

Friday,
16th January, 1914

ABSTRACT OF THE PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

Council of the Governor General of India,

LAWS AND REGULATIONS

Vol. LII

April 1913 - March 1914

ABSTRACT OF PROCEEDINGS
OF
THE COUNCIL OF THE GOVERNOR GENERAL OF INDIA

ASSEMBLED FOR THE PURPOSE OF MAKING
LAWS AND REGULATIONS,

From April 1913 to March 1914.

VOL. LII.

Published by Authority of Governor General.



Gazettes & Debates Section
Parliament Library Building
Room No. FB-025
Block 'G'

DELHI

SUPERINTENDENT GOVERNMENT PRINTING, INDIA.

1914



GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.
LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE COUNCIL OF THE GOVERNOR GENERAL OF INDIA
ASSEMBLED FOR THE PURPOSE OF MAKING LAWS AND REGULATIONS
UNDER THE PROVISIONS OF THE INDIA COUNCILS ACTS, 1861 to
1909 (34 & 35 Vict., c. 67, 55 & 56 Vict., c 14, AND 9 Edw. VII, c. 4).

The Council met at the Council Chamber, Imperial Secretariat, Delhi, on
Friday, the 16th January, 1914.

PRESENT :

The Hon'ble SIR HARCOURT BUTLER, K.C.S.I., C.I.E., Vice-President, *presiding*,
and 53 Members, of whom 46 were Additional Members.

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

The Hon'ble Mr. Qumrul Huda asked :—

1. "(i) Will the Government be pleased to lay on the table a list of newspapers which were required in the year 1913 to deposit security with the Magistrate under section 8 or 10 of the Press Act, mentioning the amount of security required of each newspaper? In the case of newspapers dealt with under section 10 the previous security forfeited to His Majesty should also be mentioned.

"(ii) Will the Government be pleased to state the names of newspapers which had to close publication in consequence of their inability to deposit security required of them?

"(iii) Will the Government be pleased to state the number of printing presses which were required under section 8 of the Press Act to deposit security in the year 1913 and out of such number how many had to close their presses in consequence of their inability to deposit the security required of them?

"(iv) Does the Government of India intend to draw the attention of Local Governments to the cases of those presses which have to be closed for failure to give security?"

Newspapers
required to
furnish security
during 1913.

[*Sir Reginald Craddock*; *Sir Fazulbhoj Currimbhoj*; *Mr. Clark*; *Sardar Daljit Singh*.] [16TH JANUARY, 1914.]

The Hon'ble Sir Reginald Craddock replied :—

"(i), (ii) and (iii). The information asked for has been obtained from Local Governments and is laid on the table.*"

"(iv). It is not thought to be necessary to take action as suggested."

The Hon'ble Sir Fazulbhoj Currimbhoj asked :—

Grievances of the members of the Indian Civil Service regarding pay.

2. "Anent the Hon'ble Mr. Montagu's reference in Parliament to the grievances of the members of the Indian Civil Service regarding pay, will Government be pleased to say whether they propose to lay on the table any reports on the subject from Local Governments as also any correspondence which may have passed between this Government and the Local Governments?"

"(a) Will Government be pleased to state the minimum and maximum of pay in the Home Civil Service and the Colonial Civil Service?"

The Hon'ble Sir Reginald Craddock replied :—

"The whole question of the remuneration of the Indian Civil Service, among other Government Services in India, is at present occupying the attention of the Royal Commission on the Public Services, and at this stage it is not thought that there is any correspondence which could usefully be made public."

"The second part of the Hon'ble Member's question is very general in form and scarcely permits of a specific answer. Information regarding the rates of pay in the Home and Colonial Civil Services is to be found in the usual books of reference, and so far as these are available in the Secretariat Library, I shall be glad to enable the Hon'ble Member to see them."

The Hon'ble Sir Fazulbhoj Currimbhoj asked :—

Proposed change in the law of confession by under-trial prisoners.

3. "Apropos of the Hon'ble Mr. Montagu's statement in the House of Commons regarding the proposed changes in the law of confession by under-trial prisoners, will Government be pleased to state whether they propose to lay on the table the papers relating to the subject?"

The Hon'ble Sir Reginald Craddock replied :—

"The Hon'ble Member is referred to the reply given to a similar question by him on the 13th September last. The Secretary of State has not yet presented the papers in question to Parliament and the Government of India are waiting for him to do so."

The Hon'ble Sir Fazulbhoj Currimbhoj asked :—

Rumoured transfer of Zanzibar to the British East African Protectorate.

4. "Is it a fact that there are rumours of a proposed transfer of Zanzibar to the British East African Protectorate and that such rumours have caused agitation among the Indian settlers?"

"If so, does Government propose to make timely representations to the proper authorities for making adequate provision for the safeguarding of Indian interests in case the rumoured transfer is made?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Clark replied :—

"The Government of India understand that it is not the intention of His Majesty's Government to absorb Zanzibar in the East African Protectorate."

The Hon'ble Sardar Daljit Singh asked :—

Civil Surgeon.

5. "(a) Is it a fact that the European Defence Association has requested the Government to make it a rule that in future the post of Civil Surgeon should not be given to any person other than a member of the Indian Medical Service?"

* *Vide Appendix A.*

[16TH JANUARY, 1914.]

[*Sardar Daljit Singh; Sir Reginald Craddock;
Sir William Meyer; Maharaja Ranajit Sinha
of Nashipur.*]

“(b) If so, what steps, if any, does the Government intend to take in the matter?”

The Hon'ble Sir Reginald Craddock replied:—

“The inquiries of the Royal Commission on the Public Services have drawn attention to the organization of the Indian Medical Service among other matters, and the European Defence Association recently submitted to Government an expression of their views regarding the appropriate manner of filling Civil Surgeoncies. Pending the receipt of the report of the Royal Commission the consideration of the subject is held in abeyance.”

THE DECENTRALIZATION BILL.

The Hon'ble Sir Reginald Craddock moved that the Bill to decentralize and otherwise to facilitate the administration of certain enactments be referred to a Select Committee consisting of the Hon'ble Sir Ali Imam, the Hon'ble Sir Ibrahim Rahimtoola, the Hon'ble Sir Gaugadhar Chitnavis, the Hon'ble Mr. Huda, the Hon'ble Malik Umar Hyat Khan, the Hon'ble Rama Rayanagar, the Hon'ble Mr. Wheeler, the Hon'ble Mr. Enthoven, the Hon'ble Mr. Malaviya, the Hon'ble Mr. Sita Nath Ray, the Hon'ble Mr. Brunyate, the Hon'ble Sir Edward MacLagan, the Hon'ble Mr. Rice, the Hon'ble Mr. Porter and the mover.

The motion was put and agreed to.

THE LOCAL AUTHORITIES LOANS BILL.

The Hon'ble Sir William Meyer said:—“Sir, a few days ago I had the honour to introduce into this Council a Bill to consolidate and amend the law relating to the grant of loans to local authorities. I now beg to move that this Bill be referred to a Select Committee consisting of the Hon'ble Sir Ali Imam, the Hon'ble Sir Charles Armstrong, the Hon'ble Mr. Baua, the Hon'ble Sir Gaugadhar Chitnavis, the Hon'ble Sir William Vincent, the Hon'ble Raja Kushal Pal Singh, the Hon'ble Mr. Abbott, the Hon'ble Mr. Brunyate, the Hon'ble Mr. Wynch, the Hon'ble Mr. Walsh and the mover, with instructions to report on or before the 3rd February, 1914.

