

**STANDING COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL JUSTICE AND EMPOWERMENT  
(2017 - 18)**

**(SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA)**

**MINISTRY OF TRIBAL AFFAIRS**

**Action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Fifty-second Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) of the Standing Committee on Social Justice and Empowerment on Demands for Grants (2018-19) of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs**

**FIFTY-NINTH REPORT**



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT  
NEW DELHI**

***August, 2018/ Shravana, 1940 (Saka)***

**FIFTY-NINTH REPORT**

**STANDING COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL JUSTICE AND  
EMPOWERMENT**  
**(2017-18)**

**(SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA)**

**MINISTRY OF TRIBAL AFFAIRS**

**Action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Fifty-second Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) of the Standing Committee on Social Justice and Empowerment on Demands for Grants (2018-19) of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs**

**Presented to Lok Sabha on 09.08.2018**

**Laid in Rajya Sabha on 09.08.2018**



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT  
NEW DELHI**

***August, 2018/ Shravana, 1940 (Saka)***

## CONTENTS

	<b>PAGE</b>
<b>COMPOSITION OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL JUSTICE AND EMPOWERMENT (2017-18)</b>	<b>(iii)</b>
<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>(v)</b>
<b>CHAPTER -I      Report</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>CHAPTER- II      Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government.</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>CHAPTER- III      Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies of the Government.</b>	<b>24</b>
<b>CHAPTER -IV      Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted and which require reiteration.</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>CHAPTER- V      Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government are interim in nature.</b>	<b>28</b>
 <b>ANNEXURE</b>	
<b>*Minutes of the 16th sitting of the Standing Committee on Social Justice and Empowerment held on 7.08.2018.</b>	<b>36</b>
 <b>APPENDIX</b>	
<b>Analysis of the action taken by the Government on the recommendations contained in the Fifty-second Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) of the Standing Committee on Social Justice and Empowerment.</b>	<b>38</b>

**COMPOSITION OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL  
JUSTICE AND EMPOWERMENT (2017-18)**

**SHRI RAMESH BAIS      -      CHAIRPERSON**

**MEMBERS**

**LOK SABHA**

2. Shri Kanti Lal Bhuria
3. Shri Santokh Singh Chaudhary
4. Shri Sher Singh Ghubaya
5. Shri Jhina Hikaka
6. Shri Faggan Singh Kulaste
7. Shri Sadashiv Kisan Lokhande
8. Smt. K. Maragatham
9. Shri Kariya Munda
10. Shri Asaduddin Owaisi
11. Dr. Udit Raj
12. Shri Ch. Malla Reddy
13. Smt. Satabdi Roy
14. Kunwar Bharatendra Singh
15. Prof. Sadhu Singh
16. Smt. Mamata Thakur
17. Shri Mansukhbhai Dhanjibhai Vasava
18. Shri Tej Pratap Singh Yadav
- \*19. Dr. Karan Singh Yadav
20. Vacant
21. Vacant

**RAJYA SABHA**

22. Smt. Jharna Das Baidya
- #23. Shri Abir Ranjan Biswas
24. Shri Chunibhai Kanjibhai Gohel
25. Smt. Sarojini Hembram
26. Dr. Narendra Jadhav
- \*\*27. Smt. Kanta Kardam
28. Smt. Vijila Sathyananth
29. Smt. Wansuk Syiem
30. Smt. Chhaya Verma
31. Shri Ramkumar Verma

---

\* Nominated to the Committee w.e.f. 14.03.2018

\*\* Nominated to the Committee w.e.f. 02.06.2018

# Nominated to the Committee w.e.f. 23.06.2018 in place of Shri Ahamed Hassan.

## **LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT**

- |    |                           |   |                      |
|----|---------------------------|---|----------------------|
| 1. | Shri Ashok Kumar Singh    | - | Additional Secretary |
| 2. | Shri Ashok Sajwan         | - | Director             |
| 3. | Smt. Mamta Kemwal         | - | Additional Director  |
| 4. | Shri Maneesh Mohan Kamble | - | Committee Officer    |

## **INTRODUCTION**

I, the Chairperson, Standing Committee on Social Justice and Empowerment (2017-18) having been authorized by the Committee to submit the Report on their behalf, do present this Fifty-ninth Report on the action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Fifty-second Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) of the Standing Committee on Social Justice and Empowerment on 'Demands for Grants (2018-19)' of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs.

2. The Fifty-second Report was presented to Lok Sabha and laid in Rajya Sabha on 8<sup>th</sup> March, 2018. The Ministry of Tribal Affairs have furnished their replies indicating action taken on the recommendations contained in that Report on 29<sup>th</sup> May, 2018. The Report was considered and adopted by the Standing Committee on Social Justice and Empowerment at their sitting held on 7<sup>th</sup> August, 2018.

3. An analysis of the action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in the Fifty-second Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) of the Standing Committee on Social Justice and Empowerment is given in Appendix.

4. For facility of reference observations/recommendations/comments of the Committee have been printed in thick type in the body of the Report.

**NEW DELHI;**

**7 August, 2018**  
**16 Shravana, 1940 (Saka)**

**RAMESH BAIS**  
**Chairperson,**  
**Standing Committee on**  
**Social Justice and**  
**Empowerment**

## **REPORT**

### **CHAPTER I**

1.1 This Report deals with the action taken by the Government on the observations/recommendations contained in the Fifty-Second Report of the Standing Committee on Social Justice and Empowerment (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) on Demand for Grants (2018-19) of the Ministry of Tribal affairs.

1.2 The Fifty-Second Report was presented to Lok Sabha and laid on the Table of Rajya Sabha on 8th March, 2018. It contained 12 Observations/Recommendations. Replies of Government in respect of all the observations/recommendations have been examined and have been categorized as under:-

- (i) Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government :

**Para Nos. 3.14, 3.15, 4.20, 4.21, 5.11, 6.14 and 6.15**

**(Total : 7, Chapter II)**

- (ii) Observations/Recommendations which the committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies of the Government:

**Para Nos. NIL**

**(Chapter III)**

- (iii) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted and which require reiterations:

**Para Nos. 2.12, 4.19**

**(Total: 2, Chapter IV)**

- (iv) Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government are interim in nature:

**Para Nos. 2.13, 5.12 and 7.7**

**(Total : 3, Chapter V)**

**1.3 The Committee desire that action taken replies on the observations/recommendations contained in chapter-I and final action taken notes in respect of the recommendations contained in chapter-V of this Report may be furnished to them at the earliest and in any case not later than three months of the presentation of this Report.**

1.4 The Committee will now deal with some of the replies received from the Government which need reiteration or merit comments.

