

*Wednesday,
30th March, 1910*

ABSTRACT OF THE PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

Council of the Governor General of India,

LAWS AND REGULATIONS

Vol. XLVIII

April 1909 - March 1910

ABSTRACT OF PROCEEDING
OF
THE COUNCIL OF THE GOVERNOR GENERAL OF INDIA

ASSEMBLED FOR THE PURPOSE OF MAKING

LAWS AND REGULATIONS,

April 1909 - March 1910

VOLUME XLVIII



Published by Authority of the Governor General.



CALCUTTA :
OFFICE OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF GOVERNMENT PRINTING, INDIA.

1910

Proceedings of the Council of the Governor General of India, assembled for the purpose of making Laws and Regulations under the provisions of the Indian Councils Acts, 1861 to 1909 (24 & 25 Vict., c. 67, 55 & 56 Vict., c. 14, and 9 Edw. VII, c. 4).

The Council met at Government House on Wednesday, the 30th March 1910.

PRESENT :

His Excellency THE EARL OF MINTO, P.C., G.C.M.G., G.M.S.I., G.M.I.E., Viceroy and Governor General of India, *presiding*,
and 54 Members, of whom 49 were Additional Members.

DISCUSSION OF BUDGET FOR 1910-11.

The Hon'ble MR. MADGE said :—“ My Lord, I desire to refer very briefly to one or two matters of some little importance. As a non-official Member in this Council I have had my ears open, and my mind also, in the expectation of hearing some useful facts from our non-official Indian Members such as I have gathered from my own experience in the past, facts upon which we could build a theory safely. Instead we have rather received theories round which facts were gathered in a very intelligent, in a very instructive manner, but in a manner that did not wholly convince me that my hunger for facts had been satisfied. I should like, my Lord, before I say another word, to say at this stage of the debate, when Members will have no opportunity of replying to anything that I may say, that I am not speaking at any Member at all, but rather taking up subjects that Members have spoken of in connection with the Budget. These Members have been spokesmen here on various subjects connected with the Budget, and it is to some schools of thought that they have represented connected with the Budget that I wish to speak.

“ The first point to which I wish to refer is the separation of the judiciary from the executive, about which some remarks have been made here. And if I link it with the Budget, instead of condoling with the Government on the delay that has taken place in introducing the scheme referred to, I would rather congratulate Government on the judicious caution that has been displayed in bringing in a movement of very great importance, some of the results of which might be very advantageous, but others of which, if the standpoint from which I look at it is correct, would be rather disastrous. The administration of justice is looked upon by some people as merely sitting upon a seat in a Court of justice and technically interpreting the texts of certain laws. I do not think it is that in any

country of the world : it is that here least of all countries in the world, where Englishmen coming out to this country have a great deal to learn about the people, about their habits of thought and feeling, their social conditions, all of which are a sealed book to them until they come here. That book is not open to them in the moment at which they come here, nor in the very early years of their career do they learn all its secrets, but later in life. I should imagine from what I have seen that it is during the period from the first 12 to 15, sometimes even 20, years of their career as civil servants that Englishmen get that mastery of facts which makes them so very useful later in life. I am far from saying that they are not very useful before. But I do say that in the position of a Judge a civil servant requires to know a great deal more of the people of this country than he can learn if he is snatched off from the executive line very early in his career. It is when the man moves about through his district as an officer possessing both magisterial and executive powers that he comes to know the conditions of life to which he would have been an absolute stranger if, at any early period of his career, he were required to elect the judicial service. In the scheme which was sent to the Government of Bengal and by that Government circulated to each of the various associations, in one of which I saw it, there was an estimate in which the cost of this experiment was rated at something like 15 lakhs of rupees for this one province of Bengal. It is in connection with that estimate that I have to say what I wish to say. I have no hesitation in saying that in my humble opinion a worse use could hardly be made of these 15 lakhs of rupees than by using them in that particular manner. I think so for reasons most of which I have already stated. It is sometimes also said that a thief-catcher ought not to be a thief-trier. This is one of those statements which belong to theory rather than to facts, because, as everybody knows, the magisterial work of a district is largely in the hands of the Joint Magistrate, and it is he who is really the thief-trier, he, or one of the subordinate Magistrates. To a large extent the practical value of the executive where it touches the masses depends on the magisterial powers that a Magistrate of a district possesses, and I wish to assure Your Lordship that I am putting forward not an official view but a non-official view, which has made many converts in recent years. For the Magistrate of the district to preserve what some people consider a red rag, namely, his prestige—which is absolutely necessary for the peace and safety of his district—I will not say that that is exclusively but it is very largely preserved by his possession of those double powers which enable him when he travels about to be what I used to hear 30 years ago called the 'Ma Bap' of the district. No doubt things have changed and scientific government has taken the place of the old

[30TH MARCH 1910.]

[*Mr. Madge.*]

paternal rule. We cannot put the hands back on the dial, but we can still preserve as much as possible of those old relations that made the ruling race of the country loved, respected and trusted by the people in the most serious crises of their lives. I am speaking, my Lord, of persons and things that have fallen within my own personal experience. I do earnestly hope, if this scheme of separating the executive from the judiciary is ever carried out, that it will be carried out at a very much later stage of the judicial officer's career than that at which the separation is proposed in some of the schemes which I have seen. Personally, though my opinion may not be worth much, I think it will be unsafe to make the decision earlier than the time at which a man is appointed a High Court Judge. Possibly it might be found expedient later on to do it when he is confirmed in the office of Sessions Judge, but certainly any earlier period would deprive him of one of the most valuable sources of official education, much of which civilians now enjoy, and for which I see no substitute in any of the theoretical schemes that I have seen recommended. People say you should do this and do that, but from what source is it proposed to supply the very valuable experience that a district officer gathers in those years, in which he has exercised both functions? I do not see that the advocates of the new scheme propose any substitute for this source of supply which they desire to extinguish.

" I should like to say a few words also on the subject of railway expenditure. I am not an expert at all, but like other people I have my eyes and ears open to what is published on the subject, and I am a little surprised that it has not been more clearly realised that, in an agricultural country like this, with mineral resources also undeveloped, although technical education, as has been stated, is very valuable and one means to an end, the first need of this great country is the extension of transport whether by railway or by waterway. Transport is one of the first necessities of this country, and it will be found in the years to come that if our railways and our feeder lines were more energetically developed, there are potential granaries to which justice is imperfectly done now, which would throw open their food products into wider markets than those which they now reach. My Lord, this is a matter for which personally as an individual taxpayer I feel very thankful for the very insight and foresight with which the Railway Board is directing its operations. I think that the more speedily railways and feeder lines are pushed on the better for us, and I should wish that some little attention was also given to our inland waterways. We are all familiar with the report of the Commission at home which has lately been published, and though the conditions are somewhat

different in this country, yet in respect of certain conditions in which it is said the Continent of Europe enjoys greater advantages than our tight little island, this country enjoys even greater advantages than the Continent of Europe. We have large rivers. I remember the time when as a little boy I saw fleets steaming up the Ganges which have almost disappeared. There is a species of traffic in which consignees and consignors are not particular as to speed, and in which greater safety can be secured by water transit, and I think that kind of traffic would be redeveloped if more attention was paid to our inland waterways. I am aware that this subject has attracted official attention and I have no doubt that it will attract more, but when reformers tell us that you should cut down railways by lakhs and turn the money on to other expenditure, if it is not exactly a case of the Irishman cutting off the blanket at one end to add to the other end, it certainly is removing something from vital interests and transferring it to less vital interests.

“ One more subject on which I wish to dwell lightly is the big education question. We have had theories on that subject with which I am in perfect accord, and I wish to join those who have thanked the Director, Mr. Orange, for his most sympathetic speech and I may say almost illuminating speech on the subject. I thank him for this country and especially for my own community. Still there are things in connection with education that ought to be kept in mind. Comparisons are being made between this country and England. The analogy would hold better if we of this country—and here I place myself besides my Indian friends—realised some essential features of English education. What has made education succeed so well in England and in poor Scotland? The people of Great Britain generally have done a great deal to provide endowments from private wealth, and the past has laid up resources on which the present thrives, and it is part of our duty—My duty as a very humble member of one small community but more so the duty of wealthy Indians—to stir up one another to something like wholesome rivalry that will place this country in a position that might furnish a parallel to England and Scotland. What endowments have we in this country laid up by the rich from which our poor benefit? I have heard it said that very little concern is shown by the rich for the masses in this country. I do not pretend to stand here in judgment on anybody, my Lord, but I do think that there is ample room when people cry out for primary education, for the people of this country to give the Government a lead in it by endowing private colleges to a much larger extent than has ever been done in the past, and thus releasing funds spent on high education. I have heard the great despatch of 1854 quoted in this place, and any one who has read it

[30TH MARCH 1910.]

[*Mr. Madge.*]

intelligently must have been struck by the passage quoted by Mr. Orange in his last report in which it is said that we value things in the proportion of what we pay for them : though it might not be the individual payer who will benefit, it will be his countrymen. The despatch is instinct with the principle that Indian private enterprise in other words should support its own higher education. The Government was only to give a lead in it ; and here, my Lord, I think I may well refer to a matter in which my own community is especially concerned. I lay claim to no originality on the point, because I have seen it repeated over and over again in the public Press and elsewhere ; but I repeat it here. The despatch refers specially to the old Parental Academy, an institution started by the domiciled community in order to educate their own people, and the despatch refers to it as the kind of institution that the Government should foster in this country. Well, my Lord, if the policy of the Government had been so shaped that private enterprise would have been more distinctly and decisively fostered, I think a great deal more justice would have been done not only to ourselves, who are in a mere microscopic minority, but to the middle classes of this country. It is good for men to be stirred up to self-help in that way, and I do say that if in this country more money was supplied by the classes who had benefited by higher education they would have undergone, in the self-denial which would have been imposed upon them, a moral discipline that would have reacted in their favour, and it might have put a stop to sundry unpleasant eruptions that we have witnessed lately. It would have given us a more robust type of educated people, it would not only have given us colleges conducted by people who had paid for them, but it would have given us colleges in which the educated sons of this country would vie with Englishmen in teaching their young. They would have gathered from English people the best of English life and manners, and they would have taught Englishmen something that they need to learn, and these institutions would have been spread all over the country. I have no doubt, my Lord, that the Education Department is striving to do its very best, and I do not stand up to criticise merely or to condemn, but I do think that if a little more stress was laid in the future than in the past upon those portions of the despatch that encouraged private enterprise, a great deal more could have been done.

