

**COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE
(2017-2018)**

SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA

TWENTY FIRST REPORT

(Presented on 02 August, 2018)



सत्यमेव जयते

**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI
August, 2018/Shravana, 1940(Saka)**

C O N T E N T S

PAGE

COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE (2017-2018)		(iii)
INTRODUCTION		(v)
<u>REPORT</u>		
Delay in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences, New Delhi		01
ANNEXURES		
Annexure-I	Statement showing the dates of laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences, New Delhi for the years 2014-2015 to 2016-2017	07
Annexure-II	The chronological sequence in respect of finalization of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences, New Delhi for the years 2014-2015 to 2016-2017	08
APPENDICES		
Appendix-I	Extracts of the Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 21 December, 2017	10
Appendix-II	Extracts of the Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 05 July, 2018	12

COMPOSITION OF COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE
(2017-2018)

Shri Chandrakant Khaire

—

Chairperson

MEMBERS

2. Shri Dushyant Chautala
3. Shrimati Veena Devi
4. Shri P.C. Gaddigoudar
5. Shri Laxman Giluwa
6. Shri Choudhury Mohan Jatua
7. Shrimati Mausam Noor
8. Shri Bheemrao B. Patil
9. Shri Sanjaykaka Ramchandra Patil
10. Shri Bishnupada Ray
11. Shri Uday Pratap Singh
12. Shri Virendra Singh
13. Shri P.R. Sundaram
14. Shri Manohar Untwal
15. Vacant*

SECRETARIAT

1. Dr. Preeti Srivastava - Joint Secretary
2. Smt. Rita Jailkhani - Director
3. Smt. Maya Lingi - Additional Director
4. Shri K. P. Kashyap - Executive Assistant

* Shri Midhun Reddy resigned w.e.f. 20.06.2018

INTRODUCTION

I, Chairperson of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table of the House (2017-18), having been authorized by the Committee to present this Report on their behalf, present this Twenty First Report in respect of delay in laying of the Annual Reports together with Audited Accounts of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences, New Delhi

2. In terms of the recommendation of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table contained in its First Report (5th Lok Sabha) presented to the House on 08.03.1976, an Organization which receives Grants-in-aid from the Government of India is required to lay its Annual Report and Audited Accounts within nine months of the closure of Accounting Year.

3. The Committee considered the matter of delays in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences, New Delhi and took oral evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (Department of Health and Family Welfare) at their sitting held on 21 December, 2017.

4. The Committee considered and adopted this Report at their sitting held on 05 July, 2018.

5. The Committee wish to express their thanks to the officers of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (Department of Health and Family Welfare) for furnishing the written replies, other material/information and for placing their views in the matter before the Committee.

6. The Observations / Recommendations of the Committee have been printed in bold letters at the end of the Report.

New Delhi
July, 2018
Shravana, 1940 (Saka)

Chandrakant B. Khair
Chairperson
Committee on Papers Laid on the Table

REPORT

Delay in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences (AIIMS), New Delhi

* * *

The All India Institute of Medical Sciences (AIIMS) was established in 1956 as an Institution of National Importance by an Act of Parliament. The objectives of the Institute are to develop patterns of teaching in undergraduate and postgraduate medical education in all its branches so as to demonstrate a high standard of medical education to all medical colleges and other allied institutions in India. Further to bring together in one place educational facilities of the highest order for the training of personnel in all important branches of health activity and also to attain self-sufficiency in post graduate medical education. The Institute provide for undergraduate and postgraduate teaching in the science of modern medicine and other allied sciences, including physical and biological sciences and also to provide facilities for research in the various branches of such Sciences.

2. The Committee have been informed that as per All India Institute of Medical Sciences Rules 1958 (GSR 135) which reads as under :

Rule 10. Annual Statement of Accounts: The annual statement of accounts including the balance sheet of Institute shall be in such form as may be laid down by the Government. The statement pertaining to each year ending with 31st March together with the audit report thereon shall be forwarded annually to the Government together with such number of spare copies thereof as may be required by the Government from time to time but not later than 31st December following.

and under :

Rule 11. Annual Report: The annual report referred to in Section 19 of AIIMS Act 1956 shall relate to the year ending with 31st March of each year and be submitted to the Government together with 50 spare copies thereof, not later than the 31st August following.