**A. Budgetary Provisions and Utilization**

**Recommendation (Para 2.12)**

1.5 The committee noted that the Ministry have utilised 98.30 and 99.90 per cent Budget allocation for the year 2015-16 and 2016-17, The committee commended the Ministry for this. The Budget allocation for 2018-19 had, therefore, been increased to Rs. 5957.18 crore (scheme) from Rs. 5300.14 crore in 2017 -18 as a result thereof. The committee found that funds allocated for the Scheme of support to NSTFDC, Institutional Support for Development and Marketing of tribal Products, National Fellowship and scholarship for higher education of ST students, Tribal Festivals Research, Information and Mass Education, Pre-Matric Scholarship Schemes had been utilized only 50 per cent till 31.12.2017 which was indeed not a happy situation. The Committee noted that lack of training institutes in the field of sports like archery, hockey, swimming, football etc. lead to non-inclusion of tribal sportspersons on the international diasporas and hence meritorious sportspersons from tribal belt have been deprived of the recognition that they are entitled to. The Secretary, Ministry of Tribal Affairs, during



the evidence, admitted that tribal sportspersons were deprived of a facility of training institutes and the Ministry have been planning to built one institute in every district having tribal majority. The Committee while appreciating such move of the Ministry recommended the Ministry to allocate sufficient funds for development of all Sports Institutes equipped with facilities of track and field events as well as indoor sports for the use of tribal sportspersons in every district having 50 per cent majority of tribal population, so that tribal sportspersons of these regions were not bereft of these facilities.

### **Reply of the Government**

1.6 The Ministry of Tribal Affairs in their Action Taken Note have stated as under:-

"There has not been any underutilization of funds under the scheme of Pre-Matric Scholarships as the entire allocation including supplementary grants for the year 2017-18 has been fully utilized under the scheme.

Other issues of this para does not pertain to Scholarships Division".

**1.7 The Committee in their original Report had mentioned the issue of under-utilization of funds of various Schemes including Pre-Matric Scholarship Scheme of the Ministry till 31.12.2017. The Committee find that the Ministry have furnished reply on Pre-Matric Scholarship Scheme only and made no mention about the fund utilisation under other Schemes such as Scheme of support to NSTFDC, Institutional support for Development and marketing of Tribal products, National Fellowship and Scholarship for higher education of ST students, Tribal**

**Festivals Research, Information and Mass Education etc. which the Committee had also commented upon. The Ministry have also not replied regarding funds for development of Sports Institutes for tribal sportspersons in every district having 50 per cent majority of tribal population. The Committee deprecate the reply of the Ministry viz, "Other issue of this para does not pertain to Scholarships Division". The Ministry are obligated to furnish reply on each recommendation of the Committee. The Committee do not accept such callous approach of the Ministry while furnishing replies to a Parliamentary Committee. The Committee, therefore, desire the Ministry to allocate sufficient funds for the Development of Sports Institutes in tribal majority areas besides furnishing replies to other recommendations of the Committee in para No. 1.6.**

#### **Recommendation (Para 2.13)**

1.8 The Committee were constrained to note that National Overseas Scholarship Scheme had not achieved desired results during the 12th Five Year Plan and the number of students going abroad had not been more than 20 in the last five years. The Committee desired to know the reasons for the same. The Committee found that the Ministry had levied very stringent norms in the process of selection of candidates under the Scheme. The Ministry had conceded the fact that various rounds of interviews and selection processes were conducted for the students going abroad which may be one of the reasons. The Committee felt that the interview norms as well as selection procedure needed to be relaxed if more tribal students were to be promoted and given benefit of the Scheme. The Committee also felt that the round of interviews was a very subjective

issue and certainly not a parameter of students calibre. The Committee recommended that a student who has secured admission in the foreign universities should not be strictly judged on the grounds of interviews alone. The Committee also desired that entire selection procedure/norms needed to be revisited and made uncomplicated.

### **Reply of the Government**

1.9 The Ministry of Tribal Affairs in their Action Taken Note have stated as under:-

"The number of students selected under the scheme for various years during 12th Five year plan has not been more than 20 since the norms of the scheme stipulates that maximum 20 awards are to be sanctioned to ST students for studies abroad. It is mentioned in this context that the students being awarded under the scheme are not in possession of secured admission offer from foreign university. Rather, the students provisionally selected for the award are given time of 2 years to seek offer of admission letter from foreign university and confirmation letter is issued by MoTA once they get such offer letter. Further more, in the revised guidelines of the scheme, priority is given to candidates who have already secured offer of admission and second priority is to be given to those who cleared GRE/GMAT/TOFEL and have started applying to various universities. Thus the interest of those students who got offer of admission from foreign university is being taken care of".

**1.10 The Committee find reply of the Ministry incomplete as there is no mention about the revamping of selection process of candidates under the scheme by**

**the Ministry . The Committee, therefore, reiterate its earlier recommendation to revamp the selection process under National Overseas Scholarship Scheme and also look into the possibility of increasing the number of Scholarships under the scheme with some relaxation in the norms for tribal girl students.**

**B. Grants Under First Provision to Article 275 (1) of the Constitution**

**Recommendation (Para 4.19)**

1.11 The Committee observed that the objective of the EMRS Scheme is welfare of Tribals and upgradation of the level of administration in Scheduled areas. The Ministry have been making use of a major part of the funds allocated in the Scheme for educational activities but at the same time, other parameters like Health, Agriculture, Animal Husbandry and other Primary Sector activities are being sidelined by the Ministry. The Committee strongly felt that these are the areas that have to be focused during the year 2018-19 as a holistic approach to Grants under article 275(1) Scheme would help achieve an upliftment in socio-economic status of tribals as a whole and not by being focused on some particular Scheme.

