

>

Title: Further discussion on motion regarding expressing deep concern over price rise, and calling upon Government to take immediate effective steps to check inflation, giving relief to common man (Motion Adopted).

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE): Madam, Speaker, I will request my colleagues to raise this issue after the reply is over ...(*Interruptions*) Yesterday all of you wanted to have a discussion on the price rise and yesterday the whole day we discussed it and now when I am going to reply, please listen. I will not take the whole day...(*Interruptions*) I will take some time and after the reply is over you can raise the issue ...(*Interruptions*)

First of all I would like to express my deep appreciation for hon. Shri Yashwant Sinha, a senior leader, who has raised this issue ...(*Interruptions*)

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (विदिशा): अध्यक्ष महोदया, मेरा प्यायांट आफ आर्डर है। जो आइटम्स लगे हुए हैं, उन आइटम्स में समितियों के निर्वाचन का प्रस्ताव है। लोकपाल विधेयक का पुनर्स्थापन है, लेकिन पहले रिप्लाय शुरू किया जा रहा है।

संसदीय कार्य मंत्री तथा जल संसाधन मंत्री (श्री पवन कुमार बंसल): इसके लिए नोट पहले से ही दिया गया है। There is a foot note made to this effect.

अध्यक्ष महोदया : इसके लिए रिक्वेस्ट आई हुई है।

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : रिप्लाय पहले ही किया जा रहा है।

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: The footnote is there.

अध्यक्ष महोदया : फुट नोट में दर्शाया गया है।

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज : मैंने फुट नोट पढ़ा है, इसीलिए मैं आपसे पूछ रही हूँ कि क्या बाकी की आइटम्स बाद में लेंगे।

अध्यक्ष महोदया : पहले रिप्लाय होगा, उसके बाद लेंगे।

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Madam, first of all I would like to express my thanks to Shri Yashwant Sinha and 25 other distinguished colleagues of this House who have participated in this discussion and I am also fully sympathetic to other 12 colleagues who laid their speeches on the Table of the House because of paucity of time we could not listen to them, but I can assure them that I will go through their observations.

Madam, Speaker, to my mind this is in one way a totally different Motion, different in the sense that normally when we express the views of the House, we do by a Substantive Motion. Without a Motion we cannot express the views of the House. Normally, between the Opposition and the Ruling Party there are positions of confrontation, there are positions of opposition or rejection, but here we agreed even to the language because we wanted to convey a sense. I feel and I am candid to share my optimism and assessment of the situation and I feel that the country required a message that on a serious issue -- despite sharp political differences, different approaches and divergent views -- the House can collectively agree to arrive at a decision.

But in the course of the debate -I do not know whether Shri Geete is present here or not -- one of his points struck me very well that we have discussed enough. I have the figures regarding the discussion.

Madam Speaker, in the Fourteenth Lok Sabha, we discussed it as many as eight times. In the Fifteenth Lok Sabha, excluding this discussion, we have discussed it four times. It has been pointed out by many hon. Members as to what is the need of discussion if we cannot arrive at a decision after discussion and create some situation to control inflation. In the course of my reply, I would try to point out as to how we can create situation and how we can create environment.

Yesterday, when making his observation, Shri Yashwant Sinha displayed a journal depicting photos of six industrialists. It is a widely circulated weekly magazine captioned "Good Bye India, Hello world" I understand that we can send the caption and we can have another issue of that same newspaper with the pictures of those six top industrialists of the country saying "Tata World, Go Back Home, Home Sweet Home" It depends on us.

What appropriate action we can take now? We can fulfil the demand of Shri Geete even if we do our normal legislative function. Four important Bills are pending before the Standing Committees. Shortly, they are going to submit their Reports to us. Many of these Bills were initiated by the previous Government like the PFRDA, Banking Act, Insurance Regulation and Constitutional Amendment to introduce GFT. There is divergence of views. The new Pension Fund was introduced by the previous Government from 1st January, 2004. The Pension Fund Regulatory Authority has been created

and substantial amount of money is at their disposal but they could not do anything as there was no time. Thereafter, elections came. The entire political picture changed. We have taken up that issue. We could not do it in the first UPA regime because one of our constituents strongly opposed it. But we can do it today provided you agree with us. It was your proposal. It was your thinking. We are going to implement it. Let us do that collectively. Let us collectively pass the important legislation. Then you will find that, in no time, another picture will emerge perhaps in the same fortnightly captioned "Hello India, Tata World" because investment climate in this country is to be created. Employment generation is to be created. There is no inherent contradiction between growth and inflation.

Shri Yashwant Sinha and many other knowledgeable Members of this House are fully aware that India was never known as a country of having high growth. From 1951-79, the annual GDP growth rate was 3.5 per cent. In 1980, the average was five per cent plus and in 1990, it was six per cent. Does that mean that there was no high inflation?

As a young and junior Minister, I was sitting somewhere here when the then Finance Minister Shri Y.B. Chavan presented his second Budget in this august House in June, 1974. Inflation reached as high as 24 per cent in September, 1974. Growth was not high. Growth was equally low. Inflation is basically a product of serious mismatch between demand and supply. If somebody comes to this conclusion that lower rate of inflation will ensure higher growth, it is not so. If I understood correctly, it does not mean you give up growth. Then, what do we want to have? We want to have growth, but with moderate rate of inflation. I agree with that proposition. That is exactly the objective which we are trying to achieve. We want growth, at the same time we want to have moderate rate of inflation.

