

***THE INDIAN LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL***

**Vol 58**

**9 - 22 March 1920**

**Book No 4**

**P L**

**PROCEEDINGS  
OF  
THE INDIAN LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL**

***ASSEMBLED FOR THE PURPOSE OF MAKING***

**LAWS AND REGULATIONS**

**VOL. LVIII**

**Gazettes & Debates Section  
Parliament Library Building  
Room No. FB-025**

**Block 'G'**

**PUBLISHED BY AUTHORITY OF THE GOVERNOR GENERAL .**



**PRINTED BY THE SUPERINTENDENT OF GOVERNMENT PRINTING INDIA**



GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.  
LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE INDIAN LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL ASSEMBLED UNDER  
THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNMENT OF INDIA ACT, 1915.  
(5 & 6 Geo. V, Ch. 61.)

The Council met at the Council Chamber, Imperial Secretariat, Delhi, on  
Tuesday, the 9th March, 1920.

PRESENT:

The Hon'ble SIR GEORGE LOWNDES, K.C., K.C.S.I., *Vice-President, presiding*,  
and 60 Members, of whom 53 were Additional Members.

FINANCIAL STATEMENT FOR 1920-21.

SECOND STAGE.

**The Vice-President:**—"The Council will now proceed with the  
discussion on the Financial Statement."

**The Hon'ble Mr. W. M. Hailey:**—"Sir, I beg to open the  
second stage of the discussion on the Financial Statement. I have no remarks to  
make definitely in connection with the second stage of the discussion, but  
if you will allow me, I should like to supplement what I said yesterday  
evening in respect of one fact only. A number of Hon'ble members asked for  
information in regard to the revision of salaries of the postal establishment. I  
merely wish to inform the Council—I should have done so yesterday evening  
but for the shortness of the time at my disposal I omitted it—that a revision of  
the salaries of this establishment has lately been sanctioned under the orders of  
the Secretary of State, the total amount of which will be over Rs. 25 lakhs a  
year."

11-10 A.M.

**The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee:**—"Does it  
include the Postal Superintendents also, if I may ask a question?"

**The Hon'ble Mr. W. M. Hailey:**—"Postal subordinates."

## RESOLUTION *RE* EXTRA GRANT FOR NEW UNIVERSITIES.

11-11 A.M.

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma:**—"Sir, I beg to move the following Resolution.

'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that the sum of Rs. 30.72 lakhs treated as reserve out of the appropriation of 214 lakhs under heads XIX—Education and 22—Education be distributed equally amongst all the Provinces for the special purpose of starting and assisting the starting of new Universities and the maintenance thereof.'

"Sir, equity, equality and culture are my motto and the maxims invoked in support of my resolution. I ask here for the special appropriation of the reserve of 30 lakhs of rupees for the expansion of university education, especially in localities where there are no universities, to enable all provinces to start new universities and to maintain them. Well I do not think that I need go into very great detail for the purpose of justifying the position. That the time has arrived when a large number of new universities ought to be started at the earliest possible moment, so that all provinces which have not got universities should have them, and that universities should be started, as far as possible, to serve district language areas. Now in framing this resolution I have in my mind particularly the claims of Burma and the Central Provinces. The population of Burma is more than 10 millions, and there are about 584 thousand boys and girls at school and more than 125 thousand in the secondary schools and the number in the colleges is not insignificant, namely, 685.

"Sir, it will be the centre of Buddhist culture. We owe much in India to Buddhism and we are proud of the prevalence of Buddhism, especially in Burma, and we should be very glad to help the progress of oriental culture by means of improving Buddhist learning in Burma. Then turning to the Central Provinces. Here we have a happy combination of Marathi and Hindi culture. I need hardly plead the claims of the Central Provinces which has a population of about 15 millions, out of which 353 thousand are at schools, 61 thousand in secondary schools, and more than 1,127 in colleges and about 321 in professional colleges, and, I think, therefore that the Central Provinces are entitled to a university in the immediate future. Well apart from the needs of other provinces, Sir, I think it is absolutely necessary that special appropriation should be made from this reserve of 30 lakhs for starting and maintaining universities in these two provinces.

"Then, Sir, we have the development of the university system in the United Provinces. The Aligarh University might have come into existence four or five years ago, but for reasons which need not be gone into now, I think it is desirable that the culture of Islam should be encouraged. Lucknow is another competitor. Nobody in the rest of India would grudge any money to the United Provinces for equipping them with additional universities, but, Sir, I think that I should not forget the claims of my own presidency, which includes extensive areas occupied by people speaking different languages—I allude particularly to my own Community, the Andhras. I think a university for the Andhras has been practically agreed to in the Madras Presidency and elsewhere, and it is merely a question of finance.

"I think, therefore, there is no great difficulty in advocating at least one other university for Madras. I need hardly multiply instances. My submission is that this money cannot be better devoted than towards the development of university culture. The question may be asked as to whether, when so much money is being spent on universities, one should not like to add these resources to secondary education, or to primary education. I have thought over the matter and I have come to the conclusion that this 30 lakhs of rupees would not make any appreciable impression either on the growth of primary education or on secondary education, and we must also remember that, unless we begin at the top and improve the university system, there cannot be a

[9TH MARCH, 1920.] [Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma; Sir Gangadhar Chitnavis.]

healthy growth either in respect of secondary education or primary education. Sir, out of the 11 crores 82 lakhs of rupees spent in 1917-18, we have about 338 lakhs spent on secondary education, and 30 lakhs is only about 10 per cent. or even less, and would not make any great impression, whereas 80 lakhs would be an appreciable addition to the expenditure on universities, it would be about 25 per cent. and that would go a long way towards helping the cause of university education.

"I am not here espousing the claims of university education in general, but I have here asked for the earmarking of this money for starting new universities.

"Then I have hardly touched on the second point, equity. I do not exactly know how the position would be in regard to these grants. I take it that these appropriations would be treated as Imperial expenditure on the basis of which contributions from the provinces would be made, and that there would be no further payment to the provinces hereafter from the Imperial Exchequer. That means to say this is to be the final gift of the Government of India to the provinces and, therefore, I ask that this parting kiss may be distributed amongst the children equally, and let there be no heart-burning that more was given here and less was given there on account of inadequate reasons, such as that there is more agitation in one province than in another. I plead here for equity and equality. If you look at the principle of distribution from the point of view of the size and population of the province, the improvement of developed areas it would be different from the point of view where large sums are required on initial development. Besides the difficulty in fixing the principle, it cannot be gainsaid by the all-powerful Government of India that weak provinces like my own generally go to the wall.

"I need hardly allude to the figures on page 48 of the Financial Statement as compared with the figures on page 307 of the previous Financial Statement for the purpose of showing that out of the 51 additional lakhs we have received only about 6 and odd lakhs, although we are entitled to more whether you look to our population or needs, and we have hardly any money unspent. Our province has got only 72 out of 555 total. Well, if we say that we are entitled to far more than has been given to us by reason of our enormous population, the large number of students, the general educational requirements, or for the matter of that, contribution we give every year to the Imperial Exchequer, we are justified in our criticism. But I shall not dwell on this unpleasant history because we are nearly at the end of the last chapter and there is no use in reviving old and bitter memories. I am only using the past for the purpose of illustrating that it may not be altogether amiss to ask for some definite principle in the acceptance of the division of this Rs. 30 lakhs. I hope, therefore, this resolution will commend itself to the Council."

**The Hon'ble Sir Gangadhar Chitnavis** :—"Sir, I beg to support Mr. Sarma's Resolution. Mr. Sarma has shown in his speech by giving figures how essential the establishment of a university is in the Central Provinces. I am glad to say the Central Provinces Government have done everything they could to give our new university scheme a good start. Land has been purchased and a committee was appointed for the purpose of suggesting a programme. That programme has been prepared and submitted to the Local Government. They are only waiting to see what improvements they could introduce in that programme as the result of the recommendations of the Sadler University Commission. A mixed Committee of officials and non-officials, as lately appointed by Sir Frank Sly, is now going to sit and consider this question. Money is, however, badly wanted in these times of high pressure. All the services are looking out eagerly for increases to their salaries on account of high prices. Such revision is essentially necessary to keep the services contented and in an efficient condition. After this revision has been made, and after allotments have been made for the several necessary purposes for which money could not be found in the last few years on account of the war, I do not

11-23 A.M.

[*Sir Gangadhar Chitnavis; Mr. Kamini Kumar Chanda; Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya.*] [9TH MARCH, 1920.]

not think sufficient money will be forthcoming to equip the university in the manner we would all desire. Any grant the Government of India may make for this purpose will, therefore, be most gratefully received and most usefully spent."

11-24 A.M. **The Hon'ble Mr. Kamini Kumar Chanda** :—" Sir, I wish to give my support to this Resolution. Although my province is not yet fit to ask for a separate university, being a small province, still I think that there ought to be a multiplication of universities in the country. We have at present altogether eight universities, including the Benares Hindu and the Mysore Universities, and if the Dacca University be established soon, as we hope it will be, the number will be only nine, and nine in a population of 315 millions is a mere drop in the ocean. I, therefore, strongly support this resolution, and I hope steps will be taken to inaugurate more universities."

11-25 A.M. **The Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya** :—" Mr. Vice-President, I gladly support the Resolution which has been moved by the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma. I only wish the figure which he has given were larger because I feel that the universities do need a great deal more help than they have up to this time received. I hope the Hon'ble Finance Member and the Hon'ble Education Member will agree to set apart at least this sum if a larger sum cannot be provided. While I do not yield to any of my friends and colleagues in my desire to see primary education extended all over the country, while I do not yield to any one in my appreciation of the very great importance of secondary education being put on a sound footing, I yet feel that university education ought to receive its proper measure of support from the State and from the public, and I think that in any money which can be spared at present too much cannot be set apart for university education. This recommendation comes at a very opportune moment. The Calcutta University Commission have made very many recommendations for modernizing university education. I think whatever differences there might be in regard to details, generally speaking, there is a unanimity of public opinion that the university should be modernised, that is to say education should be provided in a larger measure than has been done in the past. Now this wants money, and large sums of money too, and it is, therefore, desirable that the Government should set apart whatever sum it can to further strengthen the universities. It may be said that the provinces will be in a better position now than they have been in the past and the provinces will contribute in a larger measure to the universities situated within their areas. I hope they will. But even so when the Government of India are in a position to spare some money to be devoted to useful purposes, it would be very proper that they should not forget the universities. As regards the question of the distribution, the resolution recommends that the money should be set apart for starting and assisting the starting of new universities and the maintenance thereof. I am at one with my friend Mr. Sarma and my friend Mr. Chanda in desiring that there should be many more universities established in India. The number of universities in India is still very small, but I share one feeling which, perhaps, they do not share to the same extent, namely, that the universities which exist ought to be strengthened to the fullest extent. It takes a lot of money to start a university as I can tell from experience. The public have contributed Rs. 62 lakhs in hard cash to the Benares Hindu University, and the Ruling Princes have contributed, if we take the capitalised value of their grants, about 21 lakhs. The Government of India give us an annual grant of 1 lakh, but we find that the money is all too insufficient for the needs of the university, and we find that we have to raise another 50 lakhs of rupees within twelve months or so in order to put the University on a satisfactory footing. I would ask my friends, therefore, who are anxious to see universities put on a satisfactory basis, to concentrate their efforts, in the first instance, upon strengthening some centres. I do not say which particular centre. Let the centres be selected

[ 9TH MARCH, 1920. ] [ *Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya; Mr. Shafi.* ]

in an impartial way from the point of view of where the public interest would be best promoted, but I would strongly urge that a few centres well established which are able at once to provide the money and use it to good purpose, should be selected and strengthened. After this has been done, let there be new universities started. I should not be understood to say that I am opposed to the starting of new universities altogether, but I say let not the desire to see the number of universities increased lead to the universities which exist being starved and not being given their proper measure of support. There is no question but that if one particular centre is strengthened, it will benefit the whole country. We have education of the highest type provided in many centres, and it should be the aim of the Government and the public to combine to co-operate to make at least one centre such as would contribute to the needs of the youth of India in all parts of the country.

" If one centre is properly developed, it will be a great help to other centres. Therefore, I would suggest, if the Resolution commends itself to the Hon'ble the Finance Member, that, in the distribution of funds, what should be kept in view is not an equal distribution among the various provinces, but a distribution in such centres that the largest amount of good will be derived from it for the present. Perhaps in the next year, the distribution may be made to another set of Universities, but at present the needs of the country require that there should be a few universities put on a proper footing, and that cannot be done without a large sum of money being set apart.

" I, therefore, support the Resolution and hope it will find acceptance with the Government."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Shafi :—**" Sir, my Hon'ble friend Mr. Sarma 11-30 A.M. asks the Government to devote the sum of rupees 30 lakhs, 72 thousand for distribution among the various provinces for the purpose of starting and assisting the starting of new Universities and the maintenance thereof. My Hon'ble friend Mr. Reddi, as will be noticed from the next Resolution, would like to have 15 lakhs out of this sum of rupees 30 lakhs, 72 thousand devoted to the purpose of scholarships to deserving pupils of the depressed classes, while my Hon'ble friend Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya would like to see this sum distributed not in the manner in which my friend the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma proposes, between the various provinces in proportion to their needs, but distributed among definitely selected educational centres in order to strengthen the existing Universities and also to strengthen secondary education. But when I tell my Hon'ble friends what the nature of this 30 lakhs 72 thousand is and how it is not a new sum to be disbursed during the ensuing year for various projects as suggested by them, but that it is a definite sum, itself part of a larger sum most of which has already been assigned, and in the past year too this sum has been spent on definite objects, they will, I am sure, be convinced that there is no sum in the hands of the Government of India which can be distributed between the various objects suggested by them. Let me point out to them that this sum of rupees 30 lakhs, 72 thousand is merely a portion of the annual recurring Imperial subsidies, most of which have already been assigned to various objects and various provinces. This particular sum, no doubt, still remains under the control of the Government of India, but 27 lakhs, 42 thousand out of this sum have already been allotted to technological and agricultural education, so that the Government of India has got only 3 lakhs, 30 thousand. It is this remaining sum which can be distributed for other objects. And let me remind my friend the Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya that out of this 3 lakhs, 30 thousand rupees, one lakh is the annual recurring grant which the Government of India make to the Benares Hindu University, so that there remain only 2 lakhs, 30 thousand in our hands to be spent for other educational purposes. We have not got this sum of rupees 30 lakhs, 72 thousand, as some Hon'ble Members imagine, which can be distributed between either the various provinces for the founding of new Universities, or can be given to various provinces for endowing

[*Mr. Shafi; Mr. Srinivasa Sastri; Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.*] [9TH MARCH, 1920.]

scholarships to the depressed classes. I am sure Hon'ble Members realise that no one has greater sympathy with the object which they have in view, I mean the founding of new Universities or the improvement of existing Universities than myself, and I can assure the Hon'ble Mr. Reddi that, if funds were available, I would be the first person to press upon the attention of my Hon'ble colleagues the necessity of giving scholarships to the depressed classes. But the proposals now put forward in Council are obviously based upon a misapprehension of the real state of things, and I trust that the explanation which I have given to Hon'ble Members will satisfy them that the Resolution as put forward cannot be accepted. I might mention that out of the portion which is earmarked for technological education, we have given a sum of Rs. 77 thousand to the Benares Hindu University for mechanical engineering; and this will further elucidate the real state of things to Hon'ble Members. I trust that, after this explanation, my friend the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma will see that there is really no sum of rupees 30 lakhs, 72 thousand which can be distributed in the manner in which he suggests."

11-37 A.M.

**The Hon'ble Mr. Srinivasa Sastri** :—"Sir, I must confess I do not understand the Hon'ble the Education Member's explanation. At page 47 I read 'the budget estimate for 1920-21 exceeds the revised for the current year by 38-97 lakhs, the increase being mainly due to a reserve provision of 30-72 lakhs representing the portion of the recurring appropriation of 2 crores 14 lakhs that has not been allotted to definite objects.' Then follows a detailed statement in the next paragraph where a sum of 30-72 lakhs is shown as a reserve that is not yet appropriated to definite objects. It must have been appropriated to certain definite objects, as the Hon'ble the Education Member says, after the statement was prepared. Then the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma is perfectly right in asking for a definite appropriation. If the appropriation has been made since then, that, I think, is responsible for it. The Hon'ble Members have been misled by the statement."

11-38 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** :—"Well, Sir, it is unnecessary to state that the wording of paragraphs 102 and 103 gave us the impression that there is still in the hands of the Government this 30 lakhs 72 thousand available for this year. But if I understood my Hon'ble friend the Member for Education aright, he did say that this 30 lakhs was in one sense no doubt under the control of the Government of India, inasmuch as they could, if they liked, after this year, say that these 30 lakhs shall be employed not for technological or agricultural education, but for some other items, but that during this year the amount has been already appropriated. Reading the explanation and the wording of paragraph 102, I understand that, though 30 lakhs is taken out of the control of the Government of India this year, because they have finally appropriated that sum to technological or agricultural education, it is still open to them to withdraw from those two and give it to somebody else if they like to do so hereafter. Still, as a matter of fact, it is not available now, because they have appropriated it or promised it for technological or agricultural education.

