

MINISTRY OF DEFENCE

DEFENCE FORCE LEVELS, MANPOWER, MANAGEMENT AND POLICY

ESTIMATES COMMITTEE

1993-94

TENTH LOK SABHA



12225R

341

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI

FORTY-FIRST REPORT ESTIMATES COMMITTEE (1993-94)

(TENTH LOK SABHA)

MINISTRY OF DEFENCE DEFENCE FORCE LEVELS, MANPOWER, MANAGEMENT AND POLICY

*[Action Taken by Government on the Recommendations contained in the
Nineteenth Report of Estimates Committee on the Ministry of Defence—
Defence Force Levels, Manpower, Management and Policy]*



Presented to Lok Sabha on 28 April, 1994

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI

April, 1994/Vaisakha, 1916 (Saka)

E.C. No. 1319

Price: Rs. 14.00

© 1994 BY LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

Published under Rule 382 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha (Seventh Edition) and printed by the Manager, P.L. Unit, Govt. of India Press, Minto Road, New Delhi-110002.

CORRIGENDA TO ~~CONTRIBUTION~~ COMMITTEE (10TH LOK SABHA) ON THE MINISTRY OF DEFENCE - DEFENCE FORCE LEVELS, MANPOWER, MANAGEMENT AND POLICY.

.....

<u>Sl. No.</u>	<u>Page</u>	<u>Line</u>	<u>For</u>	<u>Read</u>
1.	3	12	Expenditures	Expenditure
2.	5	13	' '	' '
3.	11	22	<u>Add 'Reply of the Government'</u>	
		23	between 22nd and 23rd line	
4.	15	3	is	is
5.	16	8	the	that
6.	18	4	After 'women'	Add 'into'
		22	<u>Delete 'cadre'</u>	<u>After various</u>
7.	21	2	no-going	on-going
8.	22	3	rationalising	rationalising
		10	particularly	particularly
9.	24	17	verious	various
10.	25	11	anually	annually
11.	26	1	Nonetheless	Nonetheless
			<u>Add 'Expert Committee Action'</u>	
			in the beginning.	
		On	on	
12.	27	18	recomended	recommended
		6	Schools	Schools
13.	28	20	perequisites	perquisites
		24 }		
14.	29	4	it	It
15.	34	last	starts	start
16.	41	7	post	posts
17.	43	2	and	had
18.	46	22	claculated	calculated

.....

CONTENTS

	PAGE
COMPOSITION OF THE ESTIMATES COMMITTEE (1993-94)	(iii)
INTRODUCTION	(v)
CHAPTER I Report	1
CHAPTER II Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by Government	11
CHAPTER III Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of Government's replies	24
CHAPTER IV Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of Government have not been accepted by the Committee	31
CHAPTER V Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of Government are awaited.....	33
APPENDIX I Planning for maintenance and support services for weapons	34
APPENDIX II Policy regarding pre-mature release of Service Officers	36
APPENDIX III Policy regarding Commercial employment of Service Officers.....	38
APPENDIX IV Employment of ex-servicemen	41
APPENDIX V Policy regarding Sainik Schools	43
APPENDIX VI Hiring of accommodation for Service Officers in Delhi/Noida.....	45
APPENDIX VII Analysis of Action Taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the 19th Report of Estimates Committee (10th Lok Sabha)	48
PART II	
ANNEXURE Minutes of 20th Sitting of Estimates Committee held on 8th April, 1994.....	49
ANNEXURE Amendments/Modifications made by the Estimates Committee in the Draft Action Taken Report on Defence Force Levels, Manpower, Management and Policy at their sitting held on 08.04.1994.....	50

**COMPOSITION OF THE ESTIMATES COMMITTEE
(1993-94)**

Dr. Krupasindhu Bhoi — Chairman

MEMBERS

2. Shri Pawan Kumar Bansal
3. Shri Chhitubhai Gamit
4. Shri Parshuram Gangwar
5. Shri S.K. Gangwar
6. Shri B.S. Hooda
7. Shri Imchalemba
8. Shri Barelal Jatav
9. Shri R. Jeevarathinam
10. Shri Dau Dayal Joshi
11. Smt. Sumitra Mahajan
12. Shri Hannan Mollah
13. Shri Rupchand Pal
14. Shri B. Akbar Pasha
15. Shri Kabindra Purkayastha
16. Shri Mohan Rawale
17. Shri Satya Deo Singh
18. Shri Rajnath Sonkar Shastri
19. Shri Vishwanath Shastri
20. Shri Syed Shahabuddin
21. Shri Manku Ram Sodi
22. Shri K.D. Sultanpuri
23. Shri C. Sreenivaasan
24. Shri K. Suresh
25. Shri P.C. Thomas
26. Shri Braja Kishore Tripathy
27. Shri Arvind Trivedi
28. Shri Laeta Umbrey
29. Shri Devendra Prasad Yadav
30. Shri K.P. Reddaiah Yadav

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri G.L. Batra — *Additional Secretary*
2. Shri Murari Lal — *Joint Secretary*
3. Smt. P.K. Sandhu — *Deputy Secretary*
4. Shri K.L. Narang — *Under Secretary*

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairman of Estimates Committee, having been authorised by the Committee to submit the Report on their behalf, present this Forty-First Report on action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the Nineteenth Report of the Estimates Committee (Tenth Lok Sabha) on the Ministry of Defence—Defence Force Levels, Manpower, Management and Policy.

2. The Nineteenth Report was presented to Lok Sabha on 20th August, 1992. Government furnished replies indicating action taken on the recommendations contained in that Report on 15th March, 1993. The draft Report was considered and adopted by the Estimates Committee (1993-94) at their sitting held on 8th April, 1994.

3. The Report has been divided into the following chapters:—

- (i) Report;
- (ii) Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by Government;
- (iii) Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of Government's replies;
- (iv) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which replies of Government have not been accepted by the Committee; and
- (v) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies of Government are still awaited.

4. An analysis of action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the Nineteenth Report of the Estimates Committee (Tenth Lok Sabha) is given in Appendix-VII. It would be observed therefrom that out of 54 recommendations made in the Report, 31 recommendations i.e. 57.4% have been accepted by the Government. The Committee have desired not to pursue 17 recommendations i.e. about 31.5% in view of Government's replies. Replies have not been accepted in respect of 4 recommendations i.e. 7.4%. Final replies of Government in respect of 2 recommendations i.e. 3.7% are still awaited.

NEW DELHI;

18 April, 1994

28 Chaitra, 1916 (S)

DR. KRUPASINDHU BHOI,

*Chairman,
Estimates Committee.*

CHAPTER I

REPORT

1.1 This Report of the Estimates Committee deals with action taken by Government on the Recommendations contained in their Nineteenth Report (Tenth Lok Sabha) on the Ministry of Defence—Defence Force Levels, Manpower, Management and Policy.

1.2 The Report was presented to Lok Sabha on 20th August, 1992. It contained 54 recommendations. Action Taken notes have been received in respect of all the 54 recommendations contained in the Report.

1.3 Action Taken notes on the recommendations of the Committee have been categorised as follows:—

(i) Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by the Government:—

Sl. Nos. 1, 7, 9, 10, 12, 13, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 32, 33, 34, 35, 38, 39, 40, 41, 50, 51, 52 and 54.

(Total 31, Chapter II)

(ii) Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of Government replies:—

Sl. Nos. 2, 4, 5, 6, 8, 11, 14, 20, 21, 31, 36, 37, 42, 45, 46, 47 and 49.

(Total 17, Chapter III)

(iii) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which Government's replies have not been accepted by the Committee:—

Sl. Nos. 30, 43, 44 and 48

(Total 4, Chapter IV)

(iv) Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies are still awaited:—

Sl. Nos. 3 and 53.

(Total 2, Chapter V)

1.4 The Committee will now deal with action taken by Government on some of the recommendations.

Delegation of Powers

(Sl. No. 7, Para No. 1.86)

1.5 The Committee recommended that the decision making process in the Ministry of Defence needed to be so toned as to avoid time and cost over-runs. For this purpose, far greater powers should be delegated to the three Chiefs of Staff.

1.6 The Ministry in their action taken notes has stated that the need of enhanced delegation of administrative and financial powers to Service HQ is reviewed from time to time. Recently, an inter-Ministerial Committee reviewed the delegation of powers to Service HQ and the lower echelons in the Services. Based on its recommendations, the existing powers have been suitably enhanced. Action is also underway to establish the necessary institutional infrastructure to ensure the effective exercise of financial powers at various levels, below the Service HQ.

1.7 The Committee regret that the Ministry have not intimated the specific powers which have been suitably enhanced in respect of three Chiefs of Staff in pursuance of implementation of recommendations made by the inter-Ministerial Committee. The Committee desire to be informed of the details of the specific recommendations made by the Inter-Ministerial Committee as also powers which have been enhanced with respect to three Chiefs of Staff in their action taken statement immediately.

Combat Effectiveness

(Sl. No. 10, Para No. 1.89)

1.8 The Committee in their report observed that the question of maintaining the combat effectiveness of the Armed Forces should be examined afresh in the light of the current budgetary constraints. Fleet modernisation, Force Multipliers for the Air Force and specialised troops for the Army were to be seen in this light.

1.9 The Ministry in their reply has stated that a Study Group was constituted for an overall review and rationalisation of the Army in April 1989. It recommended several measures for the effective utilisation of manpower and equipments. The recommendations of the Study Group resulted in generating manpower and fiscal savings which are utilised for meeting Army's priority requirements. Further two special Committees, one each on combat and logistic echelons, were set up in 1991. These Committees have submitted their recommendations to generate additional savings. Certain other measures like sale of surplus land and disposal of surplus stores were also initiated; some of these have generated additional funds which are being appropriately utilised.

In view of the prevailing budgetary constraints and the need for modernisation, IAF had initiated a number of measures; the consequential savings are being deployed for meeting IAF's priority requirements.

1.10 It is indeed surprising that no specific replies regarding action taken by the Government in the direction of fleet modernisation, force multipliers for the Air Force and specialised troops for the Army have been given by the Ministry. The reply is rather couched in vague terms. The Committee would like a comprehensive response of the Ministry on this recommendation within three months.

Action taken on recommendations of Expert Committee and Committee on Defence Expenditures.