“ One more point I wish to dwell upon that I would not have touched but that an Hon'ble Indian member has referred to it, and that is recruiting in this country. I shall say very little on this subject. I know all the difficulties of the subject, because I have studied it for over 20 years ; but I do wish to say,

[*Mr. Madge; Mr. Mazharul Haque.*] [30TH MARCH 1910.]

that I honestly believe that, if local recruiting had not been stopped here as it has been, the British Army would have been much the better by at least some men—I will not venture to say how many—and their money's worth would have been received in picked local recruits.

“ In conclusion I wish to add my humble voice to that of speakers who have preceded me in thanking Your Lordship for what you have done for us all. I do not wish to use any set phrases, but I do wish to say that though I believe Your Lordship to be too large-minded to resent any difference of opinion in this Council, I do not think that there is anyone in this country who does not understand and appreciate the spirit in which Your Lordship has acted in this country; and I wish to thank you, my Lord, on behalf of myself and my community, most heartily and most sincerely that I am able to address you from this place today.”

The Hon'ble MR. MAZHARUL HAQUE said:—“ My Lord, the details of the Financial Statement were so thoroughly and exhaustively discussed in the committee stage that I thought that no room was left for discussion on the Budget in its final form. But the turn—the startling and unexpected turn,—this debate has assumed in this Council has convinced me that human ingenuity has no limit, and can have no limit, in bringing inconceivable subjects under the purview of financial administration. Apart from the repetition and reiteration of the same arguments on irrigation, education,—primary and technical,—railway expenditure and what not, we had the pleasure of hearing the congratulations to the Secretary of State on the elevation of a natural leader of the people to the high post of an executive member of a Provincial Government. We had further the edification of listening to a grave and serious indictment of the Government of India in effecting the partition of Bengal, the great wrong and the terrible injustice that had been done to the people by this iniquitous measure, and an eloquent and pathetic appeal to Your Excellency to undo it. My Lord, I was prepared for a prolonged debate, but I confess that I did not imagine such subjects creeping into a discussion of the Financial Statement. I also find that most of the members here, both officials and non-officials, have had to say something on the general topics of the country. Well, I think, Sir, that I should be perhaps failing in my duty if I too did not speak on this occasion although till very late yesterday evening I did not intend to speak at all. So I crave the indulgence of this Council for a very few minutes—I shall not trespass on its patience for very long.

“ My Lord, before I deal with the subject before this Council—the Budget—I desire to enter my most solemn and emphatic protest against the scene, the

[30TH MARCH 1910.] [*Mr. Mazharul Haque; Mr. Dadabhoj; President.*]

undignified scene, which we all so unwillingly witnessed in this Council yesterday. No less than four times Your Lordship pronounced the discussion on the partition of Bengal as out of order; but disregarding all the respect due to Your Excellency, and unmindful of the dignity of this great assembly, the speech was finished to the last sentence, even to the last word. The rules provide that the moment the President rises the member speaking shall resume his seat—I am sorry to say, my Lord, that this rule has not been observed up to this time by any one here—and that the ruling of the chair on a point of order shall be final. If the rules are not properly observed or observed only in their breach, I am afraid this Council will degenerate into a gathering of unruly schoolboys.

“The Hon’ble MR. DADABHOJ: “I rise to a point of order, Your Excellency. This is a matter for Your Excellency to decide. I do not think it is a matter which falls within the province of any other member to comment on.”

His Excellency THE PRESIDENT:—“I do not think the Hon’ble Member is out of order.”

The Hon’ble MR. MAZHARUL HAQUE:—“I thank Your Lordship. Playing to the gallery may be a fine and pleasant pastime, but when it involves the loss of our self-respect and dignity then it becomes rather a questionable proceeding. I hope and trust that in future we shall observe the rules and abide by the rulings of the chair. My Lord, I yield to none in this Council in freely, boldly, and if need be and if the interests of my country demand it even strongly, criticising Government measures; but there must be a limit to everything, and I draw the line when the decorum and dignity of this Council is at stake. But enough of this unsavory and unpleasant topic. I proceed to the consideration of the budget and the criticisms of the Hon’ble Members.

“My Lord, the dominating note of the discussion both in the committee stage and in yesterday’s debate was a demand from both the non-official and official members for money—for more money. Among the non-official members the first place must of course be given to my Hon’ble friend Mr. Gokhale. He demands a few crores to be distributed over a number of years for primary education, and I confess that my sympathies are entirely with him on this point. I would curtail many of the expenditures in the Budget. I would go even to the length of imposing fresh taxation for this urgent reform. If it be heresy to plead for free primary education for my people, I plead guilty to the charge, and am ready and willing to take the consequences. Then my Hon’ble friend

Mr. Dadabhoy wants 50 lakhs for his irrigation scheme. Again there is my Hon'ble friend Mr. Mudholkar with his one crore for a polytechnic institute, and also a modest sum of 6 lakhs for education and sanitation in his own Province—the Central Provinces and Berar. My Lord, as regards this last demand I would ask Your Lordship to give him a Legislative Council of his own and have done with it. This will save us in future from entering into the field of purely Provincial finance. My Lord, the official members from the different provinces are no better in this incessant and persistent demands for funds. This Council must have been struck with the fact that the official members one after the other got up and claimed for their own particular Province the distinction of being the most economical Province in the whole of India. My Hon'ble friend Mr. Fenton, whose forcible representation of the case of his Province we all so much admired yesterday, and whose speech was so excellent in every respect but for an unkind reference to the utterances in this Council of my absent friend the Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya, proved to his own and I believe to the satisfaction of most of us that the Punjab was the most economical Province and was in great need of money. Well, I must say that he had converted me to his own views until I heard my Hon'ble friend Mr. Lyon, the champion of the new Province—the *bete noir* of all the other Provinces—and I hold fast to the view, until I am converted by some other official member, that the Province of Eastern Bengal and Assam, in spite of the numerous attacks upon its finances, is really the most economical Province in this financially distracted country. My Lord, I do not pretend to be an authority on the finances of the country, but if my Hon'ble friend Sir Guy Fleetwood Wilson has experienced one-thousandth part of the perplexities of these demands and counter-demands that I have experienced, I can only say that I do not envy his position; I would not like to be in his place for anything in this world. My Lord, I am positive that the sympathies of my Hon'ble friend are entirely with the people of this country, and he would have liked to meet their demands in full; but the great spending departments of the Government of India are so many obstacles in his way. They are constantly hammering at his door and he, like the kindhearted gentleman that he is, cannot refuse them admittance.

“ My Lord, fresh taxes have been imposed upon the country in a normal year and two reasons have been assigned for this unusual course. The first is the contraction in the opium-revenue and the second the expenditure consequent upon the creation of the new Province. I need not speak much on the first point, because it has now been admitted that no country has any right to traffic in and benefit from the immoral habits of another country. As my friend Mr. Gokhale so well said the other day, that so long we

[30TH MARCH 1910.]

[*Mr. Mazharul Haque.*]

have benefited from this traffic, and it is only just and right that we should bear the loss now.

“As regards the expenditure in the new Province I am aware that I am treading on delicate ground. My Lord, this is neither the proper time nor the fit occasion for a full discussion of the subject of the partition of Bengal. Your Lordship has ruled it out of order as irrelevant. I wish that my Hon'ble friend Mr. Bhupendra Nath Basu, whom I am sorry to find absent from his place today, had brought this question in the form of a resolution and invited this Council to pronounce its verdict by presenting it to a division. Then and then alone the country would have been able to fully judge of the views held by the several parties to this question. As yet the people unaffected by this measure, and for that matter the British public itself, have heard only one side of the question. The other side has not been heard at all. But the time is coming, and soon coming, when the other side will also be heard, and that in no uncertain voice.

“My Lord, let us turn to the financial aspect of this question. Before the creation of the new Province the outlying parts of the old Province were shamefully neglected. My own Province of Behar was incessantly crying for money to carry on some of the much-needed improvements and reforms; but the invariable excuse was lack of funds. Behar is the most densely populated part of the two Provinces—as a matter of fact I might say of the whole of India. From being one of the richest and healthiest Provinces it has become the poorest and the most unhealthy. Now it is the centre of famine, plague and malaria. The case of my co-religionists from Eastern Bengal—and there are no less than 18 millions of Muhammadans in Eastern Bengal—has been so well put and so eloquently pleaded by my Hon'ble friend Maulvi Shamsul Huda, that I need not go over the same ground. Before the partition the Beharis and the Muhammadans of Eastern Bengal were simply hewers of wood and drawers of water. They had no voice, no influence in their own country. Calcutta and a few other districts had simply sucked our life-blood. But all this is changed and changing every day. If Bengal Proper has become self-conscious, we Beharis have also become self-conscious and are vigilant and alert in asserting and protecting our rights and interests.