3. As per Rule 237 (i) to (iii) of General Financial Rules (GFR), 2017 Government of India, the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Autonomous organizations are required to be laid on the Table of the House.

4. As per the recommendation of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table contained in its First Report (Paras 1.16 and 3.5), and Second Reports (Paras 4.16 and 4.18) of 5th Lok Sabha and Second Report (Paras 3.6 to 3.8) of 6th Lok Sabha presented to the House on 08.03.1976, 12.05.1976 and 22.12.1977 respectively, the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts together alongwith Review Statement of the Institutes are required to be laid within 09 months of the close of the respective Accounting Year. To comply with this requirement proper time schedule should be laid down for compilation of Annual Reports and Accounts and their auditing. The Committee felt that normally a period of 3 months would be sufficient for compilation of accounts and their submission to audit; the next 6 months might be given for auditing of accounts; printing of the Report and sending it to Government for laying. If for any reason, the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Institute could not be laid within the prescribed period of 9 months, the Ministry concerned should lay a Statement within 30 days of the expiry of the said period or as soon as the House meets whichever is later, explaining the reasons as to why the documents could not be laid in time.

5. The scrutiny by the Parliamentary Committee on Papers Laid on the Table reveals that the Annual Reports along with Annual Accounts and the Audit Report for the years from 2014-15 and 2015-16 of the AIIMS were laid on the Table of the House with delays ranging from 07 months and 07½ months respectively. The dates of laying and extent of delay, in laying of the Annual Reports/Audited Accounts of the AIIMS have been given at Annexure-I.

6. The Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (Department of Health and Family Welfare) has laid a Statement along-with Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the AIIMS for the years 2014-15 and 2015-16 on 22.07.2016 and 11.08.2017 respectively. Hon'ble Minister of State for Health and Family Welfare submitted the reasons for delay in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts for the years 2014-15 and 2015-16 on the Table of the House.

7. The chronological sequence of different activities for finalization of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the AIIMS for the years 2014-15 and 2015-16 as furnished by the AIIMS has been given at Annexure-II.

8. On being asked by the Committee about the reasons for delays in laying the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of AIIMS, the AIIMS in its written note submitted as under:-

"AIIMS New Delhi in 2014-15 there were 55 departments and Centers and 640 faculty members which increased to 718 faculty members in 2015-16 and the information for annual reports was voluminous."

They also submitted regarding reasons for delay :

"Some delay in the receipt of Contents of Annual Report from Departments. Huge amount of time taken in Translation of Contents of Annual Report from English to Hindi.

Tendering Process/ Lack of Technical experience of Printing Agency (L1) as medical terminology is more technical.

Time taken in verification/ Editorial correction of contents of Annual Report because of highly technical words.

Time taken by Printer in Typesetting and Final Printing.

Since as per practice both Annual Report and Audited Statement of Accounts are to be submitted as one document, the final processing of printing and content verification, typesetting, proof reading of such a voluminous material/ documents takes time."

9. As regards to persistent delays in laying the documents indicate that due importance was not given to timely laying of the papers before Parliament and the things were taken in casual manner, the Ministry submitted in its written note that they accept that there was delay in laying the documents before the Parliament due to some reasons. They also submitted that due importance is given to timely submission of the Annual Report for laying the same before Parliament. They further stated that the things are taken seriously and all possible efforts are made to submit the Report before Parliament in time.