(Sl. No. 11, Para 1.90)

1.11 The Committee recommended that action on the recommendations of the Expert Committee set up in 1989 as well as those of the Committee on Defence Expenditure should be expedited and progress reported to the Committee within a period of six months.

1.12 In their reply the Ministry stated as follows:—

"The Expert Committee submitted its final report, alongwith recommendations, to COAS in April, 1990. The responsibility of examining the recommendations and obtaining the approval of COAS was delegated to certain nodal agencies at Army Hqrs. These agencies analysed the recommendations and, after approval of the COAS, a Steering Committee under the Chairmanship of the VCOAS was constituted to oversee the implementation of the recommendations of the Expert Committee. Action has been taken by the Army Hqrs on the majority of the recommendations. Action on other recommendations is under process in Army Hqrs.

The recommendations of the Committee on Defence Expenditure can be broadly subsumed under three categories:—

- (i) Those which concern the operationalisation of specific measures of economy, which can be put into effect immediately and on which there is a concurrence of views between the concerned agencies, including Services Hqrs.
- (ii) Those which would require further examination and consideration in Study Groups as per the CDE's own recommendations.
- (iii) Those which envisage fundamental structural changes in the system of decision making in Defence.

Action has been taken to implement the CDE's recommendation which fall under category (i) above. With regard to the CDE's recommendation which require further indepth consideration, these are being processed by the Services Hqrs. and the concerned agencies. As regards the recommended measures which involve structural changes,

a decision thereon involves several Deptts/Ministries. Consultations in the matter are continuing in the Committee of Secretaries."

1.13 The Expert Committee submitted its final Report alongwith the recommendations to Chief of Army Staff in April, 1990. However, action on some of recommendations is still under process in Army Headquarters.

1.14 The Committee find from the reply of the Ministry that out of three categories of recommendations of the Committee on Defence Expenditure (CDE) action has been taken only in case of one category despite the passage of almost three years now. From this sort of response of the Ministry the Committee can discern a positive lack of action on its part. It is concerned to note that even after this Committee's recommendation that action to implement the recommendations of CDE should be expedited and the progress reported to the Committee within a period of six months, no tangible action on the part of Ministry has emanated. The matter is reported to be still in the consultation stage in the Committee of Secretaries. The Committee desire that the Ministry must take expeditious action on CDE Report without further loss of time.

Manpower Management Policy

(Sl. No. 15, Para No. 2.109)

1.15 The Committee suggested to the Government that a long term and cogent manpower management policy statement needed to be prepared by the Ministry of Defence for proper direction of the manpower related affairs in the Defence Services.

1.16 The Ministry in their reply has stated that observations of the Hon'ble Committee have been noted for future guidance. It may, however, be stated that force levels are predicated on the threat perceptions and the armament profiles of potential adversaries.

1.17 From the casual manner in which the reply has been furnished the Committee cannot but conclude that the Ministry has not given serious thought to their recommendation that a long term and cogent manpower management policy statement is needed to be prepared for proper direction of the manpower related affairs in the Defence Services. The Committee therefore call upon the Ministry to initiate concrete steps in this regard. They would also like to emphasise that all the recommendations of the Committee need to be pondered over seriously and not replied evasively as in the present case.

Review of Staff Strength

(Sl. No. 16, Para No. 2.110)

1.18 The Committee recommended that the Ministry of Defence should undertake a comprehensive review of the overall number of personnel in uniform as well as the civilian staff to judge the extent to which it could be pruned.

1.19 The Ministry has furnished the following details in this regard:—

“Army. During the last decade the Army manpower ceiling has remained constant. All the new raisings/re-organizations/conversions, to modernise and increase the battle effectiveness of the Army, have been carried out from within the existing manpower ceiling, by effecting reductions in various establishments. Thus, pruning has already been carried out wherever possible.

(2) The Army Standing Establishment Committee at Army Hqrs, carries out periodic reviews of all establishments.

(3) Various high level committees (Expert Committee, Special Committees etc.) were set up by Army Hqrs from time to time, to evolve methods to achieve enhanced combat effectiveness in the Army, This is an ongoing process.

Navy. The Naval Standing Establishment Committee is responsible for determining the staffing pattern of all the Naval Establishments. The macro level review of the complement for all Naval Units is an ongoing process.

Air Force. An exercise was undertaken to review the manpower in the IAF and a number of posts have been identified for abolition.

DRDO. A Zero Based Manpower Review Committee has been constituted to review the manpower position of all the DRDO/labs/establishments. As a result of the work so far completed, a 10.8% reduction has been effected.

AFHQ. A comprehensive review was carried out and a considerable number of civilian staff posts have been identified to be kept unfilled.

Ordnance Factories. A detailed exercise has been underway from 1987 onwards and the Factory-wise strength was fixed in 1989. There has also been a ban on recruitment w.e.f. 1984, except in respect of new projects. Thus, since 1984, the overall strength of the Factories has been brought down by 17,000.

DPUs. Review of manpower requirement is a continuous process in the Defence Public Sector Undertakings.”

1.20 The Ministry's reply does not reveal concrete figures regarding pruning down of the staff strength except in the case of Defence Research Development Organisation (DRDO) and the ordnance factories. In the case of Army it has been stated that during the last decade the Army manpower ceiling has remained constant. Considering the present trend throughout the world of making the armed forces technology intensive, the Committee find little rationale behind the manpower ceiling remaining stationary during the last decade. The Committee, therefore, desire that as recommended the Ministry should undertake a comprehensive review and

convey as a result of the review made figures of reduction of manpower in various establishments as on 31st March, 1993.

Mechanism for utilisation of Manpower

(Sl. No. 19, Para No. 2.113)

1.21 The Committee observed in their Report that for ascertaining that manpower was being optimally and productively utilised, a set of reliable indices should be developed, applied and monitored at the higher echelons of the three Services.

1.22 The Ministry in their Action Taken Notes has stated that the Services HQrs. already have various mechanisms. However, the same are being got reviewed and further measures, as necessary, shall be enforced.

1.23 The Committee note that the various mechanisms in the Services Headquarters for ascertaining optimal and productive utilisation of manpower were being reviewed and further measures as are necessary would also be enforced. The Committee would like to be apprised of the results of these reviews as also further measures considered necessary in the light of reviews undertaken.

Voluntary National Service

(Sl. No. 30, Para No. 2.124)

1.24 In their Report the Committee recommended that the question of voluntary national service might be subject to a comprehensive national debate and all necessary steps taken for the purpose.

1.25 The Ministry has stated in its action taken reply that no tangible proposal for introducing voluntary national service scheme has yet emerged.

1.26 The Committee are not satisfied with the response of the Ministry that no tangible proposal for introducing Voluntary National Service Scheme has yet emerged. Considering that such type of service is desirable in view of the resource constraints being faced by the country, the Committee reiterate that the matter should not be allowed to fizzle out and necessary measures must be initiated after a comprehensive national debate on the matter.

Specialisation to Civilian Officers and Induction of Service Officers in Ministry of Defence

(Sl. Nos. 9 and 34, Para Nos. 1.88 and 3.46)

1.27 The Committee made the following recommendations:—

“Immediate attention may be paid to imparting greater specialisation to the civilian officers of the Ministry of Defence Sectt.”

“More Officers from Defence Services should be inducted in the Ministry of Defence to provide greater specialisation and expeditious decision making in Defence matters. Due attention should be paid to

integration of the civilian and military personnel in the Ministry's Sectt."

1.28 The Ministry in its action taken reply has stated as follows:—

"On technical matters, this Ministry largely bases its views on the advice tendered by the concerned Directorates in the Service Hqrs. Thus, the Service Hqrs Directorates also need to have the requisite specialisation. At the Govt. level, the requirement is largely to take a comprehensive view of a given proposal, in the best national interest. In arriving at decisions, this Ministry is required to consult, as necessary, all other concerned Depts/Ministries, to see that the view taken is after duly considering, *inter alia*, its likely impact/linkages with other areas of governmental functioning. The Officers manning the Ministry need to be adequately experienced and competent. While vacancies are filled up under the Central Staffing Scheme, through DOP&T, continuing care is taken to identify the most qualified officers, due weightage being given to their erstwhile tenures in this Ministry and their participation in various Defence related courses. Continuous care is also devoted towards achieving maximum coordination among all concerned wings of the Ministry, including the service Hqrs, and inter-Service organisations."

1.29 The reply of the Ministry is silent on the aspect of induction of Defence Service Officers in the Ministry of Defence. The Committee's intention while making this recommendation was that such a step would go a long way in providing greater specialisation for expeditious decision making in defence matters. While reiterating their earlier recommendation, the Committee therefore impress upon the Ministry to reconsider the matter in greater depth and apprise them of the concrete steps taken in this regard.

Merit based promotions—DRDO

(Sl. No. 37, Para No. 3.49)

1.30 The Committee had recommended that the scheme for merit based promotion of scientific and technical manpower may be approved and implemented, clear rules and procedures for constituting Assessment Boards may be approved and Committee informed of the progress within a period of six months.

1.31 In their action taken replies the Ministry has stated that a draft paper for the Committee of Secretaries on merit based promotion scheme for S&T manpower in DRDO is under examination by the Ministries of Personnel and Finance. Both the Ministries apprehend that acceptance of this scheme in DRDO would raise similar demands from other Government departments. MOD feel that the career management of S&T manpower in DRDO requires to be viewed differently from that of employees in other Government Departments; it is more akin to the S&T manpower in other Scientific Departments like Department of Space,

Department of Atomic Energy, Department of Electronics etc. where more liberalised schemes have been in operation for varying periods.

1.32 The Committee think that no appreciable progress has been achieved by the Ministry in implementation of this recommendation. DRDO for all purposes is like other scientific departments of Government of India, and the Ministries of Personnel and Finance would be well advised to clear the proposal regarding merit based promotion scheme for S&T and technical manpower in DRDO at the earliest. The Committee expect more vigorous efforts on the part of Ministry of Defence in getting through this proposal.

Grievances Redressal

(Sl. No. 43, Para No. 4.59)

1.33 The Committee after examining the extant systems and procedures recommended as follows:—

“The existing system of grievance redressal in the three Services should be reviewed to identify the existing and potential causes of dissatisfaction with it.”

