

Thirteenth Lok Sabha**Session : 9****Date : 29-04-2002**

Participants : [Vaiko Shri](#), [Yadav Shri Mulayam Singh](#), [Nedurumalli J. Reddy Shri](#), [Malhotra Prof. Vijay Kumar](#), [Yerrannaidu Shri Kinjarapu](#), [Chaturvedi Shri Satyavrat](#), [Geete Shri Anant Gangaram](#), [Singh Dr. Raghuvansh Prasad](#), [Singh Shri Akhilesh](#), [Bandyopadhyay Shri Sudip](#), [Atkinson Shri Denzil B.](#), [Palanimanickam Shri S.S.](#), [Chatterjee Shri Somnath](#), [Patil Shri Shivraj V.](#), [Malaisamy Shri K.](#), [Yadav Shri Devendra Prasad](#), [Sangtam Shri K. Asungba](#), [Mahale Shri Haribhau](#), [Ponnuswamy Shri E.](#), [Thomas Shri P.C.](#), [Kurup Shri Suresh](#), [Varma Shri Ratilal Kalidas](#), [Athawale Shri Ramdas](#), [Murthi Dr. M.V.V.S](#), [Francis George Shri K.](#), [Pal Shri Rupchand](#), [Pramod Mahajan Shri](#), [Yadav Shri Mulayam Singh](#), [Dasmunsi Shri Priya Ranjan](#)

Title: Need to permit candidates to answer questions in regional language in examinations conducted by Staff Selection Commission.

SHRI VAIKO (SIVAKASI): Sir, I thank you for giving me this opportunity to raise this very important matter during 'zero hour'.

Here is the final result of the recruitment test for the post of clerks conducted by the Staff Selection Commission for the year 1999. The trend of selections shows a clear discrimination and bias against the candidates from the Southern, the North-Eastern, and the non-Hindi speaking States. It is a result of the introduction of the method of descriptive examination from the year 1999. Out of the 8085 candidates recommended for appointment by the Staff Selection Commission - three candidates are from Tamil Nadu, 12 are from Karnataka, 52 from Kerala, and only 11 from all the North-Eastern States put together. It comes to a total of only 100 candidates from the States of Tamil Nadu, Pondicherry, Andhra Pradesh, Kerala, Karnataka and the North-Eastern States. ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI (KHAJURAHU): Sir, is he making a 'zero hour' submission or giving a speech?

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: This is 'zero hour'.

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI : Can he go on reading like this?

SHRI VAIKO : Sir, this is a very serious problem. This is regarding the problem of unemployment.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: He is referring to statistics.

SHRI VAIKO : There is a provision for writing the Civil Services Main examination, which is of descriptive type, in any of the languages mentioned in the Eighth Schedule of the Constitution, not allowing that facility in this examination is a very serious issue. While the languages of the Eighth Schedule are being allowed even for the topmost services like IAS, IPS, why can the same method not be adopted for examinations conducted by the Staff Selection Commission also?

An appeal was filed in this regard before the Central Administrative Tribunal, Chennai. That Tribunal observed:

“We may observe that it is for the Government of India to consider whether all the languages included in the Eighth Schedule can be used as medium for all examinations conducted by the Staff Selection Commission. We do not think it is very difficult, when the facility is available now in Civil Services Main Examination. This fact has been rightly admitted in the reply filed.”

Sir, it is for the Government to take immediate steps either to allow the candidates to write the examination in the languages mentioned in the Eighth Schedule, or to switch over to the earlier two-tier system of recruitment wherein there was an objective type examination and an interview/skill test.

Out of the 8085 candidates selected, a thousand candidates are from Bihar. I do not have any grouse against Bihar. This has happened because there is no level-playing field available for the candidates. When candidates from all over the country are not allowed to write the examination in their respective mother tongue included in the Eighth Schedule, the candidates from the non-Hindi-speaking Southern and North-Eastern States are terribly affected. Unemployment problem is a very serious problem. It is a great injustice being done.

Therefore, I would appeal to the Government to either restore the earlier system of examination, or allow all languages in the Eighth Schedule to be the medium of examination. This is my request. ...

(Interruptions)

श्री अनंत गंगाराम गीते (रत्नागिरि) : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं वाइको साहब की बात से अपने को एसोसिएट करता हूँ।

SHRI K. YERRANNAIDU (SRIKAKULAM): Sir, I associate with the hon. Member on this issue....

(Interruptions)

श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव (सम्भल) : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, यह बहुत महत्वपूर्ण मामला है, मुझे इस पर बोलने के लिए एक मिनट का समय देने की कृपा करें।

SHRI E.M. SUDARSANA NATCHIAPPAN (SIVAGANGA): We also associate with the Member on this issue.... *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Shri Yerrannaidu, Shri Janardhana Reddy, Shri Natchiappan, Shri Kuppuswamy, Shri Suresh, Shri Murthi, Shri Thomas, Shri Francis, Shri Malaisamy, Shri Selvaganapathi and all these Members associate with Shri Vaiko on this issue.

SHRI VAIKO : Kindly allow them to speak, Sir. It is a serious problem.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: All right, Shri Vaiko, I have allowed them to associate.

SHRI K. YERRANNAIDU : Sir, the Parliamentary Affairs Minister wants to say something on this. ... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (BOLPUR): All these requests should be granted before 30th of April.... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DALIT EZHILMALAI (TIRUCHIRAPALLI): This is a discrimination.... *(Interruptions)*... Please respond to it... *(Interruptions)*... We will never accept any other language except Tamil and English... *(Interruptions)*... This is a clear discrimination against them.... *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Shri Elumalai, what is happening to you today?