What message can we give today? Series of discussions have taken place just now. My colleague Shri S. Jaipal Reddy was replying to a question where he said that petrol and diesel prices have been increased. There is no doubt in it. The prices of petrol have been decontrolled. Diesel and kerosene prices have been increased several times. There is no doubt in it. But, what are the reasons? Is it within our control? Everybody is aware as to how the prices of petrol and diesel have fluctuated. I have some figures with me and let me mention them. The prices of the Indian basket per barrel was 16 dollars in 1991; after five years, that is in 1996 it increased to 18 dollars per barrel; in March 1998 it came down to 12.23 dollars per barrel; in May 2004, when we came to power, it was 36 dollars per barrel. Today, just before coming here I checked up with Brent crude price and it was 117 dollars per barrel.

Please give me a formula by which after buying petrol at 116 or 117 dollars per barrel, I can sell it at the price which was there during your regime. I am ready to accept that formula. During your regime you could sell at cheaper price because you got crude at an average price of 36 dollars per barrel, which actually began with 12 dollars per barrel in 1998 and ended with 36 dollars per barrel in 2004.

Despite the figures which my colleague has quoted just now, despite the enhancement in the prices, Rs. 1,22,000 crore is going to be the under-recovery of these public sector oil companies. These are not private oil companies. We are not taking into account the under-recovery of private sector oil companies. We are not taking into account whether they are having under-recovery or not. But our own oil companies' under-recovery is Rs. 1,22,000 crore. Should I provide it through subsidies? What was the total picture during his time? He was an outstanding Finance Minister for six years.

In one way I adore him and perhaps which I could not do. What he did when the question came? There were two very difficult options. One, the country to be default for non payment and for which in USA, the debate is going on and ultimately, they came to the conclusion. Another option was to borrow money somehow or other to see that India does not become default, this great country does not become default in payment. He took the strong decision. He had to be criticised. We also criticised him. But, as an individual, I respect him that he took the correct and bold decision. Therefore, let us not score debating points on this issue or that issue. The problem is that high prices are there over which we do not have control. If cover price internationally increased to 34 per cent, as in the case of crude, then we have to pay more because more than 75 per cent of our total requirements are to be imported.

Certain suggestions have come. Surely, I am in agreement with Shri Sharad Yadav when he suggested that why can you not heavily tax those sectors which are not essential. ...(*Interruptions*) I am just giving you the figures. ...(*Interruptions*) You were talking of the luxury cars. I am giving you the figure that what is the consumption of diesel. Out of every 100 barrel of diesel, 10 per cent goes for industry; six per cent is used by the Railways, which is an essential service; and agriculture use is 12 per cent, not all. Sometimes, an attempt is being projected that the entire use is for agriculture purposes. It is not like that. Eight per cent is for power generation – where we can provide power that will be reduced; 15 per cent is for passenger cars - where we can accept your suggestion and try to work out what mechanism could be found out so that these sections are not subsidized. But please remember, 15 per cent of 100 million tonnes, if we import, we will get some relief; remaining, for buses – 12 per cent and trucks 37 per cent. When we talk, we shall have to keep in mind that what would be the overall impact of our observations and what type of atmosphere we would like to create.

Here, I must appreciate the cooperation from the very senior Leader, Shri Advaniji and the Leader of the Opposition, Shrimati Sushmaji who extended to us that we are having enough confrontation. When the Parliament Session begins, people start thinking that how many days it will be disrupted. They are accustomed to see a scene in the television screen that some people here and some people there are coming and making noises and the hon. Speaker or the Chair has no option but to adjourn it. After all, we are representing 1.5 million voters of this country in this House and 543 representatives of 700 crore voters. Therefore, we thought that let us try and make an attempt. That is why, the Government did not oppose it and collectively we decided. I think it will convey a message. I do not for a moment deny the right of the Opposition to criticize the Government and to oppose the Government. In the school days, we learnt that the role of the Opposition is to oppose, to expose and finally in a position to depose.

So, if you are in a position, you depose us. I have no problem. But do not misplace your emotions. In the last part of your speech yesterday, you told "go." I do not know whether you took the observation from Lord Cromwell. When he entered with his forces in the House of Commons in 1653, the Parliament which was known as the Long Parliament, he exactly uttered those words: "For God's sake go. You have stayed too long. I say you go." Ultimately, the Members of the House of Commons fled away. Who will face the soldiers there? He asked the Speaker. When these people have gone, the Speaker's cryptic reply has laid down the ground rules of the behaviour of the future Speakers: "Without the House of Commons, I cannot see; I cannot hear; I cannot say. I am not seeing you. I am not hearing and I am not telling you. The Speaker is totally impartial." These are stories of history. Even a school boy knows it.

