No.	Activity	Target	Achievement
1	Establishment of Nutritional Rehabilitation Centres	16	12
2	Land purchase scheme	4600	43
3	Additional amount for Iniramma Houses	36750	6419
4	Janshree bime Yojana	27162	54830

<b>5</b>	Establishment of PTG Culture Centres	6	12
<b>6</b>	Provision of community Health Workers in all PTG Habitations	2802	0-
<b>7</b>	Positioning of Livelihood Assistants @ 1 for every 10 habitations	281	0

### **Madhya Pradesh:**

#### **Physical Targets/Achievement 2007-08 to 2011-12**

<b>S.N.</b>	<b>Activity</b>	<b>Target (beneficiaries)</b>	<b>Achievement</b>
1.	Education	103705	88149
2.	Health	7617	6474
3.	Drinking Water	2173	1847
4.	Agriculture and irrigation	19408	16497
5.	Housing	3760	3196
6.	Livelihood	6108	5192

### **TAMIL NADU:**

Physical Achievement (2007-08 to 2011-12) (as per plan)

<b>S.N o.</b>	<b>Activity</b>	<b>Target</b>	<b>Achievement</b>
<b>I</b>	<b>II</b>	<b>III</b>	<b>IV</b>
1	Housing	836	836
2	Sheep units	1926	963
3	Milch Animals	1236	100
4	Drinking Water Facilities	219	110
5	Street light	3	2

6	Poultry	70	
7	Growing of colour fish	2	
8	Fishing net	100	
9	Brick making unit	12	
10	Embroidery chumkey works	200	
11	Power sprayer	10	
12	Sewing machines	30	
13	Embroidery training	11	
14	Community Halls	5	
15	Infrastructure facilities	282	
16	Mini power pump	1	1

## GUJARAT:

### **Physical targets/achievements**

<b>Activities</b>	<b>XI Plan (Achievements)</b>	
	<b>Target (beneficiaries)</b>	<b>Achievement</b>
Group formation	7748	<b>3999</b>
Bamboo Craft	2613	<b>6765</b>
Eco tourism	929	<b>84</b>
Dairy	3653	<b>5339</b>
Wadi & Fisheries	2206	<b>12612</b>
Skill training	8209	<b>5607</b>
Trading activities	2348	<b>1459</b>

Others	0	2982
<b>Total</b>	<b>27706</b>	<b>38847</b>

**Annexure-IV**

List of beneficiary from 2010-11 to 2012-13 as per Physical Progress Report submitted by State Governments							
S.No.	Year	2010-11		2011-12		2012-13	
	State	Individual	Family	Individual	Family	Individual	Family
1	Andhra Pradesh	N/A	168650	N/A	129616	N/A	29044
2	Assam	24711	N/A	10900	N/A	N/A	
3	Bihar	N/A		N/A		N/A	
4	Chhatisgarh	47873		38635	N/A	N/A	
5	Goa	N/A		N/A		N/A	
6	Gujarat	N/A	76437	272621	N/A	N/A	218594
7	Himachal Pradesh	105072	N/A	81478	12987	N/A	
8	J & K	N/A	10371	N/A		N/A	2162
9	Jharkhand	N/A	15537	N/A	8080	N/A	
10	Karnataka	N/A	10371	N/A	12308	N/A	2162
11	kerala	4073	N/A	3750	N/A	976	N/A
12	Madhya Pradesh	N/A		N/A	61119	79427	
13	Maharashtra	N/A	30189	N/A		N/A	
14	Manipur	N/A	10233	N/A	1242	N/A	
15	Odisha	77922	N/A	165020	N/A	N/A	
16	Rajasthan	233048	N/A	430939	N/A	N/A	
17	Sikkim	6090	N/A	159000	N/A	N/A	
18	Tamilnadu	N/A		N/A		N/A	
19	Tripura	N/A	4355	N/A	4755	N/A	
20	Uttarakhand	N/A		N/A		N/A	



21	Uttar Pradesh	N/A		N/A		N/A	
22	West Bengal	84559		33410	N/A	N/A	
	TOTAL	583348	326143	1195753	230107	80403	251962
	G.Total Individual	1859504		G.Total Family		808212	

