

*Thursday,
9th March, 1916*

ABSTRACT OF THE PROCEEDINGS
OF THE
Council of the Governor General of India,
LAWS AND REGULATIONS

Vol. LIV

March 1916

ABSTRACT OF PROCEEDINGS
OF
THE COUNCIL OF THE GOVERNOR GENERAL OF INDIA

ASSEMBLED FOR THE PURPOSE OF MAKING

LAWS AND REGULATIONS,

March 1916

VOL. LIV

Published by Authority of Governor General.



& Debates Section

Gazette
Parliament Library Building
Room No. FB-025
Block 'G'
DELHI

SUPERINTENDENT GOVERNMENT PRINTING, INDIA.

1916



GOVERNMENT OF INDIA.
LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT.

PROCEEDINGS OF THE INDIAN LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL ASSEMBLED UNDER
THE PROVISIONS OF THE GOVERNMENT OF INDIA ACT, 1915
(5 & 6 Geo. V, Ch. 81).

The Council met at the Council Chamber, Imperial Secretariat, Delhi, on
Thursday, the 9th March, 1916.

PRESENT :

The Hon'ble Sir WILLIAM CLARK, K.C.S.I., C.M.G., Vice-President, *presiding*,
and 57 Members, of whom 50 were Additional Members.

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS.

The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee asked :—

1. " (a) Will the Government be pleased to indicate the progress of Local Self-Government in India by giving for each year province by province for the last five years the number of elected members for each Municipality, District Board and Local and other Boards under the Local Self-Government Acts? Progress of Local Self-Government.

(b) Do the Government propose to direct that such statements should be published in future year by year? "

The Hon'ble Sir C. Sankaran Nair replied :—

(1) "The figures asked for by the Hon'ble Member are given by provinces for Municipalities and District Boards, respectively, in the statement* which I put on the table. Further details will be found in the statement appended to the various Provincial Reports.

(2) The figures are already published annually in the Provincial Reports."

* Vide Appendix A.

[*Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee*; *Mr. C. H. A. Hill.*] [9TH MARCH, 1916.]

The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee asked :—

Prohibition
of the
export of
wood pulp
by the
Swedish
Government

2. “(a) Has the attention of the Government been drawn to the action of the Swedish Government in prohibiting the export of wood pulps for the manufacture of printing paper ?

(b) Is it a fact that paper made from wood pulps is at present largely imported into India for printing purposes ?

(c) Is it a fact that paper-making materials are to be had in abundance in many parts of India and Burma. Will the Government direct an inquiry into this matter, and state what action, if any, it proposes to take in this connection with a view to foster the growth of the indigenous paper industry ? ”

The Hon'ble Mr. C. H. A. Hill replied :—

“(a) The Government of India have no information on the subject other than that which has appeared in the Press.

(b) The Government of India believe this to be the case, but have no definite information as to the extent to which the paper imported into India is manufactured from wood pulp.

(c) The answer to the first part of the question is in the affirmative. The possibility of fostering the paper pulp industry in India has formed the subject of detailed inquiry, both by the Government of India and by Local Governments for some years past; an expert in the manufacture of paper pulp having been employed by the Government of India for this purpose. The results of these inquiries have been published, from time to time, by the Forest Research Institute. Concessions for the manufacture of pulp from wood, bamboos and savannah grasses have been given in several provinces, while the Government of India have reason to believe that in one province the Local Government has under consideration a project for the erection of a small pulp factory in order to test thoroughly the commercial possibilities of savannah grasses for the manufacture of paper pulp. In these circumstances, the Government of India do not consider it necessary to direct any further special inquiry into the matter, more particularly as they understand that, under present conditions, little progress can be expected owing to the difficulty of procuring the necessary machinery and chemicals.”

The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee :—

“May I ask the Hon'ble Member, as a supplementary question, to state, if he thinks fit, the name of the Government which is making these arrangements ?

The Hon'ble Mr. C. H. A. Hill :—

“There is more than one Local Government at present making inquiry into the matter.”

The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee :—

Is the Bengal Government one of them ? ”

The Hon'ble Mr. C. H. A. Hill :—

“No, I think not, so far as my recollection goes at the moment.”

The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee asked :—

Dacca
and Patna
University
Bills

3. “(a) Has the attention of the Government been drawn to the statement which has appeared in the newspapers to the effect that it is improbable that the Dacca University Bill will be taken up in the Imperial Legislative Council before next autumn at the earliest, and that the Patna University Bill will also be delayed ?

(b) Do the Government propose to instruct the Local Governments to introduce these Bills into the local Legislative Councils and dispose of them in those Councils ? ”

[9TH MARCH, 1916.] [Sir C. Sankaran Nair; Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee; Sir R. W. Gillan; Mr. Qumrul Huda; Sir Reginald Craddock.]

The Hon'ble Sir C. Sankaran Nair replied :—

"(a) The attention of Government has been drawn to the statement in question.

(b) The proposals for legislation for the Patna University are still under consideration. As regards the Dacca University, it is intended to introduce the legislation in the Imperial Council, and the Local Government has occurred in this procedure."

The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee asked :—

4. "(1) Will the Government be pleased to make a statement showing the measures that have been taken from 1905 to 1915 to promote the comfort and convenience of Intermediate and Third Class Railway passengers ?

(2) Will the Government be pleased to state what further measures they propose to take in the same direction in the immediate future ?"

Measures taken to promote the comfort and convenience of Intermediate and Third Class Railway Passengers.

