

**COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE OF
SCHEDULED CASTES AND
SCHEDULED TRIBES
(2012-2013)**

(FIFTEENTH LOK SABHA)

TWENTY FIRST REPORT

ON

MINISTRY OF CIVIL AVIATION

**Reservation for and Employment of Scheduled Castes and
Scheduled Tribes in National Aviation Company of India
Limited (NACIL).**

Presented to Lok Sabha on 09.08.2012

Laid in Rajya Sabha on 09.08.2012



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

9 August, 2012 / 18 Sravana, 1934 (Saka)

CONTENTS

Page

Composition of the Committee

Introduction

CHAPTER I - Introductory

- A. Background Note
- B. Board of Directors

CHAPTER II - Reservation in Services

- A. Recruitment Orders
- B. Procedures
- C. Concessions/Relaxations
- D. Details of Recruitment
- E. Staff Strength
- F. Backlog

CHAPTER III - Measures to improve representation of SCs/STs in Services

- A. Deputation
- B. Appointment on Compassionate Grounds
- C. Posting Abroad
- D. In Service/Pre-recruitment Training
- E. SC/ST Cell/Liaison Officer in the Ministry of Civil Aviation
- F. SC/ST Cell/Liaison Officer in NACIL
- G. Rosters
- H. Complaints/Grievances

CHAPTER IV – Miscellaneous

- A. Cases of false caste certificates
- B. Housing facilities
- C. Socio-economic Development of SCs/STs
- D. Casual/Part time labours

APPENDICES

- A. Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 31.3.2010.
- B. Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 27.4.2010.
- C. Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 14.6.2012.
- D. Summary of Conclusions/Recommendations contained in the Report.

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairman, Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes having been authorised by the Committee to finalise and submit the Report on their behalf, present this Twenty First Report (Fifteenth Lok Sabha) on the Ministry of Civil Aviation on the subject "Reservation for and employment of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in National Aviation Company of India Ltd. (NACIL)".

2. The Committee took evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Civil Aviation and National Aviation Company of India Ltd. (NACIL) on 31 March, 2010. The Committee wish to express their thanks to the officers of the Ministry of Civil Aviation and National Aviation Company of India Ltd. (NACIL) for placing before the Committee the material and information the Committee required in connection with the examination of the subject.

3. The Report was considered and adopted by the previous Committee for the year 2011-12 on 27 April, 2012. The Report, however, could not be presented to/laid in the House as the term of that Committee came to an end on 30 April, 2012. The Report as adopted by the previous Committee was again placed before the Committee for the year 2012-13 on 14th June, 2012 for their consideration and the same was adopted by the Committee.

4. A summary of conclusions/recommendations contained in the Report is appended (Appendix ____).

New Delhi;
August, 2012

Sravana, 1934 (Saka)

(GOBINDA CHANDRA NASKAR)
Chairman
Committee on the Welfare
of Scheduled Castes and
Scheduled Tribes

CHAPTER - I

INTRODUCTORY

A. Background

The national carriers of India Air India (AI) and Indian Airlines were merged to form a new company National Aviation Company of India Ltd on 30 March 2007. As per the Ministry of Civil Aviation the need for amalgamation of Air India Limited (AI) and Indian Airlines Limited (IA) was necessitated due to the fact that both AI and IA were faced with fierce competition from domestic private and global airline companies. Significant increase in competitive activity had eroded historical advantage of both the carriers and leading international carriers had increased coverage and frequency to major cities in India. Domestic carriers also significantly ramped up operations.

1.2 The merger of Air India and Indian Airlines was cleared by the Empowered Group of Ministers (EGoM) on 21 February 2007 and thereafter by the Cabinet on 1 March 2007. Consequent to the Cabinet clearance, the National Aviation Company of India Limited (NACIL) was incorporated under the Companies Act, 1956 on 30 March 2007. The Certificate for Commencement of Business was issued by the Registrar of Companies, National Capital Territory of Delhi & Haryana on 14 May 2007. The Registered Office of the Company is at Airlines House, New Delhi and Corporate Office at the Air India Building, Nariman Point, Mumbai.

1.3 The Ministry of Corporate Affairs, Government of India, vide Order dated 22 August 2007 approved the Scheme of Amalgamation of Air India Limited and Indian Airlines Limited with the National Aviation Company of India Limited under Sections 391-394 of the Companies Act and on filing the Order with the Registrar of Companies, New Delhi the merger became effective from 27 August 2007, with an

appointed date of 1 April 2007 and both the erstwhile entities viz. Air India Limited and Indian Airlines Limited stood dissolved without being wound up. Post merger, the brand name “Air India” has been retained with “Maharaja” as its mascot. The name of the Company was changed from National Aviation Company of India Limited into Air India Limited on November 24, 2010.

Board of Directors

1.4 The first Board of Directors of the Company, consisted of the following:-

- (1) Shri Raghu Menon, Additional Secretary & Financial Advisor, Ministry of Civil Aviation
- (2) Shri D.K. Singh Joint Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation and
- (3) Shri Rajiv Bansal, Director, Ministry of Civil Aviation.

1.5 The Committee were informed that presently no Director on the Board belongs to SC/ST Category. When asked as to whether any member from SC/ST category had ever been appointed as Chairman/Member on the Board of Directors of Air India, it was submitted that no SC/ST Member had ever been appointed as Chairman/Member on the Board of Directors of NACIL.

1.6 In response to another query as to what steps had been taken by the Air India to include SC/ST member on the Board of Directors of Air India, it was informed that the appointments were made according to the procedure laid down by the Public Enterprises Selection Board and guidelines issued by the Department of Public Enterprises from time to time.

1.7 During the evidence, when the Committee enquired about the composition of the Board of Directors, the representatives of the Company stated that:-

“As regards Board of Directors, after the amalgamation, the Functional Directors of the Indian Airlines and Air India were brought on board. Of that, now the total number of Functional Directors are about seven”.

1.8 During the evidence, when the Committees desired to know whether any SC/ST Directors were on the Board, out of these seven Directors, the representatives of the Company clarified that "There are no SC/ST Directors".

1.9 To an enquiry as to whether periodical reviews were being undertaken by the Board to oversee implementation of reservation orders in favour of SCs/STs in services, the NACIL (A) has replied in the positive.

1.10 When the Committee desired copies of the relevant minutes/decisions of the meetings of the Board of Directors wherein such reviews were made in respect of reservation orders in favour of SCs/STs it was submitted by NACIL (A) that:-

"A procedure for processing proposals pertaining to supersession and involving dereservation of SC/ST candidates had been approved by the Board of Directors of erstwhile Air India Limited at its 63rd meeting held on 30 March 2000. This was based on the brochure on Reservation for SC/ST, the related Presidential Directives of 1975 amended up to November 1991 and also on the basis of guidelines issued by the Government in the matter".

The proposals for SC/ST supersessions are first examined by the Special Cell for SC/ST functioning in the Personnel Department and then recommended to the Board from time to time for consideration. It may be mentioned that the Members on the panel interviewing eligible candidates invariably include a representative of the SC/ST community. The Board then considers these supersession proposals and orders review, if found necessary, for appropriate action.

1.11 However, the reply of NACIL (I) to this question was in the negative stating that the Liaison Officer Corporate and Liaison Officers in Regions ensure due compliance of reservation orders in favour of SCs/STs.

1.12 The Committee note that appointment of Directors on the Board of National Aviation Company of India Limited is done in accordance with the procedure laid down by the Public Enterprises Selection Board and guidelines issued by the Department of Public Enterprises from time to time. The Committee also note that presently no Director on the Board of the Company belonged to SC/ST category. The Committee further note that at present there

are seven functional directors and four independent directors in the Company and none of them belonged to SC/ST category. The Committee feel that the Company does not promote SC/ST officers in higher scales even though Article 16(4) of the Constitution of India states that “Nothing in this article shall prevent the State from making any provision for the reservation for the appointments or posts in favour of any backward class of citizens which, in the opinion of the State, is not adequately represented in the services under the State” and Article 16(4A) which states that “Nothing in this article shall prevent the State from making any provision for reservation in matter of promotion, with consequential seniority to any class or classes of posts in the services under the State in favour of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes which, in the opinion of the State are not adequately represented in the Services of the State”. The Committee are of the view that having atleast one member on the Board of Directors from SC/ST category was essential to represent these communities. The Committee, therefore, recommend that in view of the constitutional mandate, the Government should provide reservation on appointment and promotion of officers in higher scales so that SC/ST officers could also get an opportunity to become Functional Directors of the National Aviation Company of India Limited. Further, Government should ensure that atleast one SC/ST member is nominated as Independent Director of the Board.

1.13 The Committee note that the Company has two divisions i.e. NACIL (A) and NACIL (I). In NACIL (A), the Board of Directors make a periodical review of the implementation of reservation orders in favour of SCs/STs. However, on the other hand in NACIL (I) no such periodical review is made by the Board of

the Directors. Only the Liaison officer – Corporate and Liaison Officers in the regions ensure due compliance of reservation orders in favour of SCs/STs. The Committee are unable to understand the reasons for adopting two different criteria by the Company in this regard, although the Board of Directors of both the Divisions of the Company is the same. The Committee are of the view that the Board of Directors of the Company should also make periodical review of the implementation of reservation orders in favour of SCs/STs in NACIL (I) so that SC/ST employees are not deprived of their genuine claim .

CHAPTER II

RESERVATION IN SERVICES

A. Recruitment Orders

2.1 The Committee was informed that orders/instructions issued by the Government from time to time with regard to reservation for Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and OBCs are brought to the notice of all organisations including Indian Airlines and Air India for implementation. It was also stated that the Presidential Directive was implemented in Air India and Indian Airlines since 1975 and as and when the guidelines were received in respect of reservation policy for SCs/STs, the same are implemented forthwith.

2.2 The Committee was also informed that the percentage of reservation in favour of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in both the Divisions of National Aviation Company of India Limited was as under:-

NACIL – A

(I) POSTS FILLED BY DIRECT RECRUITMENT

Direct Recruitment	Scheduled Castes	Scheduled Tribes	Date
Direct Recruitment on All India basis by means of open competitive test.	15%	7.5%	January, 1975
Direct Recruitment on All India basis otherwise than as (a) above.	16.66%	7.5%	January, 1975

(II) POSTS FILLED BY PROMOTION

Promotion	Scheduled Castes	Scheduled Tribes	Date
Post filled by promotion.	15%	7.5%	July 23rd, 1975

NACIL-I

	<u>Year of Implementation</u>	<u>Percentage</u>	
		<u>SC</u>	<u>ST</u>
All post filled by Direct Recruitment on all India Basis by open competition (excluding Pilot/Engineers/ Teachers/Medical Officers/ Airhostesses)	i) 1967	16	5
	ii) 1975	15	7.5
- Technicians & Airhostesses	1972	15	7.5
- Pilots/Engineers and Medical Officers	1975	15	7.5
All posts filled by Direct Recruitment otherwise than by open competition	i) 1972	17.5	7.5
	ii) 1975	16	7.5
	iii) Sept. 1993	16	7.5
All posts in Group 'D' filled on local basis	i) 1967	16	5
	ii) 1972		State-wise
percentages		as	prescribed
under			the Directive.
	iii) Sept. 1993		Revised State-wise percentages.

Promotions

(a) All posts filled by Promotion based on suitability-cum-Seniority.	1975	15	7.5
(b) All posts filled by internal selection upto the lowest rung of Group 'A' only.	1975	15	7.5

2.3 It was informed by NACIL-A that Reservation Orders are applicable to all categories of posts as far as direct recruitment is concerned and in promotion upto

the lowest rung of officers, i.e. Grade 25 in the pay scale of Rs.8550-13600. It was also stated that the reservation in promotion within Group 'A' was not applicable, i.e. to the post of Deputy Manager and equivalent categories in the pay scale of Rs.9500-15175 and above.

2.4 It was informed by NACIL-I that reservation was applicable to all posts in Air India Ltd. filled by direct recruitment and promotion. In respect of posts filled by selection, however, reservation was applicable upto the lowest rung of Group 'A' posts only. Consequently reservation was not applicable to some categories of posts filled by selection. However, if any direct recruitment was effected for these posts, the reservation orders were applicable.