... *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please take your seat. The hon. Minister is responding.

SHRI SURESH RAMRAO JADHAV (PARBHANI): Sir, I also associate myself with what Shri Vaiko has said... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI K. YERRANNAIDU : It is mentioned in the VIII Schedule, and it should be followed...

(Interruptions)

श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव : आप बोलिये, फिर एक सवाल करेंगे। हम वैको जी का समर्थन करेंगे।

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय : आप पहले ही सवाल पूछ लीजिए।

श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव : उपाध्यक्ष जी, यह बहुत महत्वपूर्ण सवाल है। किस प्रदेश का है, किसका नहीं है, पक्षपात है, वह तो आप देख लेंगे, सरकार बैठी हुई है। वैको जी की एक बात से मैं पूरी तरह से सहमत हूँ जो उन्होंने भारतीय भाषाओं के बारे में कहा है कि विदेशी भाषा अंग्रेजी की अनिवार्यता को हटाकर भारतीय भाषाओं में परीक्षा देने का प्रावधान हो। जब हम सरकार में थे उत्तर प्रदेश में तो वहां दक्षिण की सारी भाषाओं को पढ़ाने की व्यवस्था की थी और यह भी किया था कि जो हिन्दी के अतिरिक्त भारतीय भाषाओं में इम्तिहान देंगे उनको कुछ विशेष नंबर अलग से भी दिये जायेंगे। मुझे खुशी है कि हमारे विशेषकर तमिलनाडु के साथी वैको साहब भी किसी न किसी तरह से इस रास्ते पर आ गए हैं और मैं इनसे कहना चाहता हूँ कि भारतीय भाषाओं के बारे में बात कीजिए और विदेशी भाषा अंग्रेजी को हटाने का काम कीजिए और अभी मौका अच्छा है। कल वोट पड़ेगा इसलिए आप लोग इसके पीछे पड़ जाइए। यह अच्छा मौका है।

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : This has been raised at a proper time... (*Interruptions*)...It is a

very intelligent question... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VAIKO : Pandit Nehru had given the assurance. That assurance should be honestly fulfilled... (*Interruptions*)

(Interruptions)

श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव : इसलिए हम चाहते हैं कि उत्तर दें तो भारतीय भाषाओं में इम्तिहान देने की बात करें।

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय : भारतीय भाषाओं में ही उत्तर भी देना है।

श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव : चाहे मराठी में ही उत्तर दीजिए, हिन्दी अच्छी बोलते हैं, हिन्दी में ही दे दीजिए, लेकिन अंग्रेजी में उत्तर नहीं दें।

SHRI N. JANARDHANA REDDY (NARASARAOPET): Sir, this question of writing the examination in the regional languages arose in regard to the recruitment of para-military constables. There are about 10 lakh para-military constables but not even 10 per cent of them are from the South India. This is because they have not been allowed to write the examination in their regional languages. Either they have to write in English or in Hindi. This is the problem.

The Standing Committee on Home Affairs had taken up this matter very seriously and recommended unanimously to the Home Ministry, the Government of India to allow the examination to take place in regional languages. But for the last one year, they had given a deaf ear to it. I do not know whether the hon. Minister is going to say anything about it also.

डॉ. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा (दक्षिण दिल्ली) : उपाध्यक्ष जी, जो सवाल उठाया है बड़े महत्व का है। प्रादेशिक भाषाओं में परीक्षा देने का सवाल बहुत सालों से चल रहा था जबकि सिर्फ अंग्रेजी में परीक्षा देने की बात थी और प्रादेशिक भाषाओं में कोई उत्तर नहीं दे सकता था। इस कारण से बड़ी भारी आलोचना इसके खिलाफ देश भर में हो रही है।

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, हम चाहते हैं कि प्रादेशिक भाषाओं में जो उत्तर देना चाहें, उसकी अनुमति उन्हें होनी चाहिए और किसी एक ही भाषा, चाहे वह अंगरेजी हो या हिन्दी हो, उसकी अनिवार्यता नहीं होनी चाहिए। प्रादेशिक भाषाओं में से वह चाहे जिस भाषा में परीक्षा दे, इसकी अनुमति देनी चाहिए। ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI K. YERRANNAIDU : Sir, in the case of Indian Administrative Service Examinations, there is no discrimination in the usage of language and the local students can appear for those Examinations in the regional languages. They are allowing that to happen. But for the examinations to small posts of paramilitary personnel conducted by the S.S.C., they are not allowing the usage of regional languages. For these posts, the applicants would have studied only up to X Standard or 'Ten Plus Two' or they may be graduates. Candidates from some States do not know Hindi or English well. How can they write the examination in English or Hindi only? In some States, they have introduced the usage of regional languages up to the graduation level. When we are allowing usage of regional languages for Indian Administrative Service Examinations, why should we have this discrimination in usage of other languages for other small posts? This is a legal and a genuine demand. So, there is no need to have a discussion; and the Parliamentary Affairs Minister, taking into account all the observations from various political parties here, can make an announcement in this regard now itself.

... (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Since it is an important matter, I am allowing the hon. Members to make submissions.

... (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I will give you the floor.

