# COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED CASTES AND SCHEDULED TRIBES (2011-2012)

(FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA)

EIGHTEENTH REPORT

ON

MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (RAILWAY BOARD)

Action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Twenty - eighth Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) on the Ministry of Railways (Railway Board) on the subject "Reservation for and Employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Southern Railway".

Presented to Lok Sabha on <u>27.12.2011</u>

Laid in Rajya Sabha on 27.12.2011\_



LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT NEW DELHI

27th December, 2011 / 7 Pausha 1933 (Saka)

# **CONTENTS**

Page No.

COMPOSITION OF	THE COMMITTEE	(iii)
INTRODUCTION		(iv)
CHAPTER I	Report	1
CHAPTER II	Recommendations/Observations which have	
CHAPTER III	been accepted by the Government	38
	Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies of the Government	58
CHAPTER IV	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require	
	reiteration	74
CHAPTER V	Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of the Government have not been received	87
	APPENDICES	
APPENDIX - A	Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 17.08.2010	88
APPENDIX - B	Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 09.09.2010	90
APPENDIX - C	Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 16.12.2011	92
APPENDIX - D	Analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Twenty - eighth Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha)	94

# COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED CASTES AND SCHEDULED TRIBES (2011-2012)

Shri Gobinda Chandra Naskar - Chairman

#### **MEMBERS**

### Lok Sabha

- 2. Shri Bhudeo Choudhary
- 3. Smt. Santosh Chowdhary
- 4. Smt. Jyoti Dhurve
- 5. Shri Biren Singh Engti
- 6. Shri Prem Chand Guddu
- 7. Smt. Paramjit Kaur Gulshan
- 8. Dr. M. Jagannath
- 9. Shri Mohan Jena
- 10. Shri Mohinder Singh Kaypee
- 11. Shri Virendra Kumar
- 12. Shri Pradeep Majhi
- 13. Shri Bharat Ram Meghwal
- 14. Shri Ashok Kumar Rawat
- 15. Shri Baju Ban Riyan
- 16. Smt. Sushila Saroj
- 17. Shri Hamdullah Sayeed
- 18. Dr. Kirit Premjibhai Solanki
- 19. Shri Lalit Mohan Suklabaidya
- 20. Shri Bhausaheb Rajaram Wakchaure

## Rajya Sabha

- 21. Shri Jabir Husain
- 22. Shri Rishang Keishing
- 23. Shri Lalhming Liana
- 24. Dr. Bhalchandra Mungekar
- 25. Shri D. Raja
- 26. Shri K.B. Shanappa
- 27. Shri Veer Singh
- 28. Miss Anusuiya Uikey
- 29. Shri Veer Pal Singh Yadav
- 30. Vacant

#### **Secretariat**

- 1. Dr. R.K.Chadha, Joint Secretary
- 2. Ms. J.C. Namchyo, Director
- 3. Shri G.C.Dobhal, Under Secretary
- 5. Ms. Pooja Kirthwal, Committee Assistant

#### INTRODUCTION

- I, the Chairman, Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes having been authorised by the Committee to finalise and submit the report on their behalf, present this Eighteenth Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) on action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in their Twenty eighth Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) on the Ministry of Railways (Railway Board) regarding "Reservation for and Employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Southern Railway".
- 2. The draft Report was considered and adopted by the Committee on the 16<sup>th</sup> December, 2011 (Appendix-C).
- 3. The Report has been divided into the following chapters:-
  - I. Report
  - II. Recommendations/observations which have been accepted by the Government.
  - III. Recommendations/observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of replies of the Government.
  - IV. Recommendations/observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration.
  - V. Recommendations/observations in respect of which final replies of the Government have not been received.
- 4. An analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Twenty eighth Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee is given in Appendix-D. It would be observed therefrom that out of 31 recommendations made in the report, 14 recommendations <u>i.e.</u> 45.16 per cent have been accepted by the Government. The Committee do not desire to pursue 12 recommendations <u>i.e.</u> 38.71 per cent of the total recommendations in view of the replies of the Government. There are 5 recommendations <u>i.e.</u> 16.13 per cent in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and require further reiteration.

New Delhi; 27th December, 2011 7 Pausha, 1933 (Saka) GOBINDA CHANDRA NASKAR, Chairman, Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes.

# CHAPTER - I

#### REPORT

This Report of the Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes deals with the action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in their Twenty-eighth Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) on "Reservation for and Employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Southern Railway".

- 1.2 Twenty-eighth Report was presented to Lok Sabha and laid in Rajya Sabha on 18<sup>th</sup> March, 2008. It contained 31 recommendations/observations.
- 1.3 The Committee while deliberating upon the the draft action taken report on the subject at their sitting held on 17<sup>th</sup> August, 2010 observed that some of the replies to these recommendations/observations were non-affirmative and needed clarification. The Committee, therefore, took fresh evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Railways (Railway Board) and Southern Railway on 9<sup>th</sup> September, 2010. Subsequently a list of points was forwarded to them for furnishing additional replies of the Government in respect of these recommendations/observations. The replies received from the Ministry of Railways (Railway Board) have been examined and categorized as under:-
  - (i) Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government (Sl. No. 3, 4, 8, 9, 10, 11, 13, 15, 16, 20, 21, 23, 26 and 27).
  - (ii) Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in the light of the replies received from the Government (Sl. Nos. 1, 5, 7, 12, 14, 17, 18, 22, 25, 28, 29 and 30).
  - (iii) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration (Sl. Nos. 2, 6, 19, 24 and 31)

- (iv) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of the Government have not been received (NIL).
- 1.4 The Committee will now deal with the Action Taken by the Government on those recommendations which need reiteration or comments.

# **Strength and Working of Reservation Cell**

# Recommendation (Sl. No. 2, Para No. 1.14)

1.5 The Committee observe that there is no prescribed frequency for inspection to enforce the reservation rules. The Liaison officers/officials of the Board are supposed to carry out inspections at least once a year so as to ensure proper enforcement of reservation rules in the Railway establishments as also for redressal of grievances of SC/ST employees. The Committee are however perturbed to note that no inspection of Southern Railway had been carried out by the officers of the Board during the last three years. The Committee are of the view that the Liaison Officer is a key figure in an organization and responsible for ensuring implementation of reservation policies of the Government. The Committee feel that it is a serious lapse on part of the Liaison officer/officers of the Board for not carrying out the inspection on time and they strongly recommend that all out efforts should be made to carry out inspection of each zonal/divisional headquarters in a time bound manner. The Committee further recommend that the staff/officers working in the Reservation Cell should be given proper training in the matter of reservation policy so that they may discharge their duties properly and effectively. The Committee would like to be apprised of the recent inspection carried out by the officers of Railway Board in regard to Southern Railway.

#### Reply of the Government

1.6 The recommendation of the Committee is noted. It is stated that due to other important and urgent factor like Parliament Sessions, Union matters, meetings of the

Committee of Secretaries etc. and also the increase in the number of Zonal and Divisional Headquarters, it has not been possible to carry out inspections of each and every Zonal/Divisional Headquarters in a time bound manner. However, all out efforts would be made to carry out these inspections at random and also to impart training to the staff/officers working in the Reservation Cell in the matter of reservation policy.

- 1.7 Not satisfied with the above reply, the Committee during evidence asked the Ministry to state the additional responsibilities of Liaison officer apart from work relating to SC/ST employees. The Committee also inquired whether the Ministry have prepared a schedule for undertaking inspection of zonal/regional headquarters to inspect roster registers and were also asked to enlist the Division/Units/Headquarters visited.
- 1.8 In their post evidence reply, the Ministry of Railways have provided the details of work entrusted to Liaison Officer appointed in the Ministry. It has been stated that the Executive Director, Establishment (Reservation) acts as a Liaison Officer in respect of matters relating to the representation of SCs, STs and OBCs in all establishments and services under the administrative control of the Ministry of Railways. The Liaison Officer is responsible for
  - (i) Ensuring the compliance by the subordinate appointing authorities with the orders and instructions pertaining to the reservation of vacancies in favour of Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and Other Backward Classes and other benefits admissible to them.
  - (ii) Ensuring timely submission by each appointing authority under Ministry/Department to the Ministry/Department the SC/ST/OBC Reports I and II and ensuring scrutiny and consolidation of the above reports in respect of all establishments and services in and under the control of the

- Ministry/Department and sending the consolidated reports in the prescribed proforma to the Department of Personnel and Training.
- (iii) Acquainting himself well in time about the dates of various DPCs which will be held in future. He will have with him a ready list of officers of various levels belonging to SC/ST of a few sister Departments/Ministries so that whenever requirement arises, an SC/ST officer of appropriate level consistent with the level of the other members of the DPC and the level of appointment for which a DPC is proposed to be convened can always be associated as a member. Such a list may be prepared by the Liaison Officer by informally consulting the administrative wing of other Ministries/Departments.
- (iv) Ensuring that while making a reference to the Department of Personnel and Training and to the National Commission for Scheduled Castes and the National Commission for Scheduled Tribes for de-reservation of reserved vacancies, full details in support of the proposal for dereservation are given.
- (v) Ensuring the extension of necessary assistance to the National Commission for Scheduled Castes and the National Commission for Scheduled Tribes in the investigation of complaints received by the Commission in regard to service matters and in the collection of information for his annual report.
- (vi) Conducting annual inspection of the reservation registers/rosters maintained in the Ministry/Department/Offices under the control of the Ministry/Department with a view to ensuring proper implementation of the reservation orders.

- (vii) Acting as a Liaison Officer between the Ministry/Department and the Department of Personnel and Training for supply of other information, answering questions and queries and clearing doubts in regard to matter covered by the reservation orders.
- In addition to carrying out the responsibilities as liaison officer in respect of (viii) SCs and STs, functioning as in charge of implementation of Prime Minister's New 15 Points Programme on the Welfare of Minorities on Railways. Increase in number of Zonal Railways/Production Units, Divisions, Workshops has lead to increase in employees (including SCs/STs), number of grievances (CA-III/SC/ST Commissions, Parliamentary Committee, Department of Personnel and Training, Prime Minister's Office/President Secretariat etc.), time frame for different SC/ST Association matters, Court Cases on Reservation Policies, Clarifications, various types of RTI Applications regarding Implementation of Reservation Rules.
- 1.9 In regard to Schedule for inspection, it has been stated that though no strict schedule has been prepared for the inspection of roster registers for proper implementation of reservation policies on zonal/regional Headquarters, inspections are carried out at random, as and when time permits, in view of the huge workload devolving on the officers and staff of the Reservation Directorate of the Ministry of Railways, by the Liaison Officer himself or the officers deputed by him.
- 1.10 The Divisions visited for inspection so far are reported to be, Mumbai Division of Central Railway, Khurda Road and Vishakapatnam Divisions of East Coast Railway, Delhi Division of Northern Railway, Sealdah, Howrah, Malda Divisions and Liluah Workshop of Eastern Railway, Mughalsarai Division and Dhanbad Division of East

Central Railway, Headquarter Office and Mumbai Central Division of Western Railway, Bhopal Division of W.C. Railway, Railway Workshop at Mysore in S.W. Railway.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

The Committee note that in addition to work related to SCs/STs/OBCs, the Liaison officer appointed in the Ministry of Railways has been entrusted with other responsibilities including acting in charge of implementation of Prime Minister's New 15 Points Programme on the Welfare of minorities on Railways. Taking into consideration that Liaison Officer is burdened to look after representation of OBCs and Minorities, it is no wonder that no strict schedule has been prepared for the inspection of roster register of SCs and STs and that the inspections are carried out at random in view of huge workload. The Committee take it seriously and strongly urge the Ministry of Railways not to have a common Liaison Officer for SCs/STs/OBCs and Minorities. The Committee opine that the Liaison Officer should not be assigned responsibilities of OBCs and Minorities but the work related to SCs/STs. The Committee recommend that Ministry of Railways should chalk out a well-planned inspection chart for the scrutiny of implementation of reservation roster registers regarding zonal/regional headquarters at the earliest. The Committee would like Liaison Officer to check the rosters in Southern Railway for it does not seem to have been checked at all in the past.

#### Recommendation (Sl. No. 3, Para No. 1.18)

1.12 The Committee note that a Reservation Cell has been set up in Southern Railway in Headquarters office as well as on each Division to look after the interests of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees. Keeping in view the fact that the

Chief Liaison Officer and Liaison Officers are responsible for supply of information, answering questions and queries and clearing doubts in regard to matters covered by the reservation orders and other assigned duties pertaining to SCs/STs, they are expected to be well conversant with reservation orders/rules. The Committee, therefore, desire that the Chief Liaison Officer and Liaison Officers should be given adequate training on reservation related matters, so that reservation orders may be implemented properly. The Committee also recommend that the Annual Inspections of Divisions/Units/headquarters should be strictly carried out by these Officers, so that cases of negligence or lapses in the matter of following the reservation and other orders relating to SCs/STs may be handed timely/properly.

# **Reply of the Government**

- 1.13 The recommendation was referred to Southern Railway who have stated that in respect of non-gazetted staff, training programme are regularly organized on Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe reservation matters at Zonal Training Centre, Trichy. For officers, efforts would be made to organize such training programmes at Railway Staff College, Vadodara or by the Department of Personnel & Training at New Delhi, with the approval of Railway Board.
- 1.14 Regarding annual inspection of Divisions/Units/Headquarters by Chief Liaison Officer and Liaison Officers, all out efforts would be made to conduct such inspections for timely implementation of orders pertaining to Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes.
- 1.15 Having noted that efforts to organise training programmes for officers on reservation matters were made, it was enquired whether any liaison officer was deputed for training during the year 2010. In their post evidence reply, the Ministry of Railways stated that in this regard one officer was deputed for training during 2010.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

1.16 The Committee would like to stress that the Chief Liaison Officer and Liaison Officers are instrumental in execution and implementation of the reservation policies. Thus the training of these officials is mandatory so that they are able to discharge their responsibilities efficiently in looking after the interests of SC and ST employees. The Committee are rather concerned that only a single officer has been deputed for training during 2010.

#### **Recruitment Rules and Service Conditions**

# Recommendation (Sl. No. 6, Para No. 2.13)

1.17 The Committee also note that the written examination/interviews are mostly being conducted in major cities in the South and also in Port Blair. Since the Group 'C' and 'D' posts are advertised through Employment News on All India basis, the Committee strongly recommend that the Railway authorities should hold examinations in towns nearer to the SC/ST inhabited areas so that more SC/ST people residing in backward, remote and hilly areas are also encouraged to appear for such examinations. Most of the SC/ST candidates are not able to travel to distant places as they cannot afford to pay for transport charges and the areas where they reside may not have Railway network. The Railway authorities should, therefore, increase the number of examination centres by identifying towns nearer to SC/ST populated areas so that sufficient number of suitable candidates are available for SC/ST posts.

#### Reply of the Government

1.18 The recommendation of the Committee is noted. In this regard it may be stated that for attending written examination and viva-voce, Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe

candidates are issued second class free pass for their travel from residence to place of written examination/interview and back.

1.19 During evidence, when it was pointed out that there is difficulty for SC/ST people to go to far off places and asked about the reason as to why examinations are not held at least at district head quarters, Chairman Railway Board explained:-

"......We have 21 Railway Recruitment Board. The exams are held as per the RRB. The centres are kept in different locations. A large number of candidates are there. We find that there are some towns where thousands of candidates have applied. We make centres in those towns in the schools. We take permission from the schools in the nearest towns for which we make the payments. On a Sunday we keep these centres and hold these exams. We hold exams all over. It is not that it is only at one place.

Now, there is no system of interview. So, one has to appear and qualify in the written test held by the Railway Recruitment Board, which may be in a centre very close to the address where that candidate is staying. SCST candidates appearing for the exams get free passes on the Railway system so that they should not have any difficulty in reaching the centre. It is closer to their address. Whatever may be distance, may be 30 to 40 kilometre, they can travel by train on free passes, which are sent to them along with their Admit Card. That is how we tackle it. I understand their problem. But I think, the present system addresses this quite well."