The Hon'ble Maharaja Ranajit Sinha of Nashipur said:—“Sir, with your permission I should like to make a few observations regarding this Bill. From the preamble of the Bill it appears that the law is intended for the local authorities, but in section 4 (1), clause (vi), I find that the Local Government may make loans without the previous sanction of the Governor General in Council. So I do not understand whether this Bill also refers to the Local Governments. And then, Sir, in clause (2) I find that the local authority has been defined as any person legally entitled to the management of any local or municipal funds. But generally local authority means the municipal corporation, the district board, local boards, etc. Why here has a 'person' been authorised to make loans instead of the local authority itself? and then, Sir, I find this Bill will not affect the borrowing powers of such corporations as have got special enactments in the matter, such as the Calcutta Corporation, the Bombay Corporation, etc. Such being the case, why have

252 LOCAL AUTHORITIES LOANS BILL; DESTRUCTIVE INSECTS AND PESTS BILL; RESOLUTION REGARDING PROVINCIAL SERVICE ALLOWANCES.

[*Maharaja Ranajit Sinha; Sir William Meyer; [16TH JANUARY, 1914.]*
Sir Robert Carlyle; Rai Sri Ram Bahadur.]

these corporations been inserted in Schedule I. These are the points I find little difficulty in understanding, and I hope the Hon'ble Member in charge of the Bill will be able to enlighten the Council on the subject. With these observations I support the motion."

The Hon'ble Sir William Meyer said:—"Sir, with reference to the points raised by my Hon'ble friend, the first relates to clause 4 (1) (vi) of the Bill. By rules framed under the existing law the Local Governments have powers in certain cases to grant loans, and this sub-clause merely repeats that facility. As regards his second point, I would refer him to the Statement of Objects and Reasons. At its commencement it is said that it is proposed to amend the law so as to remove all doubts as to the competency of Port Officers, who manage little local funds, to borrow under the Act; and if you look at paragraph 3 of the Statement of Objects and Reasons it will be found that this was the reason for using the term 'any person' in the first paragraph of clause 2 of the Bill. As regards Schedule I and clause 6, the matter is in some ways rather of a technical character, and any criticism can, I think, be better dealt with in Select Committee. I may observe, however, as regards the corporations and other bodies mentioned in Schedule I, that clause 6, repealing the existing law, gives those bodies special power to borrow money by means of short term bills or promissory notes. This is a special advantage which does not affect or prejudice the ordinary borrowing powers these bodies at present possess under their own enactments."

The motion was put and agreed to.

THE DESTRUCTIVE INSECTS AND PESTS BILL.

The Hon'ble Sir Robert Carlyle presented the Report of the Select Committee on the Bill to prevent the introduction into India of any insect, fungus or other pest, which is or may be destructive to crops.

RESOLUTION REGARDING PROVINCIAL SERVICE ALLOWANCES.

The Hon'ble Rai Sri Ram Bahadur said:—"Sir, I rise to move the Resolution which stands against my name in the agenda paper. It runs as follows:—

That this Council recommends to His Excellency the Governor General in Council that the Government may be pleased to direct that the provisions of Chapter VI of the Civil Service Regulations, relating to acting allowances, be also extended to the members of the Provincial Civil Services, Judicial and Executive, holding substantive appointments and officiating in another appointment or in a higher grade as laid down in Article 105 (c) of the said Civil Service Regulations.

"Under the provisions of Article 105 (c), Chapter VI, of the Civil Service Regulations, an officer with a substantive appointment officiating in another appointment or in a higher grade is entitled, besides his own pay, to an acting allowance out of the pay allotted to the higher appointment or grade.

"But by the preceding Article of the said Regulations, the operation of the rule laid down in Article 105 is confined to the members of the Indian Civil Service, to Police officers of and above the rank of Assistant Superintendents and to certain other officers.

[16TH JANUARY, 1914.] [*Rai Sri Ram Bahadur; Malik Umar Hyat Khan.*]

"The object of the Resolution moved by me is to have the above rule extended to the members of the Provincial Civil Services, both in the Judicial and Executive lines. In the Judicial branch come Munsifs, Subordinate Judges and officers doing Judicial work, though bearing different designations in some of the provinces. In the Executive branch are Deputy Collectors, Extra Assistant Commissioners and officers of an equivalent rank, though called by other names.

"In the Police Service come the officers holding the recently created posts of Deputy Superintendents.

"It is the classes of public servants described above, who do the great bulk of the work, and the smooth running of the administrative machinery of a district is to a large extent due to their collaboration with the head of the district. These are officers whose devotion to duty is whole-hearted, and who perform the heavy work of their office ungrudgingly. The administration reports of the several provinces bear full testimony to the good work done by these officers. For the sake of saving time I do not think it necessary to give quotations from them.

"Grade promotions among these officers are very slow. The number of appointments in the higher grades being small, it takes a very long time before an officer can rise from a lower grade to a higher. It is only a few who can reach the highest grade. The majority of them have to retire from the service before their turn for promotion to the higher grades comes.

"In the United Provinces the maximum and minimum salaries attached to the posts of Deputy Collectors were fixed many, many years ago, not less than one-third of a century. Prices have risen, cost of living and of educating children has increased; but the emoluments of these officers have remained stationary and do not rise except when they are promoted to a higher grade.

"That, by extending the operation of the rule of giving acting allowances to the members of the Provincial Civil Services, substantial increase—though of a temporary character—will be secured to their emoluments when holding an officiating appointment, can well be illustrated by quoting two out of several cases—one from the last quarterly Civil List of the Punjab and the other from that of the United Provinces. Entry No. 119 at page 20 of the Punjab List shows that a member of the Indian Civil Service whose substantive pay is Rs. 500 only gets Rs. 666-10-8 more by officiating as Deputy Commissioner. Similarly, entry No. 42 at page 152 of the United Provinces List shows that an officer of the said service whose substantive pay is Rs. 700 gets Rs. 644-7-1 monthly more as acting allowance.

"If the advantages of this Article be extended to the officers of the Provincial Service, they will get similar advantages and their emoluments will be increased.

"The case of these officers deserves favourable consideration of the Government. They are the officers who, as I have said before, do the bulk of the district work and help to a great extent the District Officer in the discharge of his duties. Their case therefore is one which ought to be taken into consideration.

"It is hoped that the Resolution moved by me will receive acceptance of the Government.

"With these few remarks I move the Resolution."

The Hon'ble Malik Umar Hyat Khan said:—"Sir, I am sorry I cannot see the logic of this Resolution that members of the Indian Civil Services and Provincial Civil Services of entirely different learning and social status be brought on an equal footing by granting the latter acting allowances on

[*Malik Umar Hyat Khan; Rao Bahadur V. R. Pandit.*] [16TH JANUARY, 1914.]

equal scale with the former. The racial and religious controversies are yet at high pitch in the country and members of Indian Civil Services who are neutral to conflicting factions are far more suited at the time. Those who in consequence of racial rivalries can be either biassed or misunderstood to be such should not be placed on the same level with others who have no concern with party feelings. Speaking of the Provincial Civil Service, I will just say a word.

“ Living in their country and possessing prejudiced feelings, some of them will be bigoted and injure other communities.

“ Weak men instead of helping their community, if in the right, would be afraid and would help the other community.

“ Some would hesitate to take a bold action owing to their inability to decide which course they should take and thus weaken the administration.

“ If even they were efficient, their subordinates who are not so highly educated and are of different creeds would never have proper confidence in such officers.

“ The prestige which now an ordinary Indian Civil Servant has got would be lowered by allowing such men who have not had the chance of getting broader views in England to get the same allowances.

“ The two sets of different elements and of different habits treated equally would cause friction and discontent at the present time.