... (Interruptions)

श्री सत्यव्रत चतुर्वेदी : उपाध्यक्ष जी, यह स्वाभाविक बात है कि जो भी भारतीय भाषाएँ हैं, उनमें से अंगरेजी में, हिन्दी में या जिस भाषा में परीक्षार्थी को परीक्षा देने में सुविधा हो, इसका निर्णय करने का पूरा अधिकार परीक्षार्थी को होना चाहिए और वह जिस भाषा में परीक्षा देना चाहे उसमें परीक्षा देने की अनुमति होनी चाहिए। जिसे अंगरेजी में परीक्षा देने में सुविधा हो, उसे अंगरेजी में परीक्षा देने की अनुमति दी जानी चाहिए। हमें उसे अंगरेजी से वंचित नहीं रखना चाहिए। देश की सारी भाषाएँ खुली रहनी चाहिए। परीक्षार्थी को अधिकार होना चाहिए कि वह जिस भाषा में परीक्षा देना चाहे, उसे उस भाषा में परीक्षा देने का अधिकार देने की शुरुआत करनी चाहिए।

... (व्यवधान)

श्री अनंत गंगाराम गीते : उपाध्यक्ष जी, जो भी परीक्षाएँ होती हैं, उनमें प्रादेशिक भाषा में जो उम्मीदवार उत्तर देना चाहते हैं, उसकी अनुमति होनी चाहिए। मैं निवेदन करना चाहूंगा कि केवल परीक्षाएँ ही प्रादेशिक भाषाओं में नहीं हों, बल्कि उनके जो इशतहार अंगरेजी के अखबारों में आते हैं वे भी प्रादेशिक भाषाओं के अखबारों में आने चाहिए। जो ग्रामीण क्षेत्र हैं, वहाँ के परीक्षार्थी अंगरेजी नहीं समझ पाते हैं या कई बार अंगरेजी का अखबार ग्रामीण क्षेत्रों में पहुंचता ही नहीं है। इसलिए परीक्षाओं के जो भी इशतहार आते हैं, वे भी प्रादेशिक भाषाओं में आने चाहिए। ... (व्यवधान)

डॉ. रघुवंश प्रसाद सिंह (वैशाली) : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, भाषा का सवाल है। इस देश की राष्ट्रभाषा हिन्दी है। इसलिए अंगरेजी भाषा को विदेशी कन्या की भांति देश से तुरन्त विदा कर देना चाहिए। डॉ. लोहिया कहा करते थे-

अंगरेजी में काम न होगा, फिर देश कभी गुलाम न होगा।

लोहिया की अभिलाषा, चले देश में हिन्दी भाषा।

इसलिए महोदय, इस समय जो सवाल उठ रहा है वह प्रादेशिक भाषाओं में परीक्षा देने की अनुमति दी जानी चाहिए यह उठ रहा है। मैं चाहूंगा कि प्रादेशिक भाषाओं में जवाब देने की अनुमति मिलनी चाहिए और इसके साथ-साथ मिथिला क्षेत्र में मैथिली भाषा में परीक्षा देने की अनुमति होनी चाहिए। ... (व्यवधान)

कुंवर अखिलेश सिंह (महाराजगंज, उ.प्र.) : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, इस पर हमारी घोर आपत्ति और विरोध है। हिन्दी का अपमान नहीं होना चाहिए। हिन्दी देश की राष्ट्र भाषा है। अगर हिन्दी को समाप्त करने का प्रयास किया जाएगा तो देश के लिए और लोक तंत्र के लिए घातक और दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण होगा। हम राष्ट्रभाषा का अपमान किसी भी कीमत पर बर्दाश्त नहीं करेंगे। मेरा आपसे विनम्र निवेदन है कि हिन्दी के प्रति जो विवमन किया जा रहा है, वह ठीक नहीं है। भारत की जन-जन की भाषा हिन्दी है। उसका सम्मान होना चाहिए। ...
(व्यवधान)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Kunwar Akhilesh Singh, please resume your seat.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Shri Vaiko, the matter raised by you is being projected now. Please take your seat.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Now, Shri Sudip Bandyopadhyay .

SHRI SUDIP BANDYOPADHYAY (CALCUTTA NORTH WEST): Sir, there are at least three or four States in our country where English is accepted as the official language. We should not forget that. We have got full regards and honour for the Hindi language. I would suggest that all the question papers could be prescribed on the basis of all the languages included or enlisted in the Eighth Schedule of the Constitution.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VAIKO : We would like to get a response from the hon. Minister.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DENZIL B. ATKINSON (NOMINATED): Sir, I associate myself with whatever has been said by Shri Vaiko but I take strong objections to what the hon. Member, Shri Mulayam Singh has said about the English language. English is the mother tongue of the Anglo Indian community in this country and we are recognised in the Constitution. I request him not to say such words about the English language. ... (*Interruptions*) lakhs of children study through English medium in our christian school.

कुंवर अखिलेश सिंह : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, अंग्रेजी भारतीय भाषा नहीं है। ... (व्यवधान)

श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, यह विदेशी संतानों की भाषा हो सकती है, भारतीय भाषा नहीं हो सकती। ... (व्यवधान) अंग्रेजी अंग्रेजों की औलादों की भाषा है। ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI S.S. PALANIMANICKAM (THANJAVUR): Hon. Deputy Speaker, Sir, on behalf of the DMK Party, I fully associate ourselves with the issue raised by Shri Vaiko. We request that all the competitive examinations should be conducted in all the regional languages included in the Eighth Schedule of the Constitution.... (*Interruptions*)

श्री सोमनाथ चटर्जी : मान्यवर, यह बहुत संवेदनशील मामला है। ... (व्यवधान)

