

>

Title: Further discussion on Global Warming raised by Shri C.K. Chandrappan on 8.05.07 (Concluded).

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, the House will take up Item No.26—Discussion under Rule 193 on Global Warming.

Now, the hon. Minister is to reply.

SHRI KHARABELA SWAIN (BALASORE): Sir, yesterday when we were agitating, the Minister, Mr. Kapil Sibal passed some sarcastic comments against the Party like BJP. He said: "BJP is a party of carbon dioxide. It is a Party of carbon monoxide..."(*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI): I think strictly once we go by the rules, that is not part of the record.

SHRI KHARABELA SWAIN : Let me say that I can also use very strong words but I will never do that.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I think it is not part of the record.

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: It is not part of the record. Unnecessarily, you are spoiling your Party by bringing it on record. It was not part of the record.

THE MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS (SHRI A. RAJA): It is nothing but a running commentary.

MR. CHAIRMAN: It was not recorded. Please take your seat.

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: It was not recorded. You are bringing it on record. ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI KHARABELA SWAIN : But they are not such foul-mouthed. That is the only comment that I have to make.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, it was not recorded. Please take your seat.

SHRI KHARABELA SWAIN : Yesterday, somebody said that some Member was *â€¦*. But the Speaker said from the podium that this sort of word should not be used. But do you expect that one party will use such types of words against the other party?...(*Interruptions*) I very strongly protest it. I never use words like that ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: That was not recorded and your version will also not be recorded.

SHRI C.K. CHANDRAPPAN (TRICHUR): Sir, I would like to make a submission. With his reply, I think the discussion is over. Is not it? But I think there was a promise made that Mr. Kapil Sibal will intervene.

MR. CHAIRMAN: He has concluded his speech.

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: I think Mr. Chandrappan should know that the discussion is concluded. That was decided in the meeting this morning. Now, it is the Minister to reply.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, the Minister is to reply.[\[MSOffice23\]](#)

...(*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Within two minutes his speech was over.

SHRI KHARABELA SWAIN : It is better that he speaks for at least ten minutes. ...(*Interruptions*)

सभापति महोदय : ंरिकर्ड में कुछ नहीं जा रहा है, आप क्यों हल्ला कर रहे हैं।

â€¦(*व्यवधान*)

THE MINISTER OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY AND MINISTER OF EARTH SCIENCES (SHRI KAPIL SIBAL): Sir, he is the Minister concerned. There is no need for me to speak. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN : He does not want to speak.

...(Interruptions)

---

\* Not recorded

SHRI A. RAJA: Sir, I must thank the hon. Members who participated in the debate. ...(Interruptions)

सभापति महोदय : वह बोल चुके हैं।

â€¦(व्यवधान)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Nothing is being recorded.

(Interruptions)\* â€¦

SHRI KHARABELA SWAIN : It is because it seems I prevented him to speak. ...(Interruptions)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI: Kindly allow us to conduct the House properly. It was decided in the morning meeting with all the Leaders. ...(Interruptions)

SHRI KHARABELA SWAIN : I feel guilty because it seems I prevented him. ...(Interruptions)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : Do not feel guilty. You may not feel guilty and he may never feel shy. ...(Interruptions).

SHRI A. RAJA : Do not feel guilty. His time will come. ...(Interruptions)

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : He will continue to attack your philosophy whenever he gets the chance. ...(Interruptions)

SHRI KHARABELA SWAIN : I am not disturbing. I am asking to speak for ten minutes. ...(Interruptions)

सभापति महोदय : आपका इंटरवेंशन लिखा नहीं जा रहा है, आप क्यों बोल रहे हैं।

â€¦(व्यवधान)

---

\* Not recorded

SHRI A. RAJA: Sir, I must thank the hon. Members who have participated in the important debate which is a burning subject throughout the country. During the discussions the significance attached to the global warming or climate change has been exposed by the hon. Members. Before starting my reply to the discussion, I must salute Mrs. Indira Gandhi who took the initiative for bringing the very important piece of legislation in the name of Environmental Protection Act, 1986. Before 1986 no such legislative measure was taken. Of course, after 1986 we were concerned about the global warming and climate change. Not only that, in the year 1980 the then Prime Minister Mrs. Gandhi brought another piece of legislation in the name of Forest Conservation Act, 1980. Before that, of course, the Indian Forest Act, 1927 was there. But it was only a prohibitory clause and no regulatory clause was available in those days. Only after the 1980s, during the period of Mrs. Indira Gandhi, all these measures have started. Now we are starting at a very peak point to discuss this subject.

On global warming, with all my due respect to the hon. Members, some of the hon. Members exposed to this House that global warming can be controlled within territorial limits. With such a specification in the mind, with all my sincerity to the hon. Members in this House, I must say that such a territorial limit cannot be attached to the climate change. As a whole the climate

change must be looked after by all countries in the universe, globally.