**Findings of the independent Evaluation Agency**

The Ministry had got evaluation of the schemes conducted by an independent agency namely, M/s Development Research Services (DRS) Limited, in the States of Andhra Pradesh, Jharkhand, Karnataka and Madhya Pradesh. The study has revealed that the scheme is useful as it is flexible and covers sectors such as housing, infrastructure development, education, health, land distribution, land development, agriculture development, cattle development, social security and insurance, etc. which are important for their development. The main findings, with regard to utility and sustainability of the schemes are summarized as under:

The main findings of the independent evaluation agency are as under:

**Scheme: Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Groups(PTGs):**

- (a) The study observed that the respondent from the state of Karnataka being unable to reach the project intervention at the time of emergency, preferred to visit Government hospitals. However, a significant proportion (51%) of beneficiaries from Jharkhand preferred to visit project locations in such situations. Overall (both states taken together), about 36% respondents (highest) preferred to visit government hospitals for health related emergency. This shows health related projects need to be strengthened to meet the emergency needs of the PTGs.
- (b) The study reveals reduction in instances of severe diseases since project intervention in the two states (as reported by respondents: 88% respondents in Karnataka and 80% in Jharkhand). Likewise, instances of common diseases have also come down since project intervention 85% respondents in Karnataka and 80% in Jharkhand responded this way.
- (c) An important impact of the project intervention was access to immunization facilities by the PTGs. However, large variation was observed in both states in this regard. 84% respondents from Jharkhand and 50% from Karnataka confirmed benefits of various types of immunizations through project intervention.
- (d) The monthly spending on health related issues by the PTGs has also come down due to project intervention in health sector. Overall, majority of about 54% felt that their monthly spending on health had been reduced since project intervention (59% in Jharkhand and 50% in Karnataka). Overall, majority of the respondents (78-83%) confirmed getting free medicines for treatment through projects intervention.
- (e) Around 90% respondents from Jharkhand felt that the education level of their children had registered an increase after project intervention. Similarly more than 86% respondents from Karnataka also felt the same way.
- (f) Rise in enrollment in schools. Around 96% respondents from Karnataka and 88% those from Jharkhand informed rise in enrollment of PTGs in schools.
- (g) Decrease in drop-out rates from schools has been an important impact of the project intervention, as reported by majority of respondents (80-96%) in both states.

- (h) Around 96% respondents from Karnataka and 88% from Jharkhand reported rise in the number of teachers in schools after project interventions.
- (i) About 80% respondents from Karnataka and 50% from Jharkhand indicated increasing inclination towards higher education among children in tribal areas had the similar opinion. Overall proportion of such respondents was at the level of around 65%.
- (j) Impact of occupation on employment for economic self-reliance: Overall preference for economic self-reliance over manual labour indicated by majority of the respondents (84%) in both states followed by self-employment (65%).
- (k) Impact on employment: Rise in monthly house-hold (HH) income. The results of the survey indicate that half of the respondents from Jharkhand agreed that their HH income had increased after getting benefitted through this scheme. However, in contrast, around 94% of the respondents from Karnataka reported that the project interventions had no significant impact on their monthly HH income.
- (l) A large section of people from Jharkhand (42%) was ready to relocate anywhere for getting skill based employment. Interestingly most of the people preferred economic freedom.
- (m) Status of migration after project intervention: The project intervention has a positive impact on migration status in both states. Around 70% respondents migration had reduced due to project interventions.
- (n) Decrease the dependency on forest. Due to project intervention, the dependency on forest had come down. The results of the survey indicate that around 77% respondents from Karnataka and 50% for Jharkhand opined that their dependency on forest had reduced.
- (o) Rise in household food security: HH food security did not register any increase. Only 47% respondents from Jharkhand and only 6% of those from Karnataka reported rise in their food security because of project interventions.
- (p) Perception of other communities towards PTGs: Interestingly, the project interventions in different sectors for PTGs have changed the mind set of other communities towards PTGs. Overall, 77% (Karnataka-96%; Jharkhand-58%) respondents confirmed positive change in perception of other communities towards PTGs.
- (q) Overall significant proportions of respondent PTGs reported positive change in their life because of MoTA project interventions, in terms of food habits (30%), healthcare behavior (54%) and cleanliness and hygiene (47%). Karnataka registered highest change (32%) in health care behavior and least (7%) in terms of 'talking style language'. However, in Jharkhand highest change was reported in cleanliness and hygiene (26%).
- (r) Perception of present life compared to earlier: Most of the respondent PTGs informed that the project interventions had improved their perception and attitude towards life. More than 87% of the respondents reported that their present life was 'better' as compared to the earlier one. More than two third of the respondents from Karnataka and about half of those from Jharkhand rated their life 'better' as compared to earlier life.
- (s) Usefulness of the scheme:

- (i) The scheme enables states to address structural inequality prevalent in PTG communities in comparison to those in the mainstream society.
- (ii) The scheme is very useful as it is flexible and covers wide range of activities like housing, infrastructure development, education, health, land distribution, land development, agriculture development, cattle development, social security and insurance, etc.
- (iii) The scheme promotes creation of enabling conditions for all-round development of PTGs that would remove their isolation and also build capacity to deal with major institutions and other stakeholders to improve their life style in general and social and economic conditions in particular.