- 1.20 The Committee also sent written questionnaire asking the Ministry as to how many examination centres they have identified, are located near SC/ST dominated areas and whether the Ministry have recently introduced new examination centres near such areas.
- 1.21 In their post evidence reply the Ministry of Railways have stated that as per Railway Board's policy, examination centres are not normally opened outside the jurisdiction of the concerned Railway Recruitment Board (RRB) and these centres are generally situated in cities located nearby the RRB office and on the basis of the number of application received.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

1.22 The Committee feel that although issuing Second Class free passes for travel to SC/ST candidates is a positive step encouraging them to appear in exams, it is, however, not enough as many hilly and remote areas are quite far from the nearest Railway stations and aspiring SC/ST candidates have to travel long distances by road to reach these stations. The Committee are dismayed at the reply of the Ministry that as per the Railway Board's policy examination centres are not normally opened outside the jurisdiction of the concerned Railway Recruitment Board. The Committee are of firm view that this policy is hampering the participation of unemployed educated SC/ST youth. Had there been more examination centres especially nearer to ST dominated areas, there would be probability of more ST candidates getting recruited The Committee, therefore, recommend that the policy may be reviewed and introduce new examination centres near SC/ST dominated areas.

#### Recommendation (Sl. No. 7 Para No. 2.14)

1.23 The Committee observe that employment notification is given in Employment News/national dailies/regional newspapers and desire that copies of the Notifications/Advertisements should also be made available to the local MLAs/MPs and also to the Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes for wider publicity.

#### **Reply of the Government**

1.24 Instructions already exists that while undertaking Special Recruitment Drive to wipe out the backlog vacancies of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, wide publicity about the recruitment in all categories of services should be made through

newspapers, Doordarshan, radio etc. and information of the same should also been sent to the local MPs/MLAs of the area including the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes Associations, polytechnic colleges etc. As recommended by the Hon'ble Committee on the welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes on the Ministry of Railways as contained in their 17<sup>th</sup> Report (14<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha), necessary instructions have been issued to all the Zonal Railways/Production Units and Railway Recruitment Boards advising to send the copies of Employment Notices/advertisements to the local MPs/MLAs/Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes also whenever recruitment action is under taken by the Zonal Railways themselves or by the Railway Recruitment Boards with a view to give wide publicity and to have more response form the eligible candidates belonging to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes.

1.25 As per the extant practice the copies of notification/advertisement are also made available to Doordarshan for wide publicity.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

1.26 The Committee note that the Ministry have already issued instructions to send a copy of employment notices/advertisements to the Parliamentary Committee also. However, the Committee have not received any such employment notification till date and, therefore, advise that a copy of the same should be made available to the Committee in future.

# Recommendation (Sl. No. 10, Para No. 2.25)

1.27 The Committee note from the statement furnished by the Ministry that Southern railway was conducting recruitment regularly. At the same time, the trend of carrying forward reserved vacancies to next recruitment year has also been noticed, which the

Committee feel is against the interest of the SCs and STs. As on 1.1.2005, the carry forward vacancies in Group 'C' and 'D' for SCs were 157 and 210 and for STs these were 161 and 500, respectively, whereas similar information has not been furnished for subsequent years. From the statement of recruitment held as on 1.1.2006, the position is not clear as to whether the current vacancies of SC/ST for that particular recruitment year have been taken into account or the number is for filling up of carry forward vacancies through special recruitment drive. The carry forward vacancies are clearly to be dealt with separately from the current vacancies of a particular year. The Committee should, therefore, be apprised of the same. The Committee should also be apprised of the latest position in regard to recruitment as on 1.1.2007.

# **Reply of the Government**

- 1.28 Recruitment to Group 'C' and Group 'D' categories is regularly done in Southern Railway. Whenever vacancies are assessed for placing indents on Railway Recruitment Board, the Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe vacancies remaining unfilled in the previous year are carried forward added to the current vacancies and accordingly recruitment is done. The carry forward vacancies are taken into account while calculating current vacancies and indents placed for recruitment.
- 1.29 In the case of <u>promotion categories</u> where the vacancies could not be filled due to non-availability of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees in the feeder category, such vacancies are diverted to <u>recruitment quota</u> in terms of Railway Board's instructions contained in letter No.99-E(SCT)I/25/10 dated 11-05-1999 and filled up. In this process <u>563</u> vacancies, as detailed below were filled up upto 31.12.07. In addition to 563 vacancies, 511 Group 'D' Railway Recruitment Board papers were supplied to

wipe out Scheduled Tribe shortfall. It may thus be appreciated that action has been taken to fill up 1077 vacancies in toto.

		Recruitment				Prom	otion	
Vacancies	Group 'C' Gro		Group 'D'		Grou	ір 'С'	Gro	up 'D'
	SC	ST	SC	ST	SC	ST	SC	ST
As on 1.1.07	210	410	99	246	1016	1715	298	772
As on 1.1.08	126	343	119	180	864	1617	239	732
Filled	84	67	-	66	152	98	59	40

- 1.30 For the remaining vacancies following course of action has been taken :-
  - Notification for conducting Group 'D' Recruitment has been issued on 24.11.07 for filling up 3517 vacancies. Of this 475 vacancies are reserved for Scheduled Caste and 470 vacancies for Scheduled Tribes. The Recruitment is under process.
  - 2. As a special course of action 511 Group 'D' papers received from Railway Recruitment Board/Chennai were distributed to all Divisions of Southern Railway to fill up the safety categories where train operations is involved.
  - As directed by the Ministry of Railways, 1002 Licensed Porters were empanelled in Southern Railway for appointment as Trackman. Out of this 1002, 293 Scheduled Castes and 5 Scheduled Tribes will be appointed shortly.
- 1.31 During evidence held on 9.9.2010, it was pointed out that there is a complaint that the Railways are not going for true recruitment and not filling up the vacancies on time. In this connection, mention was made about Tambaram Railway Station where VIP lounge is there but it is always closed as there is no manpower to attend to it.
- 1.32 In response, the representative of Southern Railway stated:-

- "I will check it since you have mentioned it".
- 1.33 During evidence, the Committee also sought an explanation from the Ministry of Railways with regard to backlog vacancies and enquired as why they are not being filled up despite of prime Minister's instructions. In reply, the representative of the Ministry of Railways stated:-
  - ".....there is a backlog of 26,000 posts, out of which 14,000 is from recruitment and 12,000 from promotional posts. We are processing them."

It was further stated that:

"As per Prime Minister's direction we took a recruitment drive in 2004 and we implemented about 99.3 per cent of the backlog and in the case of promotion it was about 83.7 per cent. Again we started a drive from 1.11.2008. It is in the process. When the vacancies are filled up along with that, the backlog will be complete."

- 1.34 In a written query, the Committee desired to know what efforts have been taken by the Southern Railway to fill the current SC/ST vacancies in the same recruiting year and also that whether any special recruitment drive has been done to fill up the SC/ST vacancies separately and the number, name of such posts and year of recruitment.
- 1.35 In their post evidence reply, the Ministry of Railways stated that:-
  - (a) For filling up current SC/ST vacancies in the same recruitment year, indents are placed on Railway Recruitment Boards Chennai and Trivandrum to conduct recruitment.
  - (b) Indents were already placed on Railway Recruitment Boards, Chennai and Trivandrum for conducting special recruitment drive as per the details furnished below. The vacancies under special recruitment drive are not clubbed in General recruitment process.

Group 'C'	RRB/Chennai	RRB/Trivandrum
SC	288	116
ST	345	64

Group 'D'	Railway Recruitment Cell/Chennai
SC	95
ST	141

(c) No vacancies reserved for SCs/STs, current or backlog were de-reserved during the last 5 years in Southern Railway.

1.36 In their post evidence reply the Ministry have further stated that the Indents have been placed for 656 ST vacancies in Group 'C' categories on Railway Recruitment Boards, Chennai and Trivandrum for conducting recruitment, which includes special recruitment drive also. Further the written examinations for the posts of Assistant Loco Pilot and Assistant Station Master were held on 6.6.2010 and 13.6.2010 respectively. In respect of Enquiry cum Reservation Clerk and Goods Guard, the written examination was held on 26.9.2010. The Railway Recruitment Boards have to finalise the result and other formalities before sending the panel to Railways. It was also submitted that in respect of Group 'D' posts, indents have been placed for 470 vacancies of ST on Railway Recruitment Cell/Chennai to conduct recruitment. The details of the posts category-wise are provided as under:-

# **Group 'C' Posts**

SI.No	Name of category	ST
1	Section Engineer/Mechanical	7
2	Section Engineer/Electrical	8
3	Section Engineer/Engineering	6
4	Section Engineer/S&T	7
5	Junior Engineer/Mechanical	14
6	Junior Engineer/Electrical	14

7	Junior Engineer/Engineering	8
8	Junior Engineer/S&T	2
9	Technician/Mechanical	241
10	Technician/Electrical	68
11	Technician/S&T	1
12	Technician/Engineering	1
13	Assistant Loco Pilot/Operating	57
14	Staff Nurse	14
15	Health & Malaria Inspector	10
16	Pharmacist	5
17	Assistant Station Master	36
18	Goods Guard	21
19	Jr. Stenographer	17
20	Sr.Clerk	24
21	Clerk	14
22	Teacher	1
23	Enquiry-cum-Reservation Clerk	18
24	Ticket Collector	38
25	Commercial Clerk	19
26	Chief Metological Assistant	2
27	Train Clerk	3
	Total	656

# Group 'D' posts

SI.No	Name of the post	Department	ST
1	Sweeper cum Porter	Operating	59
2	Sweepr cum Porter	Commercial	2
3	Helper Gr.II	Electrical	33
4	Helper Gr.II	Mechanical	53
5	Helper Gr.II	S&T	8
6	Helper Gr.II	Stores	25
7	Trackman	Civil Engg.	219
8	Safaiwala Gr.III	Medical	71
		Total	470

#### **Comments of the Committee**

1.37 The Committee note that the Ministry of Railways have placed indents on Railway Recruitment Boards, Chennai and Trivandrum for filling up the current ST vacancies in Southern Railway and also for conducting special recruitment drive for SC/ST vacancies. The Ministry have maintained that the vacancies under special recruitment drive are not clubbed in General recruitment process. According to statement made during evidence, there was backlog of 26000 posts, out of which 14000 was from recruitment and 12000 from promotion. From the post evidence information, the Committee note that indents were placed on Railway Recruitment Boards, Chennai and Trivandrum for conducting Special Recruitment Drive to fill up 404 SC and 409 ST backlog posts in Group 'C' and 95 SC and 141 ST backlog posts in Group `D'. The Committee further note that indents for conducting recruitment of 656 ST vacancies in Group 'C' categories of posts and 470 ST vacancies in Group `D' categories have been placed. Indent for ST vacancies placed reported to include Special Recruitment Drive. Committee should be apprised of the details of SC and ST posts filled during the special recruitment drive as also ST posts (current vacancies) conducted by the RRB Chairman and RRB, Trivandrum. The Committee would like to know the name of the SC/ST posts lying vacant out of SRD as also due to general recruitment process. The Committee urge Southern Railway to fill up all the recruitment and promotional vacancies so that there is enough manpower to run the Zonal railway efficiently and there is no complaint in this regard.

# Recommendation (Sl. No. 11, Para No. 2.26)

1.38 The Committee regret to note that the reasons for carrying forward the reserved vacancies are stated to be the poor response from SC/ST candidates and non-availability of suitable candidates from these categories. The reason for less number of recruitment of SCs and STs is also attributed to the instruction from Railway Board to reduce the staff strength as Southern Railway has been one of the loss making Railways. The Committee are of the view that the SC/ST vacancies should not be reduced while reducing the total staff strength as these are the vacancies which should have been filled up by SC/ST candidates in the past.

# **Reply of the Government**

- 1.39 The recommendation was forwarded to Southern Railway who have stated that reduction in staff strength is unavoidable due to modernization and technological changes. Besides, as a policy of Government of India of Man Power Planning, every year the sanctioned strength has to be reduced by one percent (1%) and actual has to be reduced by two percent (2%). In this process, the sanctioned strength in general gets reduced. The reduction is affected in the overall sanctioned strength and not restricting only to Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe posts.
- 1.40 The Ministry in their post evidence reply, however, have denied that lesser recruitment of SC/ST is due to instructions from Railway Board as Southern Railway has been one of the loss making railway zones. Keeping in mind the statement given by the representative of the Ministry during evidence held on 15 September, 2006 that between 2001 and 2004 the recruitment of SCs and STs had been less and the reason being that the Southern Railway was one of the loss making Railway zones and that the Railway Board instructed Southern Railway to reduce the staff strength, the Committee had desired to know whether the carried forward vacancies of SC/ST

backlog vacancies were not included in the total strength of the Zonal Railways while reducing the strength of employees over the period of time. The Ministry were, therefore, asked to furnish backlog vacancies as also other vacancies during the years from 2005 to 2009 alongwith total number of vacancies reduced including the number. of backlog vacancies for SC/ST, if any.

1.41 The Ministry have not provided vacancy position for the year 2005 as it was not available with them. However, they have furnished the vacancy position from the year 2006 to 2009 as below adding that the carry forward vacancy of SC/ST is kept separately and added to the current vacancies of the next year for placing indents.

# **Vacancy position of Group 'C'**

SI.No.	Year	Sanction	Actual	Vacancy
1	2006	83055	73911	9144
2	2007	82789	75006	7783
3	2008	82643	75617	7026
4	2009	84329	75546	8783

### **Vacancy position of Group 'D'**

SI.No.	Year	Sanction	Actual	Vacancy
1	2006	29798	27869	1929
2	2007	28661	26725	1936
3	2008	27727	25443	2284
4	2009	27796	26757	1039

### DETAILS OF POSTS SURRENDERED IN GROUP 'C' AND 'D'

SI.No.	Year	Group 'C'	Group 'D'	Total
1	2006	1011	1342	2353
2	2007	565	738	1303
3	2008	499	978	1477
4	2009	383	596	979

1.42 The Ministry have also informed that while right sizing takes place in whole of zonal railways as per the policy guidelines issued by Railway Board the same is effected based on the total staff strength and operative staff strength irrespective of community.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

1.43 The Committee note that the Southern Railway, while adhering to the policy of the Government to reduce sanctioned strength by one percent and actual strength by two percent, has reduced the employees strength over a period of time. When the Committee desired to know whether the carried forward SC/ST vacancies were also included while downsizing the staff strength, the Ministry have however not been coherent in their replies. They have replied that the rightsizing of the staff has been done as per Railway Board's policy guidelines and was done irrespective of the community. The concern of the Committee is that since SC/ST vacancies were never fully filled up, such vacancies were also wiped out while reducing the staff. The Committee should, therefore, be apprised of the details of SC/ST posts in Group C&D which were included in the total strength of the surrendered posts in each year in 2006, 2007, 2008 and 2009 in Southern Railway while reducing the strength of employees over the period of time.

### Recommendation (Sl. No. 17, Para No. 2.55)

1.44 The Committee have been informed that in case of technical, diploma and graduate and para-medical categories, ST candidates are not becoming available to the extent of vacancies reserved for them. The Committee have also been informed that steps are being taken to wipe out shortfall in technical, diploma and para-medical

categories post reserved for SC and ST candidates by placing indents through RRB, compassionate ground appointment and by launching Special Recruitment Drive. The Committee feel that shortfall of SC/ST in case of technical and para-medical categories can perhaps be taken care of, if Southern Railway get in touch with ITIs and other professional institutes for recruitment of SC/ST candidates. Conducting Special Recruitment Drive for filling up SC/ST posts once in a while is not a permanent solution. The Committee recommend that Southern Railway should conduct Special Recruitment Drive till the shortfall is wiped out and thereafter should make every effort to fill up all SC/ST posts during every recruitment year so as to avoid shortfall to accumulate.

## **Reply of the Government**

1.45 Necessary instructions have been issued to all the Zonal Railways including Southern Railway to carry out serious exercise to find out and pin point the real causes of shortfall and to review the position and chalk out effective action plans so as to wipe out the actual shortfall/backlog vacancies of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes/Other Backward Classes both in promotional and recruitment categories. Any vacancies remaining unfilled, would be filled up by way of recruitment through Railway Recruitment Boards.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

1.46 The Committee should be apprised whether the pointed observations of the Committee to fill up vacancies, particularly in technical and para-medical fields by directly approaching technical institutes like ITIs and professional institutes for recruitment of SC/ST candidates has also been taken note of as possible remedy.

