

TWENTY THIRD REPORT
COMMITTEE ON PETITIONS

(SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA)

MINISTRY OF HEALTH & FAMILY WELFARE

(Presented to Lok Sabha on 9 December, 2016)



LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI

December, 2016/Agrahayana, 1938 (*Saka*)

CPB. NO. 1 Vol. XXIII

Price: Rs.....

(c) 2016 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

Published under Rule 382 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha (Sixteenth Edition) and printed by the Manager, Government of India Press, Minto Road, New Delhi- 110002

CONTENTS

COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON PETITIONS:	Pages (iii)
INTRODUCTION.....	(v)

REPORT

Petition received from S/Shri Lakhan Turi and Mahendra Prasad Kushwaha, presented by Shri Nishikant Dubey, M.P., Lok Sabha regarding opening up of a new All India Institute of Medical Sciences (AIIMS) at Deoghar, Jharkhand.

ANNEXURES

i) Petition presented by Shri Nishikant Dubey, M.P., Lok Sabha on 10.5.2016.	25
ii) Minutes of the 27th sitting of the Committee held on 19.09.2016.	26
iii) Minutes of the 30th sitting of the Committee held on 29.11.2016.	30

(i)

**COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON PETITIONS
(2016-2017)**

Shri Bhagat Singh Koshyari - *Chairperson*

MEMBERS

2. Shri Suresh C. Angadi
3. Shri Om Birla
4. Shri Jitendra Chaudhury
5. Shri Ram Tahal Choudhary
6. Dr. K. Gopal
7. Shri Chhedi Paswan
8. Shri Kamlesh Paswan
9. Shri Arjun Charan Sethi
10. Shri Kodikunnil Suresh
11. Shri Dinesh Trivedi
12. Shri Rajan Vichare
13. Shri Dharmendra Yadav
14. Vacant
15. Vacant

SECRETARIAT

- | | | |
|-------------------------------|---|----------------------------|
| 1. Shri Shiv Kumar | - | Joint Secretary |
| 2. Shri Raju Srivastava | - | Additional Director |
| 3. Shri Jyoti Prakash Krishna | - | Senior Executive Assistant |

(iii)

TWENTY THIRD REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON PETITIONS

(SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA)

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairperson, Committee on Petitions, having been authorised by the Committee to present the Report on their behalf, present this Twenty Third Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) of the Committee to the House on the Petition received from S/Shri Lakhan Turi and Mahendra Prasad Kushwaha, presented by Shri Nishikant Dubey, M.P., Lok Sabha regarding opening up of a new All India Institute of Medical Sciences (AIIMS) at Deoghar, Jharkhand.

2. The Committee considered and adopted the draft Twenty Third Report at their sitting held on 29 November, 2016.
3. The observations/recommendations of the Committee on the above matters have been included in the Report.

NEW DELHI;

29 November, 2016

08 Agrahayana, 1938 (Saka)

BHAGAT SINGH KOSHYARI
Chairperson,
Committee on Petitions

(v)

REPORT

PETITION RECEIVED FROM S/SHRI LAKHAN TURI AND MAHENDRA PRASAD KUSHWAHA, FORWARDED BY SHRI NISHIKANT DUBEY, M.P., LOK SABHA REGARDING OPENING UP OF A NEW ALL INDIA INSTITUTE OF MEDICAL SCIENCES (AIIMS) AT DEOGHAR, JHARKHAND.

Shri Nishikant Dubey, M.P., Lok Sabha, had forwarded a Petition of S/Shri Lakhan Turi and Mahendra Prasad Kushwaha regarding opening up of a new All India Institute of Medical Sciences (AIIMS) at Deoghar, Jharkhand.

2 The Petitioners, in their Petition, *inter-alia*, stated that the Hon'ble Prime Minister has taken the initiative for providing modern health care to every individual in the country at an affordable cost. In pursuance thereof, in the year 2002, AIIMS was established in Bihar. However, when Jharkhand was carved out of the State of Bihar in November, 2000, a demand was made to establish a new AIIMS in the State of Jharkhand also. The issue gained momentum by way of intensive administrative and logistic ground work, the Government of Jharkhand also identified land for the said purpose and the same was also given at Deogarh to the Authorities concerned. In the meantime, the proposal for the setting up of another AIIMS in Bihar was considered by the Union Government inspite of the fact that no progress had been made to establish a new AIIMS at Jharkhand. The Petitioners have further stated that it is a travesty of justice that while the Government of Bihar has still to allot appropriate land for opening up of another AIIMS, whereas, the Government of Jharkhand had already identified and allotted land for the same. It is also relevant that Deogarh in Jharkhand is a centrally located District and connected with the main railway route along with three National Highways. Needless to say that Deogarh is also world famous for Dwadesh Jyotirling and Shaktipeeth and also happens to be a site selected by the Central Government for the upcoming International Airport. The Petitioners have, therefore, prayed before the Committee that a new AIIMS be established at Deogarh, Jharkhand without further loss of time.

3. The aforesaid Petition was referred to the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare and the Ministry of Finance (Department of Expenditure) for giving their preliminary comments before determining its admissibility under Direction 40(2) of the Directions by the Speaker, Lok Sabha.

4. The Ministry of Health & Family Welfare vide their O.M No. Z-28016/02/2015-SSH (Ph.IV) dated 3.5.2016 furnished the following reply:-

"Central Government has plans to set up AIIMS in each State in a phased manner under the Pradhan Mantri Swasthya Suraksha Yojana. Hon'ble Finance Minister, in his Budget Speech for the year 2014-15, had announced to set up four AIIMS, one each in Andhra Pradesh, Vidarbha Region (Maharashtra), West Bengal and Purvanchal in Uttar Pradesh. Further, in the Budget Speech for the year 2015-16, the Hon'ble Finance Minister had proposed to set up AIIMS in J&K, Punjab, Tamil Nadu, Himachal Pradesh, Bihar and Assam. Establishment of a new AIIMS in Jharkhand is not covered in any of the Budget announcements as yet.