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय : यह संवेदनशील मामला है।

श्री सोमनाथ चटर्जी : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, सब माननीय सदस्यों ने यहां जो अपने मत व्यक्त किये हैं, हम उसका आदर करते हैं। यह बहुत गंभीर मामला है और शून्यकाल में इसका कोई नतीजा नहीं निकलने वाला है। इसलिए हमारी विनती है कि इस संबंध में प्रधान मंत्री जी विरोधी दल की नेता को बुलायें, और उनसे बातचीत करके इसका हल निकालें। यह भाषा का मामला बहुत संवेदनशील मामला है इसलिए इसमें ऐसे कोई कदम नहीं उठाये जाने चाहिए जिससे हमारे देश के किसी प्रांत की जनता को ठेस पहुंचे।... (व्यवधान)

SHRI VAIKO : It is really a very sad effort.... (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Shri Vaiko, what is this? It is a very important matter. I want every Leader to speak on this.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : It is a very sensitive matter.... (*Interruptions*) Sir, for the benefit of my friends, what I have said is, it is a very sensitive matter and it should not be decided by just mentioning it during the 'Zero Hour'. Shri Vaiko, for once – although in that company – has raised a very pertinent issue. I would request the hon. Prime Minister, this is one of the issues on which he may think it right, to call all the Opposition Parties including the Leader of the Opposition – without being irritated so much – so that there could be a proper decision out of this discussion. Our intention is not to lower the importance of any language. India is a country where so many languages are spoken.

Kindly see, Shri Vaiko cannot understand my Hindi and I have to speak in English. If this is the position, how will you run the House? If everybody comes to the House and speaks in his or her mother tongue, what will happen to this House? Everybody will have to put on the earphones.

There has to be a language for India as a whole. It can either be Hindi or Tamil. I have nothing against Tamil. My daughter is now in Chennai. My grand daughter is trying to learn Tamil. She has stood first in her examination. No language is superior to other. This is a very vital issue and, therefore, we should proceed in a manner that a proper decision is taken on it. This is my request .

SHRI VAIKO : This is a wider issue. On this particular issue, we want the response of the Prime Minister. I agree fully with Shri Somnath Chatterjee that what he has mentioned is a wider issue. But on this particular issue which I have raised, I want a response from the hon. Prime Minister.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: He will respond.

श्री शिवराज वी.पाटील (लातूर) : मान्यवर, आज की चर्चा में जैसे सोमनाथ जी ने कहा, यह बहुत ही संवेदनशील मामला है और हमें इसे गंभीरता से लेकर, इस पर पूरी तरह चर्चा करके निर्णय करना जरूरी है। जहां तक हिन्दी और अंग्रेजी का संबंध है, हमारे कान्सटीट्यूशन में बताया गया है कि जब तक साउथ के लोग अंग्रेजी चाहते हैं और वह वहां पर है, तब तक हिन्दी और अंग्रेजी चलती रहेगी। जहां तक प्रांतीय भाषाओं का सवाल है, हमारे कान्सटीट्यूशन में जिन प्रांतीय भाषाओं का उल्लेख है, उन सारी प्रांतीय भाषाओं में प्रश्न पत्र पब्लिक सर्विस कमीशन के ऐग्जामिनेशन में आने चाहिए या नहीं आने चाहिए, इसके ऊपर पहले भी चर्चा हुई है। इसके ऊपर थोड़ा सा निर्णय हुआ है, पूरी तरह से निर्णय नहीं हुआ है। लेकिन यदि हमको लगता है कि ऐसा करने से हर प्रांत के लोगों को पब्लिक सर्विस कमीशन में आने का मौका मिलेगा तो उसमें कोई दिक्कत नहीं होनी चाहिए। मगर इसके साथ-साथ यह भी देखना जरूरी है कि जब हम पब्लिक सर्विस कमीशन के ऐग्जामिनेशन में प्रांतीय भाषाओं का उपयोग करेंगे तो क्या उस प्रांत के लोग दूसरे प्रांत में जाकर भी काम कर सकेंगे या नहीं कर सकेंगे और यह पब्लिक सर्विस कमीशन यूनियन पब्लिक सर्विस कमीशन रहेगा या स्टेट पब्लिक सर्विस कमीशन होगा। यह बहुत ही सैन्सिटिव ईशू है। हमारे देश में बहुत सारी चीजों से डिक्विजन हो रहा है। इसकी वजह से भी कोई डिक्विजन नहीं हो, यह देखते हुए यहां के लोगों की जो अपेक्षाएं हैं, उन्हें पूरी करने के लिए हम क्या कर सकते हैं, वह सबको मिल कर करना चाहिए, ऐसा हमको लगता है।

SHRI VAIKO : Sir, out of 1885 candidates, less than 100 candidates are from all the Southern and North-Eastern States. This is a total discrimination. Therefore, I have raised this issue...
(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: He will respond but before that I want to give chance to every Party.

SHRI K. MALAISAMY (RAMANATHAPURAM): Sir, on behalf of AIADMK Party, I like to place my views. I congratulate Shri Vaiko for having raised a very valid issue. On this issue, we cut-across party lines and we are one in every way. As far as the matter of protecting the languages of the entire country is concerned, we are not against any language. But at the same time, we are very much interested in protecting the interest of Tamils and Tamil Nadu. In that way, the trend and mood of House is perfectly in order. I am very happy that wisdom and reason prevailed in the minds of all big leaders. This is a very sensitive issue. It has to be very carefully handled. I think the Government has got enough problem with Gujarat. Therefore, they need not invite one more problem like this. I want to forewarn the Government that this is a very sensitive issue and the Govt. must see that the tyranny of the majority should not be imposed on the tiny minority.... (*Interruptions*). The examination in question has to be cancelled. Facility to write in regional languages should be provided. The Minister should respond to it.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: He will respond.