# Recommendation (Sl. No. 19, Para No. 3.4)

The Committee note that on Indian Railways, including Southern Railway, there is no provision of imparting pre-recruitment training. It has been stated by the Ministry that Indian Railways being a vast organization with huge manpower on roll, the scheme is not feasible to implement and moreover, there is no direction in the matter from the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pension (DOP&T). The Committee are deeply distressed by such a reply as the Government works through different Ministries and policy matter of the Government in regard to SCs and STs is same. The Committee, therefore, do not subscribe to the idea that only the Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment can have such a responsibility. The Committee feel that it should be every Ministry's concern to see that employment of SCs and STs, as guaranteed in the Constitution, is fully accomplished. Non-availability of suitably trained SC/ST candidates is often the repeated reply given for not filling up reserved posts. The Committee are of the strong view that this problem can be solved to some extent by imparting pre-recruitment training. The Committee also do not find any justification in the reply that the Indian Railways being a vast organization with huge manpower on roll, pre-recruitment training is not feasible to implement. In many mega Public Sector Undertakings including Banks, the Committee have observed pre-recruitment trainings are being given successfully to SC/ST candidates. The Committee expect a positive approach from the Ministry of Railways too and desire that the Ministry should initiate some action for imparting pre-recruitment training to SCs and STs in various categories of posts. The Committee are of the opinion that such type of training would undoubtedly help in the improved intake of SC/ST candidates.

# **Reply of the Government**

- 1.48 On Indian Railways, there is no scheme of pre-recruitment training for any category. The same is true for Departments of other Ministries also. It is the assigned responsibility of Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment (earlier it was called Ministry of Welfare) to run pre-examination training centres, mainly for competitive examinations held by Union Public Service Commission etc. The Administrative Heads of these training centres shall be given intimations of employment notices to advise the candidates undergoing training there, to apply for posts suiting their qualifications as and when notified by Railway Recruitment Boards.
- 1.49 In view of the above, it is not possible for Railways to run such pre-recruitment coaching centres for Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates. It may, however, be stated that Special Recruitment Drives are undertaken to fill up the vacancies of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes. The reservation policies are strictly adhered to and it is ensured that the interests of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes are fully taken care of.
- 1.50 During evidence, the Chairman, Ministry of Railway on the subject of pre recruitment training stated:-
  - ".....this is for the people who are to be recruited first time through the RRBs. If we take the all-India position, for the RRB recruitment we get about 40 lakh applications. Generally, these are the people coming from the educational institutions directly. Once they are selected from there, we take great care of their training and give them a lot of opportunities for promotions in the system. But, the education is to be looked after the HRD Ministry and the Social Welfare Ministry. We do not actually know who are there. The number is very large. Probably we feel that after they are recruited for the first time, then they are our responsibility."
- 1.51 When it was pointed out that while the Government state that it is difficult to recruit SC/ST candidates for technical posts, it was questioned as to why the Railways are not considering option of pre recruitment training option for SC/ST candidates.

In their post evidence reply the Ministry of Railways expressed their helplessness and stated that they are not in a position to provide pre-recruitment training to any section of candidates including Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes because the number of applicants in reference to recruitment notices normally may run into crores every year. However, there is a Central Sector Scheme (namely coaching and allied assistance) of free coaching provided/imparted by Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment with a view to ensure effective implementation and monitoring of Government Programmes and assist the students belonging to weaker sections including Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and Other Backward Classes in a better manner.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

1.53 Having observed that many SC/ST posts particularly in technical and paramedical jobs remain vacant, the Committee had strongly felt that pre-recuirtment training should be imparted to SC/ST candidates in the Railways. The Committee, however, note that Railways are not in a position to provide pre-recruitment training to any section of candidates including Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes. The Committee agree that a mechanism exists wherein SC/ST candidates are given pre-examination training by the Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment for competitive examination conducted by UPSC. However that does not serve the purpose for SC/ST posts in Railways. The Committee are of the firm view that the Railways should initiate a process of pre-recruitment training for SCs and STs especially to the posts which are technical and unique to the Railways so that SC and ST posts are filled up. The Committee, therefore reiterate their earlier recommendation.

# **Deputation of SC/ST Employees**

# Recommendation (Sl. No. 23, Para No. 3.19)

1.54 The Committee note that out of a total of 161 employees, only 8 SC and 2 ST employees were sent on deputation to other departments during the years 2000 to September 2006. The Committee are not convinced with the reply of Southern Railway that SC/ST employees with sufficient number/sufficient eligibility criteria prescribed are not coming forward to volunteer for the deputation. The Committee, therefore, desire that Southern Railway should make extra efforts to encourage SC/ST employees to opt for deputation, so that adequate representation could be given to SCs/STs while sending the employees for deputation. The Committee feel sending SC/ST employees on deputation would definitely improve their knowledge and also their efficiency.

# **Reply of the Government**

1.55 The recommendation of the committee is noted. Southern Railway administration have assured to make necessary arrangements to encourage the Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees to volunteer for deputation.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

1.56 The Committee would like to know the specific measures taken by the Southern Railway to motivate more SC/ST employees opt and get selected for deputation posts.

# False Caste Certificates

#### Recommendation (Sl. No. 24, Para No. 3.26)

1.57 The Committee observe that during the years 2000 to 2005, 220 complaints and in the year 2006, 8 complaints were reported to have been received in respect of persons who obtained employment in Southern Railway on the basis of false caste certificates. Out of the above 228 cases, 37 cases have been finalized and remaining

191 cases are at various stages of investigation. The Committee note that 191 cases are still pending due to various reasons. The Committee are more disturbed by the fact that a large number of cases are pending (as these are under investigation with District Collectors). The Committee have been informed that the cases are pending with the District Collectors as in some of the districts, the District Level Committee consisting of the Collector, one Adi-Dravida Welfare Officer and one Anthropologist is not available and that in many districts, the Committee also does not hold meetings regularly. The Committee express their concern over this sad state of affairs and urge upon the Ministry of Railways to take up this matter with the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pension who are the cadre controlling Ministry over the Collectors and to ensure that all the State Governments constitute appropriate District Level Committee in every district urgently and to instruct them to hold regular meetings so that cases of investigation of false caste certificates are not held up for want of proper DLC or nonholding of meetings by such Committees. The Committee also recommend that Southern Railway should advise Railway advocates to take prompt action to get the stay vacated in the cases relating to false caste certificates. The Committee further recommend that the cases pending under departmental enquiry/investigation should also be pursued vigorously with the concerned authorities for early disposal of pending cases within a time frame. However, the Committee hope that utmost care should be taken to ensure that genuine SC and ST employees do not suffer during investigation and their cases should be finalized in the earliest possible time. The Committee, also recommend that if any person is found guilty, the criminal proceedings should be initiated immediately, besides termination of his service.

# **Reply of the Government**

- 1.58 The matter was referred to Southern Railway who have stated that they are regularly writing to the District Collectors and to the Secretary concerned for expediting the verification of alleged false community certificates. In two cases where the services of employees were terminated, criminal complaints have been lodged in one case, and the other is pending before the court.
- 1.59 During evidence, the Committee expressed their concern about the large number of false caste certificate cases. The Committee were of the view that the Railways should have gone in appeal to the next court in case of stay in courts. The Committee felt that the only solution is disciplinary proceedings under the Conduct Rules and asked the Ministry to take such action as nobody can prevent the Railways from taking departmental action against those persons who obtained employment by producing false caste certificates.
- 1.60 In response, Chairman, Railway Board assured:-
  - "We will take Departmental action against such people because it is moral turpitude. We will take it up under moral turpitude."
- 1.61 The Committee also enquired of the steps that have been taken by the Southern Railway to speed up cases of verification/investigation of large number of false caste certificates cases. In their post evidence replies the Ministry have stated that the following steps have been taken by Southern Railway to speed up the verification/investigation of false caste certificates:
  - Letters are addressed to the District Level Committee in the case of SC followed by reminders.
  - Letters are addressed to Secretaries to the Government of Tamil Nadu and Kerala in case of ST certificates followed by reminders.

- 3) The Staff and Welfare Inspectors working in the Special Reservation Cell are periodically visiting the District Level and State Government authorities for expediting the cases.
- In respect of 138 ST cases (including 7 gazetted officers cases) pending in the State Level Committee of Government of Tamil Nadu, Chief Personnel Officer/Administration has addressed a letter to the Secretary, Adi Dravida & Tribal Welfare Department, Government of Tamil Nadu on 26.3.2010 followed by a DO letter to the Secretary from the Chief Liaison Officer on 24.6.2010.
- 1.62 The Committee in their recommendation had urged upon the Ministry of Railways to take up the matter of pending false caste certificate cases lying with District Collectors with the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pension who are the cadre controlling Ministry over the Collectors and to ensure that all the State Governments constitute appropriate District Level Committee in every district urgently and to instruct them to hold regular meetings so that cases of investigation of false caste certificates are not held up for want of proper DLC or non-holding of meetings by such Committees. When asked whether the matter was taken up with DoP&T and the outcome thereof, the Ministry of Railways replied in their post evidence reply that the recommendations of Parliamentary Committee had been referred to DoP&T for necessary action vide Board's letter No. 2004-E(SCT)1/80/2/Pt.24 dated 26.10.2010. However, reply of which was awaited from DoP&T.
- 1.63 The Committee had also recommended that the Southern Railway should advise Railway Advocates to take prompt action to get stay vacated in these cases relating to false caste certificates. When asked about the action taken by the Southern Railway and cases where stay has been vacated, the Ministry of Railways in their postevidence reply stated that the Law Officer, Southern Railway, has been requested to

convene a meeting of Railway advocates who are handling the false community certificate cases for prompt action and some of the advocates have been counselled suitably. In addition to this, the Law Assistant specially attached with the Special Reservation Cell is regularly contacting the Railway advocates for speedy disposal of the cases. It was also stated that based on the efforts taken in 9 cases, the stay have been vacated and the cases were referred to the State Level Committee for verifying the genuineness of the community certificates.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

1.64 The Committee note that Southern Railway had taken some steps to speed up verification/investigation of false caste certificates. The Ministry, however, took more than two years to take up the matter of false caste certificate cases with the Ministry of Personnel Grievances and Pensions as is evident from the communication sent by them only on 26.10.2010 and that the response from that Ministry had not been received. The Committee strongly condemn the lackadaisical attitude of the Ministry of Railways and urge them to take the problem of false caste certificate cases seriously. In regard to cases pending in courts, it has been stated that in 9 cases, the stay has been vacated and the cases have been referred to State Level Committee for verifying the genuineness of Community Certificate. In regard to cases pending with State Authorities, the Committee recommend that Southern Railway should send fresh requests to appropriate State authorities to complete verification/investigations of all the pending cases of false caste certificates within one month. In case the reports are not received by the fixed date, Southern Railway should initiate disciplinary action promptly under conduct rules against the employees who produced false

caste certificate and whose cases are pending. The Committee expect that the Railways would take Departmental action against the employees under moral turpitude as assured by Chairman, Railway Board during evidence as removing such people from the service is the only way to stop this menace. As the Ministry have not provided with the exact number of pending cases with State Authorities as also in different courts, the Committee should be apprised of the exact number of cases still pending with State Authorities and in different courts, the reasons as to why these are pending and efforts to settle these cases. The Committee should also be apprised of the details and outcome of action taken in regard to false caste certificate cases as also the response of the Ministry of Personnel, Grievances and Pensions in response to the communication of the Ministry of Railways dated 26.10.2010.

### Catering Policy, 2005 and Book Stall Policy, 2004

#### Recommendation (Sl. No. 28, Para No. 4.26)

1.65 The Committee note that the Catering Policy 2005 provides for reservation of 49.5% for various categories. This includes reservation of 12% for SCs and 8% for STs in small catering units at 'D', 'E' and 'F' category stations. Further, at 'A', 'B', 'C' category stations, a reservation of 10% (6% for SCs and 4% for STs) out of 25% in award of small catering units has been provided in the new catering policy. The Committee also note that in the Book Stall policy, a reservation of 6% for SCs and 4% for STs out of 25% has been provided in the allotment of new book stalls at 'B', 'C', 'D', 'E' and 'F' category of stations. However, there is no provision for reservation in all catering/vending licenses of major units like Refreshment Room/Restaurant, Pantry car, etc. as these are awarded under two packet tender system so as to bring about tangible

improvement in catering services to the passengers and increase the Railway revenue. The Committee note that no major contract was awarded to SCs/STs during the last three years. Although SC/ST people are not debarred from applying for major contract, yet the Committee feel that a provision for reservation to SCs/STs in awarding major contracts, would definitely help SC/ST peoples. The Committee, therefore, urge the Indian Railways to provide reservation to SCs and STs in award of licenses for major catering contracts also, so that they may get an opportunity to try their mettle in catering business and thus improve upon their economic condition.

# Reply of the Government

- 1.66 The allotment of stalls to reserved category is done in accordance with the Railway Board's policy circulated vide Commercial Circular No.57/05. Reservation at A, B, C category of stations is fixed at 25%, of which 6% is allotted for SCs. Chennai Central is classified as "A1" categories station. The allotment of stalls (reserve category) at Chennai Central is done by the Divisional Railway Manager, Chennai Division, by calling applications through press notification and after scrutiny, the eligible applicants will be allotted the stalls.
- 1.67 During evidence it was pointed out that there is some discrimination in allotment of catering units to SC/ST people as they are provided small stalls to sell fruits and panmasala very close to the public toilets whereas the other category people get the stalls in prime locations. In response, General Manager, Southern Railway stated:-

"The first thing you asked was whether there is any discrimination in the allotment and also the location of the catering units or stalls given to SC/ST candidates as compared to other people. I would like to assure you – and also there is a policy of the Board – that we make no discrimination. In fact, the locations are mentioned before we call for the applications"

1.68 Chairman, Railway Board elaborated about the new catering policy thus:-

"We have got a new Catering Policy now. It was issued very recently on 21<sup>st</sup> of July. In between the work has been shifted to IRCTC who were doing mobile catering allotments and even the static units allotment was shifted to them. Now we are taking them back to the Zonal Railways because of the complaints received and also the criticisms made in Parliament."

1.69 In regard to reservation in catering, Chairman, Railway Board stated:-

"I would like to clarify to you that in the new catering policy there is a reservation of 25 per cent in `A', `B' and `C' categories in minor units, in the stalls, in which Scheduled Castes have a quota of 6 per cent; Scheduled Tribes have a quota of 4 per cent; Below Poverty Line people have a quota of 3 per cent; Freedom Fighters and Women including War Widows have a quota of 4 per cent. OBCs have a quota of 3 per cent; Minorities have a quota of 3 per cent; and Physically Challenged Persons have a quota of 2 per cent. That makes a total figure of 25 per cent. We are going to ensure that this particular 25 per cent reservation is implemented properly. In the new policy, we are now taking over to the Railways because we found that this was not getting adhered to."

1.70 In regard to backlog allotment of units, he stated:-

"There is 25 per cent segregation for SC/ST people and some other category of people for the static unit. There, we find that there is a backlog of a total of 20 units in the Southern Railway."

1.71 He further clarified:-

"A total of 20 units backlog is there. We are committed to clear this backlog very soon. We have directions from the hon. Minister and we have some targets for us that by the end of this financial year we will have to achieve a certain percentage and we will be addressing this issue immediately.

For the mobile catering also, we will be taking it over. But there is no reservation while awarding the contract for mobile catering service. We will be trying to do it ourselves as far as possible. If some contracts are given already by the IRCTC, gradually the Railways will take over everything in a phased manner. So, that is the directive from the hon. Minister. So, I think, that problem will also get addressed.

1.72 When it was pointed that for catering in Chennai no advertisement has been given as stated in their action taken reply, the Chairman, Railway Board stated:-

"If it is not there, we will now ensure that the policy is implemented in toto".

1.73 Not finding the response to the recommendation of the Committee for providing reservation to SCs and STs in award of licenses for major catering contracts it was asked whether the Ministry implied that if the reservation is provided to SCs/STs, the quality of service will not be up to the mark, and asked Government to frame elaborate rules and standard of service and then provide reservation. In regard to non-reservation in major units, the Ministry in their post evidence reply stated that the Committee, on various occasions, have raised the issue of reservation being extended to management of major catering and bookstalls to SCs and STs. For Bookstalls contracts reservation was provided for below 'A' category of Railway Station, in the last Bookstall Policy issued in 2004. The position has already been explained through various Action Taken Notes submitted to the Committee. It is once again reiterated that as a policy, Ministry of Railways has taken a stand that there will be no reservation in allotment of licenses for major catering units. Management of major units requires a lot of managerial acumen, functional capabilities and catering experience and capability to muster resources including financial resources and such management of catering services are required to cater to large scale operation in order to meet the aspiration and requirements of the traveling public. Major units require the best available in the trade. Catering today is related with the development of tourism industry in India and at international level. A catering contract now is not merely a service contract for an individual to serve but has become more complicated and is beyond the competence of one or two persons to manage the multifarious activities involved in maintaining services under the contract. It requires a full-fledged organization/company with experience or individuals having competence in the diverse activities which form the catering services. There is a huge quantum of specialized work and risk is high. Hence the percentage of reservation as is necessary in service matter is not applicable for

Central Government about reservation, its percentage and criteria for commercial contracts and licenses. Reservation up to 25% in the allotment of minor catering units at A, B and C category stations and 49.5% at D, E and F category stations and 25% at B, C, D and E category station has been primarily done as a social obligation of the Government. However, SC and ST persons are not debarred from participating in the allotment of major catering units. They are eligible at par with other similar aspirants.