Categories	Tech./Non-Tech.	Pay Scale (Rs.)
Chief Technician	Technical	10100-15000
Sr. Foreman/Sr. Inspector	Technical	11200-15350
Chief Foreman/Chief Inspector	Technical	12400-16400
Dy. Managers	Non- Technical	12400-16400
Managers	Non- Technical	15350-19100
Sr. Aircraft Engineers/Sr. Flight Engineers	Technical	15350-19100
Dy. Ch. Aircraft Engineers/Sr. Managers	Technical/Non- Technical	16050-19900
Chief Engineers	Technical	16400-20300
Chief Managers/Commanders	Non- Technical / Technical/	16750-20700 7550-9675 (Pre-rev.)
Dy. General Managers	Technical & Non-Technical	18700-22950
General Managers	Technical & Non-Technical	20500-26500
Executive Directors	Technical & Non-Technical	23750-28550

2.5 The Committee note that reservation is applicable to all posts in Air India Ltd. filled by direct recruitment and promotion. In respect of posts filled by selection, however, reservation was applicable upto the lowest rung of

Group 'A' posts only. Consequently reservation was not applicable to some categories of posts filled by selection. However, if any direct recruitment was effected for these posts, the reservation orders were applicable. The Committee feel that there is an urgent need to lay down policy guidelines for providing reservation for all categories of posts including all rungs of Group 'A' posts both in selection and promotion.

B. Recruitment Procedure

2.6 Regarding recruitment procedure, the Company had furnished the following information

(A) NACIL-A:

(i) *RECRUITMENT ON ALL INDIA BASIS*

2.7 Recruitment of staff in posts carrying the salary grade of Rs.8,550-13,600 and above and other specified categories like Cabin Crew Male/Female etc. done on all India basis are indicated below:-

Sl. No.	Category	Scale of Pay (Rs.)
1.	Officers Posts Asst. Manager – Personnel Asst. Manager – Commercial Asst. Manager – Admin. Asst. Manager - Flight Despatch	8550-13600
2.	Medical Officer Dy. Manager – IT Dy. Manager –Simualator Maint Dy. Manager – Finance Dy. Manager – Materials Management	9500-15175
3.	Management Trainee	12000/- (Stipend)
4.	Dy. Manager – CMC (Trainee)	30000/- (Stipend)
5.	Cabin Crew – Male/Female	6575-9275

(ii) *RECRUITMENT ON LOCAL/REGIONAL BASIS*

2.8 The various categories for which the recruitment is made on local/regional basis are indicated below:-

Sl. No.	Category	Scale of Pay (Rs.)
1.	Technician's Asst. III, Attendant-III, Office Asst.-III, Hygiene Attendant-III, Cook-III	5200-6850
2.	Security Asst.-III	5200-6850
3.	Safai Kamgar Suraksha Kamgar	5200-6850
4.	Transport Operator	5550-8050
5.	Canteen Supervisor, Catering Supervisor, Typist Clerk, Security Inspector, Progress Chaser, Customer Services Supvr., Stenographer, Storekeeper, Clerk, Nurse, Pharmacist, Scanning Technician etc.	5550-8050
6.	Aircraft Equipment Operator	6250-8950

2.9 It has been stated that when the vacancies are filled otherwise than by promotion, they are notified to staff both in common categories as well as other categories through employment notice.

2.10 The Committee have also been informed that the Company has been following a system of quota reservation for SCs/STs in accordance with the instructions contained in the Presidential Directive which provides for reservations for SCs and STs in appointment of various posts in the Company as per the required percentage of reservations.

2.11 It has also been informed that all posts are notified by way of publication in Employment News as well as other national newspapers having wide circulation.

The same is also notified on the website of Air India as well as its subsidiary companies. These Advertisements are also displayed in employment notices on the Office Notice Boards. Copies of publications are also sent to various Associations/agencies as well as Local Employment Exchange in the manner as provided in the relevant Act and the Rules made thereunder from time to time.

2.12 In reply to a question as to whether vacancies reserved for SCs/STs are also advertised through All India Radio/Doordarshan, it has been stated that of late Air India is not utilizing the medium of All India Radio particularly in view of there being no recruitment made in Group 'A' and 'D' posts. However, all vacancies are posted on Air India website 'www.airindia.in' and websites of its subsidiary companies. In some of the categories, the Company did encourage online applications.

2.13 On being asked whether posts reserved for SCs/STs are advertised in employment exchanges, the Committee have been informed that reserved vacancies are advertised in newspapers with a view to secure adequate number of SCs/STs candidates for appointment against the reserved vacancies. The reserved vacancies are also exclusively re-advertised in cases where SCs/STs candidates are not available in accordance with the procedure laid down in the Presidential Directives.

2.14 To a specific query whether the Employment Exchanges are informed about the SC/ST candidates so as to facilitate them in sponsoring the right type of candidates belonging to this communities, it has been informed that:-

"No, it is not a practice for the appointing authorities to indicate the reasons for rejection of SCs/STs candidates who are sponsored by the employment exchanges to employment exchange. The reason(s) for rejection of any candidate is normally recorded in the assessment sheet of the panel members."

2.15 It has also been stated that the letters of interview are issued to the candidates for appearing in the written test/interview by normal post. However, offer letters for joining after selection are sent "Under Certificate of Posting". Also approximately 3 weeks or more time period of notice is given to all candidates including SC/ST candidates for appearing for interview. However, the SC/ST candidates are not interviewed alongwith the general category candidates.

2.16 The Committee have also been informed that the selection panel consists of representatives of the concerned Department, HRD Department, Scheduled Castes/Tribes and Minority Community. The suitability of the SC/ST candidates is assessed on relaxed standard.

2.17 The Committee note that Air India was not utilizing the medium of All India Radio to advertise vacancies in view of the fact that no recruitment was being made in Group 'A' and 'D' posts. However, all vacancies were posted on the websites of Air India and its subsidiary companies. In some of the categories, the Company also encouraged online applications. The Committee also note that it was not the practice of the appointing authorities to indicate the reasons for rejection of SCs/STs candidates who are sponsored by the employment exchanges to these employment exchanges and the reasons for rejection of any candidate were normally recorded in assessment sheets of the panel members. The Committee are of the view that since many SC/ST candidates do not have access to Internet and other IT facilities, especially those residing in remote areas, the Committee feel that apart from using the facility of Internet and other technologies, the conventional system of advertising through National/Local Dailies newspapers, Employment News and correspondence through letters should be continued. The Committee

also desire that copies of the advertisement issued should be provided to the Secretariat of the Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes and recognized SC/ST Employees Welfare Association of the Company. The Committee desire that the Company should intimate the precise reasons for rejection of SC/ST candidates sponsored by the employment exchanges to enable them to sponsor other suitable SC/ST candidates. The Committee also desire to know the procedure for recruitment of Group 'A' and 'D' posts in NACIL-A&I.

C. Concessions/Relaxations

2.18 The Committee have been informed that the following concessions/relaxations are extended by NACIL-A to SC/ST candidates:-

- (i) Upper age limit is relaxed by 5 years.
- (ii) Experience is relaxed at discretion of competent authority, in case sufficient number of SCs/STs are not available in reserved quota.
- (iii) Relaxation in qualifying standards in written/trade tests, Group Discussion and interviews.
- (iv) Interviewed in separate sittings so as to judge them as per relaxed standards.
- (v) Posts reserved are carried forward to next recruitment year if not filled in the previous recruitment year, after giving necessary relaxation in qualifying standards, in service training, etc.
- (vi) Height relaxation in respect of candidates belonging to hilly areas.
- (vii) Travel reimbursement is given to SCs/STs not employed in autonomous bodies, PSUs, Government Undertaking, etc.
- (viii) No application fee is charged to SCs/STs.

NACIL-I

2.19 The details of concessions/relaxations extended to SCs/STs candidates by NACIL-I are as under:-

- (i) Upper age limit is relaxed by 5 years.
- (ii) Full exemption of application/examination fee.
- (iii) In case of clerical posts, for purpose of determining eligibility, a certain percentage of marks at the Matriculation/Higher Secondary level is prescribed for General Candidates. The same is waived off for SCs/STs Candidates.

- (iv) For the post of Stenographer/Typist, relaxation of 20 w.p.m. in shorthand/5 w.p.m. in typing speed is given to SCs/STs candidates for the purpose of determining eligibility.
- (v) SCs/STs candidates are reimbursed 2nd class train/bus fare for appearing in written test as well as interview.
- (vi) Minimum height prescribed for the post of Cabin Crew is relaxable upto 2.5 cms. for SCs/STs candidates.
- (vii) Relaxation in qualifying marks in written test up to 5%.
- (viii) Relaxation in qualifying marks in interview up to 5%.
- (ix) Candidates belonging to SCs/STs are interviewed in separate blocks and as far as possible on different days.
- (x) SCs/STs Officer is nominated on all Recruitment Boards.

2.20 Regarding procedure for recruitment of staff in various categories in NACIL-I, it was submitted that recruitment from the open market was carried out in Air India Limited for various posts in Groups 'A', 'B', 'C' and 'D'. Normally, the vacancies for the posts under Groups 'C' and 'D' were notified to the Employment Exchange(s) and a copy of the notification was also sent to various SC/ST Associations/Agencies. Posts under Group 'A' and 'B' vacancies were notified in the press and a copy of the advertisement was also sent to SC/ST Associations/Agencies, Lok Sabha and Rajya Sabha Secretariat. Advertisements were also released in Employment News and local newspapers to attract SC/ST candidates. Eligible candidates were subjected to written/trade test, group discussion and personal interview as applicable from time to time. Candidates found suitable in the interview were empanelled in the order of merit. Separate panels were formed for SC and ST candidates qualifying on relaxed standards. SC/ST candidates qualifying on merit were, however, placed on the general panel. Reservation for SCs/STs was applicable to all posts filled by Direct Recruitment.

2.21 The Committee note that reservation was made in case of direct recruitment for various posts in Groups 'A', 'B', 'C' and 'D' in Air India Limited. Normally, the vacancies for the posts under Groups 'C' and 'D' were notified to

the Employment Exchange(s) and a copy of the notification was also sent to various SC/ST Associations/Agencies. Posts under Group 'A' and 'B' vacancies were notified in the Press and a copy of the advertisement was also sent to SC/ST Associations/Agencies, Lok Sabha and Rajya Sabha Secretariats. It is, however, observed that copies of the advertisements are not received in the Secretariat of the Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The Committee desire that copies of the advertisements should be invariably endorsed to the Secretariat of the Committee for information. Advertisements were also released in Employment News and local newspapers to attract SC/ST candidates. Eligible candidates are subjected to written/trade test, group discussion and personal interview as applicable from time to time and candidates found suitable in the interview were empanelled in the order of merit. Separate panels were formed for SC and ST candidates qualifying on relaxed standards. SC/ST candidates qualifying on merit were, however, placed on the general panel. Reservation for SCs/STs is applicable to all posts filled by Direct Recruitment.

2.22 The Committee desire that in case local Employment Exchanges fail to sponsor adequate number of candidates, efforts should be made to search for the candidates from adjoining States through specific advertisement.

Details of Recruitment

2.23 The details of recruitment in operational areas made by both the Divisions of NACIL during the years 2006, 2007, 2008 and 2009 (upto 30.09.2009) are as under:-

NACIL-A Annexure – A

NACIL-I Annexure – B

2.24 The Committee have been informed that because of the ban on fresh recruitment and freeze on some vacancies in non-operational areas, the backlog has not been filled up.

2.25 During the evidence the representatives of NACIL also clarified that "most of the recruitment have been stopped and only the backlog filling has taken place and most of the activities are running on outsource basis".

2.26 During the evidence when asked whether in Air India or in all allied companies of NACIL, they require manpower or not, the representatives of the Company stated "Sir, in technical areas I do require manpower".