"Well, Sir, under these circumstances I may, I think, still put in a plea for the new Universities. Technological and agricultural education might well be accommodated under Agriculture and Industrial Education, for which there are large grants, and education proper be granted this sum of 30 lakhs. What I am most anxious about is this, if the Government of India are going to base their future contribution of six crores from the various provinces on the total of Imperial expenditure, including this 30 lakhs at the end of this year, these 30 lakhs will be available to them. If so, why cannot they promise it to University education on the lines I have mentioned? Of course if I am told that it is absolutely impossible, I shall not press this resolution."

11-41 A.M.

**The Hon'ble Mr. Shafi** :—"Sir, may I venture to remove one misapprehension which exists apparently in the mind of my friend, the Hon'ble



RESOLUTION *RE* EXTRA GRANT FOR NEW UNIVERSITIES; 1183  
RESOLUTION *RE* SCHOLARSHIPS FOR DEPRESSED  
CLASSES.

[9TH MARCH, 1920.] [Mr. Shafi; Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma; The  
Vice-President; Mr. K. V. Reddi.]

Mr. Sastri He quoted from page 47, paragraph 102, the following words :—  
'The budget estimate for 1920-21 exceeds the revised for the current year by 33·97 lakhs, the increase being mainly due to a reserve provision of Rs. 30·72 lakhs representing a portion of the recurring appropriation of Rs. 214 lakhs that has not been allotted to definite objects.' This expression 'has not been allotted to definite objects' only means that this sum has not been allotted to definite objects in this budget statement; that is all. It does not mean that this sum is a sum lying in the hands of the Government of India as a sort of reserve which can be disposed of at any time when a particular call may arise. As a matter of fact, the major portion of this sum, following the example of last year, is intended, as I pointed out, for technological and agricultural education, and I am sure my friend, the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma knows full well the great cry in the country for encouragement of these two branches of education. The need for technological and agricultural education is so widely recognised by all sincere well-wishers of the country, that I am perfectly certain public opinion would support the Government of India in their intention of spending this portion of the sum on the encouragement of those two branches of education. That exactly is the position, and I trust that that position being fully understood, my friend, the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma, will withdraw his resolution."

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma:**—"May I ask for 11-44 A.M.  
an explanation, Sir? Is this 30 lakhs or 27 lakhs of recurring grant finally appropriated to technological and agricultural education? If so, I have nothing more to ask."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Shafi:**—"It has not yet been given to the provinces, but it is earmarked for these purposes and we intend to give it."

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma:**—"Sir, I beg to withdraw the resolution."

**The Vice-President:**—"I understand the Hon'ble Member asks for leave of the Council to withdraw his resolution?"

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma:**—"Yes, Sir."

The Resolution was, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* SCHOLARSHIPS FOR DEPRESSED  
CLASSES.

**The Hon'ble Mr. K. V. Reddi:**—"Sir, the resolution I have to 11-45 A.M.  
move runs as follows :—

'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that in the Budget Estimate for 1920-21, the Reserve of 30·72 lakhs shown in paragraph 103 (iii) of the Explanatory Memorandum be reduced by 16 lakhs to be granted to the provinces and earmarked for scholarships to deserving pupils of the depressed classes.'

"The fate of this resolution is more or less sealed by the answer just given by the Hon'ble Education Member. But, Sir, there is always hope when there is life, and it is customary with all people to bring in the biggest doctor even when life is almost going out of the body. It is in that light that I once more make an appeal to the Hon'ble Member in charge of Education to see if it be not possible to include this item in the term 'agricultural expenditure' for which we are told this reserve of 30·72 lakhs is intended. The depressed classes, it is well-known, are mostly agricultural labourers in this country, and if agriculture can be improved by the education that could be given to landlords, it is my humble submission that it could be as well

[*Mr. K. V. Reddi; Mr. Shafi.*] [9TH MARCH, 1920.]

improved to a certain extent by education being given to the agricultural labourers; and in that light I would earnestly appeal to the Education Member to see that at least a portion of this is given to these agricultural labourers who are the depressed classes. I thought I could place the necessary statistics before the Government, but I feel almost disheartened and I am not at present inclined to go into the whole question; but, Sir, I would just bring to the notice of Government what is being done in the premier Native State of Mysore, where two years ago the system of scholarships to the depressed classes was introduced, and my friend Mr. C. R. Reddy, the Inspector General of Education in Mysore, was telling me that it was a very good success during the short time it was in operation. It will be seen, Sir, that there are various causes why scholarships should be given to these poor unfortunate beings. I know Government has been doing their best for the elementary education of all classes in this country, and also to some extent of these Panchamas; but economic causes prevent these depressed classes from taking advantage of the benefits that are shown to them by the Government. Schools are no doubt established, but it is the experience of those that have occasion to go into the schools and see them that at least six months in the year these schools are practically empty. During certain seasons, such as the harvest season and the transplanting season, one would only see empty benches in these Panchama elementary schools. The reason is simple. A child of 10 or 12 years will perhaps earn a rupee or two for the parents, or it may be that the child has to take food to his father in the field, or it may be that an elderly child will have to take care of the baby leaving the mother to go and work in the field. Education would, therefore, be impossible to be imparted to these unfortunate beings, unless some encouragement is given to them; and it is in that light I have pressed for this resolution. I know that hereafter the education of these classes will be in the hands of the Provincial Governments. All that I expect and pray for here is, that the principle may be recognised, so that, in the future, ministers may not find reasons to deny this kind of relief, this kind of benefit, to the depressed classes, so that you may here establish a precedent which no minister can afford hereafter not to follow. It is only for that purpose that I move this resolution. I do not mind what the amount may be; it may be a very small amount; but I only request Government to accept the principle and to do what little they can in the matter of bringing it into the expression 'agricultural education'."

11-50 A.M.

**The Hon'ble Mr. Shafi:**—"Sir, I have already explained to Hon'ble Members the exact position with regard to this sum of Rs. 30.72 lakhs; but perhaps it will interest Hon'ble Members if I were to read to them certain passages out of the publication called 'Progress of Education in India' for the years 1912-17, issued by our Bureau of Education. At page 208, paragraph 510 runs as follows:—

'The special measures adopted for bringing aboriginals and the depressed classes to school are (a) scholarships and fee exemptions, (b) the special hostel system, (c) instruction in industries, (d) special training facilities, and (e) special inspection.'

"Hon'ble Members will notice that one of the measures adopted is scholarships and fee exemptions. Paragraph 511 deals with this particular head. This is how the paragraph runs:—

'Generally speaking, these classes read free and are encouraged by scholarships and rewards. In Bombay, books and slates are supplied free of charge and clothing is distributed, after the examinations. In Bihar and Orissa, scholarships are offered including college scholarships, and two scholarships in the Kalimpong lace school for Arboriculture, and one more for the Veterinary College. In the Central Provinces and Assam, 30 and 37 scholarships, respectively, are reserved for aboriginal and depressed classes; five of the former and 21 of the latter are college scholarships.'

"After describing the various other methods adopted for the encouragement of education among the depressed classes, the net result is summed up in paragraph 516:—

'When it is considered that only 3.22 per cent. of the total population is at school, a percentage of 2.18 among the depressed classes in Madras is in comparison not altogether unsatisfactory.'

RESOLUTION *RE* SCHOLARSHIPS FOR DEPRESSED CLASSES; 1185  
RESOLUTION *RE* GRANTS TO PROVINCIAL GOVERN-  
MENTS FOR COMPULSORY PRIMARY EDUCATION.

[9TH MARCH, 1920.] [Mr. Shafi; Mr. K. V. Reddi; Khan Bahadur  
Ebrahim Haroon Jaffer.]

"It will thus be seen that the various Provincial Governments are already adopting measures for the encouragement of education amongst the depressed classes, and I am sure my Hon'ble friend Mr. Reddi will be gratified if I say to him that educational progress amongst the depressed classes has the entire sympathy of the Government of India."

**The Hon'ble Mr. K. V. Reddi:**—Sir, I think that my only alternative is to beg leave to withdraw this resolution. But before doing so, I may be permitted to make one or two observations. I have examined the figures given in the Report on the Progress of Education in India for the years 1912-1917 and the remarks appearing at page 209 in it. The figures given there are no doubt correct, but in my humble opinion they are somewhat misleading. 3.22 per cent. of the population is no doubt all that is at school, but that is, when taking the whole population into account including not merely the higher classes but also the depressed classes, the aboriginals and the criminal tribes. The population of these three classes, namely, aboriginals, depressed classes and the criminal tribes is something like 45,721,924 as appears from the Report. Of these, there are at school 4,82,244. If we take a percentage of these, it will be found that only .94 are at school. On the other hand, if we take the other or higher classes alone into account, we find their population is 198,299,176, of whom, 7,369,697 are at school, working out a percentage of 3.9. By pointing out this discrepancy it is not my desire to say that the Government has not been sympathising with the education of these lower classes. I fully appreciate, if I may say so, and I am thankful to the Government for, the great sympathy they have shown. But, Sir, the impetus given is not enough. Being a product of a University myself, it cannot for a moment be said that I depreciate University education. But, Sir, it looks to me that there is in our educational system something, as has rightly been described, top heavy. Perhaps this top-heavy nature is to be found in some other departments also, but there is a class of people who honestly believe that Government may devote more attention and more money to elementary education than to higher education comparatively speaking. With these submissions I beg leave to withdraw my resolution."

11-58 A.M.

The Resolution was, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

**RESOLUTION *RE* GRANTS TO PROVINCIAL GOVERN-  
MENTS FOR COMPULSORY PRIMARY EDUCA-  
TION.**

**The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Ebrahim Haroon Jaffer:**— 11-55 A.M.  
"Sir, I beg to move that—

'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that the surplus of two million provided in next year's budget be reduced by £500,000, and this latter amount be set aside for being utilized in grants to Provincial Governments to enable them to assist municipalities in financing schemes of compulsory primary education.'

"Sir it has been the practice of Finance Members to provide a considerable surplus in the budget, and that procedure has been defended on the ground that a surplus is necessary to enable Government to meet unforeseen financial liabilities.

[At this stage the Hon'ble the Vice-President vacated the chair and the Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill took it.]

"Without entering upon a discussion of the disputed question of surpluses, which has been a subject of repeated criticism in this Council, I may be permitted to observe that the reduction of our contemplated surplus next year

1186 RESOLUTION *RE* GRANTS TO PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENTS  
FOR COMPULSORY PRIMARY EDUCATION.

[ *Khan Bahadur Ebrahim Haroon Jaffer*; *Mr.*  
*W. M. Hailey.* ]

[ 9TH MARCH, 1920. ]

by half a million, which I propose will not create an embarrassing situation for the Finance Member, and yet will place at his disposal a sum of money which is urgently called for for the expansion of elementary education in the country. Members of the Council are aware how keen the people are on this question and how, in spite of the burdens they are willing to impose upon themselves the financing of schemes of compulsory primary education in several municipal areas is proving utterly beyond their capacity. With the full knowledge that the proposition will be challenged, I venture to make the statement that the financial responsibility of the expansion of elementary education among the mass of the people must be shouldered to a great extent by the National Government. The resources of Provincial Governments are not likely to be equal to the strain that will be put upon them by the demand of municipalities and local bodies for assistance in spreading mass education, and financial autonomy in provinces will not increase their resources to necessary extent. I want the Government of India to assume the responsibility of the extension of elementary education. Mass elevation and Mass education, on which depends the future of the country, are matters of national importance, which should be recognized by the Government of India. I am aware the objection will be raised that the system of doles to be given by the Central Government to the Provinces has been discredited, and that Provincial Governments must in the near future be left to solve their own problems without either patronage or control proceeding from Delhi. There is also the imminent separation of Imperial and Provincial Finance which may be pleaded in opposition to the arrangements I am proposing.

" I contend with reference to these objections that if we grant the urgency and the vital importance of mass education, we have to admit the necessity of providing liberal finance for the purpose. Provincial Governments and municipal and local bodies will, of course, bear their proper share of the expenditure. But their resources will have to be materially strengthened if they are to undertake schemes of compulsory education in the immediate or near future. It is here that the National Government must play its part and be prepared to shoulder its responsibility. If Government set aside, from year to year a definite sum for being devoted to the partial financing of elementary education, they will facilitate and encourage the educational progress which every one has at heart as being the very foundation of all advancement. To begin with I propose that half a million should next year be set aside and be made the nucleus of an educational fund which will grow as we proceed and which may be made available to municipalities and local bodies which undertake schemes of compulsory education, but which without some help are not in a position to put the projects into operation. The Central Government alone with its long and elastic resources can render assistance in this way and hence my proposal. With these words, I move the resolution."

12-1 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Mr. W. M. Hailey:**—"Sir, it has frequently been the custom in the past for Finance Members when rising to oppose a resolution, to begin by expressing their sympathy with it. Now the cause of Primary Education needs no perfunctory expression of sympathy from me; and I shall deal with this question frankly and simply as a financial matter. What is the claim that the Hon'ble Member seeks to establish now? It is this, that the Imperial Government shall make itself responsible for Primary Education. It will at once occur to every member of this Council that that claim strikes at the root of our Reforms policy. If Local Governments are to become more effectively autonomous, if they are to provide their own resources for those subjects over which they will have complete administrative control, then the proposition put forward by the Hon'ble Member must at once fall to the ground. I have said, however, that I shall treat this purely as a financial matter. Now Hon'ble Members have taken so much

RESOLUTION *RE* GRANTS TO PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENTS 1187  
FOR COMPULSORY PRIMARY EDUCATION; RESOLUTION  
*RE* WITHDRAWAL OF FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE TO  
MILITARY FORCES.

[9TH MARCH, 1920.]

[*Mr. W. M. Hailey; Khan Bahadur Ebrahim Haroon Jaffer; Mr. V. J. Patel; Sir Claude Hill.*]

interest in the details of the Budget,—an interest, which has been kindly on the part of some members, though less kindly on the part of others,—that it will perhaps be unnecessary for me to dilate here as to the manner in which ~~the~~ expected surplus is made up. Our surplus cannot be realised unless we succeed in making good our gains by Exchange; and it is therefore necessary to keep in our minds a very clear idea of how this surplus, if realised, must be spent. It must be spent not on grants for expenditure such as the Hon'ble Member desires to see, nor on forming the nucleus of a permanent fund such as his proposal would commit us to; it must, as I have tried to plead to the Council before, be devoted entirely to putting ourselves straight in regard to what I may (using the language which we use every day in private life) describe as our overdraft at the Bank. This is one point. The second point is this, that Local Governments themselves will in future, if our anticipations are realised, have far larger resources for meeting the cost of Primary education than they have at present. This, I think, should give the Hon'ble Member some consolation, and should give him the guarantee that the cause he is pleading for need not want that financial support which he desires. The provinces, putting the matter roughly, will have some eleven crores a year more than they have now, and I think it is reasonable on my part that I should refer the Hon'ble Member to the Provincial Councils themselves, and ask him to establish in those Councils his claim that a larger share of their resources should be devoted to Primary education. I have a final point to make in this connection. At the end of the current year the provinces will still have one crore and seventy-eight lakhs of unexpended Imperial Grants which have been earmarked for expenditure on Education. I imagine therefore that there are substantial reasons why they have not included larger sums in their Budgets for Primary education, reasons which are best known to the Local Governments themselves. I put to the Hon'ble Member therefore that any immediate pressure he wishes to apply should be applied in the Local Councils, and not here”.

**The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Ebrahim Haroon Jaffer:—**

12-7 P.M.

“Sir, I am sorry the Hon'ble the Finance Member cannot see his way to accept my Resolution, and, in view of the observations that have fallen from him in this matter, I think I have no other alternative than to ask your permission to withdraw it”.

The Resolution was, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* WITHDRAWAL OF FINANCIAL  
ASSISTANCE TO MILITARY FORCES.

**The Hon'ble Mr. V. J. Patel:—**“ Sir, I beg to move that the Rules of Business be suspended to admit of my resolution number 5 being discussed.”

12-8 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill (presiding):—**“I suspend the Rules of Business”.

**The Hon'ble Mr. V. J. Patel:—**“ Sir, I beg to move the Resolution that stands in my name that—

‘This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that the provisional allotment made in the revised estimates, 1919-20, and the Budget estimates, 1920-21, towards contributions from India to the United Kingdom under the Resolution passed by this Council on the 9th September 1918 *re* financial assistance in respect of the cost of the military forces raised or to be raised in India be omitted, and that no further payments be made thereunder.’