1.34 The Ministry has replied that Service Officers are entitled to submit statutory/non-statutory complaints for seeking redressal in respect of any military wrong done to them in their career. The complaints are examined in the Service Hqrs. Appropriate relief on non-statutory complaints is granted at the level of the Service Chiefs. In respect of statutory complaints, recommendations of the Service Hqrs. are forwarded to the Ministry of Defence where the complaints/comments of the Service Hqrs and the complete record profile of the officers are scrutinised and necessary redressal/relief given, if military wrong is established. This system has been working satisfactorily. The question of setting up an independent body/tribunal for redressal of grievances was carefully examined but not found feasible.

Setting up of Administration Tribunals for Services

(Sl. No. 44, Para No. 4.60)

1.35 Stressing the need for setting up of Administration Tribunals for the Services, the Committee recommended as follows:—

“All necessary steps should be taken to impart utmost objectivity to the existing institutions for redressal of grievances internally. For this purpose Committee desire that no further time should be lost in setting up statutory boards or tribunals exclusively for the Service personnel. On such bodies should be represented retired Service Officers, eminent civilian persons from the fields of judiciary and higher civil services. As a corollary to this Service personnel may be barred from approaching to the civil courts except for the purpose of review by Supreme Court of the decision given by the proposed statutory board.”

1.36 The Ministry in its action taken reply has stated as follows:—

“A proposal for setting up an Administrative Tribunal for the Services was carefully examined, but not found feasible.”

1.37 The Committee are not convinced with the reply of the Ministry. Had the existing system been working satisfactorily the Committee would not have heard of more and more Defence Service Officers taking recourse to the Civil Courts as is being done now. The Committee, therefore, reiterate their recommendation about a thorough review of the existing system of redressal of grievances. The Committee also desire that Government should seriously rethink about their recommendation for setting up Administrative Tribunals for the Services.

The Ministry should also explain the reasons why setting up of an Administrative Tribunal for the Services was not found feasible.

Augmentation of Medical Facilities

(Sl. No. 48, Para No. 4.64)

1.38 The Committee desired that they might be informed within six months about the steps taken to augment the number of doctors and supporting staff in the Army hospitals as also about the augmentation of beds in these hospitals.

1.39 In response the Ministry has stated that the requirement of doctors and supporting staff in the military hospitals and the availability of beds is reviewed from time to time, and augmentation is considered on the basis of availability of resources.

1.40 The Committee wish to express their displeasure at the vague reply of the Ministry. It cannot be made out from the reply as to what steps have been taken by the Ministry during the time specified by the Committee to augment the number of doctors and subordinate staff and beds in the Army Hospitals. The Committee had recommended these measures in view of the fact that there is acute shortage of these personnel and infrastructure in the Army Hospitals. They, therefore, reiterate that immediate steps may be taken by the Ministry to remove these shortages.

Action Taken replies of the Ministry of Defence on the Recommendations contained in the Nineteenth Report of the Estimates Committee

(Tenth Lok Sabha)

GENERAL

1.41 The replies of the Ministry to several important recommendations of the Committee reveal that conclusive action has not been taken and the action is either in pipeline or the matter has been referred to certain other Ministries/Departments for the purpose. Thus, at the end of the six months period accorded to the Ministry of Defence for taking action on the recommendations of the Committee, it is observed that a conclusive picture has not emerged. The Committee cannot but express their displeasure at the way the Ministry has acted on their recommendations as some of them, in

the opinion of the Committee, would have had far-reaching effect on the overall functioning of the defence forces and their efficient management had action been taken within the stipulated time frame.

CHAPTER II

RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT

Recommendation Sl. No. 1 (Para No. 1.80)

The Government would be well advised to articulate a clear and comprehensive defence policy. This can only be based on a viable national security doctrine.

Reply of the Government

Our defence policy, articulated since Independence, is that our military capability is to be directed to ensuring the defence of national territory over land, sea and air, encompassing among others the inviolability of our land borders, island territories, offshore assets and our maritime trade routes. Government have repeatedly made it clear that it is not our objective to influence/interfere/dominate the region on the basis of military strength.

As regards a national security doctrine, the security environment (which is not static) is kept under constant watch, and threat assessments are undertaken in consultation with the concerned agencies, from time to time.

Recommendation Sl. No. 7 (Para No. 1.86)

The decision making process in the Ministry of Defence needs to be reformed to avoid time and cost over-runs. For this purpose far greater powers should be delegated to the three Chiefs of Staff.

The need of enhanced delegation of administrative and financial powers to Service HQ is reviewed from time to time. Recently, an inter-Ministerial Committee reviewed the delegation of powers to Service HQ and the lower echelons in the Services. Based on its recommendations, the existing powers have been suitably enhanced. Action is also underway to establish the necessary institutional infrastructure to ensure the effective exercise of financial powers at various levels, below the Service HQ.

Recommendation Sl. No. 9 (Para No. 1.88)

Immediate attention may be paid to imparting greater specialisation to the Civilian officers of the Ministry of Defence Sectt.

Reply of the Government

On technical matters, this Ministry largely bases its views on the advice tendered by the concerned Directorates in the Service HQs. Thus, the Service HQs. Directorates also need to have the requisite specialisation. At the Govt. level, the requirement is largely to take a comprehensive

view of a given proposal, in the best national interest. In arriving at decisions, this Ministry is required to consult, as necessary, all other concerned Depts./Ministries, to see that the view taken is after duly considering, *inter alia*, its likely impact/linkages with other areas of governmental functioning. The officers manning the Ministry need to be adequately experienced and competent. While vacancies are filled up under the Central Staffing Scheme, through DOP&T, continuing care is taken to identify the most qualified officers, due weightage being given to their erstwhile tenures in the Ministry and their participation in various Defence related courses. Continuous care is also devoted towards achieving maximum coordination among all concerned wings of the Ministry, including the Service HQs and inter-Service organisations.

Recommendation Sl. No. 10 (Para No. 1.89)

The question of maintaining the combat effectiveness of the Armed Forces should be examined afresh in the light of the current budgetary constraints. Fleet modernisation, Force Multipliers for the Air Force and specialised troops for the Army are to be seen in this light.

Reply of the Government

A Study Group was constituted for an overall review and rationalisation of the Army in April, 1989. It recommended several measures for the effective utilisation of manpower and equipments. The recommendations of the Study Group resulted in generating manpower and fiscal saving which are utilised for meeting Army's priority requirements. Further, two special Committees, one each on combat and logistic echelons, were set up in 1991. These Committees have submitted their recommendations, to generate additional savings. Certain other measures like sale of surplus land and disposal of surplus stores were also initiated; some of these have generated additional funds which are being appropriately utilised.

In view of prevailing budgetary constraints and the need for modernisation, IAF had initiated a number of measures; the consequential savings are being deployed for meeting IAF's priority requirements.

Recommendation Sl. No. 12 (Para No. 1.91)

Serious efforts should be made to plan infrastructure for maintenance and support service for weapon systems and equipment to minimise gap being experienced presently between the identification of the need and actual induction into service of weapon systems/equipments etc.

Reply of the Government

Guidelines regarding remedial measures have been issued. A copy of the same, issued to Army HQs., is at Appendix I. The matter is being followed up.

Recommendation Sl. No. 13 (Para No. 1.92)

Government should take both long term and short term measures in order to minimise the involvement of Armed Forces, particularly, the Army, in the maintenance of internal security. These measures should include modernisation and strengthening of Para-military forces as well as State Police Organisations particularly in the border States.

Reply of the Government

Central para-military forces are being augmented and strengthened by Ministry of Home Affairs, from time to time, so that they can be made available to the State Governments whenever required. The following additions have been made to the para-military forces during the last 10 years.

Forces	Bns. sanctioned during 1981—91	Total present sanctioned strength
BSF	70 Bns.	149 Bns.
CRPF	65 Bns.	129 Bns.
A.R.	10 Bns.	31 Bns.
ITBP	15 Bns. (including 6 Bns. on Bank security duty in Punjab)	24 Bns.
Total	160 Bns.	333 Bns.

The above stated additions have, however, been considered inadequate by Ministry of Home Affairs. It has, therefore, been considered necessary by Ministry of Home Affairs that a longer term perspective should be taken to assess whether further additions in these forces are called for and, if so, to what extent additions may be made over the next 5 years keeping in view the requirements of organisational and technical improvements and focussing attention on cost-effective measures. With a view to studying the problem in all its details, a Working Group has been constituted in the Ministry of Home Affairs. This Group is studying the respective roles and responsibilities of the State Police and the BSF, CRPF, ITBP and Assam Rifles in responding to the internal security concerns and make recommendations regarding further strengthening/expansion of these para-military forces and other related matters.

While the Working Group is looking into the long term perspective of the requirement of para-military forces, a proposal for the following short term requirements is under Ministry of Home Affairs's consideration:

- (1) Raising of 10 Bns of ITBP for IS duties along with the supervisory and other staff;
- (2) Raising of the Border Battalion of ITBP for re-adjustment of deployment in Himachal Pradesh Sector;
- (3) Raising of one Mahila Bn. in CRPF;
- (4) Conversion of 2 BSF Bns. and 6 CRPF Aux. Bns. (alongwith supervisory staff) into regular Bns.
- (5) Strengthening BSF in Rajasthan and Jammu by raising 8 Bns. and other supervisory staff. Raising of one Bn. of BSF for guarding I.B. corridor.

Note: The above reply is based on information procured from Ministry of Home Affairs. If any further issues arise, it is requested that the same may please be addressed to Ministry of Home Affairs.

Recommendation Sl. No. 15 (Para No. 2.109)

A long term and cogent manpower management policy statement needs to be prepared by the Ministry of Defence for proper direction of the manpower related affairs in the Defence Service.

Reply of the Government

Observations of the Hon'ble Committee have been noted for future guidance. It may, however, be stated that force levels are predicated on the threat perceptions and the armament profiles of potential adversaries.

Recommendation Sl. No. 16 (Para No. 2.110)

The Ministry of Defence should undertake a comprehensive review of the overall number of personnel in uniform as well as the civilian staff to judge the extent to which it could be pruned.

Reply of the Government

Army. During the last decade the Army manpower ceiling has remained constant. All the new raisings/re-organizations/conversions, to modernise and increase the battle effectiveness of the Army, have been carried out from within the existing manpower ceiling, by effecting reductions in various establishments. Thus, pruning has already been carried out wherever possible.