1.74 Further, after the interim order of 16.09.2009, the stay on the previous Catering Policy 2005 was vacated by Hon'ble Supreme Court and it was communicated to the Zonal Railways to implement the same. Hon'ble Supreme Court in its final judgment in SLP No. 10742-43/2007 dated 04.08.2010 has disposed of the SLPs challenging the clauses on reservation and others in the Catering Policy 2005, as infraction since the Railways have reviewed the policy and introduced Catering Policy 2010 dated 21.07.2010 wherein, the clauses on the reservation which existed in the previous policy have been retained.

major catering units awarded by tender system. Further, there are no directives from

#### **Comments of the Committee**

1.75 The Committee are dismayed that the Ministry are simply putting up the facts which are known to the Committee already. The argument of the Ministry that no reservation is provided for taking up major units in order to bring improvement in catering services, grossly undermines the ability of SC/ST people as a whole. If the quality is the concern then a minimum prescribed standard/past performance can be adopted. The Committee feel that the Railways are in fact not at all inclined to provide reservation for SCs and STs in allotment of majors units even though it is emphasized that SC and ST persons are not debarred from participating in the allotment of major catering units and

that they are eligible at par with other similar aspirants. This logic seems hollow as SC/ST will not stand a chance in competition without providing reservation in allotment. The Committee were told during evidence that the Railways have a new Catering Policy since 21 July, 2010 and that the mobile and static allotments for catering units which was shifted to IRCTC earlier is being taken over by the Zonal Railways. The reason for taking back catering allotment was that the Railways had received complaints and also criticisms made in Parliament as stated during evidence. The Committee, therefore, expect that the Railway Board would consider providing reservation to SC/ST groups of caterers if not to individuals who may perhaps be able to provide quality service. The Committee were also told during evidence that there is backlog of 20 units per allotment in Southern Railway and that those allotments have to be completed by 31.3.2011. The Committee should be apprised whether those allotments have been completed by 31.3.2011. The Committee should also be apprised of the allotment position in Chennai.

#### **Projects for Backward Tribal and Undeveloped Areas**

#### Recommendation (Sl. No. 31, Para No. 4.32)

1.76 The Committee appreciate the fact that Indian Railways have taken up many projects on consideration of socio-economic development in backward tribal and undeveloped areas although majority of these projects are not financially viable. The Committee desire that adequate funds should be made available for these ongoing projects so that these areas are provided efficient line of connectivity contributing to their overall growth.

## **Reply of the Government**

1.77 Most of the new line projects are financially unviable and have been taken up on socio-economic consideration for development of hilly, tribal, underdeveloped and backward areas. The throw forward of new lines is about Rs.45000 crores, as on 1.4.08, and funds being provided per year are of the order of about Rs.2500 crores including National Projects. The funds are not sufficient to progress the projects in a satisfactory manner. The funds are not even adequate to cover for escalation. Considering this, Hon'ble Minister of Railways have requested Chief Ministers of States to agree to share atleast 50% of the cost of said projects. However, only a few State Governments have agreed to share the cost of projects in their State.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

1.78 The Committee are dismayed by the fact that the projects taken up by the Ministry cannot be completed due to insufficient fund for development of remote hilly tribal areas etc. By not connecting those remote and backward tribal areas in the past have already alienated the tribal people in the country because of which the Government are facing the revolt in these areas. The Committee, therefore, urge that all out efforts should be made to connect those remote and under developed tribal areas with other parts of the country by railway network. Resource crunch should not be the reason for delay in these projects because infrastructural development is the basic need for overall development of an area. The Committee also urge the Ministry to ask for more funds from the Centre for completing all projects in these areas. The Committee also feel that if local labour and resources are used in the projects then the cost may come down. Parts of the work which require unskilled labour can be done using local labour under MGNREGA Scheme by involving the Panchyati Raj institutions. The

Committee feel that unless wholehearted efforts are not undertaken by the Ministry such projects will always remain only on paper. The Committee would like to be apprised of the development taking place in this direction.

#### **CHAPTER II**

# RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT

#### Recommendation (Sl. No. 3, Para No. 1.18)

The Committee note that a Reservation Cell has been set up in Southern Railway in Headquarters office as well as on each Division to look after the interests of Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe employees. Keeping in view the fact that the Chief Liaison Officer and Liaison Officers are responsible for supply of information, answering questions and queries and clearing doubts in regard to matters covered by the reservation orders and other assigned duties pertaining to SCs/STs, they are expected to be well conversant with reservation orders/rules. The Committee, therefore, desire that the Chief Liaison Officer and Liaison Officers should be given adequate training on reservation related matters, so that reservation orders may be implemented properly. The Committee also recommend that the Annual Inspections of Divisions/Units/headquarters should be strictly carried out by these Officers, so that cases of negligence or lapses in the matter of following the reservation and other orders relating to SCs/STs may be handed timely/properly.

#### **Reply of the Government**

2.2 The recommendation was referred to Southern Railway who have stated that in respect of non-gazetted staff, training programme are regularly organized on Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe reservation matters at Zonal Training Centre, Trichy. For officers, efforts would be made to organize such training programmes at Railway Staff College, Vadodara or by the Department of Personnel & Training at New Delhi, with the approval of Railway Board.

- 2.3 Regarding annual inspection of Divisions/Units/Headquarters by Chief Liaison Officer and Liaison Officers, all out efforts would be made to conduct such inspections for timely implementation of orders pertaining to Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes.
- 2.4 Having noted that efforts to organise training programmes for officers on reservation matters were made, it was enquired whether any liaison officer was deputed for training during the year 2010. In their post evidence reply, the Ministry of Railways stated that in this regard one officer was deputed for training during 2010.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

## 2.5 Please see Para No. 1.16 of Chapter I.

## Recommendation (S.No. 4 Para No. 1.27)

2.6 The Committee note with concern that during periodic inspection, some discrepancies had been noted, one of which was that the controlling officers were not watching the sanction, actual vacancy and percentage of shortfall of SC/ST in the category and grade in post based roster. The Committee view it as a very serious lapse. The Committee recommend that such lapses on the part of controlling officers should be viewed seriously and he should be made accountable and liable to disciplinary action. The Committee also note with concern that the rosters had not been examined in the Southern Railway by Liaison Officer/officers of the Railway Board. Keeping in view the fact that rosters are important documents to keep watch on the implementation of reservation orders fully and to identify vacancies reserved for SCs/STs, the Committee recommend that Liaison Officer of the Ministry should make it a regular practice to visit the Divisions/Units/Headquarters of each zone at least once in a year to ensure that reservation orders are implemented in all respects and the lapse on the part of controlling officers are not repeated. Any discrepancies noted during inspection

should be rectified immediately or brought to the notice of higher officials for corrections/rectifications. The Committee feel that roster is a very important document as far as the interest and welfare of SCs/STs are concerned. In fact, the successful implementation of reservation rules depends entirely on proper maintenance of the rosters. Even slight miscalculation of roster points, whether for recruitment or promotion, may hamper employment/promotional opportunities for SCs/STs. All necessary information pertaining to the officials concerned should be duly filled in the respective columns provided for the purpose. Every entry made in the rosters should be neat and clean and over writing should not be allowed. The Committee recommend that rosters should clearly be signed with date and authenticated with official stamp of the inspecting officer concerned as a proof of the rosters having been inspected. The Committee also emphasise that liaison officers and officials working in the SC/ST Cell should be given orientation training on reservation matters so that they may not be found wanted in proper maintenance of rosters. The Committee also recommends that necessary software should be developed for effective maintenance of rosters in the Railways, including Southern Railway.

## **Reply of the Government**

- 2.7 The recommendation of the Committee has been noted. It will be ensured that in future such lapses on the part of the Controlling Officers in the matter of maintenance of post based rosters would be viewed seriously and they would be made accountable and liable to disciplinary action. Railways have been advised on these lines vide letter No.2004-E(SCT)I/80/2 Pt.IV dated 5-06-2008.
- 2.8 It is also to state that the detailed instructions on the principle/guidelines regarding proper maintenance of Roster Register and the inspection of the same at regular intervals have been issued from time to time since 1970, which was last

reiterated on 3.6.2004. On receipt of the recommendation of the Hon'ble Committee on the Welfare of SCs/STs on the Ministry of Railways contained in the 17<sup>th</sup> Report (14<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) for North Eastern Railway, the same had again been reiterated on 10.7.2007 to all the Zonal Railways including Southern Railway for strict compliance.

2.9 As recommended by the Committee, instructions regarding signing and authentication of inspections of roster by the Inspecting Officers have been issued to the Zonal Railways/Production Units vide letter No.2004-E(SCT)I/80/2 Part-IV dated 5-06-2008.

## Recommendation (S.No. 8 Para No. 2.15)

2.10 The Committee note that the minimum period of notice given to the candidates is three weeks for written test and three weeks for interview. The Committee also note that appointment letters are issued to the selected candidates giving one month's period to report. Keeping in view the fact that majority of the SC/ST candidates live in backward, remote rural and hilly areas where mode of transport as well as communication system are not so good, the Committee recommend that at the expiry of one month's period provision to issue reminders may also be made so that such SC/ST candidates may not lose the opportunity of getting the job for lack of communication.

## **Reply of the Government**

2.11 In response to the Hon'ble Committee's recommendation, Southern Railway have apprised that offer of appointments are sent by registered post with acknowledgment receipt giving about a months time to report. If the candidates do not respond to the offer of appointment atleast 2 to 3 reminders letters are sent to ensure that the candidates do not lose the opportunity of employment.

## Recommendation (S.No. 9 Para No. 2.19)

2.12 The Committee note that the Ministry of Railways provide many concessions and relaxations on recruitment to SC/ST candidates. The Committee appreciate that SC/ST candidates who fall in the initial training course are allowed repeat training course. The Committee observe that the percentage of SC candidates who successfully completed repeat training course during the years 2003, 2004 and 2005 was 100%, 75% and 79% respectively, while in respect of ST candidates it was 100% during the same period. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Railway Board should be more sensitive to the needs of the SC/ST people and continue to impart necessary training, wherever needed. The Committee hope that corrective steps would be taken so that number of SC candidates who completed repeat training may reach upto 100%.

## Reply of the Government

2.13 The Committee's recommendations are noted. All out efforts will be taken to improve the standard of training to Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates and to increase the number of Scheduled Caste candidates who completed repeat training to maximum.

#### Recommendation (S.No. 10, Para No. 2.25)

2.14 The Committee note from the statement furnished by the Ministry that Southern railway was conducting recruitment regularly. At the same time, the trend of carrying forward reserved vacancies to next recruitment year has also been noticed, which the Committee feel is against the interest of the SCs and STs. As on 1.1.2005, the carry forward vacancies in Group 'C' and 'D' for SCs were 157 and 210 and for STs these were 161 and 500, respectively whereas similar information has not been furnished for

subsequent years. From the statement of recruitment held as on 1.1.2006, the position is not clear as to whether the current vacancies of SC/ST for that particular recruitment year have been taken into account or the number is for filling up of carry forward vacancies through special recruitment drive. The carry forward vacancies are clearly to be dealt with separately from the current vacancies of a particular year. The Committee should, therefore, be apprised of the same. The Committee should also be apprised of the latest position in regard to recruitment as on 1.1.2007.

## **Reply of the Government**

- 2.15 Recruitment to Group 'C' and Group 'D' categories is regularly done in Southern Railway. Whenever vacancies are assessed for placing indents on Railway Recruitment Board, the Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe vacancies remaining unfilled in the previous year are carried forward and added to the current vacancies and accordingly recruitment is done. The carry forward vacancies are taken into account while calculating current vacancies and indents placed for recruitment.
- 2.16 In the case of <u>promotion categories</u> where the vacancies could not be filled due to non-availability of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees in the feeder category, such vacancies are diverted to <u>recruitment quota</u> in terms of Railway Board's instructions contained in letter No.99-E(SCT)I/25/10 dated 11-05-1999 and filled up. In this process <u>563</u> vacancies, as detailed below were filled up upto 31.12.07. In addition to 563 vacancies, 511 Group 'D' Railway Recruitment Board papers were supplied to wipe out Scheduled Tribe shortfall. It may thus be appreciated that action has been taken to fill up 1077 vacancies in toto.

		Recru	itment		Promotion			
Vacancies	Grou	ıb ,C,	Grou	ıp 'D'	Grou	ір 'С'	Gro	up 'D'
	SC	ST	SC	ST	SC	ST	SC	ST
As on 1.1.07	210	410	99	246	1016	1715	298	772
As on 1.1.08	126	343	119	180	864	1617	239	732
Filled	84	67	ı	66	152	98	59	40

- 2.17 For the remaining vacancies following course of action has been taken :-
- Notification for conducting Group 'D' Recruitment has been issued on 24.11.07 for filling up 3517 vacancies. Of this 475 vacancies are reserved for Scheduled Caste and 470 vacancies for Scheduled Tribes. The Recruitment is under process.
- 2. As a special course of action 511 Group 'D' papers received from Railway Recruitment Board/Chennai were distributed to all Divisions of Southern Railway to fill up the safety categories where train operations is involved.
- As directed by the Ministry of Railways, 1002 Licensed Porters were empanelled in Southern Railway for appointment as Trackman. Out of this 1002, 293 Scheduled Castes and 5 Scheduled Tribes will be appointed shortly.
- 2.18 During evidence held on 9.9.2010, it was pointed out that there is a complaint that the Railways are not going for true recruitment and not filling up the vacancies on time. In this connection, mention was made about Tambaram Railway Station where VIP lounge is there but it is always closed as there is no manpower to attend to it.
- 2.19 In response, the representative of Southern Railway stated:-

<sup>&</sup>quot;I will check it since you have mentioned it".

- 2.20 During evidence, the Committee also sought an explanation from the Ministry of Railways with regard to backlog vacancies and enquired as why they are not being filled up despite of prime Minister's instructions. In reply, the representative of the Ministry of Railways stated:-
  - ".....there is a backlog of 26,000 posts, out of which 14,000 is from recruitment and 12,000 from promotional posts. We are processing them."

It was further stated that:

- "As per Prime Minister's direction we took a recruitment drive in 2004 and we implemented about 99.3 per cent of the backlog and in the case of promotion it was about 83.7 per cent. Again we started a drive from 1.11.2008. It is in the process. When the vacancies are filled up along with that, the backlog will be complete."
- 2.21 In a written query, the Committee desired to know what efforts have been taken by the Southern Railway to fill the current SC/ST vacancies in the same recruiting year and also that whether any special recruitment drive has been done to fill up the SC/ST vacancies separately and the number, name of such posts and year of recruitment.
- 2.22 In their post evidence reply, the Ministry of Railways stated that:-
  - (a) For filling up current SC/ST vacancies in the same recruitment year, indents are placed on Railway Recruitment Boards Chennai and Trivandrum to conduct recruitment.
  - (d) Indents were already placed on Railway Recruitment Boards, Chennai and Trivandrum for conducting special recruitment drive as per the details furnished below. The vacancies under special recruitment drive are not clubbed in General recruitment process.