[ *Mr. V. J. Patel; Sir Dinshaw Wacha.* ] [ 9TH MARCH, 1920. ]

" Sir, this is not strictly a Budget resolution and at my request you have been good enough to suspend the Rules of Business in order to enable me to put the resolution before this Council. The Council is aware that when the people of India made the contribution of one hundred millions towards the expenses of the War they were told that that would be the last contribution. However in September 1918, the Hon'ble Sir William Meyer, the then Finance Member, moved a resolution in this Council that a further contribution should be made by India, and he left the decision of the resolution to the non-official Members of the Council. My Hon'ble friend Mr. Sastri then moved an amendment to the resolution of Sir William Meyer. That amendment proposed the addition of the following words—'and recognise that such larger share be to the extent and under the conditions and safeguards indicated in the speech of the Hon'ble Finance Member in moving this resolution.' That is to say, he wanted that the further contribution should be made only to the extent and under the conditions mentioned in the speech of the Hon'ble Sir William Meyer in moving that resolution. That amendment was accepted by the Hon'ble Sir William Meyer, and ultimately the resolution as amended was carried by a majority vote of the non-official Members. Now the significance of the words 'the extent' used by my Hon'ble friend Mr. Sastri was that the Council committed the country to a contribution of 45 millions only, and the significance of another part of the amendment relating to conditions was that the non-official members accepted that resolution under three conditions mentioned in Sir William Meyer's speech. If any of those conditions did operate, then the question of payment of the contribution was to be re-considered. What were these conditions? The conditions were (1) if the agricultural conditions became worse than they were then, (2) if exchange should be affected adversely, and (3) if we should have to fight on our own frontiers on our own account. If any of these three conditions happened, then our liability to pay the proposed additional charge would be re-considered. Now what I want the Council to remember in the first place, before we go into the question whether any of these conditions have operated, is that the resolution was passed by the Council in September 1918 on the supposition that the war would last till the end of 1919. That was the supposition underlying the whole resolution. If we had known that the war would come to an end in November 1918 or about that time, there would have been no occasion for the passing of that resolution at all. As a matter of fact, if there was no Council meeting in September, if the meeting were, say, in November, then there would have been no resolution at all for further contribution. It was passed on the supposition, as I said, that the war would last till the end of 1919. But the war came to an end earlier. And therefore my submission in the first place is that that resolution does not hold good at all. Then, again, I submit that the conditions mentioned in the resolution itself have operated, at any rate two important conditions have been satisfied. The agricultural conditions were worse in subsequent months than in the month in which the resolution was passed; we had to fight our own battles on our own frontier on our own account. It is an admitted fact, Sir, that in 1918 there was a failure of rain, and famine had to be declared in several parts of India in 1918, as well as in some months of 1919. It was a widespread scarcity in the whole of India and famine in several parts of India. Of course when the resolution was passed it was already known that the agricultural conditions were bad, but there was expectation that the late rains might save the situation. But unfortunately it happened otherwise. We did not get rains and there was consequent scarcity and famine. So that the first condition at once operated, and there arose therefore the ground for the re-consideration of the whole question. In fact several public bodies and associations in India passed resolutions asking the Government of India to reconsider the resolution and requesting the Secretary of State not to take any action on that resolution. In Bombay, for instance, the Bombay Presidency Association, of which my Hon'ble friend Sir Dinshaw is the President . . .

**The Hon'ble Sir Dinshaw Wacha :—**" Not now."

[9TH MARCH, 1920.] [Mr. V. J. Patel; Sir Dinshaw Wacha.]

**The Hon'ble Mr. V. J. Patel** :—"Now he is the Vice-President."

**The Hon'ble Sir Dinshaw Wacha** :—"I have no connection with it now."

**The Hon'ble Mr. V. J. Patel** :—"passed a resolution appealing to the Government of India, in view of the agricultural conditions in India, to re-consider the resolution. However somehow or other Government did not do anything of the kind then, and I do not know whether any action was taken by the Secretary of State on the resolutions passed by these public bodies and associations. Nor do I know whether the matter was placed before the two Houses of Parliament, whose sanction is necessary before any contribution could be taken from India. Even up to now I do not know whether the contribution has been sanctioned by the two Houses of Parliament. But what I wanted to point out, Sir, was this that, in spite of the fact that the agricultural conditions grew worse, and therefore the first condition operated at once, the Government of India did not take any action by way of re-considering the resolution. My Hon'ble friend the Finance Member has now suggested in his narrative that the matter is open to re-consideration. That gives us some hope and therefore I have ventured to bring this resolution before this Council. If my Hon'ble friend the Finance Member had not mentioned it, probably we would never have brought this resolution and the question would not have been the subject-matter of any discussion in the Council. It was because the Government thought it proper to tell this Council and the public that this was a matter which required re-consideration or which could be re-considered, that this resolution comes. Of course we made attempts in the past to get the Government and the Secretary of State to re-consider this question, but they did not do so then. Now Government comes forward—it is very good of them—and tells us 'you can re-consider the matter and we shall leave the decision of it to the non-official members.' Of course the decision of the non-official members you can very well understand in a matter of this kind.

"The ground on which according to my Hon'ble friend the Finance Member the matter is open to re-consideration is that the third condition, namely, that if we should have to fight on our own account on our own frontier, the question of further contribution would be re-considered, has been satisfied. That condition, Sir, was fulfilled long before even the last September Session. Why were we not asked to re-consider the question then? However, I do not complain; better late than never. The question now is how far this matter is open to re-consideration. The position is this. Under the Resolution, if the war lasted till the end of 1919, we were bound, the country was bound—because after all the decision of the non-official members was taken as representing the views of the country—to pay 45 millions. Very well. The war ended early and we expected that no contribution would be taken, but the Government of India, after some correspondence with the Secretary of State and the Home Government, came to some settlement, and they said that 31 millions and not 45 millions would be taken. So, according to the decision of the Government of India, arrived at after consultation and settlement, with the Home Government, we were bound to pay 31 millions. 13 millions have already been paid, so there remain 18 millions to be paid. This 18 millions will consist of effective as well as non-effective charges—I will not go into the question as to how much would be on account of effective and how much on account of non-effective charges. If the question is not re-considered, we will have to pay 18 millions. We had to undergo an expenditure of 14½ millions on the Afghan war according to the revised estimates of 1919. Now, Sir, I must make it quite clear that, as the Resolution stands, I do not touch the question of the amount already paid. I do not say that we should ask that it should be refunded, nor do I say that we should not ask, I leave that question open in fact for another occasion 'should any one be disposed to re-open it. My resolution does not commit the non-official members of this Council one way or the other on that question which will remain open.

[Mr. V. J. Patel.] [9TH MARCH, 1920.]

thought mine was a Budget Resolution and that I could not include in it the question of amounts which had been dealt with in the previous budgets, and therefore I restricted it to the figures of the revised budget estimates of 1919 and to the budget estimates for 1920. Therefore, as I say, my Resolution leaves that question of the 18 millions already paid quite open to be discussed on some future occasion, if some one so desires. The sole question at present is, whether we should pay the 18 millions which remain to be paid or not,

"Now in the last paragraph, paragraph 8, of Appendix II of the Financial Statement, the *pros* and *cons* of the question have been stated by the Finance Member. He says:

'One of the conditions attached to the guarantee having become operative, namely, the occurrence of war on the frontier, it might on the one hand be justly urged that the cost of the frontier operations (£14½ million) should be deducted from the contribution promised.'

"I do not understand why the proposed contribution should be reduced by that amount only. If one of the conditions has been fulfilled, then the whole question is open to re-consideration, and you cannot say therefore that so much only should be deducted; you cannot with any reason urge that only to that extent should the contribution be reduced.

"The Hon'ble the Finance Member goes on to say:—

'On the other hand, it might be pointed out that, even if the cost of the Afghan war be added to the cost of the further contribution as now estimated, the net result would exceed by very little the original estimate of £45 million framed by Sir William Meyer in 1918, which was accepted by India as the amount of her liability.'

"Now, Sir, that liability was accepted by the non-official members of this Council on behalf of India on the supposition that the war would last till the end of 1919. The argument that, because India had accepted a liability of £45 million, therefore, even if the Afghan war expenditure were added to the present liability of 31 millions, it would not exceed very much the £45 million promised, will, I hope, not appeal to this Council. Circumstances are quite different. The war ended early, and, in view of the fact that we passed the Resolution on the supposition that the war would last till the end of 1919, we are not bound to pay that amount, other considerations apart.

"The Finance Member goes on—

'Secondly, there is the important consideration that the excess profits duty, which is expected to bring in 9 crores, was specially imposed to pay for the portion of the contribution falling due in 1919-20.'

"That is true. But we want money for various purposes. Sir, because a particular contribution was levied for a particular purpose, and it is found that contribution is not necessary for that purpose, it is absurd to suggest that the contribution should still be utilized for that purpose.

"The last point that the Hon'ble the Finance Member has raised is one which it is very difficult for me to understand, and I do not know whether there are any other friends of mine who understand it fully. He says:

'Finally, there are strong grounds for holding that any re-consideration of the case should not in any case extend to the non-effective charges in view of the nature of the settlement referred to in paragraph 5 above, since to do so might involve India in liabilities which cannot now be definitely stated.'

"We do not know what those liabilities will be. It is stated in paragraph 5 that—

'It has been a long-standing practice, dating from 1870, for India to bear the Indian service share, if any, of *all* pensions of British troops employed in British campaigns, while His Majesty's Government do the same in the case of Indian campaigns.'

"And on account of that practice claims may be preferred by the Home Government. That is the suggestion, if I understand it aright. When we passed the resolution regarding the £45 millions it was definitely stated by the then Finance Member himself in his speech 'we consider that, in present circumstances, we might offer to bear the extraordinary pension



RESOLUTION *RE* WITHDRAWAL OF FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE TO MILITARY FORCES. 1191

[9TH MARCH, 1920.] [Mr. V. J. Patel; Sir Claude Hill; Sir Dinshaw Wacha.]

charges on account of Indian troops and followers, and British officers of the Indian Army; and the 'service share' of similar charges relating to British troops including both those who belonged to the Indian establishment at the outbreak of the war and those who have at some previous time served in India.' If we were really bound to pay or if the Home Government could as of right make us pay the expenditure regarding certain service share charges, where was the justification for Sir William Meyer to include those charges in the resolution of September 1918? As a matter of fact, Sir William Meyer and the Government of India were of opinion that we were not liable for those charges, and therefore it was necessary to include them in the resolution so as to make it clear that we undertook to bear them by that resolution. I do not think I need. . . .

**The Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill** (*presiding*):—"The Hon'ble Member still has a few minutes; but I think the Council would like me to draw his attention to the fact that there is a great deal of work and a great many resolutions before the Council, and perhaps he will endeavour to bring his remarks to a close within the period allotted to him."

**The Hon'ble Mr. V. J. Patel**:—"Even if I had not been asked to finish I had not in fact to say anything more. I hope the non-official members of this Council will favourably receive this resolution, and in fact welcome it, and as it is based on a suggestion of the Government I do not suppose there will be any difficulty in the way of its being accepted."

**The Hon'ble Sir Dinshaw Wacha**:—"Sir, I beg to move the 19-31 P.M.  
following amendment to the Hon'ble Mr. Patel's resolution:—

'That for the words 'the provisional allotment . . . be made thereunder' the following words be substituted, *vis.*, . . .'

I regret that I am not able to read out the whole amendment as my eyes are rather bad. I hope the Council will take it as read."

**The Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill** (*presiding*):—"I think perhaps it may be convenient if I read out the amendment. The Hon'ble Member's motion is—

'That for the words 'the provisional allotment . . . be made thereunder' the following words be substituted, namely:—

'The sum shown in paragraph 7, Appendix II, Financial Statement, as still payable for effective and non-effective charges under the Resolution passed by this Council on the 10th September 1918, on Sir William Meyer's motion, be paid to His Majesty's Government, after deducting therefrom the expenditure on the Afghan War and the Frontier Tribes Expedition.'

**The Hon'ble Sir Dinshaw Wacha**:—"Thank you, Sir. Two reasons have prompted me to bring forward this amendment. Firstly, there prevails a general feeling amongst my non-official Indian colleagues in this Council in reference to this particular contribution. Secondly, there is evident equity and justice to have this contribution waived now. My friend, Mr. Patel, has already in a preliminary way cleared the ground for me, and I do not want, therefore, to travel over it again. The reasons and the conditions which were operative before are no longer operative now. But I may say this, that all through the debate which took place in September 1918, both at the informal committee and afterwards in the open Council, most non-official members very willingly, and with the greatest alacrity, agreed to the further contribution of £45 millions as proposed by Sir William Meyer. India had up to that time rendered every possible service to England to enable her to win the war. She assisted the Government at Home with men, money and other services in all sorts of ways. In fact, we may justly say that India is very proud of the share she

[ *Sir Dinshaw Wacha; Sir Claude Hill.* ] [ 9TH MARCH, 1920. ]

had in enabling England to win the war. That being so, the contribution was at that time ungrudgingly granted, specially as she was threatened on her North-West Frontier by the enemies of the Allies. Mr. Lloyd George in his memorable speech of March the 4th of that year had observed that the Eastern menace was so great that India would do well to take care of herself; and we all thought that it was necessary not only for India's safety, but also in view of the great danger to which the Allies might be exposed on the Western front of the War. They therefore cheerfully agreed to the contribution of £45 millions. Well, Sir, events turned out very differently from what was anticipated. Happily for us and the world the war did end soon after the September resolution: the armistice was signed sometime in November 1918. I think my friend, Mr. Patel, was right in observing that had that resolution been brought forward two months later, in all probability it would not have been necessary at all. That being the case, it stands to reason, that we ought now to re-consider the position. In re-considering it I beg to refer to one point in connection with the third Afghan war. That war has cost us £14½ millions. I intended speaking on the subject yesterday, whilst the debate was going on on the budget; but it became very late and as I could not attend the Council at the later hour in the evening, I now take this opportunity of referring to the important matter. It is, in my opinion, greatly relevant to my amendment, and I should like to say a few words on the subject. It has astonished me, as I think it has astonished a great many of my Indian friends, that this little war of six months should have cost as much as £14½ millions! It is an appalling sum, even after making every possible allowance about the variety of objects to which the Finance Member referred very freely, frankly and unreservedly in his speech, namely, as to the equipment of the forces, medical and other necessities, and the modern materials and resources of warfare which had to be introduced in this war. Even after making a most general allowance for these things, I do say, Sir, that the amount expended on this Afghan War is to me most extraordinary. I cannot understand it; there must be some great leakage somewhere, some great wastage of expenditure which cannot be accounted for. There is no mistake about this waste. I may here bring to the notice of the Council one pertinent fact. Sir, the second Afghan war lasted for nearly three years, from 1877 till the end of 1879. The total cost of that war amounted to only £20 million sterling. There were many disagreeable military incidents in that war. Many of my friends here, perhaps, may not recollect them. Many must have been very young then; but there is my old friend there, Mr. Banerjee, who would probably have been 32 or 31 then, and he, I doubt not, recollects what that war cost and what were those disagreeable incidents of that campaign . . .

**The Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill** (*presiding*):—"May I ask the Hon'ble Sir Dinshaw Wacha whether this really has any reference to the question of his amendment?"

**The Hon'ble Sir Dinshaw Wacha**:—"I do submit, Sir, that it does in one way bear upon it, because I want to point out why we should forego this contribution of £14½ million. I will say a few words only on the point and no more. Two distinguished Generals were there; one marched from Kabul to Kandahar, and another marched from Kandahar to Kabul, in order to retrieve the situation on both directions. There was a great reverse of British arms at Maiwand. But I will refrain from saying more on the subject. Apart from that, there was the severe famine of 1877-78 in the whole of India, and especially in the Madras Presidency. The famine was so very great that the Government reduced the usual famine rations from 2-lb. to 1½-lb. per head. On this unwise reduction there was very severe criticism in the whole of the Indian Press. Whatever money was wanted for that war was of course freely spent, but at the expense of the famine conditions. Millions of people died because of that

[9TH MARCH, 1920.] [Sir Dinshaw Wacha; Mr. W. M. Hailey.]

reduction in the famine rations of the starving and the hungry. Then the Liberal Government came into power in 1880, with Mr Gladstone at the head of it, soon after his memorable success in the Midlothian Election campaign. The late Duke of Devonshire was the Secretary of State for India. The hue and cry raised in the House of Commons was very great. The war was taken on hand in the Imperial interests of England and not in the interests of India, and that a contribution should in justice be made to India. The House resolved to contribute five millions towards the cost of the war. The actual cost of the war, therefore, to India was fifteen millions. Thus, the Second Afghan War which was waged for three years cost India only 15 millions, while this little war of six months has cost us 14½ millions! Just contrast the difference. I say that I cannot understand why there should have been this extraordinary expenditure; of course it is an accomplished fact and I only refer to it in order that my Honourable friends, particularly the non-officials, may be enabled to come to a right understanding why I wish this amendment should be passed. I think it is only fair to India that this cost should not be borne by her. India has never grudged any voluntary contribution that was needed to win the war. In fact, from the Secretary of State downwards, every one has acknowledged that India has splendidly assisted England and the Allies and fulfilled all her obligations; *aye*, even more than she undertook and demanded by her ability. That is a fact; and, therefore, I say that having regard to that fact and having regard to this question that the third Afghan war could not entirely be said to be on account of India, my amendment should easily find acceptance. It was partly undertaken in Imperial interests. There was the preservation of the independence and integrity of Persia, and there was the consolidation of Mesopotamia to be safeguarded. Both were objects of grave Imperial interests, interests in which England and India were equally involved. My amendment on these grounds ought to be accepted therefore. Under the circumstances, it cannot be alleged or urged that the third Afghan war was simply waged to expel external aggression and nothing beyond it. It was something more than expelling external aggression. It was also for the purpose of securing the integrity of Persia and the safety of Mesopotamia. Those, I repeat, being the several reasons, Sir, I consider that in fairness and equity, that from the balance of 18 millions which have still to be paid, it will be wise on the part of the Government to accept this amendment. And it will be wise also on the part of my non-official friends who, I believe, are more or less in harmony with me to agree to the cost of the third Afghan war being deducted from the balance we have to pay. With these words I commend this amendment to the Council for acceptance."

