

SUBURBAN TRAIN SERVICES IN INDIAN RAILWAYS

MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (RAILWAY BOARD)

**PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2016-17)**

SIXTY NINTH REPORT

SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

PAC NO. 2102

SIXTY NINTH REPORT

PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2016-17)

(SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA)

**SUBURBAN TRAIN SERVICES IN
INDIAN RAILWAYS**

MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (RAILWAY BOARD)



Presented to Lok Sabha on:

11.4.2017

Laid in Rajya Sabha on:

11.4.2017

**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

April 2017/ Chaitra 1939 (Saka)

CONTENTS

COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2016-17)	(iii)
COMPOSITION OF THE SUB-COMMITTEE -II (RAILWAYS) OF P.A.C. (2016-17)	(iv)
INTRODUCTION	(v)

REPORT PART-I

I	Introductory	1
II	Definition	3
III	Operation of Suburban Train Services	6
	a) Growth of Traffic - Target <i>vis-a-vis</i> Achievement	7
	b) Punctuality of Suburban Trains	9
	c) Loss of lives of passengers in Suburban Train Services	10
	d) Medical Care for Accident Victims	14
	e) Pendency of cases and untoward incident claim cases	17
	f) Speed Restrictions and late running of trains	19
	g) Maintenance of tracks	20
	h) Land Encroachment and Level Crossings	22
IV	Status of Rolling Stock	
	a) Delay in Commissioning of Coaches	25
	b) Detention of EMU Coaches Beyond permissible limit in workshops/Car Sheds	26
	c) Failure within 100 days of periodical Overhaul (POH)	27
V	Amenities to Suburban Passengers	27
VI	Security of Passengers on Suburban Section	31
VII	Financial Performance of Suburban Train Services	
	a) Operating cost <i>vis-a-vis</i> Earnings	39
	b) Suburban Fare Structure	40
	PART - II	
	Observations/Recommendations	18-24
	APPENDICES	
I	Minutes of the Second sitting of the Sub-Committee-II(Railways) of Public Accounts Committee (2016-17) held on 23 August, 2016	
II	Minutes of the Fifth sitting of the Sub-Committee-II(Railways) of Public Accounts Committee (2016-17) held on 08 December, 2016	
III	Minutes of the Sixth sitting of the Sub-Committee-II(Railways) of Public Accounts Committee (2016-17) held on 29 March, 2017	
IV	Minutes of the Twenty-ninth sitting of the Public Accounts Committee (2016-17) held on 06 April, 2017	

⊗ Not Appended.

**COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2016-17)**

Prof. K.V. Thomas

Chairperson

MEMBERS

LOK SABHA

2. Shri Sudip Bandyopadhyay
3. Shri Prem Singh Chandumajra
4. Shri Nishikant Dubey
5. Prof. Richard Hay
6. Shri Gajanan Chandrakant Kirtikar
7. Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab
8. Smt. Riti Pathak
9. Shri Neiphu Rio
10. Shri Janardan Singh Sigrwal
11. Shri Abhishek Singh
12. Dr. Kirit Somaiya
13. Shri Anurag Singh Thakur
14. Shri Shivkumar C. Udasi
15. Dr. P. Venugopal

RAJYA SABHA

16. Shri Naresh Agrawal
17. Shri Satyavrat Chaturvedi
18. Shri Bhupender Yadav
19. Shri Bhubaneswar Kalita
20. Shri Shantaram Naik
21. Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Roy
22. Shri Ajay Sancheti

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri A.K. Singh - Additional Secretary
2. Shri S.C. Choudhary - Joint Secretary
3. Shri T. Jayakumar - Director
4. Shri A.K. Yadav - Deputy Secretary

* Elected w.e.f. 09.08.2016 vice Shri Vijay Goel, MP appointed as Minister of State w.e.f. 05.07.2016.

**COMPOSITION OF THE SUB-COMMITTEE – II (RAILWAYS) OF
THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2016-17)**

Convenor	:	1.	ⁱ Dr. Kirit Somaiya
Alternate Convenor	:	2.	Shri Naresh Agrawal
Members	:	3.	Shri Bhubaneswar Kalita
		4.	Shri Janardan Singh Sigrwal
		5.	Shri Anurag Singh Thakur
		6.	Shri Bhupender Yadav

ⁱ Appointed w.e.f. 08.07.2016 vice Shri Vijay Goel, MP appointed as Minister of State w.e.f. 05.07.2016.

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairperson, Public Accounts Committee, having been authorised by the Committee, do present this Sixty Ninth Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) on "**Suburban Train Services in Indian Railways**" based on C&AG Report No. 14 of 2016 Union Government - Railways relating to the Ministry of Railways (Railway Board).

2. The Report of Comptroller and Auditor General of India was laid on the Table of the House on 26th July, 2016.

3. The Public Accounts Committee (2016-17) took up the subject for detailed examination and report. A Sub-Committee was constituted for the purpose. The Sub-Committee took evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Railways (Railway Board) on the subject at their sitting held on 23 August, 2016 and 08 December, 2016. The Sub-Committee of PAC (2016-17) considered and adopted this Report at their sitting held on 29th March, 2017. The Report was considered and adopted by the Public Accounts Committee (2016-17) during their sitting held on 6th April, 2017. The Minutes of the Sitzings form Appendices to the Report.

4. For facility of reference and convenience, the Observations and Recommendations of the Committee have been printed in thick type and form Part- II of the Report.

5. The Committee thank their Sub-Committee for taking oral evidence of the Ministry and obtaining information on the subject.

6. The Committee would also like to express their thanks to the representatives of the Ministry of Railways (Railway Board) for tendering evidence before the Sub-Committee and furnishing the requisite information to the Committee in connection with the examination of the subject.

7. The Committee place on record their appreciation of the assistance rendered to them in the matter by the office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India.

NEW DELHI;
06 April, 2017
16 Chaitra, 1939 (Saka)

PROF. K.V. THOMAS
Chairperson,
Public Accounts Committee.

REPORT

PART I

I. Introductory

1. Indian Railways is the life line of teeming millions, especially the lower and middle stratus of the country. The suburban train services carry 72.86 per cent of the total number of passengers of Indian Railways. It is really shocking to observe that due to line crossing, falling off from running trains etc around 15000 lives of innocent passengers are lost and fairly a large number of them get maimed ever year. It is equally worrisome that out of the above, about 6000 deaths are reported from the Mumbai Suburban rail system alone. The C&AG in its Report No. 14 of 2016 have undertaken performance audit of Suburban Train Services in Indian Railways and presented the same to Parliament. Keeping in view the humanitarian aspect, the PAC selected the Report for examination. Passenger services of the Indian Railways are available on both Suburban and Non suburban sections. While the non-suburban train services cover long distance trains, the suburban services are meant for short distances, normally up to 150 Km. to facilitate rapid movement of passengers within the cities, suburbs and extended suburbs. In India, suburban services were introduced in Mumbai on 3.2.1925, Chennai on 1.5.1931, and Kolkata on 1.12.1957 being the port cities and easily accessible by sea were the first to become centres of trade and industry and therefore Electrical Multiple Units (EMUs) were introduced in these cities to cater to mass passenger transport need. This has now become the lifeline of all the above three metropolitan cities.

2. The suburban train services operate with "Electrical Multiple Units" (EMU) rakes which run in formation of 6, 9, 12 and 15 coaches. These services are provided in seven Zonal Railways and spread over 1763 Km. providing services to the major cities, i.e. Mumbai (WR & CR), Kolkata (ER, SER and MR), Chennai (SR) and Secunderabad (SCR). The suburban passengers comprise an average 72.86 per cent of the total 3054 crore passengers carried during the five year period from 2010-11 to 2014-15 by the Indian Railways which are handled by 578 suburban stations. However, the

earnings from suburban train services during the same period were Rs. 10567 crores, constituting 14.11 per cent of the total passenger earnings (Rs. 74868 crores) in the seven Zonal Railways.

3. This report is based on Audit Report No. 14 of 2016 for the year ended March, 2015. The subject was selected by PAC for examination during 2016-17. The Chairperson, PAC appointed a Sub-Committee under the Convenorship of Dr. Kirit Somaiya, MP and member of PAC to examine the issue and Report to the main Committee. The review covers issues related to performance of suburban train services and passenger amenities provided to suburban passengers during 2010-15. Based on the audited accounts for the said years, the report focuses on the performance of Indian Railways on operational efficiency in providing adequate suburban train services which includes punctuality of trains, minimizing death of passengers, elimination of speed restrictions, efficiency in ensuring optimum utilization of rolling stock and provision of requisite infrastructure; the adequacy of security and amenities provided to passengers availing of suburban train services and the efficacy in improvement of overall financial performance of the suburban train services.

4. The Audit has observed the following:

- (i) Overall growth in number of passengers in suburban section of the IR during 2014-15 was negative as compared to the previous year 2013-14. The number of passenger carried during 2014-15 was one per cent less than the previous year.
- (ii) During the period January 2010 to December 2014, out of 33445 deaths in suburban sections, 19868 deaths (59 per cent) occurred due to railway line crossing/trespassing. Further, 17638 (52.74 per cent) death cases occurred in Mumbai suburban section alone. A total of 4885 death cases (15 per cent) occurred due to falling from running trains, of which 4002 deaths (82 per cent) occurred in Mumbai suburban section alone.
- (iii) A variety of reasons i.e. weak condition of track, points and crossings, encroachment along the Railway tracks, weak bridges and others (Signaling, level crossing etc.) resulted in imposition of speed restrictions and their persistence for years indicated that the IRs did not initiate effective remedial measures to withdraw speed restrictions.

- (iv) There were 743 works in progress as on March, 2015 in five Zonal Railways (CR, ER, SR, WR and Metro Railway, Kolkata). Audit scrutiny of 204 selected works undertaken during 2010-15 revealed time overrun ranging between one month and 69 months in respect of 106 works and cost overrun of Rs. 56.21 crores in respect of 51 works such as Traffic facility works, road safety works-level crossings etc.
- (v) Indian Railways could not achieve the target of elimination of level crossings as envisaged in the Vision 2020 documents which indicated lack of concern of Indian Railways in minimizing accidents at level crossings.
- (vi) There was shortfall in provision of booking counters as per norms under Minimum Essential Amenities at 51 stations inspected on six Zonal Railways (ER, SCR, SER, SR, WR and Metro Rail, Kolkata). Out of 153 selected stations, gents toilets had not been provided at five stations in two Zonal Railways (CR -1 and SR-4) while ladies toilets had not been provided at all on 32 stations of three Zonal Railways (CR-1, ER-5 and SR-26). Foot Over Bridge (FOB) of six meter width was required to be provided at all suburban stations had not been provided at all at five stations (ER-4 and SR-1).
- (vii) There was no reduction in operational losses of any Zonal Railways during 2010- 15.

5. Against this backdrop, the Public Accounts Committee (2015-16) selected the subject for detailed examination and report. In the process of examination of the subject, the Committee obtained background notes and detailed written replies from the Ministry of Railways (Railway Board). They also took oral evidence of the representatives of the Ministry and obtained post-evidence replies. The Committee also discussed the subject during their on the spot study visit to Mumbai with Central Railways & Western Railways. Based on written and oral depositions by the Ministry, the Committee examined the subject in detail and discussed some important issues as enumerated in the succeeding paragraphs.

II. Definition

6. Suburban train services have so far been defined on the basis of classification of train services on the basis of their distance of operations whereby while the non-

suburban train services cover long distance trains, the suburban services are meant for short distances, normally up to 150 km. to facilitate rapid movement of passengers within the cities, suburbs and extended suburbs. These services are being provided in seven Zonal Railways and spread over 1763 km. providing services to the major cities, i.e. Mumbai (WR & CR), Kolkata (ER, SER and MR), Chennai (SR) and Secunderabad (SCR).

7. The Committee, therefore, desired to know the definition of Suburban Train Services (STS) by the Railways and reason for providing Suburban Train Services only in 4 cities. In reply, the Ministry stated as under:

"On Indian Railways, currently the following sections on six different Railways are classified as suburban sections.

