

Monday, 22nd September, 1924

THE

# COUNCIL OF STATE DEBATES

(Official Report)

Volume IV, Parts II & III.

---

*(3rd September to 23rd September 1924.)*

---

FOURTH SESSION

OF THE

COUNCIL OF STATE, 1924.



CALCUTTA : GOVERNMENT OF INDIA  
CENTRAL PUBLICATION BRANCH  
1925

## MONDAY, 15TH SEPTEMBER, 1924—

Member Sworn . . . . .	1031
Questions and Answers . . . . .	1031—1033
Apology by the Honourable Mr. Haroon Jaffer for non-attendance at the meeting on the 11th instant . . . . .	1033—1034
Resolution <i>re</i> the recommendations of the Lee Commission—Postponed till the 16th September . . . . .	1034—1087

## TUESDAY, 16TH SEPTEMBER, 1924—

Questions and Answers . . . . .	1089—1091
Bills as passed by the Legislative Assembly—Laid on the Table . . . . .	1091
Message from the Legislative Assembly . . . . .	1091
Resolution <i>re</i> recommendations of the Lee Commission—Adopted . . . . .	1091—1153
Statement of Business . . . . .	1153

## WEDNESDAY, 17TH SEPTEMBER, 1924—

Death of Mr. Bhupendra Nath Basu . . . . .	1155—1159
Absence from the Council of the Honourable Saiyed Raza Ali . . . . .	1159
Resolution <i>re</i> contribution by the Government of India to relieve distress caused by the floods in the Madras Presidency—Withdrawn by leave of the Council . . . . .	1160—1170
Resolution <i>re</i> appointment of a Committee to inquire into the grievances of Haj Pilgrims—Not moved . . . . .	1170—1171
Resolution <i>re</i> representation of agricultural interests on the Taxation Inquiry Committee—Adopted . . . . .	1171—1184

## FRIDAY, 19TH SEPTEMBER, 1924—

Question and Answer . . . . .	1185
Indian Post Office (Amendment) Bill—Passed . . . . .	1185—1186
Imperial Bank of India (Amendment) Bill—Passed . . . . .	1186—1188
Indian Criminal Law (Amendment) Bill—Passed . . . . .	1188—1204
Indian Succession (Amendment) Bill—Introduced and referred to Joint Committee . . . . .	1204—1206
Statement of Business . . . . .	1206—1208

## MONDAY, 22ND SEPTEMBER, 1924—

Questions and Answers . . . . .	1209—1214
Message from the Legislative Assembly . . . . .	1214
Bills passed by the Legislative Assembly—Laid on the Table . . . . .	1214
Resolution <i>re</i> appointment of a competent Indian to the Railway Board—Adopted . . . . .	1215—1222
Statement of Business . . . . .	1222—1224

## TUESDAY, 23RD SEPTEMBER, 1924—

Questions and Answers . . . . .	1225—1228
Election to the Court of the Delhi University . . . . .	1228
Land Customs Bill—Passed . . . . .	1228—1231
Valedictory speeches in connection with the impending retirement of the Honourable Dr. Mian Sir Muhammad Shafi . . . . .	1231—1237
Prorogation of Session . . . . .	1237

## COUNCIL OF STATE.

*Monday, 22nd September 1924.*

The Council met in the Council Chamber at Eleven of the Clock, the Honourable the President in the Chair.

**THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT:** The Honourable Rai Bahadur Lala Ram Saran Das.

**THE HONOURABLE SARDAR JOGENDRA SINGH:** Sir, I have been asked by the Honourable Gentleman to put the questions for him, with your permission.

### QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

**REDUCTION OF STAFF CONSEQUENT ON THE ADOPTION OF THE NEW DIVISIONAL ORGANIZATION ON THE NORTH WESTERN RAILWAY.**

**417. THE HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS:** (a) Will the Government be pleased to state what annual saving in establishment does the North Western Railway anticipate in adopting the new divisional system similar to that adopted on the Great Indian Peninsula Railway?

(b) What is the total number of officers who have been or will be retrenched or reduced in this connection, and what is the total amount of their salaries?

(c) What is the total number of subordinates who have been or will be retrenched or reduced in this connection, and what is the total amount of their salaries?

(d) What is the total number of clerks who have been or will be retrenched or reduced in this connection, and what is the total amount of their salaries?

(e) When is the new system to be enforced?

(f) Is it a fact that the North Western Railway has issued orders for the forfeiture of the gratuity of those clerks who have been reduced to effect economy and who refuse to accept the reduced salary and wish to retire? If so, why?

**THE HONOURABLE MR. G. L. CORBETT:** (a), (b), (c), (d) and (e). The permanent superior establishment of the North Western Railway, to be adopted when all the stages of the change from the present to the new divisional organization are completed, reduces the number of permanent officers from 224 to 214, and their aggregate average pay per mensem from Rs. 2,20,173 to Rs. 2,12,634. Sanction to adopt the new organization was accorded on 5th September 1924. The new organization will render possible gradual economy in the employment of staff, and such economy will be in accordance with the policy urged by the Legislative Assembly and the Inchcape Committee, that working expenses in all directions including establishment should be reduced to the lowest limits compatible with efficiency and safety. It is not possible at this stage to state the number of employees who will gradually

(1209)

become redundant, or the saving of expenditure, as the result of the adoption of a divisional organization on the North Western Railway.