**The Hon'ble Mr. W. M. Hailey:**—"Sir, if I rise to speak on 12-42 P.M. this motion, it is simply in order, in the first place, to emphasise the fact that it has been decided that the voting on this question should be left entirely to the non-official members of this Council. I have a further object, and that is, to endeavour to supply one or two figures which will make clearer the exact effect both of the resolution and of the amendment, and I hope, Sir, that I am not out of order in the circumstances in giving this information to the Council. The effect of the Hon'ble Mr. Patel's motion would be that we should of course pay no more on account of the 'further contribution' than the 13·6 millions that we have already paid. The effect of the Hon'ble Sir Dinshaw Wacha's amendment would be, that as we now calculate, we should have to pay possibly about £850,000 more. That is to say, that we should, if Sir Dinshaw Wacha's amendment is accepted, probably have to include the sum of one million which is referred to in paragraph 8 of my Appendix, and possibly a further sum of one million which may still have to be incurred in connection with the operations of 1920-21. The net effect of that—I will not trouble the Council with the calculation which is somewhat complicated—would be that we should still have to pay £850,000. That is my contribution for the information of the Council.

[*Mr. W. M. Hailey; Sir Dinshaw Wacha; Sir Claude Hill; Mr. G. S. Khaparde; Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.*] [9TH MARCH, 1920.]

"But I have a further object, and that is to ask that it should be made perfectly clear by the Hon'ble Members of this Council for the information of Government what is their intention in another respect, if Sir Dinshaw Wacha's amendment is accepted. Are we to understand by this amendment that it is the sense of this Council that we should deduct not only the expenditure on the Afghan War, the active operations of which are happily closed, but the whole of the expenditure which may be incurred in the future on the frontier tribes expedition? Are we to deduct from the 'further contribution' not only what we have already spent and what forms part of our Budget for the current year, but any future expenditure on these operations in the next year? . . . . ."

**The Hon'ble Sir Dinshaw Wacha:**—"May I say one word, Sir?"

**The Hon'ble Mr. W. M. Hailey:**—"I beg your pardon. I only ask this question with a view to put the matter on a clear footing so that when we make up our accounts and communicate with the Secretary of State any decision to which this Council may come, there may be no mistake whatever about the figures."

**The Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill** (presiding):—"I will ask the Hon'ble Sir Dinshaw Wacha to explain."

12-45 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Sir Dinshaw Wacha:**—"This frontier expedition is simply a corollary of the Afghan War, and no thing else. It is part and parcel of it, although you may make a distinction. The Afghan War was entirely for the benefit of India and of England. That being the case I do include the cost of that expedition in the 14½ millions. That is all I have to say."

12-46 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Mr. G. S. Khaparde:**—"Sir, I took part in the debate on this Resolution when it came on at Simla, and there I stated that my heart inclined me to pay but my head declined to sanction the expenditure. That was the difficulty then. After two years, I find that the same difficulty endures unfortunately to-day. If there was the great war which was spoken of the other day, there is also a frontier war on our hands to-day and something very troublesome because these little tribes are difficult to control. You cannot employ all your forces against them. They are like flies, and you cannot follow a fly with a gun, nor can you run after a fly with a sword, and these small tribes appear, disappear and re-appear. So we have that trouble on our hands. So those conditions still exist, I mean those conditions under which we agreed to pay this money or rather those conditions which would prevent us from giving that money still endure and exist. So I personally support the original proposition. We have a large number of objects on which we have to spend money, and people have been asking for grants for education, sanitation and for various other purposes which appear to be very necessary. In view of this, I think we better not pay anything at all. England is a rich country; she has got any amount of money and she can afford to pay. What is more, it is a matter which has some relevance to the present question. England has got some ships and some goods from Germans and she has also realised some money. Probably a portion of that money we shall get, and I agree that the portion of our share which we shall so receive may be devoted for the purposes of this frontier war or whatever that may be. But as the position stands at present, I still adhere to the original proposition not to give anything at all."

12-49 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma:**—"Sir, I support the amendment of my Hon'ble friend, Sir Dinshaw Wacha, and for this reason,

[ 9TH MARCH, 1920. ] [ *Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma; Mr. Kamini Kumar Chanda; Mr. Srinivasa Sastri.* ]

Of course, it may appear that there is not much difference in effect between the results of Mr. Patel's motion and that of Sir Dinshaw Wacha. But I think, Sir, there is a great deal of principle involved. We do not know exactly what the figures when worked out will come to. Rightly or wrongly we came to a decision in 1918-19. The 45 million was the outside limit which was arrived at on certain calculations. Well, we did not agree to pay as much as 45 millions if it was not necessary, such as, for example, if the war terminated earlier. We had to be prepared to pay more if the war lasted longer than those three or four years for which it lasted. There was a proviso, namely, that we would be entitled to re-consider the whole matter in case there was war, pestilence or famine in our own country. That contingency has arrived. Now if we are to re-consider the matter and say that we are not bound to pay anything at all as suggested, then it would logically follow that not only shall we pay nothing, but we would be entitled to the re-payment of the 18 millions also which we had paid. Therefore, I think, inasmuch as nobody will argue or rather is prepared to argue that India should obtain a refund of the sum of £18 millions which has been paid on the strength of that resolution, the question is to what extent we should respect that resolution. Once the principle is conceded effect ought to be given to it, and it seems to me that we would be within our rights if we say that we require the whole amount for our own purposes on account of the frontier troubles. Now the Afghan and frontier war has cost us 14½ million pounds or 15 million pounds and whatever it may be, we ask that it should be exoused. We deeply regret that any necessity should have arisen that this country should go forward and say 'please let us off that amount'. Of course, I was one of those who opposed the original motion as it at first stood. I said that whatever could be spared from the finances of the country and whatever could be got by means of excess profits taxation might be paid but nothing further. I suppose the result under my amendment would have been nearly the same as has been arrived at now. But by a decision of the majority we arrived at a different conclusion, and we must respect that resolution. There is no use now trying to whittle it down in so far as we may not be absolutely obliged to do so.

" Well, Sir, I hope those who are watching us will take it that the Council is extremely reluctant to go back in any way whatsoever upon the resolution passed in 1918. Whether the war lasted two months or four years, we made a promise; a promise is a promise, but we are not deviating from it. We do submit that, having regard to the extreme poverty of the country, to the fact that we had to undergo great privations in 1919 owing to high prices from which even now people are suffering, and the extremely unsatisfactory state of our finances, having regard to all these circumstances, Sir, we ask that we should not be uncharitably judged when we ask that the expenditure on the war should be deducted from the amount which might otherwise have been payable."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Kamini Kumar Chanda** :—" I should like to say one or two words, Sir, as I do not wish to give a silent vote on this amendment. Sir, I was one of those who thought it my duty to support the Resolution in 1918, for the grant of this additional sum of 45 millions, but, Sir, the gift was a conditional one, that is to say, that we did not agree to pay as much as 45 millions if the war terminated earlier or if we had to pay for any Frontier war. Though fortunately the war terminated earlier, we have to pay for the Afghan war and Frontier expedition, and I think it naturally follows that we should act according to the terms of the resolution and deduct the amount that we have had to pay for the Afghan war.

" With these few words, Sir, I associate myself with the amendment of Sir Dinshaw Wacha."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Srinivasa Sastri** :—" I also associate myself with the amendment of Sir Dinshaw Wacha."

1196 RESOLUTION RE WITHDRAWAL OF FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE TO MILITARY FORCES.

[*Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea; Raja Sir Rampal Singh; Mr. V. J. Patel; Mr. W. M. Hailey; Mr. Nigel F. Paton.*] [9TH MARCH, 1920.]

12-55 P.M. **The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjea** :—" Sir, I should like to associate myself with this amendment. We do not want to construe the conditions in a petty-fogging spirit, but, having regard to the circumstances in which we find ourselves, we should treat it in a generous spirit, and I therefore think that we are bound to accept the amendment of Sir Dinshaw Wacha."

**The Hon'ble Raja Sir Rampal Singh** :—" I, too, Sir, would like to associate myself with the amendment which Sir Dinshaw Wacha has moved."

12-56 P.M. **The Hon'ble Mr. V. J. Patel** :—" Well, Sir, from the statement of my Hon'ble friend, Mr. Hailey, it is quite clear that there is really no difference between what appears at first sight to be a very moderate amendment and my own Resolution. I thought at first that my Hon'ble friend, Sir Dinshaw Wacha, really wanted something materially different from what I demand, but, after all said and done, the difference comes to not even a million pounds. We have to pay 18 millions if we stand by the 1918 resolution, and if no other conditions have to be considered, I say, 'Do not pay anything'; my Hon'ble friend says, 'No, you pay 850 thousand pounds'. That is the only difference, and yet you never know whether even 850 thousand pounds will have to be paid. What further expenditure will yet have to be incurred we do not know; it may even go over 18 millions. I am not sure whether the amendment of my Hon'ble friend, Sir Dinshaw Wacha would not in effect carry us much farther than my own Resolution. If you accept the amendment of Sir Dinshaw Wacha, you are not sure where you are, but if you accept my Resolution you know exactly where you are.

"However, as there is not much difference, and perhaps the amendment goes even further than my Resolution, I do not mind giving my vote in support of it though I do not propose to withdraw my own Resolution."

12-58 P.M. **The Hon'ble Mr. W. M. Hailey** :—" Sir, I am, I hope, not out of order, but I am only acting in the capacity and with the intention I have already described. If I understood correctly what Sir Dinshaw Wacha intends I think it would be of advantage if the amendment were made clear by the addition of a few words which I hope he will accept; as I have explained before I have suggested this insertion so that there should be no subsequent doubt whatever on the subject. It would be clearer if the following words were added after the word expedition 'as shown in the accounts of the current year and including the sum of one million pounds referred to in paragraph 8 of Appendix II to the Financial Statement and any expenditure incurred during the coming year on the Frontier Tribes Expedition subject to there being no recovery of sums already paid on account of the contribution.' That, I think, expresses what Sir Dinshaw Wacha had in his mind, and I hope he will agree to these additions."

The following amended Resolution was then put to the Council and adopted :—

'This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that the sum shown in paragraph 7, Appendix II, Financial Statement, as still payable for effective and non-effective charges under the Resolution passed by this Council on the 10th September, 1918, on Sir William Meyer's motion, be paid to His Majesty's Government, after deducting therefrom the expenditure on the Afghan War and the Frontier Tribes Expeditions, as shown in the accounts of the current year, and including the sum of one million pounds referred to in paragraph 8 of Appendix II of the Financial Statement, and any expenditure incurred during the coming year on the Frontier Tribes Expedition subject to there being no recovery of sums already paid on account of the contribution.'

**The Hon'ble Mr. Nigel F. Paton** :—" Sir, might I ask it to be recorded that I did not vote? "

RESOLUTION *RE* WITHDRAWAL OF FINANCIAL ASSIST- 1197  
ANCE TO MILITARY FORCES; FINANCIAL STATEMENT  
FOR 1920-21.

[9TH MARCH, 1920.] [Mr. A. P. Muddiman; Sir Claude Hill; Mr.  
Nigel F. Paton; The Vice-President.]

**The Hon'ble Mr. A. P. Muddiman** :—" It will not be record-  
ed unless the Hon'ble Member calls for a division."

**The Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill** (*presiding*) :—" Does the Hon'ble  
Member call for a division?"

**The Hon'ble Mr. Nigel F. Paton** :—" No, Sir, I do not wish to  
put the Council to that trouble."

[At this stage the Council adjourned for Lunch.]

**FINANCIAL STATEMENT FOR 1920-21.**

THIRD STAGE.

**The Vice-President** :—" The Council will now proceed to the third  
stage of the discussion."

**The Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill** :—" Sir, I beg to introduce the 2-34 P.M.  
heads which stand in my name :—

<i>Revenue.</i>	<i>Expenditure.</i>
Land Revenue.	Land Revenue.
Provincial Rates.	Provincial Rates.
Forest.	Forest.
Agriculture.	Agriculture.
Scientific and Miscellaneous Departments.	Scientific and Miscellaneous Departments.
Irrigation.	Famine Relief.
Civil Works.	Protective Works, Irrigation.
	Irrigation.
	Civil Works.
	Capital outlay on Irrigation.

" Last year, in dealing with those heads I dealt rather briefly with the  
Public Works side of my responsibilities because it is exceedingly difficult, in a  
speech in this Council, to dilate at great length upon the technical matters  
connected with the Public Works Department, and especially irrigation. But  
I have thought that this year I might supplement what is usually done by  
laying on the table for the information of Council a note by the Inspector  
General of Irrigation on the progress and condition of Irrigation Works in  
India during the year 1919, and I hope that this departure from precedent will  
be appreciated by the Council

" Before I proceed to deal with some of the specific items in the irrigation  
programme, I should like, if I may, to refer to certain observations which fell  
from my Hon'ble friend Mr. Sastri and also to a prospective Resolution  
by the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma on the subject of irrigation. The Hon'ble Mr. Sastri  
asked certain questions, and the intention of the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma to move  
an increased vote to the irrigation budget shows a misapprehension of the  
situation in regard to irrigation which, I think, it would be well, if I can, to  
dispel. A comparison has been drawn between the irrigation budget and the  
railway budget, as though the two things were in any way parallel, and it has  
been suggested that railways are being pampered at the expense of irrigation.  
Now a little reflection will, I think, show Hon'ble Members that there is no  
possible comparison between the development of irrigation and the development  
of railways. In the case of railways, which are more or less standardised now,  
it is purely a question of construction upon recognised lines and railway

extension is merely an enlargement of an existing great scheme of communications presenting no new problems and no specific difficulties which are not thoroughly well known. Now, in the case of irrigation, it is a totally different proposition. In the case of irrigation a project may perhaps be one costing, we will say, 10 millions: that is well within the mark. In many cases it possibly contemplates the irrigation of an area of 2 million acres, and in each single case it deals with waters differing in character, volume, and so forth, so that there are no two projects for irrigation which stand upon the same footing or which are a direct guide to one another. Consequently, when a project for irrigation is mooted, it is necessary, first of all, to see the engineering possibilities of the thing, then to investigate over a very wide area of country, the possibilities of irrigation with reference to class of soil, and so forth, and thirdly, but by no means less important, to investigate the human nature side of the problem.

"Well, I am not surprised that Hon'ble Members have somewhat misapprehended the difficulties which stand in the way of irrigation and have supposed that less provision was made for it than should have been made, because, as I have often had occasion to say in this Council, Governments, and specially the Government of India, are extremely bad advisers. I have seen it stated that the Government of India go on toiling in a vacuum of good intentions and forget that there is such a thing as human nature. Well, human nature is very inquisitive, and bureaucratic Governments are singularly secretive; and those being the circumstances we have gone on assuming that everybody knew what we have laboriously ascertained in the way of information, and we have not taken either the Council or the public into our confidence in reference to this particular problem nearly so much as we should have done. But I can illustrate what I was saying just now about the complexities of irrigation problems and their elaboration and the time which it takes to work them out by a concrete instance.

"I will take the case of the Sarda Kichha project. That originally was designed to supply canal irrigation to the Province of Oudh. From its geographical situation that was clearly the best objective to have in mind. After a considerable period of investigation—because it is a very big scheme—the project was more or less mooted, and then we were up against human nature; the Taluqdars of Oudh, of whom one at all events is present here to-day, objected to the scheme altogether. They said: 'We have our wells they are quite adequate for our needs; we do not want to pay water rate—we will not have this scheme.' As a result of that attitude—that is where human nature comes in—it was necessary to see whether the waters of this Oudh river could not be utilised to greater advantage elsewhere. Consequently, a most elaborate scheme was eventually got out to take the waters of the Sarda river along the foot-hills of the Himalayas right along to the Ganges and across it, for the purpose of supplementing the deficiency in the waters of the Ganges and Jumna. It will be realised that carrying the waters of the Sarda river many hundred miles along the foot of the Himalayas was a project taking several years to investigate only. Well, when the stage was reached of elaborating that scheme, and when two and a half years had elapsed and it was announced that the project would be further considered, the Taluqdars of Oudh began to re-consider matters. In the meantime it had become apparent to them that their wells were not always full of water; also there happened to be a bad year, and it was brought home to them in fact that it might be well worth their while to utilise their own waters. Consequently, the three years which had elapsed in investigating the alternative project were wasted. We were willing to meet the Taluqdars, and now the situation is that the Sarda Kichha and the Oudh Canal projects hold the field. The Council will therefore understand why a period of eight or nine years have elapsed investigating that particular project, and why it is nobody's fault that it is not ready to be carried into completion at once. I could illustrate this by another case, namely, the Sutlej Valley project. In that instance also human nature has operated as a bar to progress. The Sutlej Valley water which was to be impounded could clearly most advantageously be used for the benefit of the Bikanir State, but the Bikanir State is not a riparian



[9TH MARCH, 1920.]