Group 'C'	RRB/Chennai	RRB/Trivandrum
SC	288	116
ST	345	64

Group 'D'	Railway Recruitment Cell/Chennai	
SC	95	
ST	141	

- (e) No vacancies reserved for SCs/STs, current or backlog were de-reserved during the last 5 years in Southern Railway.
- 2.23 In their post evidence reply the Ministry have further stated that the Indents have been placed for 656 ST vacancies in Group 'C' categories on Railway Recruitment Boards, Chennai and Trivandrum for conducting recruitment, which includes special recruitment drive also. Further the written examinations for the posts of Assistant Loco Pilot and Assistant Station Master were held on 6.6.2010 and 13.6.2010 respectively. In respect of Enquiry cum Reservation Clerk and Goods Guard, the written examination was held on 26.9.2010. The Railway Recruitment Boards have to finalise the result and other formalities before sending the panel to Railways. It was also submitted that in respect of Group 'D' posts, indents have been placed for 470 vacancies of ST on Railway Recruitment Cell/Chennai to conduct recruitment. The details of the posts category-wise are provided as under:-

## **Group 'C' Posts**

SI.No	Name of category	ST
1	Section Engineer/Mechanical	7
2	Section Engineer/Electrical	8
3	Section Engineer/Engineering	6
4	Section Engineer/S&T	7
5	Junior Engineer/Mechanical	14
6	Junior Engineer/Electrical	14
7	Junior Engineer/Engineering	8
8	Junior Engineer/S&T	2
9	Technician/Mechanical	241
10	Technician/Electrical	68

11	Technician/S&T	1
12	Technician/Engineering	1
13	Assistant Loco Pilot/Operating	57
14	Staff Nurse	14
15	Health & Malaria Inspector	10
16	Pharmacist	5
17	Assistant Station Master	36
18	Goods Guard	21
19	Jr. Stenographer	17
20	Sr.Clerk	24
21	Clerk	14
22	Teacher	1
23	Enquiry-cum-Reservation Clerk	18
24	Ticket Collector	38
25	Commercial Clerk	19
26	Chief Metological Assistant	2
27	Train Clerk	3
	Total	656

## Group 'D' posts

SI.No	Name of the post	Department	ST
1	Sweeper cum Porter	Operating	59
2	Sweepr cum Porter	Commercial	2
3	Helper Gr.II	Electrical	33
4	Helper Gr.II	Mechanical	53
5	Helper Gr.II	S&T	8
6	Helper Gr.II	Stores	25
7	Trackman	Civil Engg.	219
8	Safaiwala Gr.III	Medical	71
		Total	470

## **Comments of the Committee**

## 2.24 Please see Para No. 1.37 of Chapter I.

## Recommendation (Sl. No. 11, Para No. 2.26)

2.25 The Committee regret to note that the reasons for carrying forward the reserved vacancies are stated to be the poor response from SC/ST candidates and non-availability of suitable candidates from these categories. The reason for less number of recruitment of SCs and STs is also attributed to the instruction from Railway Board to reduce the staff strength as Southern Railway has been one of the loss making Railways. The Committee are of the view that the SC/ST vacancies should not be reduced while reducing the total staff strength as these are the vacancies which should have been filled up by SC/ST candidates in the past.

## **Reply of the Government**

- 2.26 The recommendation was forwarded to Southern Railway who have stated that reduction in staff strength is unavoidable due to modernization and technological changes. Besides, as a policy of Government of India of Man Power Planning, every year the sanctioned strength has to be reduced by one percent (1%) and actual has to be reduced by two percent (2%). In this process, the sanctioned strength in general gets reduced. The reduction is affected in the overall sanctioned strength and not restricting only to Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe posts.
- 2.27 The Ministry in their post evidence reply, however, have denied that lesser recruitment of SC/ST is due to instructions from Railway Board as Southern Railway has been one of the loss making railway zones. Keeping in mind the statement given by the representative of the Ministry during evidence held on 15 September, 2006 that between 2001 and 2004 the recruitment of SCs and STs had been less and the reason being that the Southern Railway was one of the loss making Railway zones and that the Railway Board instructed Southern Railway to reduce the staff strength, the Committee had desired to know whether the carried forward vacancies of SC/ST

backlog vacancies were not included in the total strength of the Zonal Railways while reducing the strength of employees over the period of time. The Ministry were, therefore, asked to furnish backlog vacancies as also other vacancies during the years from 2005 to 2009 alongwith total number of vacancies reduced including the number. of backlog vacancies for SC/ST, if any.

2.28 The Ministry have not provided vacancy position for the year 2005 as it was not available with them. However, they have furnished the vacancy position from the year 2006 to 2009 as below adding that the carry forward vacancy of SC/ST is kept separately and added to the current vacancies of the next year for placing indents.

## **Vacancy position of Group 'C'**

SI.No.	Year	Sanction	Actual	Vacancy
1	2006	83055	73911	9144
2	2007	82789	75006	7783
3	2008	82643	75617	7026
4	2009	84329	75546	8783

#### **Vacancy position of Group 'D'**

SI.No.	Year	Sanction	Actual	Vacancy
1	2006	29798	27869	1929
2	2007	28661	26725	1936
3	2008	27727	25443	2284
4	2009	27796	26757	1039

#### DETAILS OF POSTS SURRENDERED IN GROUP 'C' AND 'D'

SI.No.	Year	Group 'C'	Group 'D'	Total
1	2006	1011	1342	2353
2	2007	565	738	1303
3	2008	499	978	1477
4	2009	383	596	979

2.29 The Ministry have also informed that while right sizing takes place in whole of zonal railways as per the policy guidelines issued by Railway Board the same is effected based on the total staff strength and operative staff strength irrespective of community.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

## 2.30 Please see Para No. 1.43 of Chapter I.

## Recommendation (S.No. 13, Para No. 2.35)

2.31 The Committee note that there has been a huge shortfall in the promotion of SC/ST candidates every year during the years-2001 to 2005. The reason for the shortfall has been stated to be the non-availability of eligible SC/ST candidates in the feeder grade. The Committee also note that the position has improved after the special promotion drive was undertaken to clear the shortfall in promotional categories and vacancies had been diverted to recruitment categories to fill up these promotional vacancies through open market as per extant rules. According to the position as on 30.9.2006, the Committee note that there is shortfall of SC numbering 29 in Group 'B' and 80 in Group 'C' and that of 4 ST in Group 'B' categories. The Committee hope that Southern Railway would be able to fill up the remaining shortfall in Group 'B' and 'C' categories within a definite time frame. Progress achieved in this regard should be communicated to the Committee.

## Reply of the Government

2.32 In reply to the recommendation of the Parliamentary Committee, it is stated that:In order to wipe out Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe shortfall vacancies, Southern
Railway administration have taken the following course of action.

(a) Recruitment drive as on 31.03.04.

In this drive 731 vacancies were identified and all the vacancies were filled.

	Group 'C'	Group 'D'
Vacancies identified as on 31.03.04	271 (SC-126, ST-145)	460 (SC-88, ST-372)
Vacancies filled	271 (SC-126, ST-145)	460 (SC-88, ST-372)
Balance	NIL	NIL

(b) Promotional drive as on 1.07.04.

In this drive 4651 vacancies were identified and 4119 vacancies were filled.

	Group 'C'	Group 'D'
Vacancies identified as	2594 (SC-1382, ST-	2057 (SC-940, ST-1117)
on 1.07.04	1212)	
Vacancies filled	2537 (SC-1371, ST-	1582 (SC-465, ST-1117)
	1166)	
Balance	57 (SC-11, ST-46)	475 (SC-475, ST-NIL)

The shortfall vacancies were carried forward and added to the current vacancies and accordingly indents have been placed as follows for Group 'C' categories.

(c) Details of indent placed with Railway Recruitment Board's as on 15.05.08.

	Scheduled Caste	Scheduled Tribe
Railway Recruitment Board,	94	119
Chennai		
Railway Recruitment Board, Trivendrum	4	6
TOTAL	98	125

- 2.33 In respect of Group 'D' categories the following course of action has been taken to wipe out Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe shortfall.
- Notification for conducting Group 'D' Recruitment has been issued on 24.11.07 to fill up 3517 vacancies. Of this 475 vacancies are reserved for Scheduled Castes and 470 vacancies for Scheduled Tribes. The recruitment is under process.

- 2. As a special course of action, 511 <u>Group 'D' papers</u> received from Railway Recruitment Board/Chennai were distributed to all Divisions of Southern Railway to fill up the safety categories where train operations is involved.
- 1002 Licensed Porters were empanelled in Southern Railway for appointment as Trackman, Out of this 1002, 293 Scheduled Castes and 5 Scheduled Tribes will be appointed shortly.
- 2.34 From the details furnished at (a) and (b), it could be seen that a large number of Group 'C' and 'D' vacancies were filled up. With regard to Group 'B' post, it is stated that in safety category posts where there is no relaxation in qualifying marks, the eligible candidates belonging to Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe are imparted pre-selection coaching to improve their level of knowledge. In respect of non-safety categories in addition to imparting pre-selection coaching, there is relaxation in qualifying marks for candidates belonging to Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe. In addition, the principle of promoting, "the best amongst the failed candidates" on ad-hoc basis is followed.
- 2.35 By following the above procedures, all out efforts are being made to ensure that adequate candidates are available for promotion to Group 'B' posts.

## Recommendation (S.No. 15, Para No. 2.53)

2.36 The Committee note that according to staff strength as on 1.1.2005, the percentage of SC employees was more than the prescribed limit of 15% whereas the percentage of ST employees was less than the prescribed limit of 7.5% in all categories of post including both categories of Groups 'D' post. The Committee note that as per the statement at para 2.29, the ST employees in Group 'A', 'B', 'C' and 'D' (excluding Safaiwala) and Group 'D' (Safaiwala) posts are 5.57%, 6.86%, 4.52%, 2.57% and 1.80%, respectively of total employees in each category. The Committee further note

that one of the reasons for the shortfall is reported to be reservation limit of 4% for ST in direct recruitment to Group 'C' and 'D' post till August, 1997. As a result, the prescribed percentage of 7.5% for ST could not be achieved as there was no suitable ST candidate in feeder grade for promotion to higher grade. The Committee, however, observes that the prescribed percentage of 7.5% has also not been maintained even in Group 'A' posts whereas recruitment at entry level in this category is done by the Railway Board through UPSC. Even though the percentage of ST category has been mentioned as only 5.57%, it is intriguing to note that there is no shortfall of ST employees in that category in Southern Railway. The Committee would, therefore, like to know the reason as to how shortfall has been calculated. The Committee also note that there is shortfall of 3 ST employees in Group 'B' posts which is promotional category and need to be filled up at the earliest.

## **Reply of the Government**

- 2.37 The concern of the Committee on the maintenance of prescribed percentage in Group 'A' posts is noted. It may be stated that while sending/placing indents to Union Public Service Commission, the details of total number of vacancies, specifying number of vacancies reserved for Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe are mentioned as per the post based roster so as to maintain prescribed percentage of reservation during recruitment. All out efforts would be made for maintaining the prescribed percentage of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe strength in Group 'A' cadre at Southern Railway.
- 2.38 In respect of Group 'B' posts, adequate pre-promotional training are being given to Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees to enable them to get selected (There is no direct recruitment in Group 'B' posts).
- 2.39 It is stated that in safety category posts where there is no relaxation in qualifying marks, the eligible candidates belonging to Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe are

imparted pre-selection coaching to improve their level of knowledge. In respect of non-safety categories in addition to imparting pre-selection coaching, there is relaxation in qualifying marks for candidates belonging to Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe. In addition, the principle of promoting, "the best amongst the failed candidates on ad-hoc basis is followed.

2.40 By following the above procedures, all out efforts are made to ensure that adequate candidates are available for promotion to Group 'B' posts.

## Recommendation (S.No. 16, Para No. 2.54)

2.41 The Committee note that there is huge shortfall in ST category in Group 'C' i.e. 2279 and in Group 'D' (excluding Safaiwala) and Group 'D' (Safaiwala) posts, these are 1340 and 126, respectively. As the shortfall has been shown for all posts in a particular group together, it is difficult to make out whether the shortfalls are in non-technical or technical posts. Whereas Southern Railway has claimed that there is no difficulty in getting adequate SC and ST candidates for the non-technical popular categories, the Committee consider the existence of huge shortfall in Group 'D' posts (both categories) a matter of great concern as all the shortfall may not be in technical posts. The Committee strongly feel that Southern Railway have not taken appropriate action at appropriate time to fill up the prescribed number of ST candidates in these categories. The Committee recommend that Southern Railway should provide the break-up of nontechnical and technical posts of Group 'C' and Group 'D' posts (both categories) for which a consolidated figure each has been submitted as shown at para 2.37. The Committee are of the view that SC/ST vacancies should not remain unfilled for a long time. Unless concerted efforts are taken at the right time, the shortfall will continue to

grow. The Committee may also be apprised how the above mentioned shortfall of ST in Group 'C' and Group 'D' are being wiped out at the earliest.

## **Reply of the Government**

2.42 The Committee's recommendation to show the position of shortfall vacancies separately for Technical and non-technical posts has been noted and efforts would be made to fulfill the same in future. Regarding filling up of Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe vacancies, indents have already been placed for both Group 'C' and 'D' posts and the shortfall would be wiped out at the earliest.

## Recommendation (S.No. 20, Para No. 3.13)

2.43 The Committee note that in service training is being provided to SC/ST employees for their promotion to higher grade in non safety categories and in order to enable the SC/ST employees to qualify for promotion to posts in safety categories, arrangements have been made to give them pre-selection coaching without fail. The Committee hope that this trend will continue in the years to come for better intake of SC/ST employees in promotional posts.

## **Reply of the Government**

2.44 The recommendation was forwarded to Southern Railway who have stated that as directed by Railway Board vide their letter No.96-E(SCT)I/80/1 Pt.XVII dated 15.12.97, pre-promotional training are being conducted and this procedure will be followed in the years to come.

## Recommendation (S.No. 21, Para No. 3.14)

2.45 The Committee also feel that besides launching special recruitment drives more frequently, Southern Railway should also make sincere efforts to provide in service

training to more and more SC/ST employees, so that sufficient number of SC/ST employees can be promoted to eliminate the shortfall in these categories.

## **Reply of the Government**

2.46 The concern of the committee is noted and all out efforts will be taken to provide in service training, besides the pre-promotional training, so as to get sufficient Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees to fill up Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe vacancies.

## Recommendation (S.No. 23, Para No. 3.19)

2.47 The Committee note that out of a total of 161 employees, only 8 SC and 2 ST employees were sent on deputation to other departments during the years 2000 to September 2006. The Committee are not convinced with the reply of Southern Railway that SC/ST employees with sufficient number/sufficient eligibility criteria prescribed are not coming forward to volunteer for the deputation. The Committee, therefore, desire that Southern Railway should make extra efforts to encourage SC/ST employees to opt for deputation, so that adequate representation could be given to SCs/STs while sending the employees for deputation. The Committee feel sending SC/ST employees on deputation would definitely improve their knowledge and also their efficiency.

#### **Reply of the Government**

2.48 The recommendation of the committee is noted. Southern Railway administration have assured to make necessary arrangements to encourage the Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees to volunteer for deputation.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

#### 2.49 Please see Para No. 1.56 of Chapter I.

## Recommendation (S.No. 26, Para No. 4.13)

2.50 The Committee note that every year a number of persons are being appointed in Southern Railway on compassionate grounds. Out of 995 candidates appointed during the year 2004-05, 280 were SC and 18 belonged to ST categories. The Committee also note that there were 69 pending cases in Divisions, out of which 19 cases pertained to SC and 1 case pertained to ST community. The Ministry has further informed that 18 SCs and 1 ST were offered appointment and only 1 SC candidates is waiting for appointment. The Committee appreciates the efforts made by Southern Railway in disposing of pending SC and ST cases speedily. The Committee expects that the same spirit of urgency and efficiency would be kept up in dealing with other cases of compassionate appointments within specific time frame so that the dependents of the deceased SC/ST employees do not face hardships after the demise of their breadwinner.

## **Reply of the Government**

2.51 The recommendation of the committee is noted. Southern Railway administration have assured that all out efforts would be made to offer compassionate ground appointment within specified time frame.

#### Recommendation (S.No. 27, Para No. 4.16)

2.52 The Committee appreciate that Southern Railway have allotted more than the prescribed percentage in allotment of quarters to SC/ST employees. The Committee hope that they will continue to keep up this spirit in future also.

## **Reply of the Government**

2.53 The recommendation of the committee is noted. It is stated that the Southern Railway administration would keep up the same spirit in future.

#### CHAPTER III

# Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in the light of the replies received from the Government

## Recommendation (S.No. 1, Para No. 1.13)

The Committee note that there is a separate Cell in the Ministry to look after the interests of SC/ST employees on the Railways and also to ensure proper, strict and timely implementation of the instructions, issued from time to time in regard to Reservation Rules and procedures, etc. The Committee also note that the composition of the Cell consists of 17 incumbents under the control of Member (Staff). The Committee further note that out of the established strength of 17 of the Reservation Cell, only 13 officers/staff are in position and out of which 5 belong to SC and 8 to ST category. The Committee are of the firm view that since Reservation Cell is responsible for maintaining liaison and has to co-ordinate between the Ministry of Railways and all the Railway Establishments in regard to implementation of Reservation Rules and procedures, the Cell should be manned by full sanctioned strength.