**Reply of the Government**

1.12 The Ministry of Tribal Affairs in their Action Taken Note have stated as under:-

" Funding for Eklavya Model Residential schools(EMRSs) is made under the scheme of Grants under Article 275(1) of the constitution. Under this scheme, this Ministry supplements the States for undertaking various tribal development initiatives and for raising the level of administration in Scheduled Areas with an

aim to boost the economic and social status of tribal people. Its objective is to bridge the gap between Scheduled tribes (ST) population and others by providing support in education, health, sanitation, water supply, livelihood, skill development, minor infrastructure etc. This is a demand driven programme and State Government submits the annual plan based on needs of the tribal population in the State. Hence, funds are provided for various activities under the scheme for the socio-economic development of the tribals.

**1.13 The Committee observe that Grants under article 275(1) scheme is a demand driven programme and the State Governments submit an annual plan based on the needs of Tribal population of the State. The Committee are surprised to note that the Ministry are waiting for a road-map to be formulated by the State Governments and will take action thereafter only. The Committee urge the Ministry to take initiative in this regard and frame guidelines for the State Governments for taking proactive measures in the field of Health, Agriculture, Animal Husbandry and other Priority Sector Activities also. The Committee further recommend the Ministry to prepare various projects based on the need of the State Governments in consultations with experts in the above mentioned fields and then request the State Governments to implement them. The outcome of the meeting so undertaken with the experts may also be shared with the Committee.**

**C. Post-Matric scholarship (PMS Scheme) for ST students.**

**Recommendation (Para 5.12)**

1.14 The Committee observed that Scholarships for the year 2017-18 were pending and only 20% of funds of the total dues were disbursed. An amount of Rs. 400 crore was being rolled over in the next years' budget. The Committee found that in the year 2015-16 against an expenditure of Rs. 857.14 crore, 20.3 lakh students received scholarships and whereas in year 2016-17 against an expenditure of Rs. 1555.67 crore, 18.51 lakh students got scholarships. The Committee felt that these were virtual figures being submitted by the Ministry and after utilization of double the amount of funds in year 2016-17 as compared to 2015-16 still the number of beneficiaries was less. The Committee urged the Ministry to evaluate the utilization and number of beneficiaries for both the years 2015-16 and 2016-17 and submit a report to the Committee. The Committee strongly urged the Ministry to prepare a list of beneficiaries under the Post-Matric Scheme as soon as online applications of the students are received by the Ministry. This would help in finalizing the Scholarship amount as well as disbursement before the start of academic year of the beneficiaries and the concept of roll over funds would be a history. A list of Government approved Universities/Colleges alongwith volunteers may also be published on the website of the Ministry to help students in filling up of online forms and explaining benefits of the Post-Matric Scheme.

## **Reply of the Government**

1.15 The Ministry of Tribal Affairs in their Action Taken Note have stated as under:-

"During the current financial year 2017-18 arrear grants of almost all States UTs who have claimed the arrear grant upto 2016-17 with supportive documents have been cleared by the Ministry. Besides, the Ministry has also released 20% of grant for the year 2017-18 to all States/UTs in beginning of the financial year 2017-18 and also 10% of the funds has also been released in March, 2018. Further, admissible central share upto 75% of estimates for 2017-18 has been to NE states as there is separate allocation for these states. The balance fund for 2017-18 will be released to the States/UTs during the current financial year".

The Detailed list of beneficiaries is being maintained by the State Governments as they receive online application on their respective State portal and the figures of number of beneficiaries are those figures which have been reported by the States/UTs. However, this Ministry is in the process of developing software for online and all States/UTs will be requested to upload details of beneficiaries on the software to have a better monitoring of the beneficiaries under the scheme and funds being disbursed to these beneficiaries. Under this scheme, online application from the eligible students is obtained by State Governments on their respective State portal and they furnish a consolidated proposal to this Ministry for release of funds. The list of Government approved universities/colleges is supposed to be available on the state portal.

**1.16 The Committee note that the Ministry is in process of developing a software and all States/UTs will be requested to upload the details of beneficiaries on the software to have a better monitoring of the beneficiaries under the Post-Matric Scholarship Scheme. The Committee are disheartened to note that despite their repeated recommendations for several years the issue of timely disbursement of Scholarships has not yet been addressed. The students receive their Scholarships towards the end of their academic term or in some cases after the academic year is completed.**

**The Committee strongly recommend the Ministry to stop the concept of roll over funds and disburse the funds of Scholarship timely after the software for online monitoring is in place so that the students are not adversely affected due to paucity of funds during the academic year.**

**D. Support to Tribal Research Institutes (TRI)**

**(Recommendation Para 6.14)**

**1.17 The Committee found that the Ministry of Tribal Affairs have been giving Grants-in-Aid to Tribal Research Institutes (TRIs) as these Institutes provide planning inputs to the State Governments, conduct research and documentation, training and capacity building, organize festivals/yatras and set-up Tribal Museums, Memorials, Libraries etc. The Committee noted that out of twenty-one existing TRIs, funds were not released to nine TRIs in the States of Jharkhand, Jammu and Kashmir, Chhattisgarh, Kerala, Manipur, A&N Islands, Maharashtra, UP and Himachal Pradesh due to pending**



Utilization Certificates (UCs) of previous years. The Committee took a serious note of non-submission of UCs by the States as it showed that the Ministry could not pursue these States and were incapable of exerting pressure on them. The Committee, therefore, desired that the Ministry should take stringent measures against the erring TRIs/ States. The Committee also urged the Ministry to pursue with the beneficiary TRIs to upload details of funds received and utilized by them.