2. The Army Standing Establishment Committee at Army HQs. carries out periodic reviews of all establishments.

3. Various high level committees (Expert Committees, Special Committees etc.) were set up by Army HQs. from time to time, to evolve methods to achieve enhanced combat effectiveness in the Army. This is an ongoing process.

Navy. The Naval Standing Establishment Committee is responsible for determining the staffing pattern of all the Naval Establishments. The macro level review of the complement for all Naval Units as an ongoing process.

Air Force. An exercise was undertaken to review the manpower in the IAF and a number of posts have been identified for abolition.

DRDO. A Zero Based Manpower Review Committee has been constituted to review the manpower position of all the DRDO/labs/establishments. As a result of the work so far completed, a 10.8% reduction has been effected.

AFHQ. A comprehensive review was carried out and a considerable number of civilian staff posts have been identified to be kept unfilled.

Ordnance Factories. A detailed exercise has been underway from 1987 onwards and the Factory-wise strength was fixed in 1989. There has also been a ban on recruitment w.e.f. 1984, except in respect of new projects. Thus, since 1984, the overall strength of the Factories has been brought down by 17,000.

DPUs. Review of manpower requirement is a continuous process in the Defence Public Sector Undertakings.

Recommendation Sl. No. 17 (Para No. 2.111)

The manpower ceilings fixed in the Services should be determined on a futuristic basis and enforced meaningfully to ensure that these are not exceeded under any circumstances.

Reply of the Government

Manpower ceilings relate to threat perceptions and consequent requirement of force levels which may fluctuate, from time to time, depending on conditions obtaining in the region. The force levels of India's adversaries also has a direct bearing on manpower requirement. Both China and Pakistan have lower civilian to uniformed manpower ratio than India. Spending on Defence by these countries, in relation to their GDP, is also much higher. The manpower ceiling of our Army has remained constant for a considerable period.

To ensure that the manpower ceiling is not exceeded in the Army, the following procedures are being followed:—

- (a) Annual audit of manpower.
- (b) Quarterly compilation of actual holding of manpower.
- (c) Monthly compilation of actual holding of manpower.
- (d) Regulated release of annual recruitment.

Recommendation Sl. No. 18 (Para No. 2.112)

The data relevant for determining the ceiling on manpower at different levels should be maintained in a systematic manner and updated at appropriate fixed intervals.

Reply of the Government

This is being done. The existing systems are being further strengthened.

Recommendation Sl. No. 19 (Para No. 2.113)

For ascertaining the manpower is being optimally and productively utilised, a set of reliable indices should be developed, applied and monitored at the higher echelons of the three Services.

Reply of the Government

The Service HQs. already have various mechanisms. However, the same are being got reviewed and further measures, as necessary, shall be enforced.

Recommendation Sl. No. 22 (Para No. 2.116)

Serious efforts may be made to bring down the age profile of the unit commanders. For this purpose attractive voluntary retirement scheme for the officers at the appropriate level should be introduced.

Reply of the Government

Presently, the average age of a Battalion Commander is 42 years. It will come down when the Emergency Commissioned Officers of the post—1962 entry retire from the Army, in the next 2-3 years.

The policy of granting permission for premature retirement has been liberalised. A copy of the guidelines issued is at Appendix II. The Policy governing acceptance of post-retirement commercial employment by Defence Service Officers has also been liberalised. A copy of the guidelines is at Appendix III. The objective is to ultimately ensure faster promotion so that officers can reach unit commanders' level at an earlier age.

Recommendation Sl. No. 23 (Para No. 2.117)

Steps may be taken to reduce the top heaviness of the Services in order to streamline the command structure in the Services.

Reply of the Government

The organisational structure of the Army is akin to a broad based pyramid with a narrow tip. The rank structure is organized to meet the requirements of the organisation. However, the Committee's observations are noted for guidance and appropriate application in the future.

Recommendation Sl. No. 24 (Para No. 2.118)

In the normal course a Cadre review should be used merely for fine tuning promotional policies and the rank structure and should not result in upgradation of most ranks over a wide canvas. Appropriate manpower policy models should therefore be developed to meet enhanced requirement of officers and men.

Reply of the Government

Cadre reviews are undertaken, from time to time, in order to ensure that the overall structure is such as would enable the three Services to discharge satisfactorily their responsibilities. However, the Committee's observations are noted for guidance and appropriate application in the future.

Recommendation Sl. No. 25 (Para No. 2.119)

The terms of engagement in the three Services may be reviewed and desirability of reduced colour Service considered after examining the recommendation of the Committee on Defence Expenditure.

Reply of the Government

A proposal for reducing the terms of engagement of Other Ranks in the Army was considered in the Ministry of Defence but was not found practical. Army HQ have been asked to formulate fresh proposals.

Recommendation Sl. No. 26 (Para No. 2.120)

Appropriate schemes for lateral absorption of retiring Defence personnel in civilian departments should be drawn by offering appropriate relaxations of recruitment rules and procedures. The Government should urgently prepare an appropriate scheme for gainful re-employment of ex-servicemen.

Reply of the Government

The statement at Appendix-IV brings out the obtaining approach.

Recommendation Sl. No. 27 (Para No. 2.121)

The question of induction of women in the operational arms of the Defence Services may be examined.

Reply of the Government

It has been decided to induct women in the following branches/cadres of the Army: Army Postal Service, JAG's Department, Army Education Corps, Army Ordnance Corps (Central Ammunition Depots and Material Management), Army Service Corps (Food Scientists and Catering Officers), Corps of Signals, Intelligence Corps, Corps of Engineers, Corps of Electrical and Mechanical Engineering and Artillery.

It has been decided to induct women into the Logistics, Education, Legal and Air Traffic Control Branches of the Navy.

In the IAF, women are being inducted into all Branches except the fighter stream of the flying branch.

In due course, based on experience gained, the question of inducting women the combat arms shall also be considered.

Recommendation Sl. No. 28 (Para No. 2.122)

Greater attention may be paid to appropriately training civilian manpower in the Defence Services.

Reply of the Government

Attention is being paid to the trg. of civilian employees. In addition to foundational/refresher training through IST&M, the Defence Headquarters Training Institute provides regular trg. in various subjects viz Computers, Defence Security, Vigilance, Financial Management, Basic Trg. Course for different groups of employees, Administrative Management etc. Training programmes are formulated based on the functional requirements of the user organisations. Officers/staff are also nominated to various courses being conducted by other organisations like IST&M, IIPA, NDC, SSC, DIWS, DOP&T etc.

Recommendation Sl. No. 29 (Para No. 2.123)

Promotion prospects of the civilian manpower in the Defence Services may be reviewed and improved upon.

Reply of the Government

AFHQ. Review of various cadres is undertaken by the Cadre Review Committee. The JCM and other fora also exist, through which employees' representatives project their career related problems.

Air Force. A cadre review exercise has been undertaken by Air Hq in respect of cadres which do not come under the purview of IN-SITU promotion. These cadre review proposals are under consideration.

Navy. Cadre review in respect of Group C&D Naval civilian employees has been undertaken, to enhance promotional prospects. IN-SITU promotions, have also been granted to all eligible Group C&D civilian employees of Naval establishments. As regards other civilians in the Navy, their cases are taken up from time to time for providing better promotion avenues/career prospects based on functional necessity and where it is considered that the civilian has been facing acute stagnation.

Territorial Army. IN-SITU promotions in respect of some of the civilians has been granted, in terms of the Government decision.

Recommendation Sl. No. 32 (Para No. 3.44)

Ministry of Defence Secretariat should be reorganised to make decision making efficient.

Reply of the Government

Studies/analysis to improve functioning are an on going process. This Ministry places very high importance on the efficient discharge of its responsibilities and shall continue to take all practical steps to improve the decision making processes.

Recommendation Sl. Nos. 33 & 34 (Para Nos. 3.45 & 3.46)

Officers who have definite familiarisation of the working of Defence Services particularly those who have participated in various courses in DSSC & NDC should be given preference over other officers while deciding the placement of officers in the Ministry of Defence Sectt. More officers from Defence Services should be inducted in the Ministry of Defence to provide greater specialisation & expeditious decision making in Defence matters. Due attention should be paid to integration of the civilian & military personnel in the Ministry's Sectt.

Reply of the Government

On technical matters, this Ministry largely bases its views on the advice tendered by the concerned Directorates in the Service HQrs. Thus, the Service HQrs Directorates also need to have the requisite specialisation. At the Govt. level, the requirement is largely to take a comprehensive view of a given proposal, in the best national interest. In arriving at decisions, this Ministry is required to consult, as necessary, all other concerned Deptts/Ministries, to see that the view taken is after duly considering, *inter-alia*, its likely impact/linkages with other areas of governmental functioning. The officers manning the Ministry need to be adequately experienced and competent. While vacancies are filled up under the Central Staffing Scheme, through DOP&T, continuing care is taken to identify the most qualified officers, due weightage being given to their erstwhile tenures in this Ministry and their participation in various Defence related courses. Continuous care is also devoted towards achieving maximum coordination among all concerned wings of the Ministry, including the Service HQrs and inter-Service organisations.

Recommendation Sl. No. 35 (Para No. 3.47)

The Flexible complementing scheme in Defence Research & Development establishment should be constantly monitored and its efficacy watched at periodic intervals.

Reply of the Government

The Flexible Complementing Scheme has been under operation in DRDO since 1980. The operation of the scheme is being monitored by DRDO. In April 92, Cabinet Sectt. constituted a Committee (under the aegis of Secretary, Deptt. of Science & Technology) for examining the Flexible Complementing Schemes in all the S&T organisations. The DRDO also comes under the purview of this Committee.

Recommendation Sl. No. 38 (Para No. 3.50)

The progress made and the impact created by the proposed changes in the administrative, stores and finance cadres of the DRDO may be communicated to the Committee within a period of six months.