**Scheme: Grants-in-aid to voluntary organizations working for the welfare of Scheduled Tribes:**

- (i) The projects under this scheme are very useful for STs particularly because of their socio-economic conditions and characteristic spread in remote areas.
- (ii) Mobile dispensary is an effective initiative to meet the medical and health needs of the tribals in remote areas.
- (iii) Most of the ST population is not aware of the provisions and benefits of various projects being implemented under this scheme. Its full potential can be achieved through increased awareness among tribal communities and ensuring their participation.
- (iv) The scheme is useful for social, health, educational and economic development of STs.
- (v) The scheme is of critical importance in mainstreaming the STs.

**Scheme: Strengthening education among Scheduled Tribe girls in low literacy districts**

- (i) The scheme is very useful and acceptable to the community.
- (ii) There are no local schools offering similar education facilities in the low literacy districts.
- (iii) This scheme gives an important opportunity to the tribal girls in these areas to obtain education, free of cost.

**Scheme: Vocational training centres in Tribal areas**

It creates an opportunity for direct income generation by the beneficiaries, after they undergo vocational training.

**Scheme: Coaching for STs**

The scheme provides an opportunity to ST students for getting free coaching for various competitive exams. It is beneficial for young educated ST people aspiring to participate in competitive examinations.

In order to make the schemes more effective, the evaluation study has made several recommendations. The main ones have been broadly categorized as follows:

**Recommendations under PTG scheme:**

- (i) Need close and periodic monitoring at all levels to improve adequate fund allocation as well as utilization.
- (ii) The scheme is sustainable but needs effective involvement of state agencies.
- (iii) The state governments should be advised to improve the quality of their CCD plans for respective PTGs to ensure creation of livelihood supporting quality infrastructure that has direct relevance and should be in convergence with the other infrastructure schemes of the central and state governments. The utilization of the available funds under the scheme should be closely monitored at regular intervals at village, block, district and state levels.
- (iv) Adequate funds should be timely released to ensure proper implementation of the scheme. The irregular fund flow under the scheme, as observed during the 11th plan period in the study areas, may be detrimental and impede the progress of scheme thereby slowing down the intended benefits to the targeted PTGs in concerned areas.
- (v) The progress of socio-economic conditions and livelihood opportunities provided to the PTGs should be regularly reviewed to assess the impact and outcome of implementation of the scheme.

**Scheme specific recommendation under GIA scheme:**

- a) With reference to the appropriateness of the implemented schemes, the study has observed that some of the schemes such as coaching classes for tribal students and vocational training need to be reframed. The present practice of conducting coaching classes appears to be highly unfocussed as the current methods used for coaching is highly impractical, with very low rate of success.
- b) Similarly, vocational training to tribal beneficiaries also appears to be incomplete if the aptitude of the targeted individuals and back-end support in terms of infrastructure is not there. There appears to be a strong inclination among the tribal youth to seek more remunerative employment through appropriate vocational training. Location specific training modules may be identified to suit the tribal needs to be incorporated into the existing vocational training programs.
- c) Need to strengthen interventions in education sector at the middle and high school levels have emerged as one of the critical issues. Provision of a more efficient infrastructure along with support facilities is imperative to attract and retain more tribal children in the education system. Increase in the number of seats for girl children along with better hostel facilities should be the initiating step.
- d) The study respondents had also reflected strongly on the need to employ local qualified youth as teachers in the tribal schools. This would definitely improve the

accountability of the teachers towards their responsibilities. Special coaching may be provided to tribal boys and girls after their graduation to prepare them as basic school teachers and post them to their respective villages as school teachers.