City	Railway	Suburban Sections
Chennai	Southern Railway	(i) Chennai Central- Basin Bridge-Vyasarpadi-Arakkonam, (ii) Chennai Central-Basin Bridge-Washermanpet- Chennai Beach-Tambaram, (iii) Chennai Central-Basin Bridge-Korukkupet-Tondiarpet – Tiruvottiyur-Gummidipundi and (iv) Chennai Beach-Tirumayilai.
Secunderabad	South Central Railway	(i) Falaknuma-Secunderabad, (ii) Secunderabad-Lingampally, (iii) Secunderabad- Hyderabad, (iv) Hyderabad-Lingampalli, (v) Falaknuma-Umadangar- Shamshabad, (vi) Telapur-Patancheru, (vii) Secunderabad-Bolaram-Medchel, (viii) Maula Ali 'C' cabin-Ghatkesar, (ix) Maula Ali 'C' cabin-Sanathnagar and (x) Maula Ali 'C' cabin-Malkajigiri-Sitafalmandi.
Mumbai	Western Railway	Churuchgate-Dahanu Road
	Central Railway	(i) Chhatrapati Shivaji Terminus (CSTM)- Kasara, (ii) CSTM- Karjat/Khopoli, (iii) CSTM-Panvel, (iv) CSTM-King's Circle, (v) Thane-Vashi, (vi) Pune-Lonavala, (vi) Vasai-Diva, (vii) Diva-Panvel, (viii) Karjat-Khopoli, (ix) Mankhurd-Panvel and (x) Thane-Vashi.
Kolkata	Eastern Railway	Sealdah Division - (i) Sealdah- Kankurgachi (ii) Kankurgachi- Dum Dum (iii) Dum Dum –Naihati

		(iv) Naihati -Kalyani (v) Kalyani -Ranaghat (vi) Kalyani - Kalyani Simanta (vii) Ranaghat -Gede (viii) Ranaghat- Kalinarayanpur (ix) Kalinarayanpur-Shantipur (x) Kalinarayanpur- Krishnanagar (xi) Ranaghat- Bongaon (xii) Dum Dum Junction - Barasat (xiii) Barasat -Habra (xiv) Habra-Bongaon (xv) Barasat - Hasnabad (xvi) Dum Dum Junction- Dankuni (xvii) Sealdah South-Ballygunge (xviii) Ballygunge-Budge Budge (xix) Ballygunge-Sonarpur (xx) Sonarpur-Baruipur (xxi) Sonarpur- Canning (xxii) Baruipur- Diamond Harbour (xxiii) Baruipur-Laxmikantapur-Namkhana (xxiv) Kankurgachi-Ballygunge (xxv) Dum Dum Cantt. - Bimanbandar and (xxvi) Dum Dum-Kolkata-Majherhat Howrah Division- (i) Howrah- Belur (ii) Belur- Sherophuli (iii) Seoraphuli- Tarakeswar-Talpur (iv) Seoraphuli-Bandel (v) Bandel- Katwa (vi) Bandel- Shaktigarh (vii) Bandel- Naihati (viii) Belur-Dankuni (ix) Dankuni- Shaktigarh (x) Shaktigarh-Bardhaman, (xi) Liluah-Belurmath, (xii) Tarakeswar-Talpur and (xiii) Bishnupur-Gokulgar-Joypur.
	South Eastern Railway	(i) Howrah- Santragachi- Panskura- Balichak, (ii) Balichak-Midnapur, (iii) Panskura-Haldia, and (iv) Santragachi-Amta.

In addition, the EMU services operated on Northern Railways are also treated as 'Suburban services for statistical purpose.

All the above classified sections are characterized by high volume commuter traffic with peaking characteristics. The rail services here are of high frequency levels with very high discharge rates of passengers.

In addition to the above sections, Railways cater to the commuter demand in other major cities by running passenger trains at timings suited for local commuting pattern".

8. On being asked to clarify the criteria being followed to provide suburban train services in major cities and whether Delhi/NCR region is not fulfilling the above criteria though certain local train services are provided here, the Ministry in their reply stated as under:

"Consideration of routes for notification as suburban routes is based on the pattern of traffic, availability of rail infrastructure etc. Suburban Sections are notified on detailed examination of the techno-economic and financial viability derived from traffic studies

carried out by the Railways for assessing the volume and nature of suburban/commuter traffic in the urban conglomerates.

Considering the high frequency of services and high discharge rates of passengers at stations and the expectations of very high availability and reliability of services, both the route and the station infrastructure needs to fulfill a minimal set of standards. Normally the suburban routes should be electrified sections with "Automatic Signalling". Passenger Amenities of stations on the suburban sections include specified height of platforms, lighting arrangements, public announcement systems, parking spaces, etc. The expenditure incurred in upgradation of such infrastructure as well as the service levels of current passenger/EMU services on the route also need to be considered in while notifying a section as "Suburban".

The extent of routes notified as suburban and the number of services in each of the metropolitan cities and surrounding areas including Delhi/NCR region differs on account of the varying nature of urban spreads/ settlements and varying patterns of traffic. Besides EMU Services, Metro trains have been introduced in Delhi which serve the purpose of suburban train services. These Metro trains have connected Delhi with NCR region also.

Suburban services run on various sections in Delhi broadly fulfill the criteria of suburban services."

9. Further, the Chairman, Railway Board also deposed before the Committee that Delhi-Ghaziabad and Delhi - Faridabad are very popular Sub-urban services though Northern Railways are not categorised under Sub-Urban Train Services by the Railways.

10. Another representative of the Ministry of Railways *inter-alia*, stated that it has not been defined as to what exactly the suburban traffic is.

III. Operation of Suburban Train Services

11. During the period 2010-11 to 2014-15, suburban train services carried 2225 crore passengers which ranged between 72.28 per cent (2012-13) and 73.29 per cent (2014-15) of total passenger traffic of the Indian Railways with respect to its non - suburban services during the same period. This was more or less static on an average per cent of 72.86 over the five years, under period of review. The operational efficiency of Indian Railways has been assessed on the basis of growth of originating passengers in suburban sections and parameters for providing suburban train services like punctuality

of Suburban Trains, number of cases of death of passengers, speed restrictions, status of rolling stock and infrastructure augmentation.

12. In Railway Budget, 2011, it was announced that the development of integrated suburban Railway networks in large cities, like, Mumbai bringing together suburban Railway, Metro Railway and other Railway infrastructure under a single integrated system would provide faster, efficient, affordable and comfortable transportation to the citizens. It was also announced that enhancement of carrying capacity of suburban services would be taken up in Mumbai area with 47 additional services on different sections of CR and WR, while augmentation of 107 suburban services would be made in Mumbai area from the present 9 car EMUs to 12 car EMUs. Audit scrutiny revealed that in CR and WR, average number of services run per day increased by only 18 and 8 services respectively. Further, all the services on WR were run with 12 car rakes except for one 9 coach rake being run on Harbor line, while 43 nine car rakes were being run on CR.

13. Replying to the action taken by the Government on budgetary announcements made in 2011, the Railways in their written reply have stated as under:

"In pursuance of the same, proposal regarding inter-operability across different modes of transport through National Common Mobility Card and Automatic Fare Collection system in cities like Mumbai etc. is under examination in consultation with Ministry of Urban Development."

(a) Growth of Traffic – Target *vis-a-vis* Achievement

14. In March 2014, the Railway Board for the first time fixed targets for the number of passengers to be carried on the suburban section during 2014-15. Accordingly, the targetted growth in number of passengers was set at 5 per cent. Review of the position revealed that during the year 2014-15 none of the Zonal Railways was able to achieve the targetted growth of 5 per cent.

15. The Committee desired to know the reasons for not achieving the targetted growth of 5 per cent of suburban passengers during 2014-15. The Ministry have stated the reason as follows:

"The target for suburban passenger traffic for the year 2014-15 was kept at 4582 million as against 4552.18 million achieved during the previous Financial Year i.e. 2013-14 representing an increase of 0.65%. As against this, the actual achievement in 2014-15 was 4505.03 million which was 1.68% less than the target and 1.04% less than the previous year's (2013-14) achievement. The decline in suburban passenger traffic during Financial Year 2014-15 as compared to previous year was due to various factors including changed norms of issue of Izzat MSTs, improvement in road infrastructure offering better and faster connectivity, diversion of passenger traffic to metro rail projects in cities etc."

16. Contrary to achieving growth targets many Zonal Railways viz. ER, SR and MR, Kolkata registered negative growth and there was no growth on other Zonal Railways viz. SCR, SER and WR. Further, overall growth in number of passengers in suburban section of the Indian Railways during 2014-15 was also negative as compared to the previous year 2013-14. The number of passenger carried during 2014-15 and 2015-16 was one per cent less than the previous years.

17. On being asked to explain the reasons for decrease in the number of suburban passengers during 2014-15 and 2015-16 in general and in case of ER, SR and Metro Railway, Kolkata in particular, the Ministry in their reply stated as under:

"The decline in suburban passenger traffic during Financial Year 2014-15 as compared to previous year was owing to various factors including changed norms of issue of Izzat MSTs, improvement in road infrastructure offering better and faster connectivity, diversion of passenger traffic to metro rail projects in cities etc. As far as decline in suburban traffic in Eastern Railway is concerned, the major reason was changed norms of Izzat MST. In Southern Railway, the suburban traffic declined primarily due to shift of passengers from season ticket to single journey tickets which can be attributed to change in fare structure and an increase in the number of share autos and mini buses and the permission for operating maxi cabs inside city limits of Chennai. In Metro Railway, Kolkata the increase in fare led to shift of passengers to road transport."

18. The Committee, therefore, desired to know the measures taken/contemplated by the Indian Railways to attract suburban passengers. The Railways in their replies submitted as under:

"Indian Railways continuously strive to improve suburban passenger traffic through following measures:-

- (i) Increasing the capacity of commuter systems.
- (ii) Monitoring punctuality of commuter trains.
- (iii) Utilising the services of ticketing agents like Jan Sadharan Ticket Booking Sewaks (JTBS), Station Ticket Booking Agents (STBA), Yatri Ticket Suvidha Kendra (YTSK) etc. Further, Automatic Ticket Vending Machines (ATVM) have been installed and the facility of booking of unreserved tickets through mobile phone apps has also been introduced to enable quick dispensation of tickets without passengers having to stand in queues.
- (iv) Increasing the frequency of trains etc.
- (v) Organizing intensive ticket checking drives including fortress checks etc. to discourage ticketless travel."

(b) Punctuality of Suburban Trains

19. Citizen's Charter of Indian Railways serves as a commitment to the citizens to provide safe and dependable train services. Punctuality of suburban trains is an important necessity for the daily commuters who mostly depends on suburban trains services. Punctuality performance reported by the General Managers of the concerned Zonal Railways to the Railway Board through their Periodical Confidential Demi-official letters revealed that the punctuality target of 95 per cent fixed (July 1986) by the Railway Board was achieved by all the Zonal Railways except CR and SR. The audit pointed out the reasons for not achieving punctuality targets set by the Railway Board by CR during the year 2012-15 and on SR during the years 2011-15 as cautious driving, accidents/derailments, signal failures and Unit shortage/defects etc. with signal failure being the reason in more than 50% cases of delay recorded with distinct reasons.

20. However, the Ministry of Railways in their submission have attributed the delays to factors beyond their control and have stated as under:

"Since there is no exclusive corridor for running suburban services, Indian Railways has to operationally balance all three streams of traffic i.e. suburban, long distance Mail/Express trains and freight trains on the same tracks. Some other factors which are beyond Railway's control like water logging during rainy season, accidents, law and order problems, etc. affect the punctuality of non-suburban trains and consequently affects the punctuality of suburban train services. Moreover, total no. of suburban trains are increasing every year within

the existing infrastructure. In addition, new Mail/Express trains are also introduced every year. These new services in the sub-urban corridor also affect the smooth running of suburban trains."

(c) Loss of lives of passengers in Suburban Train Services

21. Indian Railways in its Citizen's Charter made a commitment to provide safe and dependable train services to passengers. Audit observed that out of 15000 deaths every year on the Railway system, about 6000 deaths are on Mumbai suburban system only. Such large numbers of deaths were mainly attributed to unlawful trespassing. Audit further observed that trespassing takes place mainly on account of lack of barricading, fencing, inadequate number of pedestrian overbridges and reluctance to replace pedestrian level crossings with foot over bridges (FOBs) etc. Review of records to ascertain reasons for fatalities in CR, ER, SER, SCR, SR, WR and MR, Kolkata during the period January 2010 to December 2014, revealed that out of 33445 deaths, 19868 deaths (59 per cent) occurred due to line crossing / trespassing only. 17638 (52.74 per cent) death cases occurred in Mumbai suburban sections (both CR and WR) due to various reasons. In ER, it was found that 1014 passengers died due to hitting/crashing with poles. While 4885 deaths cases (15 per cent) out of 33445 occurred due to falling from running trains, 4002 deaths (82 per cent) occurred in Mumbai suburban section alone.

22. Audit pointed out that fencing between tracks was not provided at seven stations of CR (Bhandup, Ambarnath, Ulhasnagar, Mulund, Ghatkopar, Vikhroli and Sion), while at three stations (Kalva, Dombivli and Badlapur), the fencing was partially provided. In WR, fencing between tracks within station premises to prevent trespassing had not been provided at Mahim, Virar, Kelve Road, Palghar, Boisar and Dahanu Road stations. Further, highest 1117 deaths due to trespassing were reported on Jogeshwari- Dahisar section and 849 deaths on Mira Road- Virar section. On ER, out of 9949 deaths, 6307 (63.39 per cent) deaths were attributed to line crossing/ trespassing as fencing between tracks within station premises to prevent trespassing had not been provided at 30 out of 40 selected suburban stations of Howrah and Sealdah Divisions.

23. In view of the audit observations, the Committee enquired from the Railways whether the reasons of deaths/casualties of passengers have been analysed by the Railways to take effective preventive measure. The Ministry of Railways in their written replies have identified the following reasons:

- (a) "People have been found crossing railway tracks as a short cut without using Road Over Bridge, Road Under Bridge and Foot Over Bridge etc.
- (b) Pedestrians crossing multiple railway tracks, while using mobile phones, etc. in suburban sections.
- (c) Boarding and de-boarding in running trains.
- (d) Passengers falling from running trains while travelling on roof top, footboards, etc".

24. Further regarding the status of fencing between tracks, the Ministry of Railways in their written replies submitted as under:

"On Western Railway fencing between tracks has already been provided at all suburban stations between Churchgate-Virar at feasible locations. However, work between Virar-Dahanu Road stations will be planned in next financial year subject of availability of funds.