Whenever we are talking about the global warming and climate change, the two important measures that have been taken by the United Nations and the other countries must be taken into account. Some of the hon. Members, more specifically my predecessor Shri Suresh Prabhu who is unfortunately not here, spoke on the subject with valuable points. He said that only after 1750 the human induced climatic change came into existence because of developmental activities.

The mover of the discussion, hon. Member Shri Chandrapan gave a very valid point that the glaciers are being melted and one more institute can be put up in this country to have a study exclusively for this purpose. Of course, Mrs. Maneka Gandhi wanted to have a Committee which would be consisting intra-ministerial members. I think that all the hon. Members are aware that when the Budget was presented to this House by the hon. Minister of Finance, in the Budget speech itself it has been categorically stated that there will be an expert Committee on climate change consisting of all Ministries, those who are having a share in the climate change namely, environment, science and technology and other Ministries.

According to the promise made in this House, a Committee has been formed and the notification has been issued under the chairmanship of Dr. Chidambaram. That has been issued. [\[MSOffice24\]](#)

Before replying the hon. Members' queries and apprehensions which were expressed in this House, I must say that we are being guided by two very important instruments – United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change and the Kyoto Protocol. The United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change is nothing but a system through which all the countries were permitted to assess, to quantify their emissions in 1994. Before that, no country was asked to quantify its emissions. Emissions were there, but no country was asked to give report to the United Nations about its emissions. In 1994, under the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, it was done. The quantification assessment was done in each and every country, which was communicated to the United Nations, and it was put on the public domain so that people may know which are the countries polluting this globe. Whenever we are talking about climate change or global warming, the very catchy words, important words being often used are 'sustainable development'. India is one country which is having its own unique perception in its mind as to how to use the sustainable development. Whenever we are planning, the planning must be towards accelerated economic growth, but the accelerated economic growth and planning must be coupled with the principle of sustainable development. That is the stand taken by India in international forums.

According to United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, India has assessed its own emissions. Some of the Members had apprehension in their minds that climate change is going to affect India more or we are the highest emitter in the world, without knowing the consequences. The United Nations Framework on Climate Change funded to assist all the countries to quantify their emissions. We were very proud before the international community in telling that we are having only 4 per cent of the global emissions while we are having 17 per cent of the population of the world. Of course, global average may be 23 per cent. When it is compared to the other countries, we are emitting only 4 per cent of US, 8 per cent of Germany, 9 per cent of UK and 10 per cent of Japan. Yesterday, my colleague Shri Kapil Sibal told what are the greenhouse gases – carbon dioxide, methane and nitrous oxide. In terms of quantification, our emission in 1994 were is, according to the UN Report, 793 million tonnes carbon dioxide in 1994, 18 million tonnes methane and 0.017 million tonne nitrous oxide.

What is going on in this country with regard to climate change or global warming? As I put it earlier, a single country in this globe cannot protect the climate change, cannot speak exclusively for climate change. It is a universal phenomenon. If at all India is not emitting and some other country is emitting, then automatically the climate will be changed. For that, Kyoto Protocol came into existence. Regarding Kyoto Protocol, the Members are aware that there is a war between the developed countries and the developing countries. According to us, we are emitting only four per cent while per capita emissions of the US, UK and Australia, are the highest in the world. According to the development, they are having more industries, more aluminium factories and more distilleries. So, developed countries are emitting more whereby climate is changing and because of the climate change, the developing countries are going to be affected.

Now, there are parallel talks going on at WTO regarding climate change. A few days back, the Prime Minister gave a statement in the WTO also that the developed countries wanted to discuss non-trade issues while it was earlier promised that non-trade issues will not be permitted in the WTO. Now, the developed countries are coming and pressing us, stating that these environmental issues must be discussed in the WTO itself. So, such a significant debate is going on in the world. Under Kyoto Protocol, full protection was given to the developing countries and developing countries, including India, are having no commitment at all in the Kyoto Protocol. It was accepted because we are the lowest polluter. Whoever is polluting this globe has to pay more. [\[s25\]](#)

According to the Kyoto Protocol provisions, India is very safe and our emissions are within the limit. But we cannot give any commitment for further reduction. We were very categorical about it before the international community whether it is the United Nations or any other forum constituted by various countries. I am saying this because we are having bilateral talks with other



countries like Australia, USA, Canada, etc. We were very categorical about it in the G-8 Plus 5 Environment Ministers Conference also held recently in Germany.

Yes, our emission is very low when it is compared with other developed countries, but we cannot give any commitment. At the same time, some people including hon. Members in the House are thinking that India is polluting more because Kyoto Protocol does not bind India for reducing emission. This stigma is totally wrong, and it must be removed from our minds. Even though we have no commitments for reducing GHG emissions under the Kyoto Protocol, yet we are taking very hectic, speedy and effective steps to reduce our emissions.