### **Reply of the Government**

1.18 The Ministry of Tribal Affairs in their Action Taken Note have stated as under:-

"Revamping of functioning of TRI is among the priority of MoTA. In this regard, Ministry has had consultations with TRIs during 2017-18 at Vishakhapatnam, Gurugram and Bhopal. During consultations, amongst other thing, State TRIs are persuaded to submit pending UCs keeping in view its direct bearing on the release of funds. Further, during APEX Committee meetings, which are held in the Ministry under the Chairpersonship of Secretary (Tribal Affairs) for appraisal and approval of TRI Annual Plan, submission of pending UCs of previous years releases are insisted upon. Efforts made by the Ministry resulted in settlement of pending UCs in respect of Chhattisgarh, Kerala and Manipur out of the nine States pointed out by the Committee and funds were also released to them during 2017-18 as follows:

Sl. No.	Name of State	Fund Released during 2017-18 (Rs. in lakh)
1	Chhattisgarh	168.73
2	Kerala	745.65
3	Manipur	58.00

**1.19 The Committee observe with concern that even after so many consultations and meetings only three States have submitted their UCs out of 9 States, the States of Jharkhand, J&K, A&N Islands, Maharashtra, Uttar Pradesh and Himachal Pradesh have still not submitted the Utilization Certificates of previous years. The Committee desire that the Ministry should pursue the matter with the States during the course of APEX Committee meetings. The Committee also recommend the Ministry to develop an online portal where funds received and utilized by the beneficiary TRIs can be viewed.**

**E. National Scheduled Tribes Finance and Development Corporation**

**Recommendations (Para 7.7)**

1.20 The Committee found that NSTFDC provides financial assistance for income generation activities and marketing support assistance for economic upliftment of Scheduled Tribes. The Committee were happy to note that allocation for the year 2015-16 and 2016-17 had been fully utilized. The Committee noted that beneficiaries of Adivasi Shiksha Rin Yojana were only from eight States and beneficiaries of Adivasi Mahila Sashaktikaran Yojana were from ten States while beneficiaries under Micro Credit Scheme were from twelve States. The Committee wondered why these schemes had no beneficiaries from remaining States too. The Ministry owed an explanation to the Committee for this asymmetrical nature of beneficiaries. The Committee desired that efforts should be made to ensure that all these Schemes are implemented across the country having tribal population.

## **Reply of the Government**

1.21 The Ministry of Tribal Affairs in their Action Taken Note have stated as under:-

" NSTFDC, at the beginning of each financial year, notionally allocates funds to the States based on proportion of their ST population to the total ST population in the county. The selection of beneficiaries as also scheme is entirely decided by the respective implementing agencies of view of local demand vis-a-vis its viability. So far any proposal received from the implementing agencies has not been denied by NSTFDC.

However, the observations of the committee would be communicated to all the implementing agencies for necessary compliance".

**1.22 The Committee are exasperated with the stereo type reply of the Ministry that "observations of the Committee would be communicated to all the implementing agencies for necessary compliance". The Committee are irked with such reply of the Ministry in spite of such a bad performance of NSTFDC schemes and the Ministry is just communicating the matter to the implementing agencies for compliance and does not want to take any tactile steps in the matter.**

**The Committee had earlier recommended that efforts should be made by the Ministry to increase the disbursement of funds and number of beneficiaries by NSTFDC under its various schemes and programmes. The Committee find that the Ministry, instead of giving a definite plan of action for increasing beneficiaries, has passed the buck to States, viz, formulating an action plan for**

the States. The Committee are of firm view that this will not yield any results. The Committee reiterate their recommendation, *viz*, to formulate an action plan for increasing the number of beneficiary States as well as beneficiaries under Adivasi Mahila Shiksha Rrinn Yojana, Adivasi Mahila Sashaktikaran Yojana and Micro Credit Scheme. The Committee feel that NSTFDC and Ministry of Tribal Affairs should work in a more coherent, composite and efficient manner with the State Governments/ implementing agencies for better implementation of NSTFDC schemes, if the NSTFDC has to remain meaningful and justify its existence.

## **CHAPTER II**

### **OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT**

#### **Recommendation (Para. No.3.14)**

2.1 The Committee observe that the ultimate objective of SCA to TSS is to raise the economic and social status of tribals. The Committee find that allocations made under the SCA to TSS have been fully utilized by the Ministry during 2015-16 and 2016-17 which is credible. The Committee desire that more funds should be sought at the RE stage for the year 2018-19 as these funds of SCA to TSS have been utilized for enhance quality of life by providing basic amenities in tribal areas, creation of productive assets and income generating opportunities are carried out through this Scheme.

#### **Reply of the Government**

2.2 The Ministry has noted the recommendation of the Committee.

[Ministry of Tribal Affairs F. No. 16015/04/2018-PC  
dated: 11<sup>th</sup> May, 2018]

#### **Recommendation (Para 4.20)**

2.3 The Committee observe that the objective of the EMRS Scheme is to provide quality middle and high level education to Scheduled Tribe (ST) students in remote areas, not only to enable them to avail reservation in high and professional educational courses and get jobs in Government and private sectors, but also to have access to the

best opportunities in education at par with the non-ST population. The Committee find that 14 new EMRS have been sanctioned during the financial year 2017-18 and target of 130 EMRS has been fixed for the year 2018- 19. The Committee feel that the construction of 130 EMRS is a unrealistic target as compared with last year's sanctioned target of 14 EMRS. The Committee desire that apart from setting up of new EMRS, the Ministry should mainly focus on the qualitative and quantitative education and providing other facilities like infrastructure, teachers and staff in the existing EMRS.

### **Reply of the Government**

2.4 Setting up of EMRSs is a demand driven activity and projects are sanctioned by this Ministry subject to availability of funds. However, in the budget announcement 2018-19, Government has announced that "The Government is committed to provide the best quality education to the tribal children in their own environment. To realise this mission, it has been decided that by the year 2022, every block with more than 50% ST population and at least 20,000 tribal persons, will have an Ekalavya Model Residential School. Ekalavya schools will be on par with Navodaya Vidyalayas and will have special facilities for preserving local art and culture besides providing training in sports and skill development."

2.5 As per census 2011, across the country, there are 564 sub-districts having more than 50% ST population and at least 20,000 tribal persons. Out of these sub-districts, at present we have 102 number of sub-districts having EMRSs. Hence, it is proposed to establish new EMRSs in the remaining 462 sub-districts by the year 2022. To achieve this target, it is now proposed to established around 50 EMRSs (against the earlier

target of 130 EMRSs) during 2018-19. Additional budget is being sought for this purpose. It is pertinent to mention that in case of delay in completion of some EMRSs as per the target, these EMRSs can be made functional in rented buildings.