The Hon'ble Sir R. W. Gillan replied :—

"A statement* is laid on the table showing the measures which have been adopted by the Railway Board, from the constitution of a Board in March 1905 up to the present time, for securing the greater comfort or convenience of 3rd class passengers, and of passengers generally where passengers of the 3rd and Intermediate classes are mainly affected, and showing also the action immediately proposed with the same object. No steps have been taken especially for the benefit of Intermediate class passengers."

The Hon'ble Mr. Qumrul Huda asked :—

5. "(1) Have any Indian newspapers been placed under Government censorship since the Defence of India Act, 1915, was passed ? If so, will the Government be pleased to lay on the table a list of such newspapers giving the places of their publication ?

Censorship of Newspapers.

(2) Are any instructions issued to the persons conducting such newspapers regarding matters which it is desired that they should not publish ?

(3) Is it a fact that the printers and publishers of such newspapers are directed not to allow anything to appear in them unless it has been previously submitted to a censor, and its publication has been approved by him ?

(4) If the answer to (3) is in the affirmative, will the Government be pleased to state under what circumstances and on what grounds such action is deemed necessary ?

(5) Will the Government be pleased to state the names of newspapers, if any, which were once censored, but in regard to which the order placing them under censorship has been withdrawn ?"

The Hon'ble Sir Reginald Craddock replied :—

"So far as the Government of India are aware, orders under the Defence of India Act have been passed against two papers—the *Hamdard* and *Zamindar*—requiring them, prior to publication, to submit matter of certain kinds for the scrutiny of a Government officer. This action was necessitated by the manner in which these papers were being conducted. So far as is known, the orders have not been withdrawn."

The Hon'ble Mr. Qumrul Huda asked :—

6. "(1) Is a Government censor required to possess any general and journalistic qualifications for the satisfactory and fair discharge of his duties ? If so, what are these qualifications ?

Qualifications of, and Instructions to, Censors.

[*Mr. Qumrul Huda; His Excellency the Commander-in-Chief; Khan Bahadur Mir Asad Ali Khan; Sir Reginald Craddock; Maharaja Ranajit Sinha of Nashipur; Sir C. Sankaran Nair.*] [9TH MARCH, 1916.]

(3) Are any instructions given to a censor to guide him in the discharge of his duties? If so, will Government be pleased to lay on the table a copy of such instructions?"

His Excellency the Commander-in-Chief replied :—

"(1) No definite qualifications are laid down for the members of the Deputy Chief Censor's staff. They are however carefully selected with regard to their suitability.

(2) The instructions issued for their guidance are, for obvious reasons, confidential, and the Government of India do not propose to lay them on the table."

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Mir Asad Ali Khan asked :—

Compilation showing classification of holders of all appointments on Rs. 200 and over.

7. "(a) Was a compilation showing the classification of holders of all appointments carrying a monthly salary of Rs. 200 and over prepared at the instance of the Public Service Commission?

(b) If so, has the compilation been published for the use of the general public?

(c) If the compilation has not been published, do Government propose to publish it at an early date?"

The Hon'ble Sir Reginald Craddock replied :—

"Such a compilation was made for the use of the Public Services Commission. It has not been published, and the question of its publication can best be considered when the report of the Royal Commission becomes available."

The Hon'ble Maharaja Ranajit Sinha of Nashipur asked :—

Financial powers of Provincial Sanitary Boards.

8. "Will the Government be pleased to state if any Provincial Sanitary Board has been entrusted with financial authority and responsibility?"

The Hon'ble Sir C. Sankaran Nair replied :—

"So far as the information at the disposal of the Government of India shows, Sanitary Boards in certain provinces have been entrusted with financial authority and responsibility. For example, in Bombay, the United Provinces and Punjab certain sums are placed by the Local Government every year at the disposal of Sanitary Boards for distribution."

The Hon'ble Maharaja Ranajit Sinha of Nashipur asked :—

Sanitary Boards.

9. "Will the Government be pleased to state in which provinces non-officials have been included as members on Sanitary Boards?"

The Hon'ble Sir C. Sankaran Nair replied :—

"So far as the information at the disposal of the Government of India shows the provincial Sanitary Boards in Bombay, Bengal, the United Provinces and Punjab contain one or more non-official members. In Burma, where there are divisional Sanitary Boards, a non-official may be added at the discretion of the Commissioner."

[9TH MARCH, 1916.] [*Sir Fazulbhoj Currimbhoj; Mr. C. E. Low; Mr. Madhu Sudan Das; Sir William Meyer.*]

The Hon'ble Sir Fazulbhoj Currimbhoj asked :—

10. "(a) Has any communication been received by the Government of India from the Secretary of State for India regarding a Resolution of the House of Commons relative to the organisation of the economic strength of the Empire with a view to secure economic superiority over enemy countries? Organisation of the economic strength of the Empire.

(b) Has the attention of Government been drawn to a report to the effect that Mr. Bonar Law recently stated in the House of Commons, in reply to a question by Mr. Hewins, that the Overseas Dominions had been approached by the Imperial Government on the subject of the Resolution referred to in (a) ?

(c) If so, do the Government of India propose to make efforts to co-operate with the Imperial Government and the Dominion Governments for the attainment of the objects in view ?"

The Hon'ble Mr. C. E. Low replied :—

"The answer to part (a) of the question is in the negative.

The answer to part (b) of the question is in the affirmative.