“ Thus we have to work towards the right direction only by slow degrees, namely, to secure more and more posts for Indians from the lower to higher grades. It will be a short-sighted policy if we try to make our candidates expensive by securing for them equal allowances. We should rather aim at making them cheap, and efficient and raising them by education above petty prejudices against which the modern educational system has provided no safeguards as yet. But that is owing to the trend of general feeling prevalent in the country. When we succeed in effecting a change, we shall be strongly vindicated in asserting that in case we could equally produce an efficient and competent staff cheaper to fill the same posts with equal ability, we should be given greater number of posts and the officers in charge of the exchequer of India for economy's sake would have to get the local and the cheaper staff. This is a safer and a better course which will lead to real advancement of our country and I am justified, I believe, if I say that I abstain from supporting the Resolution which asks for equal salaries or acting allowances for the members of the Provincial Civil Services, Judicial and Executive.”

The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur V. R. Pandit said:—“ Sir, my Hon'ble friend the Malik Sahib has entirely misunderstood the Resolution which has been moved by the Hon'ble Rai Sri Ram Bahadur. The Resolution now under discussion does not ask for payment to members of the services mentioned of *salaries* (which includes allowances) on the same scale on which they are paid to officers of the covenanted services or other services of a privileged description, which are specified in Article 104 of the Civil Service Regulations; it only asks that when an officer of a Provincial Service, whether in the judicial or executive line, holding a substantive appointment, is acting in another appointment or in a higher grade and is discharging the duties of that office, he should in justice get acting allowance calculated on the salary of the higher grade or post in the same way as it is calculated in the case of, let me say, an officer of the Indian Civil Service.

“ The mover might have gone further and asked for officiating promotions being given in every vacancy, just as an officer of the aforesaid Civil Service is given an increase of emoluments when there is a vacancy in the higher class. The real distinction between these two sets of services consists in the

[16TH JANUARY, 1914.] [Rai Bahadur V. R. Pandit ; Raja Kushal Pal Singh ; Srijut Ghanasyam Barua ; Maharaja Ranajit Sinha of Nashipur.]

appointments of one being regarded as divided into classes, and those of the other as divided into grades; and it is, I believe, held in the case of the latter that if an officer of the higher grade goes on leave officiating promotion is not granted to officers in the lower grades, because the cadres of those services provide for a certain number of leave vacancies; whereas in the case of appointments which are divided into classes that is not the practice, and when there is a temporary vacancy in the higher class the persons entitled get their respective steps and acting allowances automatically. No question as to the difference in educational or other qualifications between members of the privileged and those of the Provincial Services arises here, nor any as to the ability of the persons holding appointments in these Provincial Services.

“ I submit, Sir, that the deserving men of the Provincial Services, both in the judicial and executive line, ask for no more than bare justice in seeking adequate acting allowances or promotion when temporary vacancies occur. It may be urged that they entered the service knowing what the conditions were, and that when they have bargained for a particular salary, they have no right to go and ask for more; but, Sir, the Hon'ble Rai Sri Ram Bahadur has pointed out that circumstances have considerably changed; the cost of living is much higher and promotion is very slow; and simply because of the contract into which they have entered at the commencement of their service, it is not fair to contend that there is no justification for the increase, or that the Government ought not to give the men what is their due. On these grounds, Sir, I support the Resolution.”

The Hon'ble Raja Kushal Pal Singh said:—“ Sir, under Chapter VI of the Civil Service Regulations, only the members of the services enumerated therein are entitled to acting allowances on temporary grade promotions, but the members of the Provincial Service, such as Munsifs, Subordinate Judges, Deputy Collectors, and Deputy Superintendents of Police, have been denied this privilege; although they are a most useful and hard-worked body of public servants, and perform very responsible duties and functions. The great bulk of the judicial and executive work is done by the members of the Provincial Service, whose promotion to higher grades is very slow, owing to the paucity of posts in higher grades.

“ The following quotation from *Memorandum on some of the Results of Indian Administration during the past fifty years of British Rule in India* bears ample testimony to their worth and usefulness:—

The improvement that has taken place in the administration of justice is partly due to the simplification and codification of the law. Another important factor in this improvement has been the advance made by the great majority of Indian Judges and Magistrates in education, in legal training, and in uprightness of character. Nine-tenths of the original civil suits, and more than three-quarters of the Magisterial business of the country, come before Indian Judges and Magistrates.

“ The bestowal of the privilege prayed for will be highly appreciated by these officers and give them an incentive to work still better.

“ With these few words I beg to support the Resolution.”

The Hon'ble Srijut Ghanasyam Barua said:—“ I thank the Hon'ble mover for having brought to the front a subject which is a matter of constant complaint with the members of the Provincial Civil Service. The members of this service are no doubt a body of hard-worked, efficient and useful officers; and any encouragement given or favor shewn to them will not, I think, be ill-bestowed. I, therefore, support the Resolution.”

The Hon'ble Maharaja Ranajit Sinha of Nashipur said:—“ Sir, I fully support the Resolution which has just now been moved by the Hon'ble Rai Sri Ram. The officers of the Provincial Civil Service, both

[*Maharaja Ranajit Sinha of Nashipur ; Sir Reginald Craddock.*] [16TH JANUARY, 1914.]

in the judicial and executive lines, are hard-working officers; and they discharge their duties loyally and faithfully, so that they deserve every encouragement at the hands of the Government.

"But I could not follow him as regards acting appointments. As far as my experience goes, Deputy Magistrates when they are promoted or when they are asked to act as District Magistrates get acting allowances at least so far as Bengal is concerned, and such is the case as regards subordinate judges while acting as district judges. Thus in Bengal, as far as I know, they get acting allowances, and if that is not the practice in other provinces I think the rules should be extended to those provinces also.

"With these few observations I beg to support the motion before the Council."

The Hon'ble Sir Reginald Craddock said:—"I should like to preface my remarks upon the subject of this Resolution by stating that nothing in what I have to say implies any failure on the part of the Government to appreciate the excellent work done by the Provincial Services, Executive and Judicial, to which the Resolution refers. I cordially echo on behalf of the Government the remarks of the Hon'ble Mover as to the excellent services which these hard-working officers of the Government render, and I can also from my long experience personally testify to their merits. The various rules which govern the various services and their remunerations, permanent and officiating, have each a history of their own, and I do not propose to attempt to go into the detailed history of every provision of the Civil Service Regulations regarding acting allowances, charge allowances, and so forth. But I understand that the Hon'ble mover has really narrowed down his recommendations to an extension of these particular Provincial Services of what may be termed the privilege of officiating grade promotion which is enjoyed by the Indian Civil Service. The privilege of officiating grade promotion is in fact one of several systems regulating the remuneration of various services so as to obtain a progressive increase in the pay of officers. This regular flow of promotion may be secured by a specially adjusted system of grading itself, or by the adoption of a time scale, or by the concession of officiating grade promotions. The grant of this privilege to the Indian Civil Service has an historical reason behind it; it was granted in 1868 as compensation for the abolition of the system under which, when an officer departed on furlough his post became vacant and was thereupon held substantively on the full pay of the post by the junior who took his place. When in 1868 the remuneration given to officers acting on furlough vacancies was substantially reduced, the compensatory provision of allowing officiating grade promotion was made in its place. The Provincial Services had never enjoyed that original advantage, and necessarily did not share in the compensation for the withdrawal of that advantage.