“My Lord, my Province requires financial help, which has now become possible. We heard yesterday about injustice involved in this administrative measure. Injustice indeed! It is for those parts of the Province which have been starved up to this time to complain of injustice and not for the hitherto

[*Mr. Mazharul Haque; Sardar Partab Singh.*] [30TH MARCH 1910.]

pampered pets of Government. My Lord, you cannot have good and efficient government without paying for it. I ask this Council whether it is safe to keep the teeming millions of Behar and Eastern Bengal steeped in ignorance and darkness for lack of funds? Is it fair, is it just? Do we not pay our fair proportion of taxes? Then why should we not derive proportionate benefits? My Lord, on the strength of the views of Lord MacDonnell, the partition of Bengal has been called a blunder and Your Excellency has been invited to undo it. I, on the other hand, knowing and realizing full well the responsibility that attaches to the utterance of a member of this Council, most emphatically assert that if the Government meddled with this beneficent measure it would be committing an act of supreme folly. It would be creating serious discontent and unrest where none exist now.

"A few words more, my Lord, and I have done. I beg to repeat my congratulations to my Hon'ble friend the Finance Minister for producing a budget which is certainly the best that could be produced under the circumstances. I sympathise with him in being compelled to impose fresh taxation, but at the same time rejoice with him in arranging it in such a manner that the burden will fall lightly, if at all, on the poorer classes, and I wish him a prosperous Budget for the next year, in the hope—and I hope my Hon'ble friend will remember these words—that he will be able to give a sympathetic hearing to the numerous representations of the non-official members of this Council. I do not want crores, but only a sympathetic consideration of our requests.

"My Lord, my final appeal is to Your Excellency personally. We Indians are not ungrateful people and cannot forget all the good that Your Excellency has done to our country. I hope, my Lord, that in your well-earned retirement and rest from the cares and anxieties of State, Your Lordship will forgive my country some of the deplorable incidents that have recently occurred and that Your Excellency will sometimes remember old India."

The Hon'ble SARDAR PARTAB SINGH said:—"My Lord, I have no intention of joining the band of critics who have assailed the Hon'ble the Finance Member, although his conscience, where Punjab finances are concerned, must be somewhat uneasy. I do not intend to depart from the purely defensive attitude adopted by my Hon'ble Colleague, the official representative of my Province; but that attitude, my Lord, is not inconsistent with the expression of an intimation that we are willing to receive any subvention that may come our way, and we will raise no objection if the Hon'ble Finance Member conveys it in the form of 'conscience money'."

[30TH MARCH 1910.] [*Sir Guy Fleetwood Wilson; Sardar Partab Singh.*]

The Hon'ble SIR GUY FLEETWOOD WILSON: "The Finance Member, if I may be permitted to say so, is usually in receipt of conscience money; he does not pay it."

The Hon'ble SARDAR PARTAB SINGH: "Nor do I propose to raise the question of Lord Curzon's partition of Bengal even from the financial point of view, though they do appear to have been making rather a mess of it in the new province, across our border, judging from the latest news from Peshawar. The Peshawar riots, however suggest a reply to the Hon'ble Mr. Lyon who has twitted us about the number of our police. I am afraid, my Lord, that the character of the people of Northern India is such that they are rather given to breaking each others' heads. Were this practice of settling disputes abandoned in favour of that more in vogue in Eastern Bengal, our police bill would no doubt be less and our court-fee income more. It should be remembered, moreover, that there is a good deal of what may be called hereditary crime still in the Punjab—blood-feuds and cattle-thieving. The time is not long past when cattle-raiding was a profession for gentlemen, as it once was on the Scottish border, and in the more remote parts of the Province hereditary proclivities are wont to survive. Finally, as regards the number of our police, do we not, my Lord, give a home to the Government of India for seven months of the year, and must we not take measures to protect them? I have referred to the vogue for litigation in Eastern Bengal. I am afraid that the growth of the litigious spirit in the Punjab too has become very marked. There is something wrong about our judicial system. The Criminal Procedure Code was designed for the protection of accused persons at a time when the position of the legal profession in the country was not a very prominent one. Now our friends the lawyers have become so powerful, that it is the Courts and Magistrates who require protection. The prolongation of proceedings in criminal cases has become a public scandal, and, it is needless to say, costs the tax-payer a very heavy sum indeed. When, as is often now said, the judicial has come to overshadow the executive, it should not be forgotten that the judicial may be entirely in the hands of our lawyer friends. The Punjab is the last province in which the transfer of power from the executive to the judicial should be allowed, and for this reason I would appeal to the Hon'ble the Home Member to give his support to the proposals of the Local Government for bettering the position of the executive side of the Provincial Civil Service. The Extra Assistant Commissioners employed on executive work are at present at a very considerable disadvantage in the matter of pay and prospects as compared with those in the judicial line. The betterment of their position will cost nothing to Imperial finances because the Punjab Government, I believe, bear all the cost.

[Sardar Partab Singh; Lieutenant Malik Umar Hyat [30TH MARCH 1910.
Khan.]

"I cannot conclude these remarks, my Lord, without expressing the gratitude of my province, and especially the aristocracy of my province, to Your Excellency for the kind and gracious interest which you have always shown for us. It is not long time when we were organizing the Punjab Chiefs Association, and I can never forget Your Excellency's kind help and encouragement to me in the work which I had before me then, and I can assure Your Excellency that after Your Excellency is settled in your country and in your home there, Your Excellency's name will ever be remembered with affection and with respect by the aristocracy of the Punjab.

"My Lord, my friend the Hon'ble Mr. Mazharul Haque, referring to the remark made by the Maharaja of Burdwan in connection with the appointment of the Maharaja of Bobbili to the Executive Council of Madras, has referred in a sarcastic way to the words used by the Maharaja of Burdwan, 'the aristocracy being the natural leaders of the people in this country.' My Lord, all I wish to say is that time alone will prove whether they are or not."

The Hon'ble LIEUTENANT MALIK UMAR HYAT KHAN said;—"My Lord, as the time at our disposal is short I have given up the idea of touching on certain important subjects. In the beginning I wanted to bring them to the notice of Government either by way of questions, or resolutions. But when I found that they did not suit the current financial circumstances, I thought they would involve a useless waste of time, energy, and also money which is spent on these enlarged Councils.

"Yesterday I meant to discuss many subjects, but as a good number of them have already been dealt with by the Hon'ble Members in their various speeches I have carefully avoided their repetition.

"Knowing that Your Excellency was going to give me a chance on this Council I have been carefully studying the budget speeches for the last few years, which so impressed me that I could not make out why the Government could not see its way to accept certain useful and necessary proposals urged by certain Members.

"However, seeing things closely now, I have found out that all the different heads in the budget for which certain sums have been allotted have been first carefully considered by the heads of the various departments and then thoroughly examined by the Hon'ble Finance Member; and although the budget is an approximate estimate and thus open to discussion, yet I think that only small and

[30TH MARCH 1910.] [*Lieutenant Malik Umar Hyat Khan.*]

reasonable changes can generally be possible in it, and any offhand criticism may be based on defective information, as one can plainly see from the sweeping changes proposed by taking crores from one head and thus ruining it, and putting crores under the other favourite one for which the critic's mind may have been prejudiced. We do not object to wholesome criticisms which may sometimes prove very helpful, if they be based on strong grounds, by equally considering and balancing the necessities of all different heads.

“ My Lord, there are only two points I want to briefly mention to-day.

“ The first is that there is a change most necessarily required of making such alterations in those sections of the Indian Penal Code which deal with the offences against the State as to make them more stringent, and I think the Government will have to do this sooner or later as a preventive measure, and I hope it will not wait to be able to make a strong case by giving illustrations as my Hon'ble friend Sir Herbert Risley, who had to show strong reasons by giving a string of illustrations to justify his introduction of the Press Bill. My Lord, I can see the thickening of clouds and am sorry to differ with the opinion that everything has passed off.

“ I should like to ask Your Lordship to redress every grievance if possible by inviting public opinion in such a way that the interests of one community may not suffer or clash with the other. I must ask for funds even if there be very little available at present for the appointment of a Commission or Committee to inquire into the causes of present discontent and the grievances of individuals as well of communities, and to suggest plans how to remedy all this and to hear petitions directly sent to them which would place that body in possession of real matters on a large scale. In this way much good can be done, and even the aggrieved and dissatisfied, whose troubled minds cannot rest without doing something or other, may give vent to their feelings and be relieved to some extent, and any money spent in this direction will be well spent.

“ At the same time I strongly urge that we should award severe punishment to State offenders and for the suppression of open and subterranean currents of sedition. In connection with this, though I know a good bit has already been done in that direction, I should ask the Government to be still more liberal in increasing the power and scope of the Criminal Intelligence Department. I know, my Lord, that at this stage the expenses incurred on my above suggestion would be more useful than any other scheme, be it railway, irrigation, productive or non-productive, debatable or non-debatable, as all these schemes are meant

[Lieutenant Malik Umar Hyat Khan.] [30TH MARCH 1910.]

for ordinary life and prosperity, while the redress of grievances appeals to sentiments and to the mind which sometimes decides at the spur of the moment to bring a speedy end to itself in whatever best financial and prosperous circumstances it may be.

“My Lord, I shall now briefly touch on the other point, that is, our present system of education. But as it was thoroughly discussed the other day, I do not like to go into the details. I shall come to the conclusion at once and again ask for a most needed fund to appoint a Commission, not to devise means to put big schemes into operation, but entirely for a different purpose, that is, to suggest some definite and useful changes in the present system of education, the curriculums of our schools and colleges, and the time for school hours and for the introduction of technical education on an improved scale. My Lord, this scheme will not require so large a sum of money as was calculated the other day, but only a portion of the sum budgeted under Education in the current estimate.

“My Hon'ble Colleague the Maharaja of Burdwan has said all that I wished to say about the chief causes of sedition, and I only suggest this as a possible remedy.

“No number of higher or lower grades of service along with the increased technical education would absorb the overflow of students, and that only would be a temporary relief up to some extent.