Reply of the Government

As part of phased change process, a proposal to create 150 posts of Data Entry Operators (DEO) has been finalised. Creation of these posts will be a step towards inducting professionally qualified persons amongst the administrative categories of DRDO Staff to these posts, to introduce a new culture of modernised automated office management practices. The recruitment rules for this post (DEO) are being examined so that the existing manpower in the Adm. categories could also get inducted as DEOs, after necessary re-training. In order to improve the prospects of Adm. category staff, a scheme exists to induct Accountants in the Organisation through a Limited Departmental Competitive Examination from amongst administrative category staff. In addition, recently, a limited departmental competitive examination for filling up to 25% vacancies in the grade of JSA-II (Rs. 1320-2040) from amongst DRDO employees with 5 years service and possessing qualifications prescribed for direct recruitment has been introduced. Qualified staff members in administrative categories are also eligible.

Recommendation Sl. No. 39 (Para No. 3.51)

An indepth exercise may be undertaken to identify Defence Production Units which can be modernised and diversified. In this connection, Government should take appropriate steps.

Reply of the Government***Ordnance Factories***

In so far as Ordnance Factories are concerned, their modernisation is an on-going process. It includes re-placement of old Plant & Machineries and augmentation of capacities in critical areas. In order to optimise the capacities remaining unutilised after fully meeting the demands of the Armed Forces, the Ordnance Factories are already authorised to diversify. The steps taken in this regard, inter-alia, include close monitoring of the Action Plan drawn up for diversification, engagement of a reputed Consultant to evolve a Plan in respect of 8 Ordnance Factories for diversification of products and provide assistance for its implementation for a period of 2 years in regard to diversification in the selected product areas/marketing of existing products, delegation of additional powers to OFB to equip it to effectively function in a competitive and commercial environment etc.

Defence Public Sector Undertakings

Modernisation and diversification are no-going management exercises and the Defence Public Sector Undertakings have resorted to modernisation and diversification, wherever feasible and economically viable. The present budgetary crunch has made it necessary for them to explore civilian and export markets in a big way for the optimum utilisation of their capacities. Some of the major areas of diversification undertaken by them relate to space, missiles, gas turbines, computer software, small arms, telecommunication etc. The Defence PSUs are already meeting the needs of All India Radio, Doordarshan, Railways, Communications, Coal India, Meteorology, Space, Atomic Energy, Oil Exploration etc. for certain sophisticated equipments.

Recommendation Sl. No. 40 (Para No. 3.52)

Wherever feasible the idle assets of different production units such as land, building etc. may be commercially exploited after an indepth study and without disturbing the Defence and other interests.

Reply of the Government

This is already being done by the Defence Public Sector Undertakings. In the case of Ordnance Factories the land and assets held by them are being put to the best possible Defence use.

Recommendation Sl. No. 41 (Para No. 3.53)

Vigorous efforts should be made to obtain export orders for maintenance & production units in the Defence Sector.

Reply of the Government

Ordnance Factories

Within the constraints of a departmental undertaking and also taking into account the international environment in which Defence budget and armament procurement, the world over, is being given a lower priority and keeping in view the "dumping prices" practices followed by advanced countries, OFs are making concerted efforts for the export of their traditional products.

Defence Production Units

The Defence Public Sector Undertakings are making vigorous efforts to obtain export orders. The steps taken to boost Defence exports include policy and procedural liberalisation marketing efforts through the Indian Missions abroad, the production agencies as well as other export agencies etc. Sales/publicity measures, such as participation in foreign exhibitions, exchange of delegations, etc have also been undertaken. Targets for exports are also laid down and monitored.

Recommendation Sl. No. 50 (Para No. 4.66)

The Committee may be informed within six months about the progress made in rationalising the admissibility of special allowance particularly Remote Area Allowance and Hill Area Allowance in Forward/Field Areas and the peace areas. Similar disparities, if any, in respect of allowances admissible to service personnel posted in Island territories may also be rationalised.

Reply of the Government

An exercise is on to finalise a comprehensive view on the concessions to be admissible to Service personnel on posting to various Field Areas.

Recommendation Sl. No. 51 (Para No. 4.67)

The proposed Siachen allowance and similar allowances admissible in similar other areas may be reviewed after every five years to maintain the value of such allowances in compensating hardship faced by the officers and jawans while operating in the highly inhospitable conditions.

Reply of the Government

Orders for revising the Siachen Allowance were issued in May, 1991. These orders will be reviewed periodically, as recommended.

Recommendation Sl. No. 52 (Para No. 4.68)

Greater attention may be paid to the welfare of Defence civilians in terms of housing, educational and medical facilities. The welfare of civilian employees should be considered an important part of the performance of the Officer-in charge of a unit/establishment. An appropriate mechanism should be set up to provide an opportunity to the defence civilians to ventilate their grievances.

Reply of the Government

The comments of the Committee have been noted. Appropriate improvements, within the constraints of available resources, will be gradually introduced.

Recommendation Sl. No. 54 (Para No. 4.70)

Intensive training programmes in various technical fields may be suitably organised for exservicemen or servicemen on the verge of retirement so as to improve their chances of getting employment in various fields after retirement from the Services.

Reply of the Government

Retiring/Retired Service personnel (of a non-technical low academic background) are given intensive on-the-job training under a scheme known as OJT Scheme. This Scheme provides intensive coaching for a period of 9 months, to train these personnel according to the requirements of the employers so that they may be employed against the vacancies reserved for

ex-Servicemen in various Central Govt. Departments/Public Sector Undertakings. During the last 3 years, a total of 4393 service personnel have been trained under this Scheme, which is conducted in 10 selected Trades, given below:

(a) Fitter (b) Turner (c) Machinist (d) welder (Gas & Electrical) (e) Mechanic (Motor Vehicle) (f) Lineman (g) Moulder (h) Carpenter (i) Plumber (j) Book Binder Technical and non-technical courses of one/two years duration are also organised at various ITIs/ATIs in the country. This training aims to equip personnel for re-employment as well as for self employment. A total of 3219 personnel have so far been trained under the Scheme, during the last three years.

Certain technical courses for the personnel are also organised through private institutions of repute. These courses are: Computer Science and Application, TV Repairs and Maintenance, Refrigeration and Air Conditioning and Motor Vehicle Repairs, etc. During the last three years a total of 25858 personnel have been trained through these programmes.

CHAPTER III

RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT DESIRE TO PURSUE IN VIEW OF GOVERNMENT REPLIES

Recommendation Sl. No. 2 (Para No. 1.81)

For a more effective higher direction of national security, the dormant National Security Council should be revived.

Reply of the Government

The role of the National Security Council is under review in the light of the dynamic changes which have taken place since its establishment.

Recommendation Sl. No. 4 (Para No. 1.83)

With a view to stabilising defence plan expenditure, the feasibility of making the defence sector allocations for the entire Plan period as unalterable may be examined.

Reply by the Government

Unalterable allocations for an entire Plan period may not be feasible for various reasons. Constitutionally, the expenditure is voted annually by the Parliament; the procedure for annual appropriations is one of the corner stones of Parliamentary control. The aforesaid aspects apart, the Ministry of Defence continues to seek timely indications of resource allocations in a future Plan period. For the Plan period 1990-95, indications of likely allocations upto 1994-95 are available.

Recommendation Sl. No. 5 (Para No. 1.84)

The Defence Policy must take a greater note of emerging threat to the country from air and sea and must be reshaped to safeguard growing economic and maritime interests of the country. For this purpose greater attention needs to be paid in future defence plans towards modernisation of Air Force and Navy.

Reply by the Government

The modernisation requirements of Air Force and Navy, as well as of the Army, engage the continuous attention of the Government and investment decisions in this regard duly reckon, *inter alia*, the obtaining and emerging threat perceptions.

Recommendation Sl. No. 6 (Para No. 1.85)

The process of Defence Planning and allocation of resources should be so correlated that tasks given to the Defence Services are backed by sufficient assurance about the availability of resources.

Reply of the Government

Unalterable allocations for an entire Plan period may not be feasible for various reasons. Constitutionally, the expenditure is voted annually by the Parliament; the procedure for annual appropriations is one of the corner stones of Parliamentary control. The aforesaid aspects apart, the Ministry of Defence continues to seek timely indications of resource allocations in a future Plan period. For the Plan period 1990-95, indications of likely allocations upto 1994-95 are available.

Such an approach is unassailable in principle. However, in the context of the resource crunch, guarantees about the assured availability of resources of a given order are not invariably available. Nonetheless, efforts towards securing advance indications about resource allocations in a Plan period continue.

Recommendation Sl. No. 8 (Para No. 1.87)

Financial Advisers may be appointed in respective Service HQs and at various Command/Formation levels to ensure proper decentralisation coupled with rapid decision making and corresponding accountability.

Reply of the Government

In the exercise of powers delegated to the Services HQs, officers of Defence Finance tender the required assistance and also serve as members of Tender Purchase Committees in Service HQs. Powers are also already delegated to Commands/Lower Formation levels and Controllers of Defence Accounts act as Financial Advisers to the GOC-in-C's and Formations/Units, down the line. Action is under way to establish the structural arrangements for financial decisions being taken at the lower Formation levels in consultation with Finance officers.

Recommendation Sl. No. 11 (Para No. 1.90)

Action on the recommendations of the Expert Committee set up in 1989 as well as those of the Committee on Defence Expenditure should be expedited and progress reported to the Committee within a period of six months.

Reply of the Government

The Expert Committee submitted its final report, alongwith recommendations, to COAS in April, 1990. The responsibility of examining the recommendations and obtaining the approval of COAS was delegated to certain nodal agencies at Army HQs. These agencies analysed the recommendations and, after approval of the COAS, a Steering Committee under the Chairmanship of the VCOAS was constituted to oversee the implementation of the recommendations of the

has been taken by the Army HQs. On the majority of the recommendations. Action on other recommendations is under process in Army HQs.

The recommendations of the Committee on Defence Expenditure can be broadly subsumed under three categories:—

- (i) Those which concern the operationalisation of specific measures of economy, which can be put into effect immediately and on which there is a concurrence of views between the concerned agencies, including Services HQs.
- (ii) Those which would require further examination and consideration in Study Groups as per the CDE's own recommendations.
- (iii) Those which envisage fundamental structural changes in the system of decision making in Defence.

Action has been taken to implement the CDE's recommendation which fall under category (i) above. With regard to the CDE's recommendation which require further indepth consideration, these are being processed by the Services HQs. and the concerned agencies. As regards the recommended measures which involve structural changes, a decision thereon involves several Deptts. /Ministries. Consultations in the matter are continuing in the Committee of Secretaries.