2.27 From the statement, the Committee note that all the SCs/STs vacancies of Trainee Pilots were not filled up during the year 2006. NACIL-A informed that as regards Trainee Pilot vacancies, it was found that for a given advertisement the number of applicants in ST category was less than the number of positions advertised. Also, amongst them very few could qualify in the written test even with relaxed standards as prescribed under the reservation orders. As a result, most of the vacancies reserved for ST remained unfilled and were carried forward as backlog/shortage vacancies, the details of which are as under:-

SUMMARY OF SURPLUS/SHORTAGE AS ON 31.12.2006

SC/ST	Required	Actual	Shortages	Surplus
SC	41	42	-	1
ST	20	12	8	-

2.28 Further in pursuance to Department of Public Enterprises (DPE)'s instructions to raise the retirement age from 58 to 60 years in 1998, the Company had to introduced various cost cutting measures, one of them being the ban on fresh recruitment and freeze on some vacancies. Subsequently, in 1999 Air India approached for exemption from these instructions and reversion of retirement age

from 60 to 58 years to reduce its expenditure and run the company with a healthy financial condition. The Ministry of Civil Aviation moved a Cabinet Note for reversion of retirement age in Air India from 60 to 58 years. The proposal was approved by the Cabinet subject to the condition that the complete ban on recruitment already in force shall continue. Hence, there had been no recruitment in non-operational areas and therefore, the backlog could not be filled up.

2.29 On being asked the reasons for not carrying forward 11 SC and 30 ST vacancies during the year 2007, the Committee were informed that the carry forward figures of 2007 included the vacancies being carried forward from the year 2006 and therefore, the vacancies were not shown separately.

2.30 When asked about the reasons for carrying forward large number of SC/ST vacancies and not making any recruitment in respect of Trainee Cabin Crew during 2007 and 2008, the Committee were informed that at present, the aviation market was in a recession, due to which there had been curtailment of flights and therefore, the requirement of Cabin Crew had reduced. As on date, NACIL-A is able to meet their Cabin Crew requirement from the existing strength. However, the backlog position of SC/ST in the Cabin Crew will be filled up through Special Recruitment Drive as and when there is a requirement of Cabin Crews.

2.31 To a query whether carried forward vacancies of ST Trainee Pilots have been filled up, the Committee were informed that in the recently recruitment exercise of Trainee Pilots 21 SC and 5 ST vacancies of Trainee Pilots were filled up.

2.32 Regarding steps taken by NACIL-A to fill up SC/ST carried forward vacancies, the Committee were informed that special recruitment drives would be conducted for posts in operational areas. When asked whether the ban on recruitment also included SC/ST backlog vacancies, the Committee were informed that a general ban

on recruitment was imposed in 1996. However, the backlog vacancies of SC/ST can be filled up. NACIL-A has already filled backlog SC/ST vacancies. Further that there is ban on recruitment since May, 1996 and the ban was on non-operational areas also.

2.33 When asked as to how long the ban on fresh recruitment would continue, it was stated that the recruitment process in NACIL have been presently kept on hold in view of the present financial crunch in the company and till a reassessment of manpower and the reserved vacancies was carried out in the merged company (NACIL).

2.34 It has been reported that due to ban on fresh recruitment and freeze on some of the vacancies, there has been no recruitment in non-operational areas and the backlog has not been filled up. However, NACIL-A has filled backlog SC/ST vacancies. The Committee note that recruitment process in NACIL has been kept on hold in view of the present financial crunch in the Company and till a reassessment of manpower and the reserved vacancies was carried out in the merged company (NACIL) which was formed by amalgamating erstwhile Air India and Indian Airlines in August, 2007. The Committee recommend that NACIL-A and NACIL-I should make all out efforts to fill all the posts reserved for SCs and STs in all the categories within a reasonable time frame. The Committee also recommend that NACIL-A and NACIL-I should provide the details of recruitment carried out in the year 2009, 2010 and 2011 and details of the backlog vacancies of SCs/STs in all categories of posts as on 1st April, 2012, to the Committee.

NACIL-I

2.35 The Committee further note that during the year 2006, in certain posts like AME Trainee, 11 appointments were made without keeping any corresponding vacancies reserved during the year. Such instances were seen in other posts also in all the years for which the particulars were furnished. The explanation submitted in this regard to the Committee is that details of appointments made for the post of Sr. AME/AME in the years 2006 and 2007, as given in the statements, were from the overlapping recruitment exercises and candidates were appointed in batches over a period of 2 years in these exercises.

2.36 For the post of Sr. AME/AME, initial advertisement was issued in July, 2005 for filling up of 205 vacancies (SC-27, ST-13, OBC-60 and Gen.-105). In view of fleet augmentation and operational requirement, it was decided to fill up the residual vacancies of earlier recruitment exercise, hence two more advertisements were also issued. Recruitment exercises were completed in phases and a total of 157 candidates (SC-16, ST-08, OBC-29 and Gen.-104) were appointed. Hence, a backlog of SC-11 and ST-05 vacancies existed as on 01.01.2009. The backlog shown pertained to the recruitment exercises completed in phases. With regard to other posts, it has been stated that during the years 2006 to 2009, appointments were made either on compassionate grounds or re-appointment or reinstatement as also arising out of one time exercise as per understanding arrived at with the concerned Unions. All the eligible candidates were considered for appointment and those who were declared qualified in the selection process were appointed.

2.37 When the Committee sought explanation regarding reasons for mismatch between vacancies carried forward and actually shown as vacancies brought forward from previous years, the Company submitted that with regard to mismatch in posts in Group 'C' and 'D', during the years 2006 to 2009, appointments had been

made either on compassionate grounds or re-appointment or reinstatement as also arising out of one time exercise as per the understanding arrived at with the concerned Unions. All the eligible candidates were considered for appointment and those who were declared qualified in the selection process were appointed.

2.38 The Committee note that in some cases, the number of post, shown as carried forward did not match with the number of posts shown as brought forward from the previous years. For example, under Group 'A' post of Senior Trainee Pilot/Trainee Pilot for the year 2006, 13 posts are shown as ST vacancies carried forward to the year 2007. However, 10 posts were shown as the opening balance during the year 2007.

2.39 The Company through post evidence replies informed that details of appointments made for the post of Sr. Trainee Pilot/Trainee Pilot in the year from 2006 to 2009 as given in the statements were from the overlapping recruitment exercises and candidates were appointed in batches over a period of 5 years in these exercises.

2.40 The Committee find that for the post of Sr. Trainee Pilot/Trainee Pilot, initial advertisement was issued in October, 2005 for filling up of 260 vacancies and to form a panel for future requirements. Thereafter, another advertisement was published to fill up the residual vacancies of earlier recruitment exercise. Recruitment exercise was completed in phases including Campus Recruitment from Indira Gandhi Rastriya Uraan Academy (IGRUA).

2.41 The Committee also note that in view of fleet augmentation, an advertisement was issued in May, 2007 for filling up of 76 vacancies for the post of Sr. Trainee Pilot/Trainee Pilot and to form a panel for future requirements. The said recruitment exercise was completed in phases including Campus Recruitment from IGRUA.

However, keeping in view the operational requirement, a total of 137 vacancies (SC-13, ST-06, OBC-18 and Gen.-100) were filled up in the said recruitment exercises against required reservation of SC-24, ST-12, OBC-45. Hence, a backlog of SC-11 and ST-06 vacancies exists as on 01.01.2009.

2.42 The Committee also note that 6 vacancies of Dy. Manager (Medical) were advertised in the month of May, 2006. However, not even a single person belonging to SC/ST was recruited for the post. Reasons in this regard furnished to the Committee are that advertisement for the post of Deputy Manager (Medical) was issued in May, 2006 for filling up of 8 vacancies (GEN.-6 & OBC-02) and to form panel for future requirements for all categories. At the time of issue of the advertisement, there were two candidates (SC-1 & GEN.-1) available on the roster. In the said recruitment exercise, 06 appointments (OBC-01 & GEN.-05) and 07 (SC-01, OBC-02 & GEN.-04) were made in the years 2006 and 2007 respectively.

Staff Strength

2.43 Group-wise total staff strength of both the Divisions of the Company i.e. NACIL-A and NACIL-I as on 1.11.2010 was as under:-

NACIL-A

Group of posts	Total No. of employees	No. of		Percentage of	
		SC	ST	SC	ST
1	2	3	4	5	6
Group – A	4818	835	350	17.33%	7.26%
Group – B	3505	676	252	19.29%	7.19%
Group – C	1581	263	142	16.64%	8.98%
Group – D (Excluding Safai Kamgar)	3002	947	197	31.55%	6.56%
Group – D (Sweepers only)	546	331	13	60.62%	2.38%
Total	13452	3052	954	22.69%	7.01%

NACIL-I

Group of posts	Total No. of employees	No. of		Percentage of	
		SC	ST	SC	ST
1	2	3	4	5	6
Group – A	6574	1094	405	16.64%	6.16%
Group – B	4007	712	307	17.76%	7.67%
Group – C	1951	350	130	17.93%	6.66%
Group – D (Excluding Safai Kamgar)	3613	695	241	19.23%	6.67%
Group – D (Sweepers only)	396	234	18	59.09%	4.54%
Total	16541	3085	1101	18.65%	6.66%

2.44 When enquired about the reasons for shortfall in intake of SCs/STs as per their reserved quota and the steps taken/proposed to be taken to reduce the shortfall, the Committee were informed that the shortfall exists for Scheduled Tribes mainly in some categories due to non-availability of suitable candidates. In some

categories, it was there due to reserved posts which were carried forward on account of compassionate appointments or single appointments, etc. In view of the present financial crunch in the Company, all recruitments/promotions have been put on hold till the reassessment of manpower takes place in the merged Company.

2.45 To a query regarding measures/steps taken to maintain the required percentage of SCs/STs in staff strength of both the divisions of the Company, it was stated by NACIL-A that special recruitment drive would be conducted as and when the ban on recruitment was lifted. Also there is no restriction on direct recruitment to fill up the backlog reserved posts of SCs/STs in operational areas.

2.46 With regard to NACIL-I, it was stated that the shortfall exists only for Scheduled Tribes mainly in some categories due to non-availability of suitable candidates. In some categories, the shortfall was due to reserved posts carried forward on account of compassionate appointments or single appointments, etc. In view of the present financial crunch in the Company, all recruitment/promotions have been put on hold till the reassessment of manpower took place in the merged Company. Whenever it was decided to fill up the vacancies under Direct Recruitment, all possible efforts would be made to wipe out the shortfall wherever it exists.

Backlog

2.47 Backlog vacancies in all categories in the NACIL as on 1.1.2010 was stated to be as under:-

NACIL-A

Post	As on 01.01.2010		Action
OPERATIONAL AREA	SC	ST	
Tr. Pilot (Group-A)	2	10	SRD (External)
Asst. Mgr.-FD (Group-A)	-	3	SRD (Internal)
Cabin Crew (Female) (Group-C)	53	16	*
NON-OPERATIONAL AREA			
Dy.Manager –Finance (Group-A)	1	-	*
Cust. Services Supvr. (Group-C)	1	1	*
Loader (Group-D)	1	-	Compassionate appointment
Attendant-III/Office Asst.III (Group-D)	-	1	Compassionate appointment
Handyman (Safai)/Hygiene Att. (Group-D)	-	1	Compassionate appointment

* At present, the aviation market is in a recession, due to which there has been curtailment of flights and therefore, the requirement of Cabin Crew has reduced. As on date, we are able to meet our Cabin Crew requirement from the existing strength. However, the backlog position of SC/ST in the Cabin Crew will be filled up through Special Recruitment Drive as and when the market improves and the requirement of Cabin Crew increases.

NACIL-I

TECHNICAL

S.No.	Category of Post	Backlog as on 1.1.2010	
Group-A		SC	ST
1	Sr. Trainee Pilot/Trainee Pilot	11*	6*
2	AME Trainee (A&C)	11*	5**
Total		22	11
Group-B			
1	Aircraft Tech./Trainee Tech.	07	07
Total		07	07

* Initial Advertisement was issued in October, 2005 and thereafter two other advertisements were issued to fill up residual vacancies. Recruitment exercises

were completed in phases including campus recruitment from IGRUA. The backlog shown here is of recruitment exercises completed in phases.

** Initial Advertisement was issued in July, 2005 and thereafter two other advertisements were issued to fill up residual vacancies. Recruitment exercises were completed in phases. The backlog shown here is of recruitment exercises completed in phases.

NON-TECHNICAL

S.No.	Category of Post	Backlog as on 1.1.2010	
Group-A		SC	ST
1	Asstt.Manager (Commercial)	1	0
Total		1	0
Group-C			
1	Cabin Crew (Female)	25	9
2	Cabin Crew (Male)	0	1
3	Traffic Asstt.	0	1
4	Security/Vigilance Asstt.	0	3
Total		25	15

It was also stated that the Company propose to undertake Special Recruitment Drive for filling up the vacancies.