My contention is different. We are in a democracy. What happened after that? He declared himself a dictator, the Lord Protector. Democracy went down. After some time, when the democracy was restored, Parliament's supremacy was restored in the reign of James-II, perhaps. Then, Cromwell was resurrected from his burial ground, from his coffin and the skeleton of Cromwell was hanged because he destroyed the democracy. Ours is a democracy. We have a limited period, limited mandate. For every five years, you shall have to go; we shall have to go. If you go through the debates of the last eight Sessions, you will find that many valuable points had been made. One substantive point that has been made is that the Government is insensitive; the Government is not doing enough. The food prices went up to 22 per cent in February, 2010. If we were to bring it down to 8 per cent, efforts were needed. I am not accepting 8 per cent is today's figure. The last week's figure, the week ending in June, was released by the CSO this morning. I found that it is 8.3 per cent. I am not accepting that this is the benchmark. It should be around 5 per cent which will be comfortable. Six to 7 per cent can be tolerated but, surely not 8 per cent. But, at the same time, please remember that Government's efforts have brought it down from 22 per cent to 8 per cent between February, 2010 and July 2011. It is not as if the Government is not acting; the Government is not taking appropriate action. When an international commodity price goes high, naturally every economist will suggest that there are two ways: prevent misuse. Kerosene, I do feel, is the common man's consumption. Shri Yashwant Sinha complained, perhaps rightly so, that he lost the confidence of the women voters who use kerosene as a fuel to cook. He complained that he lost the last election. The last election means, I think, when he faced that. I do not know. But I think he is continuing here for quite some time. But, may be, after 2002, kerosene prices were increased first during your time and we have also increased twice. But we are providing subsidy. You mentioned about it. It is correct. That was a good step. I appreciate you. In order to provide relief to the common people, we have to do some thing. You have asked for *rahat* of the common people.

You have asked for the relief to the common people, and particularly to the poorer sections of the people. If we cannot provide relief to all, at least the weaker sections of the society, to what extent we can provide relief. We have provided. As you started, you said that about the BPL families. We are giving rice at Rs.5 plus; wheat at Rs.4 plus; under the Antodya Annapoorna Yojana; two and a half crore families belonging to these BPL Families are benefitting. I am not entering into the disputes of the numbers – whether it is six crore or eight crore families. I am talking of family – each family contained five members. But what I am talking of is, still we are maintaining that with the growing population. Could we maintain it if the consumption is not matched by demand? Could we provide any other incentive to the farmers which will have immediate and direct impact? Mulayam Singh ji, and Lalu ji are always demanding that the Government increase MSP much more. We have done something. May not be up to their satisfaction; may not be up to the level of the farmers themselves but please remember, when Minimum Support Price for one quintal of paddy was Rs.600 plus in 2004, we have increased it today to Rs.1,030 per quintal plus Rs.80 as bonus. ...(*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record.

(*Interruptions*) *â€*'*

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: I have admitted that it may not be up to the satisfactory level of the farmers; it may not be up to the satisfactory level of hon. Members but at the same time, you cannot say that nothing has been done. Something has been done. My respectful submission is, please accept that something has been done. Tell us, much more is to be done. Find the way in which we can do more.

We are always suggesting about our interaction with the civil society. It is not to compromise. Many a time, criticism has been made that we are compromising and mortgaging the sovereignty of Parliament. There is no question. In the very first meeting, my colleagues are present here, I made it quite clear that the normal law-making process would be followed. Even in the case of Lokpal Bill, normal legislative process will be followed – Department contemplates, Department ask the civilians, Government employees to draft the Bill, it is circulated amongst the Ministries, Cabinet approves, comes to Parliament and Parliament takes it. What we have done here in the case of Lokpal Bill is that we have inputs from the representatives of the civil society - whether they represent the whole sections, whether they are true representatives or not, we did not go into that but the short point which I am trying to drive at - which will be introduced by my colleague after my observations – is that there was no question of diluting the authority of Parliament in making the legislation. I myself have stated; I have no problem – on behalf of the Government, I can say. If the Members of Parliament, all of you, collectively decide – whatever draft they give, we will approve it but we cannot. ...(*Interruptions*)

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS: No.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: Exactly. I agree with you that here, this is an issue to be taken by you, not by the Executive, not by the Cabinet. How it will be passed? When it will be passed? Madam Speaker, I am sorry that I have digressed from my main subject. But this point I thought I should share with my distinguished colleagues.

Another point is, some figures have been quoted to show that as if we are charging the highest price so far as petrol and other petroleum products are concerned. My colleague Jaipalji has given some figures in respect of the price of petrol and petroleum products. I am talking of three important items namely diesel, PDS kerosene and LPG. For Indian price, I am taking into account the price prevailing at Delhi. In Delhi, the diesel price is Rs. 41.29 per litre, in Pakistan it is Rs. 46.79, not less, in Sri Lanka it is a little less, selling at Rs. 34.37, in Bangladesh it is further less at Rs. 27.32, and in Nepal it is sold at Rs. 45.38. But in the case of Nepal, there are reasons for it, but I would not like to mention them as many of you are fully aware of it. ...(*Interruptions*)

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI (VARANASI): With regard to diesel price in Bangladesh, is it in Taka or in Rupee? ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI GOPINATH MUNDE (BEED): The value of currency is different. How can you compare Indian currency with Bangladesh currency? ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: That is all right. But that will be much more. ...(*Interruptions*) I am telling you that will be much more. I understand that there is a difference between Bangladesh currency and Sri Lanka currency. The value of their currencies in respect of our currency is almost 40 per cent less. So I am not talking of that. I am talking of what are the other reasons. But all of you are fully aware and so I would not like to spell out them here.

As far as kerosene is concerned, the price of kerosene in Delhi is Rs. 14.83 per litre, in Pakistan it is Rs. 44, in Sri Lanka it is Rs. 24, in Bangladesh it is Rs. 27, and in Nepal it is Rs. 45.