The Ministry has further stated that the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare supports setting up of AIIMS in the State of Jharkhand. A communication to this effect has already been made to the Ministry of Finance."

5. After the receipt of comments from the Ministry Health & Family Welfare, the above Petition was admitted under Rule 160 (iii) of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha. Shri Nishikant Dubey, M.P., presented the Petition to Lok Sabha on 10.5.2016 (Annexure I). In accordance with Rule 169 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, the Committee took up for examination the said Petition.

6. The Pradhan Mantri Swasthya Suraksha Yojana (PMSSY) was announced in 2003 with the objective of correcting regional imbalances in the availability of affordable/reliable tertiary healthcare services and also to augment facilities for quality medical education in the country. PMSSY has two components:-

(i) Setting up of AIIMS like Institutions.

(ii) Upgradation of Government Medical College Institutions.

7. As regards the setting up of new AIIMS under the Pradhan Mantri Swasthya Suraksha Yojana (PMSSY), in the first phase, six AIIMS are being set up in Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna, Raipur and Rishikesh. Two more AIIMS, one at Rae Bareilly, Uttar Pradesh and the other at Raiganj, West Bengal has been approved in the second phase of PMSSY. Nineteen existing Government Medical College Institutions have been

taken up for up-gradation for creation of super-specialty facilities in the first and second phases of PMSSY.

Phase I:

S. No.	New AIIMS	Name of State	Location
1.	All India Institute of Medical Sciences Bhopal	Madhya Pradesh	Bhopal
2.	All India Institute of Medical Sciences Bhubaneswar	Orissa	Bhubaneswar
3.	All India Institute of Medical Sciences Jodhpur	Rajasthan	Jodhpur
4.	All India Institute of Medical Sciences Patna	Bihar	Patna
5.	All India Institute of Medical Sciences Raipur	Chattisgarh	Raipur
6.	All India Institute of Medical Sciences Rishikesh	Uttarakhand	Rishikesh

Legislation:

AIIMS Act, 1956 has been amended by the enactment of AIIMS (Amendment) Act, 2012 - which has come into force with effect from 16th July, 2012. The amendment has brought new AIIMS under the ambit of AIIMS Act, 1956 and also provides for the establishment of more than one AIIMS at various locations. Each of the new AIIMS is an Institution of National Importance under the Act.

Selection Committee & Finance Committee:

Under the provisions of the AIIMS Act, 1956 and AIIMS (Amendment) Act, 2013, Institute Bodies for each of the six new AIIMS have been constituted *vide* Gazette Notification dated, 2.7.2013.

Progress of work at six new AIIMS:

Site	Medical College (%)	Hospital Complex (%)	Residential Complex (%)	Electrical Services (Package-III) (%)	Estate Services (Package-IV) (%)
Bhopal	90.59	75.51	Completed	69.05	22.39
Bhubaneswar	90.43	90.80	24% (Ph.1), 21% (Ph.2)	79.21	34.93
Jodhpur	82	86.74	Completed	85	69
Patna	95.25	56.50	Completed	87.50	23.50
Raipur	78.55	67.52	Completed	87.50	35.61
Rishikesh	80	87.06	99	97	53

Phase II:

S. No.	Name of State	Location	Status
1.	Uttar Pradesh	Rae Bareli	Work for residential complex under progress. Start-up OPD construction completed.
2.	West Bengal	Raiganj, Uttar Dinajpur	Land yet to be allotted by State Government of West Bengal

In respect of AIIMS Rae Bareli Project, the Government of Uttar Pradesh has agreed to provide about 148 acres of land for the setting up the Institute. Out of this, the State Government of Uttar Pradesh has transferred 97 acres of land in Rae Bareli to Ministry of Health and Family Welfare. The Ministry has appointed M/s. HSCC (I) Ltd. as Project Management Consultant for setting up of the Institute. The Project Management Consultant has initiated action for inviting tender for construction of housing complex, preparation of detailed Project Report for medical college and hospital.

The Government of West Bengal is, however, yet to hand over the required land for setting up of AIIMS under the PMSSY.

8. On being enquired by the Committee about the role of the Ministry of Finance and the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare in regard to the setting up of new AIIMS in various States/UTs in the country, the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, in its written reply, submitted:-

"The Ministry of Finance announces setting up of a new AIIMS through budget speeches. Hon'ble Finance Minister while presenting the Budget for the year 2014-15 had announced setting up of four new AIIMS in Andhra Pradesh, West Bengal, Maharashtra and Purvanchal in Uttar Pradesh, and in the Budget 2015-16 has proposed to set up five new AIIMS in Jammu & Kashmir, Punjab, Tamil Nadu, Himachal Pradesh, Assam and one AIIMS-like institute in Bihar.

Ministry of Health & Family Welfare undertakes the work for setting up of new AIIMS directly through executing agencies. Location is finalized by MoHFW based on its team report for the site offered by State Government."

9. On a specific query with regard to the financial arrangements and various other logistic requirements, which are taken into consideration by the Ministry of Finance/ Ministry of Health & Family Welfare and the State(s) concerned before finalising a proposal as regards the opening up of a new AIIMS, the Ministry, in its written reply, stated:-

"Setting up of four new AIIMS in year 2014-15 and six new AIIMS in year 2015-16 has been directly announced by Ministry of Finance. No financial arrangements and various other logistic requirements are finalized before deciding the opening up of a new AIIMS. However, budgetary requirements to meet the capital expenditure on the various new AIIMS is considered on year to year basis in plan expenditure, under overall PMSSY budget."