10. As regard to identification of the stages at which the delays have occurred during all these years and also as to how the Institute propose to curtail delays in future, the Ministry/AIIMS in its written note submitted as under:-

"the Ministry has identified the stages at which delays have occurred during the last three years. They indentified some reasons for delay as under :

1. Some delay in the receipt of Contents of Annual Report from Departments.

2. Huge amount of time taken in Translation of Contents of Annual Report from English to Hindi.

3. *Tendering Process/ Lack of Technical experience of Printing Agency (L1) as medical terminology is more technical*
4. *Time taken in verification/Editorial Correction of Contents of Annual Report because of highly technical words.*
5. *Time taken by Printer in Typesetting and Final Printing.*

It is proposed that

1. *Circular inviting contents for annual report shall be issued to Departments in January every year.*
2. *Contents of Annual Report shall be invited from Department alongwith (Annual Performance Appraisal Report (APAR) of faculty by 15 April Every year. No Extension shall be given except in highly exceptional circumstances but not more than 7 days.*
3. *Editorial verification of contents shall be done by 15th May before Vacation.*
4. *In case the contents are not received within stipulated time period from the department*
 - a) *APAR of faculty may not be accepted*
 - b) *Funds of the department shall not be released*
 - c) *Vacation of the faculty may be withdrawn*

Translation work shall be completed within one month. By 30 June. Draft Printing of Annual report by 15th Aug. Circulation to Institute Body member and inviting suggestions by 30th Aug. Final submission of Annual Report by 30 September. Audited Statement of Account submission separately by 31 Dec.

As far as AIIMS is concerned, there is no delay noticed upto the stage of certification of Annual Accounts from Audit Authorities (office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India)."

11. *As regards, delay at the stages of translation of the documents into Hindi and subsequent printing thereof, the Ministry in its written note stated as under:-*

"the translation of contents of Annual report to Hindi starts as soon as English version is complete. It takes on an average Minimum 60 working days and subsequent to that final typesetting editorial corrections and final printing takes about 60 working days.

To overcome the problems, the Institute proposes to hire more efficient translation agencies to carry out the work of translation within one month"

12. About the status of computerization of Accounts to facilitate speedy and timely compilation of Accounts, the Ministry in its written replies submitted as under:-

" the complication of annual accounts are partially computerised and efforts are being made to implement ERP to fully computerisation of all activities of the Institute including accounts. However accounts of the Institute are compiled before the due date."

13. When the Committee desired to know about the mechanism in place in the Ministry to monitor the progress of work so as to ensure timely laying of the documents, the Ministry in its written note stated as under :-

"The Institute is regularly followed up for adherence of timelines prescribed for laying of the Annual Report and Audited Accounts. The progress report is also being called up for ensuring that the Institute is adhering to the timelines prescribed for timely laying of the Reports."

14. The Committee considered the matter of delays in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of AIIMS, New Delhi for the years 2014-15 and 2015-16 and on the issue took evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (Department of Health and Family Welfare) and AIIMS, New Delhi on 21 December, 2017.

15. Elaborating further the reasons for delay in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the AIIMS, New Delhi, the Secretary of the Ministry during the evidence explained the Committee as under:

"it is responsibility of the Ministry to lay Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of 59 Institutions and autonomous bodies in Parliament. They had already laid papers of 40 Institutions and autonomous bodies for the year 2015-16 before time and now they are ready to present papers of 10 more Institutions. Secretary apologized for the delay in laying of the papers i.e. Annual Report, Audited Accounts, Review and Delay Statements of AIIMS for the last two years. They also assured the Committee that they will present the Report of the current year before the Parliament in the ensuing Budget Session."

Further the Director of AIIMS added that :

"delay occurred due to difficulties related to translation of medical terminologies; problem in editing and delay in printing. They also stated that from 2017 they have outsourced and hired a copy editor, they also assured that they will submit Report of current year in time."

Observations/Recommendations

16. The Committee note that the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of AIIMS for the year 2014-15 and 2015-16 were delayed ranging from the period 7 and 7½ months respectively. The Committee also note that the reasons for delay are mainly due to delay in the receipt of contents of Annual Report from Departments; huge amount of time taken in translation of contents of Annual Report from English to Hindi; delay in tendering process; lack of technical experience of printing agency as medical terminology is more technical; and time taken by Printer in typesetting and final printing; etc. The committee feel that reasons stated for delay are not convincing as all these could have been taken care at the initial stage, had the Institute/Ministry been more meticulous in their planning. The Committee are of view that had the Ministry/AIIMS taken proactive measures, the Report could have been laid on the Table of the House within the stipulated time period.