With regard to LPG, the price of LPG in Delhi is Rs. 399 per cylinder, in Pakistan it is Rs. 757, in Sri Lanka it is Rs. 863, in Bangladesh it is Rs. 469, and in Nepal it is Rs. 819.

You forget about currency fluctuations. Every developing country is having this problem so far as the high prices of food, commodity and fuel are concerned. Therefore we are trying to address these issues. I can tell you that the Government will continue to do so. But for that to be much more effective, we require the support of all sections of the House, and mainly the principal Opposition Party because we are trying to implement many of your own ideas, at least in the area of legislation like PFRDA and GST. In your Election Manifesto, you stated in 2009 that if you come to power you will introduce the GST with 12 ½ per cent rate of interest and try to bring it down. So, please extend your hand of cooperation.

Madam Speaker, when there is a mismatch between the demand and supply, it follows that there are two things to do - improve the supply and moderate the demand. But it is not always possible to greatly increase the supply in the short term. There was a serious mismatch between the supply and demand in respect of agricultural commodities. What we have done is, in my last two Budgets, I have identified 8 items to remove the supply constraints from the agriculture sector, including the extension of the Green Revolution to the eastern parts of the country. I was pooh-poohed that only Rs. 200 crore has

been allocated for so many States. I told that it is the beginning and more money will be given to the States as and when they demand. I have extended it further and I have added an additional allocation in this year's Budget. We have declared 60,000 pulse villages in the rainfed areas of the country and provided special packages for them.

We got benefit in the next year. Pulse production increased; thanks to the farmers, by four million tonnes, from 14 million tonnes to 18 million tonnes. From the wholesale price index you compare some of the pulse prices which were there at a very serious level, very high level and which caused surely the stir amidst the Members, they felt agitated. That is why pulse is a poor man's consumption, poor man's protein. Why can it not be? But do not think that it will come down. The rate of inflation will have to be brought down.

The demand is increasing. What has been the wage increase in the rural areas? What has been the purchasing power of the rural areas? Do not believe me. Let us say that the COS Report is available. Samples are there; the organisation report is available.

I come from a village. I go to village every year apart from my constituency. I used to see what happened when there were food shortages. For two consecutive years, the prices of wheat and rice have been stable around Rs.21 to Rs.23. But there was no agitation in the rural areas. Did not people flock from the villages to the metropolitan cities? Yes, there were agitations in a section of the people. But it is not correct to say that people are dying of starvation because today we have the avenues.

What are the reports of the Great Bengal Famine where five million people died of starvation in 1942-43? The report says that it is not the lack of food grains; it is the lack of purchasing power. Whatever criticism you may make on Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme, it has raised the wage level in the villages. Therefore, people have option. A person has option that if I work for a day, guaranteed employment with indexing, I will get Rs.139 a day even if the prices of wheat and rice from Rs.23 to Rs.24, I am in a position to buy 2 kg. and have some surplus, which was not there before the introduction of this scheme.

If you kindly analyse the transfer of resources from the Centre to the States, from the States to the rural areas, from the Centre to the rural areas, you will find that substantial changes are taking place over the years. Therefore, these aspects are also to be considered while making our observation.

Yes, criticism has been made with regard to monetary policy; rates have been increased. Shri Yashwant Sinha bitterly criticised that "in your fiscal stimulus package, Rs.1,86,000 crore was provided as fiscal package in two years, 2008-09 and 2009-10. You have allowed the *munafakhori* to gain windfall profit, if I provided Rs.25,000 crore to the States to purchase new vehicles, public transport vehicles, buses under JNNURM to create demand in the automobile sector, I am directing the money to the profiteers, racketeers".

If I increase the developmental outlay of the States to the extent of 25 per cent out of Rs. 1,86,000 crore, am I helping the profiteers and racketeers or I am helping to construct more roads, more schools in the rural areas? Please analyse it. Yes, tax concessions were given; excise duties were reduced; import duties were reduced substantially for health industry. That is why they did not close. USA inflation was not high; Europe inflation was not high. It was 2 to 2 ½ per cent; but industry after industry closed; bank after bank collapsed. In India, we did not allow to have that. Yes, our growth became slow but we did not allow to have a catastrophic situation. But anyone of you, particularly you Mr. Yashwant Sinha as Finance Minister of six years' standing would have done if the figure would have come to you. The first quarter growth of 2008-09 was 9 per cent. Last quarter, it was going to be about 5.8 per cent. Correctly my illustrious predecessor Mr. Chidambaram and the Prime Minister, in the month of December, provided the first dose of stimulus package. In January, we provided the second dose of stimulus package. Even in the interim Budget, standing here, I told you that I am taking the liberty of the House to save the economy, to prevent further deceleration of growth, I am providing stimulus package though I know fully well that I have no mandate. My mandate comes to an end on 23rd May; it is only for 1 ½ months. But you were gracious enough to agree to my proposal. When we came back after the renewed mandate, I fulfilled that. But it is not that I am indulging in financial profligacy. By taking appropriate monetary mechanism, we reduced it.