(f) The matter is being inquired into and the Honourable Member will be informed of the result.

**APPOINTMENT OF MR. F. WEBB AS SUPERINTENDENT, CENTRAL REGISTRY OFFICE IN THE OFFICE OF THE AGENT, NORTH WESTERN RAILWAY.**

418. **THE HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS :** (a) Will Government kindly state whether one Mr. F. Webb has been appointed as Superintendent, Central Registry Office, in the Office of Agent, North Western Railway, on a salary of Rs. 350 rising to Rs. 400 per mensem ; if so, what are his duties and responsibilities ?

(b) Is it a fact that Mr. Webb was a chargeman in the North Western Railway Carriage Shops getting Rs. 210 per mensem prior to his new appointment ?

(c) Is it a fact that Mr. Webb had no office experience and that he never even held charge of any branch in any office ? If so, what led to his new appointment ?

(d) Will the Government kindly state how many clerks in class V in the Rs. 275 grade, who gave satisfaction when officiating as Superintendents in North Western Railway offices, have been superseded by this appointment and for what reasons ?

**THE HONOURABLE MR. G. L. CORBETT :** Government have no information. The selection of the best men for posts of this nature is a matter which must be left to the Agent's discretion.

**EXTENSION OF THE PRESENT REVENUE SETTLEMENT IN THE UNITED PROVINCES.**

419. **THE HONOURABLE MR. MUHAMMAD YAMIN KHAN :** (a) Have the Government of India got any control over the United Provinces Government in the matter of extension of period of revenue settlement ?

(b) If so, have the Government of the United Provinces ever represented to the Government of India within the last three years the desire of the United Provinces Council for the extension of the present revenue settlement ?

(c) Did the United Provinces Government bring to the notice of the Government of India that the United Provinces Council rejected their demand for the expenditure for the purpose of revenue settlement ?

(d) Was it ever brought to the notice of the Government of India that His Excellency the Governor of the United Provinces allowed the expenditure rejected by the Council for the revenue settlement purposes ?

(e) Was this expenditure allowed after consulting the Government of India ?

(f) If the wish of the United Provinces Council was represented to the Government of India, what steps, if any, did the Government take in this matter ?

**THE HONOURABLE SIR NARASIMHA SARMA :** (a) The Government of India exercise control over all Local Governments with regard to the

general and recognised principles of assessment and the period for which settlements may be sanctioned or extended."

(b) The answer is in the affirmative.

(c), (d) and (e). The answer is in the negative.

(f) The matter will be taken into consideration when the United Provinces Government makes its recommendation.

THE HONOURABLE MR. MUHAMMAD YAMIN KHAN: My question part (f) is, was any representation made to the Government of India?

THE HONOURABLE SIR NARASIMHA SARMA: The United Provinces Council's wish has been forwarded to us without any recommendation of the Local Government, and we cannot take into consideration any such wish until the Local Government forward it to us with their views.

THE HONOURABLE MR. MUHAMMAD YAMIN KHAN: I want to know whether it was brought to the notice of the Government of India that such was the wish of the Local Council.

THE HONOURABLE SIR NARASIMHA SARMA: I have already answered in answer to part (a) that the United Provinces Government have communicated to us the desire of the United Provinces Council.

GRANT OF A PROSPECTING LICENCE FOR PETROLEUM AT MOGHAL KOT TO  
MESSRS. GRAHAM AND COMPANY OF CALCUTTA.

420. THE HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS: Will Government kindly state whether the answer to my question No. 286, put by me on the 6th June 1924, is now ready? If so, will they give a reply to that question?

THE HONOURABLE MR. J. P. THOMPSON: Yes.

It is impossible to estimate the quantity of petroleum at Moghal Kot. No prospecting license has yet been issued, but it is proposed to issue one shortly in favour of Messrs. Graham and Company of Calcutta. The terms have not yet been finally settled. It is not proposed to enter into any arrangements with the tribes until Messrs. Graham and Company decide finally to start operations.

DEBIT TO MILITARY ESTIMATES OF THE COST OF THE KHYBER RAILWAY.

421. THE HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS: (a) Is the Khyber Railway a strategic Railway?

(b) If so, why is the cost of the Railway not borne by the Military Department?

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. L. CORBETT: The reply to the first part of the question is in the affirmative. As to the second part, the Honourable Member's attention is invited to the Resolution on the subject which was moved by him in the Council of State in February 1922 and which was negatived. It has been decided not to debit the Military estimates with the cost of such lines, but the question whether the estimates for strategic lines can be

shown separately from that of commercial lines in the railway estimates is being considered.