On Central Railway fencing in between track lines on station is done at few feasible locations and it is observed that few trackmen have been overrun, as they are not able to go to the other side due to installation of fencing and other side is platform. Since, the experience over the issue is limited, the work is planned on a programmed basis under wait and watch. This work of provision of fencing/railings between tracks has been entrusted to Mumbai Railway Vikas Corporation (MRVC) under Mumbai Urban Transport Project (MUTP)."

25. The Committee during the oral evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Railways desired to know the details of work undertaken by the Mumbai Railway Vikas Corporation (MRVC). The Ministry of Railways submitted as under:

"MRVC is undertaking work of trespassing control on 12 stations. Out of that work has been completed on 03 stations viz. Nalasopara, Vasai, Kanjurmarg (in Mumbai). Work at remaining stations is expected to be completed by December, 2016. The work that's being done include Foot Over Bridges, skywalks, fencing, boundary walls etc. Further in 2014 a study was outsourced to J.J. School of Architecture, Mumbai regarding mid-section trespassing. They have identified 131 locations where trespassing takes place. Out of them 30 locations have been identified as critical from point of view of injuries and deaths. Out of said 30

locations and an estimate of work to be done on 22 locations has been prepared by the Railways amounting to Rs.550 crores and sent to the Board for approval. Out of remaining 08 stations work at 04 stations has been done out of their present sanctioned amounts. At 02 other locations, consultancy firms have been hired to help with designs. At last at 02 stations situation of trespassing no longer exists due to construction of Foot Over Bridge." (Annexures A, B and C)

26. The Committee were skeptical that whether the proposed amount of Rs. 500 crore would be sufficient to complete the trespassing control work given the financial strains faced by the Railways. A representative of the Ministry of Railways informed the Committee during their deposition that 50% of the loan of Rs. 550 crore shall be repaid to the World Bank by levying surcharge on local commuters in Mumbai. The remaining 50% amount shall be divided equally between the Railways and State Government.

27. The Committee further desired to know from the Ministry of Railways about the instant steps taken by the Railway Board to prevent the deaths of passengers in suburban sections. The Railways in their reply stated as under:

"The following measures are taken to prevent deaths due to line crossing/ trespassing:-

1. Announcements are being made through public announcement system and also given wide publicity in mass media by concerned department about the impending dangers and resultant penalties.
2. Special awareness campaigns are also organized by the Railways to sensitize the passengers about the dangers of roof travelling and foot-board travelling.
3. Warning boards cautioning people against climbing and touching Over Head Equipments are displayed at vantage points in station areas.
4. Regular drives are conducted against the persons travelling on roof-top and foot-boards of trains and the persons apprehended are prosecuted under the relevant provisions of the Railway Act, 1989.
5. To prevent climbing upon the rooftop of any train, ladder was removed from the end panel of all coaches.
6. Railway Protection Force staff are deployed at various locations to check trespassing.
7. "Anmol Jeevan" - a concerted effort by School children, NGOs, RPF and Commercial departments - is organized at regular intervals for the awareness of passengers over Central Railway.
8. Drives named "Track Suraksha Jeevan Raksha" by the RPF and "Naya Jeevan Nayi Aasha" by the Commercial Department have been launched over

suburban section of Mumbai with the help of NGOs, Scouts and Lion Club etc. in the Western Railway.

9. Necessary signboards/posters regarding "Do not cross railway line" & "Don't travel on roof top/foot board" are in place on platforms/ station premises, for the awareness of passengers.
10. Regular drives are conducted against trespassers under the provisions of the Railways Act, 1989.
11. 154 unauthorised entry/exit points and 139 unauthorised entry/exit points have been identified over Central and Western Railway respectively and action, to plugging these entry/exit points, have been initiated.
12. 51 run over prone areas have been identified and boundary walls or fencing have been erected in the Southern Railway.
13. Awareness campaigns have been launched by RPF/Southern Railway with the help of film actor, celebrity through the media and through NGOs in rural areas.
14. Special drive named 'Sneha' to prevent suicide on tracks has been launched with the help of NGO in Southern Railway.

Zone-wise position of prosecution under section 147 over CR, ER, SER, SCR, SR and WR during the above period is as under:

Zone	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016 (upto June)	Total
CR	31799	16994	20814	22251	21753	21255	15117	149983
ER	3302	3430	3470	3650	3661	5288	4215	27016
SER	1655	1738	4158	3795	6430	6867	1456	26099
SCR	6073	6582	5953	5689	6421	5904	3208	39830
SR	4892	5363	7494	6160	3523	6238	4111	37781
WR	65627	52268	50902	47053	41501	37861	21109	316321
Total								597030

28. The Committee desired to know about the source of information regarding deaths/casualties on railway tracks. A representative of the Ministry during evidence informed the Committee as under:

"Our safety branch have full data whatever comes under the definition of accidents, we receive full data on that. We do not have a system of keeping the data of Trespassing.....GRP is the source for providing such data".

The Ministry of Railways further informed that records pertaining to deaths due to accidents in Sub-urban Railways are maintained by the GRP of the concerned state.

However, in case of train accidents as defined in the rules, medical department maintains the record of death/injury.

(d) Medical Care for Accident Victims

29. While dealing with Public Interest Litigations, Hon'ble Bombay High Court directed the Railway administration to take preventive measures to check death of passengers on tracks. It further directed (November 2014) CR and WR to make available ambulances at all suburban stations of Mumbai for the help of passengers. Hon'ble Bombay High Court also directed (November 2014) the Railway administration to set up Emergency Medical Rooms at all suburban Stations, similar to "Trauma Care Centre" already set up at Dadar (CR) in March 2011. In response, Railway administration had agreed (December 2014) to setup Emergency Medical Rooms (EMRs) on 15 suburban stations (CR and WR). Audit scrutiny revealed that of 37 selected stations (CR-15 and WR-22) of Mumbai suburban section, ambulance service was not available at 10 of these selected stations (CR-6 and WR-4) while, Emergency Medical Rooms had not been provided at any of the Mumbai suburban stations except at Dadar (CR). The CR had decided (December 2014) to set up Emergency Medical Rooms (EMR) at eight suburban stations (Kurla, Wadala Road, Vashi, Panvel, Dombivali, Kalyan, Karjat and Thane) on the Main and Harbour lines within six months.

30. In view of the adverse audit observations pertaining to matter of emergency medical care, the Committee sought clarification from the Railways. The Railways submitted as under:

"Audit has raised the following three issues:-

- (i) Availability of Ambulance services is not ensured at every suburban station in Mumbai.
- (ii) Expired medicines were not replaced in the First Aid Boxes at certain stations.
- (iii) Emergency Response Rooms have not been established at selected suburban stations in Mumbai.

As regards Item No. (i) above, the Audit contention is that provision of ambulance services are not available at every suburban stations in general and Mumbai

suburbs in particular. However, this contention of Audit is only partially correct. Availability of ambulance services at suburban stations is to be arranged from Railway hospitals to the extent possible only. At other suburban stations this facility is provided through the ambulance services of the State Government/ Municipal authorities. This provision is being ensured at all suburban stations as per need.

As far as availability of expired medicines in First Aid Boxes at two stations is concerned, this is only an aberration. However, this is a serious issue and needs to be eradicated. Therefore, all the Zonal Railways/ Production Units are being advised to ensure that the medicines in the First Aid Boxes should be checked and any medicine nearing expiry date should be replaced before its date of expiry.

Regarding establishment of Emergency Response Rooms also, the Audit contention is only partially correct. Hon'ble High Court at Mumbai had directed Railways to consider the establishment of Emergency Medical Centres at each of those Mumbai suburban stations where more than 100 accidents have taken place in the year 2012. Accordingly, Indian Railways have setup Emergency Medical Centres at 14 suburban stations (4 on Central Railway and 10 on Western Railway)."

31. On being specifically asked by the Committee about the facilities available at Suburban Railway Stations for accident victims and steps being taken to enhance the Medical facilities to provide emergency treatment facilities to the accident victims, the Ministry in their reply have stated as under:

"First Aid Boxes are available at all stations including the Suburban Railway Stations of Mumbai. In addition to this, Ambulance services (108 Ambulance service) are available at all suburban stations of the Western Railway and 22 stations of the Central Railway. As per directions of Hon'ble High Court at Mumbai, Emergency Medical Room (EMR) facilities have already been provided at 17 such suburban stations."

32. Further in view of the audit observation that the CR had decided (December 2014) to set up Emergency Medical Rooms (EMR) at eight suburban stations (Kurla, Wadala Road, Vashi, Panvel, Dombivalli, Kalyan, Karjat and Thane) on the Main and Harbour lines within six months, the Committee enquired about the action taken for setting up of such Emergency Medical Rooms in. The Ministry in their reply stated as under:

"Central Railway has provided Emergency Medical Response (EMR) facilities at Wadala Road, Panvel, Dombivli, Kalyan and Thane while provision of EMR facilities on remaining locations (Kurla, Vashi and Karjat) is in progress."

33. The Committee also enquired about the role RPF play in case of accidents in STS. The Railways informed as under:

"Wherever RPF personnel are present at railway stations or in running trains, they make efforts to get injured person admitted to hospital without waiting for written memo from any railway official. If necessary, they arrange for transportations of injured person(s), obtain bill and submit to their officers for reimbursement. If the injured passengers are accompanied by friends, colleagues or members of the family, RPF personnel render necessary help to them to go to the nearest doctor or hospital. In-charge of concerned RPF Post ensures this. After admission of the passenger to the hospital, the concerned RPF personnel give injury report to the GRP for appropriate legal action."

34. When enquired about the press/media reports that many claims of unclaimed accident victims are made by unknown persons who are not relatives of the victims in collusion with municipality/ railway staff. The Committee were informed by the Ministry of Railways as under:

"Information regarding fraudulent claims, if any, is being collected from the Zonal Railways and RCT and will be submitted for information of the Committee in due course. So far as curbing this unlawful activity/fraudulent claim, provision for punishment of imprisonment for a term upto 3 years for filing false claims has been prescribed in section 148 of the Railway Act, 1989."

35. In reply to a query of the Committee regarding average time gap of pendency of cases (age - wise pendency) in all 21 benches of Railway Claims Tribunal (RCT) located at 19 cities of India (Delhi and Kolkata having 2 benches each) and reasons for pendency the Railways informed as under:

Table - I

Age-Wise Pendency of Accident Claims Cases in all 21 Benches of Railway Claims Tribunal as on 31.10.2016.							
Type of Case	Less than 1 year old	1 year old	2 year old	3 year old	4 year old	5 year old and above	Total
Accident	41	22	25	04	15	28	135
Untoward Incident	6946	6859	6092	5189	4651	6788	36525
Total	6987	6881	6117	5193	4666	6816	36660

Table - II

Average Time Taken in Disposal of ACCIDENT & UNTOWARD INCIDENT CASES during the last 3 years (2013-14, 2014-15, 2015-16 and upto 30.06.2016)				
S.No.	Bench	Total Disposal of Cases	Total No. of Days Taken in Disposal of Cases	Average Time Taken (in Days)
1	Delhi (2)	1267	701300	554
2	Chandigarh	810	629522	777
3	Lucknow	1423	2630035	1848
4	Gorakhpur	1701	3391923	1994
5	Ghaziabad	1149	1397470	1216
6	Kolkata (2)	1905	622292	327
7	Bhubaneswar	1172	2235577	1908
8	Guwahati	242	36500	151
9	Patna	2747	1762522	642
10	Ranchi	745	642444	862
11	Mumbai	3171	4630384	1460
12	Ahmedabad	1767	2575117	1457
13	Bhopal	1520	2142330	1409
14	Jaipur	631	859890	1363
15	Nagpur	844	1585087	1878
16	Chennai	1017	273445	269
17	Bangalore	587	593500	1011
18	Secunderbad	1015	1516386	1494
19	Ernakulam	235	67112	286
Total		23948	28292836	1181

(e) Pendency of cases of accidents and untoward incidents claim cases

36. The number of cases pending for compensation claims of accidental victims at Railway Claims Tribunals during the period under review were 10774 including 4623 in CR and 3445 in WR for many years. The latest position in respect of number of Claims

Tribunal and pendency of claims was obtained from the Railways. There are 21 (Twenty one) Benches of Railway Claims Tribunal (RCT) situated in 19 cities of India (Kolkata and Delhi having two benches each). Bench-wise pendency of accident and untoward incident claim cases as on 31.07.2016 is as under:

	BENCH	Pendency of Accident and Untoward Incident Claim Cases as on 31.07.2016
1	Delhi (2)	424
2	Chandigarh	633
3	Lucknow	9359
4	Gorakhpur	3457
5	Ghaziabad	2047
6	Kolkata (2)	2029
7	Bhubaneswar	994
8	Guwahati	718
9	Patna	2754
10	Ranchi	141
11	Mumbai	6055
12	Ahmedabad	524
13	Bhopal	2250
14	Jaipur	1255
15	Nagpur	988
16	Chennai	79
17	Bangalore	618
18	Secunderabad	3279
19	Ernakulam	95
	Total	37699

37. The Committee desired to know the actions taken by the Railways to dispose of claims by Tribunal at faster pace. The Railways in their written reply submitted as under:

"The main reason for high pendency of claims cases in RCT is that settlement of claim cases being a judicial process, the legal procedure adopted is a time-consuming process which involves different stages for completion of statutory and other formalities. These include: investigation by G.R.P./RPF, filing of written statements, tendering of evidence, summoning of witness, arguments and adjournment sought by the contestants for producing evidence, cross-examination of claimant's documentary evidence, transfer of cases from one Bench to the other sought by the claimants, non-availability of heirship title with the claimants, etc.