Yesterday, some hon. Members said that before the Janata period we had raised the rate of inflation. It is not correct. When you demitted office after 2 ½ years, and thereafter by other party, the rate of inflation in January, 1980 was as high as 21 per cent. Therefore it is not correct. There is nothing to be ashamed. These are the facts. When you assumed office in 1977, the rate of interest was one of the lowest because of the policies pursued by my illustrious predecessor Shri C. Subramaniam, the then Finance Minister. One year, this country had the privilege of registering negative rate of inflation and surplus on international trade account, that is 1976-77. Therefore, the short point which I am

trying to drive at is that let us not mix up growth *versus* inflation. Let us try to project the united image of this great House, citadel of democracy. Yes, there are difficulties but that does not mean that we have to start eating lizard. Price rise is the problem we have faced in the past and we are facing currently. Collectively we will be able to do so because the Prime Minister and my other colleagues did not get the absolute majority, did not get the absolute mandate. We got the mandate but the mandate with the message: "Carry people with you". We are trying to do so.

The minor points here and there, I did not reply because I thought I have no interest in scoring a debating point. I have only one interest to find a mechanism through which we can work together.

Thank you, Madam Speaker, for giving me this opportunity.

MADAM SPEAKER: Shri Yashwant Sinha.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (HAZARIBAGH): Madam, hon. the Finance Minister has given us a very comprehensive reply to the Motion that I had moved in the House. I am not standing up to reply to the points that he has made but I am standing up to record my disappointment at the fact that he has not taken the House into confidence with regard to the steps that the Government proposes to take in the coming days to control inflation. ...(*Interruptions*)

श्री शैलेन्द्र कुमार (कौशांबी): माननीय मंत्री जी, महंगाई कब तक कम होगी इसकी कोई समय सीमा बताई जाए...(*व्यवधान*)

श्री दारा सिंह चौहान (घोसी): हमने कल इस बात को रखा। जमाखोरी और मुनाफाखोरी के कारण देश में महंगाई बढ़ रही है। मुनाफाखोरी के खिलाफ कोई कदम उठाने जा रहे हैं या नहीं?...(*व्यवधान*)

हम सदन का बहिष्कार करते हैं।

12.51 hrs.

Shri Dara Singh Chauhan and some other hon. Members then left the House

MADAM SPEAKER: Yashwant Sinhaji, please continue.

...(*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Please continue.

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा : मैडम, मुझे कोई आश्चर्य नहीं हुआ कि सरकार के समर्थक दल जो बार-बार हर मुद्दे पर उनका समर्थन करते हैं, उनको बेल आउट करते हैं, वही आज सदन के बाहर जा रहे हैं। लेकिन मेरी उम्मीद यह थी कि आज वित्त मंत्री महोदय सदन को विश्वास में लेकर यह बताएंगे कि हम अगले महीनों में या अगले दिनों में ये दस कदम उठाने जा रहे हैं। लेकिन उन्होंने एक का भी जिक्र नहीं किया। इसलिए मैं अपनी निराशा व्यक्त करने के लिए यहां खड़ा हुआ हूँ और कहना चाहता हूँ कि जहां तक हम लोगों का सवाल है, एनडीए का सवाल है, वित्त मंत्री जी के उत्तर से हमें घोर निराशा हुई है।

श्री शरद यादव (मधेपुरा): अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं पूणब बाबू के संज्ञान में लाना चाहता हूँ। उन्होंने ठीक बात कही कि 12 परसेंट डीजल किसान इस्तेमाल कर रहे हैं। मेरे हिसाब से सेल टावर लगभग 4 लाख है। एक दिन में वे 1 करोड़ 20 लाख लीटर तेल खर्च करते हैं। बाकी सवाल पर मैं नहीं जा रहा हूँ। आपने कार का जिक्र किया, लेकिन एक कदम जो यशवंत सिन्हा जी बोल रहे हैं, यह तो बिल्कुल आपके हाथ में है कि जो सेल टावर वाले लोग हैं, उनको सब्सिडाइज़्ड 3 रुपये 80 पैसे देने का क्या मतलब है। उस पैसे को बचा कर आप जो किसान के 12 परसेंट का इस्तेमाल है उसकी तरफ ट्रांसफर कर सकते हैं। मेरा आप से निवेदन है कि यह काम आसान है। यह काम आसानी से किया जा सकता है। आपके मॉल्स, होटल्स, कारें, सैल टावर को सब्सिडी देने की क्या जरूरत है? किसान को सब्सिडी देने की जरूरत है।

MADAM SPEAKER: I shall now put Amendment No.2, to the Motion moved by Shri Gurudas Dasgupta to the vote of the House.

The question is:

In the motion,-

after the words "in the House'

add"and Government's failure to curb the food price inflation"

Those in favour will please say 'Aye'.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: 'Aye'

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (BANKURA): We demand a division. ...(*Interruptions*)

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. Member has asked for a division.

Let the lobbies be clearedâ€”

MADAM SPEAKER: Now, the Lobbies have been cleared.

13.00 hrs.

Now, the Secretary-General to inform the House about the voting procedure.

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Kind attention of the hon. Members is invited to the following points in the operation of the Automatic Vote Recording System:-

1. Before a division starts, every hon. Member should occupy his or her own seat and operate the system from that seat only;
2. As may kindly be seen, the "red bulbs above Display Boards" on either side of the hon. Speaker's Chair are already glowing. This means the Voting System has been activated.
3. For voting, please press the following two buttons simultaneously immediately after sounding of first gong, viz.,

One "red" button in front of the hon. Member on the headphone plate and

Also

any one of the following buttons fixed on the top of desk of seats:

Ayes - Green colour

Noes - Red colour

Abstain - Yellow colour

4. It is essential to keep both the buttons pressed till the second gong sound is heard and the red bulbs are "off".

IMPORTANT: The hon. Members may please note that the vote will not be registered if both buttons are not kept pressed simultaneously till the sounding of the second gong.