With regard to the third part of the question, the Government of India have throughout the war been in the closest co-operation with the Imperial Government in respect of rendering available the economic and industrial resources of India for the purposes of the war. The manufacture of munitions and the export of such important articles as manganese, saltpetre, sandbags and wheat, as well as numerous others of less importance have, whether at the request of the Imperial Government or on the initiative in many cases of the Government of India, been organized, controlled and directed, with the view of giving the utmost possible assistance to Great Britain and the Allies. The Imperial Government, therefore, are well aware both of the nature and extent of the resources of India, and of her willingness to co-operate in any way in which they may desire "

The Hon'ble Mr. Madhu Sudan Das asked :—

11. "(a) What sum of money (if any) was lent to the several Presidency Banks in India from the Paper Currency Reserve during the last calendar year (1915)? Money advanced from the Paper Currency Reserve to Presidency Banks in India.

(b) Did the Presidency Banks re-advance to other Banks the amount thus lent to them? If so, will the Government be pleased to state the terms of such re-advance as regards the rate of interest and the purpose for which this money was to be used ?

(c) Were any firms or individuals financed out of this money with a view to help industries? If so, will Government be pleased to state the names of such firms or individuals ?"

The Hon'ble Sir William Meyer replied :—

"No money was lent to the Presidency Banks from the Paper Currency Reserve in 1915."

FINANCIAL STATEMENT.

FIRST STAGE.

The Hon'ble Sir William Meyer :—"I beg, Sir, to open the first stage of the discussion on the Financial Statement for 1916-17."

RESOLUTION BE REDUCTION OF SALT ESTIMATE.

The Hon'ble Sir Ibrahim Rahimtoola :—“ Sir, I beg to move—

‘ That the estimate of Revenue from salt be reduced by £200,000 (six hundred thousand pounds) and be passed at £3,400,000, so that the rate of taxation may be retained at the rate of one rupee per maund as during the current year.’

“ Sir, in view of the several discussions which have already taken place in the Council, it is not my intention to speak at any great length on this subject. On the present occasion I am, personally, safe from any criticism because the object of my Resolution is that the poor may be relieved of this additional burden. I want to make it perfectly clear that I have never been opposed to the imposition of fresh taxation to meet the requirements of the Government of India. I have clearly disclaimed any intention of opposing increased taxation from any one of the three sources proposed by Government, if the money was needed for the purposes of administration to cover in full the estimated expenditure prepared by Government themselves. My objection has throughout been that at a time like this when, in consequence of the war and the effects thereof, the people of India have suffered as have all the other component parts of the British Empire, that fresh taxation should be imposed for the purpose of obtaining a surplus.

“ Sir, the financial position has now become clear. In consequence of the passing of the Indian Tariff (Amendment) Bill and the Income-tax Bill, the result of the next year's Budget so far has been clearly established as follows: The total deficit estimated in the Financial Statement of £2,600,000 has been more than covered because the estimated additional revenue will now yield £3,000,000—£2,100,000 from the Tariff Act and £900,000 from the Income-tax Act. This additional revenue of £3,000,000 places the position of the Budget as follows: the full estimated expenditure is now financed and there is a surplus of £400,000.

“ On the present occasion, therefore, my object in moving this Resolution is to appeal to the Government to consider whether, having regard to the fact that they have already obtained a surplus of £400,000, they should obtain a further £600,000, estimated to be obtained from the salt tax, and swell the surplus from £400,000 to a million pounds.

“ Sir, I clearly recognise that the salt tax is regarded by Government—and rightly too—as a reserve. For the purposes of administering a vast country like India, it is necessary that certain sources of revenue, certain sources of taxation, should provide a reserve to be called up in case of emergency; and I recognise that the salt tax lends itself to that kind of reserve. At the same time, there is this thing to be borne in mind, that that reserve should only be tapped when it is absolutely necessary—especially so because the incidence of this tax largely falls upon the poor. If, as I said, a case is made out for additional taxation, I am quite prepared to accept the position which the Government of India have taken up, namely, to take all the revenue they can get from the increase in the tariffs, the second source to be tapped being the income-tax, and the last source being the salt tax. Now, Sir, the first two sources have been tapped, and they give not only the entire revenue that is required for the purpose, but they provide a surplus of £400,000. Under these conditions, Sir, I would appeal to the Government of India to consider whether, in view of these facts, they should persist in carrying out their intention of obtaining an additional revenue of £600,000 from salt or, at all events on this occasion, leave salt alone, reserving it for next year if circumstances then necessitate increased taxation.

“ Sir, there is an additional reason why I make this appeal. As a consequence of small increases and decreases in the salt tax considerable dislocation is caused in retail prices, and there is a strong body of opinion to show that the actual rates charged to the poor are in many cases in considerable excess of the actual additional revenue obtained by Government. Sir, taking that into consideration, would it not be better not to have this increase of four

[9TH MARCH, 1916.] [*Sir Ibrahim Rahimtoola; Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee; The Vice-President.*]

annas in the maund now till a strong justification is made out for additional revenue for administrative purposes, and then to regulate this tax in a manner so that it may be maintained at that rate for a considerable number of years. The constant changing of this tax leads to dislocation in retail prices, and it is to my mind eminently desirable that that should be avoided as far as possible.

"Sir, it is not my intention on the present occasion when we are dealing with the surplus in the Budget—whether that surplus be £1,000,000 or only £400,000—to go over the ground of moral or ^{of the} ~~imperial~~ budgetting, of finding a definition of taxpayer, or whether 3 or 4 per cent of the working balance can be easily dispensed with, or, again, whether the railway revenue is profits out of trade or indirect taxation, as I have repeatedly contended in this Council. These are points which may well be left alone on the present occasion. At a time like this it is desirable to avoid controversies and contentions as far as possible, and I do not therefore propose to go into those questions and occupy the time of the Council by any discussion about them. My only object on the present occasion is to appeal to the Hon'ble the Finance Member and the Government of India—knowing full well how keenly sympathetic the Finance Member is towards the interests of the poor—I appeal to him once again on behalf of those poor whether he should not be content on the present occasion with the surplus of £400,000 that he is going to get from other sources. As I said before, I am not satisfied that any justification exists for levying additional taxation in order to obtain an additional surplus. Well, Sir, a part of that surplus has already been obtained, and I now appeal to the Government to consider whether they will insist upon getting their full surplus of a million pounds, or, in the interests of the poor, be content with a surplus of only £400,000. Sir, with that appeal, I will conclude my observations."