Circuit Benches are held on the direction of Hon'ble Chairman/RCT at Benches where the posts of Members are vacant and pendency is comparatively higher. Action has been taken to fillup the vacancies of Members (both Judicial and Technical) and it is expected to accelerate the disposal of cases. Vigorous efforts are being made to fillup the vacancies of other supporting staff in various Benches of RCT. As a result of effort made to fast-track the pending cases, the rate of disposal of claim cases has improved. A total of 36660 accident claim cases are pending in all benches of RCT as on 31.10.2016 as against 37699 accident claim cases as on 31.07.2016."

(f) Speed Restrictions and late running of trains

38. A number of permanent and temporary speed restrictions are imposed every year and several permanent speed restrictions continue for years together due to existence of certain engineering constraints. Speed restrictions result in longer running time of train services thereby reducing availability of path in the heavily congested suburban sections. The main reasons for the speed restrictions were identified as follows:

- (i) Weak condition of track - 116 - [SR (20), ER (61) and WR (35)],
- (ii) Land Encroachment along the Railway tracks – ER (06)
- (iii) Level crossing etc. - 250 [CR (125), ER (62), SCR (13), SR (29), SER (3) and WR (1), Metro Railway, Kolkata (17)].
- (iv) Points and crossings - 23 - [ER (12) and WR (11)] and
- (v) Weak Bridges - 7 - [ER (2), SER (3) and WR (2)].

Permanent speed restrictions on suburban sections of Indian Railways increased from 384 (2010-11) to 402 (2014-15). There was four per cent reduction in the number of permanent speed restrictions on CR, SR and WR and increase in the number of permanent speed restrictions on ER and Metro Railway, Kolkata. Audit observed that the nature of reasons attributed to speed restrictions and their persistence for years indicated that the Indian Railways could not initiate effective remedial measures to withdraw speed restrictions and thus speeding up the suburban train services.

39. However, the Ministry of Railways in their replies have attributed speed restrictions to geographical constraints and expressed their inability to remove speed restrictions citing it both economically unviable and infeasible. The Railways have stated as under:

"Temporary Speed Restrictions (TSRs) are imposed for short duration to carry out planned track renewals works, emergent works etc. These TSRs are removed once work is completed. Permanent Speed Restrictions (PSRs) are imposed due to existence of certain site constraints which continue till constraints are removed/eased out. Sometimes, it is not possible to remove these constraints due to peculiar site conditions.

In Suburban section, relaxation of majority of PSRs is neither economically viable nor feasible broadly due to following reasons:

A number of Permanent Speed Restrictions have been continuing due to engineering constraints and geographical conditions viz. sharp curves, point & crossings taking off from transition of curves and inadequate SE in point & crossings on transition curves or compound curves. Relaxation of such PSRs will require acquisition of land which is not possible as many multi-storied residential buildings are existing nearby the track. Further, cost of acquisition of land and structure will be prohibitive even if attempted. At some locations major yard remodeling is required to relax the PSRs which will adversely affect functioning of major installations.

During the current financial year 2016-17, Eastern Railway & Western Railway have planned for removal/relaxation of 3 Nos Permanent Speed Restriction each in suburban routes. South Eastern Railway has planned for removal of five Speed Restrictions in their suburban section.

Overall on Indian Railways, 260 & 291 Permanent Speed Restrictions have been removed/relaxed during 2014-15 & 2015-16. For the current financial year 2016-17, against target of 213 Permanent Speed Restrictions", 99 have been removed/relaxed (upto October, 2016). Temporary Speed Restrictions (TSRs) are also imposed for short duration to carry out planned track renewal works, emergent works and to take care of emergency safety requirements etc. which are removed after necessary work/rectification is completed."

(g) Maintenance of tracks

40. Proper maintenance of track is an important factor for smooth suburban train operations as poor condition of track results in imposition of speed restrictions and risk of derailment and consequent losses. During rainy season poor drainage on tracks

causes flooding, often leading to delay and or cancellation of trains. Railway Board does not allot funds separately to Zonal Railways for suburban section. As a result, details of utilization of funds for suburban and non-suburban sections are not maintained separately by Zonal Railways.

41. Audit review of records to ascertain status of planning and execution of track related works on suburban sections undertaken during 2010-11 to 2014-15 revealed that:

"Central Railway

The targets fixed for execution of track renewal works as well as other track related works connected with the improvement in the condition of track in the suburban sections during 2010-11 to 2014-15 were not achieved in most of the works. The shortfall ranged from 10.14 to 97.00 per cent. In the enquiry report on derailment of a suburban train at Titwala station in March 2014, the Commissioner of Railway Safety stated that the speeding train derailed due to poor track maintenance and breakage of couplers that connect coaches. Further, in June 2015, it was reported that a deep crater formed in between two railway tracks on the Kalyan- Ambarnath section which was detected in the early morning led to cancellation of a few suburban services besides delay of several trains.

South Eastern Railway

The targets fixed for execution of track related works on suburban section were not achieved except in respect of supply of ballast. The shortfall ranged from 15 to 59 per cent during the review period. Further, it was observed that Zonal administration did not maintain details of allotment and utilization of funds for suburban and non-suburban sections separately during 2010-11 to 2014-15.

Metro Railway, Kolkata

Thirteen works were completed at a cost Rs. 37.93 crore against the initial sanctioned cost of Rs. 32.33 crore involving cost overrun of Rs. 5.60 crore and time overrun which ranged between 3 months and 27 months.

Western Railway

Target fixed for Through Sleeper Renewal and Through fittings renewal were not achieved during 2010-11 to 2014-15. Targets for Through Weld Renewal had not been fixed since April 2012, and available data did not reveal any work having been carried out on this account. During the period 2013-2015, 70 cases of weld failures had been reported. The consolidated Budget grant and expenditure pertaining to Plan Head 31 i.e. Track renewal was maintained for Mumbai

Central Division. Further, it was also observed that in the years 2010-11, 2011-12 and 2014-15, funds allotted were not fully utilized as evident from savings of Rs.7 crore, Rs.16.98 crore and Rs.1.12 crore respectively reported during these years. Non-achievement of the targets set for track related works on the suburban sections of all the Zonal Railways indicate that Indian Railways could not monitor the on-going works which led to deficiencies in track maintenance affecting punctuality and safe operations of suburban services."

42. Railways in their replies have taken the defense of imposing suitable speed restrictions in case of non-renewal of tracks in time as under:

"Track maintenance is a continuous activity, which is to be undertaken by Track Machines and through trackmen. Track maintenance is also done by Track renewals which are planned in advance every year and their execution is prioritized according to conditions of track and overall availability of funds ensuring all the time that the track is in a sound condition for safe running of trains. In case, if any stretch of track is not renewed in time due to various reasons including scarcity of funds, material etc., suitable speed restrictions is imposed to ensure safe running of trains."

(h) Land Encroachment and Level Crossings

43. Railway Board decided (November 2002) that the term "safety zone" in the context of removal of encroachments along the track for areas coming under Mumbai Urban Transport Project will be "land within 10 metres on either side of the centre line of the extreme future track". Audit have pointed out that there are a large number of locations on the suburban sections where hutments have encroached upon Railway land. At many locations these hutments were close to the running lines or along the Railway track hampering smooth operation of services due to speed restrictions, accumulation of garbage and drainage problems etc. Failure on the part of the Railway administration to protect their land from encroachments had resulted in imposition of speed restrictions and consequential delay in train operations. There were 152 encroachments in safety zone till March 2015. The Railway Act does not permit rehabilitation of the hutment dwellers that have encroached upon Railway land. As a result of this, removal of encroachers was often delayed. In Mumbai, it was observed that Mumbai Railway Vikas Corporation had undertaken rehabilitation of the 2839 project affected households who had encroached upon Railway land required for development of suburban Railway

infrastructure at a sanctioned cost of Rs. 124 crores. Till March 2015, Rs. 18.90 crores had been incurred for this purpose.

44. The Committee desired to know the policy of Railway Board for removal of encroachment in safety zones and problem being faced by the Railways in removal of encroachment in safety zones with action taken or contemplated to be taken to remove the constraint. The Railways submitted as under:

"Railways carry out regular surveys and take action for removal of encroachment on Railway land including safety zone. If the encroachments are of a temporary nature (soft encroachment) in the shape of jhuggies, jhopries and squatters, the same are got removed in consultation and with assistance of Railway Protection Force and local civil authorities. For old encroachments, where encroachers are not amenable to persuasion, action is taken under Public Premises (Eviction of Unauthorized Occupants) Act, 1971 (PPE Act, 1971). Actual eviction of unauthorized occupants is carried out with the assistance of State Government and police.

The constraints in the removal of the encroachments are as follows:

- i) Non availability of assistance of city police and local authorities several times due to their engagement in other issues.
- ii) Occupants create hindrance with the assistance/involvement of local leaders/politicians during the eviction and demolition of the structures.
- iii) Legal proceedings taken against Railway officials by the encroachers including notices under 80 GPC.

The issues in removal of encroachments are raised from time to time in various fora with State Government. Ministry of Railways has also suggested in consultation with Ministry of Law and Justice some amendments in Public Premises (Eviction of Unauthorized Occupants) Act, 1971 (PPE Act, 1971) to Ministry of Urban Development to make it more effective."

45. However, on the issue of resettlement and rehabilitation (R&R) of persons living on Railway land, the Railways passed on the onus to the State Government under the aegis of housing being a State subject. The reply submitted by the Railways is as under:

"Housing being a State subject, resettlement and rehabilitation (R&R) of persons living on Railway land is the responsibility of State Government. As such, Railways do not have any policy for resettlement and rehabilitation of the slum dwellers."

46. Level Crossings pose a serious challenge to operation of safe, reliable and efficient train services. Existence of a large number of level crossings adversely affects smooth operations and punctuality of suburban train services. Vision 2020 document of Indian Railways (December 2009) had observed that nearly 70 per cent of the fatalities in Railway mishaps took place at unmanned level crossings and therefore, envisaged elimination of Unmanned Level Crossings by March 2015. Audit scrutiny, however, revealed that during the review period 2010-15, out of 922 Level Crossings as on 31/03/2010 on the suburban sections of six Zonal Railways, 908 Level Crossings were not closed [CR- 47, ER-653, SCR-3, SER- 127 (66 manned and 61 unmanned), SR- 58 (55 manned and 3 unmanned) and WR-20]. It was also found that to eliminate the level crossings, work on 139 Road over bridges (ROBs)/ Road under bridges (RUBs) had been taken up between 1997-98 and 2014-15 at an estimated cost of Rs.3879.93 crores, out of these, only 14 ROBs/RUBs were completed during 2010-15.

47. In view of large number of level crossings (manned and unmanned) not being closed by the Railways, the Committee enquired about the action taken to ensure safety of commuters in unmanned Level Crossings. The Ministry of Railways in their reply submitted as under:

"It is the endeavor of Railways to progressively eliminate all unmanned level crossings by Closure/Merger/Provision of Subways/Manning through a phased programme with the available resources. Besides this, other measures taken are:

- Provision of basic infrastructure at all unmanned level crossings,
- Periodic inspection of such crossings to ensure the above,
- Education of road users through social awareness campaigns with the use of print and electronic media,
- SMS campaigns to create awareness amongst road users."

48. On the question of implementation of the action plan for removal of 908 level crossings in suburban section, the Railways in their reply have stated as under:

"Railway intends to eliminate all unmanned level crossings on Broad Gauge in next 3-4 years by Closure/Merger/Provision of Subways/Manning, subject to availability of funds."

IV. Status of Rolling Stock

(a) Delay in Commissioning of Coaches

49. Every year, Zonal Railways project their requirements for rolling stock based on which allotments are made. After allotment and receipt of Mainline Electric Multiple Unit/Diesel Electric Multiple Unit coaches by zones, the same are sent to car shed/maintenance depots for testing of equipment, conducting trial runs etc. Simultaneously, Operating Department plans and notifies the schedule for introduction of services. Though no time limit was prescribed by the Railway Board for pre-testing before induction of trains/coaches, a time limit of 30 days from the date of their receipt was assessed as adequate by audit for pre-testing and commissioning of new coaches.

50. In view of the fact that no standard time line was prescribed by the Railway Board for pre-testing before induction of trains/coaches, the Committee enquired from the Ministry whether there is any plan to prescribe such time limit by the Railways. The Ministry in their reply submitted as under:

"At present, no specific time line has been prescribed within which a coach may be commissioned after receipt. During the year 2015-16, 384 EMU coaches have been received and commissioned within an average time of 16 calendar days. Prescription of a time-limit is under consideration in the Ministry."

51. Further on being asked by the Committee about the measures taken by the Railway Board to minimize the delay in commissioning of coaches, the Railways submitted as under:

"On certain occasions, Commissioning of new Rolling stock takes time for oscillation trials and sanction of Commissioner of Railway Safety.

However, Railways make all efforts to commission the coaches without delay. Also abnormal delay in commissioning beyond a month is reviewed at higher level for intervention.

Pre-dispatch quality checks have been strengthened by Production units (PU). Continuous efforts are being made to turn out the rakes from PU without any defects so that Zonal Railways can commission the rake within minimum time."