5. Please do not press the amber button (P) during division.
6. Hon. Members can actually "see" their vote on Display Boards and on their Desk Unit.

7. In case, vote is not registered, they may call for voting through slips.

MADAM SPEAKER: I shall now put Amendment No.2, moved by Shri Gurudas Dasgupta to the vote of the House.

The question is:

In the motion,-

after the words "in the House'

add"and Government's failure to curb the food price inflation"

The Lok Sabha divided.

Division Ayes 12.52 hrs.

Acharia, Shri Basu Deb

Anandan, Shri M.

Badal, Shrimati Harsimrat Kaur

Baske, Shri Pulin Bihari

Bauri, Shrimati Susmita

Biju, Shri P.K.

Bwiswmuthiary, Shri Sansuma Khunggur

Chowdhury, Shri Bansa Gopal

Das, Shri Khagen

Dasgupta, Shri Gurudas

Dome, Dr. Ram Chandra

Gulshan, Shrimati Paramjit Kaur

Haque, Sk. Saidul

Jena, Shri Mohan

Karunakaran, Shri P.

Kristappa, Shri N.

Kumar, Shri P.

Laguri, Shri Yashbant

Lingam, Shri P.

Mahato, Shri Narahari

Mahtab, Shri Bhartruhari

Majumdar, Shri Prasanta Kumar

Malik, Shri Sakti Mohan

Mandal, Dr. Tarun

Manian, Shri O.S.

Misra, Shri Pinaki

Mohapatra, Shri Sidhant

Namdhari, Shri Inder Singh

Natarajan, Shri P.R.

Panda, Shri Baijayant

Panda, Shri Prabodh

Pangi, Shri Jayaram

Rajendran, Shri C.

Rajesh, Shri M.B.

Rao, Shri K. Narayan

Rao, Shri Nama Nageswara

Reddy, Shri M. Venugopala

*Reddy, Shri Y.S. Jagan Mohan

Riyan, Shri Baju Ban

Roy, Shri Mahendra Kumar

Saha, Dr. Anup Kumar

Sampath, Shri A.

Satpathy, Shri Tathagata

Semmalai, Shri S.

Singh Deo, Shri Kalikesh Narayan

Sivasami, Shri C.

Sugumar, Shri K.

Tarai, Shri Bibhu Prasad

Thambidurai, Dr. M.

Tudu, Shri Laxman

Venugopal, Dr. P.

Aaron Rashid, Shri J.M.
Abdullah, Dr. Farooq
Adhikari, Shri Sisir
Adhi Sankar, Shri
Advani, Shri L.K.
Agarwal, Shri Jai Prakash
Ahamed, Shri E.
Ahir, Shri Hansraj G.
Ahmed, Shri Sultan
Ajnala, Dr. Rattan Singh
Alagiri, Shri M.K.
Alagiri, Shri S.
Amlabe, Shri Narayan Singh
Antony, Shri Anto
Argal, Shri Ashok
Awale, Shri Jaywant Gangaram
Azad, Shri Kirti
Azharuddin, Mohammed
Baal, Shri T.R.
'Baba', Shri K.C. Singh
Babbar, Shri Raj
Bahuguna, Shri Vijay
Bairwa, Shri Khiladi Lal
Bais, Shri Ramesh
Baite, Shri Thangso
Bajwa, Shri Pratap Singh
Bandyopadhyay, Shri Sudip
Banerjee, Shri Ambica
Bansal, Shri Pawan Kumar
Basavaraj, Shri G. S.
Beg, Dr. Mirza Mehboob
Besra, Shri Devidhan
Bhagat, Shri Sudarshan
Bhagora, Shri Tara Chand

Bhaiya, Shri Shivraj
Bhoi, Shri Sanjay
Bhujbal, Shri Sameer
Biswal, Shri Hemanand
Bundela, Shri Jitendra Singh
Chacko, Shri P.C.
Chakravarty, Shrimati Bijoya
Chaudhary, Dr. Tushar
Chauhan, Shri Mahendrasinh P.
Chavan, Shri Harishchandra
Chidambaram, Shri P.
Chinta Mohan, Dr.
Chitthan, Shri N.S.V.
Choudhary, Shri Bhudeo
Choudhary, Shri Harish
Choudhary, Shri Nikhil Kumar
Choudhry, Shrimati Shruti
Choudhury, Shri Abu Hasem Khan
Chowdhary, Shrimati Santosh
Chowdhury, Shri Adhir
'Commando', Shri Kamal Kishor
Das, Shri Bhakta Charan
Das, Shri Ram Sundar
Dasmunsi, Shrimati Deepa
[*Dastidar, Dr. Kakoli Ghosh](#)
Davidson, Shrimati J. Helen
De, Dr. Ratna
Deo, Shri V. Kishore Chandra
Deora, Shri Milind
Deshmukh, Shri K.D.
Devi, Shrimati Ashwamedh
Devi, Shrimati Rama
Dhanapalan, Shri K. P.
Dhruvanarayana, Shri R.