The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee.—"Sir, I have a Resolution, the first part of which is identical with the Resolution moved by my Hon'ble friend, Sir Ibrahim Rahimtoola. Sir, my submission is, that it would simplify matters if you would permit me either to move that Resolution or speak in support of this, and if I do speak in support of my friend's Resolution, you will, I hope, relax somewhat the time-limit, which is 15 minutes."

The Hon'ble the Vice-President.—"I think the latter course would be the most convenient for the Council and would save time; but I trust the Hon'ble Member will not abuse the relaxation of the rule which is permitted to him."

The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee :—"Sir, I am sure the Resolution which has been moved by my Hon'ble friend and the Resolution which stands against my name must strongly appeal to the sympathies of my Hon'ble friend the Finance Minister, for his Budget, despite exceptions here and there—and the most notable of these exceptions is the enhanced duty on salt—is the poor man's Budget, instinct with living sympathy for the poor man and his lot. Could I be persuaded that fresh taxation was necessary, I would give my wholehearted support to his proposals of taxation, save and except perhaps an item here and an item there and the proposed enhancement of the salt duty. But, Sir, my submission is that no case has been made out for fresh taxation, and if it was necessary to impose taxes for the purposes of raising money, it should be confined to the raising of the amount of the actual deficit. In that case the £600,000 which it is intended to obtain by the enhancement of the salt duty would automatically disappear. My position, therefore, is this—that taxation is unnecessary. And, Sir, I desire to consider for a moment the surpluses and the deficits for a period of 20 years extending from 1894 to 1914.

"During these 20 years we had 17 years of surpluses and 3 years of deficits. The surpluses came up to £40.9 million; the deficits of the three years came up to £8.4 million; and deducting the deficits from the surpluses we have

[*Mr. Swendra Nath Banerjee.*] [9TH MARCH, 1916.]

for a period of 20 years the huge surplus of £32·5 million. Nor is this all. This surplus does not include £1 million of the Famine Insurance Fund which is charged off the accounts. When famine occurs expenditure is incurred and is shown in the accounts. However that may be, there is the outstanding fact that in the course of 20 years extending from 1894 to 1914 the Government of India were able by their taxation to accumulate a surplus of £32½ million which they have rightly, as I think, applied to the reduction of the debt. And how does the debt stand to-day, or rather on the 31st March 1915? The permanent debt of the country is £1·5 million. The statement might seem to be surprising; it may even be viewed with an air of incredulity, but I am prepared to prove it. The total debt of the country on the 31st March, 1915, amounted to the sum of £276 million; the exact figure is £276·5 million. The debt contracted for the purposes of railway construction amounts to 233·2 million £. Debt for the purposes of irrigation amounts to £41·1 million. 9 million £ represents Delhi construction. Therefore deducting these amounts from the total debt, we have the national debt reduced to the figure which I have just mentioned, *viz.*, £13 million. Sir, I am entitled to hold that these debts for railway and irrigation are in the nature of an investment, and they must not be regarded as part and parcel of the permanent national debt. In 1912-13 and in 1913-14, irrigation and railways gave us a clear income of £5·9 million after paying all working charges and interest. In 1914-15, despite the war, they gave us a profit of £3·1 million. I do not indeed overlook the fact that we have temporary debts, unfunded debts, such as Provident and Saving Banks deposits; but against these we have to bear in mind the advances which the Government of India have made to the Presidency Corporations, to Municipalities and District Boards, to Native States and to private landholders. Therefore, Sir, here we have this fact that our national debt at the present moment, barring the investments to which I have referred, stands at the ridiculously small figure of £13 million; and my submission is that, having regard to the abnormal situation in which we find ourselves at the present moment, the proper way to meet that situation would be by contracting a loan. My Hon'ble friend will probably say that you cannot get money at the present moment in the present condition of the market without a high rate of interest. Perfectly true. We may contract a temporary loan, renew it from time to time and merge it in a permanent loan in an improved market. And, Sir, there is another fact which has to be borne in mind, and which is very pertinent to the considerations I am now placing before this Council, namely, that the Government of India have always been exceedingly cautious in the framing of these estimates. A perusal of the Financial Statement will show that the actual surpluses have generally, if not always, exceeded the estimates, and the estimates of expenditure have generally, if not always, fallen short of the actuals. And the result has been that the huge surpluses of the Government of India have been kept down by doles to the Provincial Governments. My Hon'ble friend the Finance Minister, as a member of the Decentralisation Commission, remarked that these doles were wasteful and demoralising, but the Government of India have been indulging in the luxury of granting these doles, and at the same time having large accumulations of surpluses for themselves. I will give figures to show that we have been overtaxed in the past, and that we should not commit the same mistake again. Immediately after the taxation imposed by Sir Guy Fleetwood Wilson, I think in 1910, we find in 1911-12, £2 million given as doles to Provincial Governments, and in 1912-13, £3·7 million was given to the Provincial Governments. At the same time in 1911-12, the Imperial surplus was £3·9 million and in 1912, the Imperial surplus was £3·1 million; and the Provincial balances stood at the enormous figure of £7 million, the prescribed minimum being only £1 million. Therefore, it seems to me that we ought to avoid taxation by contracting a loan; and of course if that were done, the enhanced salt tax would disappear.