2.6. The objective of EMRSs is to provide qualitative and quantitative education. Funding for additional infrastructure is demand based and non-recurring grants are provided periodically for this purpose. Strengthening of teachers and staff is State's prerogative since management of the EMRS is being done by the State Government. However, Ministry monitors it in regular interval and intervenes, if needed.

[Ministry of Tribal Affairs F. No. 16015/04/2018-PC  
dated: 11<sup>th</sup> May, 2018]

#### **Recommendation (Para 4.21)**

2.7 The Committee notes that the Ministry is planning to establish a national level body for monitoring the recruitment process of teachers and pay scales etc. in EMRS. The Ministry is also in process of preparing guidelines so that EMRS could be run on the lines of Navodaya Vidyalayas. The Committee desires that while finalization of these guidelines more attention should be given to quality of education and facilities provided to the students and these guidelines should be student friendly.

#### **Reply of The Government**

2.8 The suggestion of the Committee is noted for compliance.

[Ministry of Tribal Affairs F. No. 16015/04/2018-PC  
dated: 11<sup>th</sup> May, 2018]

### **Recommendation (Para 5.11)**

2.9 The Committee note that the revised Post-Matric Scholarship Scheme has been in force from 1.04.2013. Despite revamping the Scheme in 2013 tribal students are still facing hurdles in receiving the scholarship amounts and hence face a lot of difficulties in completing their education. The Scheme was evaluated by National Institute of Rural Development (NIRD) in 2013 and the major draw backs were highlighted as delay in disbursement of Scholarships and students not having adequate awareness about the Scheme. The Committee note with serious concern these two issues have not been addressed in an effective manner by the Ministry as yet and the delay in disbursement in Scholarships is still persistent even after the revamping of the Scheme. The advertisement and publicity of the Scheme has not garnered an effective response as the Revised Estimates for the last three years has not been fully utilized and there is a shortfall every year. A separate budgetary allocation has also been made in the Scheme from the year 2017-18 and still the Actual Expenditure is less than Revised Estimates. The Committee desire the Ministry to ensure that requisite scholarship amount is deposited in the bank accounts of students with minimum delay and a time frame should be set up for receiving the scholarship amount from the date of online application of scholarship. A Grievance Cell may also be set up to address the problems and hurdles faced by the tribal students for receiving scholarship amounts.



## **Reply of the Government**

2.10 Based on the recommendations of NIRD, guidelines of the scheme has been revised in the year 2013 and as the States/UTs are the implementing agencies for this Centrally Sponsored Scheme, States/UTs give publicity to the scheme by the way of local newspapers, websites etc. Scholarships. As per existing procedure, Ministry releases funds to the State Govt/UT Admn and scholarships to the eligible ST students are being disbursed by the respective State Govt/UT Admn into their bank account through DBT mode. No State Govt/UT Admn has reported any difficulty in disbursing funds through DBT mode. Further, with a view to vigorously pursue the matter with States/UTs, the Pre-PAC meeting was organized in this Ministry in April, 2017 in which representatives of all States/UT were invited. These issues were discussed in detail with them in the meeting and they were requested to take immediate steps so that every eligible ST beneficiary gets scholarship in time. The Ministry will further continue to take up the issue with States/UTs so that students may avail maximum benefit under the scheme.

2.11 For the year 2015-16 and 2016-17, there was no separate allocation of funds under PMS scheme as it was a part of Umbrella scheme. As regard fund utilization during the year 2017-18, it is submitted that against the RE of Rs. 1436.00 crore and final grant of Rs. 1464.31 crore for PMS scheme, an amount of Rs. 1463.65 crore has been utilized which is around 99.96% of final grant.

[Ministry of Tribal Affairs F. No. 16015/04/2018-PC  
dated: 11<sup>th</sup> May, 2018]

### **Recommendation (Para 6.14)**

2.12 The Committee find that the Ministry of Tribal Affairs are giving Grants-in-Aid to Tribal Research Institutes (TRIs) as these Institutes provide planning inputs to the State Governments, conduct research and documentation, training and capacity building, organize festivals/yatras and set-up Tribal Museums, Memorials, Libraries etc. The Committee note that out of twenty one existing TRIs, funds were not released to nine TRIs in the States of Jharkhand, Jammu and Kashmir, Chhattisgarh, Kerala, Manipur, A&N Islands, Maharashtra, UP and Himachal Pradesh due to pending Utilization Certificates (UCs) of previous years. The Committee take very serious note of non-submission of UCs by the States as it shows that the Ministry could not pursue these States and more incapable exerting pressure on them. The Committee, therefore, desire that the Ministry should take stringent measures against the erring TRIs/ States. The Committee also urge the Ministry to pursue with the beneficiary TRIs to upload details of funds received and utilized by them.

### **Reply of the Government**

2.13 Revamping of functioning of TRI is among the priority of MoTA. In this regard, Ministry has had consultations with TRIs during 2017-18 at Vishakhapatnam, Gurugram and Bhopal. During consultations, amongst other thing, State TRIs are persuaded to submit pending UCs keeping in view its direct bearing on the release of funds. Further, during APEX Committee meetings, which are held in the Ministry under the Chairpersonship of Secretary (Tribal Affairs) for appraisal and approval of TRI

Annual Plans, submission of pending UCs of previous years releases are insisted upon. Efforts made by the Ministry resulted in settlement of pending UCs in respect of Chhattisgarh, Kerala and Manipur out of the nine States pointed out by the Committee and funds were also released to them during 2017-18 as follows:

Sl. No	Name of the State	Fund Released during 2017-18 (Rs. in lakh)
1	Chhattisgarh	168.73
2	Kerala	745.65
3	Manipur	58.00

2.14 Ministry has taken serious note of the observations of the Committee. It has been decided to discuss issue of pending UCs thoroughly with the heads of TRIs and Tribal Welfare Department of the States in the consultation scheduled on 8<sup>th</sup> and 9<sup>th</sup> May, 2018.