10. The Committee further desired to know about the details of AIIMS already functional in various States under the Pradhan Mantri Swasthya Suraksha Yojana (PMSSY). The Ministry of Health and Family Welfare in its written reply submitted:-

"Newly established AIIMS at Patna (Bihar), Raipur (Chhattisgarh), Bhopal (Madhya Pradesh), Bhubaneshwar (Odisha), Jodhpur (Rajasthan) and Rishikesh (Uttarakhand) have already been made functional. AIIMS Amendment Act, 2012 has been enacted to provide autonomous status to the six AIIMS. Institute Body, Governing Body, Standing Finance Committee and Academic Committee are functioning. Medical College and Nursing Colleges at all the six AIIMS have started functioning from September, 2012 and September, 2013 respectively. Regular MBBS batches started since 2012 and the current batch size is of 100 students. Regular Nursing Courses started since 2013 and current batch size is of 60 students. OPD facilities have also become functional at all six AIIMS. Besides, IPD have also become operational with partial bed capacities at new AIIMS."

11. On being again enquired about the details of AIIMS proposed/announced and under construction by the Government, the Ministry, in its written reply, submitted:-

"Six AIIMS are already functional. The details of AIIMS proposed/announced by the Government under the PMSSY are as under:-"

Sl. No	Location	Finalised site	Amount allocated/proposed to be allocated	Amount released
1.	Gorakhpur	Site finalized at Khuttan Khas	Yet to be sanctioned.	NIL

2.	Andhra Pradesh	Site finalized at Mangalagiri	Approved at a total cost of Rs. 1618 cr.	Rs 10.00 crore for pre-investment activities
3.	West Bengal	Site finalized at Kalyani	Approved at a total cost of Rs. 1754 cr.	Rs 10.00 crore for pre-investment activities
4.	Maharashtra	Site finalized at Nagpur	Approved at a total cost of Rs. 1577 cr.	Rs 10.00 crore for pre-investment activities
5.	Assam	Site finalized at Village Jalah, Mouza Sila Sinduri Ghopa in Kamrup District	Yet to be sanctioned.	NIL
6.	Punjab	Site finalized at Bhatinda	Yet to be sanctioned.	NIL
7.	J&K	Site finalized at Samba district in Jammu region and at Pulwama District in Kashmir region	Yet to be sanctioned.	NIL
8.	Himachal Pradesh	Not finalized yet	NIL	NIL
9.	Bihar	Not finalized yet	NIL	NIL
10.	Tamil Nadu	Not finalized yet	NIL	NIL

The details of AIIMS under construction are as under:-

- (1) Rae Bareilly (Uttar Pradesh)
- (2) Kalyani (West Bengal)
- (3) Mangalagiri (Andhra Pradesh)
- (4) Nagpur (Maharashtra)

12. The Committee thereafter, specifically enquired as to whether the Ministry of Finance and/or the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare have proposed/announced the setting up of second AIIMS in certain States inspite of the fact that various other States in the country do not either have any AIIMS or an Institute of National Importance, The Ministry, in its written reply, submitted:-

"Union Finance Minister proposed to set up AIIMS-like institution at Purvanchal, Uttar Pradesh in the budget speech 2014-15 and in the budget speech 2015-16 announced another AIIMS like Institute to beset in Bihar to augment Medical Sciences in the state. In addition, the Prime Minister also announced setting up of two AIIMS in Jammu region and Kashmir region of J&K on 7.11.2015 instead of one AIIMS which was announced in budget speech 2015-16."

13. Thereafter, the Committee desired to know the criterion being adopted by the Government for finalizing the site/proposal for the setting up of new AIIMS in various States in the country, the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, in its written reply, submitted :-

"The identification of locations for the proposed new AIIMS is based on the following considerations:

- (i) To remove regional disparity in the availability of tertiary level healthcare facilities persist in the identified region/State, especially in the backward areas.*
- (ii) Consultation with State Governments, their recommendations and provision of land.*
- (iii) NHM initiative particularly in the EAG States and other backward and vulnerable regions which create the demand for affordable quality tertiary health care, as this continues to be largely unmet.*
- (iv) The respective State Government has to identify locations/sites and to provide free of cost land approximating 200 Acres, which is primary requirement for setting up of AIIMS-type Super-Specialty Hospital-cum-Teaching Institution."*

14. The Committee further desired to know about the initiatives taken by the Government of the eight States, viz., Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Jharkhand, Madhya Pradesh, Odisha, Rajasthan, Uttaranchal and Uttar Pradesh included in Empowered Action Group (EAG). The Ministry, in its written reply, submitted:-

"Eight socio-economically backward States of Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Jharkhand, Madhya Pradesh, Odisha, Rajasthan, Uttaranchal and Uttar Pradesh are referred to as the Empowered Action Group (EAG) States.

Under the NRHM/NHM, the EAG states are treated as high focus States. These States receive higher per capita allocation under NRHM-RCH flexible pool as compared to relatively non-developed States, focussed supervision and higher technical support:-

1.3 per capita for Uttar Pradesh, Bihar, Madhya Pradesh, Rajasthan

1.5 per capita for Chhattisgarh & Jharkhand

3.2 per capita for North eastern and hill states including Uttarakhand."

15. The Committee, then referred to the fact that out of the aforesaid eight States, AIIMS have either been established or are in the process of being established in seven States except for Jharkhand and specifically desired to know the initiative taken by the Government to open up a new AIIMS in Jharkhand. The Ministry, in its written reply, submitted :-

"Yes, AIIMS have either been established or are in the process of being established in seven States other than in the State of Jharkhand. New AIIMS are being set up in a phased manner under PMSSY in view of resource constraint in accordance with funds availability. Further, MoHFW has conveyed to Ministry of Finance its support for any proposal to set up AIIMS in the State of Jharkhand."