“I should like to see some changes introduced in the course of teaching as would suit the ancestral occupation of the students. At present a boy is required to sit for 5 or 6 hours in the school and spend the best portion of the day there and then in cramming his prescribed lessons and exercises. In old times there existed a system in India, the old *maktab* system, which was very useful and suited to the requirements of the country and its people. Lessons and preparations all had to be done there and then in the presence of the teacher, which saved the trouble of reference to books and dictionaries, and the rest of the time the boys could use for their own occupation. The above times were chosen as not to interfere in their daily work in life. My Lord, I have said the above in the way of a suggestion, I do not insist that all this be taken up at once; I shall only urge that these proposals be given a full consideration whenever funds are available, and my only appeal is, the sooner the better. If, however, these necessities can be met with by any means other than those I have suggested, I shall be quite satisfied.

“Now a few words in conclusion to thank Your Excellency for granting a representation to the dumb masses on the Council. The small class which

[30TH MARCH 1910.] [*Lieutenant Malik Umar Hyat Khan.*]

had already got a number of voices and by making them constantly heard brought on a large reduction in its own taxation by curtailing the rights of others by the virtue of possessing and thus being able to put in more and able spokesmen to fight its cause.

“But, my Lord, we are contented, we are happy and satisfied. We may eventually calmly, quietly and without making any fuss submit for consideration of the Government an equilibrium of taxation and a few other minor differences which exist between the agriculturists and non-agriculturists, and in this way we earnestly ask the support of Government that our low voices should not be hampered by the strong combination of higher and louder voices. We are thankful to them when they try to help us, but as they are not in constant touch with us their help is not always beneficial.

“Lastly, I have to thank Your Excellency on behalf of the landowning classes, for the keen interest Your Lordship has taken in our welfare and for the countless benevolent measures adopted for our good, among which may be mentioned the vetoing by Your Excellency of the last Colony Bill, which has saved them from many unnecessary expenses and which I had the honour to oppose on the Punjab Council, and the passing of the Punjab Land Alienation Act, which was a most statesmanlike step and has since proved a great success and has saved landowners from the strong clutches of the money-lenders and the benefits of which will be reaped by generations, and which I should like to see sooner or later applied to sister Provinces wherever it may be needed. My Lord, I am glad to say that the Punjab peasantry, the chief recruiting ground of the Indian Army, has always remained thoroughly loyal and trustworthy, and I can assure Your Lordship that we shall always remain such and shall be ever ready to run down the British enemies wherever they may be, as we have been doing since about the commencement of the British Raj in India; and I strongly support the views of my Hon'ble Colleague Mr. Fenton who in the speech of the season has been able to impress the necessity of more money for the Punjab. We have brought under cultivation vast tracts of waste land and provided labour for the canal works, and have brought prosperity to India, and it is only natural that we should be rewarded for it.

“I congratulate our Finance Member on the budget as a whole, but one would not like to be in his position, particularly on the dates of budget debates. I would have liked to say something on the present taxation, but my Hon'ble friend Shamsul Huda has left nothing to be desired.

[*Lieutenant Malik Umar Hyat Khan; Nawab Saiyid Muhammad Sahib Bahadur.*] [30TH MARCH 1910.]

"At the end, my Lord, while thanking Your Excellency for all you have done for our country in the way of reforms, etc., etc., and for seeing them through along with innumerable acts.

"We all feel sorry that Your Excellency's term of office is coming to a close. Being able to know my own heart better, I think I feel it most strongly.

"But, my Lord, we have got one consolation. We know that Your Excellency's heart will be always with us.

"May Your Lordship live long to support our cause in England and prosper."

The Hon'ble NAWAB SAIYID MUHAMMAD SAHIB BAHADUR said:—"My Lord, with Your Lordship's permission I beg to offer a few observations and that very briefly. While speaking on the Budget in past years I drew the attention of the Government among other things to the imperative necessity of effecting retrenchment in the various departments. The Hon'ble Sir Edward Baker agreed with me in the suggestion, but he said that the growing needs of India will not permit of any large reductions being made. Last year the Hon'ble Sir Guy Fleetwood Wilson was silent on the point. But I am very glad my Hon'ble friends Mr. Gokhale and Mr. Subba Rao pressed the matter in the course of the present discussion. The matter is one of great urgency, and as I do not wish to minimise its importance I again bring it to the notice of the Government. My Lord, according to the well-known saying, economy is itself a great income. If the Government is able to effect retrenchment and apply the savings to the many useful purposes which were suggested during the current session, without having recourse to fresh taxation, the people will be thankful to the Government.

"My Lord, it is my pleasant duty to associate myself with the remarks that have fallen from several of my Hon'ble colleagues—remarks that are full of thankfulness and gratitude to Your Excellency. You have, my Lord, generously given the best in you to the people of this country, and I beg to take this opportunity of expressing the extreme gratitude of the people of my Presidency which I have the honour to represent. At the same time I give expression to the feelings of regret at the prospect of Your Lordship's approaching departure from this country.

"Now, my Lord, coming to a subject touched upon by my Hon'ble friend Mr. Bhupendra Nath Basu, I am very sorry to say that he spoke on the much

[30TH MARCH 1910.] [*Nawab Saiyid Muhammad Sahib Bahadur; Mr. Robertson.*]

discussed question of the partition of Bengal in the first Budget debate of this reconstituted and greatly enlarged Council. I confess am obliged to refer to this matter and cannot help expressing my own opinion on such an important question.

“ My Hon'ble friend is aware that this question has been regarded as a settled fact by the highest authorities, and I therefore think it is futile to attempt to re-open it, from an administrative point of view. The people who are closely concerned and affected by the measure both financially and otherwise are the people of East Bengal, and according to what has fallen from my Hon'ble friend Syed Shamsul Huda it seems to me that the people of that Province are quite content with the present state of affairs and would be opposed to any change. I recognise that the people of Bengal were opposed to the partition and it was carried against their will, which the Hon'ble Member said has brought on financial disaster. But, my Lord, that is no reason why such an act should be repeated against the wishes of the people of the new Province, which I am afraid will bring on a still greater financial disaster and many administrative difficulties.

“ In conclusion, I beg to congratulate the Hon'ble the Finance Member for placing before this Council what may be called on the whole to be a satisfactory Budget.”

The Hon'ble MR. ROBERTSON said:—“ My Lord, it has been customary at the closing meeting of the session for the members in charge of the different departments of the Government of India to pass in review the leading features of the year's administration. The increased facilities for debate which now obtain render it unnecessary to continue this practice, and I shall not incur the risk of being called to order by Your Excellency by attempting to enter upon any general dissertation on the subjects which have engaged our attention during the past year. In the few remarks which I have to make, I therefore propose to confine myself to one or two questions affecting the Department of Commerce and Industry which arise from what has been said by previous speakers.

“ I shall take first the speech of the Hon'ble Mr. Chitnavis. I hardly expected that it would be necessary to refer to the policy of Government in industrial matters after the full discussion which took place in the Council on Wednesday last on the subject of technical education. We had then the theory strongly put forward that what India wanted was the highest possible instruction in the industrial arts. Today we have had other panaceas suggested for the industrial ailments

of the country, ranging from strong measures of protection to the subsidising of capitalists by Government and the starting of Government factories. On the first of these remedies this is hardly the occasion to enter into a discussion, but I wish to say something about the further suggestions of my Hon'ble friend. If I understand him aright, he would have Government come to the rescue and draw out capital for investment in industrial enterprise by means of subsidies, and further start model factories to show the way in the working of new manufactures. His object is one which I quite understand. He says, do not turn out highly trained young men before there are openings for their talent, or they will be idle and discontented and may become a source of anxiety to Government. Now I think there is a great deal in this, and it bears out the points that were made by the Hon'ble Sir Harvey Adamson in last Wednesday's debate. The policy of Government, as then explained, is by all means to advance industrial study, but to do it on cautious and practical lines suited to the needs of the country.

"But when I come to the measures which my friend has proposed for the industrial regeneration of India, I fear that it is impossible for me to agree with him. Unless I am mistaken in regard to his suggestions, I gather that the subsidies that he would give are to be particularly ear-marked for inducing Indians to enter the field. He surely cannot in fairness expect that Government could take up such a position. I am further surprised that he should have such a poor opinion of the business capabilities of Indians as to think it necessary that they should have to be led by the hand in the manner he suggests. In his own part of the country there are commercial undertakings which are most successfully managed by his countrymen without any question of Government subsidy or Government leading. He has heard of the great Empress Cotton Mills at Nagpur, which are managed by an Indian, and which no less an authority than Sir John Hewett in his opening speech at the Naini Tal Industrial Conference has described as the model of what a cotton mill ought to be. He must also have heard of the growth of the manganese mining industry in the Central Provinces in which Indians have taken a not unimportant part. If examples for the encouragement of enterprise are wanted, these are some, and I think the Hon'ble gentleman may take it that they are better examples than could ever be furnished by Government subsidized or Government managed concerns.

"And with regard to this second suggestion of Government management, the Hon'ble Member must surely recognise how difficult, if not impossible it would be for Government to conduct a business of the nature and on the scale he advocates on a strictly commercial basis. I, for one, am sure that it would be

[30TH MARCH 1910.] [Mr. Robertson; Mr. Miller.]

most unlikely to serve as an object lesson to a nervous capitalist. There are ways in which Government can help the industries of India: these have been referred to on previous occasions in this Council and I shall not detail them now. But the Hon'ble Member must recognise that there is a point at which Government assistance must stop and the enterprise of the people take its part.