**Recommendation under GIA scheme for Implementation and monitoring:**

- a) The role, responsibilities and involvement of State Tribal Departments in implementation of the schemes need to be strengthened.
- b) At present, the active participation of state tribal welfare departments is mostly limited to identification of suitable NGOs/VOs, and forwarding the proposals of the NGOs/VOs for consideration and selection by the MoTA. Beyond this activity, the state departments feel that their involvement in actual implementation of the schemes is just marginal.
- c) A decentralized process for release of funds through the state departments to the NGOs would not only create a suitable environment for smoother implementation, it will also ensure the accountability of the NGOs to the state.
- d) Critical issues like fund flows and monitoring of vital progress indicators is close to being relegated to the status of a minor activity. Systematic monitoring framework need to be designed and used at all levels.
- e) Accountability is another major factor that needs to be examined. As of now, it appears that NGOs have a literal monopoly over implementation and the actual target community has hardly any say in activity selection, beneficiary selection, implementation timeframes, etc.
- f) In the above context, it may be worthwhile to involve the Panchayati Raj Institutions and the CBOs in implementing the schemes right from the planning stage.
- g) Involvement of PRIs and CBOs will positively fulfill a social audit function and prompt correction of routine anomalies involve in implementation by and NGO/VO.
- h) As mentioned earlier, the state government agencies do not have a sufficient control over the implementing NGOs/VOs. Empowering the PRIs and CBOs to regularly monitor the implementation activities would help reduce the load and onus on the state departments in regular monitoring.
- i) The role of the implementing agents (NGOs/VOs) needs to be re-examined for their capabilities in implementing the schemes, as in some cases, their capabilities have been the limiting factor.

## **Findings and Recommendations of the Monitoring Agency in the 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> Report**

### **Operational Methodology**

To ensure that all three components of the project – Service delivery on ground, Conformation to MoTA specifications, and fulfillment of Tribal needs, were covered, four types of stakeholders (Project Head at Project location, Beneficiaries of these projects, Key Opinion Leaders, Personnel at the NGO Head Office ) per project were interviewed.

### **Project Selection/ Sampling Design/Coverage/Scoring**

It was proposed to cover 523 projects in 206 districts in 3 year period. Though 200 projects were targeted and visited in the 1<sup>st</sup> year, a total of 185 projects were finally completed across 25 states. Similarly, 167 projects were covered in 21 states in the 2<sup>nd</sup> year of monitoring. A composite score was obtained by giving weightage to project location, view of beneficiaries and key opinion leaders and a performance score-card was prepared for each project covered. Ranking was done based on the scores.

### **Qualitative Findings and Success Stories**

#### **Awareness & Opinion about projects among tribals:**

Though awareness was observed to be less in few cases, overall people were found to be well aware about of the schemes and the benefits which these projects are bringing to the STs. For 10+ Bedded Hospital project, almost 91% were aware about the scheme and said that the STs are benefitting from the project. In case of Computer Training Centre, respondents said that the facility was free of cost and that this project will make ST children self-reliant.

Only a small percentage (12%) of respondents of the hostel project, said that it was a properly implemented project, 34.7% knew that this is a free facility for the ST students and 32% said that ST students will definitely benefit from this project. At Vocational Training Centre, 50% of the respondents interviewed said that the project was a good programme to earn livelihood and the other half said that it bestowed a sense of pride among the STs.

In case of Mobile dispensaries, the respondents felt that these projects are a facility for tribal / poor people, and that disadvantaged tribals are benefitted. In case of Residential, primary schools and ST Girls' Education Hostel, the respondents said that the Govt. is doing good work and the ST Children are receiving free education.

### **Level of involvement of the local community**

The Key Opinion Leaders (KOLs) who were interviewed, when asked about their involvement in different projects, a large percentage said that they support the cause and always help in increasing awareness about the projects, some said that whenever they feel the need, they recommend people to avail benefit from the project. In case of Computer Training Centres, it was found that the Panchayat Head and parents support the project. For Hostel project, the KOLs provide suggestions, arrange for meetings, organize festivals / cultural programmes and extend help by other means.

In some cases, communities were not able to extend any help – either due to their poor financial condition, or lack of awareness / knowledge. Overall, there is support for all the projects and people do get involved to raise awareness so that more and more STs are able to benefit from these projects.

### **Level of involvement of Panchayat in project operations and monitoring**

Responses indicate that in few of the cases, some of the members of the Panchayat in their own capacity were supporting and facilitating the projects.