**ESTABLISHMENT OF BOAT-MAKING AND OTHER INDUSTRIES IN WANA, RAZMAK AND MIRANSHAH.**

422. **THE HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS :** What practical difficulties, if any, stand in the way of the establishment of such industries as boat-making, breweries, saddle-making, tailoring, etc., in Wana, Razmak and Miranshah ?

**ESTABLISHMENT OF STONE-WORKS, ETC., IN WANA, RAZMAK, MIRANSHAH AND PARACHINAR.**

423. **THE HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS :** Will Government kindly state what practical difficulties there are in the way of establishing such industries as stone-works, cement and lime-making or woollen textile mills in Wana, Razmak, Miranshah and Parachinar ?

**ESTABLISHMENT OF MILITARY AND OTHER INDUSTRIES IN WAZIRISTAN.**

424. **THE HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS :** Do Government propose to consider schemes for the establishment of military and other industries in Waziristan ?

**THE HONOURABLE MR. J. P. THOMPSON :** If I may, Sir, I will answer questions Nos. 422, 423 and 424 together. The answer is the same.

Inquiry is being made from the local Administration and the information will be supplied to the Honourable Member in due course.

**SHIPS ENGAGED IN CARRYING GOVERNMENT OR RAILWAY COAL FROM BENGAL TO BOMBAY, MADRAS, KARACHI AND RANGOON.**

425. **THE HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS :** What was the average number of ships engaged in carrying Government or railway coal from Bengal to Bombay, Madras, Karachi and Rangoon in the quinquennium before the war, and what has been the average number of ships engaged in this trade in the quinquennium after the war ?

**THE HONOURABLE MR. G. L. CORBETT :** Figures for the pre-war period are not available. Figures for the period from 1st April 1919 to 31st March 1924 are :—

Bombay	..	..	..	..	..	24 shipments.
Madras	..	..	..	..	..	87 "
Karachi	..	..	..	..	..	7 "
Rangoon	..	..	..	..	..	120 "
Total						238

or an average of 48 per annum. Besides these 38 ships were loaded from Calcutta on Royal Indian Marine account during the same period.

**ACTION TAKEN BY GOVERNMENT TO INCREASE THE NUMBER OF SHIPS REFERRED TO IN Q. NO. 425.**

**426. THE HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS :** Have Government done anything in the matter of increasing the number of ships engaged in carrying Government and railway coal from Bengal to Bombay, Madras, Karachi and Rangoon ?

**THE HONOURABLE MR. G. L. CORBETT :** The Honourable Member has doubtless seen the Resolution which appeared in last Saturday's Gazette, appointing a Committee to consider what measures can be taken to stimulate the export of coal from Calcutta by sea to Indian and foreign ports.

**RAILWAY COLLISION NEAR HARAPPA ON THE NORTH WESTERN RAILWAY.**

**427. THE HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS :**  
(a) Will Government kindly place on the table of the Council the detailed report regarding the cause of the collision which recently took place between Mirdad Muafi and Harappa stations on the North Western Railway ; how many people were killed and how many injured ?

(b) What is the number of subordinate traffic staff at Mirdad Muafi and Harappa stations, and what are their duties and hours of working, and what is the daily average number of trains passing ?

(c) What was the traffic subordinate staff on these stations three years back ? How did the Train Control fail in this instance ?

(d) Is any mechanical block signalling apparatus installed on these two stations ?

**THE HONOURABLE MR. G. L. CORBETT :** (a) The report will be published as soon as received. The latest information received shows that the total casualties were 202, which included 105 deaths.

(b) The traffic staff at both stations are :—

- 1 station master,
- 2 Assistant Station Masters,
- 4 pointsmen.

Their hours of working are :—

- 1 assistant station master, midnight to 9 a.m.
- 1 station master, 9 a.m. to 6 p.m.
- 1 assistant station master, 6 p.m. to midnight.
- 2 pointsmen are on duty at a time. They work 6 hours, then have 6 hours' off.

The daily average number of trains in each direction is :—

Mail and Passenger	..	..	..	..	4
Goods	..	..	..	..	2

(c) The same as now. There was no failure of Train Control.

(d) No.

**THE HONOURABLE DR. SIR DEVA PRASAD SARVADHIKARY :** Have the Government more information about the Great Indian Peninsula Railway device for preventing collision that was mentioned in this House some time ago, and if so, will the Government let the House have it ?

**THE HONOURABLE MR. G. L. CORBETT :** I am afraid I must ask for notice of that question. I have no information on the subject.

**INDIAN TRAFFIC INSPECTORS (TRANSPORTATION) ON THE N. W., O. AND R. AND E. B. RAILWAYS.**

**428. THE HONOURABLE RAI BAHADUR LALA RAM SARAN DAS :** Will the Government kindly state the number of Indians appointed as Traffic Inspectors (Transportation) on each of the three State Railways' (North Western Railway, Oudh and Rohilkhand Railway and Eastern Bengal Railway) since my Resolution on this subject was adopted in this House on the 28th February 1923 ?