“ Sir, the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has made a statement in the course of which he gives the reasons for the imposition of the new taxes. It occurs

[9TH MARCH, 1916.] [Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee; Sir William Meyer.]

at page 10 of the Financial Statement (paragraph 32). The statement is written with that brevity, conciseness and force which distinguish the utterances of Sir William Meyer. After having stated the difficulties experienced by the Secretary of State in raising loans in the English market, the Financial Statement says—

‘We have also to recollect that the termination of the war, when it comes, will leave us with heavy financial demands upon us. We shall still, in all probability, have a large amount of temporary debt to pay off, and must also prepare for the liquidation of the rupee loan raised this year, which has to be repaid by 1923. We shall likewise have to surrender nearly £2 million which we shall have received in connection with the liquidation of hostile firms and the employment of captured enemy vessels. On the revenue side again, we must recognise that the experiences and lessons of the war must also add in some directions to our permanent military charges; and, lastly, it is desirable that we should be in a position when peace returns; or as soon after as may be, to provide further funds for such beneficent purposes as the improvement of education and sanitation.’

“Sir, let us consider in seriatim the various points which have been urged by the Finance Minister. There is the debt contracted this year which has to be paid off in 1923. Sir, I venture to submit that 7 or 8 years are a long time to look forward to in the financial history of India. ‘Sufficient unto the day is the evil thereof’ is a maxim which administrators and even financiers may take note of. It is risky to take long views of things. The imagination comes into play, it distorts our vision and magnifies our difficulties. We have to pay off this debt in 1923, but we may raise a loan, it may be at an unfavourable market; but the market will not always remain unfavourable; the market will change, improve for the better. Renew the loan in a favourable market, merge it into the permanent loan, and in that way discharge the debt. And in the same way that £2 millions which have to be paid to the enemy may be dealt with. Then we are told that there are these great problems of sanitation and education which have to be faced and grappled with. I have the greatest sympathy with all the beneficent efforts which the Government may make in that direction; but these are more or less Provincial charges. Undoubtedly the Government of India supplies the money; but in any case the Provincial balances have reached the huge figure of £7 millions.

“Sir, my difficulty has been, and I speak as a Member of a Provincial Council, that we cannot get the Provincial Governments to disburse them. They are not always able to get ready their schemes for the purpose of spending the money, and the sanction of the Government of India has to be obtained. Therefore what I say is this, the market is bound to improve, our resources are elastic, and will grow and expand. Having regard to these facts and that the permanent debt is only 1·3 million pounds, we invite the Government to give up 90 lakhs by the surrender of this salt revenue. I venture to think that, as a question of ways and means, this may be found by reducing the closing balances of 1916-17; the closing balances of 1916-17 is estimated at 24·2 million pounds, the closing balance of 1915-16 according to the revised estimate is 23·8 million pounds.”

The Hon'ble Sir William Meyer :—“Where does the Hon'ble Member get these figures, I do not recognise them?”

The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee :—“I think they are correct; I have not got the books here, but I think they may be found to be correct. The surrender would reduce the closing figure to very much what it was last year. There is another point which I desire to submit for the consideration of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister, it is this; even before the increased tax was levied, the price of salt had been doubled, and that was due to the shortage of imported salt from Liverpool and the cessation of trade with the enemy countries. The effect of an enhanced tax would be to make the price more than double what it was. I would suggest that the Government should take palliative measures, measures which would afford facilities, for the manufacture of salt in this country. We had in Bengal large manufactories, in Orissa and in Midnapore

[*Mr. Surendra Nath Banerji; Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya.*] [9TH MARCH, 1916.]

they have been given up; revive this industry which will put money into the pockets of the poor and into the coffers of the Government. I desire to associate myself with my Hon'ble friend's appeal that Government should reconsider the matter, and if it is impossible to give up the whole of the tax, at least to surrender one-half of it. This will be a *via media*, a reasonable compromise, if the Government should surrender 45 lakhs of rupees that would not make any material difference in the financial situation. With these words I support the motion."

The Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya:—"Sir, it would seem almost profitless to discuss this Resolution after we heard the remarks of the Hon'ble the Finance Member the other day on the amendment of the Hon'ble Mr. Dadabhoj. But the fact that, in spite of that discussion, two of my Hon'ble friends have thought it right to appeal strongly to Government to reconsider the situation, is evidence of the strong feeling that is entertained on the subject. I will not take up the time of the Council by repeating the arguments that have been used by my predecessors. I will invite the Government to look at the matter from another point of view. This year controversial questions are, by a wise ruling of His Excellency the President, to be avoided in this Council. The Budget proposals for additional taxation to the tune of £3,000,000 have been received by this Council, save with the exception now before us, with unanimity. Not only here but outside also, as is evidenced from the comments of the Press, the proposals put forward by the Hon'ble the Finance Member, excepting the one relating to salt, have met with general approval. Might I ask the Government, might I ask the Hon'ble the Finance Member, to look at the question from this point of view; at this time of pressure when other controversial subjects have been put aside, when even legislation pending before the war which was regarded as of a controversial nature has been put aside for the time, in order that controversies may not be heard in this Council, may I ask my Hon'ble friend to consider whether, in view of what has been said, and in deference to the opinions expressed in this Council and outside, he will not reconsider the matter and be content with a surplus of £400,000, which the taxation imposed has already secured to the Government. My Hon'ble friend is aware, and the Council is aware, that numerous comments have been made against the increase of the salt tax; that complaints that the salt tax should be enhanced are general. There may be here and there some man who might express his acquiescence in the proposal that that tax should be raised. There may be some blessed with plenty, who are not able to appreciate the fact that an increase of 4 annas in the salt duty will really press upon the poor. But when we take into account all that the poor have to pay and the general rise in prices, the proposed addition will not appear to be inconsiderable. I submit that, in view of the fact that the general public, including the poor, have through the additional import duties come in to pay their increased share of taxation, Government may be pleased to do without the enhanced duty on salt.