2.48 When asked the reasons for the backlog and the measure taken by the Company to fill up the backlog vacancies, NACIL-A informed that while pursuing the Department of Public Enterprises (DPE's) instructions to raise the retirement age from 58 to 60 years in 1998, the Company had introduced various cost cutting measures, one of them being ban on fresh recruitment and freeze on some vacancies. Subsequently, in 1999 Air India approached for exemption from these instructions and reversion of retirement age from 60 to 58 years to reduce its expenditure and run the company with a healthy financial condition. The Ministry of Civil Aviation moved a Cabinet Note for reversion of retirement age in Air India from 60 to 58 years. The proposal was approved by the Cabinet subject to the condition that the complete ban on recruitment already in force shall continue. Hence, there

has been no recruitment in non-operational areas and therefore, the backlog has not been filled up.

2.49 With regard to NACIL-I, it has been stated that the backlog exists in some technical categories due to non-availability of suitable SCs/STs candidates. In certain other categories, it was due to reserved posts carried forward on account of compassionate appointments or single appointments, etc. In view of the present financial condition being faced by the company all recruitments/promotions had been put on hold. As and when it was decided to make recruitment from open market and promotions from within, priority would be given to clear all the backlog vacancies.

2.50 When the Committee desired to know whether at any point of time the Company had de-reserved any post, it was informed by NACIL-A that the Air India had not de-reserved any post in the recent past.

2.51 NACIL-I in this regard submitted that there was no de-reservation in Direct Recruitment. However, in promotion the procedure for de-reservation was followed as per the Presidential Directives. For Group A&B posts, approval of the Board of Directors and for Group C&D posts approval of Managing Director is obtained in the prescribed proforma. Such de-reservation arose only when suitable candidates belonging to reserved categories were not available even with relaxed standards and in the extended zone of consideration. One post of SC and ten posts of ST in the year 2008 were de-reserved after following the due process during the last years.

2.52 The Committee note that in NACIL-I, the backlog exists in some technical categories due to non-availability of suitable SCs/STs candidates. In certain other categories, it was created due to reserved posts carried forward on account of compassionate appointments or single appointments, etc. In

view of the present financial condition being faced by the Company, all recruitments/promotions have been put on hold. As and when it is decided to make recruitment from open market and promotions from within, priority will be given to clear all the backlog vacancies. The Committee also note that there is no de-reservation in Direct Recruitment. However, in promotion the procedure for de-reservation as per the Presidential Directives was followed. For Group A&B posts, approval of the Board of Directors and for Group C&D posts approval of Managing Director was obtained in the prescribed proforma. Such de-reservation arose only when suitable candidates belonging to reserved categories were not available even with relaxed standards and in the extended zone of consideration. One post of SC and ten posts of ST in the year 2008 were de-reserved after following the due process during the last years.

2.53 It is difficult to believe that NACIL is not able to recruit SC/ST candidates for technical posts due to non-availability of suitable candidates. They should make efforts to recruit SC/ST candidates in all categories of posts by advertising in National Dailies, TV Channels, writing to Universities/Technical Collages, etc. The Committee are of the view that the Company should have considered giving further relaxation/training to SC/ST candidates before de-reserving the one post of SC and two posts of STs in the year 2008. Further after taking the approval of Managing Director, the Ministry of Civil Aviation should also be consulted in this regard to avoid such de-reservation of SCs/STs posts. The Committee would like to be apprised of the details of posts de-reserved by both the divisions of the Company during the

year 2009-2012 as also the steps taken by the Company to avoid de-reservation of SC/ST vacancies in promotion.

CHAPTER – III

Measures to improve Representation of SCs/STs

A. Deputation

NACIL-A

3.1 The Committee have been informed that NACIL-A had taken eight officials in different categories of posts on deputation from other departments but none of them belonged to SC/ST category. Also, no employee of NACIL-A had ever been sent on deputation to other departments.

NACIL-I

3.2 It has been stated that one Police Constable from Ranchi (Jharkhand) was taken on deputation during the period 20.10.2009 but he did not belong to SC/ST category. Also one of their employees was sent on deputation. However, both of them did not belong to SC/ST category. It has also been stated that no application was received from eligible SC/ST employees while considering candidates for deputation in the Company both in NACIL-A and NACIL-I as well as for sending them to other organisations.

3.3 The Committee note that NACIL-A had taken eight officials on deputation from other Government Department(s) during the year 2006-2009, but none of them belonged to SC/ST category. NACIL-I had also sent one of their employees on deputation and taken one employee on deputation from other Department. However, neither of them belonged to SC/ST category. The Committee feel that for career progression of SC/ST employees, they should be given opportunities in the matter of deputation as it opens an avenue for

them to get exposed to new work environment, improve their working skill and aptitude which eventually will benefit the employee and the organisation. The Committee, therefore, desire that it should be apprised of details deputation in both the divisions of NACIL during last three years.

B. Appointment on Compassionate Grounds

3.4 The Committee note that no appointments on compassionate grounds had been made by NACIL-A during the years 2006, 2007, 2008 and 2009 even though they had 201 applications from SC/ST pending for consideration. However, NACIL-I have furnished data regarding compassionate appointments during the same period as follow:-

Year	Total appointment made of compassionate ground	SC	ST
2006	55	13	05
2007	50	09	05
2008	09	03	--
2009	01	01	--

3.5 When asked about the reasons for non-appointment on compassionate grounds by NACIL-A during the above cited period, the Committee were informed that till 1996, both Divisions of the Company were appointing dependents of deceased employees on out-of- turn (OOT) compassionate grounds on a regular basis in the erstwhile companies, when the freeze in recruitment was imposed by the Ministry given the high employee-aircraft ratio. The ban did not cover appointments on compassionate grounds. While the erstwhile Indian Airlines interpreted this freeze on recruitment as not covering the OOT compassionate cases and continued with OOT appointments on a regular basis, the erstwhile Air India Ltd. interpreted this freeze on recruitment as applicable to appointments including the

OOT cases on compassionate grounds. No appointment on compassionate grounds had been made due to ban on recruitment since May 1996.

3.6 To a query regarding number of applications which were pending for such appointments under both NACIL-A and NACIL-I as on 30.03.2010, the Committee were informed that the total number of applications pending for appointments on compassionate grounds were 613 in NACIL-A out of which 201 belonged to SCs/STs.

3.7 With regard to NACIL-I it was stated that as on 31.3.2010, a total of 123 applications were pending for appointment on compassionate grounds out of which 28 belonged to SC category and 12 to ST category.

3.8 Regarding the criteria for appointment on compassionate grounds, the NACIL-A informed that Air India has a scheme for compassionate appointment for giving employment to dependants of deceased employee who were not gainfully employed anywhere and had no other means of livelihood to support the family.

3.9 Initially, these dependants were appointed as casual labourers or taken on temporary basis. Thereafter, depending on the availability of vacancy, such dependents were engaged on regular basis. Subsequently, due to imposition of restriction on recruitment by the Ministry in 1996, this Scheme could not be further implemented.

3.10 As per Clause VI of the Scheme for Compassionate Appointment, the procedure to be followed before making compassionate appointments is as under:-

"Candidates applying for appointments on compassionate grounds should be subject to a written test/interview, wherever applicable. The test need not be very rigid. It is only to be ensured that the person concerned would be in a position to discharge the duties of the post being offered to him. The test is

also meant to assess the aptitude of the person for the particular job proposed to be assigned to him/her. It should be conducted keeping compassion in view which is the basis of such appointments".

3.11 As regards compassionate appointments, NACIL-I informed that compassionate appointment were offered to the dependents of employee who died in air crash or in accident while on duty and those who died in circumstances other than those mentioned above keeping in view the financial condition of the family, purely on humanitarian grounds for the posts in the initial rung of Group 'C' and 'D' posts commensurate with their age, qualification and experience etc. through the process of interview. It was also stated that keeping in view the present financial crunch in the Company, all appointments including compassionate appointments had been kept on hold.

3.12 When asked as to what steps were being taken by the Company for appointments on compassionate grounds, the Committee were informed that a proposal was being considered for engaging OOT cases including those belonging to SC/ST, as Trainees for a period of 6 months and subsequently they might be appointed on regular basis.

3.13 The Committee are surprised to note that no appointments on compassionate grounds have been made by NACIL-A during the year 2006 to 2009 even though they had 201 applications from SC/ST candidates pending for consideration as on 30.03.2010. Similarly in NACIL-I, applications from 28 SC and 12 ST candidates were pending for appointment on compassionate grounds. The Committee feel that it is a matter of great concern that such a large number of SC/ST applications for appointment on compassionate grounds are pending in both the divisions of the Company. The Committee

desire that the process of appointments on compassionate grounds should be expedited and accorded utmost priority as many of these SC/ST families belong to lower income groups with no other means of livelihood. The Committee, therefore, recommend that both the divisions of NACIL should initiate immediate action for filling up posts for SCs/STs from eligible SC/ST candidates whose applications are pending for appointment on compassionate grounds. The Committee should apprised of the outcome of the above at the earliest.

C. Posting Abroad

3.14 When asked about the number of officers (category-wise) posted abroad during the years 2006 to 2009, the NACIL-A informed as under:-

Category/Post	2006	2007	2008	2009
Group 'A'	71	74	47	37

3.15 Out of the above, 31 officers belong to SC/ST category. It was also stated that no reservations orders apply to these postings.

With regard to NACIL-I, the details of abroad posting is as under:-

Year		Total No. of employee/ re-employed	SC	ST
2006	Officers	14	03	02
	Staff	16	03	02
2007	Officers	20	02	01
	Staff	11	03	01
2008	Officers	07	01	01
	Staff	12	-	01
2009	Officers	06	02	-
	Staff	07	01	01

3.16 It was also stated that since foreign postings are only transfers and no upgradation of any post is involved, the reservation orders do not apply to there postings.

3.17 The Committee note that NACIL-A has furnished the details of postings abroad of Group 'A' posts only despite the fact the Committee had asked for category-wise details. The Committee have been informed that there was no reservation in the matters of posting abroad in both the divisions of the Company and reservation orders were not applied in the matter of postings abroad. However, the Committee feel that the management should give priority to SC/ST employees who are qualified and eligible for posting abroad.

The Committee, therefore, urge the management to give due consideration to their suggestion and nominate as many as possible eligible SC/ST candidates for postings abroad.

In Service/Pre-recruitment Training

3.18 The Committee were informed by the Company that in-service training is given to all employees including SC/ST employees. The details of in-service training during the year 2006 to 2009 are as under:-

NACIL-A

Year	2006	2007	2008	2009 (upto Sep. 2009)
GEN.	1155	1193	903	653
SC	231	248	217	161
ST	92	81	70	63
Total	1478	1522	1190	877

NACIL-I

Year	No. of Employees Trained
2006	11353
2007	16562
2008	14380
2009	3728

3.19 The Committee were also informed that the Company did not arrange pre-recruitment training in both NACIL-A and NACIL-I.

3.20 The Committee note that NACIL-I has furnished consolidated information with regard to in-service training given to SC/ST employees. Also both the divisions of the Company gave details without mentioning the category of posts for which such training was imparted. The Committee recommend that NACIL should conduct regular in-service training programmes for SC/ST employees in all categories of posts so as to bring up them at par with other employees and have better prospects for promotion to

next higher grade. The Committee should also be provided with break up of posts in which SCs/STs were given in-service training by NACIL-I. The Committee are also of the view that the Company should explore the feasibility of imparting pre-recruitment training to SC/ST candidates.

SC Cell/Liaison Office in Ministry of Civil Aviation

3.22 The Committee were informed that SC/ST Cell was presently functioning in the Ministry of Civil Aviation to oversee the interests of SC/ST employees in Government Undertakings under their control, including Air India.

3.23 Regarding composition of the SC/ST Cell in the Ministry, the Committee were informed that an Assistant of Coordination and Welfare Section dealing with SC/ST matters assisted the Liaison Officer. It was also informed that a Liaison Officer had been appointed in the Ministry of Civil Aviation to coordinate/oversee the interests of SC/ST employees in Air India.