**THE HONOURABLE MR. G. L. CORBETT :** The Government have not the latest information but are making inquiry.

---

#### MESSAGE FROM THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY.

**SECRETARY OF THE COUNCIL :** Sir, a message has been received from the Legislative Assembly.

**THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT :** Let it be read.

**SECRETARY OF THE COUNCIL :** The message runs as follows :—

"Sir, I am directed to inform you that the Bill to amend and consolidate the law relating to Government and other Provident Funds which was passed by the Council of State at its meeting of the 10th September, 1924, was passed by the Legislative Assembly at its meeting of the 20th September, 1924, with the following amendments :—

In clause 6 of the Bill sub-clause (b) was deleted and in sub-clause (a) the letter "a" within brackets and the word "or" at the end of the sub-clause were deleted.

2. The Legislative Assembly requests the concurrence of the Council of State in the amendments."

---

#### BILLS PASSED BY THE LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY LAID ON THE TABLE.

**SECRETARY OF THE COUNCIL :** Sir, I lay on the table the Bill in question as amended by the Legislative Assembly, and, in accordance with Rule 25 of the Indian Legislative Rules, I lay on the table a copy of the Bill to consolidate, amend and extend the law relating to the levy of duties of customs on articles imported or exported by land from or to territory outside India, which was passed by the Legislative Assembly at its meeting held on the 19th September 1924.



## RESOLUTION *RE* APPOINTMENT OF A COMPETENT INDIAN TO THE RAILWAY BOARD.

THE HONOURABLE SARDAR JOGENDRA SINGH (Punjab : Sikh) : Sir, my motion is:—

“ This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that at least one competent Indian should be appointed to the Railway Board taking into consideration [the wide range of Railway activities.”

With your permission, Sir, I should like to amend my Resolution by adding “ as early as possible ” after the word “ appointed ”.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : Is there any objection on the part of the Government to this alteration ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. L. CORBETT (Commerce Secretary) : No, Sir.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : Then the Honourable Member should move his Resolution in the amended form.

THE HONOURABLE SARDAR JOGENDRA SINGH : The amended Resolution will run as follows :

“ This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that at least one competent Indian should be appointed *as early as possible* to the Railway Board taking into consideration the wide range of Railway activities ”

I may begin by saying, Sir, that the moving of this Resolution has not been inspired by any mistrust of the Railway Board or its management. We have the fullest possible confidence in the Commerce Member who is in charge of the Railway Department, which is carrying on one of the largest undertakings in the world. The Railway Board has managed our railways very efficiently—in fact, as efficiently as is possible—and I hope it will continue to do so in the future. My reasons for moving this Resolution are quite different. We, Sir, are conscious of the change that is now taking place in the Government of India. With the rapid development of the self-governing institutions and the gathering of the power in the hands of the Legislatures, there is a greater need of strengthening control and making the authorities materially and morally strong. I agree with the Honourable Sir Alexander Muddiman in his remark that the real issue is not that of a few appointments out here but there are larger issues which are involved. And I feel, Sir, that the larger association of Indians with the Railways will lead to the strengthening of the railway management. For instance, if from the Government side a new suggestion is made in the interests of the railway management in the two Houses, it very often happens that public opinion, not being fully informed, becomes suspicious of the proposals made by the Government. But if we have an Indian fully associated with the management of the Railways, there will be no suspicion of any proposals which the Government of India may make for the efficient running of this great department. Another reason, Sir, is that in the process of reconstruction that is now at work, there is a risk of a break-down unless a large body of politicians come to grips with the real problems of administration. An attitude of drift and criticism without any constructive ideas is likely to disturb that atmosphere of discipline which all Governments must maintain. There is,

[Sardar Jogendra Singh.]

therefore, Sir, a greater need of harmony between the Legislatures and the Services. This need cannot be too greatly emphasised. The presence of an Indian on the Railway Board will bring that harmony of relations between the Services, which are responsible for the carrying on of the railway administration and the Legislatures, which is absolutely essential if the work is to progress harmoniously. I feel, Sir, that what we need most in these Councils is a better informed opinion and the Councils will be greatly strengthened when responsible men like our friends over there come and sit on the non-official Benches knowing the inner working of the Administration and ready to arrive at right conclusions. In the matter of Railways, there is a great need for Indian opinion being properly informed. In the interests of the country it is essential that an Indian ought to be in touch with the working of this big department, so that his presence in our Councils may be helpful in carrying out the administration on right lines. For instance, Mr. Hindley, the Chief Commissioner of Railways, is now being tied down for months in Simla and for months in Delhi, whereas he ought to be free to go about and see to the efficient working of the railways. If an Indian were to be appointed to the Railway Board, he will be able to do Mr. Hindley's work at the headquarters and Mr. Hindley will then become free to go about and make the railways more efficient. Then, again, Sir, the railways are great customers and the development of railway industries can be of great service to India. Here, also, an Indian would be of very great help in accelerating the development of railway industries. I, for one, have no fear, Sir, that the development of Indian industries will ever run counter to English interests. In fact, if India grows richer, her trade with England will grow larger. I am frightened of practical men. They hold short views, so do the capitalists. What one needs is a broader view, the view that is based on the faith that in the unity of India and England lies the prosperity of the two countries, and that a prosperous India also means a prosperous England and a poor India certainly governs the wage in England. That is why I am of the opinion that an Indian Member of the Railway Board, who will be able to promote Indian industries, will be indirectly helping English trade, which is very essential for the prosperity of both the countries. Under these conditions, Sir, I hope the House will support me in this Resolution asking for the appointment of an Indian on the Railway Board. I shall conclude my speech by saying to my English friends do not be despondent but with faith work for the realisation of self-government for India, promote the spirit of partnership and free association of India and England and maintain the aristocratic principles of greater humour, greater kindness and greater humility; and, believe me, India will respond with greater affection, greater faith and greater friendship.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. L. CORBETT (Commerce Secretary): Sir, with your permission I will state at once the position of the Government in this matter. The Honourable Mover of this Resolution, both to-day and on other occasions in this House has emphasised—and if I may say so, he has rightly emphasised—the business aspect of railway administration. The Indian Railways are one of the greatest commercial undertakings in the world. There are 38,000 miles of line, and the capital at charge is no less than 571 crores for the commercial lines and 101 crores for the strategic lines. Last week, as Honourable Members are aware, it was agreed in another place