"The privilege of officiating grade promotion has a direct bearing upon the arrangement of the grading. If these privileges were withdrawn from a service, its grading would have to be re-considered; and similarly if the privileges were to be newly given to a service, its grading would also have to be re-considered. A reference to any of the Civil Lists would make my meaning clear. The Punjab Civil List, for instance, shows that of Assistant Commissioners there are 14 in the 1st grade, 15 in the second, while there are as many as 40 in the 3rd grade, that is to say 58 per cent. in the lowest grade. On the other hand, among Extra Assistant Commissioners in the same Province out of 125 posts the lowest grade contains 52 or only 42 per cent. In the Central Provinces among Assistant Commissioners no less than 63 per cent are in the lowest grade, while among Extra Assistant Commissioners the two lowest grades only amount to 27 per cent. Clearly, therefore, if the privilege were to be withdrawn from the Indian Civil Service, it would be necessary to revise the gradings among Assistant Commissioners so as to make them more favourable; and if the privilege were to be given to Extra Assistant Commissioners in those two Provinces, the number of posts of the lowest grades would have to be

[16TH JANUARY, 1914.] [Sir Reginald Craddock; Rai Sri Ram Bahadur.]

revised. But the question is not really one of either taking away or giving privileges; it is a question in which the grading and remuneration of certain services have been framed, and decided upon the hypothesis of officiating grade appointments, and of certain other services upon the hypothesis that no such officiating appointments are made. It is not a question of right or title, but merely of a system of remuneration.

"The Hon'ble Mover in effect is merely asking us to increase the remunerations of Provincial Services. Now, however anxious we may be to redress grievances or to recognize merit, it would clearly be inopportune to make a change of this kind in favour of the Provincial Civil Service, which would have the effect of altering the system of remuneration of one particular service at the very moment when these very questions are being considered by a Royal Commission.

"If this concession were made to one Provincial Service, it could scarcely be refused to others, nor could it be conceded without special inquiry into the average prospects of the Service and the method upon which the grading should be framed, *i.e.*, the very inquiry upon which the Public Services Commission are engaged. Although it is possible that the Royal Commission may find itself able to recommend some improvement of the pay of the Provincial Services or any of the Public Services, it would not be correct to say that by declining to anticipate the possible recommendations of that body, we are displaying any want of sympathy towards the Provincial Services. Reorganization schemes for improving the pay and gradings of the various Provincial Services have been a constant feature of Administration for many years past, and some of these schemes are now held in suspense pending the report of the Commission. I mention this fact, because I wish to make it clear that Provincial Civil Services have not stood still. Far from it, the pay and grading of various Provincial Services have during the last thirty years advanced relatively faster than has been the case of many services, notably the Indian Civil Service.

"Finally, this particular method of adding to the remuneration of a service is probably not the best, so that, even if the emoluments of the Provincial Service were to be raised, it does not follow that this particular method would be adopted. In these circumstances I hope that the Council will agree with me that it would be unwise and inopportune for the Government to accept this Resolution, and I must accordingly oppose it on their behalf."

The Hon'ble Rai Sri Ram Bahadur said:—"Sir, I am thankful to the Hon'ble the Home Member for the appreciative remarks he has made regarding the nature of the work done by the members of the Provincial Civil Service.

"With regard to the scope of my Resolution, I beg to submit that it is a limited one; it does not involve the question of raising permanently the pay of the different grades. That is a question which requires a larger consideration and which, perhaps, the Government is not ready to give to it at present. By acceding to the request contained in my Resolution it would be very easy to better to some extent, and at a smaller cost, the prospects of the members of the Provincial Civil Service, whose zealous, conscientious discharge of duty has been acknowledged by the Hon'ble the Home Member on behalf of the Government.

"There were some remarks made by my friend the Hon'ble Malik Umar Hayat Khan in opposing the Resolution, and I would have replied to them at length; but I have been anticipated in that by my friend the Hon'ble Mr. Pandit. My Resolution aimed at a different object and not at what it has been understood by the Hon'ble Malik Umar Hayat Khan. I beg to say that the object of the Resolution is one which, I hope, will receive the favourable consideration of the Government, if not just now, at some time in the near future."

258 RESOLUTION REGARDING PROVINCIAL SERVICE ALLOWANCES; IMPROVEMENT OF MAIL SERVICE BETWEEN GREAT BRITAIN AND INDIA.

[*Rai Sri Ram Bahadur ; Sir Fazulbhoj Currimbhoj.*] [16TH JANUARY, 1914.]

The Resolution was put and the Council divided as follows :—

Ayes

Noes.

The Hon'ble Raja Kushalpal Singh.
The Hon'ble Rai Sri Ram Bahadur.
The Hon'ble Nawab Saiyid Muhammad.
The Hon'ble Mr. C. V. R. Achariar.
The Hon'ble Mr. R. R. Venkataranga.
The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mir Asad Ali Khan.
The Hon'ble Maharaja Ranajit Sinha.
The Hon'ble Maharaja M. C. Nandi.
The Hon'ble Maharaja Kumar of Tikari.
The Hon'ble Mr. Huda.
The Hon'ble Rai Sita Nath Ray Bahadur.
The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur V. R. Pandit.
The Hon'ble Sir G. M. Chitnavis.
The Hon'ble Mr. S. G. Barua.

His Excellency the Commander-in-Chief.
The Hon'ble Sir Robert Carlyle.
The Hon'ble Sir Harcourt Butler.
The Hon'ble Sir Ali Imam.
The Hon'ble Mr. Clark.
The Hon'ble Sir Reginald Craddock.
The Hon'ble Sir William Meyer.
The Hon'ble Mr. Hailey.
The Hon'ble Sir T. R. Wynne.
The Hon'ble Mr. Cobb.
The Hon'ble Sir A. H. McMahon.
The Hon'ble Mr. Brunyate.
The Hon'ble Mr. Wheeler.
The Hon'ble Mr. Enthoven.
The Hon'ble Mr. Sharp.
The Hon'ble Mr. Porter.
The Hon'ble Sir E. D. MacLagan.
The Hon'ble Major-General Birdwood.
The Hon'ble Mr. Michael.
The Hon'ble Mr. Russell.
The Hon'ble Mr. Maxwell.
The Hon'ble Major Robertson.
The Hon'ble Mr. Kenrick.
The Hon'ble Mr. Kesteven.
The Hon'ble Mr. MacKenna.
The Hon'ble Sir William Vincent.
The Hon'ble Mr. Wynch.
The Hon'ble Sir Ibrahim Rahimtoola.
The Hon'ble Sir F. Currimbhoj Ebrahim.
The Hon'ble Mr. Donald.
The Hon'ble Mr. Walsh.
The Hon'ble Mr. Arthur.
The Hon'ble Major Brooke Blakeway.
The Hon'ble Malik Umar Hyat Khan
The Hon'ble Sardar Daljit Singh.
The Hon'ble Mr. Diack.
The Hon'ble Mr. Laurie.
The Hon'ble Mr. Rice.
The Hon'ble Maung Myé.
The Hon'ble Mr. Abbott.

The Resolution was accordingly rejected.

RESOLUTION FOR APPOINTMENT OF A COMMITTEE TO INQUIRE INTO THE POSSIBILITY OF IMPROVING THE MAIL SERVICE BETWEEN GREAT BRITAIN AND INDIA.

The Hon'ble Sir Fazulbhoj Currimbhoj said :—“ Sir, Hon'ble Members will please note the terms of the Resolution I move :—

That this Council respectfully recommends to the Government of India that a Committee may be appointed, consisting of Members of this Council, to inquire into and report on the question of improving the Mail Service between Great Britain and India.

“ The text makes it fairly clear that the Resolution does not seek either to forestall the Government policy in the matter of improved Mail Service between the two countries, or to request Government sanction to any particular scheme of improvement. It relates to the preliminary stages of inquiry and

[16TH JANUARY, 1914] [Sir Fazulbhoy Currimbhoy.]

report. Hon'ble Members will, therefore, lay aside for the moment any fears regarding the probable effects of an improved mail service upon the public finances of India. I claim as keen a sense of responsibility as any of my colleagues here, and in the present financial condition of the Government I would hesitate to urge upon them improvements, involving large outlay, recurring or non-recurring, which are not, by reason of their absolute importance or special urgency, unavoidable. The proposal I submit to the judgment of this Council, I assure Hon'ble Members, has been prompted by my anxiety to prevent avoidable expenditure and to manage the necessary reform in the most economical way possible.