Recommendation Sl. No. 14 (Para No. 1.93)

The desirability of raising Rashtriya Rifles may be reviewed.

Reply of the Government

Budgetary constraints do not permit raising of additional RR battalions. Regarding disbanding of the existing RR battalions, the matter would be reviewed for a conclusive decision as soon as the continuing pressure on Army's involvement in J&K, Punjab and the North-east eases.

Recommendation Sl. No. 20 (Para No. 2.114)

In order to overcome shortage of Commissioned Officers in the three Services, particularly the Army, the existing package being offered to officers recruited under the Short Service Commission Scheme should be improved upon to bring it at par with what was being offered to Officers recruited under Emergency Commission Scheme in 1962.

Reply of the Government

The terms of service of Short Service Commissioned Officers are being continuously reviewed and improved, as necessary. On review we have found that the existing service conditions of Short Service Commissioned Officers are in no way inferior to those of the officers recruited under Emergency Commission Scheme in 1962.

Recommendation Sl. No. 21 (Para No. 2.115)

More Sainik Schools should be opened in the rural areas to target recruitment efforts at a wider social base and to catch appropriate human resource at a young and impressionable age.

Reply of the Government

Under the Sainik Schools Scheme, a new Sainik School is opened on the specific request of a State Govt. or Union Territory admin., since the entire capital expenditure and a major portion of the recurring expenditure has to be met by it. This policy was reviewed at the last meeting of the Board of Governors of the Sainik Schools Society, held on 26-5-92, wherein the reps. of the States were also present. The Board of Governors decided that the entire issue be examined by a Committee consisting of reps. from the Centre and the States. A Committee has now been constituted, on 5-1-93, for this purpose, as at Appendix V. The Committee is expected to give its report by April, 1993. Further action to open new Sainik Schools will be taken in accordance with the recommendations of the above Committee.

Recommendation Sl. No. 31 (Para No. 2.125)

The report of the Committee on Defence Expenditure be placed before the Parliament for a comprehensive debate on the subject.

Reply of the Government

The Report of the CDE is classified "Secret." It would not be in the national security interest to discuss it.

Recommendation Sl. No. 36 (Para No. 3.48)

The Committee would like to be informed about the actual impact created by the two schemes viz. hiring of research associates in specific area as consultants and emeritus scientists, on the Defence Research & Development effort.

Reply of the Government

A scheme for Research Associate and Sr./Jr. Research Fellows has just been introduced by DRDO. In the first instance, 6 Research Associates, 8 Sr. Research Fellows and 16 Jr. Research Fellows have been selected in various disciplines. The impact of Research Associates/Fellows can be realistically reviewed only after their 3 years tenure is completed.

Till date DRDO has availed the services of six scientists emeritus who have worked in diverse areas of integrated optics and optical communication systems, missile warheads, radars, semi-conductors and other strategic programmes. DRDO's experience in regard to these scientists has been satisfactory and they will like to continue with them on need based basis.

Recommendation Sl. No. 37 (Para No. 3.49)

The scheme for merit based promotion of scientific and technical manpower may be approved and implemented, clear rules and procedures for constituting Assessment Boards may be approved and Committee informed of the progress within a period of six months.

Reply of the Government

A draft paper for the Committee of Secretaries on merit based promotion scheme for S&T manpower in DRDO is under examination by the Ministries of Personnel and Finance. Both the Ministries apprehend that acceptance of this scheme in DRDO would raise similar demands from other Government departments. MOD feel that the career management of S&T manpower in DRDO requires to be viewed differently from that of employees in other Government Departments; it is more akin to the S&T manpower in other Scientific Departments like Department of Space, Department of Atomic Energy, Department of Electronics etc. where more liberalised schemes have been in operation for varying periods.

Recommendation Sl. No. 42 (Para No. 3.54)

Earnest efforts may be made to remove disparities in the wages and perquisites between workers performing similar tasks in Defence Public Sector Undertakings and other production units under the Ministry of Defence.

Reply of the Government

The wages and the perquisites of the workers of the Defence PSUs are fixed on the basis of agreements reached between the Management and Employees' Unions, keeping in view the guidelines issued by the Deptt. of Public Enterprises. On the other hand, the employees of the Ordnance Factories are Government Servants and their wages are governed by the rules/orders/instructions issued by the Government, from time to time.

Recommendation Sl. No. 45 (Para No. 4.61)

Suitable amendments in the disciplinary laws/regulations in respect of Service personnel and the Defence civilians may be made to ensure that, for grave acts of omission and commission, the two categories are held equally accountable and awarded due punishment under the same laws.

Reply of the Government

Separate procedures govern disciplinary action against Defence civilians & uniformed personnel. Defence civilians are covered by CCS (CC&A) Rules, 1965, like other civilians under the Central Govt. whereas uniformed personnel are covered by Service Acts like Army Act, Navy Act etc. It is not possible to bring them under the same rules because of different service conditions & liabilities. There is no time bar for initiating disciplinary cases against Defence civilians while they are in service; for

Service personnel there is a time bar of 3 years. The Service rules & procedures for the Defence Service personnel have been tailored to suit their service requirements just as the rules for civilians are fashioned to suit their service environment. It is not considered feasible to have identical rules for both these streams. However, accountability exists in both of these streams & appropriate punishments are meted out to those held guilty.

Recommendation Sl. No. 46 (Para No. 4.62)

The existing scales of residential accommodation may be reviewed with a view to (i) optimising satisfaction from the existing housing facilities; and (ii) ensure greater availability of hired accommodation within the authorised scales of rent. To begin with such exercise may be undertaken urgently in respect of metropolitan cities and other areas where residential accommodation is scarce. The progress made in this regard may be intimated within six months.

Reply of the Government

An exercise has been carried out to assess whether the existing scales of accommodation can be reduced. This has not been found feasible, due to a number of reasons. Further, the designs of the housing units do not lend themselves to sharing of accommodation.

To secure increased accommodation on hire within the authorised scales of rent, lesser plinth area has been prescribed for Delhi and Noida *vide* MOD letter No. 2(2)84/D(Q&C) dated 27.3.92 (Copy enclosed as Appendix VI).

Recommendation Sl. No. 47 (Para No. 4.63)

An in-depth study of the manpower structure and age profiles in the three services may be carried out in order to meet burgeoning requirement for housing and other facilities.

Reply of the Government

The provision of housing and other facilities depends on resource availability. The available scarce resources are being directed to higher priority areas. Efforts towards enhancing satisfaction levels for housing and other facilities remain under constant review.

Recommendation Sl. No. 49 (Para No. 4.65)

Necessary steps may be taken to minimise disparities between Defence Services personnel and the Defence civilian in regard to various Service entitlements including transfer grant, leave preparatory to retirement, retention of accommodation after retirement, etc. Wherever necessary rationale for such disparities should be fully explained to the Service personnel or Defence civilians as the case may be through available channels of communication. Under no circumstances groundless misgivings should be allowed to take root.

Reply of the Government

Previously, a Service Officer could retain married accommodation for a period of only 2 months after retirement. Keeping in view the waiting periods for allotment of entitled accommodation to serving officers, the aforesaid period has been extended to 3 months. As regards leave entitlement and transfer grants, such matters are examined after duly keeping in view the position pertaining to civilian employees and the rationale behind their allowances/entitlements. Parity in all matters between Defence personnel and their civilian counterparts is not possible.

CHAPTER IV

RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH GOVERNMENT REPLIES HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE COMMITTEE

Recommendation Sl. No. 30 (Para No. 2.124)

The question of voluntary national service may be subject to a comprehensive national debate and all necessary steps taken for the purpose.

Reply of the Government

No tangible proposal for introducing voluntary national service scheme has yet emerged.

Recommendation Sl. No. 43 (Para No. 4.59)

The existing system of grievance redressal in the three Services should be reviewed to identify the existing and potential causes of dissatisfaction with it.

Reply of the Government

Service Officers are entitled to submit statutory/non-statutory complaints for seeking redressal in respect of any military wrong done to them in their career. The complaints are examined in the Service HQrs. Appropriate relief on non-statutory complaints is granted at the level of the Service Chiefs. In respect of statutory complaints, recommendations of the Service HQrs. are forwarded to the Ministry of Defence, where the complaint/ comments of the Service HQrs. and the complete record profile of the officers are scrutinised and necessary redressal/relief given, if military wrong is established. This system has been working satisfactorily. The question of setting up an independent body/tribunal for redressal of grievances was carefully examined but not found feasible.

Recommendation Sl. No. 44 (Para No. 4.60)

All necessary steps should be taken to impart utmost objectivity to the existing institutions for redressal of grievances internally. For this purpose Committee desire that no further time should be lost in setting up statutory boards or tribunals exclusively for the Service personnel on such bodies should be represented retired Service Officers, eminent civilian persons from the fields of judiciary and higher civil services. As a corollary to this Service personnel may be barred from approaching to the civil courts except for the purpose of review by Supreme Court of the decision given by the proposed statutory board.

Reply of the Government

A proposal for setting up an Administrative Tribunal for the Services was carefully examined, but not found feasible.

Recommendation Sl. No. 48 (Para No. 4.64)

The Committee may be informed within six months about the steps taken to augment the number of doctors and supporting staff in the Army hospitals as also about the augmentation of beds in these hospitals.

Reply of the Government

The requirement of doctors and supporting staff in the military hospitals and the availability of beds is reviewed from time to time, and augmentation is considered on the basis of availability of resources.

CHAPTER V

RECOMMENDATIONS/OBSERVATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF GOVERNMENT ARE AWAITED

Recommendation Sl. No. 3 (Para No. 1.82)

The Official Secrets Act may be reviewed and rationalised to facilitate a more meaningful debate on national security affairs.

Reply of the Government

An extract of the recommendation made by the Estimates Committee has been forwarded to the Ministry of Home Affairs, with whom a proposal on the subject is under consideration.

Recommendations Sl. No. 53 (Para No. 4.69)

The feasibility of introducing a contributory pension scheme, free of charge for the retiring Serviced personnel may be examined and the results reported to the Committee within a period of six months.

Reply of the Government

The Dep'tt. of P&PW would be reviewing this matter for the best possible decision. Accordingly, the recommendations of the Estimates Committee have been sent to Dep'tt. of P&PW.