to put the finance of this great undertaking on a business footing by separating the railway budget from the general budget. The basis of this arrangement is that the commercial lines are required to make a standardised profit over and above the interest charges on capital. At the same time, it is essential for the trade of the country and for the travelling public that the rates imposed should be as low as possible. We must not abuse our position as monopolists, for political or for any other reasons.

Railway finance, then, has been put upon a business footing. We have got to make a standard profit. At the same time, we have got to keep rates and fares as low as possible. It follows that railway management must be on a business footing too. And I hope that the House will treat this Resolution as a business matter.

Let us first consider how this great commercial undertaking is directed and controlled. The Directors are the Government of India. The Railway Board are the technical managers. The Government of India settle the policy, the Railway Board carry it out. I am not quite sure that the Honourable Member has correctly conceived the functions of his Indian Member of the Railway Board. It seems to me that the officer he described would rather be the Railway Member of the Government of India.

Now let us consider this question of Indianisation. Let us see what this policy is, and how it has been carried out. The policy of the Government of India is to Indianise the railway services. I believe that this policy has the approval of this Council, and there can be no doubt, to my mind, that it is the right policy. I am not now concerned with political considerations. But from the business point of view, it is unsound that we should depend too much on overseas recruitment.

And what steps are we taking to give effect to this policy? In the first place, we have accepted the recommendations of the Lee Commission's Report, that recruitment should be 75 per cent. Indians and 25 per cent. Europeans. In practice, we have already in some branches actually exceeded this percentage of Indians. I have the figures here. I think this Council is chiefly interested in the recruitment of gazetted officers, that is, the superior establishment. Taking the Traffic and Engineering branches together, 47 appointments have been made on the State Railways during the last three years. Of these only 9 were Europeans, and 38 or 81 per cent. were statutory natives of India.

This Resolution, however, recommends the appointment of an Indian to the Railway Board. Now, Sir, as I have shown, our policy and our practice are to Indianise the railway system as a whole. But we cannot undertake to Indianise any particular post within any particular time. This is a business concern, and we must employ each man on the work for which he is best suited. In particular, as I have said, the Railway Board are our technical managers. The Board is a very small body for the management of a great railway system. It consists of only four men. It is essential that each of these four should be the best man we can get for the job. The time will come, I am sure, when the best man we can get for the job will be an Indian. But it will not be at once. It must take time before there are Indians of the requisite standing

[Mr. G. L. Corbett.]

and experience in the Railway Department for appointment to the Railway Board. I feel sure that this Council will agree that the technical managers of this vast undertaking should be chosen for their technical qualifications, and not for any extraneous consideration.

Last Saturday, a Resolution was moved in another place in the following terms :

“That Indians should be appointed as Members of the Railway Board as early as possible.”

This Resolution was not opposed by Government. The Resolution, as now amended by the Honourable Mover, is substantially the same, and it is not opposed by Government.

THE HONOURABLE COLONEL NAWAB SIR UMAR HAYAT KHAN (West Punjab : Muhammadan) : Sir, the reason why, a little while ago, I got up in a hurry was that I was thinking the Government will probably accept the Resolution and I would not get a chance of supporting it. More or less the same thing has happened, so that there is no need for bringing forward the arguments in favour of it. At the same time I will say this that there has been a general feeling amongst Indians that railway appointments went more or less either to Europeans or to Christians ; and they also went further in thinking that only those appointments, for which they could not get men from the communities I have spoken of before, were given to Indians. There are lots of people who have given up their head-dress, such as pleaders and others, and when we ask them “ Why have you done it,” they say “ When we go on the railway and travel, the English hat helps a great deal.”

We have all heard of this last accident and people think if there are Indians on the Board they will look after the third class passengers more, and instead of putting carriages after the engine, they may see that there are some wagons between.