श्री देवेन्द्र प्रसाद यादव (झंझारपुर) : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, प्रतियोगिताएं या कम्पीटीटिव ऐग्जामिनेशन में देशभर में भारतीय भाषाओं को अधिकार है ही लेकिन छात्र-छात्राओं को प्रांतीय भाषाओं में भी उत्तर देने का अधिकार होना चाहिए क्योंकि यदि इसमें प्रांतीय भाषाओं का समावेश नहीं होगा तो उनकी अभिव्यक्ति नहीं हो पाएगी और वे जवाब नहीं दे पाएंगे। यह विषय बहुत ही महत्वपूर्ण और संवेदनशील है। आज इस सवाल पर सदन या देश को नहीं बंटना चाहिए लेकिन भारतीय भाषाओं को निश्चित रूप से इसमें पूरा आदर मिलना SÉÉÉÊcA ।

राष्ट्र की एकता भी इससे जुड़ी हुई है। इसीलिए भारतीय भाषाओं की महत्ता होनी चाहिए। प्रांतीय भाषाओं को भी इसमें सम्मिलित करना चाहिए।

SHRI K.A. SANGTAM (NAGALAND): India is a multi-racial, multi-ethnic, multi-religious and multi-linguistic country. So, I would like to make an appeal here. In States like those in the North-East we have adopted English as the official language. In my own State of Nagaland we have sixteen dialects,

but we do not have scripts. We have adopted the Roman script as the official one. We have adopted English as the official language. If we have to go by other languages, do we stand a chance of competing in the examinations?

As rightly said, in Goa, Andaman and Nicobar Islands and in other parts of India, people speak different languages. If we continue to stress that English should be taken away from the list of main languages, it would not be a correct decision. India has encouraged English language and that is the reason why we are standing first in the field of software in the world today. Whereas Japan, Korea and China have adopted their own languages and their own scripts, India chose to adopt English language as a medium in education as well as in the Government and therefore and we are first in the field of software. That is one important aspect.

If we do not encourage regional languages and if we do not encourage Hindi, then we would be failing in our duty. At the same time, we should continue with the English language so that everybody can translate their language into the other's language. I would, therefore, request the Government of India that we should continue Hindi as well as English as the official languages in all official matters.

श्री हरिभाऊ शंकर महाले (मालेगांव) : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, मकान में दीवार होती है, खिड़की की भी जरूरत होती है। राष्ट्रीय भाषाएं दी वार हैं और प्रांतीय भाषाएं खिड़की हैं इसलिए दोनों ही चाहिए।

SHRI E. PONNUSWAMY (CHIDAMBARAM): The issue raised by Shri Vaiko is a very serious and sensitive one. PMK is the only Party which had conducted a seminar in 1998 in Delhi on the national languages issue where it was said that all the 18 languages be included in the official languages list.

The Father of the Nation Mahatma Gandhiji wrote his autobiography in Gujarati and Rabindra Nath Tagore wrote Gitanjali in Bengali. So, mother tongue must be given priority in the competitive examinations to enable people have a fair chance in all the attempts in their career. For once, Shri Mulayam Singh Yadav also supported us by saying that mother tongue be allowed. We the PMK

associate ourselves with the issue raised by Shri Vaiko and reiterate that mother tongue be given priority in competitive examinations.

SHRI P.C. THOMAS (MUVATTUPUZHA): India is a country with much diversity. In our Constitution we have accepted federalism. It is necessary to strengthen the federalist nature and the real intent of the makers of our Constitution. The issue raised by Shri Vaiko is a sensitive and a serious one to be addressed by all of us. We cannot leave away this issue.

Therefore, I would submit, as most of the sections of the House did, that we must give due importance to all the languages. In fact, we should accept that all the Indian languages are national languages and as national languages spoken in the nation we should give importance to all the languages in all the tests, including the one which has been mentioned by Shri Vaiko.

Here the issue has come up because the nature of the questions has also changed. Earlier it was of objective type and now it has been made into descriptive type. That is also an issue to be addressed. In the light of the changes now taken place in the type of questions it is very important that we look at the language issue also. As far as English is concerned, I would submit that it has been accepted as an international language and we cannot go back from it as it connects us to other nations also. Therefore, it must continue.

SHRI SURESH KURUP (KOTTAYAM): Candidates are allowed to take part in the Civil Services examinations in regional languages. In Staff Selection Commission examinations they have changed over to descriptive type questions and answers in order to discriminate against people who are from the South and the North-Eastern parts of the country .

The results also show that. The results should be cancelled. This examination should be cancelled, fresh examination should be conducted and candidates should be allowed to take part in this examination using their regional languages..... (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: It is a very important issue and every Member is taking part in it. Something useful is being done.