Dhurve, Shrimati Jyoti
Dias, Shri Charles
Dikshit, Shri Sandeep
Dubey, Shri Nishikant
Dudhgaonkar, Shri Ganeshrao Nagorao
Dutt, Shrimati Priya
Elangovan, Shri T.K.S.
Engti, Shri Biren Singh
Ering, Shri Ninong
Gadhvi, Shri Mukesh Bhairavdanji
Gaikwad, Shri Eknath Mahadeo
Gandhi, Shri Dilipkumar Mansukhlal
Gandhiselvan, Shri S.
Gawali, Shrimati Bhavana Patil
Ghatowar, Shri Paban Singh
Ghubaya, Shri Sher Singh
Gogoi, Shri Dip
Gouda, Shri Shivarama
Guddu, Shri Premchand
Handique, Shri B.K.
Haque, Shri Mohd. Asrarul
Hari, Shri Sabbam
Harsha Kumar, Shri G.V.
Hassan, Dr. Monazir
Hooda, Shri Deepender Singh
Hossain, Shri Abdul Mannan
Hussain, Shri Ismail
Hussain, Shri Syed Shahnawaz
Islam, Sk. Nurul
Jadhav, Shri Baliram
Jagathrakshakan, Dr. S.
Jain, Shri Pradeep
Jaiswal, Dr. Sanjay
Jaiswal, Shri Shriprakash

Jakhar, Shri Badri Ram
Jardosh, Shrimati Darshana
Jat, Shrimati Poonam Veljibhai
Jatua, Shri Choudhury Mohan
Jawale, Shri Haribhau
Jena, Shri Srikant
Jeyadurai, Shri S. R.
Jhansi Lakshmi, Shrimati Botcha
Jindal, Shri Naveen
Joshi, Dr. C.P.
Joshi, Dr. Murli Manohar
[*Joshi, Shri Kailash](#)
Joshi, Shri Mahesh
Joshi, Shri Pralhad
Kachhadia, Shri Naranbhai
Kamal Nath, Shri
Kamat, Shri Gurudas
Kashyap, Shri Virender
Kaswan, Shri Ram Singh
Kataria, Shri Lalchand
Kaur, Shrimati Preneet
Kaypee, Shri Mohinder Singh
Khan, Shri Hassan
Khandela, Shri Mahadeo Singh
Kharge, Shri Mallikarjun
Khatgaonkar, Shri Bhaskarrao Bapurao Patil
Khatri, Dr. Nirmal
Khursheed, Shri Salman
Killi, Dr. Kruparani
[*Kowase, Shri Marotrao Sainuji](#)
Krishnasswamy, Shri M.
Kumar, Shri Kaushalendra
Kumar, Shri Ramesh
Kumar, Shri Virendra

Kumar, Shri Vishwa Mohan

Kurup, Shri N. Peethambara

Lakshmi, Shrimati Panabaka

Madam, Shri Vikrambhai Arjanbhai

Mahajan, Shrimati Sumitra

Mahant, Dr. Charan Das

Maharaj, Shri Satpal

Mahato, Shri Baidyanath Prasad

Majhi, Shri Pradeep

*Maken, Shri Ajay

Malik, Shri Jitender Singh

Mandal, Shri Mangani Lal

Manjhi, Shri Hari

Maran, Shri Dayanidhi

Masram, Shri Basori Singh

Mcleod, Shrimati Ingrid

Meena, Shri Namu Narain

Meena, Shri Raghuvir Singh

Meena, Dr. Kirodi Lal

Meghe, Shri Datta

Meghwal, Shri Arjun Ram

Meghwal, Shri Bharat Ram

Meinya, Dr. Thokchom

Mirdha, Dr. Jyoti

Mishra, Shri Govind Prasad

Mishra, Shri Mahabal

Mitra, Shri Somen

Moily, Shri M. Veerappa

Mukherjee, Shri Pranab

Munda, Shri Karia

Munde, Shri Gopinath

Muttemwar, Shri Vilas

Naik, Dr. Sanjeev Ganesh

Naik, Shri Shripad Yesso

Napoleon, Shri D.
Naqvi, Shri Zafar Ali
Narah, Shrimati Ranee
Narayanrao, Shri Sonawane Pratap
Narayanasamy, Shri V.
Natrajan, Kumari Meenakshi
Nirupam, Shri Sanjay
Nishad, Capt. Jai Narain Prasad
Noor, Kumari Mausam
Ola, Shri Sis Ram
Pakkirappa, Shri S.
Pal, Shri Jagdambika
Pal, Shri Rajaram
Pala, Shri Vincent H.
Palanimanickam, Shri S.S.
Pandey, Dr. Vinay Kumar
Pandey, Kumari Saroj
Pandey, Shri Ravindra Kumar
Paranjpe, Shri Anand Prakash
Paswan, Shri Kamlesh
Patel, Shri Devji M.
Patel, Shri Dinsha
Patel, Shri Kishanbhai V.
Patel, Shri Lalubhai Babubhai
Patel, Shri Nathubhai Gomanbhai
Patel, Shri Praful
Patel, Shri Somabhai Gandlal Koli
Patel, Shrimati Jayshreeben
Pathak, Shri Harin
[*Patil, Dr. Padmasinha Bajirao](#)
Patil, Shri A.T. Nana
Patil, Shri C.R.
Patil, Shri Danve Raosaheb
Patil, Shri Pratik