(b) Detention of EMU Coaches Beyond Permissible Limit In Workshops/Car Sheds

52. Audit observed that all Periodical Overhaul (POH) activities for an EMU Coach are to be completed within a period of 12-16 days and 25 days for coaches running on Metro Rail, Kolkata. However, EMU Coaches on seven Zonal railways are being detained beyond permissible limit. This has resulted in non-availability of coaches for service for period ranging between 1 to 91 days and loss of earning capacity of Rs.106.56 crore during the period of review.

53. On being asked about the main reasons for detention of EMU coaches beyond the permissible time limit, the Railways in their reply submitted as under:

"During POH of coaches, apart from the regular overhauling activities, some additional works are required to be done to improve safety, reliability depending upon the physical condition of coaches. Additional works like corrosion repair, reconditioning of Traction Motor and electrics etc. are required to be done based upon the condition of coaches. These additional works lead to increase in the number of repair days of EMUs in the workshop. During 2015-16 all Railways have turned out EMU coaches with normal POH activities without additional repairs within an average of 21 working days. However, POH of EMU coaches with additional works like corrosion repair, body panel repair, sole bar attention etc. takes extra time depending on the quantum of work. Railways are being advised to adhere to an average time limit of 21 working days for normal POH activities."

54. However, the Railways denied any dereliction of duty in this regard and submitted as under before the Committee:

"There has been no case of dereliction of duty. POH of coaches which require additional repairs, takes extra time. Railways continuously monitor the time taken for POH activities and take corrective action to complete normal POH activities as well as additional repairs taking the optimum time."

55. The Committee desired to know the action plan to minimise the detention of EMU Coaches beyond permissible limit. The Ministry in their reply submitted as under:

"Workshops have been advised to review infrastructure facilities, availability of spare major sub assemblies, other material and manpower to complete normal POH activities as well as additional repair works within an optimum time."

56. On being asked by the Committee about the monitoring system for completing the POH activities within permissible time, the Ministry submitted as under:

"Workshops Management monitor the work done during POH of coach on daily basis. Time line for different POH activities are being decided by Workshops. Daily progress review meetings are being held in workshops after monitoring the progress of work."

(c) Failure within 100 Days of Periodical Overhaul (POH)

57. Monitoring of the quality of POH activities is essential to ensure that all deficiencies in the coaches are attended to before the coach is put into service. Audit pointed out that out of 16896 coaches which underwent POH during 2010-15, 5160 coaches reported sick within 100 days of POH. 1529 coaches (29.63 per cent) failed within 10 days of their POH which included 566 coaches (37 per cent) in WR alone. Failure of coaches within 100 days of POH revealed that POH carried out in workshops on CR, ER and WR was not upto the mark due to poor workmanship.

58. Since failure of coaches within 100 days of periodical overhaul put a question mark on the reliability of POH process, the Committee desired to know about the steps contemplated by the Railway Board to minimise such failures of coaches and investigation done by the railways in the matter. The Ministry in their reply stated as under:

"There are a very few cases in which coaches were marked sick and substitute coach was given for service because of defect within 100 days of POH. During 2015-16 such sick marking of coach were almost nil. However, minor defects are being noticed during 100 days of POH in which defects are being attended by car sheds during schedule attention.

All types of defects occurring in EMU coaches within 100 days of POH are being monitored in Car sheds. Regular feedback is given to workshops. Reliability action plan comprising RDSO modifications/ Special Maintenance Instructions are being implemented during POH to reduce failures. Replacement of must change items during POH is monitored by workshops. All defects within 100 days

are also discussed during POH coordination meeting between car sheds and workshops and action plan is being drawn to reduce such failures by workshops.

No major defects have been noticed within 100 days of POH which require sick marking of coaches. However, reports on all types of failures within 100 days of POH are sent by car sheds to POH Workshop and responsibility is fixed on the concerned staff for bad workmanship, if any."

V. Amenities to Suburban Passengers

59. Audit had observed that Railway Board issued (January, 2007 and September, 2012) comprehensive instructions on provision of passenger amenities for different categories of stations including suburban stations (Category 'C' stations). Some of the important minimum essential passenger amenities to be provided at suburban stations were booking facilities, drinking water facilities, seating arrangements, platform shelters, high level platforms, urinals and latrines, lighting, fans, time table display, clock, water cooler, public address system and electronic train indicator board etc. In addition to the above, escalators/elevators, were also to be provided at all C category suburban stations and stations of tourist importance under 'Desirable Amenities'. Further, Minister of Railways announced (February 2009) that some stations would be developed as 'Adarsh Stations' where improvement in ticketing, circulating area, signages, easy access and exit will be focused upon, with a view to provide enhanced level of passenger facilities within a year. Accordingly, Railway Board had issued various instructions from time to time regarding amenities to be provided at Adarsh stations. Out of the 578 suburban stations, 153 (including 81 Adarsh Stations) were selected for test check to ascertain compliance with Railway Board's instructions regarding provision of passenger amenities. Audit Scrutiny revealed that Minimum Essential Amenities as per prescribed norms and also certain facilities envisaged for provision at Adarsh Stations were not provided some of which are detailed below:

(a) Ticket Booking Facilities

There was shortfall in provision of booking counters as per norms under Minimum Essential Amenities at 51 stations inspected on six Zonal Railways. Automatic Ticket Vending Machines were not provided at 13 suburban stations in two Zonal Railways (ER-12 and SR-1). Smart card sale counters had not been

provided at 15 stations in three Zonal Railways (ER-12, SER-2 and SR-1). The status of booking facility in three Zonal Railways revealed the following:

Western Railways

During Joint Inspection at 15 suburban stations of WR, it was observed that many ticket windows remained shut down due to shortage of staff. Long queue of passengers for tickets were noticed at some stations despite Automatic Ticket Vending Machines (ATVMs) having been provided. This indicated that usage of ATVMs has not been adequately propagated or the equipment provided was not user friendly. The number of ATVMs provided at suburban stations had increased from 195 to 457 during the period 2012-13 to 2014-15.

South Central Railways

Only one booking counter as against the Railway Board orders for 4 booking counters had been provided at C category stations viz. Dabirpura, Hitech City, Lakdikapul, Vidyanagar, Arts College and Borabanda stations.

Eastern Railways

564 booking windows and 95 ATVMs only had been provided at the 284 suburban stations handling 27 lakh daily commuters with an average of 2 booking windows per station.

(b) Provision of Toilets

Out of 153 selected stations inspected, gents toilets had not been provided at five stations in two Zonal Railways (CR -1 and SR-4) while ladies toilets had not been provided at all on 32 suburban stations of three Zonal Railways (CR-1, ER-5 and SR-26). Though urinals for ladies were provided at 28 suburban stations of ER, they were not as per norms which mandate that one-third of total number of toilets provided should be for ladies. Further, it was observed that urinals for physically challenged persons were not provided at 109 stations of six Zonal Railways (CR-4, ER-32, SCR-15, SER-16, SR-26 and WR-16). In WR, 125 complaints were received and penalty of Rs. 1.36 lakh was recovered during the period 2012-13 to 2014-15 from Pay and Use toilet contractors for unclean and dirty toilets and not maintaining cleanliness in toilets as per terms and conditions of the contract.

(c) **Foot Over Bridges (FOBs)**

One FOB of six meter width was required to be provided at all suburban stations. It was observed that FOBs of the prescribed size had not been provided at all at five stations (ER-4 and SR-1).

(d) **Level of Platforms**

As per Para 411 of the Indian Railways Work Manual, the height of platform on Broad Gauge route is 840 mm above Rail level in case of suburban stations. This was further revised to 840 mm - 920 mm for Mumbai suburban platforms. It was, however, observed that High Level platforms (range of 760 mm to 840 mm) had not been provided at eight stations on two Zonal Railways (ER-6 and SER-2) while high level platform in revised range of 840 mm to 920 mm for Mumbai suburban platforms had not been provided at 26 stations on two Zonal Railways (CR-4 and WR-22). Government Railway Police records of the suburban sections show that as many as 347 (CR-25, ER-167, SCR-1, SER-80, SR-13 and WR-61) people died after falling in the gap between platform and Electric Multiple Unit (EMU) footboard during the period January 2010 to December 2014. The gaps between platforms and footboards of the trains were noticed at 91 out of 153 suburban stations test checked. In WR, raising the height of 7 out of 16 platforms at six stations, 19 sanctioned during 2014-15, had been completed. In CR, the work of raising the height of 14 platforms was in progress, while work on 35 platforms had not yet commenced (July 2015).

(e) **Length of platforms to accommodate 12 coach EMU Trains**

It was observed that the length of 39 platforms was inadequate to accommodate 12 Coach EMU trains at 20 selected stations 25 of five Zonal Railways (CR- 9 PFs of 3 stations, ER- 1 platform of 1 station, SER- 2 platforms of 1 Station, SR- 25 platforms of 12 stations and WR- 4 platforms of 3 stations). Besides, surface of 118 platforms at 28 selected stations was uneven and was not conducive to mechanized cleaning.

(f) **Provision of fencing/railings between tracks within stations premises**

Fencing /railings between tracks within station premises to prevent trespassing had not been provided at 61 stations on four Zonal Railways (CR-10, ER-30, SCR-15 and WR-6).

(g) **Lifts/Escalators**

Lifts/Escalators were to be provided at Adarsh suburban stations (subject to feasibility). This amenity was not provided at 72 out of 81 selected stations of five Zonal Railways (CR-6, ER 36, SER-19, SR-4 and WR-7). Minister for Railways in her budget speech (July 2009) had stated that Railways would provide lifts and escalators to facilitate movement of physically challenged and aged persons. It was, however, observed that while lifts had not been provided at any suburban stations, escalators were provided at eight suburban stations viz. Dombivli (CR), Dum Dum (ER), Kharagpur, Panskura (SER), Tambaram (SR) and Dadar, Andheri, Vileparle and Borivali stations on (WR). Ramps for physically challenged passengers were also not provided at 55 out of 81 selected Adarsh stations of five Zonal Railways (CR-5, ER-24, SER-18, SR-2 and WR-6).

60. In view of the aforesaid audit observations the Committee enquired from the Railways about the facilities being provided for passenger amenities for suburban train /Stations and measure contemplated to rectify the deficiencies noticed in suburban trains and at suburban Stations. The Railways in their reply have stated as under:

“For provision of the amenities in an objective manner, the stations have been classified into seven categories viz. ‘A1’, ‘A’, ‘B’, ‘C’, ‘D’, ‘E’ & ‘F’ based on the annual earnings from passenger traffic of the stations. When a station is constructed, certain Minimum Essential Amenities are required to be provided at stations at all times. The Minimum Essential Amenities are dependent upon category of the station. Facilities like Booking offices, high level platforms, platform shelters, drinking water arrangements, toilets urinals, seating arrangements and time table display, water cooler etc. are Minimum Essential Amenities, which are required to be provided at all suburban stations. Further, Electronic Train Indication Boards, Escalators, Pay and Use toilets, ATMs are desirable amenities at sub-urban stations. Whenever any deficiency/defect in any amenity is noticed either as a part of inspection(s) or otherwise, quick action is taken for its rectification.

Minimum Essential Amenities are provided for sub-urban stations (C Category) such as: Booking facilities, drinking water facilities, seating arrangements, platform shelters, high level platform, urinals and latrines, lighting, fans, time table display, clocks water cooler, public address system and electronic train indicator boards etc.’

In view of the increased expectations of the passenger/daily commuters, Indian Railways are making all out efforts to provide various facilities at the stations. It has always been the endeavor of the Railways to provide adequate amenities to the passengers at the stations. Improvement in passenger amenities is a continuous process and new works are taken up to upgrade the facilities at stations based on perceived demand and availability of funds. However,

instructions have been issued to all Zonal Railways for rectification of shortfall in Minimum Essential Amenities, if any, by December, 2016."

61. The Railways provided the details of reasons of deaths and injuries to passengers travelling on Western Railways and Central Railways during the study visit of the Committee to Mumbai. It was observed that during the year 2016 (Jan-September) while falling from running trains was second highest reason of deaths (WR- 150, CR- 314), it was the highest cause of injuries to passengers (WR- 525, CR- 518). The Railways had admitted that vertical gap between platforms and the trains cause accidents when passengers try to board or de-board the moving train.

62. In view of high number of casualties owing to gap between platforms and the trains, the Committee sought clarification from the Ministry regarding the steps taken to rectify the problem of platform gaps. The Ministry in their reply stated as under:

"On Central Railway, out of 273 platforms, 83 platforms have been taken up for raising, being less than 840mm height. 78 platforms have been raised. All out efforts are being made to raise balance 02 platforms by 31.12.2016. 03 platforms are not to be raised as they are being dismantled in connection with works of 5th & 6th line between Chhatrapati Shivaji Terminus and Kurla. On Western Railway, out of 145 platforms, 88 platforms have been raised and balance 56 will be raised by June, 2017. 01 platform is not to be raised as the same is being dismantled in connection with works of 5th & 6th line between Mumbai Central and Borivali."

63. The Committee sought clarification from the Ministry whether the level of raising the platforms upto 920mm is being strictly adhered to by the Central and Western Railways under Mumbai region. The Ministry acknowledged that while Western Railways are adhering to the stipulated upper level of 920mm, the Central Railways have decided to raise platforms only upto 900mm. On being asked to state the reason for fixing the level of 900mm when instructions mentions 920mm, the Railways submitted that as per instructions anything within the range of 840-920 mm is acceptable. Thus, the platforms above 840mm are not being raised.