[Sir Claude Hill.]

State; the Bawalpore State, a little lower down, is and the Bahawalpore State took up an attitude which, I regret, I can only characterise as that of a 'dog in the manger' and asked that the scheme should be stopped. It was only last year that we were able to get a kind of understanding between the two States, and it is only this year that we have reached a more or less technical agreement on the subject. There again a scheme, which might have been carried out already, has been deferred for several years through the instrumentality of, and jealousies incidental to, human nature.

"I only illustrate my statement by these two illustrations, though there are many others which I could cite; but, I think, Council will agree that in the case of these enormous irrigation projects in regard to which India has no model to go upon, and in which India leads the way, it is, in view of the engineering difficulties and problems to be solved, differing in each case, unreasonable to expect, as it will be very foolish to insist, that the Irrigation Department should push on with undue haste in the preparation of schemes.

"Well, as a result of the facts I have mentioned, it has happened that during the past two or three years we have had none of the major Irrigation projects actually ready to be carried into being. To refer again to the instances I have mentioned; had it not been for the peculiarities of human nature we should very easily have been able this year to spend the crore of rupees to which the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma has referred in his resolution. As things are we are not in a position to spend that crore of rupees. But I should like to make this further point clear, that during my tenure of office at all events not on a single occasion when I went up to the Finance Department with a request for money to carry out an irrigation project was I refused. It is simply that we have not been ready, owing to the exigencies of the particular problems which have had to be solved.

"In regard to one point made by my Hon'ble friend, Mr. Sastri, one inquiry rather as to what schemes have been proposed by the Irrigation Commission and what has been done about them. Without wearying the Council with details I may mention that they put forward, I think it was, 61 schemes of which 52 have been taken up, investigated and in the majority of cases carried out.

"The major schemes which are still outstanding I shall now describe to the Council as briefly as I can. But I hope that it will be understood from what I have said that there has been no withholding of money on the part of the Finance Department, from irrigation, and that every demand which has been made to the Finance Department, at all events in my time, has been met and that if I were able to ask for a crore of rupees this year I am certain the Hon'ble Mr. Hailey would have admitted it.

"The following important estimates for irrigation schemes have during the past year been sanctioned by the Secretary of State:—

The Sarda Kichha Feeder Canal in the United Provinces (which I have just mentioned)	Two
The Revised estimate for the Wainganga canal in the Central Provinces.	crores. 48 Lakhs.
The scheme for widening the Madaripur Bhil route, Bengal	Rs. 16,80,000

I need not refer to the Sarda Kichha project further since I have already related its history briefly; but I may mention that the difficult diversion scheme of the Sarda for the improvement of the supplies in the Ganges and Junna canals is no longer necessary for another reason, apart from the waiving by the Taluqdars of their objections. The supply in the Ganges canal, which was short, has been greatly improved by the construction of permanent headworks for the Upper Ganges Canal, while the deficiencies on the Junna will, it is hoped, be made good by the construction of the Bhakra dam project now under investigation.

"The widening of the Madaripur Bhil Route was proposed in order to permit of steamers towing three or four flats abreast, to facilitate vessels passing

one another and to allow of the removal of restrictions which have at present to be imposed, owing to the narrowness of the channel, on certain classes of traffic during the dry season. The widening was not provided for in the original project, but has been rendered necessary by the fact that the traffic using the route has far exceeded what was anticipated when the project was originally framed.

"The project for the Grand Trunk Canal in Bengal, which has been long under consideration, has now been worked out in detail and the estimate, which amounts to Rs. 309 lakhs, has been forwarded to the Secretary of State for sanction. The scheme is designed to provide direct routes for steamer navigation between Calcutta and (a) the Ganges, (b) Assam, Cachar and Sylhet, and (c) Barisal. The canal is eventually to have a width of 400 feet, though in the first instance its width will be 250 feet, with widenings at intervals for crossings. The canal will form a most important link in the chain of waterways in Bengal and will be an asset of the greatest value to Calcutta and those districts of the Presidency which depend upon waterways as an outlet for their trade.

"The Sutlej Valley scheme I have already referred to, but the details of the estimates are the following:—The cost will approximately be Rs. 1,200 lakhs, to secure 2,400,000 acres of new irrigation and to improve 1,600,000 acres of old irrigation. So it will be seen that I was guilty of no exaggeration in referring to some of these schemes as costing 10 million pounds.

"Then the Sind Sagar Canal project, which is estimated to cost about 10 crores and to irrigate about 1,500,000 acres, is now under consideration. The investigation of the Bhakra Dam project, which will irrigate some 1,400,000 acres at a cost of about Rs. 14 crores is delayed pending the preparation of the final project for the Sutlej Valley Scheme.

"The Sukkur Barrage project is still under preparation by the Government of Bombay, but we hope very soon to have proposals from them. The Sukkur Barrage project is an admirable illustration of what I said in regard to the unique character of practically every big project for irrigation in India. It will be the largest work of its kind in the world.

"The project for the Cauvery Reservoir Scheme in Madras is still with the Government of India. I referred to this matter last year when I pointed out that it could not be proceeded with until a settlement had been arrived at between the Governments of Madras and Mysore in the dispute regarding the Kannambadi Reservoir. Unfortunately no agreement has been come to yet between the Governments of Mysore and Madras and matters are still held up.

"I do not propose to weary the Council with details of actual construction since I have laid the Inspector General's Memorandum on the table. But I should like to refer to three matters.

"The first is the Hydro-Electric-Survey which Council will remember, I referred to last year, and mentioned that we had appointed Messrs. Barlow and Meares to make a preliminary survey of India, to see what openings there were for projects of this character. The Council will be sorry to learn that Mr. Barlow died last April and Mr. Meares had to write the Report alone. He produced a very admirable document which some members interested in the matter may have read, and this year we have appointed another officer who will, in association with Mr. Meares, get out a great deal more of valuable information on the subject.

"As regards New Delhi, I do not propose to say much since the matter has been indirectly under discussion. But we hope to be able now, by speeding up, to secure that the new site will be ready for occupation by the winter of 1924-1925.

"The last matter to which I should like to refer is the provision of Council Chambers in the Provinces for the new Legislatures. We have asked Provincial Governments to take this matter under consideration at the earliest possible moment, because it is important that the new Legislatures should have a habitat when they come into being. For the Imperial Councils, as some members of

[9TH MARCH, 1920.]

[Sir Claude Hill.]

this Council are aware, designs are in preparation for a building in the New Capital of dignified proportions and impressive style on a site conveniently adjacent to the central buildings and easily accessible. It is proposed that this block shall embrace three Chambers, namely, the Legislative Assembly, the Council of State, and the Princes' Chamber, with the necessary attached offices and so on. The problem of providing accommodation at Simla is an exceedingly difficult one, which is still engaging the attention of the Government of India.

"Turning now to the Revenue and Agricultural Departments; fortunately, this year, I am being spared the necessity for dilating on the agricultural situation as I had to last year. The monsoon has all round been an excellent one. If only it had followed upon normal conditions we would have had very little to say indeed. Things, however, are still abnormal, and the situation is complicated by the facts not only that the monsoon of 1918 was an unprecedented failure, but that special efforts had to be made till nearly the end of 1918 to supply the allied belligerents with food-stuffs; while there is now the further factor of high world-prices, with their re-action upon internal prices in India. In the result there has been a depletion of India's reserve stocks which have still to be built up to their normal level. It is for these reasons that we have had to take special steps for the control of Burma rice—a measure which has brought us into conflict with the Government of Ceylon. I do not propose to weary the Council with a detailed narrative of the methods of control adopted, since *Communiqués* have been published which have made that clear to anybody who cared to read them. Nor do I propose to enter in detail into the contentions between the Ceylon Government and the Government of India, since His Excellency the Viceroy in his reply to the deputation from Ceylon, which was published, has made the position perfectly clear, but I should like to say definitely here that we hold, as indeed His Excellency the Viceroy told the deputation, that our rice control, under which we give both a quantitative and price preference to Ceylon has benefited that Colony by reducing the price below the level it would otherwise have had to pay. There is a limit below which it would be unfair to the Burma producer to go; since any further concession to Ceylon or elsewhere, is, under our scheme, directly at the cost of Burma producers.

"I would, however, urge those Hon'ble Members who are interested in the food situation in India to study the very able report of Mr. Innes, who was lately Foodstuffs Controller and to whom I am very glad to take this opportunity of paying a tribute for the admirable work he did on behalf of India when he was Foodstuffs Controller. Incidentally to that report, Hon'ble Members will remember that, during the year 1919, until about August last, we were importing wheat from Australia; and it may interest the Council to be reminded that we imported altogether from Australia nearly 201,000 tons. We controlled the disposal of that wheat in the interests generally of India with a view to keeping prices at a reasonable level. The profits on the whole transaction are estimated to amount to 23 lakhs of rupees.

"As a remnant of the conditions which came into being on account of the failure of the 1918 monsoon, I may mention that the inter-provincial control of the movements of food-grains still obtains in the case of rice throughout India, wheat and gram from the Punjab and the United Provinces and of all food-grains to and from the two frontier provinces, but we hope to remove these restrictions as soon as practicable having regard to economic and political conditions. The policy of tightening control over the exports of food-grains is being continued, and the reason why such control is necessary is, as will have been clear to those who have studied Mr. Innes' Report and the various *Communiqués* which we have issued, the need for keeping internal prices within reasonable limits and for building up stocks of food-stuffs in India. There is the further need, of course, so long as we control the exports of Burma rice, to see that the exports of rice from India are also restricted within the narrowest possible compass; since otherwise there would be no guarantee that the purpose for which we reserve some 800,000 tons of Burma rice will be fulfilled,

[ *Sir Claude Hill.* ]

[ 9TH MARCH, 1920. ]

There would in fact be no certainty that the speculators in India, with a view to reaping the large profits which would be open to them by re-exporting the Burma rice and getting for such exports extraordinarily high prices, would not thus defeat the whole object of the policy. I should like to add here a warning. I believe it to be the case, certainly we have information which points to that that rice and other food-grains in India are being hoarded and kept back from the public by speculators who hope that the restrictions on exports of grain from India will be removed and that they will then be able to reap the benefit of enhanced prices. I should like to state here that the Government of India propose to maintain a careful watch upon that matter, and that the exports of food-stuffs will not be permitted in such a manner, so far as Government can prevent it, as to enable those profiteers to reap the benefit which they hope to at the expense of the producer and consumer.

" Certain questions have been asked in this Council bearing upon the net exports of grain, pulse and flour from India, and it may interest the Council if I lay on the table a short statement showing the figures of net exports of grain, pulse and flour from India, excluding Burma, in tons. The interest of the figures lies in the fact that it is shown that we have already succeeded by our policy in accumulating stocks of food-stuffs to the extent of some 4 million tons.

" Other questions have been asked with a view to eliciting comparative figures of average prices of food-grains for India as a whole. I think it is extraordinarily difficult to furnish reliable figures on that head, partly owing to the control, and partly owing to the shortage of rolling-stock which has obtained in some places; also where you have, as you had until a few days ago, inter-district control. In Madras, we have such extraordinary variations of prices within the same province, that no average can possibly be struck which would be of any value.

" I will now turn to other matters. In the first place, I think it will interest the Council to know that the Secretary of State has recently sanctioned a Cattle Breeding and Dairying scheme which we laid before him a year ago, and that we have addressed Local Governments on it, and we hope they will take steps to give effect to it. I will not attempt to describe the scheme in detail, but it has been the subject of close examination by the Board of Agriculture and is based on a memorandum which was drawn up originally by Mr. Coventry, who was formerly Agricultural Adviser. It is proposed under the scheme to create a post of Imperial Dairy Expert and to engage a Physiological Chemist, while provinces under the scheme will, we hope, co-operate in an organised manner to improve cattle breeding with a view to the development and improvement of the milk supply throughout India.

" I think the Council will learn, with satisfaction, that the Government of Bengal have at last decided to establish an agricultural institute at Dacca. Hitherto, the Bengal Government have been content to rely, for their agricultural development, upon the College at Sabour in the province of Bihar and Orissa. We have long felt that a large and important province like Bengal should have an institution of its own (in this, I am sure, my Hon'ble friend Mr. Banerjee will agree), and it is a subject for congratulation that they should have taken the present opportunity for inaugurating that institute, because it synchronises with the bringing into being of the University of Dacca, and it is, therefore, possible to hope that not only will the institute subserve the functions of a College for tuition and so forth, but that it will eventually follow the example of Bombay and the Punjab, and be affiliated to the Dacca University.

" It has been clear to anyone reading the papers that great interest has been aroused recently in the matter of fodder storage. This extraordinarily difficult question has been under the consideration of the Bombay Government since before I left that Government, and great assistance has been given by a Member of the Bombay Legislative Council, namely, the Hon'ble Purshotamdas Thakordas. Thanks to his efforts, backed by those of the Bombay Agricultural Department, a scheme has now been brought partially into being

[9TH MARCH, 1920.]

[*Sir Claude Hill.*]

under which they have established two stores of fodder reserves, both of grass and kadbi; and the last annual Report of the Agricultural Department from Bombay has a peculiarly interesting section dealing with this subject of fodder reserves. It is very instructive, and I propose to draw the special attention of every province to what is being done in Bombay. It may also interest the Council to know that we have arranged to hold a conference on fodder storage during the ensuing Simla Season.

"Hon'ble Members may also be interested to hear that we have considered a proposal which has been made for inaugurating an Indian Agricultural Society on the lines of the Royal Agricultural Society in England. Local Governments have been consulted in the matter, and, although their reports are in many instances critical, on the whole they afford room for encouragement, and it is hoped that eventually such a Society will come into being, and that it will be a valuable stimulus to Provincial Governments in the matter of agricultural development. Conditions, of course, are quite different in India from what they are in England, still more so from what they were in England when the Royal Agricultural Society came into existence some eighty years ago; but to my mind the difference is in favour rather than against the establishment of such a Society in India. In England, at the time the Royal Agricultural Society came into existence, there was no agricultural service, there was no organisation for research in agriculture of any kind, and all these things have been developed by the stimulus given by the Royal Agricultural Society. Certain Local Governments have pointed out the difficulties that may arise from the establishment of a corresponding body out here, side by side with the existing agricultural staff. I myself do not share the view that these difficulties are insurmountable, or that it will be less useful to have a stimulating non-official body, such as an influential Agricultural Society, such a Society might keep Provincial Governments and the Government of India up to the mark in the matter of the improvement of agriculture, and I hope that soon that development will be possible.

"Reverting for a moment to the question of high prices of food-stuffs, this Council is aware that the Select Committee on High Prices has already held one meeting and hopes very shortly to meet again. I think the briefest way of dealing with this question will be to lay on the table a copy of the proceedings of the meeting of the Select Committee which was held on the 17th February last.

"Before I leave the subject of agriculture and its development I should like once more, and for the last time, to refer to the subject of agricultural education.

"This Council will be glad to learn that the inauguration of agricultural middle schools, to which I referred last year, is showing signs of developing, and Local Governments are now displaying an active interest which I felt sure we could count upon when once the necessary initiative was applied. I feel that, if nothing else has resulted during the last five years, a very useful start has been made in this matter by getting people to realise that, in agriculture, just as in every other industry and department of life, it is sound education and training that is necessary if progress is to be achieved.

"I am still hoping that it will be a very short time before every province has an agricultural college or institute affiliated to the Provincial University. The opposition to this idea has been strenuous, but I think there are signs of this breaking down, when once agricultural education makes good from top to bottom, and when middle agricultural schools multiply. I think India may regard herself as being on the high road towards securing that her rich inheritance in agricultural land shall be exploited to its fullest capacity, which is very, very far from being the case at present.

"I now turn to forest matters. Owing to the great depletion of our cadres we have been handicapped in developing forestry as rapidly as we should wish. In spite of the handicap of shortage of staff, however, there has been progress, and the work of preparation for the fuller utilisation of our forest resources is proceeding. The services of two Consulting Forest Engineers have been obtained from America—one is already working in Burma,

1204 FINANCIAL STATEMENT FOR 1920-21; RESOLUTION *RE*  
REDUCTION OF ALLOTMENT FOR CAPITAL EXPENDI-  
TURE ON DELHI.

[*Sir Claude Hill; Mr. Kamini Kumar Chanda.*] [9TH MARCH, 1920.]

and the other, who is to be employed in the Andamans and India, is expected to arrive shortly. Further, and the Council will, I know, approve of our action taken in this matter. We have been encouraging to the utmost the deputation of the forest officers on leave to study various special branches of forestry both at Home and in America. The Secretary of State, moreover, has now sanctioned the creation of a regular service of Forest Engineers, the officers of which will undergo a course of training in America before taking up their duties.

"The most important matter, however, in connection with forestry is perhaps that we have just received the sanction of the Secretary of State to a scheme, recently submitted, for the expansion of the Forest Research Institute at Dehra Dun. This expansion is necessitated by the realisation that if our forests are to be exploited on scientific lines, we must enlarge greatly both the laboratory and establishment sides of our research institute and instal plant for the testing and artificial seasoning of timber for the production of paper pulp and so forth. It is also possible that tuition in the higher branches may have to be given at Dehra Dun, and this can more easily be arranged if we have a thoroughly up-to-date institute and an up-to-date staff.