[Ministry of Tribal Affairs F. No. 16015/04/2018-PC  
dated: 11<sup>th</sup> May, 2018]

#### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see Para 1.19 of Chapter-I of the Report)

#### **Recommendation (Para 6.15)**

2.15 The Committee note in the States of Arunachal Pradesh, Nagaland, Mizoram, Meghalaya and Bihar no TRIs is functional and some of the TRIs do not have their own buildings. As TRIs have pivotal role to protect and

nourish the tribal heritage & culture by preserving their tribal arts, tribal dances and music, the Committee desire that the Ministry should establish TRIs in State of Arunachal Pradesh, Nagaland, Mizoram, Meghalaya and Bihar and allocate more funds to those TRIs who do not have their own buildings.

### **Reply of the Government**

2.16 The Ministry of Tribal Affairs has taken note of kind observations of the Hon'ble Committee. It is submitted that the Ministry has issued revised Guidelines for scheme "Support to TRIs" in December 2017, The Guidelines, inter alia, has the provision to provide assistance to the States in setting up of TRIs where it does not exist and also for construction of TRI building. Pursuant to issuance of revised Guidelines, assistance has been provided to the States of Arunachal Pradesh, Nagaland during 2017-18 for establishing TRIs alongwith construction of TRI building. Further Government of Sikkim has also been provided funds for construction of TRI building. Budgetary allocation under the Scheme has been substantially increased from Rs. 16.99 Crore in 2016-17 to Rs. 80.00 Crore in 2017-18, which has been further increased to Rs. 100.00 Crore in 2018-19. Though the Scheme is demand driven, efforts of the Ministry would be to provide

assistance to such States for establishment of TRIs where it does not exist as well as for construction of TRI building.

[Ministry of Tribal Affairs F. No. 16015/04/2018-PC  
dated: 11<sup>th</sup> May, 2018]

### **CHAPTER III**

**OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT DESIRE  
TU PURSUE IN VIEW OF THE REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT**

**NIL**

## **CHAPTER IV**

### **OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED AND WHICH REQUIRE REITERATION**

#### **Recommendation (Para 2.12)**

4.1 The Committee note that the Ministry have utilised 98.30 and 99.90 per cent Budget allocation for the year 2015-16 and 2016-17. The Committee commend the Ministry for this. The Budget allocation for 2018-19 has, therefore, been increased to Rs. 5957.18 crore (Scheme) from Rs. 5300.14 crore in 2017-18 as a result thereof. The Committee find that funds allocated for the Scheme of support to NSTFDC, Institutional Support for Development and Marketing of Tribal Products, National Fellowship and Scholarship for higher education of ST students, Tribal Festivals Research, Information and Mass Education, Pre-Matric Scholarship Schemes have been utilized only 50 per cent till 31.12.2017 which is indeed not a happy situation. The Committee note that lack of training institutes in the field of sports like archery, hockey, swimming, football etc. lead to non-inclusion of tribal sportspersons on the international diasporas and hence meritorious sportspersons from tribal belt are deprived of the recognition that they are entitled to. The Secretary, Ministry of Tribal Affairs, during the evidence, admitted that tribal sportspersons are deprived of a facility of training institutes and the Ministry is planning to built one institute in every district having tribal majority. The Committee while appreciating such move of the Ministry recommend the Ministry to allocate sufficient funds for development of all Sports Institutes equipped with facilities of track and field events as well as indoor sports for the use of tribal sportspersons in every district having 50 per cent majority of tribal population, so that tribal sportspersons of these regions are not bereft of these facilities.

### **Reply of the Government**

4.2 There has not been any underutilization of funds under the scheme of Pre-Matric Scholarships as the entire allocation including supplementary grants for the year 2017-18 has been fully utilized under the scheme.

Other issues of this para does not pertain to Scholarships Division.

[Ministry of Tribal Affairs F. No. 16015/04/2018-PC  
dated: 11<sup>th</sup> May, 2018]

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see Para 1.7 of Chapter I of the Report)

### **Recommendation (Para 4.19)**

4.3 The Committee observe that the objective of the EMRS Scheme is welfare of Tribals and upgradation of the level of administration in Scheduled areas. The Ministry have been making use of a major part of the funds allocated in the Scheme for educational activities but at the same time, other parameters like Health, Agriculture, Animal Husbandry and other Primary Sector activities are being sidelined by the Ministry. The Committee strongly feel that these are the areas that have to be focused on during this current year of 2018-19 as a holistic approach to Grants under article 275(1) Scheme will help achieve an upliftment in socio-economic status of tribals as a whole and not by being focused on some particular Scheme.

### **Reply of the Government**



4.4 Funding for Eklavya Model Residential Schools(EMRSs) are made under the scheme of Grants under Article 275(1) of the Constitution. Under this scheme, this Ministry supplements the States for undertaking various tribal development initiatives and for raising the level of administration in Scheduled Areas with an aim to boost the economic and social status of tribal people. Its objective is to bridge the gap between Scheduled Tribes (ST) population and others by providing support in education, health, sanitation, water supply, livelihood, skill development, minor infrastructure etc. This is a demand driven programme and State Government submits the annual plan based on needs of the tribal population in the State. Hence, funds are provided for various activities under the scheme for the socio-economic development of the tribals.

[Ministry of Tribal Affairs F. No. 16015/04/2018-PC  
dated: 11<sup>th</sup> May, 2018]

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see Para 1.13 of Chapter I of the Report)

## **CHAPTER V**

### **OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF THE GOVERNMENT ARE INTERIM IN NATURE**

#### **Recommendation (Para 2.13)**

5.1 The Committee are constrained to note that National Overseas Scholarship Scheme has not achieved desired results during the 12th Five Year Plan and the number students going abroad have not been more than 20 in the last five years. The Committee would like to know the reasons for the same. The Committee find that the Ministry have levied very stringent norms in the process of selection of candidates under the Scheme. The Ministry have conceded the fact that various rounds of interviews and selection processes are conducted for the students going abroad which may be one of the reasons. The Committee feel that the interview norms as well as selection procedure need to be relaxed if more tribal students are to be promoted and given benefits of the Scheme. The Committee also feel that the round of interviews is a very subjective issue and is certainly not a parameter of students calibre. The Committee recommend that a student who has secured admission in the foreign universities should not be strictly judged on the ground of interviews alone. The Committee also desire that entire selection procedure/norms need to be revisited and made uncomplicated.