श्री रतिलाल कालीदास वर्मा (धन्धुका) : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, श्री वैको जी ने जो बात कही है, मैं उसका समर्थन करता हूँ। बात यह है कि पूर्व से पश्चिम तक और उत्तर से दक्षिण तक पूरे देश के अन्दर विविधता है और उसी में एकता है। महात्मा गांधी, जिनको हमने राष्ट्रपिता के रूप में सम्मानित किया है, उन्होंने कहा था कि हर बालक को शिक्षा उसकी मातृभाषा में देनी चाहिए। जब वह शिक्षा की शुरुआत अपनी मातृभाषा में करता है, तो उसको परीक्षा भी उसी भाषा में देने का अधिकार देना चाहिए। राष्ट्रीय परीक्षाओं में भी अपनी मातृभाषा में बैठ सके, ऐसा होना चाहिए, यह मैं मानता हूँ। राष्ट्रपिता महात्मा गांधी ने बात कही थी कि मातृभाषा में परीक्षा होनी चाहिए।

श्री रामदास आठवले (पंढरपुर) : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, श्री वैको जी ने जो सवाल उठाया है, वह बहुत महत्वपूर्ण है। लोकल रीजनल लैंग्वेज में स्टूडेंट को एग्जाम देने का अधिकार होना चाहिए। इसके अलावा दूसरा महत्वपूर्ण सवाल है, अपना भारत देश एक है, अपने देश का संविधान एक है, मगर अपने देश में धर्म ज्यादा हैं और अपने देश में जातियां भी ज्यादा हैं तथा अपने देश में लैंग्वेज भी ज्यादा हैं, लोकल लैंग्वेज तो हैं ही। इसके बावजूद को-आर्डिनेट करने वाली भाषा की भी आवश्यकता है। अंग्रेजी की भी आवश्यकता है, अगर कोई विद्यार्थी अंग्रेजी में एग्जाम देना चाहता है, तो उसको रोकना भी ठीक नहीं है। अगर हमें दुनिया का सामना करना है, तो अंग्रेजी की भी आवश्यकता है। इसलिए स्टूडेंट अंग्रेजी में एग्जाम देना चाहता है, तो उसका प्रोवीजन होना चाहिए, मगर हमारी राष्ट्रभाषा हिन्दी है। हिन्दी सभी लोगों को सीखनी चाहिए। जैसे सोमनाथ जी ने अपनी बात कही। कोई भाषा में बोलने का प्रयत्न करते हैं, तो बोल सकते हैं। सोमनाथ जी ने हिन्दी बहुत अच्छी बोली है और मैं उनका अभिनन्दन करता हूँ तथा वैको जी से निवेदन करता हूँ कि आप थोड़ा सा मुलायम सिंह जी के साथ आइए ... (व्यवधान) हिन्दी भी थोड़ी-थोड़ी आती है, हम तमिल भी सुनते हैं ... (व्यवधान) मराठी नहीं बोलेंगे, तो बालासाहिब जी को बोलना पड़ेगा। ... (व्यवधान) मेरे कहने का मतलब इतना ही है कि सबको जोड़ने वाली भाषा होनी चाहिए। जिस तरह से भारत के संविधान में सभी भारतीय जातियों के लोगों को एक साथ जोड़ा है, उसी तरह की एक भाषा ऐसी होनी चाहिए, जो सभी प्रान्तों में हो। लोकल लैंग्वेज का मैं सपोर्ट करता हूँ, मगर उसके बावजूद एक भाषा ऐसी होनी चाहिए और हिन्दी को हम लोगों ने स्वीकार किया है। हिन्दी को सिखाने का प्रयत्न भारत सरकार को करना चाहिए। आपके साथ काफी लोग हैं। ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI M.V.V.S. MURTHI (VISAKHAPATNAM): Is there any link between writing the examination in the regional language and what he is speaking now? Sir, it is a diversion of the subject..... (Interruptions)

श्री अनंत गंगाराम गीते : महोदय, श्री वैको जी ने रिक्रूटमेंट के बारे में बात कही है। इस बात को मोड़कर कहां ले जाया जा रहा है। वैको जी ने भाषा के संदर्भ में इशू यहां पर उठाया है और रीजनल इम्बैलेंस के बारे में बताया है। प्रादेशिक भाषा में परीक्षा होनी चाहिए। इसकी चर्चा यहां पर हो रही है, लेकिन इस चर्चा को कहां से कहां ले जाया जा रहा है।

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय : इस सदन में तो बात कहीं से कहीं चली जाती है।

... (व्यवधान)

श्री रामदास आठवले : मेरे कहने का मतलब है कि श्री वैको जी ने जो सवाल उठाया है, उसको मैं सपोर्ट करता हूँ, लेकिन सब को जोड़ने के लिए एक भाग होनी चाहिए और उसकी आवश्यकता है।

SHRI K. FRANCIS GEORGE (IDDUKKI): Sir, I rise to support the issue that has been raised by Shri Vaiko. In our multi-linguistic country, it is not fair to discriminate or disregard any regional language. I do not know how this issue has come up at all. It is because we have three-language formula here. We have the mother tongue, the regional language and then the national language. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: He has given the details.

SHRI K. FRANCIS GEORGE : If the Government is bound by this formula that has been accepted in the Constitution even, then how can this issue come up? How can any regional language, which has been accepted in the Eighth Schedule of the Constitution, could be discriminated against? So, the point I want to raise is this. Along with Shri Vako and other hon. Members, I would request that this particular examination may be cancelled and chance be given to all those who want to appear in the examination throughout the country.

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL (HOOGLY): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, the language policy of the country has been discussed several times. We have broadly reached a consensus that we should have one official language, that is Hindi, and all the other languages, which are mentioned in the Eighth Schedule should be encouraged. About the link language, we do follow the three-language formula.