"But of course the increased provision of timber is at the root of all forest policy and the importance of a scientific development of silviculture cannot be over-estimated. India is going to take part in the Timber Exhibition which is to be held in England this year, and we have endeavoured to arrange that she shall be adequately represented. I confidently hope that, with the realisation of India's resources in this respect, there will be an ever-growing demand for Indian timber, and it will be up to the Forest service to maintain the high standard of technical efficiency which it has maintained hitherto.

"That, Sir, completes all I have to say in detail on the heads which stand in my name, but as this is the last opportunity I shall have of referring to these subjects, I should like, if the Council will tolerate me for a moment longer, to discharge my feeling of obligation to those with whom I have been associated by referring, as briefly as I can, to some, though not nearly all, of those to whom India, and the Department for which I have been responsible during the last five years, owe so much. We have lost in Sir Sidney Burrard a very distinguished survey officer, who was well known in the scientific world, and who stayed on most patriotically, after his period of service was over, during the war. In Sir George Hart, India has had an Inspector General of Forests of pre-eminent ability, and Mr. McKenna as an agricultural officer has been well known to every Member of this Council on various occasions, and has himself been a Member of this Council. His conduct of the work of the Cotton Committee has been endorsed at Home as being of the utmost possible value, and I think India will find that she owes a great debt of gratitude to him. Of Mr. Rose, who recently left India to take up an appointment in China, I can only say that I experienced in his departure a very serious loss, though it has been made good as far as was possible by Sir Sidney Crookshank. And I should like in conclusion to convey my cordial personal thanks to the Hon'ble Mr. Mant for his long and very valuable assistance to me in all the work that has fallen to our joint lot."

---

**RESOLUTION *RE* REDUCTION OF ALLOTMENT FOR  
CAPITAL EXPENDITURE ON DELHI.**

3-19 P. M. **The Hon'ble Mr. Kamini Kumar Chanda :—**"Sir, I beg to move the following Resolution :—

"This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that the allotment for capital expenditure on Delhi works be reduced by fifty thousand rupees."

RESOLUTION RE REDUCTION OF ALLOTMENT FOR CAPITAL 1205  
EXPENDITURE ON DELHI.

[9TH MARCH, 1920.] [Mr. Kamini Kumar Chanda; Sir Claude Hill;  
Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.]

"I will not detain the Council for more than a minute. My point shortly is this, that in view of the last debate on the question of the location of the headquarters of the Government of India, we are not justified in spending such a large sum of money on Delhi. The allotment is Rs. 1,10,00,000 and I should mention to the Council that my Resolution should have been worded, that the amount should be reduced by 50 lakhs, not 50,000. Sir, it will be remembered by the Council that Sir William Vincent, in reply to my motion that Calcutta be made the headquarters of the Government of India, again said that he had no time to investigate the question as the notice received was too short. I referred to this yesterday and I now put it more formally. And, in the second place, he said that the reformed Council, which would come into being next year, would be a better judge, and that he would place the papers before His Excellency the Viceroy to decide what to do. In view of this, Sir, I submit it cannot possibly be right that we should be spending such a large amount. If the answer was that the decision of Government that Delhi would be the headquarters of the Government of India was final and irrevocable, one could not find fault with this process of spending such a large amount on Delhi; but you do not say that. What Sir William Vincent said amounted to this: 'Wait and see what happens next year when the new Council comes into being.' That being so, my submission is that you ought not to spend such a big amount, but simply carry on as you have been doing during the last four or five years. Sir Claude Hill said just now that he expected that many buildings would be ready by the cold weather of 1924, not the whole city—the architects do not certify that—but in five years only a portion of the city will be ready. In these circumstances, I do not think there is any particular hurry for going on spending money like this. Why not wait for another year? That is my ground for bringing this matter up again formally. I think the Council probably will join me in asking the Hon'ble Home Member to tell us what decision has been arrived at after the papers were placed before His Excellency as he promised to do.

"With these words I place this Resolution before the Council."

**The Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill;**—“The Hon'ble Mr. Chanda is 3-17 P.M.  
apparently engaged in the unfruitful occupation of flogging a dead horse, but I am not quite clear as to whether he is flogging it with a 50,000 whip or a 50 lakh whip. His motion as it stands, and which I understand I am dealing with, is that the Delhi estimate should be reduced by Rs. 50,000. If that is so, I can only regard the motion as, so to speak, a qualified vote of censure, but with no particular definite objective, since it is not suggested where those Rs. 50,000 should be devoted instead of to the construction of Delhi. Well, Sir, if I may suggest it, I will ask this Council not to accept the Hon'ble Mr. Chanda's Resolution. I am reluctant to detain the Council by going again into the details of the arguments relating to abandoning New Delhi, which were so thoroughly threshed out the other day, and in regard to which, in connection with the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma's Resolution, little support of a definite and constructive character was secured. It seems to me that I should be doing what this Council would hardly approve if I detained it any longer on that subject, which, quite frankly, I cannot myself help regarding, in view of that discussion, and of all that has occurred, as *chose jugée*. I still venture to hope that the Hon'ble Mr. Chanda will not press this Resolution to a division.”

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma:**—“Sir, I have not 3-19 P.M.  
given notice of any similar resolution because I knew there would not be much use in it, but I may state that the horse is not dead, it has simply fainted for the time being, and it all depends on the 200 members who may come here next year whether they will put life into it, or whether they are going to leave it for dead. The only point in urging any motion of this description is that

1206 RESOLUTION *RE* REDUCTION OF ALLOTMENT FOR CAPITAL EXPENDITURE ON DELHI; RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF EXPENDITURE ON IRRIGATION AND DRAINAGE BY ONE CRORE OF RUPEES.

[ *Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma*; *Mr. Kamini Kumar Chanda*; *The Vice-President.* ] [9TH MARCH, 1920.]

it may not be said against the members of this Council that they were ready to agree to heavy expenditure of this kind when they could have stayed it by a motion of this character. I think there is no need to detain the Council any further."

3.20 P.M. **The Hon'ble Mr. Kamini Kumar Chanda** :—" Sir, I submit with all respect to my Hon'ble friend, Sir Claude Hill, that he has avoided the issue which I raised. I asked what was the decision come to by Government on this question. I wanted to know what was the decision come to by the Government on this debate. The Hon'ble Sir William Vincent told us that he would place the papers before His Excellency to decide what should be done. I should like to know what has been done, whether the papers have been sent Home, or whether it has been decided irrevocably that Delhi is to be the capital. If it is not, then, I submit, there is no justification for spending such a large amount of money on it, which would be a waste after all. With these remarks, I beg to press my Resolution."

**The Vice-President** :—" I did not quite catch what the Hon'ble Member has decided to do."

**The Hon'ble Mr. Kamini Kumar Chanda** :—" I press the Resolution before the Council; I do not withdraw it."

The Resolution was put and rejected.

---

**RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF EXPENDITURE ON IRRIGATION AND DRAINAGE BY ONE CRORE OF RUPEES.**

3.21 P.M. **The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** :—" Sir, I would like to have information on one or two points, as the Hon'ble Member said there was no use in pressing my Resolution and I do not wish to waste the time of the Council. The Hon'ble Member for Agriculture said . . . ."

**The Vice-President** :—" I must ask the Hon'ble Member to move his Resolution or to withdraw it. He knows the rule quite well. He must not make a speech first."

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** :—" I was asking for information."

**The Vice-President** :—" That can be done by a question."

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** :—" It was a question I was putting."

**The Vice-President** :—" This is not question time."

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma** :—" Are there no projects on which any money can be spent?"

**The Vice-President** :—" I must call upon the Hon'ble Member to move his Resolution; he must either move it or withdraw it."



RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF EXPENDITURE ON IRRIGATION AND DRAINAGE BY ONE CRORE OF RUPEES. 1207

[9TH MARCH, 1920.] [Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.]

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma :—**“ Well, Sir, there is plenty of time to withdraw a Resolution. I beg to move the Resolution standing against my name :—

‘ This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that the expenditure on Irrigation and Drainage be increased by one crore of rupees.’

“ We listened, Sir, with very great interest and attention to the very lucid exposition of the policy of Government with regard to irrigation and their difficulties. I may state at once that the outside public are not altogether so ignorant of the difficulties of the Government as perhaps the Government think they are. We know that there is a wide difference between irrigation projects and railway projects. The matter has been clearly set forth in the Irrigation Commission's Report itself. Nor are we complaining of the relative expenditure on railways and irrigation or asking that because large sums of money are being spent on railways that, therefore, large sums ought to be spent on irrigation. There is a feeling, however, that the Government of India—I am not saying the present Government of India—have not hitherto shown very great alacrity in pushing forward irrigation schemes so as to rapidly increase the productivity of the soil in India, which they might have been expected to do from the recommendations of the Irrigation Commission.

“ The Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill has told us that most of the projects, 51, I think, out of the 62, have been sanctioned, and many of them completed. That is a very gratifying feature, but the public would like to have some detailed information as to the extent of extra acreage which has been brought under cultivation since 1908-04, and as to whether more irrigation projects could not have been undertaken during this period of 17 years since the Report of the Irrigation Commission was published. I believe they recommended a programme of about 44 crores of rupees, and the sum which has been so far expended does not seem to exceed about £19·6 million. The progress in irrigation during the period of the war was necessarily handicapped by reason of the absence of Public Works officers on military duty. I think nobody can hold the Government of India responsible for their inability to push on irrigation programmes when their principal officers were unavoidably absent on military duty. But, Sir, the public are somewhat impatient, and have been, I think, not unreasonably so, especially since last year, because the causes of obstruction have been removed and the Government of India themselves have published reports which show that the margin between famine, destitution and bare sustenance is very, very narrow. I need hardly allude to the fact that the report of Mr. Innes, to whom we are glad to acknowledge our indebtedness, shows that the exports of foodstuffs from India, when analysed, are largely from Burma and the margin of production in British India itself is extremely low. I believe 2½ million tons out of 57 million tons, the average before 1913-14, and consequently, in a bad year, when there is a deficiency of 14 or 18 million tons, as there was in 1918-19, the fate of the people was nearly sealed. It is in these circumstances, Sir, that the people appeal to the Government of India not to blame them if they are a little impatient in urging the Government of India to endeavour to the best of their ability to meet them by showing greater progress, in spite of the manifold difficulties which the Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill had urged in his admirable address to us. That is the real point. His memorandum shows that the Government of India have projects under consideration, some of which have been sanctioned, some of which are under sanction, aggregating 60 crores of rupees. So it is not that money cannot be spent. In answer to a question of mine last year it was stated that two important projects costing a good deal of money have been sent up to the Secretary of State for consideration and sanction, and I take it, Sir, that, if the Government of India has not received his sanction already, they will receive it in the not distant future. May I ask, therefore, whether there are absolutely no projects ready on which they could not spend an additional sum of one crore of rupees provided the human material is forthcoming? I think the difficulties of the Government really are, first, the

1208 RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF EXPENDITURE ON IRRIGATION AND DRAINAGE BY ONE CRORE OF RUPEES.

[*Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma ; Mr. K. V. Reddi.*] [9TH MARCH, 1920.]

labour problem, secondly, the officer problem. I have not heard that the labour problem is so very difficult and that a crore of rupees cannot be spent on masonry and earthwork provided the officers are ready and the schemes are ready. I hope that there would be a possibility of getting men from the tracts where very low wages prevail. It will be possible to attract them to the tracts where these irrigation works may have to be started. It will be possible to bring them to the tracts where irrigation works may be started.

“Then the real problem seems to be, as has been hinted clearly, the human material, the personnel of officers. Here I can sympathise with the difficulties of the Government of India and of the officers. It would be cruel on the part of the people to ask these officers who did such hard work to remain another year. But some of them at least should remain another year in order to push some of these schemes through. Taking the poverty of the country, the poor margin of subsistence of the people, and the fact that for the last few years practically very little has been spent upon new schemes (I think the total amounts for four years to three crores including next year) may I ask if it is too much to request some of these officers to remain on duty although they are legitimately entitled to furlough, if that is the real difficulty?

“This would necessarily bring us to another question, as to whether it would be right in the interests of India to rely entirely upon the European element in the higher personnel of the Public Works Department and the Irrigation Department having regard to these extreme inconveniences? My own opinion is that there are enough talented Indian Engineers in India whose services would be highly useful in pushing these projects through under perhaps one or two expert European Engineers. All I ask is for information on these points, firstly, as to whether there are no projects ready on which money could be spent, secondly, as to whether labour is not forthcoming, and thirdly, as to whether the material as regards officers is absolutely out of the question. If I am told that the money cannot be spent, I shall most reluctantly withdraw the Resolution.”

2-32 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Mr. K. V. Reddi:**—“Sir, there is one aspect in connection with the irrigation policy of the Government of India which deserves to be placed before them. As my Hon'ble friend just now stated, the Irrigation Commission reported nearly twenty years ago on projects which would cost 44 crores of rupees. This was distributed among the various provinces, and Madras was allotted something like 15 crores and a half. I was examining the figures of the sums that were spent in the provinces from the year 1908 to the year 1917; and taking the major provinces of the Punjab, the United Provinces and Madras, I find that whereas in the United Provinces something like £536,981 were spent on capital outlay on productive works, in Madras only £349,178 were spent, while in the Punjab I find that £5,324,000 were spent. That would work out, Sir, in this proportion, whereas the Irrigation Commission expected that one-third of the expenditure would be in the Madras Presidency, we find that, as a matter of fact, it is only one-eighteenth, based on these figures. In Madras, very important works were suggested; there was the storage work on the Cauvery, there was the Tungabhadra project and there was the Krishna storage works in my own district of Krishna. None of these works would seem to have been commenced, though I know that so far as the Cauvery work is concerned, a genuine attempt was made by the Government to see its way to commence the work. Unfortunately as has been shown, no agreement could be come to between the Mysore Government and the Madras Government; but, Sir, no such difficulty exists so far as the Krishna storage work is concerned, and if that work had been taken up and completed, I am perfectly certain that trouble from Burma for having controlled rice would have been easily avoided. So far as the Krishna district is concerned, it has been able to supply rice not only to the whole of Madras Presidency, but to a great portion of the Bombay Presidency also; and if only this work had been completed, India

RESOLUTION RE INCREASE OF EXPENDITURE ON IRRIGATION AND DRAINAGE BY ONE CRORE OF RUPEES. 1209

[9TH MARCH, 1920] [Mr. K. V. Reddi; Mr. K. V. Rangaswamy Ayyangar; Sir Claude Hill; The Vice-President; Sir Dinshaw Wacha.]

need not have gone to Burma for rice. I would, therefore, support this resolution in the hope that something might be done for the province of Madras and some work would be undertaken. I know the difficulties of the Government. I know it is not merely their intention to start these works; but there are the engineer's difficulties and the human factor to which Sir Claude Hill so ably referred."

**The Hon'ble Mr. K. V. Rangaswamy Ayyangar:**—"Sir, for 8-36 P.M. the last four years I have been urging the Government to take up the question of the Cauvery Reservoir Project. In the report submitted to the Government of India by Mr. T. R. J. Ward it is stated that the Cauvery Reservoir Scheme was estimated to cost about four crores and that the project is still with the Government of India and cannot be proceeded with pending settlement of the question of the distribution of the Cauvery water between Mysore and Madras. The only question I want to put is, even supposing that the arbitration award should be in favour of the Mysore Government, is it not the intention of the Government to proceed with the project? . . . .

**The Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill:**—"Sir, I rise to a point of order. Has it any relevance to the present motion?"

**The Vice-President:**—"I suppose the Hon'ble Member is coming to it. I gather that all Hon'ble Members are proposing that these various schemes should be financed out of this additional one crore."

**The Hon'ble Mr. K. V. Rangaswamy Ayyangar:**—"A beginning may be made just now, even if the whole amount cannot be spent in the course of the year. What I want to say is that even if the award should go against the Government of Madras, we could begin on a small scale with this project. Why not make a beginning now? We have been suffering very much and the Government have been put to a very great loss on account of not beginning this project long before. As to labour difficulties, I do not think there will be much in that way. We have heard only this morning that the conditions in Southern India and Bihar are very bad and that some project or other should be taken in hand to relieve the situation by providing labour for them. I beg to bring before the notice of the Government the urgency of this matter, that this Cauvery Reservoir scheme may be begun this year. If it is begun on a small scale it can be expanded if the award should be in favour of the Madras Government."

**The Hon'ble Sir Dinshaw Wacha:**—"I am afraid, Sir, 8-39 P.M. that the policy on which the Government is proceeding in reference to the irrigation works in the country is not quite a practical policy, in one respect only. The Government do everything through the Public Works Department; even large irrigation works of the character which the Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill just mentioned in his speech are done entirely by the Public Works Department. Now, if instead of the Public Works Department undertaking the construction of such works they were entrusted to large contractors of recognised ability and great reputation, men like Messrs. Bird and Company, who built the Assouan Dam, which cost 10 crores of rupees and more, I think the progress would be rather speedier and more satisfactory, and the Government would not be worried in this matter as it has been in the past. That is the change that is required in the policy of the Government as regards the construction of large irrigation works. That should be the right procedure. Even on the Continent, big railways were built by big firms of the financial ability and resources of Messrs. Brassey. They built most satisfactorily railways in Austria and in other parts of Europe. Why should not the Government of India entrust works to the large contractors of the ability and reputation I have named who are perfectly

1210 RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF EXPENDITURE ON IRRIGATION AND DRAINAGE BY ONE CRORE OF RUPEES.