Another thing is that we have been having a great deal of trouble with our B. A.'s and M. A.'s, because they are so numerous and the openings in Government service are so few, that we now practically prepare them for becoming volunteers for non-co-operation ; so if we can Indianise, as the Government Member has kindly said, to the extent of 75 per cent., we will be able to give appointments to all these, and when they settle down we will have great relief.

I will not say anything further except to support the Resolution.

THE HONOURABLE MR. J. W. A. BELL (Bengal Chamber of Commerce) : Sir, the proposals that are made in this House by my Honourable friend, the Honourable Sardar Jogendra Singh, are usually so reasonable that I am often persuaded to vote for them, and when he does not so persuade me, he very nearly does.

On this occasion had my Honourable friend not altered his Resolution I should have been unable to support him, because I think his original Resolution was put forward under a misapprehension. The weakness of it was referred to by my Honourable friend, Mr. Corbett. My Honourable friend,

Sardar Jogendra Singh, has apparently confused the functions of the Railway Board with the functions of a Railway Advisory Committee. If the problems which are dealt with by the Railway Board had been merely business problems for which ordinary business experience only was necessary, there would have been a good deal to say even for my Honourable friend's original Resolution. But the matters which are dealt with by the Railway Board are of a highly technical nature. There are problems of civil engineering, problems of mechanical engineering, problems of electrical engineering, problems with regard to the control of traffic and many other matters which can only be dealt with efficiently by men who have spent their whole working lives in railway administration. While, therefore, I am in sympathy with the Resolution as amended, and which has been accepted by Government, and while there is every probability that in the future there will be Indians available to occupy positions on the Railway Board, I would warn my Honourable friend that it is not likely that this will happen for some years, and I would suggest that he should exercise patience, and refrain from embarrassing Government by too frequently bringing up Resolutions reminding them of this Resolution and asking what has been done. If he will only have patience, I have no doubt, that in the course of years, but it will be a good many years, there will be Indians available of sufficient experience to deal with the highly technical matters which are dealt with by the Railway Board.

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. A. NATESAN (Madras : Nominated Non-Official) : Sir, I should like to convey the thanks of myself and of those who think with me to the Honourable Sardar Jogendra Singh for having brought up this matter for discussion here, and to the Member of Government for having accepted it. I wish the first part of the speech of the Honourable Member was not delivered at all, having regard to the excellent progress and the splendid service which the association of Indians in other departments of Government, equally important, equally serious, and many of them requiring a considerable amount of practical and technical knowledge, has resulted in. I can assure the Honourable Mr. Bell that Members here are acquainted with the distinction between the functions of the Railway Board and the Railway Advisory Committee. I have some knowledge of the functions of the Railway Advisory Committee as I happen to be a representative of the South Indian Chamber of Commerce, Madras, on the Railway Advisory Committee of the Madras and Southern Mahratta Railway. I quite realise that the functions of the Members of the Railway Board are of a very technical character, but I do not think they are of such a character that you cannot find competent Indians, (at least one or two are in my mind, but I will not drag their names in here for obvious reasons) ; but I do think the work can be done by them very satisfactorily. I would ask my Honourable friends, who are somewhat pessimistic in this matter, to remember that this was the kind of objection that was advanced years ago against admitting even one Indian into the Executive Council of the Viceroy. It was the same kind of objection that was repeated from time to time when it was suggested that some Indians should be associated with the Executive Councils of the Local Governments. I would like to remind the Honourable Mr. Corbett and the Honourable Mr. Bill that, as a matter of fact, some of these technical subjects are now in charge of Ministers in the Provinces. Engineering and some of these subjects are in charge of

[Mr. G. A. Natesan.]

Ministers, and public acknowledgment has been made by the Governors of Provinces, particularly at the time when some of these Ministers have laid down their offices, upon the very efficient and very satisfactory and honourable manner in which they have discharged their duties. I would ask my Honourable friend Mr. Bell, and my friend Mr. Corbett also, who in the first part of his speech expressed some doubt about the matter, to pay a visit to Mysore. I have had the privilege of visiting Mysore on more than one occasion. On one occasion I stayed there for more than six weeks, and I was very much struck by the excellent manner in which the Mysore Government Railways have been constructed and the way in which they are being run. My Honourable friend Mr. Bell said the requirements of a Member of the Railway Board involved a knowledge of mechanical engineering, civil engineering, electrical engineering, traffic and transport. I believe in Mysore Indians have successfully shown in their small sphere that they can manage and tackle these problems, and there is absolutely no danger in associating Indians in the Railway Board, because, after all, if they are likely to take wrong views and make mistakes, there are other Members of the Board whose experience can be placed at their disposal, so that no disaster may happen. I do hope that Government, having said they will accept this proposition, will give effect to it at the earliest opportunity and appoint an Indian and thereby satisfy the aspirations of Indians, who, like most of us think that, after all, despite occasional lapses, the intentions of the Government of India are good, and that they are anxious to advance the cause of self-government. They will make our path easy, if an appointment of this description is made at the earliest opportunity.