"The Hon'ble Sir Vithaldas Thackersey has mentioned the new Factory Bill and has made the suggestion that the recommendations of the Factory Commission have been set aside under orders from England. The Hon'ble Member no doubt refers to the proposal to limit the hours of adult male labour which has been embodied in the draft of the Bill. I can assure him that he is mistaken as to this. The decision that direct limitation of the working hours of men was necessary in the circumstances of India was taken by the Government of India without any suggestion from home, and it was taken after very full consideration of the subject and with the very general concurrence of the Provincial Governments. In this connection the Council will perhaps expect to be informed of the stage at which this Bill has arrived. It will be remembered that it was introduced in Council on the 30th July last, when the Hon'ble Mr. Harvey explained at some length the main provisions of the measure. It was then referred for the opinions of Local Governments and others interested in the subject, prior to reference to a Select Committee. The opinions of Local Governments were not, however, all received till the middle of January. The Bill is an elaborate measure and the numerous points raised require careful and mature consideration. It would have been quite impossible in the circumstances for a Select Committee to complete or even do more than commence their deliberations on the Bill in the short time at our disposal this session, and the Bill has therefore had to stand over till the Council meets next cold weather."

The Hon'ble MR. MILLER said:—"My Lord, the Hon'ble Mr. Mazharul Haque complained of the irrelevancy of some of the subjects that have been introduced into our debate yesterday and today. This is no doubt true, but I think that no one who has had any experience of the proceedings of the old Council will fail to agree that, while the discussion has as usual, and as is almost inevitable, ranged over a very wide variety of subjects, still there has been a distinct tendency—a noticeable tendency, to confine it more closely than before to matters that are connected, though that connection may sometimes be slight, with the finances of the country. There have been some exceptions, but I propose to follow the general example and to confine myself today strictly to matters arising out of the Budget. Looking back over the various discussions we have had this session, I am not sure that there is not a good deal in them that may give the

Finance Member cause for apprehension. It is true, that recently a great deal has been said, and very rightly said, about the necessity for economy, but in the discussions which have passed we have had many suggestions made that show how strong the tendency will be in future for the expenditure of the country to develop at a rapid and perhaps at an almost alarming pace. The claims of education in general and of technical education in particular, the claims of irrigation and of sanitation, these have been urged with great force and with arguments against which there is little to oppose except the argument of finance. At the same time, it is pointed out, and the official members have shown us, how inevitable it is that the expenditure of the Civil Departments will go on increasing. I think myself, as far as I can forecast the future, that there are bound to be further increases in those departments, both on account of the demands for greater efficiency and because the rise of prices and other causes tend to throw always increasing charges upon the Government. It is all very well to talk jestingly of 'efficiency' with a capital 'E.' I understand that efficiency with a capital E means a bureaucratic efficiency, efficiency such as all the departments wish to achieve; and efficiency without a capital E means real and genuine efficiency such as commends itself to the particular speaker. But I am not, certain, my Lord, whether the demands of the latter class of efficiency will not involve us in just as heavy expenditure as the former, and I am quite certain, looking to the conditions under which the administration of this country is carried on, that you will not have efficiency in the wider sense without a good deal of the efficiency in the departmental sense. Having in view all these causes that must tend to increase the expenditure in this country in the future, I am in entire agreement with those who attach the greatest importance to the observance of economy. I think it is hardly possible to over-rate the importance of a strict attention to economy in all branches of the administration of India. It is necessary in all countries that expenditure by the State should be closely scrutinized, and it is certainly no less necessary in India than elsewhere.

"In the departments with which I am more particularly concerned, reference has been made to the question of restricting expenditure on settlements, of spending money more freely on irrigation, and of taking up more vigorously the question of the supply of cattle. I propose only to make a very few remarks on these points. The simplification of settlement procedure is an object to which the Government of India has always attached the very greatest importance. There is hardly any temporarily settled province in which much has not been done to simplify and shorten the procedure and to prevent the inevitable harrassment to which settlement proceedings must temporarily always give rise. I do not however think that we are likely to

[30TH MARCH 1910.]

[Mr. Miller.]

attain to the ideal which the Hon'ble Mr. Mudholkar placed before us yesterday. I doubt if it will ever be possible to vary assessments solely with reference to changes in prices. There are very great difficulties in this matter. It has been discussed much in the past; I have no doubt it will be discussed again in the future, and I certainly do not propose to detain the Council by going into the subject at any length today. My own opinion is that, while simplification is in every way desirable, it is not likely to be carried so far as the Hon'ble Member suggested yesterday. At the same time the Council and the Government ought to think very seriously before foregoing the system of periodical investigation, and if necessary of periodical re-valuation, which has been handed down to us in this country, and which other countries now seem to show a desire to emulate.

"Regarding cattle, I have explained on more than one occasion that the Government of India and Local Governments are fully alive to the importance of this question. The problem was very fully discussed in all its bearings at the Conference held at Lucknow last year, and I should like to refer my Hon'ble friend Mr. Chitnavis to the conclusions that were then arrived at by a very large and very representative Committee. I have explained to him before how the question of a cattle survey stands, and I will only say now that I think he would on reflection admit that an attempt to make a census of cattle at the same time as the ordinary census of this country would be attended with very great difficulties and probably with an expense which the result would not justify.

"In regard to irrigation, there is a very substantial amount of agreement between my friend Mr. Dadabhoj and myself, though unfortunately we always seem to express ourselves differently. The works in which the Central Provinces are interested are works which must, under existing arrangements, be financed from revenue. That is the actual position and I at least must take account of actual facts. The amount made available for financing those works is now not sufficient to carry on the programme of protective works at the pace at which our engineers are able to undertake it. Up to a year ago, it was sufficient, but that is no longer the case. We have, however, as the Council has been informed by my Hon'ble friend Mr. Jacob, been discussing arrangements for making a larger sum available under which we shall be able to undertake a larger programme and to carry it through more quickly. I am quite aware that it has been a great disappointment to the administration in the Central Provinces that they have not been able to start work on the one great scheme which has been sanctioned for that Province, the Tendula Canal; but it would be useless to start work unless we could look forward with some confidence to carrying it through uninterruptedly.

I hope we shall soon be in this position, and that if the state of the finances improves, as we all hope, that we shall be able to sanction the beginning of this work. The Government of India fully recognise that this is a work from which very great benefits are likely to be derived in a tract a great part of which has suffered severely from famine. We also recognise that, through it is classed as a protective work, it is on the very verge of being a productive work, and that any improvement in the rates which the people may be willing to pay for water or any other improvement in the financial position may bring it into the productive category. For that reason we are anxious, if possible, to see it start. My Hon'ble friend Mr. Phillips has suggested that a grant of three lakhs would be exceedingly useful at the present time. I cannot of course make any promise that such a sum will be found, but I may say that his remarks on this subject will be considered. The question of course whether any grant can be made or not will depend to some extent on the arrangements that can be made for carrying on the work.

“ I have listened with much interest, my Lord, to the tale of the hardships of the various Local Governments and to the competition as to which should be given the lowest place. I once belonged to a very sorely afflicted Local Government myself. I had some responsibility for its financial arrangements, and I must admit that I held very strong views on the subject at that time, so strong that I do not know that I could refer to the proceedings of those days now with the reserve and impartiality which are necessary in my position. I understand, from what my Hon'ble friend Mr. Holms has said, that the position in the United Provinces has very greatly improved, though I think he has some justification for not professing himself altogether content; and I observed with great interest that another Hon'ble Member who represents the Province of Bengal, and whose impartiality must therefore be unquestioned, had also a good deal to say about the finance of the United Provinces. We may, however, I think, give the palm for a forcible and picturesque representation of the difficulties of Local Governments to my Hon'ble friend Mr. Fenton. Nothing could well exceed the strength of the description which he has given of the position of the Punjab, and he made one or two remarks to which I should like to refer, though of course I have no intention of entering upon the general financial question as between the Imperial Government and the local one. The Hon'ble Member asked for a freer hand for his Local Government in its revenue policy. I need hardly say at this time, when the claims of decentralization are very much to the fore, that the necessity of giving Local Governments as free a hand as possible is not likely to be overlooked. At the same time, the Government

[30TH MARCH 1910.] [Mr. Miller ; Mr. Fenton.]

of India must maintain its control over general questions of policy, and I cannot myself understand how any control that the Government of India may exercise could have such serious results as the Hon'ble Member referred to on the spending departments of his Province. Nor am I quite sure of the accuracy of the Hon'ble Member's description in all other respects. Since he made his speech, he has been very liberally supplied with figures from other speakers, some of which must have suggested to him that there are other provinces where the hardships are scarcely less than they are in the Punjab, and perhaps he may have felt that he had overstated his own case. There is one statement in his description of the position that I fail to understand, though perhaps the fault may be my own. I do not know, and he has not explained in his speech, the exact meaning of his reference to the fact that of the assessments in the Canal Colonies, the Finance Member takes 15 annas and the Punjab is left with only one anna."

The Hon'ble Mr. FENTON: "My Lord, if time had permitted yesterday, I would have gone on to explain that, whatever the Punjab Government receives on account of irrigation revenue is virtually, and has been for some years past, and will for some years to come, be of the nature of a fixed assignment, a fixed assignment of 30½ lakhs neither more or less, which the Punjab gets on account of the profits of irrigation. When I said that the Punjab Government gets only one anna out of the assessment in the Chenab Colony, I excluded the irrigation revenue, because the Punjab share of the same does not depend on the actual assessments but is of the nature of a fixed assignment."

The Hon'ble Mr. MILLER:—"My Lord, I am still in the dark. I inquired as to what the division was, and I understood that both irrigation revenue and land-revenue were divided in the ratio of ten annas to the Imperial Exchequer and of six annas to the Provincial. What I have understood from the other remarks my Hon'ble friend made was that he wished to point out that out of the Provincial six annas, five annas were spent on the cost of administration. He mentioned those costs at some length, he referred to the question of jails, Magistrates, treasuries, expenses of collection and growth, and so on. I understood that five annas went to these, and that only one anna was left over; but I understand now that this is no the case."