Patle, Shrimati Kamla Devi
Paul, Shri Tapas
Pawar, Shri Sharad
Pilot, Shri Sachin
Potai, Shri Sohan
Pradhan, Shri Amarnath
Prasada, Shri Jitin
Punia, Shri P. L.
Purandeswari, Shrimati D.
Purkayastha, Shri Kabindra
Raghavan, Shri M.K.
Rahman, Shri Abdul
*Rai, Shri Prem Das
Rajagopal, Shri L.
Raju, Shri M.M. Pallam
Rajukhedi, Shri Gajendra Singh
Ramachandran, Shri Mullappally
Ramasubbu, Shri S.S.
Ramshankar, Prof.
Rana, Shri Rajendrasinh
Rane, Shri Nilesh Narayan
Rao, Dr. K.S.
Rawat, Shri Harish
Ray, Shri Bishnu Pada
Reddy, Shri Anantha Venkatarami
Reddy, Shri K.J.S.P
Reddy, Shri M. Raja Mohan
Reddy, Shri M. Sreenivasulu
Reddy, Shri S. Jaipal
Reddy, Shri S.P.Y.
Roy, Prof. Saugata
Roy, Shri Arjun
Roy, Shrimati Shatabdi
Ruala, Shri C.L.

Sahay, Shri Subodh Kant
Sahu, Shri Chandu Lal
Sai Prathap, Shri A.
Sangma, Kumari Agatha
Sanjoy, Shri Takam
[*Sardinha, Shri Francisco Cosme](#)
Satyanarayana, Shri Sarvey
Scindia, Shri Jyotiraditya M.
Scindia, Shrimati Yashodhara Raje
Selja, Kumari
Shanavas, Shri M.I.
Shantha, Shrimati J.
Sharma, Dr. Arvind Kumar
Shariq, Shri S.D.
Sharma, Shri Jagdish
Shekhawat, Shri Gopal Singh
Shetkar, Shri Suresh Kumar
Shinde, Shri Sushilkumar
Shukla, Shri Balkrishna Khanderao
Sibal, Shri Kapil
Singh, Chaudhary Lal
Singh, Dr. Bhola
Singh, Dr. Sanjay
Singh, Rao Inderjit
Singh, Shri Ajit
Singh, Shri Bhoopendra
Singh, Shri Dushyant
Singh, Shri Ganesh
Singh, Shri Ijyaraj
Singh, Shri Mahabali
*Singh, Shri N. Dharam
Singh, Shri Pradeep Kumar
Singh, Shri R.P.N.
Singh, Shri Rajnath

Singh, Shri Rakesh
Singh, Shri Ratan
Singh, Shri Ravneet
Singh, Shri Rewati Raman
Singh, Shri Uday
Singh, Shri Uday Pratap
Singh, Shri Virbhadra
Singh, Rajkumari Ratna
Singh, Shrimati Meena
Singh, Shrimati Rajesh Nandini
Singla, Shri Vijay Inder
Sinha, Shri Yashwant
Solanki, Dr. Kirit Premjibhai
Solanki, Shri Bharatsinh
Solanki, Shri Makansingh
Sudhakaran, Shri K.
Sugavanam, Shri E.G.
Suklabaidya, Shri Lalit Mohan
Sule, Shrimati Supriya
Suresh, Shri Kodikkunnil
Sushant, Dr. Rajan
Swaraj, Shrimati Sushma
Tagore, Shri Manicka
Tamta, Shri Pradeep
Tandon, Shrimati Annu
Tanwar, Shri Ashok
Taviad, Dr. Prabha Kishor
Taware, Shri Suresh Kashinath
Tewari, Shri Manish
Thakor, Shri Jagdish
Thakur, Shri Anurag Singh
*Thamaraiselvan, Shri R.
Tharoor, Dr. Shashi
Thirumaavalavan, Shri Thol

Thomas, Prof. K.V.

*Thomas, Shri P.T.

Tirath, Shrimati Krishna

Toppo, Shri Joseph

Udasi, Shri Shivkumar

Vardhan, Shri Harsh

Vasava, Shri Mansukhbhai D.

Venugopal, Shri D.

Venugopal, Shri K.C.

Verma, Shri Sajjan

Verma, Shri Beni Prasad

Viswanathan, Shri P.

Vundavalli, Shri Aruna Kumar

Vyas, Dr. Girija

Wakchaure, Shri Bhusaheb Rajaram

Wankhede, Shri Subhash Bapurao

Wasnik, Shri Mukul

Yadav, Prof. Ranjan Prasad

Yadav, Shri Arun

Yadav, Shri Dinesh Chandra

Yadav, Shri Hukmadeo Narayan

Yadav, Shri Anjankumar M.

Yadav, Shri Ramakant

Yadav, Shri Sharad

MADAM SPEAKER: Hon. Members, subject to correction*, the result of the division is:

Ayes: 51

Noes: 320

The motion was negatived.

*At this stage, Shri Basu Deb Acharia and some other
hon. Members left the House*

MADAM SPEAKER: I shall now put the motion moved by Shri Yashwant Sinha to the vote of the House.

The question is:

"That despite repeated discussions on price rise in the House, the burden of price rise on the common man is continuing. Expressing deep concern over price rise, this House calls upon the Government to take immediate effective steps to check inflation that will give relief to the common man."

The motion was adopted.