"Sir, the Resolution derives its importance and urgency from the agitation for more frequent foreign mails. I need not trouble the Council with details. They are pretty well known. The broad fact is there that Indian Commercial opinion is practically unanimous in demanding quicker service. Whatever may be the merits of the demand, it acquires weight from certain undeniable circumstances. India has progressed rapidly in various directions; the leisurely ways of the East notwithstanding, the people are dissatisfied with slow locomotion. The active West has imparted, through her education and example, some of its energy to India. As a result, there is public dissatisfaction at delay in haulage inland, in spite of the increase in speed on our railways. The existing arrangements for communication over-sea, introduced decades back, likewise are regarded as unsatisfactory in view of the large expansion in our sea-borne trade. Compared to the decade next preceding, the decade ending with 1911-12 'saw', in the words of the official report, 'a great expansion of India's foreign trade'. The number and tonnage of steamships and sailing vessels (including their repeated voyages), with cargoes and in ballast, entering the Indian ports and clearing from them, give some idea of the volume of our foreign trade, and these have increased rapidly during the past decennium of which we have the figures. As against 8,613 ocean-going steamships and vessels of 1901-02 there were 8,868 in 1911-12. But the number does not show the real increase. It is in the tonnage that we find a more correct idea, and that advanced during the same period over 72 per cent, the figure for 1911-12 being 1,66,16,000 against 96,25,000 in 1901-02. The total sea-borne trade of India advanced from £166,834,837 in 1901-02 to £290,592,281 in 1911-12, or an increase of a trifle over 74 per cent; and 68.3 per cent of this large trade has been carried on with the United Kingdom, the European Continent, and the United States of America, exactly the countries served by the Mail Service under review. It would be strange if this enormous expansion in our trade with the West had not its influence upon the mails. As a matter of fact, the increase in the volume of our foreign (European) mails has been even more marked. I quote the conclusion of the official report: 'The estimated numbers of letters and post-cards passing between India and the United Kingdom were trebled in the 10 years, the total numbers despatched to, and received from, the United Kingdom in 1911-12 being respectively 12½ and 14½ millions.' It is absurd to suppose that we have reached the limit. It is equally unreasonable to assume that the correspondence necessitated by this vast trade is carried on satisfactorily under the present system of mail service. As a supplementary system for quicker communication with the West on urgent business matters, the submarine cable has been relied on by merchants. The system of deferred telegrams in plain language at half the usual rates, introduced in 1912 for the convenience of business and other people not using codes, has already become popular. Within three months of the introduction of the system 3,720 messages were exchanged, some proportion of which, we may take it, represented business transactions. Naturally, there is a strong feeling in India that the intervals between the foreign (European) mails should be shortened. The Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs has submitted a special report to Government on the subject in which, as far as we know, a definite recommendation for the inauguration of a Bi-Weekly Mail Service between the United Kingdom and India has been made with certain suggestions regarding details. If newspaper

[Sir Fazulbhoy Currimbhoy.] [16TH JANUARY, 1914.]

report be correct, the idea is viewed favourably by the Hon'ble Member in charge of the Commerce and Industry Department. In England the agitation for a Bi-Weekly Mail Service is gaining in weight and volume. Opinion, lay and commercial, official and non-official, both in England and in India, has been focussed on the subject and would seem to demand a change. And it appears pretty certain that sooner or later, rather sooner than later, we are going to have a change. The matter has advanced so far that the Peninsular and Oriental Steamship Company, which has the contract for the transport of the mails, has decided, according to the *Birmingham Post*, 'to create a contingent fund of £450,000, in view, among other things, of the uncertainties of the new mail agreement.'

"But all said, Sir, this is only one view of the matter. There are other aspects of the problem which will have to be considered along with this. The question is, will the new arrangement demanded by commercial opinion be all to the good? It must be conceded that even with a bi-weekly mail service merchants will have to depend, to some extent at least, upon cablegrams for the prompt transaction of business. The market is so sensitive, and prices vary so often and so unexpectedly. Will therefore the inflation in the volume of mail business be really so large as to adequately compensate Government for the increased expenditure? Then, in order to profit by the change, merchants will have, if not to duplicate the office staff, to make sensible additions to it. It remains to be seen how many among them would care to undertake them and how many can profitably do that. There is again the question of questions as to the amount of additional expenditure from the public funds that Government would find it necessary to incur to finance any scheme of improved mail service. Connected with this subject is the whole range of Indian Civil expenditure. There is a strong body of lay opinion that Government cannot starve, and will not be justified in starving, any of the other measures necessary in the interests of better administration, and divert money for the support of an improvement that has yet to establish its imperative necessity. According to the general public, stronger justification than is at present clear will be required to reconcile them to a change which involves even at a moderate estimate enormous additional expenditure every year. All these points require careful consideration before any line of action is decided upon.

"Sir, there is also, what may be called for convenience sake, the technical side of the question. Two ways will occur to all for effecting an improvement in the mail service. Improved mail service is certainly not identical with a bi-weekly service, and, as has been pointed out by some of the commercial bodies, the object can be gained, perhaps equally satisfactorily, by accelerating the existing mail service. It is a matter of almost common knowledge that even the Peninsular and Oriental Mail Steamers out here have not the speed of the giants that ply on the Atlantic, and the view is not extravagant that the service can be accelerated at a reasonable cost. The advantages and disadvantages of the two different proposals must be investigated with that care and thoroughness which the far-reaching consequences of the final decision demand. And yet another point remains to be discussed. If a bi-weekly service ultimately presents the greatest attraction, the question of the route of the additional service will then arise. The respective claims of Bombay and Karachi will have to be considered. The advantages of Karachi, the high authority of the Director-General of Posts and Telegraphs notwithstanding, do not appeal to many. The benefit of a double service from Karachi would seem to disappear in the case of districts which, in the present undeveloped state of railway communication, cannot be reached from that port in less than five or six days, while there are few places in India which cannot be reached from Bombay in three days at the most. The question of mail contract with one or more steamship companies has its own set of problems and difficulties which must claim our attention before decision.

"Sir, even a man with decided views will pause before he expresses his final opinion on a subject of this kind. The points are so various, so complicated, and so difficult. The Resolution accordingly suggests that they may be

[16TH JANUARY, 1914.] [*Sir Fazulbhoj Currimbhoy ; Malik Umar Hyat Khan.*]

threshed out by a Committee of this Council. An inquiry is clearly necessary, and it is desirable that it should be made by a Committee instead of any department of Government. All important interests are represented on this Council; certainly, there is not a dearth of commercial men among Hon'ble Members whose advice, founded upon experience, will be found sound and helpful. Government have called into being a representative body quite competent to advise Government on any measure, legislative or administrative, and we shall search in vain for any cogent and convincing reason for keeping Hon'ble Members out from even non-political inquiries like the one relating to an improved mail service. Sir, I commend this Resolution to the acceptance of the Council."

The Hon'ble Malik Umar Hyat Khan said :—" Sir, I heartily support the Resolution before the house for the following manifold reasons :—

- (1) The connection between the countries of the rulers and the ruled is so strong that a closer touch seems to be of supreme necessity.
- (2) This resolution will not only obviate the difficulties in the way of correspondence, but also assist in promoting trade in its general aspects.
- (3) It is impossible for the ordinary public to afford to spend money on cablegram, involving heavy expenditure; and though the Government can carry on the affairs of the State by such means, it not only drains India's purse, but is also inconvenient and gives rise to mistake.

A letter is more expressive and comprehensive than a cable, which requires a careful abbreviation to avoid unnecessary use of money.