The Hon'ble Mr. FENTON: "What I meant was this—that whatever the Punjab Government gets on account of irrigation is a fixed quantity, which does

[*Mr. Fenton ; Mr. Miller ; Sir Harvey Adamson.*] [30TH MARCH 1910.]

not vary from year to year, and that it is of the nature of a fixed assignment, an assignment of 30½ lakhs. Every year since the Provincial settlement came into operation the Government of India has had to make up the difference between the actual receipts and this fixed assignment; under such conditions it is not incorrect to regard all irrigation receipts as Imperial revenue, the Punjab share of the assessments being confined to three-eighths of the land-revenue."

The Hon'ble MR. MILLER:—"I do not see how the Hon'ble Member has proved his case, but I do not propose to say more about this particular calculation.

"The Hon'ble Mr. Phillips, in dealing with the finances of his Province, has carried us back to the times of large expenditure on famine. He gave a very interesting account of the manner in which the late famine was dealt with in the Central Provinces. The Government of India have already endorsed what he said about the efficiency and economy of those operations, and I need not add anything on the subject now. I only express personally the hope that the finances of the Province will not suffer in the long run.

"These allusions to famine carry us back to a time that is fortunately past. The budget of the present year makes no provision for similar expenditure; the reports from almost every part of the country are most satisfactory; and I trust that the year before us will not disappoint the promise with which it begins."

The Hon'ble SIR HARVEY ADAMSON said:—"I wish to say a word about what fell from the Hon'ble Mr. Haque about the regrettable incident that occurred yesterday. The Hon'ble Member spoke with disapprobation of the conduct of the Hon'ble Mr. Bhupendra Nath Basu in ignoring the ruling of His Excellency the President, but he exaggerated the wrong that was done when he said that the Hon'ble Mr. Basu had continued to the end of his irrelevant remarks. The Hon'ble Mr. Basu was prevented by the intervention of His Excellency the President from delivering more than two or three sentences of what he was prepared to say. The ruling of the chair was in fact enforced.

"The only point that has come up in this debate which requires an explanation from the Home Department is the separation of judicial and executive functions which has been referred to by the Hon'ble Mr. Dadabhoj and the Hon'ble Mr. Madge. The Hon'ble Mr. Dadabhoj has remarked that no provision has been made in the Budget for the separation of judicial and executive functions, and has enquired why the experiment which I outlined in this Council

[30TH MARCH 1910.] [*Sir Harvey Adamson; Sir Guy Fleetwood Wilson.*]

two years ago has been postponed. The scheme has not yet been submitted to the Secretary of State for three reasons. First, the reports of the Governments of Bengal and Eastern Bengal and Assam have shown that the experiment would cost considerably more than was anticipated, and as neither the Imperial Government nor the Local Governments are in a position to find the money the experiment must stand over. Second, it must be admitted that the scheme is regarded by influential sections of opinion in both provinces as calculated to weaken the power of the District Officer. The Hon'ble Mr. Madge has referred to this. The Government of India do not share this opinion, nor I may say does Sir Edward Baker. Nevertheless it is widely entertained by classes whose views are entitled to consideration. In the present condition of the provinces it is inexpedient to start a scheme regarding which there is so much diversity of opinion. Third, during the past two years crime of a political nature has overshadowed the peace of the two provinces, and in these conditions it is undesirable to make delicate experiments with the judicial system. I may add that something already is being done in the direction of separation in districts of Eastern Bengal and Assam to which additional District Magistrates have been appointed. I regret the postponement of the experiment, and I do not doubt that in more satisfactory conditions separation between the functions will eventually be carried out; but I fully concur in the reasons for the postponement."

The Hon'ble SIR GUY FLEETWOOD WILSON said:—"My Lord, I should like to give the speech of each individual Member the attention which it deserves, but the time at my disposal does not admit of my doing so. I shall therefore deal with the speeches by groups of subjects rather than with the speakers. There are one or two points as to which I must make an exception. The first relates to the prices enquiry which was referred to by the Hon'ble Member opposite.

"I thank the Hon'ble Mr. Dadabhoj for his kindly reference to me, but I must say quite candidly that it was with profound regret that I heard him discredit in advance the result of the enquiry which we have entrusted to one of his own countrymen. The difficulties which Mr. Datta will have to grapple with are sufficiently great, and it is neither just nor generous to decry the outcome of his labours. At any rate believe that our choice will be amply justified and that Mr. Datta's research will be of great value.

"I cannot pass unnoticed Mr. Chitnavis' advocacy of economy. I welcome it, thank him for it, but I must say in reply to his hope that I may devise a means for keeping down expenditure that, the reduction of expenditure rests with the

[*Sir Guy Fleetwood Wilson.*] [30TH MARCH 1910.]

Government of India as a whole and must be supported by the enlightened opinion, both English and Indian, in the country if it is to be effective.

"The Hon'ble Raja Partab Singh's speech was not delivered because I think he is not familiar with the English language. It is given in the papers this morning, and I only allude to it for the reason that the Hon'ble Member was not, I think, present when the budget was first discussed, and he cannot have been present at the subsequent discussions which took place when the various resolutions were gone over.

"He travels over the whole of the questions which in some cases had been voted upon. I hope I shall be forgiven if I say that this plan of re-discussing questions which have not only been the subject of resolutions but have been discussed very fully and actually voted upon, is one which, if I may be permitted to say so, would in some assemblies stand a good chance of being ruled out of order. I have only one remark to make as regards the Hon'ble Mr. Quin, who complained that he wanted a bigger piece of cloth as his coat was getting too small for him. May I suggest that instead of a frock coat, Mr. Quin should wear a more homely garment, such as a jacket. That is the principle which I should like Provincial Governments to work to.

"The Hon'ble Mr. Fenton's forcible speech was marked by great ability, and I am sorely tempted to deal with it as fully as it deserves.

"He began by conclusively proving that the Punjab is the perennial home of earthquakes, plague, pestilence and famine, and concluded by likening it to a shorn lamb which I, the cruel shearer, have turned out to starve in the cold.

"His eloquent peroration, which time did not admit of his delivering but which I have read with interest in this morning's paper, dealt mainly with sheep.

"I should be disposed to vary it somewhat and to say rather that the provinces appear to be not unlike fat sheep who having fallen on their backs are incessantly baaing to me to put them on their legs again. Indeed of all the flock the gentle lamb of Madras alone greets me with a friendly bleat.

"Mr. Fenton reproaches me with retaining 15 annas out of 1/5 every rupee. Bearing in mind some features of Punjab expenditure I can only say in the words of Clive that 'I marvel at my own moderation.'

"One of the most useful purposes which this discussion has served for many years is the opportunity it affords to provincial representatives (both official and

[30TH MARCH 1910.] [Sir Guy Fleetwood Wilson.]

non-official) of putting the financial needs and difficulties of their provinces before us in a friendly, temperate, able and, in some ways, informal manner. This feature of the discussion has been well maintained today and yesterday, and I have listened with much interest to the speeches of Hon'ble Members on the affairs of their respective provinces. I recognize much force in what they have told us; and I am sure we respect the patriotic zeal with which they have pressed their points. I can assure them that their views will be most carefully considered.

"The remarks which I made on provincial finance when presenting the Financial Statement may have been somewhat misunderstood. Nothing was further from my intention than to allot blame or to classify the provinces in any sort of financial order of merit. I have learned something of the difficulties of the provinces. They have less elasticity in their finances than the Imperial Government, for the simple reason that they have no independent powers of taxation. They have become committed to expenditure, which they find it difficult to curtail in a hurry. They have their times of calamity and forced retrenchment; and they are apt to think that the Central Government sometimes drives hard bargains with them. I recognize all this. I gladly make allowances for these difficulties, as I am sure that Local Governments make allowances for ours. For I confess I know of no more delicate task than that of weighing the claims of all the different provinces in this vast country with their varied history and their varied needs. This task in itself is heavy enough: but when we have to go a step further and balance the result with the claims of our Imperial services, then I say the allocation of funds between the Central and the Local Governments requires all the good temper, and all the tolerant give and take, of which we are collectively capable.

"My remarks on provincial finance last month were directed at another aspect of the case. We are losing our opium revenue: and heavy demands for new expenditure on education, sanitation, and so forth are being daily pressed upon us. In my judgment therefore we have reached a point at which we ought to stop and consider whether India can afford all that she has hitherto been aiming at. We may, as I have already suggested, be compelled to slacken the pace of our administration, or to seek for cheaper methods, or even to give up some sections of our governmental activities. I have no wish to prejudge the decision. But I would like Local Governments to see what is impending as clearly as I do myself, and to give them a friendly warning that they will have to bring their expenditure more directly into line with their income. I look on the position in this way. The Local Governments are our partners in the administration of the country; and I want to invite them as partners to co-operate with us

[*Sir Guy Fleetwood Wilson.*] [30TH MARCH 1910.]

in taking a clear view of the needs of the country, of what is requisite for its well-being, and how we are going to find the ways and means. After what he has seen and heard in this Council during the last two months, and after the insight he has gained into our general financial position, I do not think that any provincial representative can possibly go back to his Local Government and encourage them with hopes of large Imperial grants for general purposes. I trust that, on the contrary, he will explain how strongly the need for economy is felt in this Council, and how important it is for Local Governments to make common cause with the Imperial Government in securing it.

“It is with this view that I have laid emphasis on the danger of overstraining the provincial settlements, which are on the whole, I believe, adequate if worked with care and foresight. I do not pretend that the settlements are in all respects perfect. In particular I am impressed with the inconvenience of disproportionately large fixed assignments, if these exist. But I would remind the Council that this point and a number of kindred points were commended to our attention by the Royal Commission on Decentralization, and it would be premature to express any opinion on those points until they are fully examined by us in consultation with Local Governments. I intend to take up the subject; and I can assure the speakers of today and yesterday that anything which tends to give Local Governments greater elasticity in the management of their finances will receive my most friendly consideration. But any general recasting of the existing settlements with a view solely to increasing the spending power of the provinces is, in my judgment, out of the question, and I can only end this subject as I began it, by a strong appeal to Local Governments to co-operate with us, on broad-minded and steadfast lines, in the pursuit of that economy without which there can be no real efficiency.