#### **Reply of the Government**

5.2 The number of students selected under the scheme for various years during 12<sup>th</sup> Five year Plan has not been more than 20 since the norms of the scheme stipulates that

maximum 20 awards are to be sanctioned to ST students for studies abroad. It is mentioned in this context that the students being awarded under the scheme are not in possession of secured admission offer from foreign university. Rather, the students provisionally selected for the award are given time of 2 years to seek offer of admission letter from foreign university and confirmation letter is issued by MoTA once they get such offer letter. Furthermore, in the revised guidelines of the scheme, priority is given to candidates who have already secured offer of admission and second priority is to be given to those who cleared GRE/GMAT/TOFEL and have started applying to various universities. Thus the interest of those students who got offer of admission from foreign university is being taken care of.

[Ministry of Tribal Affairs F. No. 16015/04/2018-PC  
dated: 11<sup>th</sup> May, 2018]

#### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see Para 1.10 of Chapter-I of the Report)

#### **Recommendation (Para 3.15)**

5.3 The Committee note that no funds have been released to the State of Goa and Tamil Nadu in 2015-16 and the State of Uttarakhand has not received any fund during the year 2015-16 and 2016-17. The Committee desire to know the reasons for not allocating funds to these States and the steps taken by the Ministry to allocate funds to these States too

### **Reply of the Government**

5.4 As regards Goa State, it is submitted that during the years 2006-07 and 2007-08, Rs. 110.00lakh and Rs.133.00 lakhs were released to the State respectively. However, Utilization Certificate (UC) as required under General Financial Rules (GFR), was not submitted by the State despite repeated reminders. Due to funds lying unspent with the State, no fund could be approved for release during 2009-10 to 2015-16. After rigorous pursuance by the Ministry, the State Government finally submitted pending UCs which enabled sanction of funds to the State and accordingly during 2016-17, an amount of Rs. 455.68 Lakh was released. Further during 2017-18, an amount of Rs. 559.09 Lakh was sanctioned and entire funds was released too. Gist of sanction and release of funds to the State Government of Goa is as under:

<b>Year</b>	<b>Fund approved</b>	<b>Fund Released</b>	<b>Unspent Balance with the State</b>	<b>Remarks</b>
2006-07	110.00	110.00	-	-
2007-08	133.00	133.00	-	-
2009-10 2015-16	0.00	0.00	-	Due to funds lying unspent with the State, and non-submission of Utilization Certificate, no fund was approved for release during the years 2009-10 to 2015-16.
2016-17	455.68	455.68	0.00	-
2017-18	559.09	559.09	0.00	-

5.5 As regards Tamil Nadu State, it is submitted that during the year 2014-15, an amount of Rs. 217.33 lakh was released to the State. However, Utilization Certificate as required under GFR, was not submitted by the State in time which lead to non-release of fund during 2015-16. However, after resolving the issue of pending UCs with the State, an amount of

Rs. 600.00 Lakh was released during 2016-17. Further during 2017-18, an amount of Rs. 894.10 Lakh was approved for release. Gist of sanction and release of funds to the State Government of Tamil Nadu is as under:

Year	Fund approved	Fund Released	Unspent Balance with the State	Remarks
2014-15	217.33	217.33	651.00	-
2015-16	0.00	0.00	868.33	Due to funds lying unspent with the State, no fund was approved for release during the years 2015-16
2016-17	600.00	600.00	0.00	-
2017-18	894.10	894.10	0.00	-

5.6 As regards Uttarakhand State, it is submitted that during the year 2014-15, an amount of Rs. 805.83 lakh was released to the State. However, Utilization Certificate as required under GFR was not submitted by the State in time and as such due to funds lying unspent with the State, no fund could be released during 2015-16 and 2016-17. During 2017-18, the issue of pending UCs was got settled and a sum of Rs. 679.00 Lakh was released to the State. Gist of sanction and release of funds to the State Government of Uttarakhand is as under:

Year	Fund approved	Fund Released	Unspent Balance with the State	Remarks
2014-15	805.83	805.83	945.43	Rs. 139.60 Lakh was lying unspent with the State was adjusted.
2015-16	0.00	0.00	945.43	-
2016-17	0.00	0.00	945.43	-
2017-18	783.27	679.00	104.27	Rs. 104.27 Lakh was lying unspent with the State was adjusted.

[Ministry of Tribal Affairs F. No. 16015/04/2018-PC  
dated: 11<sup>th</sup> May, 2018]

### **Recommendation (Para No. 5.12)**

5.7 The Committee observe that Scholarships for the year 2017-18 are still pending and only 20% of funds of the total dues are disbursed till now. An amount of Rs. 400 crore is being rolled over in the next years' budget. The Committee find 34 that in the year 2015-16 against an expenditure of Rs. 857.14 crore, 20.3 lakh students received scholarships and whereas in year 2016-17 against an expenditure of Rs. 1555.67 crore, 18.51 lakh students got scholarships. The Committee feel that these are virtual figures being submitted by the Ministry and after utilization of double the amount of funds in year 2016-17 as compared to 2015-16 still the number of beneficiaries is less. The Committee further urge the Ministry to evaluate the utilization and number of beneficiaries for both the years 2015-16 and 2016-17 and submit a report to the Committee. The Committee strongly urge the Ministry to prepare a list of beneficiaries under the Post-Matric Scheme as soon as online applications of the students are received by the Ministry. This will help in finalizing the Scholarship amount as well as disbursement before the start of academic year of the beneficiaries and the concept of roll over funds will be a history. A list of Government approved Universities/Colleges alongwith volunteers may also be published on the website of the Ministry to help students in filling up of online forms and explaining benefits of the Post-Matric Scheme.

### **Reply of the Government**

5.8 During the current financial year 2017-18, arrear grants of almost all States/UTs who have claimed the arrear grant upto 2016-17 with supportive documents have been cleared by the Ministry. Besides, the Ministry has also released 20% of grant for the

year 2017-18 to all States/UTs in beginning of the financial year 2017-18 and also 10% of the funds has also been released in March, 2018. Further, admissible central share upto 75% of estimates for 2017-18 has been released to NE states as there is separate allocation for these states. The balance fund for 2017-18 will be released to the States/UTs during the current financial year.