"There is another aspect of the matter to which I will invite the attention of the Government of India and of the Hon'ble the Finance Member. In this Council it has been our complaint, and I am sorry to say that that complaint has been well founded, that never once are we able to bring about by our most unanimous, by our most earnest, by our most pathetic appeals, an alteration in the Budget proposals when they have been decided upon by the Government. We feel grateful that the Government invite us to take a part in discussing the financial affairs of the country.

"We have been contributing in our own way of time and of service to such discussion. But it seems hard, it seems unjust that non-official members who are called upon to vote on the Government proposals, and are expected to support them, should not be given the smallest opportunity of having a say in determining what taxation shall be imposed and what shall not be. I mean no disrespect to the Government and none to the Hon'ble the Finance Member,

[9TH MARCH, 1916.] [*Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya; Sir William Meyer.*]

whose courtesy we acknowledge with pleasure; but the fact is that, when Budget proposals are considered, not one member of the non-official body is taken into confidence and asked to make suggestions or asked to express an opinion as to the propriety or otherwise of the various proposals which may be under the consideration of the Government. That places us, the non-official members, in a disadvantageous position. The unsatisfactory character of the existing arrangements is accentuated when it happens to be the case, as it is now, that we are able and willing to render our loyal, enthusiastic and firm support to the major part of the proposals contained in the Budget, but we feel strongly at the same time that some other proposals are open to grave objection. We feel that if we had an opportunity of discussing the matter with the Hon'ble Sir William Meyer before the proposals were announced possibly, probably, we might have been able to persuade him not to enhance the duty on salt, and to be content with the surplus of £400,000 which the taxation already agreed to would bring to him.

"But finding ourselves in the position we are, I invite the Hon'ble the Finance Member, and I invite the Government of India, to initiate a new departure in this year of war, which also happens to be the last session of His Excellency the Viceroy's administration. Let there be this new departure initiated that, after proposals for taxation have been made public, after even a Notification has been issued, enhancing the duty on salt, the Government of India, in gracious deference to the public opinion expressed in this Council and outside it, withdraw that Notification and be content with the additional taxation that has been imposed. The adoption of such a course will not lead the Government into a false position, for there is no proposal at this moment before the Government to alter or amend the Indian Salt Act, and under the provisions of that Act, His Excellency the Governor General can, at any time, by a mere Notification, increase the duty on salt not only by four annas, but up to the extent of Rs. 3 per maund. That is a power which few Governments possess, and that is a power the existence of which affords very strong support to the appeal which I make. It is not likely that the Budget, which has been carefully prepared under the direction of the Hon'ble the Finance Member and the Hon'ble the Finance Secretary—it is not at all likely, I say it is very improbable, that the Budget will be found to be overestimated so far as revenue is concerned. I agree with my friends who have spoken before me that the chances are that the Budget will be found to be, as many previous Budgets of India have been found to be in the last many years, over cautiously prepared, and that at the end of twelve months, we shall find that a much larger revenue has been derived from the various sources than has been estimated in the Budget. That being so, there is no reason to apprehend any embarrassment, I will not say disaster, for that is utterly out of the question, there is no reason to apprehend any financial embarrassment to the Government of India if the Government will be pleased, as I earnestly hope it will be graciously pleased, to accede to the prayer which has been made in the interests of the poorest of the poor."

The Hon'ble Sir William Meyer :—"Sir, I wish to acknowledge the very moderate and friendly spirit in which the Hon'ble Sir Ibrahim Rahimtoola has brought forward his Resolution. At the same time, I still think that to bring it forward at all was unnecessary, seeing that we had the matter out fully at the last sitting. It was perfectly legitimate for Sir Ibrahim to table his Resolution when he did, but in the meantime the wind had been taken out of his sails, so to speak, by my friend Mr. Dadabhoj who had brought up the question of the salt tax in the discussions we had at our last sitting on the Tariff Bill. Therefore, I say, it seems to me to be taking up the time of the Council to little purpose to revive a discussion which was carried out fully and seriously the day before yesterday.

"My Hon'ble friend's main argument is, that it is undesirable that we should have an estimated surplus of one million pounds in 1916-17. The

[*Sir William Meyer; Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee.*] [9TH MARCH, 1916.]

enhancement of the salt tax is estimated to give us £600,000, and he argues that we can do quite well with £400,000. If I may say so, he has advanced in financial virtue, for at the last sitting he wanted to have no surplus at all, or even a deficit of £500,000. I hail this moral progress; and I hope that in the course of time the logic of facts will convince my Hon'ble friend that in the present state of things a surplus of one million pounds is not too much. I quite admit that, if in a time of peace we had, by reason of unfavourable financial circumstances, to increase taxation, we ought not to increase the taxation more than would be necessary to meet our expenditure estimates and leave a small margin. But, as I reminded the Council at the last sitting, the times are very different now. We are living in a period in which our revenue estimates may be badly dislocated, in which expenditure may go up to an extent which we cannot foresee at present. As I said on the last occasion, this year it was necessary that we should meet an unexpected increase in our military expenditure, and we were only saved from having a much bigger deficit than we anticipated by the quite unforeseen way in which the railway receipts came in. We cannot gamble on a recurrence of those favourable circumstances at a time like this, which has very peculiar anxieties, and which may produce unforeseen events. I should think that I was failing in my duty to Government and to the people if I were content to work on narrow margins. It must be remembered, too, that if our surplus should be less than we expect; if, indeed, as may quite possibly happen, the estimated surplus should disappear altogether, we cannot reasonably have recourse to the London market. We do not want to embarrass His Majesty's Government in obtaining all the money they can for the war by making demands in the home market for India.