SC/ST Cell/Liaison Officer in NACIL

3.24 Both the divisions of the Company i.e. NACIL-A and NACIL-I had informed that a Special Cell for SC/ST employees had been set up at the Headquarters to look after the interests of SC/ST employees.

3.25 The Special Cell for SC/ST reported to the Liaison Officer for SC/ST. At present the Executive Director-HQ had been designated as the Liaison Officer for SC/ST and entrusted with the responsibility of implementing the President's Directive, orders/instructions issued by the Ministry in the matter of reservation for SC/ST. In order to implement reservation for SC/ST, for posts filled by direct recruitment/promotion, the Company was following the Post Based Roster in compliance with the O.M. No.36012/2/96-Estt.(Res.) dated 2 July, 1997. These rosters were examined and scrutinized by the Liaison Officer for SCs/STs of the Company. Any shortcomings observed were corrected at the time of inspection of rosters. In addition, annual statistics, as required by the Ministry, were submitted from time to time.

3.26 When asked about the number of person belonging to SCs/STs working in the Cell at head office, the NACIL-A informed as under:-

"A Special Cell headed by a professionally qualified SC Officer at the senior level of Dy. General Manager is set up in the Human Resources Development Department under the supervision of the Liaison Officer for SC/ST. The Staff attached to the Cell is as follows:-

Dy. General Manager (SC)	:	01
Asst. Manager-Personnel (1SC)	:	02
Officer-Admin.(Steno)(SC)	:	01
Attendant-II (SC)	:	01

NACIL-I in this regard had furnished the following composition of the SC/ST Cell.

S.No.	Region	Name & Designation of Officers/Staff for the Cell
1.	Registered Office (ST)	Shri K.M. Prasad Dy. Manager (Personnel), Shri Manoranjan Pradhan, Assistant Manager (Personnel)
2.	Western (SC)	Shri B.T. Wankhede Assistant Manager (Personnel) Shri P. Sudalal Office Supdt. (SG).
3.	Eastern (SC)	Shri B.C. Biswas Chief Manager (Personnel) Shri A. Poddar, Assistant Manager (Personnel) Shri Ratan Kumar Das, Office Supdt. (SG)
4.	Northern (SC)	Shri Dharam Das Deputy Manager (Personnel). Shri Iqbal Office Supdt. Mrs. Rekha Sharma Office Assistant.

5.	Southern (SC) (Chennai)	Shri S. Bhaskaran Asstt. Manager (Personnel) Shri P. Venugopal Office Supdt. (SG)
6.	Southern (Hyderabad) (SC)	Shri S.G. Raj Dy. General manager (Personnel) Shri A.L. Jairaj Office Supdt.

3.27 Regarding details of Liaison officer appointed in the organisation to ensure due compliance of reservation policy, the NACIL-A informed that Executive Director (HQ) had been designated as the Liaison Officer for SC/ST and entrusted with the responsibility of implementing the Presidential Directives, Orders/instructions issued by the Ministry in the matter of reservation for SCs/STs.

3.28 NACIL-I stated that the Executive Director, Integration and Headquarters had been appointed as the Liaison Officer Corporate to ensure due compliance of the reservation orders. In addition, General Manager (Personnel) in each of the four Regions had been designated as Liaison Officer for their respective regions. Details of Liaison Officer at corporate and regional level was as under:-

Sl.No.	Region	Name of Designation
1.	Headquarter	
2.	Western	Shri M. Raghuramiah, General Manager (Personnel) National Aviation Company of India Ltd. New Engineering Complex, Vile Parle (East), Sahar, Mumbai -400 029.
3.	Eastern	Shri S.N. Bhattacharya, General Manager (Personnel), National Aviation Company of India Ltd., Airlines House, 39, Chittanjan Avenue, Kolkata – 700 012.
4.	Northern	Mrs. Deepa Mahajan, General Manager (Personnel),

National Aviation Company of India Ltd.,
IGI Airport, Terminal-I,
New Delhi – 110037.

5. Southern

Shri J. Gurumurthy,
General Manager (Personnel),
National Aviation Company of India Ltd.,
Airlines House,
Meenambakkam,
Chennai – 600 027.

3.29 Regarding designation of Liaison Officer appointed by the Company at its head office and regional/zonal offices. NACIL-A informed that Executive Director (HQ) at head office has been appointed as the Liaison officer for SC/ST (NACIL). Regional Liaison Offices are appointed at the respective regions.

3.30 When asked about the procedure for selecting/appointing the Liaison Officer, both the divisions of Company informed that there was no laid down procedure for selecting/appointing the Liaison Officers.

3.31 It was also stated that the Liaison Officers were sent for seminars/training on reservation policy for SC/ST conducted by outside Specialized Agencies.

3.32 It was also stated that periodical meetings were held with SC/ST Employees Associations to sort out their problems and grievances. In addition, the Liaison Officer for SC/ST and officers of the SC/ST Cell meet the Association/SC/ST employees as and when they approach to get their grievances redressed. Regional and Inter-Regional meetings were also conducted. The details of meetings held with the Associations by the Liaison Officers during the last three years were as follows:-

NACIL-A

Year	Date	Station
2006	04.02.2006 09.08.2006	Chennai Kolkata
2007	08.06.2007	Amritsar
2008	28.05.2008	Mumbai

NACIL-I

Hyderabad	03.02.2009
Western Region	30.03.2009
Eastern Region	30.03.2009
Northern Region	30.06.2009
CTE Hyderabad	09.10.2009

3.33 The Committee were also informed that the Minutes of the meetings are also circulated to SC/ST Welfare Association of the Company.

Rosters

3.34 Regarding NACIL-A the Committee were informed that recruitment rosters were maintained at Headquarters and at regional level also. These rosters were inspected on a regular basis by the Special Cell for SC/ST and certified by the Liaison Officers for SC/ST. Also the rosters of Air India (Head Office at Mumbai) were inspected by the representative of the Ministry of Civil Aviation during the years 2007 and 2008. A number of lacuna were noticed and reported to Air India for corrective action and compliance.

3.35 With regard to NACIL-I, the Committee were informed that Rosters were being maintained at Registered Office for all Officers upto the lowest rung of Group 'A' and for non-technical categories in Group 'B', 'C', & 'D'. In Regions, rosters were being maintained for certain technical posts upto the lowest rung of Group 'A' and for technical and non-technical categories in Group 'B', 'C' & 'D'.

3.36 Inspection of Rosters was carried out by the Liaison Officer (Corporate). The General Manager (Personnel) in each of the four Regions i.e. Northern, Southern, Eastern and Western had been designated as Liaison Officer for their respective Regions. They also examined the rosters from time to time for ensuring

implementation of reservations orders in respect of recruitment, selection & promotion within their jurisdiction.

3.37 The rosters for recruitment and promotion were maintained separately by both the divisions of NACIL. Details of rosters inspected by the respective Liaison Officers during each of the last three years were as under:-

NACIL-A

Region	Date of Inspection
Mumbai	24 June to 17 July, 2008
	3 April to 15 May, 2009
Delhi	12 & 13 May, 2008
	19 May, 2009
Kolkata	8 September, 2008
	22 May, 2009
Chennai	24 & 25 April, 2008
	26 May, 2009

NACIL-I

Region	Date of Inspection
Northern Region	24 January, 2008
	20 January, 2009
	20 January, 2010
Eastern Region	9 March, 2007
	18 February, 2008
	15 January, 2009
Western Region	12 January, 2009
	7 January, 2010
Southern Region	31 February, 2008
	12 February, 2009
	19 January, 2010
SR, Hyderabad	28 March, 2008
	19 February, 2009
	19 January, 2010

3.38 A lacuna regarding maintenance of roster for a post for which the SF is less than 14, was found in Western Region and the same had since been rectified.

3.39 It has been stated that during the year 2007 and 2008, a number of lacunae were noticed while inspecting the rosters of Air India (H.O. at Mumbai) by the representative of the Ministry and reported to Air India for corrective action and compliance. On being asked as to what kind of discrepancies/observations were reported by the representative during the inspection of rosters and the remedial

action taken by NACIL thereon, it has been stated that the action taken was informed to the Ministry of Civil Aviation vide attached letter No.HQ/60-25/5098 dated 14th February, 2008 by the then ED-HQs.

3.40 When the Committee asked whether representative of the Ministry of Civil Aviation inspected the rosters maintained by NACIL-I during the last three years, the following details were furnished to the Committee by post evidence replies:-

The inspection team observed that the rosters were not complete. NACIL has been instructed to take remedial action in the matter.

2008 - Followed up on the previous inspection.

2009 - No inspection conducted as the merged entity was in the process of manpower integration.

3.41 Inspection of NACIL-A was conducted by the representatives of Ministry of Civil Aviation as follows:-

Year	Date of Inspection	Representatives from Ministry of Civil Aviation
2007	9th April, 2007	Dy. Secretary of Ministry of Civil Aviation.
2008	7th & 8th February, 2008	Under Secretary of the Ministry of Civil Aviation.
2009	NIL	

3.42 The Committee note that in both the divisions of the Company, the Special Cell for SC/ST reports to the Liaison Officer for SC/ST. At present, the Executive Director-HQ has been designated as the Liaison Officer for SC/ST and entrusted with the responsibility of implementing the President's Directive, orders/instructions issued by the Ministry in the matter of reservation for SCs/STs. In order to implement reservation for SCs/STs in appointments filled by direct recruitment/promotion, the Company are

following the Post Based Roster in compliance with the O.M.No.36012/2/96-Estt.(Res.) dated 2nd July, 1997. These rosters are examined and scrutinized by the Liaison Officer for SCs/STs of the Company. Any shortcomings observed are corrected at the time of inspection of rosters. In addition, annual statistics as required by the Ministry, are submitted from time to time by the Company.

3.43 The Committee also note that Executive Director-HQ has been appointed as the Liaison Officer Corporate to ensure due compliance of the reservation orders. In addition, General Managers (Personnel) in each of four regions have been designated as Liaison Officer for their respective region. The Committee further note that there is no laid down procedure for selecting/appointing the Liaison Officers and also that the Executive Director-HQ has been entrusted with additional charge as Liaison Officer for SCs/STs.

3.44 The Committee stress that the nomination of Liaison Officers should not be considered as mere fulfillment of a formality. The Committee, therefore, recommend that only such officers should be appointed as Liaison Officers who are not only fully acquainted with reservation orders but are also committed to justify their appointment to safeguard the welfare of SC/ST employees. The Committee also desire that the Liaison Officers for SCs/STs should exclusively look after the matters relating to SCs/STs and should not be burdened with other matters. The Committee also feel that Chief Liaison Officers posted at Headquarters as well as the Liaison Officers at regional offices should preferably be appointed from people belonging to SCs/STs category.

3.45 The Committee note that during the years 2007 and 2008, a number of lacuna were noticed while inspecting of the rosters of Air India (H.O. at Mumbai) by the representative of the Ministry and reported to Air India for corrective action and compliance. The Committee desire to know the details of the remedial action taken by NACIL on the lacunae noticed during the inspection and recommend that requisite steps should be taken to prevent recurrence of such lacunae in future. The Committee also recommend that the officials responsible for maintenance of rosters should be imparted proper training so that the chances of any lacunae are obviated.

3.46 The Committee also note that during the years 2006 to 2008 the Liaison Officer of NACIL-A held meeting with SC/ST Welfare Association at Chennai, Kolkata, Amritsar and Mumbai. However, NACIL-I has submitted details of meetings held in 2009 only. The Committee desire that NACIL-I should furnish the details of meetings held by the Liaison Officer with SC/ST Welfare Association during 2006 to 2008. The Committee further, recommend that the both the divisions of NACIL should furnish the details in this regard for the years 2010 and 2011 also.

Complaints/Grievances

NACIL-A

3.47 In reply to a query about mechanism for redressal of grievances of SC/ST employees, it was stated by NACIL-A that the grievances/representations received from SC/ST employees are examined by the Special Cell and wherever required, it was discussed with the Liaison Officer and remedial action taken.

3.48 It has further been stated that in NACIL-A, the following complaints/grievances were received from SC/ST employees or SC/ST Associations during the years 2006 to 2009 as under:-

Year	Mumbai		Delhi		Chennai		Kolkata	
	SC	ST	SC	ST	SC	ST	SC	ST
2006	15	3	--	1	2	1	--	--
2007	8	3	2	--	1	1	--	--
2008	2	3	3	--	--	2	--	1
2009	--	1	1	--	1	1	--	--
Total	25	10	6	1	4	5	--	1

3.49 When asked about the total number of complaints received during the year 2009 and how many had been attended to, it was informed that the total number of complaints during 2009 from SC/ST employees was four. Out of the four cases reported, two cases have been disposed off.