17. The Committee also note that from the year 2017 Institute have out sourced and hired a copy editor. The Ministry had assured to lay Report of current year in time. The Committee urged upon the AIIMS, New Delhi and the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (Department of Health and Family Welfare) to monitor and to give due priority to timely laying of the documents. The Committee may be apprised of the outcome.

18. The Committee also recommend that if, for any reason the Annual Report and Audited Accounts of the Institute could not be laid on the Table of the House within Nine months after the closure of respective accounting year, the Ministry concerned should lay within 30 days of the expiry of the prescribed period or as soon as the House Meets, whichever is later, a statement explaining the reasons as to why the Report and Accounts could not be laid within the stipulated period.

New Delhi
July , 2018
Shravana, 1940 (Saka)

Chandrakant Khaire
Chairperson
Committee on Papers Laid On the Table

Annexure-I
vide para 05 of the Report

**Statement showing the dates of laying of the Annual Reports and
Audited Accounts of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences, New Delhi.**

Year	Date of laying of Annual Report and Audited Accounts	Extent of delay
2014-15	22.07.2016	07 months
2015-16	11.08.2017	7½ months
2016-17	16.03.2018	2½ months

Annexure-II
vide para 07 of the Report

**The chronological sequence in respect of finalization of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences, New Delhi.
for the years 2014-15, 2015-16 and 2016-17**

S. No	Questions	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17
a.	The date on which auditors were appointed for auditing the Accounts; Time taken in Appointment after closure of F/Y	30th June 03 months	30th June 03 months	30th June 03 months
b.	The date of compilation of Annual Accounts of Institute; Time Taken after appointment of auditors	30th June	30th June	30th June
c.	The date on which the Annual Accounts were submitted to Auditors for auditing; Time taken after appointment of auditors	29.06.2015	30.06.2016	01.07.2017
d.	The date and duration for auditing the Annual Accounts of Institute by Auditors;	39 days	46 days	45 days
e.	The date of queries raised by Auditors during auditing of Annual Accounts;	Normally annual audit of certification of accounts started in July of respective year and concluded in early September of the respective year. The Auditors raised queries during the conduction of annual audit are replied on day to day basis.		
f.	The date on which the replies to the audit queries was furnished to the Auditors;	The Auditors raised queries during the conduction of annual audit are replied on day to day basis.		
g.	The date on which draft Audit Report was issued by Audit Authorities;	01.10.2015	26.09.2016	17.10.2017
h.	The date on which the final Audit Report received by Institute; Time taken after receipt of Annual Accounts	04.11.2015	15.11.2016	29.11.2017
i.	The date of finalization of Annual Reports;	07.03.2016	30.05.2016	Under Finalization

j.	The date on which documents were got approved in the AGM; Time taken after finalization of Annual Report	30.03.2016*	15.06.2017	Yet to be approved
k.	Dates on which Reports were got printed Time taken in translation and printing of Report after finalization.	For ensuring timely translation, chapter wise information, as and when received from different departments of the Institute, is sent for translation as the Institute consists of more than 50 departments.		
l.	The date on which documents were sent to the Ministry for being laid in House; and	13.06.2016	31.07.2017	Yet to be received in the Ministry
m.	The date of laying of the documents on the Table of the House Time taken by the Ministry after receipt of the Annual Report and Audited Account	22.07.2016-LS 26.07.2016-RS	11.08.2017-LS 08.08.2017- RS	NA NA

**THE EXTRACTS OF THE MINUTES OF THE 4th SITTING OF THE
COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE (2017-2018)**

The Committee sat on Thursday, 21 December, 2017 from 15:00 hrs to 16:00 hrs. in Committee Room No. 03, Parliament House Annexe Extension, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Shri Chandrakant Khaire - Chairperson