16. The Committee enquired as to whether there is any Institute of National Importance (INI) for tertiary health care in the State of Jharkhand and if not, whether the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare has communicated the factual position as obtaining in regard thereto to the Ministry of Finance. The Ministry, in its written reply, submitted:-

"No, there is no Institute of National Importance (INI) for tertiary health care in the State of Jharkhand.

Ministry of Health & Family Welfare has communicated the factual position to the Ministry of Finance vide letter dated 16.06.2016 from Hon'ble Union Health Minister and from Secretary, Department of Health & Family Welfare dated 30.04.2016 regarding setting up of AIIMS in Jharkhand."

17. The Committee desired to know that if the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare has already supported the opening up of a new AIIMS in Deoghar, Jharkhand, what consequential action is being taken by the Ministry of Finance. The Ministry of Finance, in their written reply, submitted:-

"A recommendation for setting up of AIIMS in Jharkhand has been received from the Hon'ble Minister of Health & Family Welfare on 20.6.2016. The State of Jharkhand is one of the eight socio-economic backward States belonging to Empowered Action Group (EAG). The State of Jharkhand being a tribal State with no institute of national importance for tertiary healthcare, Ministry of Finance has no objection to the proposal of setting up of AIIMS in Jharkhand. The location, however, would be decided by the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare taking note of pre-requisites and in consultation with the State Government."

18. On being categorically enquired as to Whether the Ministry of Finance has any concrete action plan for the opening up of a new AIIMS in Deoghar, Jharkhand, the Ministry of Finance, in its written reply, submitted:-

"The location would be decided by the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare taking note of pre-requisites and in consultation with the State Government."

19. In order to have a holistic view in the matter, the Committee afforded an opportunity to Shri Nishikant Dubey, M.P., Lok Sabha to make a presentation before the Committee on the issue. Accordingly, on 19.9.2016, Shri Nishikant Dubey was invited before the Committee to hear his views in the matter.

20. During the course of his interaction with the Committee, Shri Nishikant Dubey, M.P., *inter alia*, submitted before the Committee the following facts:-

- (i) *Establishment of new AIIMS in Jharkhand is not covered in any of the Budget announcements as yet. In our country, eight States, viz., Bihar, Chattisgarh, Jharkhand, Madhya Pradesh, Odisha, Rajasthan, Uttaranchal and Uttar Pradesh belong to the Empowered Action Group (EAG) due to their socio-economic backward status. AIIMS have either been established or are in the process of being established in all other seven States out of this Group, except in the State of Jharkhand. Also, there is no institute of national importance for tertiary health care in the State of Jharkhand.*
- (ii) *In the year 2015, the Government of Jharkhand had given land for opening up of a new AIIMS at Deoghar, Jharkhand.*
- (iii) *As per the data of National Rural Health Mission (NRHM), in Jharkhand, many posts in the health sector are lying unfilled. For instance, 80 per*

cent posts of Grade 'A' Nurse are vacant, 50 per cent posts of Lab Technician are vacant, 130 posts of Radiographer, 220 posts of Pharmacist and 774 posts of Nursing Staff are also vacant.

- (iii) *Some Members of Parliament had written letters to the Central Government for again soliciting a fresh proposal from the State Government of Jharkhand in regard to the location of a new AIIMS. In this regard, on 16.8.2016, the Director, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Government of India spoke to the Additional Chief Secretary, Department of Health, Jharkhand and informed that if the Government of Jharkhand is keen on establishing the proposed AIIMS type super-speciality Hospital at Deoghar, as proposed earlier, then, a letter to that effect may be sent in order to proceed further in the matter.*
- (iv) *The Government of Jharkhand had decided to set up a new AIIMS type super-speciality Hospital in Deoghar and the detailed information, in the prescribed checklist, which was given on 15.1.2015, has been reiterated on 19.8.2016 to the Central Government.*
- (v) *A team of AIIMS has recently visited the identified site at Deoghar and they have sought some additional information viz., connectivity of railway and roadways, etc.*

21. With a view to further reinforcing and supplementing his point of view regarding establishing of a new AIIMS at Deoghar, Jharkhand, Shri Nishikant Dubey, M.P., also made a written submission before to the Committee for their kind consideration:-

Rich and unique spiritual history of Deoghar

Deoghar's Baba Baidyanath Dham is the most unique of 12 Jotirlingas, as it also has a Shakti Peeth. This makes Deoghar Shrine a unique temple among the holiest places of the country. Along with this fact, the presence of Anukul Chandra Thakur Satsang and Rikhia Peeth makes this place very popular especially in the Eastern, Northern and North Eastern parts of the country. Every year, nearly 3 crore pilgrims visit Deoghar from around the world, with number of pilgrims reaching a figure beyond 50 lakh in the month of Shavani Mela alone. This cultural and historical richness of Deoghar can attract many professionals (faculty and staff who may want to work and settle there) and large gatherings of public who may visit Deoghar for both medical treatment and also spiritual blessings.

Enormous need for healthcare facilities in the region

People of these Districts are at a highly disadvantageous position when it comes to health care facilities. The health indicators of the nearer Districts including Deoghar are by far the worst among other regions of the country (also the worst compared to other regions of Jharkhand). For example, Infant Mortality Rate (IMR) indicators are - Deoghar 40, Godda 64, Sahibganj 59, Pakur 59, Dumka 45 (compared to the National IMR of 22). Also, another example of Maternal Mortality Rate (MMR) for these 6 Districts is 325 (compared to the National MMR of 178). There are still in existence various cases of Leprosy and Kalazar in Deoghar and surrounding Districts. Also, there are no Super Speciality Hospitals in the region. The nearest hospitals (in Ranchi) with Super Speciality have only 16 Departments (compared to the minimum 33). Hence, establishing a new AIIMS at Deoghar is essential to help our country meet its Sustainable Development Goals (SDG).