#### **Reply of the Government**

3.2 Ministry of Railways have a full fledged reservation cell in the Ministry which exclusively looks after the interests of SC/ST employees on the Railways and also ensures proper, strict and timely implementation of the instructions, issued from time to time in regard to Reservation Rules and Procedures etc. Recently, the sanctioned strength of the cell has been increased from 17 to 21 based on the work study in various Directorates. The Cell at present is being manned by almost full sanctioned strength except for one post.

## Recommendation (S.No. 5, Para No. 2.12)

3.3 The Committee observe that reservations for Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes have been made invariably in all posts filled by direct recruitment and promotion unless exempted by special or General Instructions issued by Railway Board. Recruitment to posts in various Group 'A' services on Indian Railways is done centrally by Railway Board through UPSC whereas there is no direct recruitment to Group 'B' posts and recruitment to Group 'C' is done by Railway Recruitment Board (RRB) at Chennai and Trivandrum and recruitment of various Group 'D' posts on Zonal Railways is being done by Zonal Railways themselves by clubbing their total Group 'D' requirements.

## **Reply of the Government**

3.4 The observations made by the Hon'ble Committee are noted.

#### Recommendation (S.No. 7, Para No. 2.14)

3.5 The Committee observe that employment notification is given in Employment News/national dailies/regional newspapers and desire that copies of the Notifications/Advertisements should also be made available to the local MLAs/MPs and also to the Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes for wider publicity.

## **Reply of the Government**

3.6 Instructions already exists that while undertaking Special Recruitment Drive to wipe out the backlog vacancies of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes, wide publicity about the recruitment in all categories of services should be made through newspapers, doordarshan, radio etc. and information of the same should also been sent to the local MPs/MLAs of the area including the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled

Tribes Associations, polytechnic colleges etc. As recommended by the Hon'ble Committee on the welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes on the Ministry of Railways as contained in their 17<sup>th</sup> Report (14<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha), necessary instructions have been issued to all the Zonal Railways/Production Units and Railway Recruitment Boards advising to send the copies of Employment Notices/advertisements to the local MPs/MLAs/Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes also whenever recruitment action is under taken by the Zonal Railways themselves or by the Railway Recruitment Boards with a view to give wide publicity and to have more response form the eligible candidates belonging to Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes.

3.7 As per the extant practice the copies of notification/advertisement are also made available to Doordarshan for wide publicity.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

#### 3.8 Please see Para No. 1.26 of Chapter I.

## Recommendation (S.No. 12, Para No. 2.27)

3.9 The Committee feel that Southern Railway has not made adequate serious efforts to fill SC/ST posts in the past. The Committee are of the view that unless concerted efforts are made by Southern Railway to fill up all SC/ST posts during every recruitment year, the situation will not improve. The Committee hardly need to point out that mere provision of relaxations/concessions in favour of SC and STs will have no meaning unless the pragmatic and innovative efforts are made to fill up the reserved posts during every recruitment year. This would also do away with the trend of carrying forward vacancies in future recruitment.

## **Reply of the Government**

- 3.10 In response to the Hon'ble Committee's recommendation, the Southern Railway Administration has submitted that all out efforts have been made to fill up the Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe vacancies by conducting regular recruitment and also special drives, as and when directed by Railway Board. The following courses of action have already been taken by Southern Railway to fill up the Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe vacancies which is inclusive of carry forward vacancies as observed by the committee.
- Notification for conducting Group 'D' Recruitment has been issued on 24.11.07
  for filling up 3517 vacancies. Of this 475 vacancies are reserved for Scheduled
  Caste and 470 vacancies for Scheduled Tribes. The Recruitment is under
  process.
- 2. As a special course of action 511 Group 'D' papers received from Railway Recruitment Board/Chennai were distributed to all Divisions of Southern Railway to fill up the safety categories where train operations is involved.
- As directed by the Ministry of Railways, 1002 Licensed Porters were empanelled in Southern Railway for appointment as Trackman. Out of this 1002, 293
   Scheduled Castes and 5 Scheduled Tribes will be appointed shortly.

## Recommendation (S.No. 14, Para No. 2.36)

3.11 The Committee note that a provisions exists in the Railways according to which performance of SC/ST candidates are reviewed by the Head of the Department/General manager for promotion, if reserved quota remains unfilled and the requisite SC/ST candidates though available, have failed to qualify the selection in spite of all relaxations. The Committee further note that during the years 2004 to 2006 performance of 1 ST candidate in 2004 and 5 and 4 SC candidates in 2005 and 2006,

respectively, were reviewed. The Committee are of the view that Southern Railway should be more flexible and not be too rigid while considering such cases for revision. The Committee appreciate that there is a provision to review performance of SC/ST employees and initiative taken through this provision will immensely benefit SC/ST candidates and make good the backlog/shortfall.

## **Reply of the Government**

3.12 The observations of the committee are noted.

## Recommendation (S.No. 17, Para No. 2.55)

3.13 The Committee have been informed that in case of technical, diploma and graduate and para-medical categories, ST candidates are not becoming available to the extent of vacancies reserved for them. The Committee have also been informed that steps are being taken to wipe out shortfall in technical, diploma and para-medical categories post reserved for SC and ST candidates by placing indents through RRB, compassionate ground appointment and by launching Special Recruitment Drive. The Committee feel that shortfall of SC/ST in case of technical and para-medical categories can perhaps be taken care of, if Southern Railway get in touch with it is and other professional institutes for recruitment of SC/ST candidates. Conducting Special Recruitment Drive for filling up SC/ST posts once in a while is not a permanent solution. The Committee recommend that Southern Railway should conduct Special Recruitment Drive till the shortfall is wiped out and thereafter should make every effort to fill up all SC/ST posts during every recruitment year so as to avoid shortfall to accumulate.

#### Reply of the Government

3.14 Necessary instructions have been issued to all the Zonal Railways including Southern Railway to carry out serious exercise to find out and pin point the real causes

of shortfall and to review the position and chalk out effective action plans so as to wipe out the actual shortfall/backlog vacancies of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes/Other Backward Classes both in promotional and recruitment categories. Any vacancies remaining unfilled, would be filled up by way of recruitment through Railway Recruitment Boards.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

## 3.15 Please see Para No. 1.46 of Chapter I.

## Recommendation (S.No. 18, Para No. 2.56)

3.16 In pursuance of MR's announcement in railway Budget 2000-2001, the Committee have been informed that Special Recruitment Drive for SCs/STs were undertaken to wipe out the backlog vacancies existing as on 30.06.2000 and 31.03.2004, respectively and 715 candidates under special drive have so far been recruited as on 15.09.2006 as against 731 backlog vacancies identified. The Committee, however, note that so far, no SC/ST candidate has been recruited from the panel of another Railway Recruitment Board to wipe out the shortfall during the last 5 years. The Committee, therefore, desire that if suitable candidates are not readily available from their own Recruitment Boards, panels from other Railway Recruitment Board should be utilized to fill up the quota reserved for SCs/STs.

## Reply of the Government

3.17 For Group 'C' recruitment, Railway Recruitment Board, Chennai and Railway Recruitment Board, Trivandrum are supplying the candidates including Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe. Wherever sufficient Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates are not supplied by these Railway Recruitment Boards, Special Recruitment Drives have been launched where Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates have

been recruited through other Railway Recruitment Boards, with the permission of Railway Board, as a special case to clear the backlog vacancies expeditiously.

## Recommendation (S.No. 22, Para No. 3.15)

3.18 The Committee are happy to note that there is a ban on de-reservation. The Committee are of the view that in any case, the posts reserved for SCs/STs should not be filled up by way of ad-hoc appointments but rather those promotional vacancies should be filled up by suitably training the SC/ST candidates.

## **Reply of the Government**

3.19 It is stated that generally adhoc appointments are discouraged in Railways and it is assured that Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe vacancies will be filled up on regular basis by suitably trained Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe employees.

## Recommendation (S.No. 25, Para No. 4.8)

3.20 The Committee appreciate the measures taken by the Southern Railway for redressal of grievances of SC/ST employees. While the aforesaid initiatives are applauded, proper implementation of measures is also desired or otherwise such initiative may remain sterile. Southern Railway has informed that during the years 2002 to 2005 hundred percent complaints were disposed of while in the year 2006, 16 complaints had been received up to 30 September 2006, out of which 11 cases had been disposed of and 5 cases were under investigation. The Committee recommend that those 5 cases should also be disposed of at the earliest and that the difficulties faced by the SC/ST employees should always be rectified by the concerned officer/division, as per the extant instructions in a specific time frame.

## **Reply of the Government**

3.21 The recommendation was forwarded to Southern Railway who have stated that all the five cases pending upto 30<sup>th</sup> Sept., 2006 were disposed off subsequently.

## Recommendation (S.No. 28, Para No. 4.26)

The Committee note that the Catering Policy 2005 provides for reservation of 49.5% for various categories. This includes reservation of 12% for SCs and 8% for STs in small catering units at 'D', 'E' and 'F' category stations. Further, at 'A', 'B', 'C' category stations, a reservation of 10% (6% for SCs and 4% for STs) out of 25% in award of small catering units has been provided in the new catering policy. The Committee also note that in the Book Stall policy, a reservation of 6% for SCs and 4% for STs out of 25% has been provided in the allotment of new book stalls at 'B', 'C', 'D', 'E' and 'F' category of stations. However, there is no provision for reservation in all catering/vending licences of major units like Refreshment Room/Restaurant, Pantry car, etc. as these are awarded under two packet tender system so as to bring about tangible improvement in catering services to the passengers and increase the Railway revenue. The Committee note that no major contract was awarded to SCs/STs during the last three years. Although SC/ST people are not debarred from applying for major contract, yet the Committee feel that a provision for reservation to SCs/STs in awarding major contracts, would definitely help SC/ST peoples. The Committee, therefore, urge the Indian Railways to provide reservation to SCs and STs in award of licences for major catering contracts also, so that they may get an opportunity to try their mettle in catering business and thus improve upon their economic condition.

## **Reply of the Government**

- 3.23 The allotment of stalls to reserved category is done in accordance with the Railway Board's policy circulated vide Commercial circular No.57/05. Reservation at A, B, C category of stations is fixed at 25%, of which 6% is allotted for SCs. Chennai Central is classified as "A1" categories station. The allotment of stalls (reserve category) at Chennai Central is done by the Divisional Railway Manager, Chennai Division, by calling applications through press notification and after scrutiny, the eligible applicants will be allotted the stalls.
- 3.24 During evidence it was pointed out that there is some discrimination in allotment of catering units to SC/ST people as they are provided small stalls to sell fruits and panmasala very close to the public toilets whereas the other category people get the stalls in prime locations. In response, General Manager, Southern Railway stated:-

"The first thing you asked was whether there is any discrimination in the allotment and also the location of the catering units or stalls given to SC/ST candidates as compared to other people. I would like to assure you – and also there is a policy of the Board – that we make no discrimination. In fact, the locations are mentioned before we call for the applications"

3.25 Chairman, Railway Board elaborated about the new catering policy thus:-

"We have got a new Catering Policy now. It was issued very recently on 21<sup>st</sup> of July. In between the work has been shifted to IRCTC who were doing mobile catering allotments and even the static units allotment was shifted to them. Now we are taking them back to the Zonal Railways because of the complaints received and also the criticisms made in Parliament."

3.26 In regard to reservation in catering, Chairman, Railway Board stated:-

"I would like to clarify to you that in the new catering policy there is a reservation of 25 per cent in `A', `B' and `C' categories in minor units, in the stalls, in which Scheduled Castes have a quota of 6 per cent; Scheduled Tribes have a quota of 4 per cent; Below Poverty Line people have a quota of 3 per cent; Freedom Fighters and Women including War Widows have a quota of 4 per cent. OBCs have a quota of 3 per cent; Minorities have a quota of 3 per cent; and Physically Challenged Persons have a quota of 2 per cent. That makes a total figure of 25

per cent. We are going to ensure that this particular 25 per cent reservation is implemented properly. In the new policy, we are now taking over to the Railways because we found that this was not getting adhered to."

3.27 In regard to backlog allotment of units, he stated:-

"There is 25 per cent segregation for SC/ST people and some other category of people for the static unit. There, we find that there is a backlog of a total of 20 units in the Southern Railway."

#### 3.28 He further clarified:-

"A total of 20 units backlog is there. We are committed to clear this backlog very soon. We have directions from the hon. Minister and we have some targets for us that by the end of this financial year we will have to achieve a certain percentage and we will be addressing this issue immediately.

For the mobile catering also, we will be taking it over. But there is no reservation while awarding the contract for mobile catering service. We will be trying to do it ourselves as far as possible. If some contracts are given already by the IRCTC, gradually the Railways will take over everything in a phased manner. So, that is the directive from the hon. Minister. So, I think, that problem will also get addressed.

3.29 When it was pointed that for catering in Chennai no advertisement has been given as stated in their action taken reply, the Chairman, Railway Board stated:-

"If it is not there, we will now ensure that the policy is implemented in toto".

3.30 Not finding the response to the recommendation of the Committee for providing reservation to SCs and STs in award of licenses for major catering contracts it was asked whether the Ministry implied that if the reservation is provided to SCs/STs, the quality of service will not be up to the mark, and asked Government to frame elaborate rules and standard of service and then provide reservation. In regard to non-reservation in major units, the Ministry in their post evidence reply stated that the Committee, on various occasions, have raised the issue of reservation being extended to management of major catering and bookstalls to SCs and STs. For Bookstalls contracts reservation was provided for below 'A' category of Railway Station, in the last Bookstall Policy

issued in 2004. The position has already been explained through various Action Taken Notes submitted to the Committee. It is once again reiterated that as a policy, Ministry of Railways has taken a stand that there will be no reservation in allotment of licenses for major catering units. Management of major units requires a lot of managerial acumen, functional capabilities and catering experience and capability to muster resources including financial resources and such management of catering services are required to cater to large scale operation in order to meet the aspiration and requirements of the traveling public. Major units require the best available in the trade. Catering today is related with the development of tourism industry in India and at international level. A catering contract now is not merely a service contract for an individual to serve but has become more complicated and is beyond the competence of one or two persons to manage the multifarious activities involved in maintaining services under the contract. It requires a full-fledged organization/company with experience or individuals having competence in the diverse activities which form the catering services. There is a huge quantum of specialized work and risk is high. Hence the percentage of reservation as is necessary in service matter is not applicable for major catering units awarded by tender system. Further, there are no directives from Central Government about reservation, its percentage and criteria for commercial contracts and licenses. Reservation up to 25% in the allotment of minor catering units at A, B and C category stations and 49.5% at D, E and F category stations and 25% at B, C, D and E category station has been primarily done as a social obligation of the Government. However, SC and ST persons are not debarred from participating in the allotment of major catering units. They are eligible at par with other similar aspirants.

3.31 Further, after the interim order of 16.09.2009, the stay on the previous Catering Policy 2005 was vacated by Hon'ble Supreme Court and it was communicated to the

Zonal Railways to implement the same. Hon'ble Supreme Court in its final judgment in SLP No. 10742-43/2007 dated 04.08.2010 has disposed of the SLPs challenging the clauses on reservation and others in the Catering Policy 2005, as infraction since the Railways have reviewed the policy and introduced Catering Policy 2010 dated 21.07.2010 wherein, the clauses on the reservation which existed in the previous policy have been retained.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

# 3.32 Please see Para No. 1.75 of Chapter I.

# Recommendation (S.No. 29, Para No. 4.27)

3.33 The Committee are constrained to note that the performance of Southern Railway with regard to extending small catering contracts to SCs and STs is very disappointing. The Committee note that altogether 42 and 5 small catering contracts had been awarded to SCs and STs respectively in Southern Railway during the years 2003, 2004 and 2005 and in 2006, no contract was given to SCs and STs. In case of 'D', 'E', 'F' category stations. 10 book stall contracts were awarded to SCs, whereas no contracts was awarded to ST candidates. The Committee regret to note that nothing has been said about the contracts given to others and in the absence of this information, it is not possible to comment whether the prescribed quota for SCs and STs has been maintained. The Committee may be apprised of the reasons as to why no contract was awarded to SCs/STs during the year 2006, as also the details of contracts given to others during 2003 onwards. The Committee also note that in the book stall policy, reservation has been provided only in the allotment of book stalls at 'B', 'C', 'D', 'E' and 'F' category of stations. The Committee are of the view that unless liberal and sympathetic attitude is adopted towards SCs/STs entrepreneurs, the situation will

improve. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the book stall policy 2004 should be revised and reservation should be provided to SCs/STs in the allotment of book stalls licences at 'A' category stations also.