Before going into the details about the Kyoto Protocol, there is the issue of global warming. How can we reduce global warming? Kyoto Protocol is there, and it says that all developed countries must reduce their emissions. Further, the developing countries need not give any commitment, but they must see that they take effective steps to reduce emissions according to their capabilities. ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI BIKRAM KESHARI DEO (KALAHANDI): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would request the hon. Minister to kindly yield for a minute.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please let him conclude his reply, and you can speak after he concludes his reply.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI BIKRAM KESHARI DEO : Mr. Chairman, Sir, the issue of global warming was to be discussed further. There was a ruling from the Chair that there will be further discussion on the issue of global warming. Thereafter, the hon. Minister would reply to the discussion. Today, this issue suddenly came up, and no Member has taken part in the discussion. I would request you to kindly give us some time to ask some clarificatory questions from the hon. Minister after the hon. Minister concludes his reply. We would like to ask some clarifications from the hon. Minister regarding some important issues, which we have in mind.

MR. CHAIRMAN: It is all right.

SHRI BIKRAM KESHARI DEO : Thank you, Sir.

SHRI A. RAJA : Although there is no express commitment under the Kyoto Protocol, yet the Government of India is very much concerned about issues like climate change and emissions. Two systems are available under the Kyoto Protocol for reduction of emissions. One is domestic, and the other is international. What is the international outlet available under the Kyoto Protocol? It is called the Clean Development Mechanism (CDM) project. CDM project is a system where the developed countries reduce emissions in the developing countries using technology and financial support. This reduction of emission can be discounted in the account of the developed countries. This is the system available under the CDM. India is having the highest potential account in the CDM projects. Nearly, 599 projects have been cleared so far under the CDM projects, and India is one among the biggest achievers in this regard.

What are the domestic endeavours? It is not only the Parliamentarians, but even the laymen are thinking that India is not bothered about reducing emissions since as per Kyoto Protocol, developing countries have no commitment to reduce GHGs. We were very deeply concerned about the Kyoto Protocol even though there is no expressed commitment. How can I say this? The manner in which the power projects work in this country has been contemplated in the Electricity Act 2003 itself. I can mention the detailed steps and the measures being taken in this regard.

If electricity is produced through coal or any other material, then there will be pollution. In order to reduce emissions and reduce pollution, we are switching over to hydro and renewable power. Nearly, 3.26 million biogas plants; 34.3 million improved wood-stoves; 3,50,000 solar lanterns; 1,77,000 solar home lighting systems; 41,400 solar street lighting systems; and 4,200 solar pump-sets have been installed in this country since 1994. ...(*Interruptions*)[\[r26\]](#)

DR. SUJAN CHAKRABORTY (JADAVPUR): What about the percentage in terms of total energy that we require?

SHRI A. RAJA: That is different. How much we are going to consume and how much we need is a different issue. ...(*Interruptions*)

DR. SUJAN CHAKRABORTY : It is less than one per cent.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Let the Minister conclude his reply.

SHRI A. RAJA: What I want to submit before the House is that we are trying to switch over the technology in the power sector in accordance with the U.N. Convention on Climate Change.

What about our emissions? As I told you, it is only 4 per cent, when the global average is 23 per cent. Sector-wise, from the energy side, the emission is 61 per cent. Supposing we are accounting for 100 per cent emission, then the emissions from the energy sector alone constitute 61 per cent. Naturally, our prime concern must be to see that the energy sector is reformed in such a way that the emissions are reduced by the induction of new technologies. That is why, we amended the Electricity Act, 2003, and we started giving priority to hydro electric power.

DR. SUJAN CHAKRABORTY : That was not the main purpose of amending the Electricity Act of 2003.

**सभापति महोदय :** अभी आपकी बात रिकार्ड में नहीं जाएगी। जब मंत्री जी जवाब समाप्त कर दें, उसके बाद आप पूछें। Do not intervene like this.

SHRI A. RAJA: A provision has been made to switch over to it. Hydro power initiatives worth 50,000 MW, over 50 per cent from RoR projects, are to be accomplished by 2012. These are the commitments made by the Power Ministry. These are the domestic measures that we are taking in our country, notwithstanding the Kyoto Protocol commitments which were given to the developed countries. Therefore, the feeling that is there in the minds of many people that since India has no binding commitments under the Kyoto Protocol, it is allowing the emissions very freely is a wrong notion. The Government of India is deeply concerned about it.

When the Environmental Protection Act came into existence, in this very House, the then Prime Minister Shrimati Gandhi said: "The Government is very keen that this world, this universe, this globe which was inherited by our forefathers has been entrusted to us to give it safely to the future generations." The advice given by Shrimati Gandhi is very well taken by the Government, and we are making all efforts and endeavours to improve the climate.