“Since I introduced the Budget on the 25th of February we have had a number of resolutions moved and forcibly and eloquently supported in Council. The predominant feature throughout the discussions has been a demand for largely increased expenditure.

“We have also had a series of speeches which in book form might be suitably entitled—‘What I shall do when I am Finance Member.’

“From that standpoint it has no doubt presented itself to the minds of the speakers that as money is not available money would have to be provided.

“Accordingly they have advanced a number of suggestions for very heavily adding to the burden of taxation.

[30TH MARCH 1910.] [*Sir Guy Flectwood Wilson.*]

"The Hon'ble Mr. Gokhale will not be offended if I say he has gone one better. He even advocates impairing our credit by ceasing all endeavours to reduce our debt.

"I think that must have been for Calcutta consumption.

"I want to be absolutely frank with the Hon'ble Members opposite whom I am glad indeed to claim as personal friends but whom I recognise also as fair and indulgent critics.

"I will tell then exactly what would happen if I yielded to their entreaties to put the heavy additional taxation which they advocate on their unfortunate fellow-countrymen. I do not know whether we should hear much about the benefit of improved sanitation or the blessings of technical colleges, but one thing I do know, and that is that from one end of India to the other Hon'ble Members would loudly proclaim that the additional taxation could quite well have been avoided and that the people may thank an extravagant and inept Government for the burden under which they are groaning. I should not presume to find fault with my Hon'ble friends for so doing. In politics you must play the game, and that would be a perfectly legitimate game to play; but they must not mind if I respectfully decline to take a hand in it. I do not wish to add to the heavy burden of taxation in the country. I would rather turn my thoughts towards economies.

"It is possible that you may have, in this country, been striving too vigorously to attain a policy of perfection. A policy of perfection is an excellent thing if you can afford it; but as is the case in regard to most other things you must cut your coat according to your cloth, and it is no good attempting to attain perfection if you have not the necessary funds wherewith to do it. Whilst we should keep a high ideal well before us, we must, I am afraid, be satisfied to go slower in that direction, for I am sure that it is absolutely essential to introduce greater sobriety in our public expenditure if we are to avoid deficits and consequent enhanced taxation.

"There is one subject on which all my non-official critics unite. Some of them think I have under-estimated the revenue: most of them would like to see more money provided for public health and education or whatever they specially support. But all of them agree that we spend too much on other purposes. In regard to the latter I wish to say at once that I personally am very desirous of seeing expenditure cut down. I do not of course accept everything that has been said on the subject to-day or yesterday. I demur particularly to any

comparisons which take us back to times before the closing of the Mints. I do not suggest that that event, like a magician's wand, altered the whole tenor of our finances; but it is a fact that, with stability of exchange—and probably in no small part as a result of it—began a period of remarkable prosperity in the affairs of this country. Commerce improved, political aspirations awoke, a higher standard of comfort came to the front, and as a necessary consequence both our revenue and expenditure were correspondingly affected. With the progress of the country and the constant demands upon Government to undertake duties which in other countries would largely be left to private enterprise or private liberality, the claims upon the public purse must of necessity grow. I do not wish on this occasion to say anything about our military expenditure, as it is only a year ago since a masterful exposition of that subject was given to the Council by Lord Kitchener. Similarly, I have nothing fresh to say about our railway expenditure, except to express the hope, in which I trust I shall be encouraged by Sir T. Wynne, that the large share of the earnings which is now being put back into the railways in the form of betterments will yield an adequate return.

“As regards the cost of the civil administration proper, I think that it requires very careful watching and that we must very seriously examine whether we are not committed to a standard of expenditure which will ultimately be beyond our means. Apart from opium, which seems to have reached a stage which knows no laws, we cannot expect our revenues to advance with the same rapidity as they did up to 1907. That alone would be a sufficient reason for steadying the pace of the increase in our charges. But over and above this, we have the fate of our opium-revenue in much uncertainty; and on the other hand, if we are going to do anything at all for education and industrial progress, we have heavy liabilities impending. However much therefore or however little we do for these new requirements, a readjustment of expenditure is in my opinion clearly indicated. How this is to be effected, is not a point on which I care to dogmatise today. We have been offered many prescriptions. We are told that the greater use of indigenous agency would tend to economy. We are told that Government might hand over a good deal of its work to local bodies and non-official effort. We are told that in some respects we have duplication of work and machinery which is unnecessarily elaborate for a simple country. I will say that on all these points there is a good deal on which my Hon'ble friends and myself will find ourselves in substantial agreement. But hasty economy is often false economy; and the particular directions in which we are asked to retrench require much thought. That thought will not be spared, and I am prepared to do what in me lies to press forward the consideration of this all important subject,

[30TH MARCH 1910.] [Sir Guy Fleetwood Wilson.]

With that assurance I would ask my Hon'ble friends to absolve me for today from a more detailed examination of the various suggestions which they have put forward.

"Turning for a minute to the question of the new taxes on silver, I am sure I would not be justified in taking up the Council's time with further remarks, after the very full examination to which the whole question was subjected in the debate on the Taxation Bills. I merely note that the opinion is repeated by my Hon'ble friend opposite that we could have reached equilibrium without any new taxation at all. Now, I am reasonably confident of this: that we could not have worked up to an adequate working balance on our old basis of taxation without taking a very much higher figure for opium than we did. I understand my Hon'ble friend would have been willing to see this done, and I agree with him that, in view of the excitement in the opium market, it would have involved no great risk to assume a selling-price considerably in excess of our budget figure. But should we be justified in putting our financial arrangements so largely at the mercy of a feverish speculation? And if the extra revenue is forced upon us, ought we not in prudence to set it apart in some way from our ordinary resources, and not be content to live upon what may virtually be vanishing capital? There is surely only one answer to such questions.

"Only one word more on taxation. I see that, in spite of all that was said by us to the contrary, there is still a good deal of head-shaking in certain quarters as to our real object in raising the duty on silver. I am glad that the Hon'ble Sir Sassoon David and Sir Vithaldas Thackersey are present, because I have secured an excerpt from that admirably conducted journal, *The Pioneer*, which I will with Your Lordship's permission read for the benefit of the Bombay Members:—

'The price of silver on Wednesday 23rd was two shillings an ounce, the figure at which it stood when the import-tax was imposed. Recovery has thus taken place in less than a month.'

"Incidentally I am glad to see that the price of silver, after a slight and we may hope a temporary fall, is now higher than it stood on the day before our Budget proposals were published; and I sincerely trust that this may be taken as a good omen that the fears of our Hon'ble Colleagues from Bombay as to the effect of the duty will not be realized. But this is a parenthesis. What I started to say was that we are still being assailed by gloomy hints that the silver duty is an insidious move in our currency policy. I

[*Sir Guy Fleetwood Wilson.*] [30TH MARCH 1910.]

wish categorically to correct that impression. If I had meant the new duty to be currency matter, I am not at all sure that I should have fixed it at 4 annas an ounce, and I am not at all sure that we should have used the proceeds as ordinary revenue. We anticipated some such criticisms, and for that reason we intentionally avoided all refinements, such as a sliding scale, which would give colour to the idea that we were manipulating silver for currency ends. We do not seem to have wholly succeeded in averting suspicion: and I can only repeat that the tax is meant to strengthen our revenue, and for revenue purposes only.

The Hon'ble Members for Bombay have on this and on previous occasions dealt with two subjects of superlative importance in this country, with what I may term commanding ability. The problems which have been burning questions in this country for many a long year are not perhaps problems which command quite equal attention at home. From sheer lack of knowledge I should not show to advantage were I to enter the lists with the Hon'ble Members on the more abstruse features of currency questions and the various bearings of the gold Currency Reserve. But it is not for that reason alone that I reduce my remarks to the narrowest limits. The whole matter is so closely interwoven with the Gold policy of England, that I thought it more useful to advance, if slowly, at any rate steadfastly, along the path which we wish to follow, to note what we have done, and to indicate what I really hope to accomplish, rather than to deliver myself of lengthy expositions of an academical character.

"One word as to the Gold Standard Reserve. I am well aware that there exists in the financial and commercial communities in this country a strong feeling that the Gold Standard Reserve should be what the term implies, a reserve in gold. I sympathise with that feeling, but we must all, I think, recognise that there is much to be said against locking up a large sum of non-interest-producing gold, and in all such matters it is useless to ignore the fact that opinion in England has to be considered. Personally it is my earnest desire, as it is my intention, to approach Indian finance from an Indian standpoint, but I should like to add that I can conceive nothing more unfortunate than any attempt to separate the common interests of England and India, or any failure to recognise how dependent India is on the markets at home. All must, I think, appreciate the improvement which Lord Morley has effected in the position of the Gold Standard Reserve during the last year.

"I think I have now touched upon most of the points which have arisen during the Budget debates, and it only remains for me to express my genuine

[30TH MARCH 1910.] [*Sir Guy Fleetwood Wilson; the President.*]

appreciation of the patience and consideration which have been shown me throughout the session.

"I have had as Finance Member this year to deal with a new system, the outcome of the reforms, which has thrown at times an almost unbearable burden upon me.

"At my age, handicapped by climatic conditions and faced by the painful necessity of imposing fresh burdens on the people, and, I say quite honestly, overweighted by lack of knowledge and experience, I must have broken down but for the magnificent support I have received from my dear friend the Hon'ble Mr. Meston and my financial staff, Indian and English, and I must add from Sir W. Meyer, one of the ablest officials and most loyal of comrades I have ever met.

"But it is not to that help alone that I owe my continued official existence. It is most certainly also due to the sympathetic, indulgent and considerate treatment which this Council as a whole has accorded me."