# **Reply of the Government**

3.34 During 2003-2004, Southern Railway had commenced the process of allotting new staff in accordance with the Catering Policy. However, as per Board's instructions vide letter No.2003/TG.III/600/5 dated 16.12.2003, Zonal Railways were advised not to process any further new allotments of catering/vending units both static and mobiles so that the same can be done by IRCTC. As such, the process of allotment of new catering stalls was kept under abeyance. Hence, no allotment of catering units to reserved category was done during the year 2003. Further, allotments of stalls commenced in 2005-2006 for D,E,F category station as per revised catering policy. On Southern Railway there were 424 static catering units in 2005. Of these 424 units, 299 units in A, B, C category stations were handed over to IRCTC w.e.f. 15-11-2005. The catering units in D, E, F catering stations which are under the management of the Railways have been identified for reserved categories in accordance with the Revised Catering Policy-2005 dated 21-12-2005. During 2006, 9 stalls to SC category and 2 stalls to ST category were allotted in D, E, F category stations. This is in addition to the existing 21 reserved category stalls in D, E, F category stations and prior to the implementation of the Revised Catering Policy-2005. Applications were called for on numerous occasions in various newspapers but the response has been feeble. Southern Railway is taking strenuous steps to ensure that the prescribed quota for allotment of stall is met. Further the suggestions given by the Committee will also be

adhered to by the Railway. As desired, the details of allotment of catering stalls from 2003-2006 is as under:-

DETAILS OF ALLOTMENT OF CATERING STALLS TO RESERVED CATEGORY OVER SOUTHERN RAILWAY (2003-2006)

Year	SC	ST	Minority	OBC	General	Remarks
2003	-	-	-	-	5	No fresh allotment was done to any category
2004	-	-	-	-	-	in this period since zonal railways were
						advised not to process any further new
						allotment of catering units both static and
						mobile so that the same can be done by
						IRCTC.
2005	-	-	-	-	-	Reservation as per Revised Catering Policy
2006	9	2	4	11	13	dated 21-12-2005.
Total	9	2	4	11	18	

3.35 As regards bookstall, there is no reservation in allotment of new bookstall at 'A' category stations as these bookstalls are to be allotted based on eligibility criteria through tender system. Further, it is clarified that Bookstall Policy-2004 dated 12-10-2004 has been stayed on 7-01-2005 by the High Court of Allahabad on the Writ Petition filed by M/s A.H.Wheeler against the clause of renewal and a status quo is being maintained in allotment of new bookstalls. Appeal has been made against the judgement of Allahabad High Court in the Supreme Court and the matter is sub-judice. The issue would be considered only after the matter is decided by the Supreme Court of India.

# Recommendation (S.No. 30, Para No. 4.28)

3.36 The Committee also feel that mere provision of reservation in favour of SCs/STs on paper will have no meaning unless these are publicized widely, so that availability of various schemes/policies are known to SCs/STs and they can take benefits of these schemes. The Committee, therefore, recommend that wide publicity of these petty

contracts should be given so that more and more deserving SC/ST candidates could be benefited. The Committee would also like the Ministry of Railways to involve panchayats/BDOs and local MLAs/MPs for dissemination of information in this regard.

# **Reply of the Government**

- 3.37 The recommendation of the committee is noted. It is stated that there is provision of 25% reservation in the Revised Catering Policy-2005 issued on 21.12.2005 in allotment of minor catering units at A, B, C category stations and 49% at D, E, F category stations. Allotment of these reserved category units are done by Division by calling through press notification. Similarly, there is 25% reservation in allotment of bookstall at 'B', 'C' and 'D' category station, to be allotted by calling application by Zonal Railways. There is no reservation in allotment of new bookstalls at 'A' category stations as these bookstalls are to be allotted based on eligibility criteria through tender system.

  3.38 Further, as Bookstall Policy-2004 dated 12.10.2004 has been stayed on 7.01.2005 by the High Court of Allahabad on the Writ Petition filed by M/s A.H. Wheeler against the clause of renewal, a status quo is being maintained in allotment of new bookstalls. Appeals have been made against the judgement of Allahabad High Court in the Supreme Court and the matter is sub-judice.
- 3.39 The aspect of reservation in respect of STD/PCO booths has been envisaged in the policy itself. Allotment of the booths at stations is done as under:-

		Percentage reserved for various categories				
Category	Total Percentage	Scheduled Caste	Scheduled Tribe	Other Backward Class	General (Unreserved)	
Educated Unemployed Youth	50%	15% of 50% (i.e. 7.5%)	7.5% of 50% (i.e. 3.75%)	27% of 50% (i.e. 13.5%)	50.5% of 50% (i.e. 25.25%)	
Physically Handicapped (including Blind Disability 40% and above)	25%	15% of 25% (i.e. 3.75%)	7.5% of 25% (i.e. 1.875%)	27% of 25% (i.e. 6.75%)	50% of 25% (i.e. 12.625%)	

Women (including war Widows and Railway Employees' Widows)	25%	15% of 25% (i.e. 3.75%)	7.5% of 25% (i.e. 1.875%)	27% of 25% (i.e. 6.75)	50% of 25% (i.e. 12.625%)
TOTAL	100%	15%	7.5%	27%	50.5%

- 3.40 Allotment of the booths is done by inviting tender/applications, through advertisements in Newspaper, from the particular category of persons for whom the particular booth is earmarked for. This ensures adequate publicity.
- 3.41 As far as Cycle Stand (Parking Contracts) are concerned, they are awarded strictly on tender basis and there is no provision for reservation of any kind in the policy.

#### CHAPTER IV

# Recommendation (Sl. No. 2, Para No. 1.14)

The Committee observe that there is no prescribed frequency for inspection to enforce the reservation rules. The Liaison officers/officials of the Board are supposed to carry out inspections at least once a year so as to ensure proper enforcement of reservation rules in the Railway establishments as also for redressal of grievances of SC/ST employees. The Committee are however perturbed to note that no inspection of Southern Railway had been carried out by the officers of the Board during the last three years. The Committee are of the view that the Liaison Officer is a key figure in an organization and responsible for ensuring implementation of reservation policies of the Government. The Committee feel that it is a serious lapse on part of the Liaison officer/officers of the Board for not carrying out the inspection on time and they strongly recommend that all out efforts should be made to carry out inspection of each zonal/divisional headquarters in a time bound manner. The Committee further recommend that the staff/officers working in the Reservation Cell should be given proper training in the matter of reservation policy so that they may discharge their duties properly and effectively. The Committee would like to be apprised of the recent inspection carried out by the officers of Railway Board in regard to Southern Railway.

# Reply of the Government

4.2 The recommendation of the Committee is noted. It is stated that due to other important and urgent factor like Parliament Sessions, Union matters, meetings of the Committee of Secretaries etc. and also the increase in the number of Zonal and Divisional Headquarters, it has not been possible to carry out inspections of each and every Zonal/Divisional Headquarters in a time bound manner. However, all out efforts

would be made to carry out these inspections at random and also to impart training to the staff/officers working in the Reservation Cell in the matter of reservation policy.

- 4.3 Not satisfied with the above reply, the Committee during evidence asked the Ministry to state the additional responsibilities of Liaison officer apart from work relating to SC/ST employees. The Committee also inquired whether the Ministry have prepared a schedule for undertaking inspection of zonal/regional headquarters to inspect roster registers and were also asked to enlist the Division/Units/Headquarters visited.
- 4.4 In their post evidence reply, the Ministry of Railways have provided the details of work entrusted to Liaison Officer appointed in the Ministry. It has been stated that the Executive Director, Establishment (Reservation) acts as a Liaison Officer in respect of matters relating to the representation of SCs, STs and OBCs in all establishments and services under the administrative control of the Ministry of Railways. The Liaison Officer is responsible for
  - (i) Ensuring the compliance by the subordinate appointing authorities with the orders and instructions pertaining to the reservation of vacancies in favour of Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and Other Backward Classes and other benefits admissible to them.
  - (ii) Ensuring timely submission by each appointing authority under Ministry/Department to the Ministry/Department the SC/ST/OBC Reports I and II and ensuring scrutiny and consolidation of the above reports in respect of all establishments and services in and under the control of the Ministry/Department and sending the consolidated reports in the prescribed proforma to the Department of Personnel and Training.
  - (iii) Acquainting himself well in time about the dates of various DPCs which will be held in future. He will have with him a ready list of officers of

various levels belonging to SC/ST of a few sister Departments/Ministries so that whenever requirement arises, an SC/ST officer of appropriate level consistent with the level of the other members of the DPC and the level of appointment for which a DPC is proposed to be convened can always be associated as a member. Such a list may be prepared by the Liaison Officer by informally consulting the administrative wing of other Ministries/Departments.

- (iv) Ensuring that while making a reference to the Department of Personnel and Training and to the National Commission for Scheduled Castes and the National Commission for Scheduled Tribes for de-reservation of reserved vacancies, full details in support of the proposal for dereservation are given.
- (v) Ensuring the extension of necessary assistance to the National Commission for Scheduled Castes and the National Commission for Scheduled Tribes in the investigation of complaints received by the Commission in regard to service matters and in the collection of information for his annual report.
- (vi) Conducting annual inspection of the reservation registers/rosters maintained in the Ministry/Department/Offices under the control of the Ministry/Department with a view to ensuring proper implementation of the reservation orders.
- (vii) Acting as a Liaison Officer between the Ministry/Department and the Department of Personnel and Training for supply of other information, answering questions and queries and clearing doubts in regard to matter covered by the reservation orders.

- (viii) In addition to carrying out the responsibilities as liaison officer in respect of SCs and STs, functioning as in charge of implementation of Prime Minister's New 15 Points Programme on the Welfare of Minorities on Railways. Increase in number of Zonal Railways/Production Units, Divisions, Workshops has lead to increase in employees (including number of grievances (CA-III/SC/ST SCs/STs), Commissions, Parliamentary Committee, Department of Personnel and Training, Prime Minister's Office/President Secretariat etc.), time frame for different SC/ST Association matters, Court Cases on Reservation Policies, Clarifications, various types of RTI Applications regarding Implementation of Reservation Rules.
- 4.5 In regard to Schedule for inspection, it has been stated that though no strict schedule has been prepared for the inspection of roster registers for proper implementation of reservation policies on zonal/regional Headquarters, inspections are carried out at random, as and when time permits, in view of the huge workload devolving on the officers and staff of the Reservation Directorate of the Ministry of Railways, by the Liaison Officer himself or the officers deputed by him.
- 4.6 The Divisions visited for inspection so far are reported to be, Mumbai Division of Central Railway, Khurda Road and Vishakapatnam Divisions of East Coast Railway, Delhi Division of Northern Railway, Sealdah, Howrah, Malda Divisions and Liluah Workshop of Eastern Railway, Mughalsarai Division and Dhanbad Division of East Central Railway, Headquarter Office and Mumbai Central Division of Western Railway, Bhopal Division of W.C. Railway, Railway Workshop at Mysore in S.W. Railway.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

# 4.7 Please see Para No. 1.11 of Chapter I.

# Recommendation (Sl. No. 6, Para No. 2.13)

4.8 The Committee also note that the written examination/interviews are mostly being conducted in major cities in the South and also in Port Blair. Since the Group 'C' and 'D' posts are advertised through Employment News on All India basis, the Committee strongly recommend that the Railway authorities should hold examinations in towns nearer to the SC/ST inhabited areas so that more SC/ST people residing in backward, remote and hilly areas are also encouraged to appear for such examinations. Most of the SC/ST candidates are not able to travel to distant places as they cannot afford to pay for transport charges and the areas where they reside may not have Railway network. The Railway authorities should, therefore, increase the number of examination centres by identifying towns nearer to SC/ST populated areas so that sufficient number of suitable candidates are available for SC/ST posts.

# Reply of the Government

- 4.9 The recommendation of the Committee is noted. In this regard it may be stated that for attending written examination and viva-voce, Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates are issued second class free pass for their travel from residence to place of written examination/interview and back.
- 4.10 During evidence, when it was pointed out that there is difficulty for SC/ST people to go to far off places and asked about the reason as to why examinations are not held at least at district head guarters, Chairman Railway Board explained:-
  - "......We have 21 Railway Recruitment Board. The exams are held as per the RRB. The centres are kept in different locations. A large number of candidates are there. We find that there are some towns where thousands of candidates have applied. We make centres in those towns in the schools. We take permission from the schools in the nearest towns for which we make the payments. On a Sunday we keep these centres and hold these exams. We hold exams all over. It is not that it is only at one place.

Now, there is no system of interview. So, one has to appear and qualify in the written test held by the Railway Recruitment Board, which may be in a centre very close to the address where that candidate is staying. SCST candidates appearing for the exams get free passes on the Railway system so that they should not have any difficulty in reaching the centre. It is closer to their address. Whatever may be distance, may be 30 to 40 kilometre, they can travel by train on free passes, which are sent to them along with their Admit Card. That is how we tackle it. I understand their problem. But I think, the present system addresses this quite well."

- 4.11 The Committee also sent written questionnaire asking the Ministry as to how many examination centres they have identified, are located near SC/ST dominated areas and whether the Ministry have recently introduced new examination centres near such areas.
- 4.12 In their post evidence reply the Ministry of Railways have stated that as per Railway Board's policy, examination centres are not normally opened outside the jurisdiction of the concerned Railway Recruitment Board (RRB) and these centres are generally situated in cities located nearby the RRB office and on the basis of the number of application received.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

#### 4.13 Please see Para No. 1.22 of Chapter I.

# Recommendation (Sl. No. 19, Para No. 3.4)

4.14 The Committee note that on Indian Railways, including Southern Railway, there is no provision of imparting pre-recruitment training. It has been stated by the Ministry that Indian Railways being a vast organization with huge manpower on roll, the scheme is not feasible to implement and moreover, there is no direction in the matter from the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pension (DOP&T). The Committee are deeply distressed by such a reply as the Government works through different Ministries

and policy matter of the Government in regard to SCs and STs is same. The Committee, therefore, do not subscribe to the idea that only the Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment can have such a responsibility. The Committee feel that it should be every Ministry's concern to see that employment of SCs and STs, as guaranteed in the Constitution, is fully accomplished. Non-availability of suitably trained SC/ST candidates is often the repeated reply given for not filling up reserved posts. The Committee are of the strong view that this problem can be solved to some extent by imparting pre-recruitment training. The Committee also do not find any justification in the reply that the Indian Railways being a vast organization with huge manpower on roll, pre-recruitment training is not feasible to implement. In many mega Public Sector Undertakings including Banks, the Committee have observed pre-recruitment trainings are being given successfully to SC/ST candidates. The Committee expect a positive approach from the Ministry of Railways too and desire that the Ministry should initiate some action for imparting pre-recruitment training to SCs and STs in various categories of posts. The Committee are of the opinion that such type of training would undoubtedly help in the improved intake of SC/ST candidates.

# Reply of the Government

4.15 On Indian Railways, there is no scheme of pre-recruitment training for any category. The same is true for Departments of other Ministries also. It is the assigned responsibility of Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment (earlier it was called Ministry of Welfare) to run pre-examination training centres, mainly for competitive examinations held by Union Public Service Commission etc. The Administrative Heads of these training centres shall be given intimations of employment notices to advise the candidates undergoing training there, to apply for posts suiting their qualifications as and when notified by Railway Recruitment Boards.