"Then, my Hon'ble friend, observed, and two other speakers I think argued, that the small addition of four annas a maund to the salt tax was undesirable as leading to a dislocation of retail prices. My Hon'ble friend, I think being a man of wide ideas, if he did increase the salt tax at all, would like to raise it a good deal more than four annas. Well, I am content with small things, I think myself that a four-anna increase, while it brings an appreciable revenue to Government, a revenue which we cannot safely forego in these times, will not hit the poor very much: to a certain extent no doubt, but not to the full extent that the small increase of duty might in itself warrant. I think, it is not unlikely, that a part of the extra tax will be paid by the trade, the wholesale dealers, and to a certain extent, possibly, the retailers too.

"I have had naturally—the Finance Minister in every country does, I suppose—a variety of communications in regard to this Budget, and I was very pleased to find that two very eminent Indian economists hold the same view as I do, and think that this taxation will not inflict any material hardship on the poor.

"The Hon'ble Mr. Banerjee, having, unfortunately for us, been absent from the last sitting, proceeded to retail a number of statistics which Sir Ibrahim Rahimtoola had already made play with the day before yesterday. I will not go into these matters again. My friend, I believe, is a careful student of the works of Dickens, and when he was speaking, I recalled to myself the immortal Mr. Micawber. My friend professed to object only to the salt tax, but it was clear as he warmed to his subject that he objected to any taxation at all, so long as he could borrow. 'Let us borrow', he says; 'it is true that some day or other the loan may come in and the creditor may demand payment, well let us then borrow again at a higher rate of interest'. That is Micawber finance, but it is hardly suitable, I think, for the serious—"

The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee:—"I said, Sir, our credit would improve and we should be borrowing at a lower rate of interest in an improved market."

[9TH MARCH, 1916.]

[*Sir William Meyer.*]

The Hon'ble Sir William Meyer :—“ Mr. Micawber always thought that ‘something was going to turn up,’ and so does my friend. I do not share his views. As I said at the last sitting, the Budget is already, *perforce*, a gamble on rain and a gamble on railways, but I am not going to make it a gamble on something going to turn up.

“ My Hon'ble friend also made a very interesting statement as to the Provincial balances. He says the Provincial balances are inordinately swollen. I rubbed my eyes because I find that he has got two Resolutions down on the present day's agenda inviting extra grants from the depleted Imperial treasury to his own province of Bengal. I take it that these Resolutions were tabled in a fit of absence of mind, and that my Hon'ble friend, having now studied the state of the Provincial balances, will promptly withdraw them.

“ I took him up while he was speaking in regard to our closing balances. I think he took the figures from an abstract statement, which includes moneys which belonged to the Gold Standard Reserve and other funds. The actual closing balances which the Government of India have ordinary control over and the character of which I explained at the last sitting will be, as far as I can now estimate, £17,700,000 in India and England together on the 31st of March and £17,400,000 at the end of 1916-17.

“ The Hon'ble Pandit has asked us to avoid controversy and to yield to the ‘unanimous wish’ of the non-official members of Council. Well, I cannot find that there is any such unanimous wish, because at the last sitting two of the non-official members of Council, my friend Mr. Das and my friend Mr. Shafi said that they approved of the salt tax in present circumstances. I rather think, too, that the Hon'ble Sir Fazulbhoj Curriambhoj said the same. Therefore, there was no unanimity among the non-official members of Council. Then, he says, drop the salt tax in order to avoid controversy. Well I am afraid we cannot import that axiom of avoiding controversy into financial affairs, because it would be so easy for anybody to say that he objected to a tax and that it would lead to acute controversy to proceed with it, and then we should have to drop it. The salt tax has no doubt been disapproved in some quarters; while in other quarters it is regarded as necessary. But similarly, in some quarters the increase of income-tax is not looked on entirely with happiness. Are we to drop that because it will raise controversy? One Calcutta newspaper, I think, objected to the Budget lock, stock and barrel. Is the whole Budget therefore to be scrapped? I am sure my Hon'ble friend will see that we cannot adopt this axiom of dropping taxation which, after very careful consideration, we thought to be necessary, merely to obtain unanimity.

“ Then he speaks of the desirability of consulting non-official opinion before framing budget proposals. It is always open to any non-official member of this Council or any non-official member of the public, to put his views before me as to what taxes might or might not expediently be imposed. Certain members of this Council did so before the Budget was framed, or while it was under consideration. I was very glad to have their views; but to go further than this, to admit the non-official members to a share in the framing of the Budget would be going far beyond what the Chancellor of the Exchequer does at home. He tries to frame a Budget that will be in consonance with the opinions of his party and the country; but he certainly does not take independent members into counsel as to the details of his scheme, nor does he modify his Budget in principle when he has once tabled it. If a Government at home is defeated on an important Budget proposal, it resigns. So that I think my Hon'ble friend is looking to a Utopian state of things that does not prevail even in the classic land of Liberty and Parliaments.