3.50 On being asked about the nature of these complaints and the time taken for disposal of each complaint, the Committee were informed that the complaints related to promotion, administrative matters, seniority, training, etc. Most of the complaints were disposed of during the year itself. The complaints were discussed with the SC/ST Association during the regional/inter-regional meetings on a mutually convenient date and resolved to the satisfaction of the complainant. In view of the large number of Departments, the Special Cell for SC/ST was required to follow-up complaints with the concerned Departments for redressal and efforts were made to resolve the same within a reasonable period.

3.51 It was also stated that the Grievances Register was maintained at all the regions with the record of complaints/grievances and that the Liaison Officer for SC/ST was the competent authority to redress the grievances of SCs/STs.

3.52 To a query about the periodic meetings of the Management with SC/ST employees to sort out their problems/grievances, the Committee were informed that

complaints were discussed with the SC/ST Association during the regional/inter-regional meeting on a mutually convenient date and resolved to the satisfaction of the complaints.

NACIL-I

3.53 Regarding the mechanisms for redressal of grievances of SCs/STs in NACIL-I, it was stated that all employees including those belonging to SCs/STs, could seek redressal of their grievances through the Grievance Procedure in operation for redressal of individual grievances. In addition, the Liaison Officer had been made responsible to deal with all matters pertaining to SCs/STs including individual grievances from those employees. Under each Liaison Officer, a Special Cell had been established and the officers in charge of these Cells were associated with implementation of the directives in recruitments/promotions as also to look into the representations/grievances received from SC/ST Associations and individual employees. The Cells also maintained a Grievance Register for the purpose. On receipt of any such representation or grievance, comments were sought from the concerned department or region as the case may be, and the matter was examined by the Liaison Officer and action taken thereon was reflected in the Grievance Register, besides being communicated to the aggrieved employees. A total of 15 complaints had been received during the years 2006-2009 (till date) and the same had been disposed off by the respective Liaison Officer of the Region.

3.54 When asked about the total number of complaints received during the year 2009 from SC/ST Employees Association, the Committee were informed that a total of six complaints had been received from SC/ST Employees/Association during the year 2009 out of which four have been disposed off and two were pending.

3.55 It had also been stated that the Ministry of Civil Aviation also received representations from SC/ST employees/Associations/Parliamentary Committee and the same were examined in consultation with NACIL.

3.56 During the evidence on the subject matter with the representatives of the Ministry of Civil Aviation and NACIL, the Committee also raised the point relating to redressal of complaints/grievances /complaints relating to SCs/STs. The representative of the Ministry inter-alia submitted that :-

"Sir, on behalf of the Ministry we would like to assure the Committee that we will do everything to ensure that the Grievance Redressal Machinery is tightened. One of the concerns that has been expressed rightly by Members is that the Grievance Redressal Machinery is not effective. So, the Deputy Secretary, who is handling this, we will see that he gets a very strong cell so that this aspect can be looked at. In the Ministry, we will work closely with all the SC/ST Associations. We will request Air India also to do the same so that these Associations get a proper hearing. One of the reasons mentioned is that we have not been effectively hearing them and try to redress their grievances. We will try to tighten up the mechanism, talk to them and see that some of the specific grievances which can be addressed are done. Apart from receiving the vacancy position and seeing that if there are any orders that have come from the Government to see that compassionate appointments are done as a time bound basis".

xxx

xxx

xxx

3.57 With regard to NACIL-I, the Committee are happy to note that all employees including those belonging to SCs/STs could seek redressal of their grievances through the Grievance Procedure in operation for redressal of individual grievances. In addition, the Liaison Officer has been made responsible to deal with all matters pertaining to SCs/STs including individual grievances from these employees. Under each Liaison Officer, a Special Cell had been established and the officers in charge of these Cells were associated with implementation of the directives in recruitment/promotions as also to look into the representations/grievances received from SC/ST Welfare Associations and individual employees. The Cells also maintain a Grievance Register for the purpose. On receipt of any representation or

grievance, comments are sought from the concerned department or region as the case may be and the matter is examined by the Liaison Officer and action taken thereon is reflected in the Grievance Register, besides being communicated to the aggrieved employees. A total of 15 complaints had been received during the years 2006-2009 and the same have been disposed off by the respective Liaison Officer of the Region. The Committee further note with satisfaction that the Liaison Officer-Corporate and Liaison Officers in the (h&i) Regions are the Competent Authorities to redress the grievances of SCs/STs in their administrative control. Periodical meetings are held by the Head of the Department and Liaison Officers with the representatives of the SC/ST Welfare Association of Air India and the minutes are prepared and circulated to the SC/ST Employees Association.

3.58 During the evidence when the Committee asked about the number of complaints received by the Company during the year 2009 from SC/ST candidates or SC/ST Employees Association disposed off, the representative of NACIL-A informed that:-

"The total number of complaints received from Mumbai from SCs was 25; from STs 10, From Delhi, we have got six complaints from SCs and one from ST; from Chennai had 4 complaints from SCs and 5 from STs; and Kolkata are got one."

3.59 In a glaring case of Dr (Mrs.) L.P. Nakhwa who was working as General Manager since 2005 was promoted as E.D. (Medical) on officiating basis w.e.f. 13.3.2009 and on regular basis w.e.f. 1.4.2010 and had been handling all responsibilities of the said post. However, the Ministry of Civil Aviation had directed Air India to revert Dr. (Mrs.) L.P. Nakhwa as Air India Administration failed to divert the post of E.D. (Headquarters) to E.D. (Medical) and accordingly Air India, vide their letter No. HPDO1/M-5001 dated 21.11.2011, conveyed to Dr (Mrs.) L.P. Nakhwa the

decision for not acceding to her request for upgradation of her post as E.D. (Medical).

The Ministry of Civil Aviation vide their O.M. dated 17 April, 2012 forwarding therewith comments of the Air India inter-alia stated that:-

"The post of E.D. (Medical Services) was created in erstwhile Air India Limited with the approval of the e/w Air India Board in September 1996. The post was, however, lying vacant since 2005. In the year 2006, Air India sought approval for filling up the vacancies in the grade of Executive Directors. The Ministry of Civil Aviation, however, granted approval for filling up of 08 vacancies of Executive Directors and 03 vacancies, namely, E.D. (Properties & Facilities), E.D. (Training) and E.D. (Medical Services) were not approved to be filled. The then CMD vide his letter dated 06.08.2008, informed the Ministry Civil Aviation that the Board Committee of NACIL, had decided to upgrade the post of GM (Medical Services) to that of E.D. (Medical Services) in the merged entity and requested for approval of the Ministry for upgradation of post GM (Medical Services) to E.D. (Medical Services) on a supernumerary basis, personal to the incumbent.

The above proposal was approved by the Ministry subject to the post of E.D. (Hqrs) getting diverted to Medical accordingly, vide office order dated 13.03.2009 the post was upgraded and Dr (Mrs.) L.P. Nakhwa was allowed to officiate as E.D. (Medical Services). She was subsequently appointed to the post on a regular basis w.e.f. 1st April, 2010.

However, the Ministry of Civil Aviation, vide their letter dated 27.08.2010, observing that the post of E.D. (Hqrs.) and had not been diverted to the Medical Services Department even after superannuation of the then incumbent to the post of E.D. (Hqrs), as advised by them, termed the appointment of E.D. (Hqrs) against the approval of the Ministry and advised for annulment of irregular appointment of E.D. (Medical Services) with immediate effect, and reversion of the incumbent to the substantive position. Dr. Nakhwa was accordingly re-designated as G.M.(Medical Services) vide office order dated 08.09.2010. Simultaneously, Ministry was once again requested to revalidate up-gradation of the post of G.M. (Medical Services). However, Ministry has yet to take a decision in her case."

3.60 The Committee note the reply of NACIL-A that the grievances/representations received from SC/ST employees are examined by the Special Cell and whenever required, it is discussed with the Liaison Officer and remedial action was taken. Also the Grievance Registers for SCs/STs were maintained at all the regions at Mumbai, Delhi, Kolkata and Chennai with the records of complaints/grievances.

3.61 The Committee also note that most of the complaints were disposed of during the year itself. The complaints were discussed with SC/ST Employees Association during the regional/inter regional meetings on a mutually convenient date and resolved to the satisfaction of the complaint. In view of the large number of Departments, the Special Cell for SC/ST is required to follow up with the concerned Department for redressal of grievances and efforts were made to resolve the same with a reasonable period.

3.62 The Committee observed that in the case of Dr. (Mrs.) L.P. Nakhwa, the Ministry of Civil Aviation had approved upgradation of the post of E.D. (Medical) against vacant post of E.D. (Hqrs) w.e.f. 01.09.2009. The Committee also note that the total vacant posts of E.D. in the Company are 22 out of sanctioned posts of 43. The Committee observe that Dr (Mrs.) L.P. Nakhwa, Executive Director (Medical) had been unceremoniously demoted to General Manager (Medical) for no fault of her's but due to Air India and the Ministry of Civil Aviation not taking any timely action. The Committee is of the view that the post of E.D. (Medical) should be adjusted against the 22 vacant posts of Executive Directors at the earliest so that Dr. (Mrs.) L.P. Nakhwa is restored to E.D. (Medical) at the earliest. Compliance report to this effect should be sent as early as possible for placing the same before the Parliamentary Committee.

3.63 The Committee is of the view that there is an ample scope of improvement in handling the complaints of SC/ST employees. Management needs to be sensitized towards the grievances of SC and ST employees. They should get speedy justice. The Committee would like to be apprised about the steps taken by the Ministry of Civil Aviation to tighten the grievances redressal machinery, as committed by the Secretary, Ministry of

Civil Aviation. The Committee would also like to know the status of the two pending cases from Chennai region relating to complaints/grievances in NACIL-A. The Committee should also be apprised about the total number of complaints relating to SCs/STs received by both the divisions of the Company during the year 2009 to 2011 (till date) together with action taken thereon.

CHAPTER IV

Miscellaneous

A. Cases of false caste certificates

4.1 The Committee were informed that there had been instances of 11 cases in NACIL-A and 07 cases in NACIL-I where persons obtained employment on production of false caste certificates.

4.2 When asked as to whether any criminal cases have been initiated against the guilty, it was informed that in NACIL-A no criminal cases have been registered as all 11 such cases were pending before various authorities including courts.

4.3 In case of NACIL-I a total of 5 criminal cases had been registered in respect of the employees who were found guilty of obtaining employment on production of false caste certificate as under:-

Sl. No.	Name (S/Shri), Designation & Employees No., Region, Category	Criminal Case No. & Police Station	Present Position
1	Bhagwati Prasad, Office Supdt. S/G, 269034, NR ST	FIR No. 467/2006 dated 01.06.2006, Kotwali City, Alwar, Rajasthan	Case pending with Rajasthan Police.
2.	Vinod Mehto, Helper (Engg.), NR ST	FIR No. 77/2007 dated 11.06.2007, Police Station, Palam, Delhi.	Case pending with Delhi Police.
3.	Phantom Biren Singh, Aircraft Engineer, 247464, NR ST	FIR No. 78/2007 dated 11.06.2007, Police Station, Palam, Delhi.	Case pending with Delhi Police.
4.	Arun Kumar, Helper (Commercial) 700118, NR ST	FIR No. 21/2006 dated 22.03.2006, Palam, Delhi	Case pending with Delhi Police.
5.	Swapan Kumar Saha, Master Technician, 428655, ER SC	Criminal case registered in Bahu Bazar Police Station, Kolkata.	Case pending with Kolkata Police.

4.4 During evidence when the Committee asked about the action taken against the fake SC/ST certificate holders, the representatives of the NACIL stated as under:-

"There are quite a number of cases of false certificate holders. A large amount of sensitivity was there on this issue. This matter comes up before the National Commission on Scheduled Tribes also. After that we have given this entire investigation to the Vigilance Department. They should be able to give me a report in one or two months time. Once that report come to me then I will be taking action on that".