Ideal location of Deoghar

Deoghar falls right in the middle of important cities - Patna, Ranchi, Kolkata and Bagdogra. It is equidistant from these State Capitals and has very good connectivity to all. Nearly, 14 Districts (9 of Jharkhand, 3 of Bihar and 2 of West Bengal) of the country are within the 150 km radius of Deoghar. Cumulative population of these 13 Districts is 2.7 crore (add this figure to the average pilgrim inflow of 3 crore per year).

Suitability of site

Land measuring 291.69 acres is available in 2 plots (223.89 acres) + 67.80 acres (right opposite) near the City Centre. Land acquisition from farmers is not involved. Hence, the pre-investment/ construction work can start soon without any displacement or dispossession issues involved. The land for the proposed AIIMS is ideally placed with near-rectangular features with a railway station (Shakarpur) touching the proposed site. Apart from the desired 200 acres of land, more land can be transferred to AIIMS/any affiliated Institution of AIIMS for parallel development. Also, Deoghar District is free from any form of Naxal/ Left-Wing Maoist activity or violence (which, unfortunately may not be the case with other Districts of the State).

Good Connectivity

Apart from its ideal location to serve the disadvantaged population of these 13 Districts, Deoghar is very well connected by road and railway. Deoghar city is at the intersection of 3 National Highways (NH-133, NH-333 and NH-114) and has many State highways connecting the District. The proposed site also falls along the State highway SH (MDR-235). Also, the Deoghar (Jasidih) junction falls at the

intersection of 5 different railway lines including the Delhi-Kolkata line. For smooth travel from town, the work of construction of 4 railway over bridge has since been started. In addition to this, Deoghar Airport expansion project is in its last leg with 80% of the land has already been acquired. The Government of Jharkhand has already entered into an Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with the Airport Authority of India and the work is expected to commence in a month and the project is expected to be completed by the year 2018. The Government of Jharkhand has also prioritized the Deoghar Airport project as its most important infrastructure project. This airport will be only 8 km away from the proposed site of AIIMS. After establishing of AIIMS at Deoghar, Jharkhand, it is expected to cater the medical needs of around 5.7 crore population.

Infrastructure development in the region

Deoghar District is in the priority list of both the Central and the State Governments when it comes to development. Deoghar is part of the Central Government's Atal Mission for Rejuvenation and Urban Transformation (AMRUT) by the Ministry of Urban Development and the National Mission for Pilgrimage Rejuvenation and Spiritual Augmentation Drive (PRASAD) Scheme by the Ministry of Tourism. In addition to the prestigious Deoghar Airport project, the State Government has also entered into an MoU with the Ministry of Power to build a 4000 MW Ultra Mega Power Plant (UMPP) in the District. The land for this purpose has been identified and the Social Impact Assessment has been completed. The project is expected to be completed by mid-2019. Deoghar also has a Strategic Research Centre of Defence and Development Organisation (DRDO). Also, there are prestigious educational institutions such as Birla Institute of Technology (BIT), Deoghar, proposed Food Craft Institute, Fashion Design Studio, Sanskrit University, International Convention Centre and Trade-cum-Incubation Centre. Big Power Projects, viz., Adani Power Plant and Jindal Power in Godda are also proposed to be set up in the adjacent Districts. There are also good recreational facilities for the families of staff such as Kumetha Indore Stadium and a Mall with 4-screen cinema and numerous shopping centres. There are also numerous reputed schools such as R.K. Mission School (established in 1922), St. Francis School, DAV and St. Xavier's School. This large scale infrastructure and economic development in the District and its surroundings can complement the formation and operation of AIIMS at Deoghar.

22. Immediately followed by the presentation made by Shri Nishikant Dubey, M.P., the Committee took oral evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare and the Ministry of Finance (Department of Expenditure) on the issue, wherein the

Committee desired to know about a brief background of the case. The representatives of the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare submitted:-

"The Government has been writing to various State Governments to allocate land for construction of AIIMS in the States. The State Government of Jharkhand has already allocated land for AIIMS at Deoghar. The Ministry have also sent their team to the site for conducting technical survey so as to assess the feasibility of opening up of a new AIIMS at the proposed site by the State Government."

23. On being enquired by the Committee about the broad parameters considered by the Central Ministry before opening up of new AIIMS in a State, the Secretary, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Government of India submitted:-

"There are various parameters on which the Central Ministry deliberate before opening up a new AIIMS in the State. Amongst other things, connectivity to the proposed site, non-existence of hazardous industry, local infrastructure such as connecting over bridges/flyovers, airports, etc., are important parameters for approving AIIMS for a particular site."

The witness further submitted :-

"The technical team from the Central Ministry which undertook the feasibility study of the site at Deoghar has already submitted its findings to the State Government with a request to improve certain ongoing infrastructural projects such as over bridges, etc."

24. The Committee, then, specifically desired to know as to whether the Ministry of Finance has given its approval for the said project. The representative from the Ministry of Finance (Department of Expenditure) submitted:-

"Once the Ministry/Department gets the proposal from the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare regarding the construction of a new AIIMS at Jharkhand, appropriate action in this regard would be initiated."