NEW DELHI;
18, April 1994

28, Chaitra 1916(S)

DR. KRUPASINDHU BHOI,
*Chairman,
Estimates Committee.*

APPENDIX I

MINISTRY OF DEFENCE

SUBJECT:—*Action taken by Government on the Nineteenth Report of Estimates Committee on the Ministry of Defence—Defence Force Levels, Manpower, Management and Policy.*

It has been recommended by the Estimates Committee in para 1.91 of their 19th Report on the Ministry of Defence, Defence Force/Manpower Levels—Policy, Institutional aspects that serious efforts should be made to plan infrastructure for maintenance and support service for weapon systems and equipments to minimise gap being experienced presently between the identification of the need and actual induction into service of weapons systems/equipment etc. In order to minimise the gap between establishment of infrastructure/procurement spares for maintenance and their actual implementation, it is requested that the concerned organisations may be advised to propose the following provisions for inclusion in the contracts while forwarding procurement proposals relating to weapon systems/equipment etc:—

- (a) Contracts should include supply of drawings to ease indigenisation process;
- (b) Requirement of spares for maintenance should be included in the contract. The delivery schedule should be spread over as the initial requirement will be low being new equipment. A clause may be included in the contract wherein the requirement of spares can be increased when required;
- (c) Contracts should have provision for early delivery of a few pieces for their extensive exploitation in training and exercises. Pilot overhaul could be carried out on this equipment and the requirement of spares worked out and procurement action initiated.

2. In addition, efforts should be made to identify indigenous engine for repowering. Repowering trials could be carried out and the repowered equipment put through trials alongwith similar original equipment and the data collected. When required the repowering could then be carried out without any delay. Indigenisation of items and identification of sources for indigenisation should starts immediately on procurement.

3. A copy of the Action Taken may be sent to us for information.

(RAMANATH JHA)
Director (O)

DMGO

M of D.I.D. No. 32(1)92/D (GS-IV) dated 9.11.1992

APPENDIX II

F.No. 5(1)90/D(Coord)
GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
MINISTRY OF DEFENCE

New Delhi, dated the 16th February, 1993

OFFICE MEMORANDUM

SUBJECT: Requests of Defence Services Officers for premature retirement

· · · · ·

**Reference: MOD I.D.No. 84(5)/78/D(MS)/D (Pen/Ser),
dated 20-01-1979.**

In partial modification of the existing instructions relating to premature retirement/release of Defence Services Officers, it has been decided that—

- (i) Service Officers of the rank of Lt. Colonel and higher rank (and equivalent) may be allowed to apply for civil jobs and permitted to retire from service on the basis of the recommendations of the Chiefs of Staff, if such officers have been bypassed for promotion on first look.
- (ii) Similar flexibility as above may be adopted in respect of officers who have no prospects for advancement in service in view of reasons other than in (i) above. In this regard, the concerned Chiefs of Staff will make their recommendations, on a case-by-case basis, for a decision by Government.
- (iii) In so far as appointments in the Public Sector Undertakings are concerned, for vacancies below the Board level posts, applications by Service Officers for employment in PSUs may be made directly, under intimation to the competent Authority. Further, there would be no objection to applications being sponsored by the Services HQs or DG Resettlement out of the select panels of officers maintained by them.

2. The existing instructions on the subject shall be deemed to have been modified to the extent indicated above, with immediate effect.

(N.S. SISODIA)

Joint Secretary to the Government of India

AG/Army HQrs
COP/Naval HQrs
AOP/Air HQrs
D.G.A.F.M.S.

Heads of All Inter Service Organisations

Copy to:—

Additional Secy. (A)

All Joint Secretaries/Directors/Deputy Secretaries/Branch Officers.

Copy also to:—

Chairman, PESB

APPENDIX III

No. 5(1)90/D (Coord)
GOVERNMENT OF INDIA
MINISTRY OF DEFENCE

New Delhi, dated the 16th February, 1993
OFFICE MEMORANDUM

SUBJECT: Acceptance of post retirement commercial employment by Defence Services Officers.

.....

Reference: (1) O.M.No. 42/166/D (Coord) dated 3-5-1966,
(2) O.M.No. 42/179/D (Coord) dated 17-7-1980,
(3) 42/181/D (Coord) dated 21-8-1981,
(4) 42/181/D (Coord) dated 19-4-1982,
(5) 42(2)81/D (Coord) dated 1-10-1988,
(6) 5(2)87/D (Coord) dated 15-7-1987.

Defence Services Officers of the rank of Colonel or equivalent and above, who retire with pension, gratuity or any other benefits in respect of the services rendered by them, are required to obtain prior permission of the Government for accepting any commercial employment within a period of two years from the date of retirement. Before granting permission in such cases, Government have to satisfy themselves that—

- (a) The duties of the retired officer in the proposed commercial employment will not be such as to bring him into conflict with the Government;
- (b) There is no basis for suspecting that such employment has been offered to the officer for any favour which he might have shown, while in service, to the prospective employer;
- (c) That any official information, knowledge or contacts which the officer might have gained by virtue of his official position while in service cannot be used to give the prospective employer any kind of unfair advantage; and
- (d) The proposed employment should be of a thoroughly reputable kind as clarified in Department of Personnel & Admin. Reforms OM No. 2923/74-Est(A) dt. 11 Feb. 75 (copy attached for strict adherence).

2. Certain guidelines had been prescribed in accordance with the above criteria for processing requests of retired Service Officers for permission to

take up commercial employment. Representations were received by the Government that some of the extant guidelines were excessively restrictive and needed to be liberalised. The matter has since been reviewed by Government. Having regard to the safeguards which are considered essential and the need for rationalising the existing provisions, the following criteria shall henceforth be followed, while considering requests of ex-Service Officers for post-retirement commercial employment:—

- (i) Any Officer who has had dealings with a particular firm and its sister concerns before his retirement shall not be allowed to take up a job with that firm.
- (ii) Any officer in an appointment dealing with contracts and procurement shall not be allowed to take up a job with a firm and its sister concerns which has subsisting contract(s) with Ministry of Defence.
- (iii) If the proposed appointment calls for marketing or liaison with Defence Establishments, such an appointment shall not be permitted.
- (iv) Appointments with companies/firms which operate in sensitive areas of Defence procurements or which have subsidiary firms having contracts with Ministry of Defence shall not be permitted.
- (v) Appointments with foreign Governments or foreign firms shall not be allowed (such restriction shall apply to only foreign companies *per se* and foreign companies investing in India, but not Indian companies entering into foreign collaboration. Apart from this, only those foreign companies shall be excluded, for purposes of commercial employment, which operate in the Defence sector).

3. With a view to ensuring expeditious processing of such requests from retired Service Officers, it has also been decided to reduce the levels of consideration. Henceforth, applications of retired personnel upto and including the rank of Brigadiers (and equivalent), will be considered and disposed off by the respective Chiefs of Staff, subject to the Chiefs of Staff exercising this delegated power personally, having regard to the above prescribed criteria.

4. The existing instructions on the subject shall be deemed to have been modified to the extent indicated above, with immediate effect.

(N.S. SISODIA)

Joint Secretary to the Government of India

AG/Army HQrs.

COP/Naval HQrs.

AOP/Air HQrs.

D.G.A.F.M.S.

Heads of All Inter Service Organisations

Copy to:

Additional Secy. (A)

All Joint Secretaries/Directors/Deputy Secretaries/Branch Officers.

Copy also to:

Secretary, DOP&T

APPENDIX IV

Employment

1. Civil employment constitutes the principal mode of resettlement of ex-Servicemen and both the Central and State Governments continue to provide concessions to promote employment of ex-Servicemen in civil posts/services. These include reservation of posts, relaxation in upper age limits and educational qualifications prescribed for various post, priority in employment etc.

2. The reservation of post under the Central and the State Governments has been provided as under:—

(a) Reservation under Central Government/Public Sector Undertakings (PSUs):

Posts	Government Departments	PSUs Nationalised Banks
Group 'A' & 'B' (Posts of Assistant Commandants in Para Military Forces)	10%	
Group 'C'	10%	14½ %
Group 'D'	20%	24½ %

(b) Reservation under State Governments: This ranges from 2% to 20%, varying from State to State. There is no reservation in Bihar, Kerala, Meghalaya and Nagaland.

3. The number of ex-Servicemen appointed against vacancies reserved in Group 'C' and 'D' posts in the Central Government Departments,

Public Sector Undertakings, Nationalised Banks, Para Military Forces and Ordnance Factories during the last five years is shown in the following table:—

Year	Ex-Servicemen Recruited	
	'C'	'D'
1988	3148	3460
1989	2193	3098
1990	1754	2239
1991	1658	1689
1992 (Upto June)	409	347

4. In addition, the number of ex-Servicemen re-employed with the Defence Security Corps during the year 1988, 1989, 1990, 1991 and 1992 (Upto June) was 1727, 2774, 2064, 2133 and 1129 respectively. As regards officers, the number appointed during 1988, 1989, 1990 and 1991, 1992 to June was 97, 77, 103, 59 and 32 respectively.

5. In order to optimise utilisation of vacancies reserved for ex-Servicemen, several measures have been taken by the Ministry of Defence to improve the position at the Central level. These include pooling of vacancies, special recruitment drives, advance intimation of vacancies, carry forward of the vacancies for one year, etc. Implementation of these measures is monitored closely. State Governments have also been asked to take similar measures with a view to improving the overall position with regard to filling up of the reserved vacancies.

6. There is considerable scope for absorption of ex-Servicemen in the Para Military Forces like CRPF, BSF, ITBP, CISF, ETC. However, the response of ex-Servicemen for joining these forces has been very poor. Despite streamlining of recruitment procedures and systematic efforts being made by the Directorate General of Resettlement in this regard, the utilisation of the reserved vacancies in Para Military Forces is still around 25%. With a view to achieving fuller utilisation of reserved vacancies, special recruitment rallies are being organised in selected States. Ministry of Defence are continuing publicity efforts through Rajya Sainik Boards/ Zila Sainik Boards, Regimental Centres, units etc., to inform the retiring and retired Service personnel about the scope for their re-employment in Para Military Forces.