64. The Committee also desired to know the reasons which led the Railways to revise the height of platforms from 760 - 840 mm to 840 - 920 mm. The Railways stated that due to the technology of air springs in new trains which were introduced five years

back, the height of train no longer lowered from weight of passengers. The Railways further admitted that owing to large number of deaths being caused by the gap that have developed between platforms and trains after introduction of new trains, the Railways took the decision to revise platform height commensurate with the non-sagging height of trains in operations.

(VI) Security of Passengers on Suburban Section

65. An Integrated Security System (ISS) was conceptualized after the 2006 serial bomb blasts in Mumbai, for installation at identified vulnerable stations all over Indian Railways. Accordingly, Railway Board issued instructions in September 2008 specifying guidelines and technical specifications for implementation of ISS at 202 sensitive stations over Indian Railways including 76 suburban stations on seven Zonal Railways. It envisaged an internet protocol based CCTV system, Access Control, Personal and Baggage screening system, Bomb Detection and Disposal System. Audit review of status of implementation of security measure viz. ISS, CCTVs, DFMDs etc in the Zonal Railways revealed the following:

Central Railway

The Integrated Security System was only partially implemented even eight years after it was conceptualized. DFMDs installed at various stations were not monitored by the security personnel. The purpose of installation of DFMDs was defeated due to multiple unauthorized/unmanned Entry and Exit points existing at most of the suburban stations. This was also reinforced by the findings of passenger survey in trains wherein 175 out of 258 passengers and 186 out of 302 passengers at stations expressed dissatisfaction with the security and safety arrangements.

Eastern Railway

Review of selected stations revealed that CCTVs have been provided at three major terminal suburban stations namely Howrah, Sealdah and Sonarpur (Provided by Government Railway Police). DFMDs at seven station (except one under the control of Government Railway Police at Sealdah) were not manned. The purpose of installation of DFMDs was defeated due to multiple unauthorized/unmanned Entry and Exit points existing at most of the suburban stations.

Metro Rail, Kolkata

Installation of CCTV cameras- Eight Pan Tilt Zoom cameras and 43 C-mount cameras were to be installed at nine different locations. However, CCTV cameras had not been installed at any location. Further, the purpose of installation of DFMDs was defeated as multiple Entry and Exit points exist at most of the stations.

Western Railway

The Integrated Security System was partially implemented. Door Frame Metal Detectors DFMDs were installed only at two stations namely Churchgate and Borivali, which did not serve its purpose as they were not monitored by the security personnel and there were multiple Entry and Exit points exist at most of the suburban stations. DFMD at Borivali station was found to be non-functional on the day of joint inspection with the Railway officials.

66. The Committee enquired from the Railways about the time period for completing the Integrated Security System at 76 suburban stations. The Ministry submitted the details of status of the system as under:

"Integrated Security System has been conceptualized to provide multiple checking of passengers and their baggage from the point of entry in the station premises till boarding of the train. The System comprises of Close Circuit Television Camera, access control, personal and baggage screening system and bomb detection and disposal system".

Position of Integrated Security System (ISS) over Central Railway, Eastern Railway, South Eastern Railway, Southern Railway and Metro Railway, Kolkata, including suburban section stations of these railways, is as under-

RLY	NAME OF STATIONS & PRESENT POSITION OF ISS
Central Railway	<p>Nominated Stations-</p> <p>Chatrapati Shivaji Terminal (Main line & Suburban), Dadar, Kurla, Lokmanya Tilak Terminus, Thane, Kalyan, Pune, Miraj, Bhusawal, Nasik, Road, Manmad, Chalisgaon, Jalgaon, Akola, Murtajapur, Badnera, Nagpur.</p> <p>Present Position-</p> <p>Contract has already been awarded for installation of ISS over all the Mumbai area stations. All the stations have been covered with CCTV cameras. In addition, 13 baggage scanners, 02 under</p>

	<p>vehicle scanners, 88 door frame metal detector and 252 hand held metal detectors have been provided under ISS over Mumbai area stations. Matter is under tendering process for stations outside Mumbai area stations.</p>
Eastern Railway	<p>Nominated Stations-</p> <p>Sealdah, Kolkata(T), Bidhannagar, Majherhat, Ballygunge, Dum Dum, Howrah, Malda, Bardhaman, Asansol, Durgapur.</p> <p>Present Position-</p> <p>Contract has already been awarded for installation of CCTV surveillance System, Baggage Scanners, DFMDs and HHMDs over all the identified stations of ER and installation is expected to be completed during the year 2016-17.</p>
Kolkata Metro	<p>Nominated Stations-</p> <p>Dum Dum Jn, Belgachia, Shyambazar, Sovabazar, Girish Park, Mahatma Gandhi Road, Central, Chandni Chowk, Esplanade, Park Street, Maidan, Rabindra Sadan, Netaji Bhawan, Jatindas Park, Kalighat, Rabindra Sarobar, Tollygunge, Kudghat, Bansdram, Naktala, Garia Bazar, Birji (Previous Pranab Nagar) New Garia.</p> <p>Present Position-</p> <p>All the stations have already been covered under CCTV surveillance system under ISS over all the identified 24 stations of Metro Railway. In addition, 23 baggage scanners and 60 Hand Held Metal Detectors (HHMDs) have also been provided under ISS over Metro Railway.</p>

Southern Railway	<p>Nominated Stations-</p> <p>Trivandrum, Ernakulam, Coimbatore, Madurai, Calicut, Tiruchirapalli, Mangalore, Chennai Central, Chennai Egmore, Beach, Mambalam, Tambaram, Basin Bridge, Tiruvalur.</p> <p>Present Position-</p> <p>All the stations have already been covered with CCTV surveillance system under ISS over Southern Railway. In addition, 17 baggage scanners, 17 under vehicle scanners, 66 DFMDs and 203 HHMDs have also been provided under ISS over Southern Railway. Additional 155 CCTV cameras are being further supplied and will be installed over 07 suburban stations of Southern Railway.</p>
South Eastern Railway	<p>Nominated Stations-</p> <p>Kharagpur, Ranchi, Tatanagar, Chakradharpur, Rourkela, Jharsuguda, Bokaro, Puruliya, Adra, Muri, Midnapur.</p> <p>Present Position-</p> <p>Contract has already been awarded for installation of CCTV cameras under ISS over nominated stations of SER and target is to complete the works by 31.03.2017.</p>
Western Railway	<p>Nominated Stations-</p> <p>Church Gate, Marine Drive, Charni Road, Grant Road, Mumbai Central, Mahalaxmi, Lower Parel, Elphinston Road, Dadar, Matunga Road, Mahim, Bandra Local, Bandra Terminus, Khar Road, Santa Cruz, Vile Parle, Andheri, Jogeshwari, Goregaon, Malad, Kandivali, Borivali, Dahisar, Miraroad, Bhayander, Nayagaon, Basairoad, Nalasupara, Virar, Palghar, Boisar, Dahanuroad, Surat, Vadodara, Godhra, Ahmedabad, Ujjain.</p> <p>Present Position-</p> <p>CCTV surveillance system has already been provided over all the ISS stations (except Ujjain & Dahanu Road) of Western</p>

	Railway. However, ISS is under tendering process over WR.
--	---

Efforts are being made for speedy execution of works related to Integrated Security System over all the nominated stations of ISS over Indian Railways."

67. The Committee also desired to know the role RPF play for providing security to the passengers. The Ministry submitted as under:

"Policing on Railways being a State subject, prevention of crime, registration of cases, their investigation and maintenance of law and order in Railway premises as well as running trains are the statutory responsibility of State Government, which they discharge through Government Railway Police (GRP). However, Railway Protection Force supplements the efforts of the Government Railway Police by deploying its staff for escorting of important trains in affected areas and access control duties at important and sensitive stations.

Besides, following steps are being taken by the Railways to improve safety and security of passengers over Indian Railways:-

- a) On vulnerable and identified routes/ sections, 2500 trains (on an average) are escorted by Railway Protection Force daily, in addition to 2200 trains escorted by Government Railway Police of different States daily.
- b) An Integrated Security System (ISS) consisting of surveillance of vulnerable stations through Close Circuit Television Camera Network, access control, Anti-sabotage checks has been sanctioned to strengthen surveillance mechanism over 202 sensitive Railway stations.
- c) Surveillance is kept through CCTV cameras, provided at about 344 stations over Indian Railways, to ensure safety and security of passengers.
- d) Modern Security Gadgets viz. DFMD, HHMD, Luggage Scanners are provided at major and important railway stations.
- e) Sniffer dog squads are utilized at important railway stations and in trains for anti sabotage checking.
- f) Quick Response Teams (QRTs) are deployed at important and sensitive railway stations to ensure a quick counter response in case of any attack on railways. All the ladies special trains running in Metropolitan cities are being escorted by lady RPF constables.

- g) RPF Crime prevention and detection squads and special teams are formed to keep vigil on the criminals in trains/ stations to prevent crime.
- h) Frequent announcements are made through PA system and Loud Hailers advising the passengers to take precautions against theft, chain snatching, drugging etc.
- i) Joint drives by RPF and Commercial Department are conducted from time to time against the unauthorized entry of passengers in trains and railway premises.
- j) Railway Protection Force personnel are being deployed in civil clothes at platforms and, in trains to keep watch on the activities of suspects and anti social elements.
- k) Periodical drives are being conducted under the provisions of the Railways Act against antisocial elements.
- l) The ladies compartments in local trains are being escorted in sub-urban sections by RPF and GRP during peak / non-peak hours. Staff deployment is made during late night and early morning local trains to ensure proper security to the lady passengers.
- m) An All India Security Helpline No. '1800-111-322' and "182" are operational over Indian Railways to enable passengers to seek security related assistance round the clock.
- n) RPF holds regular coordination meetings with State Police at all levels to ensure proper registration and investigation of crime by Government Railway Police (GRP)."

68. During the study tour of the Committee to Mumbai, the Committee looked into the actions taken under Integrated Security System at stations which was put in place after serial bomb blast of 2006. The Committee were informed that Railway Board had accorded sanction for implementation of Integrated Security System on 32 stations of Mumbai Suburban and five other stations i.e. Vadodara, Godhra, Surat, Ujjain, Ahmedabad, Sabarmati and Dwarka. 1311 number of CCTV cameras have been installed at 47 stations of Western Railways. In addition, 1048 Hand Held Metal Detectors and 77 Door Frame Metal Detectors have also been provided over western Railway. 03 baggage scanners for Mumbai division are under process of procurement.

Further as for non manning of DFMD by security personnel it was submitted by the Western railways that DFMDs are monitored during alerts. Further, work has been sanctioned in the year 2016-17 for provision of CCTV surveillance system at 50 stations over Western Railway under Nirbhaya Fund with allocation of Rs. 11 cr.

VII. Financial Performance of Suburban Train Services

(a) Operating Cost *vis-a-vis* Earnings

69. Audit scrutiny related to earnings from passengers carried on suburban sections revealed that there was no reduction in operational losses of any Zonal Railway during 2010-15. Further, it was observed that the growth in passenger earnings during the review period was not commensurate with the growing operational costs resulting in losses of Rs.13,631crore. Operating ratio of the suburban sections on all Zonal Railways was more than 100 per cent during the review period indicating that gross revenue from this segment was substantially lower than the gross operating expenses incurred. On CR and WR, Operating Ratios of the suburban section revealed an increasing trend over the previous years during review period indicating reducing revenues and escalating operating costs.

70. The Committee desired to know the reasons for increasing Operational losses in suburban sections of 07 Zonal Railways (CR, ER, SCR, SER, SR, WR and Metro Railway, Kolkata). The Railways in their reply submitted as under:

"The growth in EMU-suburban earnings during the period 2010-11 to 2014-15 was not commensurate with the growing operational cost resulting in losses of Rs.17522 crore. The reasons for incurring such huge losses have been examined. The staff cost, cost of fuel/energy, operating expenditure, appropriation to pension fund etc. have increased the cost of services as compared to deficient earnings due to low fares. Suburban fares were rationalized in 2002-03, thereafter, there was no increase in suburban fares up to 21.01.2013, while the cost of repair and maintenance of coaches, track, fuel, etc. increased over the years."

71. In view of growing operational losses, the Committee further enquired about the ameliorative measures that are needed to be taken for restricting the operational losses. The Railways in their reply submitted as under:

"The Railways have examined the reasons for the Operating Ratios and have observed that existing low fares compared to the high operations and maintenance cost, cost of general overheads etc. are the primary reasons. It is a constant endeavor of Railways to reduce the Operating Ratio, avoid wasteful expenditure and increase growth by improving staff productivity, improved assets utilization, control over fuel expenditure etc."

72. Further, the Committee was informed of the action plan prepared by the Railways for financial revamp of the operations of Suburban Train Services. The Railways submitted as under:

"More than 50% of the Indian Railway's passengers are sub-urban. Indian Railway is committed to provide affordable transport solution to the poorest segment of the people of the country. As sub-urban services caters to the passenger of lower strata as well as the working class who commute to and from their working place daily, the fares for sub-urban services have been historically fixed at lower level keeping in view the affordability sector. Any abrupt increase in fare for this segment is sensitive. However, evaluation of various alternatives for rationalization of fare and freight is an ongoing process and MOR has been alive to the need to rationalize the fares from time to time.

Ministry of Railways has also been stressing the need for increasing non fare revenues on suburban sections from both stations and trains."