[*Sir Dinshaw Wacha; Sir Claude Hill; Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma.*] [9TH MARCH, 1920.]

solvent, who have got large organisations at their command, who employ any number of labourers and who can also finance these projects? If those were invited to carry out the projects sanctioned by the Government of India, I think the progress would be quicker and more satisfactory. The whole mistake lies in never going outside the Public Works Department for colossal works."

3-40 P. M.

**The Hon'ble Sir Claude Hill:**—"Sir, I charged the Hon'ble Mr. Chanda with beating a dead horse; I must now charge my Hon'ble friend Mr. Sarma, with flogging a willing one. I am perfectly willing, if I can only see my way to it, to ask the Hon'ble Mr. Hailey for a crore of rupees, but I had already indicated, I hoped more or less lucidly to the Council, that it is impossible to spend that sum, much to my regret.

"But I see that I have not been altogether plain. It has been assumed that it is a question only of being able to provide *personnel* and labour. That is very far indeed from being the case. It is not merely a question of *personnel* and labour, though that is a very important factor, and we have great deficiencies in our staff. This happens to be one of those periods when we are not ready to spend a great deal of money on any of the vaster schemes. In other words, the three schemes which are sanctioned, to which I referred in my speech and which the Hon'ble Member referred to, are not in a condition to be the subject of expenditure. There is a great deal of lay-out work to be done before the solid work of construction can be commenced.

"Then, again, my Hon'ble friend Sir Dinshaw Wacha referred to the question of employing big contractors. That, if I may say so, subject to correction if I mistook his meaning, is not a question of policy, but a question of method of execution; and the question of the method of execution has not been reached at the present time because we are not in a position at present to give any of these large works out on contract. The stage has not yet been reached when contracts could be invited for those particular works. That is the situation so far as I understand it.

"Well, I need only refer, I think, to one other point, and that is the circumstance that my Hon'ble friend Mr. Sarma has secured support from two compatriots from Madras to his motion. But I should like to point out, in reference to the particular work—the Cauvery Reservoir—which has been referred to, that I explained how it was that progress was not made. It is not the fault of the Government of India that the progress has been slow.

"Since the Hon'ble Mr. Reddi has drawn attention to what he regards as a grievance on the part of Madras based on the assumption that the amount of expenditure in Madras bears a somewhat meagre proportion to the value of the works recommended by the Irrigation Commission, it may be relevant merely to mention that of the few works recommended by the Irrigation Commission which have been abandoned, two are in Madras and they happen to be the two largest. It has been necessary to abandon the Tungabhadra scheme, while the Krishna Reservoir Scheme had to be held in abeyance pending the completion of the Cauvery Reservoir. The Tungabhadra project was estimated to cost nearly 12 crores and the Krishna Reservoir project about 8 crores; so that if one eliminates those two from the programme, it will be seen that the expenditure in Madras has not been so deficient as has been suggested.

"In the circumstances, I suggest that as I am unable, much as I should like, to back my Hon'ble Friend Mr. Sarma in asking for this one crore of rupees, it will perhaps not be worth while to press the resolution."

3-45 P. M.

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma:**—"Sir, I do not see any object in further pressing this resolution."

The Resolution was, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

[9TH MARCH, 1920.]

[Mr. Shafi.]

**FINANCIAL STATEMENT FOR 1920-21.**

**The Hon'ble Mr. Shafi** :—“ Sir, I have the honour to introduce <sup>8.45 P.M.</sup> the heads of Sanitation and Education (Revenue and Expenditure), of the Financial Statement for 1920-21.

“ To deal with the subject of Education first.

**(a) EDUCATION.**

“ The year which is about to close has been eventful particularly in two respects. It saw the conclusion of the labours of the Calcutta University Commission and the commencement, on the part of the Government of India, of action on its recommendations. Hon'ble Members will agree that perhaps the most important of the Commission's proposals is the prolongation of the school life and the curtailment of the period of college study. It has long been generally recognised that the lower classes in our colleges cannot be regarded as classes for university teaching at all, and that instruction in those classes on lines which are suitable to a university student is altogether unsound. The Commission have now formulated a definite scheme for severance of intermediate education from university education proper. The change is undoubtedly very great and, like all wholesome changes, is certain to involve heavy expenditure. But if the task of placing our educational system on a proper basis is to be earnestly taken into hand, we shall have to face the expenditure involved. The introduction of the new system recommended by the Commission will result in the extension of our secondary education over a longer period than is the case at present, and with its adoption will result in considerable improvement in its quality and standard. Perhaps it is not fully realised that during the last 12 years or so almost every province in India has been adopting measures calculated to bring about improvements in our system of secondary education along a programme definitely laid down in each province. During the past year the scheme of improvement in Bengal, where secondary schools are most numerous and their condition, as the Commission has pointed out, is anything but satisfactory, has been partially completed by the sanction of considerable expenditure both on Government and on privately managed schools.

“ Another important proposal of the Commission is the establishment of unitary universities. It is unnecessary for me to dilate on this portion of its recommendation as a great deal has already been said and written in this connection, and I expect we shall hear a lot more about the subject during the remainder of this Session. The fact that the Government of India have promptly taken up this idea in connection with the proposed establishment of the Dacca University is indicative of their earnestness in carrying into effect this portion of the Commission's proposals. Hon'ble Members will be interested to learn that action is also being taken in other provinces in this respect. Schemes are afoot in the United Provinces for establishing teaching universities at Allahabad and Lucknow, while our Muhammadan friends are again bringing forward the scheme of a university at Aligarh. Moreover, schemes for the establishment of a university at Rangoon and another at Nagpur are also likely to reach a definite stage at an early date. The coming year, therefore, bids fair to be one of great activity in the sphere of university education in the country.

“ Another important event of the year under review has been the re-organisation of our Educational Services. Hon'ble Members will remember that, owing to the outbreak of the World War, decision on the various recommendations of the Public Services Commission had remained in abeyance. On the conclusion of the war the Government of India, fully recognising their duty to the Indian public in this respect, turned their attention to the work of re-organisation. It will be remembered that the Commission proposed the transfer of certain posts from the Provincial to the Indian Educational Service, recommended that 25 per cent. of the resultant aggregate number of posts in

the Indian Educational Service should go to Indians, and that 50 per cent. of whatever posts may hereafter be created should be filled up by the appointment of Indians. The Government of India went a step further and recommended the adoption of 50 per cent. Indianisation of the Indian Educational Service, old and new, as the goal to be aimed at. The orders of the Secretary of State were received at the close of 1919 sanctioning the recommendations made by the Government of India. The Government of India have further decided that, in order to accelerate the realisation of the ultimate goal, all vacancies in the posts to be transferred from the Provincial to Indian Educational Service and 50 per cent. of the vacancies occurring in the existing Indian Educational Service shall be filled up by the appointment of Indians until the goal of 50 per cent. Indianisation in the entire cadre of the Indian Educational Service is reached. It is clear, therefore, that the system now adopted, on the initiative of the Government of India, is one which marks a decided and a highly satisfactory advance in the existing conditions in the matter of Indianisation of our higher Educational Service. The earnestness with which the Government of India are carrying out this scheme of Indianisation will be clear from the fact that during the year under review as many as 25 Indians have already been appointed to the Indian Educational Service.

“Similarly, the conditions of the Provincial Educational Services are also about to undergo considerable improvement. From some questions which have been asked in this Council, I gather that there is, in the minds of Hon'ble Members, some doubt about the terms for those services. To my mind the matter is simple enough. Between a minimum of Rs. 250 and a maximum of Rs. 800, a Local Government may frame its scale as it thinks fit. This appears to be a much better scheme than that put forward by the Commission; for being elastic it will allow of variation in provinces according to the ease or difficulty with which suitable candidates may be forthcoming and commensurate with the cost of living, etc. It has, further, this advantage that the transformation of the existing varied services into a single rigid mould would be a matter of enormous difficulty. In the system which has been adopted, this difficulty will not arise.

“Nor have our service improvements stopped here. In recent years various Local Governments have taken up the case of the Subordinate Educational Service and a steady improvement has been going on in the pay of elementary teachers, whether employed in Board or aided schools. The Educational Commissioner will lay his annual Narrative on the table for the information of Hon'ble Members and, read together with those which have gone before, this year's Narrative will show that a steady improvement is being effected along these lines. The increase of pay in the case of individual primary teachers may not be very great. But when we think of the vast number of primary teachers and figure out the enormous cost which these small changes involve, the significance of these improvements becomes self-evident.

“Another reform, which we have carried out in the year under review, is likely to grow into one of very great importance. I refer to the scheme which after long and careful consideration in consultation with the Local Governments and obtaining the sanction of the Secretary of State, has been promulgated for the creation of the provident fund for teachers in non-pensionable services. I can think of few conditions more fully calculated to render our teachers more contented, to attract better men, to keep them in the service and gradually to bring about the formation of a regular profession of teaching than this scheme of provident funds. Its benefits will extend to a very large number of persons who, in the existing conditions, are not in a position to make provision for themselves and their families calculated to keep them in comfort in their old age.

“I now pass on to primary education. The Government of India have declared their policy in a letter which was published at the time and which I laid on the table again the other day. In the meanwhile, in province after

[9TH MARCH, 1920.]

[Mr. Shafi.]

province Acts have been placed on the Provincial Statute-books permitting the adoption of compulsion in local areas for the expansion of elementary education. In Bengal, Bihar and Orissā, the United Provinces and the Punjab such Acts were passed during the year under review and received the assent of His Excellency the Viceroy and Governor General.

“ But it is self-evident that schools cannot be carried on with material addition to the cost of education without a sufficiency of trained teachers, and I regard this as a subject of the highest moment to the cause of educational advancement in this country. In the year 1919 we had 21,527 teachers under training for all sorts of institutions. But, though the number sounds large, it is, in my judgment, by no means enough. The Secretary of State sanctioned a scheme for Bengal which is calculated to bring about a vast improvement in the system of training of elementary teachers in that Presidency. Similarly, an important scheme of expansion has been sanctioned for the Bombay Presidency. Hon'ble Members will appreciate the magnitude of these schemes when I say that taken together the capital expenditure thereon will exceed 13 lakhs, and the ultimate additional recurring expenditure will be about 5½ lakhs.

“ Hon'ble Members will ask where the money for all these schemes is to come from. It will be provided largely by the Local Governments but, as the Council is aware, assignments have been made, during the last two years, from Imperial funds of 30 lakhs recurring for primary education and 30 lakhs recurring for technological, commercial and agricultural education. The first of these two assignments is proving a source of great help to Local Governments and local bodies, the latter during the year just ending was equally divided between technological and agricultural education. We are using the technological grant to assist Local Governments in promising schemes which seem to fit in with the general recommendations of the Indian Industrial Commission. As Hon'ble Members are aware, the bulk of the expenditure on education, so far as public funds are concerned, comes from provincial revenues, to which local and municipal funds also contribute, as well as fees, private contributions, etc. But it will, I have no doubt, interest Hon'ble Members to know that, since the creation of this Department in the Government of India, Imperial grants have been disbursed which up to the end of 1918-19 amount to no less than over 14 crores and that the recurring grants from Imperial sources, which are now annually disbursed, total 214 lakhs per annum. Critics have sometimes complained that Government in this country has cut down its educational expenditure during the war. Such criticism is neither well-informed nor has it any foundation in fact. On the contrary, the expenditure from public funds in 1913-14, before the commencement of the World War, was 5½ crores; in 1918-19 it rose to 717 lakhs. During that year, the last for which we have figures available, expenditure from public and private sources increased by over 116½ lakhs and now stands at the large figure of nearly 13 crores. And it is significant to note that the Budget for the ensuing year 1920-21 exceeds the revised estimates for 1919-20 by nearly 34 lakhs and the total Budget estimate for the forthcoming year is 836½ lakhs as against 468½ lakhs in 1916-17. Private generosity has also been in evidence. We have recently heard with pleasure of Sir Rash Bihari Ghosh's second generous donation to the University of Calcutta and a European citizen of Calcutta has given 10 lakhs partly for the creation of scholarships for Europeans and Anglo-Indians, and partly for the education of Indians.

“ Turning now to that all-important subject, *i.e.*, the education of our girls. In October last we issued a resolution in this connection laying down the lines along which activities should be directed. But the notable feature of the year 1918-19 is that, while owing to the adverse circumstances produced by war, as well as post-war conditions, failure of crops and the influenza epidemic, the number of boys in our educational institutions has shown no improvement, the number of girls has increased by 48,215. This is a matter of the happiest augury and with the return of normal conditions, one hopes that this improvement will go on steadily increasing from year to year.

[ *Mr. Shaft.* ]

[ 9TH MARCH, 1920. ]

"Some Hon'ble Members may feel disappointed that the increase in the number of scholars taken as a whole has not been commensurate with the enormous increase in the expenditure from all sources during the year under review. But had this period been one of normal conditions, I entertain no doubt whatever that we would have had a corresponding increase in the number of pupils. Moreover, it is to be remembered that the cost of everything and everybody has been steadily rising for some time past, not only in India but all over the world. We have, for instance, had to increase the rate of our scholarships for Indian students in the United Kingdom. The figures of boys and girls at school for the year which is now closing are of course not yet available. But I have every hope that the increased expenditure of 1918-19 will show its beneficial effect in the figures for the year which will end on the 31st of this month. Moreover, it should be remembered that the comparatively slight decrease in the number of boys reading in our schools during the year 1918-19 took place in private institutions; public institutions, on the contrary, showed an increase of pupils. In that year no less than 2,820 new public institutions were opened in India. Nor, if we take the war period as a whole, have we any great reason for dissatisfaction. Between the years 1913-14 and 1918-19 the number of pupils in all institutions rose from  $7\frac{1}{2}$  to nearly 8 millions.

"In conclusion, there is one thing which I must mention in connection with our educational activities. Government have undertaken to educate the children of Indian soldiers who have fallen or have been incapacitated during the terrible war which has now happily ended. This concession covers the cases of children of non-combatants as well as of combatants. It is, of course, impossible for us to educate these children up to the highest standard, but the Silver Wedding Fund instituted by Her Excellency Lady Chelmsford will, I understand, be quite sufficient to give higher education to those boys of this class who desire it. There are many other matters on which I should like to speak, such as the schemes for school hygiene, boy-scouts, the various enterprises for which our technological grant is being given to various institutions, courses in elementary, hydro-electric engineering, etc. But the time at our disposal being short, I do not propose to detain the Council with a narrative of our activities in these spheres of progress.

#### (b) PUBLIC HEALTH.

"I now turn to sanitary matters and consider first the steps which have been taken or initiated during the past year for the prevention of disease. The terrible scourge of influenza which swept over the country at the close of 1918, remained clearly present to our minds. Early this year symptoms were not wanting of a possible re-occurrence. The measures for combating the epidemic naturally rest with the Local Governments. But in this connection Government of India have certain functions to perform. In the first place, we increased our stocks, which we had already accumulated, of anti-influenza vaccine. At the same time, we increased the number of stations at which this vaccine can be produced and which now number four. We distributed the vaccine at a low price throughout British India and the Indian States and urged Local Governments to take over consignments and have them ready on the spot, to be kept, where necessary, in cold storage. We issued instructions for the use of vaccine. Further, we warned Local Governments to make ready their organisation for coping with a possible epidemic, and we urged that local bodies should be encouraged to do the same. The Sanitary Commissioner issued a note upon the methods to be adopted in case of illness. We deputed two officers to carry out special investigations so that we may be in a better position to combat the disease. Finally, where necessary, we gave the necessary powers under the law to the Local Governments to take all requisite measures. Fortunately we have not had to make use of the full preparations which had been made. No doubt there has been a good deal of influenza again this year in certain centres; but it has not indicated; save here and there, the virulence of last year's attack, nor has it assumed the same pandemic form. The precautions thus taken in advance assisted, we may hope, in restricting the effect of this third epidemic.



[9TH MARCH, 1920.]

[Mr. Shafi.]

"Another disease, which has recently been engaging our serious attention, is yellow fever. When the Panama Canal was opened, the possibility of danger to India was realised and certain rules were issued with regard to the precautionary measures which should be taken at our ports. The arrangements, however, which would enable those rules adequately to be carried out are costly and must necessarily take time in their realisation. The Government of India were of opinion that the preparations against the possibility of an inroad of this disease must be expedited. At the same time, they were aware that the general position throughout the world as regards yellow fever was changing. Last month, after addressing the Secretary of State exhaustively upon the whole subject, we summoned a committee of experts to meet in Calcutta, and Council may rest assured that their report will be considered with all possible speed.

"I now turn to medical research. I hope that Major-General Edwards will speak on this subject out of the fulness of his knowledge. All I need say here is that very successful pieces of isolated research are going on at various places in India, and that it is possible that certain important developments for the better organisation of this research will now be made.