25. On the aspect of proposals for setting up of a new AIIMS like Institutions received from various States and Union Territories, the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare vide SQ No. 284 dated 5.8.2016, *inter alia*, informed:-

"...Proposals have been received from 17 States for setting up of new AIIMS like Institutions. The details are as under:-

S.No.	State's Name	Location as per requirement
1.	Andhra Pradesh	Government of Andhra Pradesh identified single location at Mangalgiri Mandal in Guntur District for setting of up AIIMS in Andhra Pradesh. Site selected and approved.
2.	Arunachal Pradesh	Suggested only single location without proper details. 204 acres Located around 30 km (approx.) from Itanagar via NH 52 A (Hollongi-Itanagar road) under Tubung Village of Balijan Circle, Papum Pare District, Arunachal Pradesh.
3.	Assam	Suggested three locations- a) Dimoria Mouza in Kamrup (Metro) District. (769 Bighas) b) Kamalpur revenue circle in Kamrup District. (650 Bighas) c) Shahari Mouza of Raha in Nagaon District. (600 Bighas) d) North Guwahati (Near IIT/Guwahati) e) 879B of land at village Jalah, MouzaSilaSinduriGhopa, Kamrup District, located 6-7 km away from the already allotted site near IITG. f) 624B in KachamariMouza, Pukripar villlage under NagaonSadar Revenue Circle.
4.	Goa	State Government has identified only single location which is situated in Dhargar village of PernemTaluka.
5.	Gujarat	State Government has identified four suitable sites in two district of the State namely Rajkot and Vadodara:- a) Village-Chokari and Village Pavda, TalukaPadra, District, Vadodara. b) Village- Khirasara (Ranmalji), Tehsil- Lodhika, District- Rajkot. c) Village-Khandheri, Tehsil- Padadhari, District Rajkot. d) Village-Para Pipaliya, Tehsil-Rajkot, District Rajkot.

6.	Haryana	State Government has identified location for new AIIMS at Manethi, District Rewari in Haryana.
7.	Himachal Pradesh	Kothipura in Bilaspur District.
8.	Jammu & Kashmir	Government of Jammu & Kashmir has identified locations at Vijaypur in Jammu Region and at Awantipora in Kashmir region. Site selected.
9.	Jharkhand	State Government has identified location for new AIIMS at Devipur in Deoghar.
10.	Karnataka	State Government has identified three locations in the State:- a) Harohalli in Ramanagar District near Bangalore. b) Itagatti in Dharwad District. c) District Hospital Campus, Bijapur (Canter Distt. Head Quarters).
11.	Kerala	State Government has identified following four locations:- a) Thiruvananthapuram District-Kattakada Taluk, Kallikadu Village, Block 31, Resurvey 66. b) Kottayam District-Arpookkara, Athirampuzha and Peraicakadu villages. c) Ernakulam District- Block No.5, 717/5, Block No.6, 321/1. d) Kozhikode District- Kinalur and Kanthalad villages in Panangad Grama Panchayath, Thamarassery Taluk.
12.	Maharashtra	Government of Maharashtra identified location at Nagpur in Nagpur District for setting of up AIIMS in Maharashtra. Site selected and approved.
13.	Punjab	State Government has identified location for new AIIMS at Bathinda in Punjab. Site selected and approved.
14.	Tamil Nadu	State has identified locations at: a) Chengalpattu in Kancheepuram District b) Pudukkottaitowm in Pudukkottai District

		c) Sengipatti in Thanjavur District d) Perundurai in Erode District e) Thoppur in Madurai District The finalization of site is under consideration.
15.	Telangana	State Government has identified location for new AIIMS at Bibinagar in Telenagana.
16.	Uttar Pradesh	The Government of Uttar Pradesh identified four locations in Tehsil Gola and Tehsil Sadar in Gorakhpur District for setting up AIIMS in Poorvanchal, Uttar Pradesh. One site has been selected and approved. Foundation stone laid.
17.	West Bengal	Government of West Bengal identified location at Kalyani in Nadia District for setting of up AIIMS in West Bengal. Site selected and approved.

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS

Criterion adopted for opening up of new All India Institute of Medical Sciences (AIIMS)

26. The Committee note from the submission made by the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare that the proposal for opening up of new All India Institute of Medical Sciences (AIIMS) like Super-Speciality Hospital in various States/Union Territories in the country is finalised by the Union Government on the basis of various considerations, viz., (i) in order to remove regional disparity in the availability of tertiary level healthcare facilities that persist in the identified region/State, especially in the backward areas; (ii) it involves consultation with the respective State Government(s), their recommendations, identification and provision of land by the State for the purpose; approximating 200 acres - free of cost; and (iii) under the National Health Mission initiative, particularly in the Empowered Action Group (EAG) States and other backward and vulnerable regions - which create the demand for affordable quality tertiary health care. The Committee also note, in particular, that eight socio-economic backward States of Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Jharkhand, Madhya Pradesh, Odisha, Rajasthan, Uttaranchal and Uttar Pradesh have been referred to as the EAG States. Under the NRHM/NHM, these EAG States are treated as high focus States for the purpose. They also receive high per capita allocation under the NRHM-RCH flexible pool as compared to relatively non-developed States, focussed supervision and higher technical support. Notwithstanding the fact that the Central Government plans to set up AIIMS in each State, in a phased manner, under the Pradhan Mantri Swasthya Suraksha Yojana (PMSSY), the Committee are flabbergasted to find that even after 69 years of Independence, the progress in the availability of affordable quality tertiary health care services in various States/UTs in the country remains way far from satisfactory. As a matter of fact, a lackadaisical

approach has so far been adopted by the Union Government in establishing AIIMS like Super-Speciality Hospital in various States/UTs in the country. Now that a renewed impetus has been propounded by the Union Government, the Committee hope that opening up of at least one AIIMS like Super-Specialty Hospital in each State/UT in the country would become a realistic component of the long-term perspective planning process. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare should assess and provide a detailed account of the time-bound trajectory for attainment of the objective of opening up of new AIIMS like Super-Speciality Hospital in every State/UT in the country.