This is a very sensitive issue and piecemeal discussion may lead to further confusion. It is because on the issue of language, our neighbouring country was divided. It was due to imposition of a language. There is a mis-conception in this country that some particular language is sought to be imposed on other languages and on others mother tongues. This has already been issued. ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI K. YERRANNAIDU : Sir, he is diverting the issue. ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL : I am concluding. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: He is coming to that.

... (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: He is a Professor and he will have to come.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI K. YERRANNAIDU : This is a limited issue of writing examination. Shri Rupchand Pal is raising the language issue. ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL : While supporting the issue raised by Shri Vaiko., I would like to say this. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: He is supporting Shri Vaiko.

SHRI RUPCHAND PAL : While supporting the issue raised by Shri Vaiko, I would like to say that in respect of IT Sector, the advantage that India has, among many other things, is that the number of English-learning people in this country is much larger than many other countries in the world. This is an advantage, particularly in the age of Information Technology, which is used world over. ... (*Interruptions*) I demand a full-fledged discussion on this issue. ... (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS AND INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: Sir, the most sensitive part of the 'Zero Hour' is that an issue is suddenly raised in the House without a notice. Being the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs, it becomes my responsibility to answer the questions, which are beyond my competence and jurisdiction. We almost discussed this issue for about forty or forty-five minutes. Even though none of us wanted to discuss it, everybody discussed it. Even though none of us wanted to enlarge its scope, everybody added to the original scope.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: They have contributed.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: I would take up one point before I come to the specific point raised by Shri Vaiko .

I think, all of us agree that the creation of any language was to unite the people and not to divide the people. When we went from a gesture language to a spoken language and a written language, the basic need of the humanity was to communicate with the other person and try to unite people and not to divide people. I am sure, the whole House will agree with me that any discussion which we have under such circumstances should unite the country and not to divide it. The AIADMK leader has rightly put it that the Government has many hot issues on hand. We do not want to add one more issue. My problem is that I have not raised it. Once it is raised, it becomes my responsibility to answer it.

I can briefly say that Hindi is our national language. We love and respect Hindi. As in the case of Shri Vaiko, Hindi is not my mother tongue. But as an Indian citizen, I would submit that Hindi is a language which has an old tradition. I think, by love and affection, we should try to learn Hindi. When I said by love and affection we should learn it, I would still reiterate what Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru told long back in the 1960s that if the whole country learns Hindi by love and affection, there is no objection. I think Shri Vaiko will also not object to it. But, at the same time, we would not like to force the language or impose the language till the society is ripe for it, till the society is ready for it. As long as that, the usage of English becomes necessary.

One more thing which my comrade Rupchand Pal mentioned. Indeed he helped me in that matter. I also belonged to a movement like Shri Mulayam Singh. In my initial days, in my college days, I joined the *Angreji hatao* campaign. But I can say that lately I have realised that one of the strengths which India has today internationally, particularly in the sector of Information Technology, is its largest human resource who can speak English. We are ahead of China only because of the English language which we have. Now the Chinese are trying to learn English very fast. At this juncture, if we start deviating from English and if we are not allowing our students to learn English, we will be giving double advantage to China which, I think, as a nation, we should not give. So, I would beg of Shri Mulayam Singh to consider this. हिंदी का मेरा स्नेह और प्रेम किसी से कम नहीं है। मैं तो कभी-कभार मुलायम सिंह जी से कह देता हूँ कि इनसे अच्छी और शुद्ध हिंदी मैं बोलकर बता सकता हूँ और अगर शर्त लग जाए कि आधे घंटे बिना अंग्रेजी शब्दों का उ

पयोग करके हिंदी बोलें तो उत्तर भारत के भी बहुत से सांसद बोल नहीं पाएंगे और मैं बोलकर दिखा सकता हूँ। इसलिए मेरी हिंदी की भक्ति कम नहीं है। But, at the same time, I would like to say that if the real India, if the rural villagers want to go ahead in Information Technology, if we stop them from learning English, we will be putting them in a disadvantageous position not only at the national level but also at the international level. So, I do not want the Indian citizens, Indian students and the Indian kids from any State, particularly from Bihar and Uttar Pradesh to be put in a disadvantageous position for lack of the English language when they go at the international level in information technology.... (Interruptions)

SHRI VAIKO : Sir, let the hon. Minister complete his submission.... (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: If there is any misunderstanding, that could be removed now.

श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव : वैको जी, हम इनके विरोध में नहीं हैं। हमारा यह कहना है कि आप जो यह कह रहे हैं कि मुलायम सिंह जी अंग्रेजी विरोधी है तो जो विदेशी भाषा या विदेशी साहित्य है उसका कोई विरोध मुलायम सिंह नहीं कर सकता, वह तो कोई नादान या मूर्ख करेगा। यह सवाल नहीं है, सवाल यह है कि हमारा सरकारी कामकाज, संसद, न्यायालय, सार्वजनिक क्षेत्र का कामकाज बहुभाषी बने। अगर कोई अंग्रेजी सीखे, जर्मनी सीखे या कोई विदेशी भाषा सीखे, इटैलियन कोई सीखे - मुझे इस पर कोई आपत्ति नहीं है लेकिन लोक सभा का सारा सरकारी कामकाज बहुभाषी बने और न्यायपालिका भी बहुभाषी बने। सरकारी नौकरियों में उन्हें हर भारतीय भाषा में लिखने का अवसर दिया जाए। इसलिए कृपया आप समाजवादी पार्टी की नीतियों को समझने की कोशिश कीजिए। मुझे इस बात की खुशी हुई कि आप हम से ज्यादा हिन्दी जानते हैं। मुझे इस बात का बुरा नहीं लगा। हम इसका स्वागत करते हैं और कभी मौका आएगा तो आपका सम्मान भी करेंगे। ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI VAIKO : Let him complete his submission. ... (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: If there is any misunderstanding, the same could be removed now.