(b) Suburban Fare Structure

73. Audit scrutiny revealed that as per Coaching Tariff (No. 26 Part II) of Indian Railway Conference Association, prior to January 2013, the fare for suburban passenger services was higher than the fare for the non-suburban section. With effect from 22nd January 2013, due to rounding off of fares to the next higher multiple of Rs. 5, there was virtually no difference between fare for suburban and non-suburban section. However, the suburban fare as charged through Season Tickets being heavily subsidized caused mounting losses as passengers travelling on season tickets accounted for about 65 percent of the total originating passengers on suburban sections while passengers travelling on season tickets on Non suburban section is not too significant.

74. When the Committee enquired from the Railways about the various sources for generating revenue in suburban sector and the action taken thereof, the Ministry replied as under:

"The tariff policy on Indian Railways has been to keep passenger fares affordable especially in the lower classes so that even the poorest segment of the people can travel by rail. The policy of Indian Railways has traditionally been one of restraint with regard to increase in passenger fares and moderation in case of periodic increases in freight rates. Conventionally, the losses incurred in passenger and other coaching services have been compensated through a process of 'cross-subsidization' from revenues generated in the freight segment. From 07.10.2013, Fares for Second Class Ordinary (Non-Suburban) were increased by a maximum of Rs. 5/- in select distance slabs, while in the other distance slabs there was no change in existing fares. There was also no increase in either Second Class Ordinary (Suburban) or Second Class MST fares. From 25/6/2014, Passenger fare including MST fare was increased by 14.2%. However, there was no increase in Second Class (Ordinary) Suburban fares upto a distance of 80 kilometers. Further, from 22.11.2015 the minimum chargeable fare for Second Class (Ordinary) Non-suburban services has been increased from Rs. 5 to Rs. 10.

Evaluation of various alternatives relating to rationalization of the fare structure is an on-going process. Such exercises are aimed at evolving optimal and acceptable ways of, inter alia, minimizing the extent of losses being generated in the passenger segment."

75. Since subsidized season tickets were causing huge losses to the Railways, the Committee desired to know the measures required to be taken by the Railways for reduction of subsidy on season ticket. The Railways in their reply submitted as under:

"One option to reduce the subsidy on Season Ticket is to increase the Base Fare or increase the number of single journey based on which Season Tickets are structured. Presently Second MST fares are charged equivalent to 15 to 20 single journey fares of Second Class (Ordinary) Suburban fare and First Class MST is equivalent to 5 to 7 single journey fares of First Class (Ordinary).

This segment of passengers is highly price sensitive and any upward revision in fare for season ticket may attract lot of criticism.

Evaluation of various alternatives relating to rationalization of the fare structure is an on-going process. Such exercises are aimed at evolving optimal as well as acceptable ways and means of inter alia minimizing the extent of losses being generated in the passenger segment."

76. The Committee also enquired whether the Railways have assessed the number of passengers travelling without valid tickets on suburban Railways and the modus operandi followed by the Railways to deal with such passengers. The Railways submitted as under:

"At present, six Railways i.e. Central, Eastern, Southern, South Central, South Eastern and Western Railways operate suburban sections. Separate statistics of ticketless passengers caught on suburban section is not maintained. However, overall, on these Railways, during checks in financial year 2015-16, approximately 44.8 lakh persons were found travelling without ticket. Actions as per provisions of Railway Act, 1989 were taken against these persons. Further, with a view to curb ticketless travel, various steps have been taken by Indian Railways, some of which are as under:-

- i. Conducting of regular and surprise checks against ticketless travel, which are intensified during peak rush periods.
- ii. Vigorous drives such as Ambush Checks, Fortress Checks are conducted in association with Railway Protection Force and Magistrates under the Action Plan framed by Railway Board.
- iii. Intensive Check Posts have been set up at important stations of each division of Zonal Railways to curb ticketless travelling in unreserved segments.
- iv. With a view to curbing entry of without-ticket passengers in ticketed areas and reduces ticketless travel, instructions have been issued for ensuring effective manning of all designated/functional gates at stations.
- v. Travelling public are urged to avoid ticketless travel through publicity campaigns launched by Zonal Railways through posters/notices/ announcements at railway stations and advertisements in newspapers.

Further, Indian Railways have taken various measures using technological advancement or otherwise to facilitate issuing of tickets so as to prevent travelling without ticket on account of availability of tickets which include:-

- a. Provision of Automatic Ticket Vending Machines.
- b. Provision of unreserved tickets through Mobile phones.
- c. Engaging Jan Sadharan Ticket Booking Sewaks outside station premises for issuing of unreserved tickets through Unreserved Ticketing System (UTS) of Indian Railways.
- d. Engaging of Station Ticket Booking Agents (STBAs) for issuing of unreserved tickets from E category stations.
- e. Engaging Yatri Ticket Suvidha Kendra (YTSK) licensee for issuing of unreserved as well as reserved tickets."

IDENTIFICATION OF TRESPASS LOCATIONS (By MRVC in 2013-14)

Heavy Trespassing locations - Main Line: -

Sr. No.	Pole No.	Between Stations	Average Annual Casualties	Type of Trespassing
01	3/17	Sandhurst Road and Byculla	2	Along Track
02	7/10	Currey Road and Parel	1	Along Track
03	7/16C	Parel and Dadar	3	Along Track
04	10/10C	Matunga and Sion	3	Mid section crossing
05	15/1	Sion and Kurla	5	Along Track
06	15/26	Kurla and Vidyavihar	5	Along Track
07	20/505A	Ghatkopar and Vikhroli	4	Mid section crossing
08	24/5	Vikhroli and Kanjurmarg	1	Along Track
09	28/6	Nahur and Mulund	6	Along Track
10	32/13A	Mulund and Thane	4	Along Track
11	33/11	Thane and Kalva	34	Along Track
12	34/20	Thane and Kalva	11	Along Track
13	35/12	Thane and Kalva	4	Mid section crossing
14	35/2	Thane and Kalva	2	Mid section crossing
15	35/4	Thane and Kalva	4	Along Track
16	35/7-8	Thane and Diva (Through Line)	-	Mid Section crossing
17	36/63	Kalva and Mumbra	11	Mid section crossing
18	40/4	Mumbra and Diva Junction	16	Along Track
19	42/3D	Mumbra and Diva Junction	4	Along Track
20	42/14B	Diva Junction and Kopar	2	Along Track
21	42/18B	Diva Junction and Kopar	2	Along Track
22	43/11	Diva Junction and Kopar	1	Mid section crossing
23	49/20	Thakurli and Kalyan	4	Along Track
24	51/617	Thakurli and Kalyan	0	Mid section crossing
25	52/02	Thakurli and Kalyan	2	Along Track
26	56/2	Kalyan and Shahad	5	Along Track
27	58/9	Shahad and Ambivali	5	Mid section crossing
28	55/10	Vitthalwadi and Ulhasnagar	3	50 m to 300 m from end of the platforms.
29	55/23-33	Vitthalwadi and Ulhasnagar	5	50 m to 300 m from end of the platforms.
30	57/23	Ulhasnagar and Ambarnath	-	Mid section crossing
31	59/2	Shahad and Ambivali	1	Along Track
32	67/3	Ambarnath and Badlapur	5	50 m to 300 m from end of the platforms.

Heavy Trespassing locations - Harbour Line:

Sr. No.	Pole No.	Between Stations	Average Annual Casualties	Type of Trespassing
01	9/7	Wadala and GTB Nagar	1	Along Track
02	9/30	Wadala and GTB Nagar	0	Mid section crossing
03	10/7	Wadala and GTB Nagar	1	Mid section
04	15/5	Kurla and Tilaknagar	10	Along Track
05	18/3	Chembur and Govandi	4	Mid section crossing
06	21/5	Govandi and Mankhurd	13	Along Track

PROPOSAL FOR TRESPASS CONTROL INCLUDED IN MUTP-III BY MRVC

A) Main Line:

TP no.	Between	FOB/ Skywalk/ Staircase (nos)	Metal Railing / Barricades (Length in m)	R.C.C. Boundary wall (Length in m)	Green Patch (Area in sq.m.)	Green patch fencing (Length in m)	Concrete Pathway (Length in m)	Escalators (nos)
19-13A	Ghatkopar & Vikhroli	2 (Connection with existing BMC FOB)	380	950	-	-	380	-
28-6	Nahur & Mulund	1 (Flight conn- ecting ROB on north end)	-	50	120	130	-	2
30-15B	Mulund & Thane	-	1,328.00	170	-	-	1,328.00	-
33-11 to 34/20	Thane & Kalwa	1 FOB+ 4staircases+ 1connection+ 1 elevated pathway	1,848.00	260	-	-	-	1
35-7	Thane & Diva (Through Line)	1 FOB	250	-	-	-	-	-
35-1	Thane & Kalwa	1 FOB	10	210.76	-	-	-	-
37-3	Kalwa & Mumbra	1 FOB	-	230	-	-	-	-
40-4	Mumbra & Diva Junction	-	-	500	-	-	45	-
42-6	Diva Junction	1 FOB	1,000.00	-	-	-	1,000.00	1
55-10	Kalyan & Ulhasnagar	1 FOB	-	630	-	-	-	3
Shahad	Kalyan & Ambivli	1 FOB + 2 staircases (Dog legged)	-	300	400	162	-	-
67-3	Badliapur Station	2 Skywalks	1	1,119.30	-	-	115	-
		7 FOB	4,817.00	4,420.06	520	292	2,888.00	7

B) Harbour Line:

TP no.	Between	FOB/ Skywalk/ Staircase (nos)	Metal Railing / Barricades (Length in m)	R.C.C. Boundary wall (Length in m)	Green Patch (Area in sq.m.)	Green patch fencing (Length in m)	Concrete Pathway (Length in m)
9-7	Wadala road and GTB Nagar)	-	-	950	459	227	-
16-4	Tilak Nagar and	-	200	214	-	-	200
18-3	Chembur and Govandi	1 FOB	-	91	-	-	-
21-5	Govandi and Mankhurd	1 FOB	-	492.62	4,066.00	351	-
22-20	Mankhurd and Vashi	1 FOB	-	1,000.00	-	-	-
29-3	Sanpada and Vashi	1 FOB	-	850	-	-	-
		4 FOB	200	3,597.62	4,525.00	578	200

SUMMARY OF STATUS & ACTION PLAN

Sr No.	Activity	Status/Action	Remarks
1.	Construction/Repairs of Boundary Wall	Total 19147 meters of wall constructed during last 7 years.	Construction & Repairs is a continuous process.
2.	Fencing between Tracks	Provided at 21 stations	At other stations, the stations are either having island platform or double discharged.
3.	Platform Raising	Total PFs-273 3 to be dismantled. 152 PFs have been Raised upto 900mm.	Work at 2 PFs is in progress. Work of 8 PFs is sanctioned. Proposal for increasing height of 48 platforms, which are in the range of 840-870 MM is planned in next phase.
4.	FOBs at stations	Recently 9 FOBs have been commissioned.	Work for 27 FOBs at various stations is in progress at different stages.
5.	Public FOBs in Section	Recently 2 FOBs have been commissioned.	Work for 9 FOBs at various stations is in progress at different stages.
6.	Escalators	14 have been provided at 10 stations.	36 are sanctioned at 14 stations. Work is in progress at various stages.
7.	Elevators	3 have been provided	35 Lifts are sanctioned for 14 stations. Work is in progress at various stages.
8.	Punitive Measures	Frequent drives are conducted by RPF Branch and offenders are prosecuted.	Drives are being intensified.
9.	Public Awareness	Being made through various means. 1. Stickers. 2. Boards 3. Announcements 4. Skit Plays Etc.	4000 stickers, 400 boards & 400 Banners are expected to be displayed by 30.09.2016.
10.	Ambulances	State Govt. Ambulances (108) are parked at 22 stations. Private Ambulances parked at 2 stations. Ambulances are also available on Call Basis.	State Govt. has been requested to park Ambulances at 30 more stations.
11.	Emergency Medical Rooms	Out of 12 EMRS of First Phase 7 EMRs are functional.	EMRs at 14 more stations are proposed in Second Phase.
12.	Sanctioning of New Trespass Control Work	Fresh survey has been conducted by MRVC to study Heavy Trespassing location	Identified works are included for sanction in MUTP-III. Sanction is expected shortly.