Socio-economically backward States vis-a-vis Jharkhand

27. The Committee find that the Hon'ble Finance Minister, in his Budget Speech of 2014-15, had announced to set up four AIIMS, one each in Andhra Pradesh, Vidarbha Region in Maharashtra, West Bengal and Purvanchal in Uttar Pradesh. Further, in the Budget Speech for the year 2015-16, the Hon'ble Finance Minister had proposed to set up AIIMS in Jammu & Kashmir, Punjab, Tamil Nadu, Himachal Pradesh, Bihar and Assam. The Committee also note that Jharkhand is also one of the socio-economically backward States referred to as Empowered Action Group (EAG) States. The Committee further note from the submissions made by the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare that AIIMS have either been established or are in the process of being established in all the seven EAG States other than the State of Jharkhand. Further, the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare had already conveyed to the Ministry of Finance its support for any proposal to set up AIIMS in the State of Jharkhand. The Committee are constrained to point out that Jharkhand was carved out of Bihar in the year 2000 and even after a lapse of more than 15 years, no serious efforts so far were made by the Government to set up a Super-Speciality Hospital like AIIMS in the State;

while on the other hand, opening up of another AIIMS in Bihar has been announced by the Union Government in the year 2015-16. In view of the foregoing, the Committee are of considered view that the Pradhan Mantri Swasthya Suraksha Yojana would not be able to deliver the desired results of removal of regional disparity in the availability of tertiary level healthcare facilities; if in the process, a socio-economically backward State like Jharkhand is denied of its legitimate right of having a Super-Speciality Hospital like AIIMS within their own territory. Having noted that the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare had already endorsed the proposal for opening up of a new AIIMS in Jharkhand, the Committee strongly recommend the Ministry of Finance to work out all the requisite details, in co-ordination with the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, to formalize the proposal for the opening up of a new AIIMS in Jharkhand within three months of presentation of this Report to the House. The Committee urge the Union Government to take the necessary action and apprise the Committee accordingly.

Financial arrangements and logistic requirements for opening up of new AIIMS

28. The Committee note from the submissions made by the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare that the setting up of four new AIIMS in the year 2014-15 and six new AIIMS in the year 2015-16 had been directly announced by the Ministry of Finance. The Committee also find that no financial arrangements and other logistic requirements are finalised before deciding the opening up of a new AIIMS. Besides, the budgetary requirements to meet the capital expenditure on the various new AIIMS are considered on year-to-year basis in Plan Expenditure, under overall PMSSY Budget. Based on the deliberations the Committee had with the representatives of the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare and the Ministry of Finance (Department of Expenditure) during the oral evidence - while examining the Petition presented by Shri Nishikant Dubey, M.P., the Committee are surprised to note that on the one

hand, opening of a new AIIMS in various States had been announced even without going in for financial implications, viz., funds allocated/proposed to be allocated and/or various logistic requirements, viz., selection/suitability of site, connectivity, non-existence of hazardous industry, local infrastructure (over bridges, flyovers, and airports), etc., and on the other hand, prior to approving the proposal of opening up of a new AIIMS in Jharkhand, the Ministries concerned have been going in for detailed deliberations in regard to financial arrangements and other logistic requirements. The Committee are of the opinion that the aspect of providing quality health care to every citizen in the country is one of the prime objectives of a Welfare State and, therefore, imposition of pre-conditions in the form of fulfilling all the pre-requisites/parameters before announcing the opening up of a new AIIMS in a State should not stand as an impediment for attainment of the said objective. The Committee, therefore, urge the Government to work out a uniform policy for announcing the opening up of new AIIMS like Super-Speciality Hospital in various States, in general and in the State of Jharkhand, in particular. A consistent and universal procedure for the said purpose should now be drawn up by the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare in consultation with the Ministry of Finance (Department of Expenditure) under intimation to the Committee.

Location of new AIIMS in Jharkhand

29. The Committee while examining the Petition presented by Shri Nishikant Dubey, M.P., as regards opening up of a new AIIMS at Deoghar, Jharkhand, considered at length, the written submissions made by the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare and the Ministry of Finance (Department of Expenditure). The Committee also undertook a detailed examination of various aspects connected with the pre-requisites for opening up of a new AIIMS in a particular State, viz., the role of various stakeholders - Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Ministry of Finance, and

the State Government concerned. While the Committee heard the views of the representatives of the said Ministries, Shri Nishikant Dubey, M.P., was also invited before the Committee to hear his views in the matter. Based on the aforementioned deliberations and in-depth examination of the subject, the Committee made specific recommendation for opening up of a new AIIMS in Jharkhand, in the foregoing paragraphs. However, on the issue of location of the proposed AIIMS at Deoghar, Jharkhand, the Committee wish to undertake a sequential recapitulation as under:-

Submissions made by the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare and the Ministry of Finance (Department of Expenditure)

- *The State of Jharkhand, being a tribal State with no institute of National Importance for tertiary healthcare, the Ministry of Finance (Department of Expenditure) has no objection to the proposal for opening up of a new AIIMS in Jharkhand. The location, however, would be decided by the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare in consultation with the State Government.*
- *The Government has been writing to various State Governments to allocate land for construction of AIIMS in the States. The State Government of Jharkhand has already allocated land for AIIMS at Deoghar.*
- *The Ministry of Health & Family Welfare has also sent its team to the site for conducting technical survey so as to assess the feasibility of opening up of a new AIIMS at the proposed site by the State Government.*
- *The Technical Team from the Central Ministry which undertook the feasibility study of the site at Deoghar has already submitted its findings to the State Government with a request to improve certain ongoing infrastructural projects such as over bridges, etc.*

Submissions made by Shri Nishikant Dubey, M.P.