His Excellency THE PRESIDENT said:—"Gentlemen, in accordance with our new system of procedure the discussion of the Budget has been so full and detailed, that I propose to confine myself to a few very general remarks on the financial position.

"In his opening speech the Hon'ble Sir Guy Fleetwood Wilson explained to us the financial story of the past years, his view of future demands upon our revenues, and the means by which he proposed to meet them. I congratulate my Hon'ble friend on the lucidity of his explanation. Since then the Financial Statement has passed through its various stages, and has today been before you as the Budget for the coming financial year.

"My Hon'ble friend invited us to look back into the past, to the time of the Hon'ble Mr. Wilson fifty years ago, to the days of small revenues and equivalent expenditure, but entailing speeches of portentous length; he told us of the complicated methods of successive Finance Members anxious to explain to inanimate Councils their administration of the vastly growing trade and ever-increasing income of India, till he brought us down to the present day, with our revenue of over 75 millions, our enlarged Councils and their greatly increased opportunities for criticism and discussion; and now that we are at the conclusion of this debate my thoughts naturally turn to the story of our finances since I assumed the Viceroyalty in November 1905. It is four

years almost to a day since I addressed the first Budget meeting of my Council, and of the advisers who then sat beside me on my Executive Council it is curious to note that none now remain to me. Some after long years of useful work have retired from the service, one distinguished amongst his compeers has gone to his last resting place, and two are ably directing the administration of great Provinces.

In financial, as in other matters, India has passed through a time of strain and anxiety during those four years; but she has, I hope, notwithstanding many ups and downs, emerged successfully from her trials. When I took over the Government, the country was on the crest of a wave of remarkable prosperity. Notwithstanding short rains and the cruel ravages of plague, we had had in 1905-06 a surplus of over 2 millions, and at my first Budget meeting, in March 1906, we were able to announce a large number of special grants, for education, agricultural research, and police reform, as well as to remit a variety of petty cesses on the land at a cost of 82 lakhs of rupees. Yet even these large concessions failed to check the onward march of our revenues, and in the following year, 1906-07, we obtained a surplus of $1\frac{1}{2}$ millions, and found ourselves in a position to put the crown on a long series of remissions of taxation by reducing the duty on salt to the nominal figure of one rupee per maund. This however brought us to the end of our cycle of good years, and in the autumn of 1907 the outlook became suddenly overcast. The rains failed over the greater part of Northern India, and we had to prepare to avert the misery of a widespread famine, whilst almost simultaneously we found ourselves called upon to face one of those financial upheavals which periodically convulse the great markets of the world. The combination of misfortunes bore heavily upon our resources. Our revenue fell off; our trade was dislocated; and a severe drain was imposed on our reserves of gold. In 1907-08 our surplus dropped to little over $\text{£}\frac{1}{2}$ of a million; in the following year, the reaction was at its height and we had to declare a heavy deficit. Thus passed two years of anxiety, of constant watchfulness, and of many enforced economies, but throughout our time of trial we may justly recall with pleasure that our financial machinery worked efficiently, and the credit of India remained unimpaired.

"With the year which is now closing begins the third phase of Indian finance during my term of office. We are entering on a time of recovery. The Hon'ble Finance Member has told us that the new financial year promises to open 'under favourable auspices, with good harvests, active markets, expanding trade.' He anticipates prosperity in the private and public finances of the

[30TH MARCH 1910.]

[*The President.*]

country, and, given a good monsoon, looks forward to a general improvement in our revenues. My Hon'ble friend is proverbially lucky in his 'gamble in rain', so I hope his prognostications may prove true. But there are obvious difficulties ahead of us. Our opium-revenue is menaced. We are committed in some respects—and Local Governments along with us—to expenditures on a scale which it may not be prudent to maintain and which it may be necessary to revise. We are face to face with new aspirations entailing a heavy outlay on social and industrial progress, the vital necessity for which no one recognises more sincerely than I do, but which cannot be directly or speedily remunerative; and though we may heartily rejoice over a progress which must entail increased expenditure in many directions, we cannot disregard the consideration of the sources from which that expenditure is to be met. It is a great problem—in it there is much food for thought. And behind it there may lurk many other problems which we cannot now foresee, and whilst sympathising, as I do, with many of the ambitions of advancing prosperity, I cannot but feel that the conditions of the present time call for caution, for the husbanding of our resources and the strengthening of our credit to enable us to meet the duties that lie before us.

“And notwithstanding the increased taxation to which we have been driven by stress of weather, the skies are beginning to clear now, and to my mind it is no paradox to say that our position is in reality stronger than it was four years ago at the flood-tide of our prosperity. I am not unaware of the criticisms which, in the light of more recent events, have been passed upon our financial policy and upon the large remissions of taxation which we were able to give before 1908; but I do not concur in those criticisms. We have lightened the burdens of the poor; we have raised the general welfare of the people; and we have returned to the tax-payer money that would otherwise have gone towards enhancing our scale of recurring expenditure, and consequently increasing our present difficulties. It is not only the incidence of our taxation, however, that we have improved. We have taken steps to discount the probable loss of our opium-revenue. We have proved the necessity for a less ambitious programme of capital expenditure. We have tested the strength of our gold reserves, and have, I hope, disposed of certain weaknesses in our currency system. It is on all these grounds that I consider we may take stock of our financial position with some pride, and may look forward to the future with confidence.

“I will only say one word more in reference to the conduct of our finances. Three years ago—at the Budget debate—I referred to the arrangements which had been made with China for assisting her in the gigantic task of putting down the opium habit in her vast territories. I deprecated the doubts that were

thrown on the good faith of the Chinese Government, and I refused to accept the assumption that the revenues of India were being sacrificed to the views of a few faddists. The three years for which we agreed to co-operate with China as a test of her sincerity have not yet expired, and it would be premature to discuss the results of the experiment. Nevertheless, I think I may justly invite the attention of the Council to the verdict of the International Commission which sat at Shanghai last year and on which India was so ably represented by the Hon'ble Mr. Brunyate. The Commission recorded its recognition of the unswerving sincerity of the Government of China in their efforts to eradicate the production and consumption of opium throughout the Empire * * * and the real, though unequal, progress already made in a task which is one of the greatest magnitude.' We may welcome the integrity of China's aims and though our co-operation with her has involved genuine sacrifices, both in British India and in the States of some of my friends, the Ruling Chiefs of Central India, we can distinctly claim that those sacrifices have been made in the interests of humanity alone. There is evidence that China appreciates our help. Whether she succeeds in her share of her compact with us, careful local enquiry alone can show; but if she attains the success which her efforts deserve India may well be proud of the assistance she has rendered to her great neighbour.

"I shall not attempt, gentlemen, to trace our financial position any further. The many points which have been raised by resolutions and questions have been dealt with by the Members in charge of the various Departments; but as this is the last Budget debate at which I shall be present, I venture to say a few words on the first session of the new Council which closes today. It has been a memorable session. The Council assembled at a moment of great anxiety, and was immediately called upon to support the Government of India in legislation which the conditions of the country had unfortunately rendered inevitable. That support was not only unhesitatingly forthcoming, but the reasons for it were discussed with a good sense and appreciation of circumstances which fully confirmed the views I have always advocated, that increased representation of the real interests of India would not weaken, but would greatly strengthen, the hands of the Government. And throughout our debates there has been ample evidence of a deep interest in public affairs and a desire to contribute to the better administration of the country. The Government has benefited by criticism and suggestions, and the dignity of procedure so necessary to an assembly such as this has been well recognized by its Members. I am aware that there have been exceptions to the observance of that dignity, and I am glad the Hon'ble Member

[30TH MARCH 1910.]

[*The President.*]

Mr. Haque drew attention to them, as his doing so is evidence of the jealousy with which Hon'ble Members are prepared to safeguard a strict conformity with the rules of business; but I feel that I may very justly say that the exception to which he specially referred was due merely to a want of acquaintance with those rules and certainly to no intentional discourtesy towards this assembly.

"Our machinery is, I admit, not as yet perfect. It will require some alterations, especially in respect to a rearrangement of the work of the session. I fully recognise the inconvenience and waste of time that must have been caused to Members, both official and non-official, by being required to attend meetings of Council on dates scattered over many weeks. I foresee no great difficulty in a rearrangement of work. Bills might be introduced at an early meeting in the autumn which would not necessitate the attendance of Members except those especially interested in them; at a second meeting in the middle of December they might be referred to Select Committees; a short session might be held at the end of January, or beginning of February to pass them; and the Budget session would be in March. I am only foreshadowing possibilities, with which my successor will have to deal.

"But putting aside questions of administrative machinery and the great political considerations involved in the creation of this enlarged Council, I claim for it one happy result. It has brought people together—official and non-official Members have met each other. The official wall which of necessity to some extent had separated them has been broken down; they have talked over many things together. Non-official Members from a distance have, not only in our debates but in private conversation, had opportunities of explaining their grievances. Much healthy fresh air has entered this old Council Chamber, and, speaking on behalf of my colleagues as well as myself, it has been very welcome to us. And now, gentlemen, as this is the last time that I shall preside over a full Council, I would ask you to bear in mind that for some time to come there must be much that is experimental in our recent reforms; it rests upon you to consolidate the work which has been done, to prove yourselves worthy of the interests which you represent, to safeguard the moderation and good sense of the Council of which you are Members. It is to you that the Executive Government will look for the expressions of unofficial opinion; it is on your loyal support that they should be able to rely.

"I am grateful for the appreciative words in which Hon'ble Members have alluded to my services. I hope that the labours of my colleagues and myself will bear good fruit. I know this Council to be very capable of safeguarding

the great responsibilities entrusted to it, and I shall leave this country in the firm belief that it is destined to play a distinguished part in the future history of India."

The Council adjourned *sine die*.

R. SHEEPHANKS,
Offg. Secretary to the Government of India,
Legislative Department.

CALCUTTA;

The 15th April 1910. }