PART II

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS

DEFINING SUBURBAN TRAIN SERVICES

1. The suburban train services are provided by seven Zonal Railways. On an average 445 crore passengers are being served every year by 578 suburban stations. The Suburban Railways, apart from being one of the major services rendered by the Indian Railways, also plays a facilitating role in addressing the challenges of the public transport system in many of India's important cities. Various Railway Zones, viz., Central, Eastern, Southern, South Eastern, South Central and Western and Kolkata Metro, are providing dedicated suburban services in the country covering about 72.86 percent of the total passengers on the Indian Railway system spread over 1763 km during the period under review. The defining feature of Suburban Train Service as identified by the Railways is that they are meant for short distances, normally up to 150 km. to facilitate rapid movement of passengers within the cities, suburbs and extended suburbs. Further, the Railways have contended that consideration of routes for notification as suburban routes is based on the pattern of traffic, availability of rail infrastructure etc. and suburban sections are notified on detailed examination of the techno-economic and financial viability derived from traffic studies carried out by the Railways for assessing the volume and nature of suburban/commuter traffic in the urban conglomerates. Further it was also contended that passenger amenities of stations on the suburban sections include specified height of platforms, lighting arrangements, public announcement systems, parking spaces, etc. The expenditure incurred in upgradation of such infrastructure as well as the service levels of current passenger/EMU services on the route also need to be considered while notifying a section as "Suburban". The Committee observe that, although Sub-urban Train Services are bearing the major burden of passengers carried by the Railways at 72.86 percent, the Railways have more or less have not accorded it justifiable importance to the extent that the Railways have not very well defined what constitutes the Sub-urban Train Services and are

relying on definition based on functional needs of local areas and availability of requisite infrastructure to decide to run Suburban Train Services. As a result records of the Railways does not show all the routes being served under Suburban Train Services and thus the performances of Suburban Train Services cannot be assessed completely when there is ambiguity in the Railway records what constitutes Sub-urban service and non-suburban service. The Committee, therefore recommend that the Railways come out with clear and unambiguous guidelines for what constitute Sub-urban Train Services, carry out detailed analysis of all its routes/operations and verifiably update and notify its database on Suburban Train Services.

SEPARATE ORGANISATIONAL SET-UP

2. The Committee desire that the Ministry of Railways should draw a clear distinction between Suburban and non-suburban services not only just in terms of definition but also by establishing a separate organizational set-up for the Suburban Train Services despite the fact that many routes might fall common to both Sub-urban and non-suburban train services. They exhort that there should be separate fund allocation to Suburban and non-suburban train services to critically examine the details of utilization of funds towards improvement of Suburban Train Services. The Committee feel that this is absolutely necessary to enhance the operational efficiency of these services by having a well defined and accountable hierarchy of officials and targeted fund allocation for operations of Sub-urban Train Services only.

PUNCTUALITY OF SUBURBAN TRAINS

3. Suburban train services play a major role in public transportation system of major cities of seven Zonal Railways. In view of the fact that during the period 2010-11 to 2014-15, suburban train services carried 2225 crore passengers which ranged between 72.28 per cent (2012-13) and 73.29 per cent (2014-15) of total passenger traffic of the Indian Railways, it would not be wrong to term the Suburban Train Services as lifeline of transport system in suburban areas upto

150 km. More so since the majority of passengers on Suburban Train Services are daily office going travellers, the punctuality of trains on said routes attract utmost importance as trains on suburban routes are running not just to commute passengers but to enable them to reach their destinations on time. The performance of Central Railway and Southern Railway especially needs improvements as around 15% of their trains are running late regularly. The Committee are dismayed to observe that the prominent reason proffered by the Ministry for delay in Train Services has been attributed to signal failures which is an infrastructural issue on the part of the Railways. During the course of examination, the Committee have found that issues of land encroachment, poor maintenance of tracks, level crossings etc. have contributed to placing of speed restrictions on the operation of Railways and thus adversely affecting timely and speedier operations of Suburban Train Services. Hence, the contention of the Ministry of Railways that the absence of exclusive corridor for running suburban services and factors beyond their control like water logging during rainy seasons, accidents, law and order problems etc. does not hold ground. The Committee, therefore, desires that the Railways accord utmost priority to timely and speedier running of trains and remove shortcomings like signal failures, poor maintenance of tracks, delays in removal of land encroachments and level crossings. The Committee would like to be informed about the action plan prepared for repair of the old tracks/ rakes of all the Suburban Railways with particular focus on Mumbai section which carries major share of passengers traffic of Suburban Railways.

LOSS OF LIVES OF PASSENGERS IN SUBURBAN TRAIN SERVICES

4. The Committee are aghast to find the unfortunate figure of large number of loss of precious lives of passengers on Suburban Train services which is going upto 15000 deaths, every year. More so, when major portion of problem is located in a particular region, i.e. the Mumbai suburban system. Out of total deaths of 15000 per year, 6000 take place in Mumbai region alone. The cross examination of representatives of the Ministry of Railways revealed that in three

quarters of the year 2016 (Jan-Sep) alone 783 deaths occurred on the Western Railway, while 1414 deaths were recorded on the Central Railway. The figures of those injured is equally alarming. Among the prominent reasons stated by the Ministry were line crossings/trespassing accounting for more than 50% of deaths followed by falling from running trains. As per evidence tendered before the Committee, the Central Railway have got a study done by a consultancy firm on critical trespassing locations at Mumbai division and prepared a proposal of work at an estimated cost of Rs. 550 crore which is awaiting approval of the Ministry. However, the Committee observe that given the alarming number of loss of precious human lives every year the work of trespassing control should be undertaken on war footing. Ministry of Railways should commence works in right earnest and accord immediate priority for construction of fencing between railway lines, Foot Over Bridges, Escalators and Elevators etc. In their own admission, the Ministry of Railways have stated that just by construction of Foot Over Bridges in Mumbai division the situation of trespassing has been resolved to a great extent. The Committee recommend that the Ministry of Railways take urgent necessary action to complete the construction of FOBs, escalators and elevators at all the stations on the Suburban sections of Indian Railways within next four months and present the status report to the Committee. The development work of Mumbai division of suburban railways which accounts for 52 % of total deaths due to trespassing is being managed by Mumbai Rail Vikas Corporation (MRVC). The Railways have submitted detailed action plan of MRVC for controlling trespassing in Mumbai division which are attached as annexures A, B, and C to the report. The Committee would like to be informed of status of work done on the said action plan within the next six months.

5. During evidence, the Ministry of Railways have admitted that the deaths of passengers occur due to falling off from running trains while boarding and deboarding, which happens because of gaps between the trains and platforms. The Railways in Mumbai Division (Western and Central) have committed to the task of raising the height of all 83 platforms in Central Railway and 145 platforms

in Western Railway by June, 2017. The Committee would like to be apprised of the station-wise status report on completion of work of raising of height of the platforms within four months from the date of presentation of this Report in Parliament.

6. The Committee note that a significant number of deaths are caused due to overcrowding in trains during peak hours forcing passengers to stand on the doors of the coaches as everybody was in a hurry to reach office or their destination on time and jerks of trains result in imbalance of passengers leading to their falling off from the trains causing injuries/deaths. The Committee are shocked and pained to note that even though 6000 innocent passengers lose their precious lives and thousand of passengers became maimed every year in the Mumbai suburban sections of the Railways alone, the Ministry of Railways remained as a mute spectator of the horrific scenes of such incidents. The Committee, therefore, earnestly desire that Ministry of Railways take urgent necessary action to :

- (a) redesign the coaches on suburban trains on the lines of coaches with automatic doors similar to that used in Metro trains;
- (b) increase the number of coaches to 15 on each train in all the suburban railways; and
- (c) conduct a scientific study on movement of passengers and prepare an action plan to deal with large number of deaths and to bring down it to 10,000 passenger/human casualties per annum in the Mumbai sub-urban division.

7. The Committee also note that a large number of deaths on suburban trains particularly in Mumbai are caused due to line crossing/trespassing. This also leads to speed restrictions on trains. The Committee recommend the Ministry of Railways to give priority to:

- (a) elimination of line crossing by constructing FOBs/FUBs;
- (b) make provision for fencing/boundary walls on both sides of the railway lines at the required stations and where the area is more populated/congested;

- (c) provide status of work undertaken/completed regarding fencing/boundary walls especially on Mumbai Section (Western and Central Railways) which registers 52.74 % of total deaths from trespassing/line crossing.
- (d) removal of encroachments on Railway lands in coordination with local authorities.

8. The Committee are surprised to note that the Railways do not have any specific authority to keep record of casualties/deaths caused due to falling off from trains, trespassing/line crossing etc. The Railways have to depend on the information provided by the GRP for number of deaths/injuries caused by accidents in suburban railways and on medical department for the number of deaths/injuries in train accidents. The Committee desire that the Ministry of Railways create its own authority which can maintain all the data of deaths/casualties on railway stations/tracks particularly on sub-urban train services.

MEDICAL CARE FOR ACCIDENT VICTIMS

9. In view of high rate of accidents and fatalities on the suburban train network, the Committee feel that there should be provision of medical facility to the extent of First Aid on suburban trains and emergency medical centres at all Suburban stations. The situation is especially worrisome in Mumbai suburban sections where the number of deaths and cases of injured people are very high. The Committee, therefore, recommends that emergency medical centres fully equipped with all essential medical facilities including adequate beds and stretchers etc. to deal with all possible medical emergencies should necessarily be established at all Mumbai Suburban stations within a period of six months with request being made to the State Government to deploy registered medical practitioners there on 24 hour basis. The Committee also desire that necessary instructions be followed by passengers in case of medical emergencies, whom to contact and indicator boards to the medical rooms may be prominently displayed at various wanton locations at stations. The Committee recommend that Mumbai

Suburban stations be equipped with all the facilities mentioned above within a period of six months.

COMPENSATION TO VICTIMS

10. Keeping in view the large number of deaths and maimed cases in suburban railway, it is of utmost importance that the Railways have a prompt and efficient system of claim settlement in place. The pendency of accident and untoward incident claim cases as on 31.07.2016, as reported to the Committee stands at a staggering number of 37699, with highest pendency at Lucknow and Mumbai Benches of Railway Claims Tribunal (RCT) of 9359 and 6055 cases, respectively. Such Tribunals make suitable awards after considering the claims of passenger in this regard. Compensation in case of death or permanent disability is Rs. 4 lakh and in case of injuries, the minimum compensation is Rs. 32,000/- and the maximum is Rs. 3, 60, 000/- depending upon the gravity of the injury. The Committee are deeply concerned to note such a huge number of pending cases of unsettled compensation claims with Railway Claim Tribunals. The acute shortage of Claim Tribunals and vacancies in existing tribunals have made the situation worse. In their own admission by the Railways, Circuit Benches have to be held in view of high pendency and vacancies. The cases of regular deaths/injuries in the premises of the Railways in itself is highly deplorable and the inordinate delay in awarding compensation to the aggrieved passengers/dependants makes the issue more painful. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Railways come out with a concrete action plan to eliminate pendency with Claim Tribunals on an urgent basis especially in Lucknow and Mumbai benches of Railway Claims Tribunal and intimate the Committee of the action plan within a period of six months. The Committee exhort the Railways to increase the number of permanent benches of Claim Tribunals in view of alarming pendency of cases. Further, the Committee feel that the Ministry of Railways consider the feasibility of revision of amount of compensation keeping in view irreparable financial and emotional losses suffered by the kin of

deceased/disabled victims as its repercussions extend beyond lifetime of a single individual.

11. More often it is reported in the media that unclaimed bodies of the accident victims were claimed by unscrupulous/anti social elements to get compensation amount is connivance with officials of railway/local bodies. The Committee were informed that data regarding fraudulent claims, if any, is being collected from Zonal Railways and Railway Claim Tribunals. The Committee would like to be apprised of such cases and action taken against concerned Railway officials so as to ensure that unclaimed bodies of victims are not claimed by persons other than the kith and kins of the victims.

SECURITY OF PASSENGERS

12. With almost 73% of total passenger traffic of the Indian Railways travelling on Suburban Trains, their safety and security is a matter of serious concern. Although Integrated Security System was conceptualised after the 2006 serial bomb blasts in Mumbai, its implementation has not been completed at all Zonal Railways viz. Eastern Railways, Central Railways, South Eastern Railways and Western Railways. The Committee note that major flaws in security system pertained to non-functional Door Frame Metal Detectors, multiple entry and exit points at suburban stations, non-manning of Door Frame Metal Detectors, Non-installation of CCTV cameras etc. These are the basic security requirements which should be taken care of at all Railway stations on Suburban sections of Indian Railways especially after the horrific serial bomb blasts of 2006 in Mumbai. The Committee desire that the Railways carry out an internal security audit of all suburban stations and present status report within a period of 06 months to the Committee relating to security features provided as per extant guidelines of Integrated Security System.

FINANCIAL PERFORMANCE AND REVENUE GENERATION

13. The Railways have been unable to exploit the full potential of suburban train services which are an effective source of revenue generation as shown by the unimpressive growth of revenue from Suburban section of trains which

registered a growth of only 10% during the year 2014-15 *vis-a-vis* 2013-14. The main reasons as observed by the Committee are decline in number of passengers originating in Suburban section of Indian Railways, mounting operational losses being incurred by the Railways, high number of ticketless travelers, inadequate provision of ticket booking facilities at many suburban stations etc. Further, the Committee have noted that the Railways have exercised restraint in raising tariffs on the plea that the tariff policy on Indian Railways has been to keep passenger fares affordable especially in the category of lower classes so that even the poorest segment of the people can travel by rail and conventionally, the losses incurred in passenger and other coaching services have been compensated through a process of 'cross-subsidization' from revenues generated in the freight segment. Thus the Committee feel that there is an urgent need to curtail operation costs being incurred by the Railways. Since the Railways have not been able to find ways to reduce the operation cost, the Committee recommend that the Railways hire an external agency to undertake a study of operations of the Railways and recommend the measures to reduce the same at the earliest to make operations of Suburban train services economically viable. Further, as for source of generation of revenue other than passenger fares, the Committee recommends that the Railways should fully exploit the Commercial Publicity potential of Suburban Train Services given the fact that 73% of the passenger traffic are being carried by the Suburban Section of the Railways.

NEW DELHI;
06 April, 2017
16 Chaitra, 1939 (Saka)

PROF. K.V. THOMAS
Chairperson,
Public Accounts Committee.