- (4) If only a bi-weekly service could be maintained, the public convenience would be greatly benefited.
- (5) It might have been noticed in my Budget speech dated 24th March, 1913, that I emphasized the necessity of making Karachi a port for mails to and from England. It is a necessity which is sure to come sooner or later.
- (6) England is nearer Karachi than Bombay by sea, and Bombay is more distant from Delhi than Karachi by train. This short distance between England and Karachi will facilitate early delivery of mails at both sides, and entails a considerable saving of time. Another great advantage lies in the comparatively smaller consumption of coal in steamships and trains *via* the Karachi mail than it is otherwise, as well as saving of labour and money.
- (7) If the capital were to be a sea-port, I should have preferred Karachi to Calcutta, Madras or Bombay, on the ground of its being nearer to Europe and British possessions and being more suited for trade purposes—exports and imports alike. However, if a committee be appointed, it would be able to go through the whole of this most important question, and I hope that the Hon'ble Mover will not be prejudiced in favour of Bombay. The route from England to Aden mail is always the same unless railway communications are established between the East and the West; and if there can be any improvement, it can only be effected by adopting a shorter route from Aden to India. For these reasons I am strongly in favour of the appointment of such a committee, which may do justice to its existence by ascertaining several methods to improve the postal service. As the matter lies in the hands of the Government to adopt or reject the measure, it cannot possibly effect any harm, even if it fails to be beneficial.

" With these few remarks I support the Resolution,—rather, second it."

[*Khan Bahadur Mir Asad Ali Khan; Sir Gangadhar Chitnavis; Rai Sita Nath Ray Bahadur.*] [16TH JANUARY, 1914.]

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mir Asad Ali Khan said :—
“ Sir, the question of improving the Mail Service between Great Britain and India has of late been before the Indian public. It has not, however, taken a definite shape. My friend the Hon'ble Sir Fazulbhoys' Resolution before the house is but a simple recommendation, asking for the appointment of a Committee to inquire into and report on the question. A Committee of this kind will go fully into the details of the question, and consider the advantages or disadvantages of an improved Mail Service to the Indian communities in particular, and its effect upon the general trade of India. If by an improved service is meant the introduction merely of a bi-weekly mail, the resulting advantage, if any, will hardly justify the additional expenditure to be incurred thereon. But if it meant also a shorter period of journey by a day or two between London and Bombay, it would not only improve trade relations between the two countries, but bring them into still closer contact with each other. As for the suggestion that Karachi should be another port for one of the mails, it will hardly commend itself to the people of Southern India. To us in Madras it would mean no improvement in the Mail Service, as Karachi is farther from us than Bombay. Hence, we would certainly prefer Bombay to Karachi. And, above all, the question of total expenditure should be considered in all its bearings on the revenues of India. Any improved service should not prove an additional burden to the Indian taxpayer. If the advantages of such a service are to be equally shared by England and India, I see no reason whatever why India should be made to bear the whole expenditure. Further, it is open to doubt whether such expenditure will be justified by the circumstances of the Indian situation. These are all points for full consideration by the proposed Committee. Before venturing to pronounce my opinion one way or the other, I should like to see a Committee formed and hear its report. With these words I give the Resolution my hearty support, and trust that the Government will give it their favourable consideration.”

The Hon'ble Sir Gangadhar Chitnavis said :—“ Sir, the very lucid speech of the Hon'ble Mover has convinced me of the desirability of the Committee he wants. There is apparently no question such as the Hon'ble Malik Umar Hyat Khan seems to imagine about the mails reaching Bombay or Karachi, but the question is one of cost. There are undoubtedly many points of importance connected with this phase of the question which require careful investigation. We may safely assume that Government are in possession of voluminous reports and opinions on the subject, but their examination would not be either delayed or hampered if referred to a Committee of this Council. This Council is supposed to be one of the authorities to sanction the extra expenditure involved in an improved mail service. It would be much more convenient if some of the non-official members and some expert commercial men form a Committee to examine the question thoroughly in conjunction with departmental officers. The responsibility of Government will be in the end less. I accordingly support the Resolution.”

The Hon'ble Rai Sita Nath Ray Bahadur said :—“ Sir, although the Resolution, which my Hon'ble friend Sir Fazulbhoys' Currimbhoys has just moved, has my sympathy, I regret that owing to financial reasons I cannot see my way to supporting it. My Hon'ble friend suggests that a Committee consisting of members of this Council may be appointed to inquire into and report on the question of improving the mail service between Great Britain and India. My initial objection to such a Committee is that it cannot serve any useful purpose, for the simple reason of what my lawyer friends would call 'defect of party.' In this matter the two parties concerned are England and India, of which England is the predominant partner and more vitally interested. So anything relating to this question of mail service which leaves the dominant factor out of account can be of little or no practical value. The initiative must come from her. I see in the papers that the question of further improving

[16TH JANUARY, 1914.] [*Rai Sita Nath Ray Bahadur; Mr. Abbott; Mr. Qumrul Huda.*]

the mail service between England and India was recently discussed by that influential body—the London Chamber of Commerce. They did not pass any formal resolution but ‘the sense of the meeting was in favour of a bi-weekly service, provided that can be given without any heavy extra charge on Indian revenues and that a fair share of the burden is met from English revenues.’ They discussed many other things in this connection, but they hesitated to pass a formal resolution on this topic; because they thought, as it depended on several other contingencies, the time was not as yet ripe for carrying it through. In my humble opinion, they are right. The principal factor which should determine a question like this, involving a heavy extra outlay, is, can India in her present situation take up such a question seriously? Can she indulge in the luxury of an improved or bi-weekly mail service when her present internal needs are varied and various, requiring vast sums of money? Can she think of it now when we are threatened with the spectre of famine in some portions of the United Provinces and with the possibility of its extension to other parts of the country? It is anticipated that for various reasons the railway earnings would not be so large as in the last year. The gradual disappearance of the very large yearly revenue which we get or used to get from opium will surely cause a blank, which can hardly be met from any other known sources without raising the storm. These, coup'd with the grave financial crisis which some parts of the country are passing through, make it most inopportune to ask the Government for an improved Mail Service which will involve the country in a heavy expenditure, amounting to, it may be, over forty lakhs of rupees. Taking my seat here as the representative of the Indian commercial community, it may indeed sound strange that I should oppose the Resolution, which is evidently intended to give facilities to commercial people; but, Sir, it is not unknown that important business matters are now-a-days settled by cablegrams; the ordinary or routine business being done by the weekly mail. In my opinion the gain to the commercial community would not be commensurate with the heavy outlay which the carrying out of this scheme would involve. My last word is that if we are to have such an improved or bi-weekly Mail Service, a fair portion of the extra heavy charge should be borne by the English people, who are undoubtedly several times more wealthy than the poor tax-payers of this country.”

The Hon'ble Mr. Abbott said :—“Sir, I beg leave to support the Resolution, as I think the time has arrived for the improvement of the service.”

“The Hon'ble Mr. Qumrul Huda said :—“Sir, I may at the outset confess that I do not know much of the subject my Hon'ble friend has so thoroughly discussed in his Resolution. But the speech he has just delivered, instructive though it may be, has made me more inquisitive; and not only that, I feel deeply interested in the question when I see the huge amount of money India shall have to pay. Sir, there is an old Indian proverb “*Damri-ki handi thok thatha ke lai,*” i.e., if you purchase an earthen pot of even a farthing's worth, you should examine it thoroughly. So the request of my Hon'ble friend to appoint a Committee consisting of Members of this Council is very reasonable. We all presume, and rightly presume, that the Government must have been giving the subject its best attention and examining it from various points of view. But this fact should not bar us from taking part in the consideration of the subject. As the Resolution does not require us to say whether a weekly or bi-weekly mail service is the best for India and its trade, I need not touch it.

