

**GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
HOME AFFAIRS
LOK SABHA**

UNSTARRED QUESTION NO:3952

ANSWERED ON:15.12.2009

MADHAVA MENON COMMITTEE REPORT

Hamsrajbhai Shri Radadiya Vitthalbhai ;Yadav Shri M. Anjan Kumar

Will the Minister of HOME AFFAIRS be pleased to state:

- (a) whether all the States have furnished their comments/suggestions on the Madhava Menon Committee Report on the Criminal Justice System;
- (b) if so, the details thereof;
- (c) whether some States have expressed their dissent;
- (d) if so, the reasons therefor, Statewise; and
- (e) the reaction of the Government thereto?

Answer

MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS(SHRI MULLAPPALLY RAMACHANDRAN)

(a) to (e): The States of Haryana, Sikkim, Orissa, Mizoram, Madhya Pradesh, Assam, Gujarat, Meghalaya, Punjab, West Bengal, Karnataka, Delhi, Chhattisgarh, Tripura and Union Territories of Pondicherry, Andaman & Nicobar, Lakshadweep, Daman & Diu, Chandigarh, Dadra & Nagar Haveli have forwarded their comments/views on the Report. Rest of the State Governments/Union Territories have not furnished their replies despite reminders. Some of the State Governments have expressed their dissent (Tripura relating to marginal offences and multiple criminal codes, Orissa, Gujarat, Meghalaya, Punjab, Tripura relating to creating a national united agency, Meghalaya relating to award of punishment and sentencing, Gujarat relating to formation of Board of Criminal Justice, NCT of Delhi relating to modern court complex, Gujarat relating to involvement of NGO's in criminal investigation & trial). As the Criminal Law and Criminal Procedure falls in the Concurrent List of the Seventh Schedule to the Constitution of India, and as the recommendations of the Committee have wide ranging implications and would entail large scale amendment in criminal and social laws, taking a view on the report is subject to receipt of comments from all the State Governments and Central Government, further taking a holistic view on the recommendations, for which no time frame can be fixed.