... (Interruptions)

श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव : जिस किसी मनुष्य ने यहां जन्म लिया, वह कृपया बताए कि वह जब पैदा हुआ तब उसने कौन सी भाषा बोली थी? ... (व्यवधान) फ्रांस और जर्मनी के लोग मातृभाषा ही बोलते हैं।

श्री प्रियरंजन दासमुंशी (रायगंज) : बच्चा पैदा होता है तो सबसे पहले मां बोलता है।

श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव : अन्तर्राष्ट्रीय स्तर पर यह बात कहना गलत है। आप ऐसा कह कर सदन को गुमराह मत कीजिए चाहे वह रूस हो, जर्मनी हो या फ्रांस हो। मैं बहुत से देशों की बात कह सकता हूँ। वहाँ सरकारी कामकाज अंग्रेजी में नहीं होता है। उन देशों ने अंग्रेजी के सहारे तरक्की नहीं की। उन्होंने अपनी भाषा का प्रयोग करने से तरक्की की। ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI VAIKO : The most classical language is Tamil. ... (*Interruptions*) Tamil should be the official language of India. ... (*Interruptions*)

श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव : उन्होंने अंग्रेजी हटाने के लिए कैसा कानून बनाया, आपको यह भी पढ़ना चाहिए।

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Shri Vaiko, time is running out. ... (*Interruptions*)

श्री प्रियरंजन दासमुंशी : अभी लोक सभा के क्वश्चन पेपर्स हिन्दी और अंग्रेजी में आते हैं। क्या कल से ये सभी भारतीय भाषाओं में बनेंगे? वह अभी हिन्दी और अंग्रेजी में बनते हैं। अब उसे पूरी इंडियन लैंग्वेजस में बना दिया जाए। ... (व्यवधान)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Hon. Members, please resume your seats.

... (*Interruptions*)

श्री प्रमोद महाजन: मुलायम सिंह जी, जब मनुय पैदा होता है तो वह किसी भाषा में नहीं बोलता है। वह रोता है तो रोने की कोई भाषा नहीं होती है। ... (व्यवधान) मुझे पूरा करने दीजिए।

श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव : बच्चा सबसे पहले मां बोलता है इसलिए उसे मातृभाषा कहा गया है।

श्री प्रियरंजन दासमुंशी : आप एक राय दीजिए। जब किसी को दिल की खतरनाक बीमारी होती है तो वह बड़े डाक्टर को बुलाता है। क्या वह उसके कान में कहता है कि मेरी प्रान्तीय भाषा में प्रिसक्रिप्शन लिखो? वह कहता है कि जल्दी से मेरा इलाज करो। ऐसी बहस करके यहां क्यों झगड़ा कर रहे हैं?

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: I would now conclude by saying about the particular issue. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: The hon. Member has raised a point, Mr. Minister, reply to it.

... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: I was in a dilemma. I was only going to refer to the issue raised by him. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: You are also in a mood to join the debate in the House.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: I should do it for that is my duty.

Lastly, I would say only one thing and that is about the issue of Staff Selection Commission examinations raised by Shri Vaiko.

In principle, I think that if somebody does not have the knowledge of a particular language, that should not put somebody at a disadvantageous position as far as these examinations are concerned. Shri Vaiko has told two things. Firstly, the style of examination has been changed where some descriptive questions have been asked, due to which persons, who do not know Hindi or English, were put to a disadvantageous position. That seems to be the case because in an objective question-answer paper, your knowledge and proficiency is not needed. At this moment, Shri Vaiko and the whole House would appreciate that I do not know as to what kind of examination it was, as to what were the questions and as to what were asked last time and this time. As I said, in principle, I do not want anybody to be at a disadvantage whether he is a Tamilian or a Bihari. I do not want anybody to be at a disadvantageous position. I want everybody to be at an advantageous position. In a competition examination, merit should matter .

13.00 hrs.

So, whether Tamilians get all the seats or Biharis get all the seats, it is not really our concern. But as you rightly said, there should be a level playing field. The whistle should blow when everybody is in line. I have taken note of what he has said.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : He is not insisting on a reply by tomorrow.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: I cannot even reply by tomorrow. So, I will take up this matter with the concerned department and see that at least, as he has said, the disadvantage is not there if the language is changed. At the same time, I cannot react to this on the spot. I take a serious note of this and communicate to the Minister concerned.

SHRI K. YERRANNAIDU : Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, he can ask the concerned Minister to convene an all-party meeting on this issue.

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: Sir, there are two demands for convening an all-party meeting. One is by Shri Somnath Chatterjee who has demanded it for a larger issue and another is by Shri Yerrannaidu on a smaller issue. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: This is 'Zero Hour'. How can he reply just like that?

SHRI PRAMOD MAHAJAN: Sir, looking at the agenda before Parliament, whatever Shri Somnath Chatterjee and Shri Yerrannaidu say, it is very difficult for me not to communicate to the Prime Minister and the concerned Minister. I will communicate both the requests. ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (BANKURA): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, I want to raise an important matter. ... (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I cannot help now.

13.02 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Fourteen of the Clock.

14.03 hrs.

लोक सभा 1403 बजे पुनः समवेत् हुई।

(**Shri Basu deb Acharia in the Chair**)