APPENDIX V

No. 8/3/92/SSC
BOARD OF GOVERNORS
SAINIK SCHOOLS SOCIETY
MINISTRY OF DEFENCE

New Delhi, the 5th January 93.

To

All the Members of the Committee.

SUBJECT : Constitution of a Committee to examine the funding pattern for new Sainik Schools.

The XVIII meeting of the Board of Governors of the Sainik Schools Society and discussed, *inter-alia*, the question of opening of new Sainik Schools in the country. The majority of representatives of the State Govts. had pointed out that the financial obligations of the State Govts. for opening new Sainik Schools were far too stiff. It was, therefore, decided that the funding pattern for opening new Sainik Schools may be examined by a small Committee having representation from the Centre and the States. The Board of Governors had authorised the Raksha Mantri to constitute the proposed Committee.

2. Accordingly, the Sainik Schools Society has decided to constitute the following Committee to look into the various issues regarding the funding pattern for the opening of the new Sainik Schools.

1. Education Minister — Karnataka.
2. Education Minister — Manipur.
3. Education Minister — Punjab.
4. Education Minister — West Bengal.
5. Education Minister — Tamil Nadu.
6. Education Minister — Maharashtra.
7. Education Minister — Bihar.
8. Education Secretary — Uttar Pradesh.
9. Education Secretary — Orissa.
10. Education Secretary — Andhra Pradesh.
11. Adviser to Governor — Jammu & Kashmir.
12. Sh. S.B. Gogate, Member, BOG, Sainik Schools Society.
13. Additional Financial Adviser (S), Ministry of Defence.
14. Joint Secretary (T&M)/MOD — Member Secretary.

3. The term of reference to the Committee would be as follows:—

- (i) To suggest a suitable funding pattern for the capital expenditure required in setting up new Sainik Schools in the country, clearly bringing out the responsibilities of the Centre and the States.
- (ii) To suggest a suitable funding pattern for meeting the recurring expenditure of new Sainik Schools, including the rates of scholarships payable to students in the new Sainik Schools.
- (iii) To suggest procedures for setting up new Sainik Schools in the country.

4. The Committee shall render its report to the Sainik Schools Society within a period of 3 months.

(JOSE CYRIAC. K)

*Director (Trg), Min of Def &
Honorary Secretary, Sainik Schools Society.*

Copy forwarded to:—

1. Prime Minister's Office
2. Cabinet Secretary
3. Defence Secretary
4. Additional Secretary, M of D.
5. FADS
6. PS to RM.

APPENDIX VI

No. 2(2)/84/O(Q&C)
GOVERNMENT OF INDIA,
MINISTRY OF DEFENCE

New Delhi, 27th March, 1992

To

The JS (Ad) & CAO,
Ministry of Defence.

**SUBJECT: Hiring of accommodation for Service Officers in Delhi/Noida :
Procedure regarding**

Sir,

I am directed to refer to this Ministry's letter No. 2(2)/84/O(QC) dated 15-4-88 and to say that the problems faced in hiring of accommodation for service officers in Delhi/New Delhi and NOIDA have been under consideration keeping in view the acute shortage of accommodation and non-availability of suitable houses corresponding to prescribed scales and to convey the sanction of the President to adoption of the following norms for hiring of accommodation for service officers in Delhi/New Delhi and NOIDA.

(a) Hiring of accommodation in Delhi/New Delhi will be with reference to carpet area of Drawing/Dining Room, bed rooms, kitchen, bath, toilets, stores, study room, enclosed varandah lounge/lobby and subject to the following lower limits.

Rank	Colonies within 12	Colonies beyond 12
	Kms of AHQ Complex	Kms of AHQ Complex
(a) Brig. & Equivalent	700 sq. ft.	800 sq. ft.
(b) Major to Col. & Equi.	670 sq. ft.	725 sq. ft.
(c) Capt. & Equivalent	625 sq. ft.	650 sq. ft.

(b) JS (Ad) & CAO may hire houses in Delhi/New Delhi with Lesser carpet area by not more than 5% of the above referred limits. In such cases the rent payable will be as per the next lower slab except in the case of accommodation for officers of the rank of Captain in the Army and equivalent where the rent payable will be restricted to Rs. 1700/- p.m.

(c) In respect of cases involving relaxation by more than 5% of carpet

area, prior concurrence of Director (Fin/Works) as IFA would be obtained in each case.

(d) Rent payable will be assessed at Rs. 3.15 per sq. ft and Rs. 3.00 per sq. ft. for houses within and outside 12 kms respectively of Army Headquarters Complex but shall not exceed the limit of the lower slab as given in sub para (b) above.

(e) Hiring of accommodation at NOIDA will be regulated in terms of this Ministry letter No. 82547/CAO/Q-II dated 11th Dec. 84 and will be with reference to the plinth area, given as under: The plinth areas shown below includes servant quarters and garage which are in the range of 200-550-Sq. ft.

(i) 1751 Sq. ft. and above : Rs. 2100/- when the house is occupied by an officer of the rank of Brig and above or equivalent in other two services.

(ii) 1500 to 1750 Sq. ft. : Rs. 1900/- when the house is occupied by an officer of the rank of Major and above and equivalent in other two services.

(iii) 1200 to 1499 Sq. ft. : Rs. 1800/- when the house is occupied by an officer of the rank of Captain and above and equivalent in other two services.

(iv) 1000 to 1199 Sq. ft. : Rent to be calculated @ Rs. 1.50 per Sq. ft. of plinth area.

Note: Houses having plinth area less than 1000 Sq. ft. will not be hired. However, in case of self-occupied houses with plinth area of less than 1000 Sq. ft. relaxation upto 5% may be allowed in the case of officers on rent reimbursement basis with prior concurrence of DFA (W) as IFA.

2. The above norms would also apply to the houses hired by service officers on rent reimbursement basis.

3. Cases already dealt with otherwise than in accordance with the above orders will be treated as having been regularised under these orders.

4. This letter issues with concurrence of Ministry of Defence (Finance W-I) *vide* their ID No. 540/WI/92 dated 23rd March, 1992.

Yours faithfully,

(JASWANT SINGH)
Under Secretary to the Government of India.

Copy to:—

The Controller General of Defence Accounts, New Delhi.
The Director of Audit, Defence Services, New Delhi.
The Senior Deputy Director of Audit, Defence Services, Western Command, Meerut.
The Controller of Defence Accounts, Western Command, Meerut.
The Controller of Defence Accounts (O).
The Controller of Defence Accounts (AF).
The Controller of Defence Accounts (Navy).
DFA (W), DFA (AF), DFA (Navy).
The QMG's Branch/Q-3 (B-I) — 10 Copies.
The Naval Headquarters (Dte. of Works).
The Air Headquarters, (Dte. of AF Works).
D (N-II), D (Air-II), CAO (Q-II).
The DG DE, The E-in-C's Branch/E-2 (WPC).

Copy signed in ink to be sent to:—

CDA (O), CDA (Navy), CDA (AF),
Controllers of Defence Accounts — All Commands,
Controller of Defence Accounts, Patna.

APPENDIX VII

(*Vide* Introduction of the Report)

Analysis of Action taken by Government on the 19th Report of Estimates Committee

(10th Lok Sabha)

Total number of Recommendations	54
I. Recommendations/Observations which have been accepted by Government:—	
(Sl.Nos. 1,7,9,10,12,13,15,16,17,18,19,22,23,24,25,26, 27,28,29,32,33,34,35,38,39,40,41,50,51,52 and 54)	
Total	31
Percentage	57.4%
II. Recommendations/Observations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of Government's replies:—	
(Sl. Nos. 2,4,5,6,8,11,14,20,21,31,36,37,42,45,46,47 and 49)	
Total	17
Percentage	31.5%
III. Recommendations/Observations in respect of which Government's replies have not been accepted by the Committee:—	
(Sl. Nos. 30,43,44 and 48)	
Total	4
Percentage	7.4%
IV. Recommendations/Observations in respect of which final replies are still awaited:—	
(Sl. Nos. 3 and 53)	
Total	2
Percentage	3.7%

PART II

MINUTES OF THE TWENTIETH SITTING OF THE ESTIMATES COMMITTEE (1993-94) HELD ON 8TH APRIL, 1994

The Committee sat from 1500 to 1610 hours.

PRESENT

Dr. Krupasindhu Bhoi — *Chairman*

MEMBERS

2. Shri S.K. Gangwar
3. Shri B.S. Hooda
4. Shri R. Jeevarathinam
5. Smt. Sumitra Mahajan
6. Shri Rupchand Pal
7. Shri Kabindra Purkayastha
8. Shri Satya Deo Singh
9. Shri P.C. Thomas
10. Shri Braja Kishore Tripathy
11. Shri Laeta Umbley

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri Murari Lal — *Joint Secretary*
2. Smt. P.K. Sandhu — *Deputy Secretary*
3. Shri K.L. Narang — *Under Secretary*
4. Shri R.C. Gupta — *Under Secretary*

2. The Committee considered the Draft Report on Action Taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the Nineteenth Report of the Estimates Committee (10th Lok Sabha) on the Ministry of Defence—Defence Force Levels, Manpower, Management and Policy and adopted the same with the modifications given in Annexure.

3. The Committee authorised the Chairman to make verbal and other consequential changes arising out of factual verification by the respective Ministries in these Draft Reports and present the same to the House.

The Committee then adjourned.

AMENDMENTS/MODIFICATIONS MADE BY THE ESTIMATES COMMITTEE IN THE DRAFT ACTION TAKEN REPORT ON DEFENCE FORCE LEVELS, MANPOWER, MANAGEMENT AND POLICY AT THEIR SITTING HELD ON 08.04.1994.

<i>Page No.</i>	<i>Para No.</i>	<i>Line No.</i>	<i>Amendments/Modifications</i>
2	1.5	—	The Recommendation contained in the existing para of the Report may be incorporated in the end of the Report.
4	1.8	9	<i>Add</i> at the end 'immediately'.
14	1.21	13	<i>For 'exact' Substitute 'as a result of the review made.'</i>
—	—	15	<i>For 'within a period of six months' Substitute 'as on 31st March, 1993'.</i>
26	1.38	—	At the end of the existing para <i>Add</i> sub para "The Ministry should also explain the reasons why setting up of an Administrative Tribunal for the Services was not found feasible."