“In the end I have only to say that if this Resolution is accepted by the Government, it will be of benefit to all of us concerned. It will be advantageous to the Government, to have the opinions and views of the representatives of the people in a matter in which the Government is going to spend more or less about 40 lakhs of rupees of India's revenue. After the discussion the Government may arrive at any decision, we shall be in a position to explain

[Mr. Qumrul Huda; Mr. Clark.] [16TH JANUARY, 1914.]

to the people why this decision was arrived at.

“With these few remarks I support the Resolution.”

The Hon'ble Mr. Clark said:—“I may say at once that I fully recognise the reasonableness of the main object which, I conceive, the Hon'ble Member who moved this Resolution to have had in mind in urging the appointment of a Committee to inquire into the possibility of improving the Mail Service between the United Kingdom and India. His main object, I take it, is to secure that, while the revision of the Mail contract is under consideration, all classes of the community, official and non-official, commercial and leisured, those who have to work for their living and the more fortunate minority who do not, should all have an opportunity of making their requirements known to Government on a matter which touches every one who has any ties of family, friendship, or business with the United Kingdom. The number of such persons is rapidly increasing with the growth, which we all welcome, of ever closer relationship between India and the West; nor does it require a very long experience of life in India to appreciate how important a part in it is played by the foreign mail. Perhaps, in the purely private relations of life, the relatively protracted intervals at which our letters reach us from other climes give them a finer flavour, and the halo which now encircles the incoming mail might ‘fade into the light of common day’ were we to attain to two or, still more, to three mail days in the week. Still I doubt if any one, except perhaps a few unsocial souls who regard the receipt of letters as a nuisance only to be surpassed by the burden of writing them, would fail to be interested in the chance of sending or getting letters more frequently or more expeditiously than at present. The question, however, of any revision or any alteration in the terms of the existing contract has of course to be considered mainly in its bearing on business requirements. It is sometimes stated that all important business is transacted now-a-days by cable and that postal facilities are relatively of little interest to commerce. I venture to think that that is only a half truth and I am glad to find that I have there the support of the Hon'ble Mover. It is belied by the remarkable growth in postal transactions; to which the statistics of our post office testify, and to which the Hon'ble Mover has referred, and for that matter also by the interest in this question, which in the last few months has been manifested throughout India. In point of fact, it is hardly conceivable that the cable, important as it must be, can really render improvement in postal facilities of no account. There must always be a very large interchange of formal documents in which expedition is desirable and advantageous, and the rapid transport of newspapers, parcels and packets of all kinds is no less important. I take it too that in business, just as in the affairs of Government, there are many questions which require to be discussed in greater amplitude than would be possible merely by telegraphic communication and that the larger questions of policy have to be dealt with by letter. I think therefore that there is very little doubt that any improvement in postal communications must *pro tanto* be a gain to the commercial community, and it is clearly the duty of Government, on an occasion of this kind, to take all reasonable pains to ascertain what are the requirements of the general public, and especially of those engaged in commerce. In India, such consultation is especially necessary owing to its vast area, which produces a great diversity of needs in different parts of the country. Bombay, the highly favoured, receives its mail one morning, and those of its citizens who are sufficiently strenuous, have at least the opportunity of dealing with it before the outgoing mail on the morrow. In Madras, the situation is precisely the reverse; the outward mail departs the day before the inward arrives. In Calcutta, the interval is sufficiently pronounced not to be tantalising, but Rangoon has to endure weekly the exasperating spectacle of the inward mail passing the outward mail in the river. These are all questions on which local opinion naturally wishes to express itself, and which Government has to take into consideration before making any recommendations to the Imperial Government on the subject. Government fully recognises this; so we are, I think,

[16TH JANUARY, 1914.]

[*Mr. Clark.*]

in general agreement as to the chief object in view, and the main question before the Council is how that object may be best attained.

“Let me first explain exactly how the matter now stands. The existing Eastern Mail Contract, which, as Hon'ble Members are aware, is held by the P. & O. Company, was due to expire on the 31st January, 1915, if the prescribed notice had been given. The Postmaster-General in England, however, decided in February of last year to extend the contract for another year in order to afford more time for a consideration of what arrangements should be made on its termination. The contract therefore, if notice is given, falls in on the 31st of January, 1916. It must be remembered that the carrying of mails between the United Kingdom and India is only a part of a far larger contract for the carriage of mails to the East, the Far East and Australasia. The whole contract, of course, is made by the British Postmaster-General. The proportion of the cost which falls on India has been decided by an independent arbitration, and I may add that the Government of India have no reason to be dissatisfied with the award. We do propose, however, when we have received full information, to make to the Secretary of State such recommendations and suggestions for the improvement of the service as may seem to us desirable in relation to their cost, for transmission, if he approves of them, to the Postmaster-General; and with this object we have been taking steps to elicit opinions on the subject. In May of last year we addressed all Local Governments and Administrations and requested to be favoured with their views after consultation by them of local commercial opinion. These views have now been received, and they unquestionably demonstrate that Local Governments have spared no pains to make their inquiries as complete as possible. They have consulted Chambers of Commerce, Trades' Associations, and other similar bodies, and have communicated their views to the Government of India with such comments of their own as they have thought fit. I have also myself, in the course of recent tours, and so has my Hon'ble friend, the Director-General of the Post Office, taken every opportunity of discussing the question. Broadly, it may be said, that every one would like to see some improvement. Were there is some divergence of opinion it is as to whether that improvement should take the form of acceleration of the existing service or the establishment of a second service, while some of the more ardent and optimistic spirits are asking boldly for both. I cannot at the present stage express an opinion on the rival merits of these demands. They have not yet been fully considered by the Government of India and cannot be so considered until we have information as to their respective cost. I recognise, of course, that it would be easy to form from this Council, which comprises members representative of many interests and of all parts of India, a Committee thoroughly competent to examine this question, but I doubt whether in that way we could possibly attain a more representative body of opinion than we have at the present moment secured. There are three main questions to be determined before Government approach the Secretary of State. The first is what India wants; the second is what those wants are likely to cost Government; and the third is whether Government will be able to afford the cost. I have already explained what steps have been taken in regard to the first of these questions. As to the second we shall shortly receive from the Secretary of State for our examination the forms of tender which the Postmaster-General proposes to issue with a view to ascertaining what would be the cost of an acceleration in the existing service, or of a bi-weekly service, or of both. When these tenders have been issued and the information which they will elicit has been received, it will be for the Government of India to consider whether and how far the advantages to be gained would justify them in incurring additional expenditure. I would therefore submit to Council that there is really very little room for the deliberations of a Committee of this Council on the matter, which might also involve a very considerable measure of delay.

“There is one other consideration which I ought perhaps to mention. The appointment of a Committee, such as my Hon'ble Friend proposes, would, as I think he would himself admit, represent an innovation of some importance.

[*Mr. Clark; Sir Ibrahim Rahimtoola.*] [16TH JANUARY, 1914.]

Hitherto Committees of Council have been appointed under its constitution only for legislative work, which of course is the primary function of the Council, and it would be distinctly unusual to constitute similar Committees to deal with questions which belong to the sphere of the Executive Government. But I need not insist on this aspect of his proposals. The main point which I wish to impress upon Council is that Government have in effect already been at pains to elicit opinions from all quarters as to possible improvements in the mail service and that there would therefore be very little scope for the activities of a Committee such as he proposes. I regret therefore that I cannot accept the Resolution, but I hope my Hon'ble Friend will not think that this debate has been without value. It has enabled Hon'ble Members to express their opinions on this important question, and I can assure them that those opinions will be very carefully noted and will receive from Government all the consideration which they deserve."

The Hon'ble Sir Ibrahim Rahimtoola said:—"Sir, I regard the Resolution in the light of an appeal for co-operation. There is no doubt that the ultimate decision in these matters must remain with the Government of India but in view of recent pronouncements in Parliament, we are all anxious that the non-official element should be associated in co-operation with Government officials for the determination of important questions affecting this country. I take it that this resolution is in the nature of an appeal for co-operation, the stage for which, according to Mr. Montagu, has now been reached in India.