MEMBERS

2. Shri P.C. Gaddigoudar
3. Shri Laxman Giluwa
4. Shri Choudhary Mohan Jatua
5. Shrimati Mausam Noor
6. Shri Bheemrao B. Patil
7. Shri Bishnu Pada Ray
8. Shri Manohar Untwal

SECRETARIAT

1. Dr. Preeti Srivastava - Joint Secretary
2. Smt. Rita Jailkhani - Director

**REPRESENTATIVES OF THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE
(DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE)**

1. Ms. Preeti Sudan - Secretary
2. Shri Arun Singhal - Joint Secretary

**REPRESENTATIVES OF THE ALL INDIA INSTITUTE OF MEDICAL SCIENCES,
NEW DELHI.**

1. Dr. Randeep Guleria - Director
2. Shri Neeraj Kumar Sharma - Sr. Financial Adviser

At the outset, the Hon'ble Chairperson welcomed the Members to the sitting of the Committee and briefly apprised them about the agenda of the sitting i.e. to consider draft Report regarding delay in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Indian Institute of Forest Management, Bhopal and to take oral evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (Department of Health and Family Welfare) - in connection with delay in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the AIIMS, New Delhi.

2. XX XX XX

3. XX XX XX

4. XX XX XX

5. The Committee then called the representatives of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (Department of Health and Family Welfare) and All India Institute of Medical Sciences(AIIMS), New Delhi.

6. The Chairperson welcomed the representatives of the Ministry and the AIIMS as mentioned above to the sitting of the Committee and explained the purpose of convening the meeting. The Chairperson also explained to the witnesses the provisions of Direction 58 of Directions issued by the Speaker, Lok Sabha regarding confidentiality of the proceedings.

7. The Secretary submitted before the Committee that it is responsibility of the Ministry to lay Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of 59 Institutions and autonomous bodies in Parliament. They had already laid papers of 40 Institutions and autonomous bodies for the year 2015-16 before time and now they are ready to present papers of 10 more Institutions. Secretary apologized for the delay in laying of the papers i.e. Annual Report, Audited Accounts, Review and Delay Statements of AIIMS for the last two years. They also assured the Committee that they will present the Report of the current year before the Parliament in the ensuing Budget Session.

8. Further the Director of AIIMS also stated that delay occurred due to difficulties related to translation of medical terminologies; problem in editing and delay in printing. They also stated that from 2017 they have outsourced and hired a copy editor, they also assured that they will submit Report of current year in time.

9. The Chairperson directed the representatives of the Ministry of AIIMS to complete all the process of laying of the Annual Report and Audited Accounts within stipulated time period in future. Thereafter, the Hon'ble Chairperson thanked the representatives of the Ministry and the AIIMS for useful discussion - in connection with examination of the subject. The Chairperson also directed to the representatives of the Ministry and AIIMS to furnish the information on certain other points desired by the Committee, which was not readily available with them, within two weeks' time to the Secretariat.

10. A copy of the verbatim proceedings of the sitting of the Committee has been kept on record.

The Committee then adjourned.

**EXTRACTS OF THE MINUTES OF THE 9th SITTING OF THE
COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE (2017-2018)**

The Committee sat on Thursday, 05 July, 2018 from 11:00 hrs to 13:05 hrs. in Committee Room 'D', Parliament House Annexe, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Shri Chandrakant Khaire - Chairperson

MEMBERS

2. Shri Dushyant Chautala
3. Shri P.C. Gaddigoudar
4. Shri Laxman Giluwa
5. Shri Manohar Untwal

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri R.C. Tiwari - Joint Secretary
2. Smt. Rita Jailkhani - Director
3. Smt. Maya Lingi - Additional Director

XX XX XX

XX XX XX

2. At the outset, the Hon'ble Chairperson welcomed the Members to the sitting of the Committee.

XX XX XX

XX XX XX

5. Thereafter, the Committee took up for consideration the draft Report regarding delay in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences, New Delhi.

6. After deliberations, the Committee adopted the Report without modifications.
7. The Committee authorized the Hon'ble Chairperson to present the same to the Parliament.

XX XX XX

XX XX XX

The Committee then adjourned.