"Altogether the year has been a very busy one from the public health point of view. A great deal of work has been put through. We have addressed the Secretary of State regarding the re-organisation of the Bacteriological Service and we are dealing with the Sanitary Service as expeditiously as possible. We have also called together two conferences of medical experts, and we have had an informal conference of Sanitary Commissioners. One of the most important points discussed at this conference was the future organisation of public health work in India. Hon'ble Members will recollect that in answer to a resolution put forward by the Hon'ble Mr. Sarma in March 1919 a grant of 5 lakhs from Imperial funds was announced to form a nucleus of a public health fund. This is a most important matter and before a move is made in this direction, we have to consider very carefully how the money may be most economically expended to the best advantage. The proposals are still under consideration. But I can assure Hon'ble Members that we propose a scheme which is not going to increase very largely the headquarters staff. Though the bulk of the expenditure, as we are at present advised, will be carried out under what will indeed be a central agency, it will be capable of doing practical work all over India.

"We have continued our attempts to ameliorate the conditions of pilgrims, whether Hindus or Muhammadans. A large grant has been provided from Imperial funds for improving the water-supply of Puri—a scheme which will benefit pilgrims from all over India and which, I am sure, will be fully appreciated. As regards Muhammadans, every one here is well aware of the immense difficulties which, as a result of the great war, had been placed not only on the performance of the Haj, but also with reference to the position of the Government in relation to this important matter during that catastrophic period. This year, the war being at an end, we decided that all who desired to perform the pilgrimage to Mecca and Medina should have every facility for doing so. But, owing to the dislocation of trade and commerce and the paucity of ships, we were held up at every point by unanticipated difficulties. At the last moment it seemed as though no ships would be available which would take the pilgrims to Jeddah at a reasonable rate since freights have so enormously increased. But, after a few days' discussion with the local authorities and the representatives of Companies, we reached a satisfactory arrangement which it is not too much to say, made the performance of the Haj a possibility, was enormously appreciated by the Muhammadan public and has not proved unduly expensive. We have also, so far as is possible among the many difficulties of the post-war period, improved the conditions of quarantine and medical inspection, and we anticipate still further improvement in that connection.

"I cannot close my remark on public health without paying a tribute to the splendid services performed during the war by the staff of the Central Research Institute, Kasauli. I hope that Major-General Edwards will inform

[*Mr. Shafi; Mr. H. Sharp; Major-General W. R. Edwards.*] [9TH MARCH, 1920.]

Council of the work which has been done and which, I have no hesitation in saying, must have saved an incalculable amount of sickness among our soldiers in many areas of the great war.

“Passing on to local self-government: there has been a certain amount of legislation with which I need not deal save to congratulate the Government of Bengal and the Legislative Council of the Governor of that presidency on the passage of the Bengal Village Self-Government Act which will, so to speak, bring the problems and powers of local self-government to the very doors of the villagers in their own villages. Legislation with somewhat similar objects is also proceeding in Bombay and the United Provinces.

“While dealing with the administrative side of local self-government, I should mention that we have just had a small committee in England consisting of officers who were on leave and my esteemed friend the Hon'ble Mr. Surendranath Banerjea, who made a study of the system of local self-government in England. The other day I laid their report upon the table and I venture to think that its contents are deserving of careful study by advocates of complete autonomy in local bodies. Hon'ble Members have all read our Resolution of the 16th May 1918 and are, therefore, aware that the Government of India is in favour of every reasonable measure which can increase the autonomy of those bodies. But this report will show how largely, even in a country where local self-government is of long standing and firmly rooted, the State exercises a vigilant control over the activities of local bodies. Last year my friend, Sir Dinshaw Wacha, asked us questions about the housing of industrial labour and I may say, if he has no objection, that a good deal of correspondence of a private nature has passed between him and my predecessor and Secretary. I admire Sir Dinshaw's unswerving attitude in this matter and can assure him that the Government of India have not been unmindful of their duties in this matter, and during the past year have had various large questions regarding this problem under consideration. I believe my Hon'ble friend himself realises the immensity of the problem in the City of Bombay. It is a problem of enormous magnitude, and I can only hope and trust that my Hon'ble friend will not be disappointed with the result of the schemes which are now on the anvil.

“There are many minor matters which are dealt with in this Department. The year before last a conference was held to encourage the enlargement and organisation of libraries. It has not been without results in stimulating public interest in this matter, and Local Governments have been addressed regarding the possibilities of some widespread organisation.

“The Government of India have also taken in hand the question of record offices. They issued a resolution and appointed an Indian Historical Records Commission, the principal functions of which will be to give expert advice regarding records and records offices and to make proposals for the wider use by scholars and students of our historical data. The Commission has already held two meetings, the second one which was held only the other day in Lahore appears to have been a marked success and afforded an opportunity for public meetings and the reading of interesting papers, etc.

“With these remarks, I beg to introduce the heads of the Financial Statement for 1920-21 relating to Sanitation and Education, Revenue and Expenditure.”

4-16 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Mr. H. Sharp:**—“Sir, I beg to lay on the table the annual narrative called ‘Indian Education’ and also the statement dealing with Education generally known as ‘Salient Features.’ These are always laid on the table at the time of introducing these heads.”

4-17 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Major-General W. R. Edwards:**—“Sir, when I addressed the Council a year ago, I described briefly our activities in the direction of medical research, and preventive medicine, and the assistance we were able to give to the military authorities in supplying vaccines and sera.

[ 9TH MARCH, 1920. ] [ *Major-General W. E. Edwards.* ]

"Military operations on the Frontier and the necessity for maintaining garrisons in Mesopotamia and Egypt have demanded the continued employment of the staff at the Research and Pasteur Institutes and have absorbed much of our time and energy.

"The demands of the civil population in India have, however, also been met. This civil demand is quite new, and it is a very significant and noteworthy development. Except for the issue of plague vaccine from the Parel Laboratory, Bombay, the civil population used to make few claims on our resources. For example, no cholera vaccine was issued from the Central Research Institute in pre-war days—in 1918, 7,000 doses were issued, in 1919, a quarter of a million doses were issued on demands from civil institutions alone. During 1917-18 and 1919, 10½ million cubic centimetres of typhoid and cholera vaccines were produced at the Karachi Institute, the value of which was £530,000. This is an enormous increase over pre-war days. In the year before the war only 15,000 cubic centimetres of typhoid vaccine were produced.

"The Council well remembers the appalling pandemic of Influenza which ravaged India in the autumn of 1918. We have watched with anxiety the course of this dread epidemic, as it has waxed and waned, in epidemic form over the whole world.

"Active steps were taken by the Government of India to advise provincial administrations as to the prophylactic and remedial measures to be taken in case of further outbreaks, which at one time appeared probable.

"Arrangements were made for the various Central Research Institutes and Bacteriological Laboratories to manufacture anti-influenza vaccine, and from the Central Research Institute alone over a million cubic centimetres were issued. The efficacy of this vaccine is still the subject of investigation, but opinion in England corroborates our Indian experience, that the vaccine has, at least, an influence in preventing the pneumonic complications which are the dread sequelæ of this disease.

"The Bacteriology of this disease is being prosecuted by Captain Malone who commenced his research in 1918, and his very detailed investigations appear to confirm the constant rôle of Pfeiffers bacillus in Influenza.

"The epidemiological aspect of the disease is being investigated by Major Morison, whose object is to collect and analyse reliable figures of the commencement, manner of spread and termination of localised epidemics, in order to determine the relative virulence of different epidemics and the causation of differences in virulence. The investigation is difficult, but in collaboration with Major McKendrick of the Pasteur Institute, useful and valuable results are being obtained.

"I very much regret that we have not more officers available for investigating the problems of this disease. But we should not complain when we remember that in England and Scotland some 15 to 20,000 medical practitioners were called to the war out of a total of some 40,000, and in India we are still at war.

"We have however made very substantial progress in certain directions.

"Lieutenant-Colonel McCarrison continued his inquiry into *Deficiency Diseases* and has published papers which have roused the greatest interest in scientific circles in England and abroad. His discoveries in this connexion have evoked world-wide comment, and it is not too much to say that they are fraught with consequences of the utmost importance.

"The inquiries into Hookworm have been continued in the Madras Presidency by Dr. Mhaskar who, in conjunction with Father Caius, is investigating, among other matters, the chemical composition and efficiency of various drugs used for the treatment of this disease.

"Kala Azar is being investigated by Major Knowles and Mrs. Adie at the Pasteur Institute, Shillong, and discoveries as to the life history of the parasite, which causes this disease, seem to be imminent. Excellent results have been obtained in the treatment of this disease by Dr. Brahmachari of Calcutta. Sir L. Rogers, whose services are, I regret to say, lost to India, for a time,

[Major-General W. R. Edwards.] [9TH MARCH, 1920.]

owing to ill-health, has worked throughout the year, with his customary energy, on leprosy and tuberculosis. Some very remarkable and encouraging results have been obtained in the treatment of these diseases by various remedial substances obtained under his direction by Dr. Sademoy Ghosh from certain fatty acids of chalmogra and cod liver oils, and latterly from the oil of soya beans which Sir I. Rogers considers the most effective of all.

“ Other investigations financed by the Governing Body of Research Fund were those by Lieutenant-Colonel Donovan, I.M.S., into the possibilities of monkeys acting as carriers of malarial organisms; the continuance of the investigation into the value of the ground-nut as a food-stuff, and into the sterilization of water by various chlorogens by Dr. Mackenzie Wallis. This work is being carried out in St. Bartholomew's Hospital, London.

“ Dr. Annandale, of the Zoological Department, is directing the survey of the distribution and types of molluscs in India, the direct importance of which is the possible introduction of Bilharziosis from Egypt, Mesopotamia and China and its spread in India.

“ Dr. Chitre has completed his experimental inquiry into the baits and traps best suited for dealing with the rat pest. A field campaign in selected plague districts, based on the results obtained, has been sanctioned by the Bombay Government and will be carried out on a large scale. Another inquiry, the results of which have proved of immediate practical utility, is that completed by Mrs. Norris, formerly chemist at the Central Research Institute. She has been very successful in preparing a purely vegetable medium suitable for the growth of organisms from which the vast quantities of prophylactic vaccines are prepared. Dr. Karuna Chatterji has been working on a drug, margosic acid, produced from Neem tree oil; used this drug in the treatment of syphilis and other diseases with very marked success. I am waiting for a further report from him.

“ With this brief reference to the results of the past year's work in Medical Research, I will now speak of the prevention of avoidable diseases. The efficient application of the limited knowledge at our disposal is capable of saving a vast number of lives every year. Such application is unquestionably the function of local authorities, but local authorities require help from the central Government of their country. In all countries the central Government *must* be vitally interested in the efficiency of this work and in securing, as far as possible, not only uniformity of method, but also the education of public opinion without which but little advance can be made. In the first place, therefore, it is the duty of every central Government to foster, and even inaugurate, measures for educating the public; it is also their duty to prevent the introduction of infection from other countries and to limit its spread from Province to Province. The Hon'ble Member for Education has spoken of the Medical Committees, which have met within the last few months and whose recommendations are under the consideration of Government, and I can assure this Council that, if circumstances permit the adoption of these recommendations, the Government of India will have taken a great step towards coping with epidemics, with a view to their limitation, eradication or, best of all, their prevention.

“ The last of these Committees met in Calcutta to consider the vexed question of port quarantine, with special reference to the possible introduction of yellow fever. Its resolutions are of far-reaching importance to India and, indeed, to the world at large. India, it is true, is unfortunately the home of many serious diseases; but diseases also exist in other countries which, so far as is known, do not exist in India and which must be kept out of India. Special attention has been focussed on yellow fever. As with malaria, this disease is transmitted by a certain species of mosquito. After sucking the blood of a yellow fever patient, a period of twelve days elapses before the mosquito is capable of infecting another patient, but after that the mosquito continues to be a source of infection as long as it lives.

“ It is obvious then that, in order to protect an uninfected country, the mosquitoes on a 'suspected' ship must be destroyed by efficient fumigation,

[9TH MARCH, 1920.] [Major-General W. R. Edwards.]

before the ship is allowed into dock. At present facilities for such fumigation do not exist. Colonel Glen Liston of the Parel Laboratory, Bombay, has been experimenting with hydrocyanic acid gas, money for this purpose having been provided by the Indian Research Fund Association. He has recently devised a machine which promises to render the fumigation of loaded ships possible and effectual. Ten such machines have now been ordered for experimental work, and paid for from the Government of India sanitary grant.

"This gas destroys not only mosquitoes and small vermin, such as fleas and bugs, but also rats; the latter is of course a most important matter. A very great point in favour of this gas is that it does no damage to any merchandise, even fruit and vegetables are not injured. If these experiments prove a success, and it is reasonable to expect that they will, a very great advance will have been made in the disinfection of ships, an advance which will not only tend to protect India from yellow fever, but one which will benefit the whole world.

"The question of education in our medical colleges and schools is under my consideration. It is very important at the present time, when our colleges and schools have arrived at a very considerable stage of excellence, that due consideration should be given to the selection of specialised personnel for the development of new departments. The selection of this specialised personnel is of the greatest importance as here the man is everything.

"Professor Starling from England is arriving this month to advise the Government of India with regard to the founding of a Central Medical Research Institute for India. He will visit Bombay, Poona, Bangalore, Calcutta, Delhi and Kasauli, and will be accompanied by Lieutenant-Colonel Greig, O.I.E., of the Indian Medical Service, who has just completed a tour of the world. Colonel Greig had been placed on deputation at the expense of the Indian Research Fund Association, in order that he might collect information concerning the principal Medical Research Institutions of the world. He has now returned, having visited Great Britain, France, the United States, Canada, Japan, Manila and Hong-Kong. I trust that the result will be that before long we shall possess, in addition to our Tropical Schools and numerous laboratories, an Imperial Central Research Institute with its combined hospital and library of which India may be proud. Lastly, I wish to say a few words concerning the Indian Medical Service.

"This service until recent years has never contained more than 7 per cent. of Indians, and has been regarded by Indians as an alien service. The Secretary of State for India not long ago decided that one-third of the new recruits should be Indians, and this number may be still further increased. More than this, there is a proposal that in order to facilitate the entry of Indians, scholarships or nominations shall be given to the most promising Indian medical students who wish to enter this service. In the former case they would proceed to England to complete their curriculum and then compete for the Indian Medical Service; in the latter case they would proceed to England for a further course of instruction only.

"I trust then that Indians may, in future, no longer regard this service as one in which they have no personal interest, but as a service they may be proud of and one that will shed a lustre on the name of India.

"All countries sooner or later come before the judgment bar of the world. The verdict depends not on the size and greatness of the country, nor on the territories it has conquered and the riches it has acquired. It does not depend on the number of great Kings, Generals, politicians and millionaires that the country has produced, but it does depend on those greater men who by their life's work have tended to improve and ameliorate the conditions of the peoples of the world in general. Such men are those who have left their mark on literature and the fine arts, great philanthropists, explorers, inventors, mathematicians, and, above all, great thinkers and men who have made a name for themselves in original research.

"Now a great change is coming over the destinies of India. It is at such a crisis in the history of a nation that we may look for the birth

1220 FINANCIAL STATEMENT FOR 1920-21; RESOLUTION RE  
PROVISION IN THE BUDGET FOR 1920-21, OF ONE LAKH  
TO THE BENARES HINDU UNIVERSITY.

[ *Major-General W. R. Edwards; Rao Bahadur* [9TH MARCH, 1920.]  
*B. N. Sarma.* ]

of men great in the highest sense of the word. It is natural that I personally should be intensely interested in the medical aspects of this question.

"I earnestly desire to see Indians coming to the front in the medical scientific world. America has recently produced many great medical scientists, and so has Japan; why should India not do so?"

"This service has been a great asset to India in the past, and has attracted the best intellects from the British medical schools; let it now attract the best from the schools of India as well. I would further call attention to the fact that the greatest intellects cannot achieve complete success unless they have leisure and opportunity to take up the particular work for which they are fitted. How can a man, who has to support himself and his family by the ordinary routine of private practice, find time to really specialise or find time to study in great European centres? These priceless facilities are offered by the Indian Medical Service, and I want to see them taken advantage of by the doctors of India. If they come forward and succeed, as I hope they may, it will be a great thing for India as well as for the Indian Medical Service."

**RESOLUTION RE PROVISION IN THE BUDGET FOR  
1920-21 OF ONE LAKH TO THE BENARES HINDU  
UNIVERSITY.**

4-36 P.M.

**The Hon'ble Rao Bahadur B. N. Sarma:**—"Sir, notice of this resolution was sent up under a mistake arising from the omission of the entry of one lakh on page 98 of the Financial Statement and the matter having been explained, I do not propose to move the resolution."

The Council then adjourned till Wednesday, the 10th March 1920, at 11 o'clock.

A. P. MUDDIMAN,

*Secretary to the Government of India,  
Legislative Department.*

DELHI:

*The 23rd March, 1920.* }

---

\* "This Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that a provision of one lakh may be made in the budget allotment for 1920-21 to the Hindu University, Benares, and the necessary transfer be made between Imperial and Provincial."