### **Implementation / Overlapping of similar projects by other Ministries & Demand for additional similar services in that area**

79% of the total respondents interviewed said that Ministry of Tribal Affairs is the only Ministry which has implemented projects like 10+ Bedded Hospitals, Computer Training Centres, Agricultural Training Centres, Balwadis, Hostel and Schools for STs (both residential and non-residential), Library, Mobile Dispensary, Mobile Library cum Audio Visual Units, Typing and Shorthand Training and Vocational Training Centers. The rest 21% said that some local private institutions also run such programs as for example–projects like Residential School, Mobile Dispensary, Hostel, and 10+ bedded hospitals.

Almost all beneficiaries and KOL's interviewed said that there is an enormous requirement for such projects. The awareness has increased about the welfare programs and projects being implemented by the Government and therefore large number of STs desire to avail the benefit. Particularly, there is a need of more 10+ bedded hospitals, Hostel, Residential, Middle and Primary schools for Girls, along with Computer and Vocational training schools.

### **Problems faced by NGOs in running the project**

As per the responses received by the NGOs, major problems faced by them in running the projects are:

1. Lack of funds (resulting in low resources and less salaries for staff)
2. Untimely release of funds by the ministry,
3. Lack of support from the government in terms of administration



4. Improper supply of electricity and drinking water
5. Absence of a proper grievance redressal mechanism
6. Finding quality staff and
7. Slow processing by the government machinery etc.

### **Suggestions for improvement**

Almost all NGO Officials and Project Heads interviewed suggested for timely release of grants, increase in amount with respect to different provisions of grant and the resources to include computers and printers. One important demand was to increase the awareness about the schemes and to implement more welfare projects so that more and more people could avail the benefits. Among beneficiaries, a large number said that the resources provided to them should be better. There should be more doctors, nurses, trained teachers and other staff in the projects. Some beneficiaries said that the facilities provided should be of higher quality and in larger quantity. Lastly, some of the beneficiaries said that there should be more inspections and career guidance must be provided to the beneficiaries.

### **Success Stories**

Success stories of few projects included a student of a middle school (run by **Rajasthan Bal Kalyan Samiti, Rajasthan**) who later became judge in a city; the Computer Training Centre and the Vocational Training Centre run by **Pathahri Vocational Institute**, in Assam, has helped in upliftment of the tribal people and has been a major motivating factor for tribal communities to step out of their homes and take up training. After few trainees got good jobs, many educated youth took up training at this centre for better employment opportunities, resulting in the improvement of their socio economic status.

The Mobile Dispensaries have made possible the treatment and the medical help to reach less accessible areas. The unit, run by **Bharat Sevashram Sangha**, in Dumka district of Jharkhand has changed the behaviour of the people by making them come out of superstitions and start believing in medical treatment. The **Mobile Dispensary in East Godavari district, Andhra Pradesh** run by Ram Krishna Mission, has helped significantly in reducing Diabetic cases, Hypertension and Eye related diseases. The effectiveness of the dispensary is such that people come here for treatment and have stopped going to Govt. Hospitals. The dispensary is now serving more areas than before.

The **Residential School run by Seva Bharati in Meghalaya** has helped the residents of the Brokona village and its surrounding, as earlier not a single person was even 10<sup>th</sup> pass. But now many have completed their schooling (10<sup>th</sup>) and most of them have been recruited in Army. Now along with Hezong language, large numbers of people understand and speak Hindi, English, Assamese and Garo. The students of the **Primary School** at Rayagada district of Orissa (run by **SNEH**), participated in UNDP cultural programme in 2006 and has achieved 3<sup>rd</sup> position at Block level science exhibition recently.

These successful examples indicate that the tribal population are benefitting from the projects / schemes that are run by the Ministry and there is continuous building up of belief among the tribals that such projects are for their benefit and upliftment.

### ***Recommendations in the 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> Monitoring Report***

The findings of the study suggest that the Ministry of Tribal Affairs should continue to implement such programmes and projects either directly or through NGOs. The features of many of these projects are unique and cater to basic socio-economic needs of the tribal population in the country – whether they are on education, health, upliftment, employment or welfare related. Based on the 1<sup>st</sup> year findings of the monitoring exercise of the NGO run projects, the major recommendations are:

- Ministry should release the funds on time to the NGOs. This would facilitate the NGOs to run the projects smoothly, pay the salary on time to the staff and to properly maintain and improve the facilities at the project sites.
- Funds should be increased across the different heads as with time, the cost of living and resources has increased significantly and for the NGOs to provide quality resources and facilities, increase in the funds is necessary.
- Awareness about the projects and the schemes should be increased among the STs across India, particularly in the less accessible areas, so that the inhabitants use the nearest facilities at minimal cost.
- Monitoring of these projects should be at regular intervals, to know the development of the projects over time and to verify if things are going 'as planned' and therefore implementing corrections and changes required for improvement in the delivery mechanism.
- The opinions and feedback of beneficiaries and key opinion leaders should be taken and given importance for improvements in the projects as they observe and scrutinize the working of the projects very closely at the grass root level. Their gap analysis and the inputs for improvements can be of great use for the efficacy of the projects.
- More emphasis should be given to the development of infrastructure and resources. This would elevate the quality of the project and will attract more beneficiaries.
- One of the fundamental aims of these schemes is to bridge the gap in the literacy level between the general and the tribal population. To achieve this, the schemes should also focus on the awareness generation in the interiors and less accessible regions.
- The safety of the girls is imperative and therefore it should be considered important and given proper attention at all the Girl specific projects. This would make the ST Girls and their families more confident in availing the facilities.

- The Ministry should interact with NGOs on regular basis to understand the need and the problems faced by the NGOs in running the projects.
- There should be an Effective Grievance Redressal Mechanism for all stake holders – the NGOs, beneficiaries, KOLs, community etc - where they can lodge their suggestion or complaints. The Ministry should take a proactive role for the same.
- Private Companies can be given incentives by the Government if they employ ST students who have passed from the Computer training Centers or Vocational Training Centers.

Some recommendations with reference to specific segments are:

- 1. Schools: Residential School & Non-Residential School under Grants-in-Aid scheme, Primary School & Middle School under ST Girls Education Scheme:** The schools should emphasize on imparting quality education and providing clean and hygienic environment along with safety for the students. English should be taught as a subject from the primary level for the reason that students face problems when they join another school where the medium is English. Also if English is introduced at Class 6<sup>th</sup> level in the Vernacular medium schools, the students have to compete with English medium pupils in the 10<sup>th</sup> Boards, which is very difficult for them. English speaking classes may be introduced. Further grants for computers should be provided to each and every school. Scholarships and stipends should be provided to meritorious students to motivate the students, their parent's and the community at large. There should also be an increase in the number of teachers and in the honorarium / salary paid to the teachers and the support staff.
- 2. Computer Training Centre, Typing and Shorthand Training Centre & Vocational Training Centres:** The Courses/ Teaching / Training should be job oriented and the syllabus should match the current requirements of the job market, so that the students start earning as soon as the training ends. Also, if the students are more in number at the training centres, the grants - both non-recurring and recurring - should be increased accordingly. There should be provision for on-job training and placement assistance.
- 3. 10+ bedded hospitals:** There is a dearth of medical facilities in the interiors and in remote ST villages. Therefore, number of 10+ bedded hospitals should be increased along with the funding for the medicines, medical equipments and other related aids, such as –X- Ray & Ultrasound machines,

Pathological labs, etc. If these are not available the patients have to travel to other places for treatment, thus delaying the process. The honorarium and salaries of the doctors, nurses and also of other support staff should be increased in order to employ quality staff by the implementing institutions.

**4. Mobile Dispensary:** The Ministry should fund more such projects as the findings divulge that all the project units are over- stressed due to need and demand of health services by the tribes and especially in the remote areas. It is required that the frequency of the visits of the mobile dispensaries to the remote/ non-accessible areas should be increased, especially during the rainy seasons. There should also be provision for grants for Part- time specialist doctors (Gynaecologists, Paediatricians etc.).

**5. Balwadi:** Provision should be made for midday meals to the children.

**6. Hostel:** Facilities like playground, library, more room space, study rooms, conveyance (bus / cycle), etc. should be considered at the time of evaluation of the project proposal by the NGO, as these are necessary for the overall development of the students.

**7. Library:** should have a large sitting arrangement and books should be available on diverse subjects.

**8. ST Girl's Education – Hostel:** This segment is an important and popular segment under the Scheme, 'Strengthening of Education among the ST girls in low literacy districts'. To make people aware about this scheme so that more and more girls can avail the benefit, special awareness drives and campaigns are required to be conducted by various state departments. Emphasis should also be to provide better infrastructure at the hostel and for the safety of the girl students.