4.5 When Committee asked about lodging criminal case against false caste certificate officials, the representative of NACIL during the evidence had further informed that:-

"This is what the Vigilance Department of mine has started asking from every body and all that. Based on this report we will be taking action."

4.6 The Committee note that 11 cases of false caste certificates in NACIL-A are pending for verification with various agencies. The Committee recommend that the State Governments concerned should be pursued to complete the verification of caste certificates referred to them by the Company in a time bound manner. However, the Committee are happy to note that NACIL-I has registered criminal cases against five persons who obtained employment in the company on production of false caste certificates. The Committee recommend that extra care should be taken while examining the caste certificates at the time of offering appointment letter itself by resorting to compulsory verification of all caste certificates at entry level. The Committee would also like to be apprised about the present status of pending cases in both the divisions of the Company.

B. Housing facilities

NACIL-A

4.7 The Committee have been informed that employees were provided accommodation in AI Housing Colonies at Kalina, Mumbai. Employees who apply for accommodation in response to Staff Notices are put on the waitlist as per laid

down criteria. Reserved quota accommodation is also being provided at Company quarters to executives, at JVPD, Vile Parle (West), Shanti-Kunj CHS, Khar, Acquarius Taurus CHS, Malad (West) Satyam CHS, Malad (East). These facilities are provided at Delhi and Kolkata also.

4.8 To a query as to whether the Company provided reservation for SCs/STs in allotment of residential quarters to the employees, it was stated that the policy adopted for allotment of Company accommodation did not provide for any reservation for SC/ST employees.

4.9 The Committee have further been informed that at present there was no housing loan facility in the Company.

4.10 When asked whether any concession in terms and conditions or in the rate of interest was allowed to SC/ST employees, the Company replied in the negative.

NACIL-I

4.11 NACIL-I informed that Air India provided housing facilities to its employees on the basis of their length of service in the Company and availability of accommodation in the cities where Housing Colonies were available. Reservation in the allotment of quarters for SC/ST employees in Air India is based on BPE guidelines, which as under:-

Type of Quarters	Percentage	
A-1	10%)	In respect of Eastern, Northern and Southern Regions.
A&B	5%)	
A	10%)	In respect of Western Region since no A-I type of quarters available.
B	5%)	

4.12 The details of quarters (type-wise) allotted vis-à-vis the number of allotment to SC/ST employees as on 30.09.2004 is given below:-

Type Allotted	Percentage Reserved for SC/ST	Total Allotted	Allotted to SCs	Percentage	Allotted to STs	Percentage
A 1	10%	622	151	24.27	37	9.94
A+B	5%	986	191	19.37	94	9.53

4.13 When asked about the housing loan given to the employees, it has been stated that there was a facility of providing housing loan to the employees. However, due to economy measures, there was a complete ban on granting of all loans, including housing loan, w.e.f. 19.09.1998.

4.14 Regarding any concession in terms and conditions or rate of interest on loan to SC/ST employees, it has been stated that unfortunately terms and conditions or rate of interest on loans is same for all employees including those belonging to SC/STs.

4.15 The Committee regret to note that NACIL-A does not provide any reservation in Company's accommodation for SC/ST employees. Further, no housing loan facilities are provided to SCs/STs by both the divisions of the Company. The Committee strongly recommend that the Company should reserve quota in accommodation for its SC/ST employees in consonance with the orders of the Government of India and also provide housing loan to SC/ST employees on priority basis.

C. Socio Economic Development of SCs/STs

NACIL-A

4.16 The Committee were informed by NACIL that no Special Scheme for socio economic development of SCs/STs had been undertaken by NACIL-A. However, Medical Officers and Nurses were deputed to provide medical aid to the large masses who visit Chaitya Bhoomi on 6th December, the Death Anniversary of late Dr. Babasaheb Ambedkar. Also, every year, NACIL and SC/ST Association have

been jointly celebrating the Birth Anniversary of late Dr. Babasaheb Ambedkar at Mumbai, for which financial assistance is given.

NACIL-I

4.17 NACIL-I in this regard has submitted that Air India extends a number of welfare scheme to its employees such as housing loan, vehicle loan, canteen facilities, subsidized transport, holiday homes, medical facilities, educational scholarships for wards of employees, financial assistance for pursuing higher studies, staff housing colonies, etc. For certain welfare amenities, employees belonging to SC/ST categories were given reservation/relaxation in eligibility in comparison to General Category employees. However, a few welfare schemes had been temporarily withdrawn for the time being in view of present financial crunch in the Company.

4.18 It was also submitted by both the divisions of the NACIL that no projects initiated by the Air India resulted in displacement of SC/ST people at any period of time.

4.19 When asked about providing funds for allocation under Annual Component Plan for upliftment of SCs/STs communities both the divisions of the Company replied in the negative.

4.20 The Committee are concerned to note that no specific projects have been initiated by the Company for the upliftment of SC/ST people at any point of time. The Committee further note with concern that under the Annual Component Plan for upliftment of SC/ST communities, no funds have been provided by the Company. The Committee feel that the company is avoiding its social responsibility for upliftment of the down trodden sections of the society. The Committee therefore, recommend that the Company must

provide sufficient funds under the Annual Component Plan for upliftment of SCs/STs on priority basis.

D. Casual/Part time Labourers

4.21 It was stated by NACIL-A that out of 487 casual labourers, 105 are compassionate cases of which 55 were SCs and STs who were relatives of the deceased employees. Regarding future of these labourers including SCs/STs, it was submitted that as and when it was decided to make fresh recruitment in non operational areas, the recruitment would be made as per service regulations of the Company and the reservation rules would also be followed.

4.22 In NACIL-I out of 1492 casual labourers, 407 belonged to SC/ST community. It was also informed that SC/ST reservation policy was not applicable in case of casual employment.

4.23 The Committee are not satisfied with the casual reply of the NACIL-I. The Committee also note with concern that in NACIL-A out of 487 casual labourers only three belonged to ST category. The Committee are of the view that like NACIL-A, NACIL-I should provide separate data of SC and ST casual labourers engaged by them during the last three years. The Committee, however, feel that even if the SC/ST reservation policy is not applicable in the case of casual employment, the Company should have explored possibility of giving employment to SC/ST persons. The Committee, therefore, strongly recommend that the Company should take affirmative action to give employment to as many SC/ST as possible as casual labourers and also regularize their services within a stipulated period. The Committee should be apprised about the action taken in this regard.

**NEW DELHI;
NASKAR)**

August, 2012

Shravana, 1934 (Saka)

(GOBINDA CHANDRA

CHAIRMAN

**COMMITTEE ON THE WELFARE
OF SCHEDULED CASTES AND
SCHEDULED TRIBES**

APPENDIX

(Vide para 4 of Introduction)

SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS CONTAINED IN THE REPORT

Sl. No.	Para No.	Conclusions/Recommendations
1	2	3
1.	1.12	<p>The Committee note that appointment of Directors on the Board of National Aviation Company of India Limited is done in accordance with the procedure laid down by the Public Enterprises Selection Board and guidelines issued by the Department of Public Enterprises from time to time. The Committee also note that presently no Director on the Board of the Company belonged to SC/ST category. The Committee further note that at present there are seven functional directors and four independent directors in the Company and none of them belonged to SC/ST category. The Committee feel that the Company does not promote SC/ST officers in higher scales even though Article 16(4) of the Constitution of India states that “Nothing in this article shall prevent the State from making any provision for the reservation for the appointments or posts in favour of any backward class of citizens which, in the opinion of the State, is not adequately represented</p>

in the services under the State” and Article 16(4A) which states that “Nothing in this article shall prevent the State from making any

1	2	3
		<p>provision for reservation in matter of promotion, with consequential seniority to any class or classes of posts in the services under the State in favour of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes which, in the opinion of the State are not adequately represented in the Services of the State”. The Committee are of the view that having atleast one member on the Board of Directors from SC/ST category was essential to represent these communities. The Committee, therefore, recommend that in view of the constitutional mandate, the Government should provide reservation on appointment and promotion of officers in higher scales so that SC/ST officers could also get an opportunity to become Functional Directors of the National Aviation Company of India Limited. Further, Government should ensure that atleast one SC/ST member is nominated as Independent Director of the Board.</p>
2.	1.13	<p>The Committee note that the Company has two divisions i.e. NACIL (A) and NACIL (I). In NACIL (A), the Board of Directors make a periodical</p>

review of the implementation of reservation orders in favour of SCs/STs. However, on the other hand in NACIL (I) no such periodical review is made by the Board of the Directors. Only the Liaison officer – Corporate and Liaison Officers in the regions

1	2	3
		<p>ensure due compliance of reservation orders in favour of SCs/STs. The Committee are unable to understand the reasons for adopting two different criteria by the Company in this regard, although the Board of Directors of both the Divisions of the Company is the same. The Committee are of the view that the Board of Directors of the Company should also make periodical review of the implementation of reservation orders in favour of SCs/STs in NACIL (I) so that SC/ST employees are not deprived of their genuine claim .</p>
3.	2.5	<p>The Committee note that reservation is applicable to all posts in Air India Ltd. filled by direct recruitment and promotion. In respect of posts filled by selection, however, reservation was applicable upto the lowest rung of Group 'A' posts only. Consequently reservation was not applicable to some categories of posts filled by selection. However, if any direct recruitment was effected for</p>

these posts, the reservation orders were applicable. The Committee feel that there is an urgent need to lay down policy guidelines for providing reservation for all categories of posts including all rungs of Group 'A' posts both in selection and promotion.

1	2	3
---	---	---

4. 2.17 The Committee note that Air India was not utilizing the medium of All India Radio to advertise vacancies in view of the fact that no recruitment was being made in Group 'A' and 'D' posts. However, all vacancies were posted on the websites of Air India and its subsidiary companies. In some of the categories, the Company also encouraged online applications. The Committee also note that it was not the practice of the appointing authorities to indicate the reasons for rejection of SCs/STs candidates who are sponsored by the employment exchanges to these employment exchanges and the reasons for rejection of any candidate were normally recorded in assessment sheets of the panel members. The Committee are of the view that since many SC/ST candidates do not have access to Internet and other IT facilities, especially those residing in remote areas, the Committee feel that apart from using the facility of Internet and other technologies, the conventional system of advertising through National/Local Dailies newspapers, Employment News and

correspondence through letters should be continued. The Committee also desire that copies of the advertisement issued should be provided to the Secretariat of the Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare

1	2	3
		of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes and recognized SC/ST Employees Welfare Association of the Company. The Committee desire that the Company should intimate the precise reasons for rejection of SC/ST candidates sponsored by the employment exchanges to enable them to sponsor other suitable SC/ST candidates. The Committee also desire to know the procedure for recruitment of Group 'A' and 'D' posts in NACIL-A&I.
5.	2.21	The Committee note that reservation was made in case of direct recruitment for various posts in Groups 'A', 'B', 'C' and 'D' in Air India Limited. Normally, the vacancies for the posts under Groups 'C' and 'D' were notified to the Employment Exchange(s) and a copy of the notification was also sent to various SC/ST Associations/Agencies. Posts under Group 'A' and 'B' vacancies were notified in the Press and a copy of the advertisement was also sent to SC/ST Associations/Agencies, Lok Sabha and Rajya

Sabha Secretariats. It is, however, observed that copies of the advertisements are not received in the Secretariat of the Parliamentary Committee on the Welfare of

1	2	3
		<p>Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. The Committee desire that copies of the advertisements should be invariably endorsed to the Secretariat of the Committee for information. Advertisements were also released in Employment News and local newspapers to attract SC/ST candidates. Eligible candidates are subjected to written/trade test, group discussion and personal interview as applicable from time to time and candidates found suitable in the interview were empanelled in the order of merit. Separate panels were formed for SC and ST candidates qualifying on relaxed standards. SC/ST candidates qualifying on merit were, however, placed on the general panel. Reservation for SCs/STs is applicable to all posts filled by Direct Recruitment.</p>
6.	2.22	<p>The Committee desire that in case local Employment Exchanges fail to sponsor adequate number of candidates, efforts should be made to search for the candidates from adjoining States through specific advertisement.</p>
7.	2.34	<p>It has been reported that due to ban on fresh recruitment and freeze on some of the vacancies,</p>

there has been no recruitment in non-operational areas and the backlog has not been filled up.