THE HONOURABLE MAULVI ABDUL KARIM (East Bengal : Muhammadan) : I am exceedingly glad that Government has accepted this Resolution. The Railway Board has the largest number of employees in any of the departments of the Government of India. I believe no other department requires so many hands to carry on the work. On the 31st of March 1923 there were 750,000 railway servants in India. I am sorry to have to say that for a long time the superior railway service was closed to the Indians. I am glad, however, to have been told by the Honourable Member who has replied to Sardar Jogendra Singh, that of late Indianisation has been going on satisfactorily. There are about 2,000 officers in the superior ranks, and of these only a few are Indians. There is hardly any Indian, I think there is no Indian, holding any responsible post in the railway service, such as Agent, Chief Engineer, Loco. Superintendent, Chief Controller of Stores, or Traffic Manager in any of the Indian railways. Even in the subordinate railway service, the number of Indians is very small. Most of these posts are monopolised by Anglo-Indians, who now-a-days call themselves pure Indians.

The railways being the property of Indian tax-payers, it is but natural that Indians should desire, nay demand, that these should be worked in the interests of Indians. But I am afraid this has not been the case. It has been said by the Honourable Mr. Bell that Indians cannot expect in the near future to get into the Railway Board because they will have to gain the requisite technical knowledge. As far as I see, the work of the Railway Board is broadly divided into four parts : (1) commercial and traffic, (2) financial, (3) engineering,

and (4) administrative. I think there are Indians who can do each of these works as well as it is being done now. For example, Mr. S. C. Ghose was the first Indian Assistant Traffic Superintendent of the East Indian Railway and rose from Rs. 200 to Rs. 800. When he resigned this post, he joined the Khetra Mohan Company and constructed the Jessore-Jhenidah Railway, of which he was Manager. On severing his connection with the Khetra Mohan Company, he joined the McLeod Company and constructed the Burdwan-Katwa, Bankura Light and some other lines, and was appointed Manager of these lines on a salary of Rs. 2,000 a month. He then came to the Railway Board as a special officer on Rs. 1,500 and rose to Rs. 3,000. He left the Railway Board on the completion of the special work. He is an expert in rates, on which he wrote a book which was highly appreciated by all the railway officials. I think he is well qualified to be a member of the Railway Board. Another function of the Board is financial. There is Mr. Hydari, who was Accountant General of Bombay and is now the Financial Minister of Hyderabad. I think he is quite competent to take charge of the financial work of the Board. As for the Engineering Department, there is Rai Bahadur Ralla Ram, who was the Chief Engineer of the Eastern Bengal Railway on Rs. 2,500. I have no doubt he would have been the Agent of that Railway if he had not been an Indian. He is now the Manager of the Patiala State Railways. I think he is quite competent to do the engineering work of the Railway Board. There is another gentleman, Mr. Ali Akbar, who is a very experienced engineer. He was the Superintending Engineer and Secretary to the Government of Bombay. I think he also is competent to take charge of the engineering work of the Railway Board. As for the administrative department, Sir Ibrahim Rahimtulla, the President of the Fiscal Commission and Sir Purshotamdas, I think, are quite competent to take charge of the administrative work of the Railway Board. I hope and trust that one of these men or some other competent man will be appointed a Member of the Railway Board in the near future. I need scarcely say that, unless and until a competent native of India is appointed a Member of the Railway Board, the interests of Indians will not be properly looked after.

**THE HONOURABLE SARDAR JOGENDRA SINGH :** The Resolution has been very well received by the Government and the support that I have received from the other Members of the House, including Mr. Bell, is most gratifying. It shows that any business proposal made in this House is considered on its own merits and may we long continue this tradition. The Railway Department, as has been pointed out, is a business concern and it should not be allowed to be considered in any other light than that of pure business. If I may say so, Sir, without violating any sense of modesty, I did not confuse the functions of the Railway Board with the Advisory Committee. I quite realise that the Board in itself is a body of technical experts. At the same time, I feel, as in private companies, you have technical experts, but you have always men with large views of business associated with the technical men, so that the combination of these two forces leads to good and efficient business. I do not see why in the Railway Board we should not have the larger view of the ordinary business man who may not understand the technical side but who knows what business is. That is an important point. Then, again, the Honourable Mr. Corbett laid great stress on the Indianisation

[Sardar Jogendra Singh.]