SHRI BIKRAM KESHARI DEO : Sir, I want to raise only one point.

Thank you, Mr. Chairman, Sir, for giving me an opportunity to seek clarification on one point. The Minister gave a very well prepared and well-studied reply. First of all, I want to thank him for the same. However, in his reply, he missed one very important aspect.

Regarding tropical rain-forests, a study was made by Deborah and David Clark of the La Selva Biological Station in Costa Rica, and Charles Keeting and Stephen Piper of the Scripps Institution who reported that trees in rain-forests grow slowly in warmer night temperatures, which is the hallmark of climate change in the tropics.

We come within the tropics. Therefore, the amount of natural rain-forest cover which we have and the tropical forest which we have, have the capacity to regenerate itself. You have spent crores of rupees in plantation. Had you spent that much amount of money on the protection of the rain-forests and tropical forests, there would have been a marked improvement in the climate change.

**सभापति महोदय:** आपकी बात पूरी हो गई है अब आप बैठ जाएं।

SHRI BIKRAM KESHARI DEO : Sir, India is also a signatory to the Clean Air Act of 1970 to which amendments were made in 1977 and 1990 to reduce sulphur nitrogen oxide particulate emissions from various types of industries. We have not applied this Clean Air Act in our country in true sense. Will the Minister take up these two reforms, that is, one on the tropical and rain-forests and the other on the clean air.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No other queries please.

SHRI BIKRAM KESHARI DEO : Sir, we want a clarification from the Minister.

SHRIMATI TEJASWINI SEERAMESH (KANAKAPURA): I am only requesting the Chair that the House should be allowed to have an elaborate discussions in the near future on this issue of global warming.

...(Interruptions)

**सभापति महोदय:** यह तरीका सही नहीं है। अब डिस्कशन खत्म हो गया है।

SHRI GURUDAS DASGUPTA (PANSKURA): Sir, he is the mover of the Resolution.

SHRI C.K. CHANDRAPPA : Sir, we may be in a hurry to wind up the show, but that is a different matter. ...(Interruptions)[r27]

He may be in a hurry to wind up the show. That is a different matter. ...(Interruptions) I was very disappointed with the manner in which the discussion, which was termed by the Speaker as one of the most important discussions, is wound up. One of the main points raised was the unilateral withdrawal of the United States from the Kyoto Protocol. We suggested that India should take the initiative to mobilize the developing countries the non-aligned countries and put up a global fight and stand

against the United States, about which the Minister even did not mention. I would like to know as to what is the opinion of the Government on this? ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI KHARABELA SWAIN : Hon. Minister spoke about shifting from thermal power generation to hydro-electricity. In my State in Orissa, many developers are coming forward to set up all these projects. What the Government is going to do to ensure zero emission from these thermal power stations set up all over the country? ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN : This is not the procedure.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI A. RAJA: Under the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, the USA is a signatory, whereby they quantified their own emission levels and they disclosed as to how much is their emission level in comparison to other nations. We gave all the details as to how much is the emission levels of India. Sir, hectic negotiations are going on. Even a few days back - when it was disclosed by our hon. Prime Minister that under the WTO - it was promised that non-trading issues will not be discussed. For the first time, developed countries including the U.K., the U.S.A. wanted to discuss non-trading issues including environment in the WTO. What I wanted to submit before the House is, under the Kyoto Protocol on par with the WTO, there is a war going on between the developed and the developing countries, where we are pressurizing the developed countries to comply with their existing commitments and to take lead for accepting deeper commitments for future periods. ...(*Interruptions*)

सभापति महोदय : आपकी बात रिकार्ड में नहीं जा रही है, आप बैठ जाइये।

...(*व्यवधान*)\*

SHRI A. RAJA: How can we compel them? We cannot compel them. At the same time, we are mobilizing with all the developing countries including Brazil, China in this regard. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN : Mr. Minister, please address the Chair.

...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI A. RAJA: In Kyoto Protocol, all developing countries are behind India. We are negotiating on behalf of developing countries. But I must disclose one more point that though they are not signatories to Kyoto Protocol, some of the developed countries including Australia wanted to attempt in the other way, notwithstanding the Kyoto Protocol, to address the issue. The Asia-Pacific Partnership on Clean Energy and Climate, whose partners include India, China, Korea, Australia and Japan, comprise one half of the world's population, seek to address poverty alleviation, economic growth, air pollution and energy security. ...(*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Nothing except the speech of the Minister will be recorded, Shri Chandrappan.

(*Interruptions*)\* &euro;

SHRI A. RAJA: We are the forerunners and we are pressurising other developed countries to meet the Kyoto Protocol commitments...(*Interruptions*)