"I quite admit that the Hon'ble Member, in speaking on this resolution, has been very sympathetic, and the only point of difference between him and some of us who hold that a Committee should be appointed is this: the Hon'ble Member recognises that there should be consultation; whether that consultation should be by way of correspondence or by way of deliberation, is the issue before the Council. However much the course advocated by the Hon'ble Member may be considered preferable, I think there can be no disputing the fact that the advantages of consultation by deliberation are far greater than can possibly be the case when decisions have to be arrived at on written opinions. Points arise in the course of discussion in view of divergence of opinions sent up in writing from different parts of India, which all require to be dealt with, sitting at what I may call a round table conference; and I therefore feel that we should now try, in some instances at least, to work on the lines that appeal to us better than on the lines that have hitherto been adopted, namely, consultation by deliberation. I gather from the Hon'ble Member's reply that probably the present time is rather premature for the appointment of such a committee because he has told us that three points require to be considered before any decision can be arrived at. (1) What India wants, (2) what will be the cost involved, (3) whether the advantages are commensurate with the expense that will be involved in case of either acceleration or a bi-weekly mail service. He further explained to the Council that the Government of India is awaiting from the Secretary of State certain information indicating the approximate cost that will be involved in regard to each of these alternatives. In the circumstances I think it would be better if the resolution is not pressed to a division to-day; but, in asking the Hon'ble Mover not to press the resolution, I do so in the belief that the Government of India will take the matter into their careful consideration, and when the time is ripe for arriving at a decision, they will invite members of this Council to sit as a committee for the purpose of recommending the course that should be adopted. It is perfectly true that so far the Committees of the Imperial Council have been appointed for the purposes of legislation only, but I think the time has arrived when their scope should be extended. In the rules and regulations governing the deliberations of the Bombay Legislative Council it is provided, as far as I remember, that Select Committees may be appointed for the purpose of any important matter affecting the Presidency. Surely, when the Bombay Government have provided for the appointment of such committees, it cannot be held that the time is not ripe when the Gov-

[16TH JANUARY, 1914.]

[*Sir Ibrahim Rahimtoola ; Sir Fazulbhoy Currimbhoy ; Mr. Clark ; The Vice-President.*]

ernment of India should also adopt the same procedure, and on important occasions associate the non-official element of this Council in their deliberations and in arriving at decisions on important questions. For these reasons, Sir, although I feel that, as sufficient information is not available at present, the resolution should not be pressed, I hope that the appeal for co-operation which I am making will be carefully considered and given effect to in future."

The Hon'ble Sir Fazulbhoy Currimbhoy said :—" Sir, If the Hon'ble Member in charge of the Department agrees with the views expressed by the Hon'ble Sir Ibrahim Rahimtoola that later on, when there is fuller information before him, the Government will appoint a Committee to discuss the matter, I shall be willing to withdraw my Resolution now."

The Hon'ble Mr. Clark said :—" I am afraid, Sir, that I cannot give that undertaking."

The Hon'ble Sir Fazulbhoy Currimbhoy said :—" I have been asked by my friend the Hon'ble Sir Ibrahim Rahimtoola that it is advisable that I should withdraw this Resolution in the absence of fuller information. So, with your permission, Sir, I shall withdraw my Resolution and bring it up again when the time comes."

The Hon'ble the Vice-President said :—" The Resolution is, by permission, withdrawn."

" The Council is adjourned to Tuesday, the 3rd February, at 11 o'clock."

W. H. VINCENT,

*Secretary to the Government of India,
Legislative Department.*

DELHI ;

The 23rd January, 1914.

APPENDIX A.

[Referred to in the Answer to Question 1.]

STATEMENT I.

Province.	Name of Newspaper.	Section under which dealt with.	Amount of security demanded.	Amount of previous security forfeited (in section 10 cases only).	Whether they ceased publication.	REMARKS.
			R	R		
Madras	1. Aska (Uriya newspaper)	8	500		No.	
	2. Andra Chandrika (weekly journal)	"	1,000	...	No.	
	3. Faropakar	"	2,000	...	Did not issue.	
	4. Vikataratnam	"	1,500	...	Yes.	
	5. Vijayavikalan	"	1,000	...	No.	
	6. Yatharthavachani	"	500		No.	
	7. Name not given	"	500		Did not issue.	
	8. " " "	"	500		Did not issue.	
Bombay	1. Vishv Dishaal	8(1)	500	...	Yes.	
	2. Nask Mitra	"	500	...	No.	
	3. Suprabhat	"	Not known	...	No.	
	4. Patrika	"	500	...	No.	
	5. Ittefaq	"	500	...	Yes.	
	6. Vidushak	"	500	...	Yes.	
	7. Din Mitra	"	500	...	Yes.	
	8. Kashiwar and Mahikantha Gazette.	8(u)	2,000	...	Yes.	
Bengal	1. "Habul Matin," Calcutta (in respect of Urdu, Bengali and English editions).	8(1)	1,500		No.	
	2. Calcutta Spectator, Calcutta	"	500	...	No.	
	3. Bharatvarsha, Calcutta	"	500	...	No.	
	4. Pranthabathi, Mymensingh	"	500	...	No.	
	5. "Probashi," Calcutta	"	500	...	No.	
	6. Habul Matin Calcutta (Urdu edition).	10	2,000	500	Yes.	
Bihar and Orissa	
United Provinces	1. Talim (Meerut)	8	1,000	...	Did not issue.	
	2. Urdu-i-Mualla (Aligarh)	...	"	...	Yes	* No security was fixed in the order, as publisher was not prepared to deposit any.
	3. Maithal Markhand (Mainpuri).	8	500	...	Yes	
	4. Herald of India (Cawnpore)	"	500	...	Not known.	
	5. Al-shahid Urdu Ahl Sunnat (Allahabad).	"	750	...	Did not issue.	
	6. Indian National Gazette (Fyzabad).	"	500		Yes.	

STATEMENT I—contd.

Province.	Name of Newspaper.	Section under which dealt with.	Amount of security demanded.	Amount of previous security forfeited (in section 10 cases only).	Whether they ceased publication.	REMARKS.
			R	₹		
Punjab	1. Nairu-i-Hind	8(1)	2,000	
	2. Ahlhadis.	8(2)	2,000	
Burma	1. Thatanatikaya News (Burmese).	8(1)	500	...	No.	
	2. Wazrul-Islam (Tamil weekly).	"	500	...	No.	
Central Provinces	
Assam	
North-West Frontier Province.	**	** The <i>Afgan</i> newspaper was asked to deposit Rs2,000 security under section 8(1) in 1918; amount subsequently reduced to Rs200 and deposited.
Coorg	
Delhi	**	** Papers were exempted from furnishing security as the presses from which they were printed deposited security under section 8(1) of Act.

STATEMENT II.

Province.	Number of printing presses dealt with under section 3.	No. of those that closed.	REMARKS.
Madras	10*	{ 4 did not open 1 closed	* Excludes 3 in which printers and publishers were identical.
Bombay	6	1	
Bengal	13	{ 3 opened. 9 not known.	
Bihar and Orissa	3†	1	† The newspapers (Ittihad and Moshahir-i-Bihar) published at these presses ceased to be published.
United Provinces	12‡	{ 9 not known. 2 closed. 1 not opened.	‡ The newspapers (Urdu-i-Mualla, Allgarh, and Union Gazette, Bareilly) printed at two of these presses ceased to appear.
Punjab	6	{ 5 not known. 1 not yet started work.	
Burma	
Central Provinces	
Assam	1	No.	
North-West Frontier Province	
Coorg	
Delhi	8	{ 7 opened. 1 not opened.	