which is in progress. Personally, Sir, I do not attach an undue importance to this matter. I am more anxious that the directorate should be more Indo-Anglian than it is at present; and personally I was going to say on the Lee Report that we want British officials more in the districts than at the headquarters. Similarly I suppose we want British officers in charge of railway districts. I am not particularly interested one way or the other, as long as the administration of the districts and the railways is made efficient, whether it is run by English or Indian officials. I hold to the ideal of a British Indian Empire, united and solid. I hold to the ideal that this is the only thing to work for, without any regard for race or creed. There is some truth in what Mr. Bell said, regarding the functions of the Indian Member. If I may, with your permission, draw attention to the Acworth Committee's report, the Acworth Committee clearly recommended the appointment of a Member in charge of the Railways and the sooner that recommendation is given effect to the better. You need an Indian Member in charge of the Railways, which is a very big department, and which certainly needs representation on the Government of India. I need not lay more stress on this point as this has been clearly set forth by the Acworth Committee. I do not think, Sir, it would be wise to delay the appointment of an Indian to the Railway Board. I do not want to reduce the number of members on the Railway Board. Perhaps an additional member may be sanctioned, and I can say without any hesitation that the appointment of an additional member will not burden the finances of the Railways to such an extent as to reduce it to bankruptcy. For instance, Agriculture is a purely technical department, and yet it has been found that very often the man in charge of the Agricultural Department is not a technical expert and the experts have welcomed the appointment of a non-technical expert at the head of the Agricultural Department. I am sure the Railways too will find that a man of business brings a broader view and strength to the Railway Board. One thing needful in the changing times which both Indians and Britishers should keep in view is this that we have been brought together to learn to live together, and in spite of many contentions we should not lose our faith but continue the good work in full belief that our faith will be justified in the long event.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: Does the Honourable Mr. Corbett wish to reply?

THE HONOURABLE MR. G. L. CORBETT: No, Sir.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: The question is:

"This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that at least one competent Indian should be appointed as early as possible to the Railway Board taking into consideration the wide range of Railway activities."

The motion was adopted.

---

### STATEMENT OF BUSINESS.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: The Honourable the Leader of the House, I understand, wishes to make a statement about the course of business.



THE HONOURABLE DR. MIAN SIR MUHAMMAD SHAFI (Law Member): Sir, before you decide the date of the next meeting, I may mention that in accordance with the suggestion made on Friday last, copies of the Land Customs Bill, as passed by the Legislative Assembly, were circulated to Members on Friday evening. The consideration and passing of that Bill is the only further business which Government propose to place before this Council during the present Session.

THE HONOURABLE MR. LALUBHAI SAMALDAS (Bombay: Non-Muhammadan): Do I understand, Sir, that the Provident Funds Bill is not to be taken into consideration this Session?

THE HONOURABLE DR. MIAN MUHAMMAD SHAFI: Sir, with regard to the inquiry made by my Honourable friend, I have to inform the House that it is not the intention of Government to proceed further with the next stage of the Bill in this Session. That has been necessitated by certain amendments made in another place in the Bill, which require examination.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: I should like to ascertain the feelings of the Council as to when the Land Customs Bill should be taken up. Under the rules it should not be taken before Thursday next. But there is a power vested in the President to dispense with this notice. If it is the wish of the House, I am prepared to take up this Bill to-morrow.

THE HONOURABLE DR. SIR DEVA PRASAD SARVADHIKARY (West Bengal: Non-Muhammadan): It may be taken up to-morrow.

THE HONOURABLE COLONEL NAWAB SIR UMAR HAYAT KHAN (West Punjab: Muhammadan): I think we have already seen the Bill and it has been circulated to the Honourable Members. So, if it comes up to-morrow, I do not think we will be able to say that we have not seen the Bill.

THE HONOURABLE MR. MUHAMMAD YAMIN KHAN (United Provinces West: Muhammadan): I think, Sir, it will be more convenient if this Bill is taken up on Wednesday as some Honourable Members may like to send in amendments. Although the Bill was circulated on the evening of Friday, it did not reach some Honourable Members till Saturday morning. So the only intervening day was Sunday, when everybody wants to take some rest and does not like the idea of going through the legislative business, especially when he has been busy for the whole week. So this is the first day when the Bill has come to the notice of many Honourable Members. In order to enable us to go thoroughly into the Bill, I think it will be better if we take it up on Wednesday.

(SEVERAL HONOURABLE MEMBERS: The Bill had better be taken up to-morrow).

THE HONOURABLE SIR ARTHUR FROOM (Bombay Chamber of Commerce): Sir, I understand that amendments will be received at short notice in connection with this Bill. I therefore support the proposal that the Bill be taken up to-morrow.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT: Before I come to a decision, I should like to know from the Government Member whether an objection will be taken on account of lack of notice if an amendment is handed in this afternoon or to-morrow morning?

THE HONOURABLE MR. A. C. MCWATTERS (Finance Secretary) : I should like to have time to consider the amendments. If they are handed in this afternoon, no objection whatsoever will be raised on the part of the Government. But if they are handed in to-morrow morning, it might be somewhat embarrassing.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT (to the Honourable Mr. Muhammad Yamin Khan) : Does the Honourable Member propose to hand in any amendments ?

THE HONOURABLE MR. MUHAMMAD YAMIN KHAN : After going through the Bill I shall be in a position to say whether I will send in any amendment. But I do not want to inconvenience other Honourable Members and for that reason I will not press that the Bill be taken up on Wednesday.

THE HONOURABLE THE PRESIDENT : In that case I direct that the Bill be taken up at to-morrow's sitting. Honourable Members who are desirous of sending in amendments should do so during the course of to-day. If a copy is sent to the department, as well as to the Secretary of the Council, so much the better.

The Council then adjourned till Eleven of the Clock on Tuesday, the 23rd September, 1924.

---