5.9 The Detailed list of beneficiaries is being maintained by the State Governments as they received online application on their respective state portal and the figures of number of beneficiaries are those figures which have been reported by the States/UTs. However, this Ministry is in the process of developing software for online and all States/UTs will be requested to upload details of beneficiaries on the software to have a better monitoring of the beneficiaries under the scheme and funds being disbursed to these beneficiaries. Under this scheme, online application from the eligible students is obtained by State Governments on their respective state portal and they furnish a consolidated proposal to this Ministry for release of funds. The list of Govt. approved universities/colleges is supposed to be available on the state portal.

[Ministry of Tribal Affairs F. No. 16015/04/2018-PC  
dated: 11<sup>th</sup> May, 2018]

### **Comments of the Committee**

(Please see Para 1.16 of Chapter I of the Report)

### **Recommendation (Para No. 7.7)**

5.10 The Committee find that NSTFDC provides financial assistance for income generation activities and marketing support assistance for economic upliftment of Scheduled Tribes. The Committee are happy to note that allocation for the year 2015-16 and 2016-17 has been fully utilized. The Committee note that beneficiaries of Adivasi Shiksha Rinn Yojana are only from eight States and beneficiaries of Adivasi Mahila Sashaktikaran Yojana are from ten States while beneficiaries under Micro Credit Scheme are from twelve States. The Committee wonder why these schemes do not have beneficiaries from remaining States too. The Ministry owe an explanation to the Committee for this asymmetrical nature of beneficiaries. The Committee desire that efforts should be made to ensure that all these Schemes are implemented across the country having tribal population.

### **Reply of the Government**

5.11 NSTFDC, at the beginning of each financial year, notionally allocates funds to the states based on proportion of their ST population to the total ST population in the country. The selection of beneficiaries as also scheme is entirely decided by the respective implementing agencies of view of local demand vis-à-vis its viability. So far any proposal received from the implementing agencies has not been denied by NSTFDC.



However, the observations of the committee would be communicated to all the implementing agencies for necessary compliance.

[Ministry of Tribal Affairs F. No. 16015/04/2018-PC  
dated: 11<sup>th</sup> May, 2018]

**Comments of the Committee**

(Please see Para 1.22 of Chapter-I of the Report)

New Delhi;  
7 August, 2018  
16 Shravana, 1940 (Saka)

**RAMESH BAIS**  
Chairperson,  
Standing Committee on  
Social Justice and Empowerment.

**MINUTES OF THE SIXTEENTH SITTING OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON  
SOCIAL JUSTICE AND EMPOWERMENT HELD ON TUESDAY, 7<sup>th</sup> AUGUST, 2018**

The Committee met from 1500 hrs. to 1530 hrs. in Chairperson's Chamber, Room No. 113, PHA Extension Building, New Delhi.

**PRESENT**

**SHRI RAMESH BAIS - CHAIRPERSON**

**MEMBERS**

**LOK SABHA**

2. Shri Sher Singh Ghubaya
3. Shri Sadashiv Lokhande
4. Smt. K. Maragatham
5. Dr. Udit Raj
6. Shri Ch. Malla Reddy
7. Smt. Satabdi Roy
8. Kunwar Bharatendra Singh
9. Prof. Sadhu Singh
10. Smt. Mamata Thakur
11. Shri Mansukhbhai Dhanjibhai Vasava
12. Shri Tej Pratap Singh Yadav
13. Dr. Karan Singh Yadav

**RAJYA SABHA**

14. Smt. Jharna Das Baidya
15. Shri Abir Ranjan Biswas
16. Smt. Sarojini Hembram
17. Dr. Narendra Jadhav
18. Smt. Vijila Sathyananth
19. Smt. Wansuk Syiem
20. Smt. Chhaya Verma
21. Shri Ramkumar Verma

**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT**

1. Shri Ashok Sajwan - Director
2. Smt. Mamta Kemwal - Additional Director

2. At the outset, the Chairperson welcomed the Members to the sitting of the Committee.

3. The Committee then took up for consideration of the following draft Reports of the Committee:-

(i) \*\*\*\* \*\*\*\* \*\*\*\*

(ii) \*\*\*\* \*\*\*\* \*\*\*\*

(iii) \*\*\*\* \*\*\*\* \*\*\*\*

(iv) \*\*\*\* \*\*\*\* \*\*\*\*

(v) \*\*\*\* \*\*\*\* \*\*\*\*

(vi) 59<sup>th</sup> Report on Action Taken on 52<sup>nd</sup> Report on 'Demands for Grants (2018-19)' of the Ministry of Tribal Affairs.

(vii) \*\*\*\* \*\*\*\* \*\*\*\*

(viii) \*\*\*\* \*\*\*\* \*\*\*\*

(ix) \*\*\*\* \*\*\*\* \*\*\*\*

4. The Chairperson then requested the Members to give their suggestions, if any, on the draft Reports. The Reports were adopted by the Committee without any amendments. The Committee then authorized the Chairperson to finalize these draft Reports in the light of consequential changes that might arise out of factual verification of the draft Reports and to present the same to both the Houses.

*The Committee then adjourned.*

---

\* Matter not related to this Report.

## **APPENDIX**

### **ANALYSIS OF ACTION TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT ON THE RECOMMENDATIONS CONTAINED IN THE FORTY-THIRD REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON SOCIAL JUSTICE AND EMPOWERMENT**

**(SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA)**

	<b>Total</b>	<b>Percentage</b>
I. Total number of Recommendations	12	
II. Observations/Recommendations, which have been accepted by the Government (Paragraph Nos. 3.14, 4.20, 4.21, 5.16, 6.14 and 6.15)	6	50.00
III. Observations/Recommendations which the committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies of the Government (Nil)	0	0
IV. Observations/Recommendations, in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted (Paragraph Nos. 2.12, and 4.19)	2	16.67
V. Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government are interim in nature (Paragraph Nos. 2.13, 3.15, 5.12 and 7.7)	4	33.33