- *In the year 2015, the Government of Jharkhand had given land for opening up of a new AIIMS at Deoghar, Jharkhand.*

- *Some Members of Parliament had written letters to the Central Government for again soliciting a fresh proposal from the State Government of Jharkhand in regard to the location of a new AIIMS. In this regard, on 16.8.2016, the Director, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Government of India spoke to the Additional Chief Secretary, Department of Health, Jharkhand and informed that if the Government of Jharkhand is keen on establishing the proposed AIIMS type Super-Speciality Hospital at Deoghar, as proposed earlier, then, a letter to that effect may be sent in order to further proceed in the matter.*
- *The Government of Jharkhand had decided to set up a new AIIMS type Super-Speciality Hospital in Deoghar and the detailed information, in the prescribed checklist, was given on 15.1.2015, has been reiterated on 19.8.2016 to the Central Government.*
- *A team of AIIMS has recently visited the identified site at Deoghar and they have sought some additional information, viz., connectivity of railway and roadway, etc.*
- *Deoghar falls right in the middle of important cities - Patna, Ranchi, Kolkata and Bagdogra. It is equidistant from these State Capitals and has very good connectivity to all. Nearly, 13 Districts (9 of Jharkhand, 3 of Bihar and 2 of West Bengal) of the country are within 150 km radius of Deoghar. Cumulative population of these 13 Districts is 2.7 crore.*
- *Land measuring 291.69 acres is available in two plots (223.89 acres) + 67.80 acres (right opposite) near the City Centre. Land acquisition from farmers is not required. Hence the pre-investment/construction work can start soon without any displacement or dispossession issues involved.*
- *The land for the proposed AIIMS is ideally placed with near-rectangular features with a railway station (Shakurpur) touching the proposed site. Apart from the 200 acres of land, more land can be transferred to AIIMS/ any affiliated Institution of AIIMS for parallel development.*
- *Apart from its ideal location to serve the disadvantaged population of these 13 Districts, Deoghar is very well connected by road and railway. Deoghar city is at the intersection of 3 National Highways and has many State Highways connecting the District. The proposed site also falls along the*

State Highway (MDR-235). Also, the Deoghar (Jasidih) junction falls at the intersection of 5 different railway lines including the Delhi-Kolkata line.

- For smooth travel from Deoghar town, the work of construction of 4 railway over bridge has since been started. In addition to this, Deoghar Airport expansion project is in its last leg with 80% of the land has already been acquired.**
- The Government of Jharkhand has already entered into an Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with the Airport Authority of India and the work is expected to commence in a month and the project is expected to be completed by the year 2018. This airport will be only 8 km away from the proposed site of AIIMS. After establishing of AIIMS at Deoghar, Jharkhand, it is expected to cater the medical needs of around 5.7 crore population.**
- Deoghar District is in the priority list of both the Central and the State Governments when it comes to development. Deoghar is part of the Central Government's Atal Mission for Rejuvenation and Urban Transformation (AMRUT) by the Ministry of Urban Development and the National Mission for Pilgrimage Rejuvenation and Spiritual Augmentation Drive (PRASAD) Scheme by the Ministry of Tourism.**
- In addition to the prestigious Deoghar Airport project, the State Government has also entered into an MoU with the Ministry of Power to build a 4000 MW Ultra Mega Power Plant (UMPP) in the District. The land for this purpose has been identified and the Social Impact Assessment has been completed. The project is expected to be completed by mid-2019. Deoghar also has a Strategic Research Centre of Defence and Development Organisation (DRDO). Also, there are prestigious educational institutions such as Birla Institute of Technology (BIT), Deoghar, proposed Food Craft Institute, Fashion Design Studio, Sanskrit University, International Convention Centre and Trade-cum-Incubation Centre. This large scale infrastructure and economic development in the District and its surroundings can complement the formation and operation of AIIMS at Deoghar.**

30. Going into all aforementioned determining factors connected with the opening up of a new AIIMS at Deoghar, Jharkhand, the Committee note that since the State Government has to identify and allot land for construction purpose, their opinion is

of utmost importance in finalising the project. In the instant case, the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, while giving reply to SQ No. 284 dated 5 August, 2016 in the House, had categorically informed the Parliament that the State Government of Jharkhand had identified the location for new AIIMS at Devipur in Deoghar. Besides, while deposing before the Committee, the representatives of the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare had submitted that the State Government of Jharkhand has already allocated land for AIIMS at Deoghar and the technical team from the Central Ministry which undertook the feasibility study of the site at Deoghar has already submitted its findings to the State Government. The representatives of the Ministry of Finance (Department of Expenditure), while deposing before the Committee also emphatically informed that once they receive the proposal from the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare regarding construction of a new AIIMS at Jharkhand, they would initiate further action. The Committee are, therefore, of the opinion that the main pre-requisite for giving approval for opening up of a new AIIMS at Deoghar, Jharkhand has now been attained. The Committee, therefore, recommend the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare to sort out the remaining minor pre-requisites in consultation with the State Government of Jharkhand at the earliest without loss of any further precious time by adhering to a strict time schedule and forward the proposal for sitting up of a new AIIMS at Deoghar, Jharkhand to the Ministry of Finance (Department of Expenditure) for finalising the proposal for being placed before the Union Cabinet. The Committee would like to be apprised of the final outcome in this regard - within three months of presentation of this Report to the House.

NEW DELHI;
29 November, 2016
8 Agrahayana, 1938 (Saka)

BHAGAT SINGH KOSHYARI
Chairperson,
Committee on Petitions