- 4.16 In view of the above, it is not possible for Railways to run such pre-recruitment coaching centres for Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe candidates. It may, however, be stated that Special Recruitment Drives are undertaken to fill up the vacancies of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes. The reservation policies are strictly adhered to and it is ensured that the interests of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes are fully taken care of.
- 4.17 During evidence, the Chairman, Ministry of Railway on the subject of pre recruitment training stated:-
  - ".....this is for the people who are to be recruited first time through the RRBs. If we take the all-India position, for the RRB recruitment we get about 40 lakh applications. Generally, these are the people coming from the educational institutions directly. Once they are selected from there, we take great care of their training and give them a lot of opportunities for promotions in the system. But, the education is to be looked after the HRD Ministry and the Social Welfare Ministry. We do not actually know who are there. The number is very large. Probably we feel that after they are recruited for the first time, then they are our responsibility."
- 4.18 When it was pointed out that while the Government state that it is difficult to recruit SC/ST candidates for technical posts, it was questioned as to why the Railways are not considering option of pre recruitment training option for SC/ST candidates. In their post evidence reply the Ministry of Railways expressed their helplessness and stated that they are not in a position to provide pre-recruitment training to any section of candidates including Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes because the number of applicants in reference to recruitment notices normally may run into crores every year. However, there is a Central Sector Scheme (namely coaching and allied assistance) of free coaching provided/imparted by Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment with a view to ensure effective implementation and monitoring of Government Programmes and assist the students belonging to weaker sections including Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and Other Backward Classes in a better manner.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

# 4.19 Please see Para No. 1.53 of Chapter I.

# Recommendation (Sl. No. 24, Para No. 3.26)

The Committee observe that during the years 2000 to 2005, 220 complaints and 4.20 in the year 2006, 8 complaints were reported to have been received in respect of persons who obtained employment in Southern Railway on the basis of false caste certificates. Out of the above 228 cases, 37 cases have been finalized and remaining 191 cases are at various stages of investigation. The Committee note that 191 cases are still pending due to various reasons. The Committee are more disturbed by the fact that a large number of cases are pending (as these are under investigation with District Collectors). The Committee have been informed that the cases are pending with the District Collectors as in some of the districts, the District Level Committee consisting of the Collector, one Adi-Dravida Welfare Officer and one Anthropologist is not available and that in many districts, the Committee also does not hold meetings regularly. The Committee express their concern over this sad state of affairs and urge upon the Ministry of Railways to take up this matter with the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pension who are the cadre controlling Ministry over the Collectors and to ensure that all the State Governments constitute appropriate District Level Committee in every district urgently and to instruct them to hold regular meetings so that cases of investigation of false caste certificates are not held up for want of proper DLC or nonholding of meetings by such Committees. The Committee also recommend that Southern Railway should advise Railway advocates to take prompt action to get the stay vacated in the cases relating to false caste certificates. The Committee further recommend that the cases pending under departmental enquiry/investigation should also be pursued vigorously with the concerned authorities for early disposal of pending cases within a time frame. However, the Committee hope that utmost care should be taken to ensure that genuine SC and ST employees do not suffer during investigation and their cases should be finalized in the earliest possible time. The Committee, also recommend that if any person is found guilty, the criminal proceedings should be initiated immediately, besides termination of his service.

# Reply of the Government

- 4.21 The matter was referred to Southern Railway who have stated that they are regularly writing to the District Collectors and to the Secretary concerned for expediting the verification of alleged false community certificates. In two cases where the services of employees were terminated, criminal complaints have been lodged in one case, and the other is pending before the court.
- 4.22 During evidence, the Committee expressed their concern about the large number of false caste certificate cases. The Committee were of the view that the Railways should have gone in appeal to the next court in case of stay in courts. The Committee felt that the only solution is disciplinary proceedings under the Conduct Rules and asked the Ministry to take such action as nobody can prevent the Railways from taking departmental action against those persons who obtained employment by producing false caste certificates.
- 4.23 In response, Chairman, Railway Board assured:-
  - "We will take Departmental action against such people because it is moral turpitude. We will take it up under moral turpitude."
- 4.24 The Committee also enquired of the steps that have been taken by the Southern Railway to speed up cases of verification/investigation of large number of false caste certificates cases. In their post evidence replies the Ministry have stated that the

following steps have been taken by Southern Railway to speed up the verification/investigation of false caste certificates:

- Letters are addressed to the District Level Committee in the case of SC followed by reminders.
- Letters are addressed to Secretaries to the Government of Tamil Nadu and Kerala in case of ST certificates followed by reminders.
- 3) The Staff and Welfare Inspectors working in the Special Reservation Cell are periodically visiting the District Level and State Government authorities for expediting the cases.
- In respect of 138 ST cases (including 7 gazetted officers cases) pending in the State Level Committee of Government of Tamil Nadu, Chief Personnel Officer/Administration has addressed a letter to the Secretary, Adi Dravida & Tribal Welfare Department, Government of Tamil Nadu on 26.3.2010 followed by a DO letter to the Secretary from the Chief Liaison Officer on 24.6.2010.
- 4.25 The Committee in their recommendation had urged upon the Ministry of Railways to take up the matter of pending false caste certificate cases lying with District Collectors with the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pension who are the cadre controlling Ministry over the Collectors and to ensure that all the State Governments constitute appropriate District Level Committee in every district urgently and to instruct them to hold regular meetings so that cases of investigation of false caste certificates are not held up for want of proper DLC or non-holding of meetings by such Committees. When asked whether the matter was taken up with DoP&T and the outcome thereof, the Ministry of Railways replied in their post evidence reply that the recommendations of Parliamentary Committee had been referred to DoP&T for necessary action vide Board's letter No. 2004-E(SCT)1/80/2/Pt.24 dated 26.10.2010. However, reply of which was awaited from DoP&T.

A.26 The Committee had also recommended that the Southern Railway should advise Railway Advocates to take prompt action to get stay vacated in these cases relating to false caste certificates. When asked about the action taken by the Southern Railway and cases where stay has been vacated, the Ministry of Railways in their post-evidence reply stated that the Law Officer, Southern Railway, has been requested to convene a meeting of Railway advocates who are handling the false community certificate cases for prompt action and some of the advocates have been counselled suitably. In addition to this, the Law Assistant specially attached with the Special Reservation Cell is regularly contacting the Railway advocates for speedy disposal of the cases. It was also stated that based on the efforts taken in 9 cases, the stay have been vacated and the cases were referred to the State Level Committee for verifying the genuineness of the community certificates.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

#### 4.27 Please see Para No. 1.64 of Chapter I.

# Recommendation (Sl. No. 31, Para No. 4.32)

4.28 The Committee appreciate the fact that Indian Railways have taken up many projects on consideration of socio-economic development in backward tribal and undeveloped areas although majority of these projects are not financially viable. The Committee desire that adequate funds should be made available for these ongoing projects so that these areas are provided efficient line of connectivity contributing to their overall growth.

#### **Reply of the Government**

4.29 Most of the new line projects are financially unviable and have been taken up on socio-economic consideration for development of hilly, tribal, underdeveloped and

backward areas. The throw forward of new lines is about Rs.45000 crores, as on 1.4.08, and funds being provided per year are of the order of about Rs.2500 crores including National Projects. The funds are not sufficient to progress the projects in a satisfactory manner. The funds are not even adequate to cover for escalation. Considering this, Hon'ble Minister of Railways have requested Chief Ministers of States to agree to share atleast 50% of the cost of said projects. However, only a few State Governments have agreed to share the cost of projects in their State.

#### **Comments of the Committee**

4.30 Please see Para No. 1.78 of Chapter I.

#### **CHAPTER V**

Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of the Government have not been received.

NIL

New Delhi 27th December, 2011 7 Pausha, 1933(Saka) (GOBINDA CHANDRA NASKAR)
CHAIRMAN
COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE
OF SCHEDULED CASTES AND
SCHEDULED TRIBES

#### **MINUTES**

# COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED CASTES AND SCHEDULED TRIBES (2010-2011)

# (FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA)

# SIXTH SITTING (17.08.2010)

The Committee sat from 1500 to 1600 hrs. in Committee Room 'B', Parliament House Annexe, New Delhi.

#### **PRESENT**

#### Shri Gobinda Chandra Naskar - Chairman

#### **MEMBERS**

#### Lok Sabha

- 2. Shri M. Anandan
- 3. Shri Harishchandra Chavan
- 4. Smt. Paramiit Kaur Gulshan
- 5. Shri Kamal Kishor 'Commando'
- 6. Shri Virendra Kumar
- 7. Dr. Chinta Mohan
- 8. Shri Ashok Kumar Rawat
- 9. Shri Baju Ban Riyan
- 10. Shri Kodikkunnil Suresh
- 11. Shri Sajjan Singh Verma
- 12. Shri Bhausaheb Rajaram Wakchaure

#### Rajya Sabha

- 13. Shri Mukut Mithi
- 14. Shri D. Raja
- 15. Shri Thomas Sangma
- 16. Ms. Sushila Tiriya

#### **SECRETARIAT**

- 1. Dr. R.K. Chadha, Joint Secretary
- 2. Ms. J.C. Namchyo, Director
- 3. Shri Hoti Lal, Addl. Director
- 4. Shri M.L.K. Raja, Deputy Secretary
- 5. Shri G.C. Dobhal, Under Secretary

At the outset, the Hon'ble Chairman welcomed the Members to the sitting of the Committee. Before taking up the agenda of the meeting, the Members raised the issue of finalization of the report of the study tour to Mirchpur village, Distt. Hisar, Haryana undertaken by the Committee on 2<sup>nd</sup> July, 2010 and desired that the Report should be discussed by the Committee before it is laid in Parliament during current session. At that point, Hon'ble Chairman informed the Committee that the Reports on Study Tours/Visits of the Committee are laid in the Parliament after approval of Chairman and are not considered and adopted by the Committee. However, the Committee, having taken the view that Mirchpur visit was not a regular study tour but having intense ramifications, decided to lay the Report in Parliament as per practice but after consideration by the whole Committee so that all the Members could contribute their views in the Report. The Committee then decided to hold their next sitting on 26<sup>th</sup> August, 2010 to consider the Report on the visit of the Committee to Mirchpur village before it is laid in both the Houses of Parliament.

2. The Committee then took up the draft report on Action Taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Twenty-eighth Report (14<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) on the subject "Reservation for and Employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Southern Railway" for consideration. However, the Committee were not satisfied with the action taken replies of the Government to the recommendations of the Committee, particularly relating to filling up of shortfall and backlog vacancies in Southern Railway, non-filling up of vacancies inspite of a number of educated employed SCs/STs persons. The Committee, therefore, did not adopt the Report and decided to take oral evidence of the Chairman, Railway Board and other representatives of Railway Board and Southern Railway on the subject.

The Committee then adjourned with vote of thanks to the Chair.

#### **MINUTES**

# COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED CASTES AND SCHEDULED TRIBES (2010-2011)

(FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA)

EIGHTH SITTING (09.09.2010)

The Committee sat from 1430 to 1645 hrs.

# **PRESENT**

Shri Gobinda Chandra Naskar - Chairman

#### **MEMBERS**

#### Lok Sabha

- 2. Shri M. Anandan
- 3. Shri Tara Chand Bhagora
- 4. Shri Bhudeo Choudhary
- 5. Shri, Eknath Mahadeo Gaikad
- 6. Smt. Paramiit Kaur Gulshan
- 7. Shri Kamal Kishor 'Commando'
- 8. Shri Virendra Kumar
- 9. Shri Gajendra Singh Rajukhedi
- 10. Shri Ashok Kumar Rawat
- 11. Shri Baju Ban Riyan
- 12. Shri Kodikkunnil Suresh
- 13. Shri Sajjan Singh Verma
- 14. Shri Bhausaheb Rajaram Wakchaure

#### Rajya Sabha

- 15. Shri Mukut Mithi
- 16. Shri D. Raja
- 17. Shri Praveen Rashtrapal
- 18. Shri K.B. Shanappa
- 19. Shri Veer Singh
- 20. Ms. Sushila Tiriya
- 21. Miss Anusuiya Uikey
- 22. Shri Veer Pal Singh Yadav

#### SECRETARIAT

- 1. Dr. R.K. Chadha Joint Secretary
- 2. Ms. J.C. Namchyo Director
- Shri Hoti Lal Additional Director
   Shri M.L.K. Raja Deputy Secretary
- 5. Shri G.C. Dobhal Under Secretary

# **WITNESSES**

# REPRESENTATIVES OF THE MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (RAILWAY BOARD)

- 1. Shri Vivek Sahai Chairman (Railway Board)
- 2. Shri Sanjiv Handa Member Staff
- 3. Shri P.K. Sharma Addl. Member (Staff)
- Shri R.C. Jat Executive Director Estt.(RRB)
   Shri R.Mukundan Executive Director Estt.(N)
- 6. Shri Vinay Singh Executive Director Estt. (Works)
- 7. Smt. Mani Anand Executive Director Estt.(T&C)
- 8. Shri K. Biswal Executive Director Estt.(Res.)

#### SOUTHERN RAILWAY

- 9. Shri Deepak Krishan General Manager
- 10. Shri N.K. Prasad Chief Personnel Officer
- 11. Shri J. Senguttuvan Senior Personnel Officer (Reservation Policy)
- 2. At the outset the Chairman welcomed the representatives of the Ministry of Railways (Railway Board) and Southern Railway.
- 3. The Committee then took oral evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Ministry of Railways (Railway Board) and Southern Railway on the Action Taken by the Ministry on the recommendations contained in the Twenty-eighth Report (14<sup>th</sup> Lok Sabha) of the Committee on the Subject "Reservation for and Employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Southern Railway".
- 4. The evidence was completed.

(The witnesses then withdrew)

5. A verbatim record of the proceedings was kept.

The Committee then adjourned.

# **MINUTES**

# COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF SCHEDULED CASTES AND SCHEDULED TRIBES (2011-2012)

# (FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA)

# TENTH SITTING (16.12.2011)

The Committee sat from 1000 to 1100 hrs. in Committee Room "D", Parliament House Annexe, New Delhi.

#### **PRESENT**

#### Shri Gobinda Chandra Naskar - Chairman

#### **MEMBERS**

#### Lok Sabha

- 2. Smt. Santosh Chowdhary
- 3. Smt. Jyoti Dhurve
- 4. Shri Prem Chand Guddu
- 5. Shri Mohinder Singh Kaypee
- 6. Shri Virendra Kumar
- 7. Shri Baju Ban Riyan
- 8. Shri Hamdullah Sayeed
- 9. Dr. Kirit Premjibhai Solanki
- 10. Shri Lalit Mohan Suklabaidya
- 11. Shri Bhausaheb Wakchaure

# Rajya Sabha

- 12. Shri Jabir Husain
- 13. Shri Lalhming Liana
- 14. Dr. Bhalchandra Mungekar
- 15. Shri D. Raja
- 16. Shri K.B. Shanappa

#### **SECRETARIAT**

- 1. Dr. R.K. Chadha Joint Secretary
- 2. Ms. J.C. Namchyo Director
- 3. Shri G.C. Dobhal Under Secretary

At the outset, the Chairman welcomed the Members of the Committee. The Committee then considered the draft report on Action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Twenty - eighth Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) on the Ministry of Railways (Railway Board) regarding Reservation for and Employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in Southern Railway and adopted the same without modification. The Committee authorised the Chairman to present the same to both the Houses of Parliament.

- 2. The Committee also discussed the issue of termination of 10 SC teachers appointed by Navyug School Educational Society of New Delhi Municipal Council (NDMC) on contract basis during Special Recruitment Drives 2005 and 2007. The Committee desired that the Chairman may write to the Secretary, Ministry of Home Affairs to direct the New Delhi Municipal Council to restore the services of the aggrieved SC ex- teachers. The Committee also decided to call the representatives of the Ministry of Home Affairs and NDMC during the current session to resolve the issue.
- 3. The Committee also decided to undertake on the spot study tour during the month of January 2012, to Bhubaneswar, Chennai and Visakhapatnam.

The Committee then adjourned with a vote of thanks to the Chair.

# APPENDIX - D (Vide Para 4 of Introduction)

Analysis of action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Twenty - eighth Report (Fourteenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes.

1.	Total number of recommendations	31
2.	Recommendations/observations which have been accepted by the Government (vide recommendations at SI. Nos. 3, 4, 8, 9, 10, 11, 13, 15, 16, 20, 21, 23, 26 and 27)	
	Number	14
	Percentage to the total	45.16%
3.	Recommendations/observation which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the Government replies (vide recommendations at Sl. Nos. 1, 5, 7, 12, 14, 17, 18, 22, 25, 28, 29 and 3	30)
	Number	12
	Percentage to the total	38.71%
4.	Recommendations/observations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration (vide recommendations at SI. Nos. 2, 6, 19, 24 and 31)	
	Number	5
	Percentage to the total	16.13%
5.	Recommendations/observations in respect of which final replies of the Government have not been received	NIL