**MINUTES OF FIFTEENTH SITTING OF THE COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES (2013-2014)**

The Committee sat on Wednesday, the 23<sup>rd</sup> October, 2013 from 1100 to 1250 hrs. in Committee Room 'E', Parliament House Annexe (PHA), New Delhi.

**PRESENT**

Shri Francisco Sardinha – Chairman

**MEMBERS**

- |    |                           |
|----|---------------------------|
| 2  | Smt. Harsimrat Kaur Badal |
| 3  | Shri Bapi Raju kanumuru   |
| 4  | Dr. Thokchom Meinya       |
| 5  | Shri Prabodh Panda        |
| 6  | Shri R. Sambasiva Rao     |
| 7  | Shri Subodh Kant Sahai    |
| 8  | Shri S. Semmalai          |
| 9  | Shri M.I. Shanavas        |
| 10 | Shri Ganesh Singh         |
| 11 | Shri Jagadanand Singh     |
| 12 | Shri Mukul Wasnik         |
| 13 | Shri Omprakash Yadav      |

**SECRETARIAT**

- |    |                      |   |                 |
|----|----------------------|---|-----------------|
| 1. | Shri A. Louis Martin | - | Joint Secretary |
| 2. | Smt. Anita B. Panda  | - | Director        |

3. Shri Srinivasulu Gunda      Additional Director

**WITNESSES**

- 1    Shri Ashok Pai      -      Joint Secretary
2.   Dr( Smt) Sadhna Rout - Joint secretary
3.   Shri Siliditya Chaudhari – Deputy Director General
4.   Smt. Sangeeta Verma-      Economic Advisor
5.   Smt. Vibha pandey-      Chief Controller of Accounts
6.   Shri A.K. Angurana-      Managing Director, TRIFED.

2.    At the outset, the Chairman welcomed the Members of the Committee and the representatives of Ministry of tribal Affairs to the sitting of the Committee convened for discussion on action taken by the Government on the observations/ recommendations contained in the Twenty- First Report of the Committee (2012-13) on 'Tribal Welfare Schemes', which was presented to Lok Sabha on 23 April, 2013.

3.    The Chairman also drew the attention of the representatives of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs to Direction 55(1) of 'Directions by the Speaker, Lok Sabha' regarding confidentiality of the proceedings of the sitting of the Committee and desired the. representatives of the Ministry to explain various steps taken following presentation of the Committee's Twenty- first Report.

4.    The representatives of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs then gave a power- point presentation covering *inter alia* mandate of the Ministry, demographic status, educational, health and other indicators of Scheduled Tribes, schemes and programmes of the Ministry, Special Central Assistance to the Tribal Sub Plan, Grant under Article 275(1) of the Constitution, scholarships & fellowships to STs and their utilization, market development of tribal products / produce, conferring of rights to scheduled tribes under Forest Rights Act, 2006, proposed scheme of Minimum Support Price (MSP) for Minor Forest Produce (MFP) etc.

5. Thereafter, Members of the Committee raised queries on various issues regarding impact of vocational training given to ST youth on their employability/ suitability for setting up own businesses, monitoring the role of NGOs and the action taken against those indulging in violations of rules/ misappropriation of funds / misconduct in running / managing vocational training schemes, underutilization of funds earmarked for tribal welfare schemes, need for mechanism at the National level for ensuring accountability for utilization of funds allocated to Tribal Sub Plan (TSP), need to pursue with the Planning Commission on the shortfall in funds under TSP , formulation of guidelines on TSP, compensation for tribals who lose their land consequent to the declaration of the areas as National Parks / forest reserves/wild life sanctuaries, extension of the Pre-Matric scholarship scheme to ST students from class I itself, recognition and extension of the benefits of tribal welfare schemes to the tribals residing in States other than their home states, steps taken to preserve the tribal culture and inclusion of the same in the schemes formulated by the Ministry of Tribal Affairs, reasons for not conferring the land rights to all the eligible tribals, inclusion of Homopathy under AYUSH, setting up of State level forest procurement institutions ensuring MSP for MFP and the urgent need for a National policy for tribals, etc.. Details regarding the pendency of proposals received from various States for recognition of particular tribal communities like 'Dhangar , Majhi' etc. and the age of pendency of these proposals were also asked.

6. The representatives of the Ministry of Tribal Welfare responded to the queries raised by the Committee. In respect of points for which the representatives could not readily respond, the Ministry was asked to furnish written replies at the earliest.