1	2	3
		<p>However, NACIL-A has filled backlog SC/ST vacancies. The Committee note that recruitment process in NACIL has been kept on hold in view of the present financial crunch in the Company and till a reassessment of manpower and the reserved vacancies was carried out in the merged company (NACIL) which was formed by amalgamating erstwhile Air India and Indian Airlines in August, 2007. The Committee recommend that NACIL-A and NACIL-I should make all out efforts to fill all the posts reserved for SCs and STs in all the categories within a reasonable time frame. The Committee also recommend that NACIL-A and NACIL-I should provide the details of recruitment carried out in the year 2009, 2010 and 2011 and details of the backlog vacancies of SCs/STs in all categories of posts as on 1st April, 2012, to the Committee.</p>
8.	2.52	<p>The Committee note that in NACIL-I, the backlog exists in some technical categories due to non-availability of suitable SCs/STs candidates. In certain other categories, it was created due to reserved posts carried forward on account of</p>

compassionate appointments or single appointments, etc. In view of the present financial condition being faced by the Company, all recruitments/promotions have been put on hold. As and when it is decided to make recruitment from open market

1	2	3
		and promotions from within, priority will be given to clear all the backlog vacancies. The Committee also note that there is no de-reservation in Direct Recruitment. However, in promotion the procedure for de-reservation as per the Presidential Directives was followed. For Group A&B posts, approval of the Board of Directors and for Group C&D posts approval of Managing Director was obtained in the prescribed proforma. Such de-reservation arose only when suitable candidates belonging to reserved categories were not available even with relaxed standards and in the extended zone of consideration. One post of SC and ten posts of ST in the year 2008 were de-reserved after following the due process during the last years.

9. 2.53 It is difficult to believe that NACIL is not able to recruit SC/ST candidates for technical posts due to non-availability of suitable candidates. They

should make efforts to recruit SC/ST candidates in all categories of posts by advertising in National Dailies, TV Channels, writing to Universities/Technical Collages, etc. The Committee are of the view that the Company should

1	2	3
		<p>have considered giving further relaxation/training to SC/ST candidates before de-reserving the one post of SC and two posts of STs in the year 2008. Further after taking the approval of Managing Director, the Ministry of Civil Aviation should also be consulted in this regard to avoid such de-reservation of SCs/STs posts. The Committee would like to be apprised of the details of posts de-reserved by both the divisions of the Company during the year 2009-2012 as also the steps taken by the Company to avoid de-reservation of SC/ST vacancies in promotion.</p>
10.	3.3	<p>The Committee note that NACIL-A had taken eight officials on deputation from other Government Department(s) during the year 2006-2009, but none of them belonged to SC/ST category. NACIL-I had also sent one of their employees on deputation and taken one employee on deputation from other Department. However, neither of them belonged to SC/ST category. The Committee feel that for career progression of SC/ST employees, they should be given opportunities in the matter of deputation as it opens an avenue for them to get exposed to new work environment, improve their</p>

working skill and aptitude which eventually will benefit the employee and the

1	2	3
		organisation. The Committee, therefore, desire that it should be apprised of details deputation in both the divisions of NACIL during last three years.
11.	3.13	<p>The Committee are surprised to note that no appointments on compassionate grounds have been made by NACIL-A during the year 2006 to 2009 even though they had 201 applications from SC/ST candidates pending for consideration as on 30.03.2010. Similarly in NACIL-I, applications from 28 SC and 12 ST candidates were pending for appointment on compassionate grounds. The Committee feel that it is a matter of great concern that such a large number of SC/ST applications for appointment on compassionate grounds are pending in both the divisions of the Company. The Committee desire that the process of appointments on compassionate grounds should be expedited and accorded utmost priority as many of these SC/ST families belong to lower income groups with no other means of livelihood.</p>

The Committee, therefore, recommend that both the divisions of NACIL should initiate immediate action for filling up posts for SCs/STs from eligible SC/ST candidates whose

1	2	3
		applications are pending for appointment on compassionate grounds. The Committee should apprised of the outcome of the above at the earliest.
12.	3.17	The Committee note that NACIL-A has furnished the details of postings abroad of Group 'A' posts only despite the fact the Committee had asked for category-wise details. The Committee have been informed that there was no reservation in the matters of posting abroad in both the divisions of the Company and reservation orders were not applied in the matter of postings abroad. However, the Committee feel that the management should give priority to SC/ST employees who are qualified and eligible for posting abroad. The Committee, therefore, urge the management to give due consideration to their suggestion and nominate as many as possible eligible SC/ST candidates for postings abroad.

13. 3.20 The Committee note that NACIL-I has furnished consolidated information with regard to in-service training given to SC/ST employees. Also both the divisions of the Company gave details without mentioning the category of posts for which such training was imparted. The Committee recommend that NACIL should conduct regular in-service training programmes for SC/ST employees in all categories of

1	2	3
		posts so as to bring up them at par with other employees and have better prospects for promotion to next higher grade. The Committee should also be provided with break up of posts in which SCs/STs were given in-service training by NACIL-I. The Committee are also of the view that the Company should explore the feasibility of imparting pre-recruitment training to SC/ST candidates.

14. 3.42 The Committee note that in both the divisions of the Company, the Special Cell for SC/ST reports to the Liaison Officer for SC/ST. At present, the Executive Director-HQ has been designated as the Liaison Officer for SC/ST and entrusted with the responsibility of implementing the President's Directive, orders/instructions issued by the

Ministry in the matter of reservation for SCs/STs. In order to implement reservation for SCs/STs in appointments filled by direct recruitment/promotion, the Company are following the Post Based Roster in compliance with the O.M.No.36012/2/96-Estt.(Res.) dated 2nd July, 1997. These rosters are examined and scrutinized by the Liaison Officer for SCs/STs of the Company. Any shortcomings observed are corrected at the time of inspection of rosters. In addition, annual statistics as required by the Ministry, are submitted from time to time by the Company.

1	2	3
15.	3.43	<p>The Committee also note that Executive Director-HQ has been appointed as the Liaison Officer Corporate to ensure due compliance of the reservation orders. In addition, General Managers (Personnel) in each of four regions have been designated as Liaison Officer for their respective region. The Committee further note that there is no laid down procedure for selecting/appointing the Liaison Officers and also that the Executive Director-HQ has been entrusted with additional charge as Liaison Officer for SCs/STs.</p>

16. 3.44 The Committee stress that the nomination of Liaison Officers should not be considered as mere fulfillment of a formality. The Committee, therefore, recommend that only such officers should be appointed as Liaison Officers who are not only fully acquainted with reservation orders but are also committed to justify their appointment to safeguard the welfare of SC/ST employees. The Committee also desire that the Liaison Officers for SCs/STs should exclusively look after the matters relating to SCs/STs and should not be burdened with other matters. The Committee also feel that Chief Liaison Officers posted at Headquarters as well as the Liaison Officers at regional offices should preferably be appointed from people belonging to SCs/STs category.

1	2	3
17.	3.45	The Committee note that during the years 2007 and 2008, a number of lacuna were noticed while inspecting of the rosters of Air India (H.O. at Mumbai) by the representative of the Ministry and reported to Air India for corrective action and compliance. The Committee desire to know the details of the remedial action taken by NACIL on the lacunae noticed during the inspection and

recommend that requisite steps should be taken to prevent recurrence of such lacunae in future. The Committee also recommend that the officials responsible for maintenance of rosters should be imparted proper training so that the chances of any lacunae are obviated.

18. 3.46 The Committee also note that during the years 2006 to 2008 the Liaison Officer of NACIL-A held meeting with SC/ST Welfare Association at Chennai, Kolkata, Amritsar and Mumbai. However, NACIL-I has submitted details of meetings held in 2009 only. The Committee desire that NACIL-I should furnish the details of meetings held by the Liaison Officer with SC/ST Welfare Association during 2006 to 2008. The Committee further, recommend that the both the divisions of NACIL should furnish the details in this regard for the years 2010 and 2011 also.

1	2	3
---	---	---

19. 3.60 The Committee note the reply of NACIL-A that the grievances/representations received from SC/ST employees are examined by the Special Cell and

whenever required, it is discussed with the Liaison Officer and remedial action was taken. Also the Grievance Registers for SCs/STs were maintained at all the regions at Mumbai, Delhi, Kolkata and Chennai with the records of complaints/grievances.

20. 3.61 The Committee also note that most of the complaints were disposed of during the year itself. The complaints were discussed with SC/ST Employees Association during the regional/inter regional meetings on a mutually convenient date and resolved to the satisfaction of the complaint. In view of the large number of Departments, the Special Cell for SC/ST is required to follow up with the concerned Department for redressal of grievances and efforts were made to resolve the same with a reasonable period.

1	2	3
21.	3.62	The Committee observed that in the case of Dr. (Mrs.) L.P. Nakhwa, the Ministry of Civil Aviation had approved upgradation of the post of

E.D. (Medical) against vacant post of E.D. (Hqrs) w.e.f. 01.09.2009. The Committee also note that the total vacant posts of E.D. in the Company are 22 out of sanctioned posts of 43. The Committee observe that Dr (Mrs.) L.P. Nakhwa, Executive Director (Medical) had been unceremoniously demoted to General Manager (Medical) for no fault of her's but due to Air India and the Ministry of Civil Aviation not taking any timely action. The Committee is of the view that the post of E.D. (Medical) should be adjusted against the 22 vacant posts of Executive Directors at the earliest so that Dr. (Mrs.) L.P. Nakhwa is restored to E.D. (Medical) at the earliest. Compliance report to this effect should be sent as early as possible for placing the same before the Parliamentary Committee.

22. 3.63

The Committee is of the view that there is an ample scope of improvement in handling the complaints of SC/ST employees. Management needs to be sensitized towards the grievances of SC and ST employees. They should get speedy justice. The Committee would like to be apprised about the steps taken by the Ministry of Civil Aviation to tighten the grievances redressal machinery, as committed

by the Secretary, Ministry of Civil Aviation. The Committee would also like to know the status of the two pending cases from Chennai region relating to complaints/grievances in NACIL-A. The Committee should also be apprised about the total number of complaints relating to SCs/STs received by both the divisions of the Company during the year 2009 to 2011 (till date) together with action taken thereon.

23.

4.6

The Committee note that 11 cases of false caste certificates in NACIL-A are pending for verification with various agencies. The Committee recommend that the State Governments concerned should be pursued to complete the verification of caste certificates referred to them by the Company in a time bound manner. However, the Committee are happy to note that NACIL-I has registered criminal cases against five persons who obtained employment in the company on production of false caste certificates. The Committee recommend that extra care should be taken while examining the caste certificates at the time of offering appointment letter itself by resorting to compulsory verification of all caste certificates at entry level. The Committee would also like to be

apprised about the present status of pending cases in both the divisions of the Company.

1	2	3
24.	4.15	<p>The Committee regret to note that NACIL-A does not provide any reservation in Company's accommodation for SC/ST employees. Further, no housing loan facilities are provided to SCs/STs by both the divisions of the Company. The Committee strongly recommend that the Company should reserve quota in accommodation for its SC/ST employees in consonance with the orders of the Government of India and also provide housing loan to SC/ST employees on priority basis.</p>
25.	4.20	<p>The Committee are concerned to note that no specific projects have been initiated by the Company for the upliftment of SC/ST people at any point of time. The Committee further note with concern that under the Annual Component Plan for upliftment of SC/ST communities, no funds have been provided by the Company. The Committee feel that the company is avoiding its social responsibility for upliftment of the down trodden sections of the society. The Committee therefore, recommend that the Company must provide</p>

**sufficient funds under the Annual Component Plan
for upliftment of SCs/STs on priority basis.**

1	2	3
---	---	---

26. 4.23 The Committee are not satisfied with the casual reply of the NACIL-I. The Committee also note with concern that in NACIL-A out of 487 casual labourers only three belonged to ST category. The Committee are of the view that like NACIL-A, NACIL-I should provide separate data of SC and ST casual labourers engaged by them during the last three years. The Committee, however, feel that even if the SC/ST reservation policy is not applicable in the case of casual employment, the Company should have explored possibility of giving employment to SC/ST persons. The Committee, therefore, strongly recommend that the Company should take affirmative action to give employment to as many SC/ST as possible as casual labourers and also regularise their services within a stipulated period. The Committee should be apprised about the action taken in this regard.