7. A verbatim record of the proceedings has been kept.

**The Committee then adjourned.**

**MINUTES OF THE SECOND SITTING OF THE STUDY GROUP OF THE  
COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES (2013-2014)**

The Study Group of the Committee on Estimates sat on Wednesday, the 18<sup>th</sup> December, 2013 from 1030 hrs. to 1045. hrs. in Room No. 52-B, (Chairman's Chamber), Parliament House, New Delhi.

**PRESENT**

Shri Subodh Kant Sahai – Convener

**Members**

- 2 Shri K. Bapi Raju Kanumuru
- 3 Dr. Thokchom Meinya
- 4 Shri Prabodh Panda
- 5 Shri S. Semmalai
- 6 Shri Radha Mohan Singh
- 7 Smt. Annu Tandon

**SECRETARIAT**

- |                           |   |                     |
|---------------------------|---|---------------------|
| 1. Shri M. Louis Martin   | - | Joint Secretary     |
| 2. Smt. Anita B. Panda    | - | Director            |
| 3. Shri Srinavasulu Gunda | - | Additional Director |
| 4. Dr. Yumnam Arun Kumar  | - | Deputy Secretary    |
| 5. Shri U.C. Bharadwa     | - | Deputy Secretary    |



2. At the outset, the Chairman welcomed the Members of the Study Group of the Committee on Estimates to the second sitting. The Study Group took up for consideration the following draft Chapter-I of Action Taken Reports:

(i) \*\*\* \*\*\*,

(ii) Memorandum No. 5 and draft Chapter-I of Action Taken Report on the Recommendations contained in the Twenty First Report of the Committee on Estimates (2012-13) on 'Tribal Welfare Schemes' pertaining to the Ministry of Tribal Affairs; and

(iii) \*\*\* \*\*\*,

3. The Study Group approved the categorization of replies as shown in the Memorandum and also approved the draft Reports without any modification.

**The Study Group then adjourned.**

**MINUTES OF TWENTY-FIRST SITTING OF THE COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES**  
**(2013-2014)**

The Committee sat on Wednesday, the 18<sup>th</sup> December, 2013 from 1045 hrs. to 1100 hrs. in Room No. 52-B, (Chairman's Chamber), Parliament House, New Delhi.

**PRESENT**

Shri Francisco Sardinha – Chairman

**Members**

- 2 Smt. Harsimrat Kaur Badal
- 3 Shri Bapi Raju Kanumuru
- 4 Dr. Thokchom Meinya
- 5 Shri Prabodh Panda
- 6 Dr. Vinay Kumar Pandey "Vinnu"
- 7 Shri Subodh Kant Sahai
- 8 Shri Ijyaraj Singh
- 9 Shri Jagada Nand Singh
- 10 Smt. Annu Tandon
- 11 Shri Om Prakash Yadav

**SECRETARIAT**

- 1 Smt. Anita B. Panda - Director
- 2 Dr. Yumnam Arun Kumar - Deputy Secretary

2. At the outset, the Chairman welcomed the Members to the sitting of the Committee. Then, the Committee took up for consideration the following draft Reports:

(i) \*\*\* \*\*\*,

(ii) Action Taken Report on the Recommendations contained in the Twenty First Report of the Committee on Estimates (2012-13) on 'Tribal Welfare Schemes' pertaining to the Ministry of Tribal Affairs as approved by the Study Group of Committee on Estimates;

(iii) \*\*\* \*\*\*,

(iv) \*\*\* \*\*\*,

3. The Committee adopted the abovementioned Reports without any modification.

4. The Committee then authorized the Chairman to finalise the above reports after factual verification by the Ministries concerned and present the same to Lok Sabha.

**The Committee then adjourned.**

**APPENDIX IV**

**ANALYSIS OF THE ACTION TAKEN BY GOVERNMENT ON THE RECOMMENDATIONS  
CONTAINED IN THE TWENTY-FIRST REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES  
(FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA)**

(i)	Total number of recommendations/observations	19
(ii)	Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government  (Sl. Nos. 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 9, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, & 19)  Percentage of total recommendations	12     63%
(iii)	Recommendation/Observation which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the Government's reply  Percentage of total recommendations	Nil  0%
(iv)	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which Government's replies have not been accepted by the Committee  (Sl. Nos. 1, 8, 12 & 13)  Percentage of total recommendations	4     21%
(v)	Recommendation/Observation in respect of which final replies of Government is still awaited.  (Sl. No. 4, 10 & 11)  Percentage of total recommendations	3     16%