“ There is only one more point I need notice, and that is the argument that we might go on with a modest surplus of £400,000, and that if things go wrong, we could use the executive power we have got to raise the salt tax. As I said at the last sitting, I deprecate doing that except in the last resort. We know how uncertainties affect trade, and to my mind such alterations in prices as have taken place in salt are largely due to speculation with reference

[*Sir William Meyer* ; *Sir Ibrahim Rahimtoola* .] [9TH MARCH, 1916.]

to Budget proposals, to withdrawal of stocks or to holding them up and so forth. I should be very sorry indeed to look forward to a state of things in which the trade would remain in this state of uncertainty, with people scanning the railway returns, the land-revenue returns, and the various signs by which they think they can read the financial position of the Government of India looking out for this information, and then having gossip in the bazaar as to whether the salt tax is to be raised or is not to be raised. That would hurt the people in the long run far more than the definite and small increase of a small amount which we have now proposed and to which we think it our duty to adhere.

"I hope my Hon'ble friend the Mover, having regard to my speech and his desire to avoid needless controversy, will now withdraw his Resolution. If he cannot see his way to do so, I can only oppose it."

The Hon'ble Sir Ibrahim Rahimtoola :—“ Sir, I had hoped that the manner in which I placed my Resolution before the Council would have some restraining effect upon the great fund of humour which the Hon'ble Finance Member undoubtedly possesses. Whether the humour brought forward to-day so far as my remarks are concerned is good, bad or indifferent, I will not trouble the Council with discussing, but I will say this, that if his desire was that no further time should be spent in the discussion of this subject, he might have abstained from covering points which provoke a retort. Sir, I was told in that great humorous way that I am making rapid and substantial moral progress in my ideas of economics and finance. Sir, I have been a humble student of these subjects for close upon a quarter of a century, and I will candidly confess that I am obliged to revise various ideas which I had formed from that study by sitting at the feet of so great and overwhelming a master of economics and finance as our esteemed Finance Member is.

“ Sir, for the first time I have learned that the Chinaman in buying our opium is the taxpayer, and not the Indian producer or the cultivator of poppy. I have further learned that when you have a substantial balance and overwhelming reasons in other directions, that it is immoral to state that a Budget with a small deficit caused by the attitude of Government themselves is an immoral Budget. I am also beginning to learn that though Government have a monopoly of railways and regulate the minima and maxima rates, that their revenue is not indirect taxation but is profits on business transactions made owing to Government holding a monopoly, and that Government can by regulating rates bring about results in the matter of railway revenue yielding what I have now learnt to call enormous profits to the State. Sir, these are all the lessons that I am repeatedly learning, and I daresay that, within a short time hereafter, I shall have revised all the lessons I have learned in the past, sitting at the feet of the great master, as I have already stated.

“ Sir, I wish it to be clearly understood that I am not opposing the Budget, I am not objecting to Government having a surplus of one million pounds. Sir, the time I have taken in explaining my position to the Council is sufficiently warranted because of the misapprehension which the remark of the Hon'ble Member leads me to believe he is labouring under, namely, that I object to a surplus in the Budget of one million pounds. I do not object to this surplus. I say that no one will be better pleased than myself to have a larger surplus in the Budget at a time like this. What I do object to, and object to most strongly, is that additional taxation should be specifically imposed to obtain a surplus. Sir, I cannot make my meaning clearer than I have tried to do and am trying to do. I say it is absolutely wrong in principle—of course I mean the principle as I have learnt to understand it better, not the principle that I am now revising. The principle that I learnt was that it is wrong to impose additional taxation in order to enable Government to have a surplus, especially in view of the fact that there are absolutely strong, undisputed safeguards in the great financial strength of the Government of

[9TH MARCH, 1916.] [*Sir Ibrahim Rahimtoola.*]

India which I tried to indicate by a great number of statistics and facts which I placed before the Council on the last occasion. Sir, I do not object to a surplus, I would be pleased to have a surplus; but I most strongly object to additional taxation for that purpose, especially when it is imposed on the poor and that it should be levied in order that a surplus of 60 lakhs of rupees should be converted into a crore and a half. That is the point.

"Then, Sir, I was told that it was unnecessary, in view of the previous discussion, to have moved this Resolution. Sir, I regard it not only as not unnecessary but, consistently with my duty, as essentially necessary on the present occasion to move it. In speaking on the Hon'ble Mr. Dadabhoj's motion on the 7th instant, I clearly pointed out that that was not an opportune time to raise the question of the salt tax, because the Tariff Act and the Income-tax Act had not been settled. This most appropriate case for which I am representing is overwhelmingly strong now, because a surplus of £400,000 has been absolutely secured. If that is so, I ask whether there is any justification for imposing a tax on the poor and obtaining £600,000 more for adding to and swelling the surplus.

"Sir, it was only during one of the years to which I referred the other day that the Budget estimates of the Government of India opened with a surplus of less than £400,000. If the then Finance Member—I think it was Sir Guy Fleetwood Wilson—was content to open his Budget statements for the next year with a surplus of less than £400,000, I should like to know why the same thing should not occur again to-day. Sir, the Hon'ble Member charged me with playing with figures. I think I might retaliate and say that he was playing with my arguments when it was urged that I objected to a four-anna increase in the salt tax, and that it should be considerably more. I never did anything of the kind. I said that in view of the fact that the salt tax was a reserve, and that a dislocation would be caused to retail prices by a sudden increase or decrease in an article like this, it was all the more necessary to exercise great caution and discrimination in frequently raising or reducing a tax of this description. A tax of this description should be raised on only such justification as would, in looking forward to the future, lead one reasonably to expect that that tax will be maintained at a given standard. Any frequent increase or decrease is objectionable, because it takes a long time, when the reduction comes, to reach the small consumer. It is for that reason, Sir, and stating again the principles that I have learned, that I say that any tax like this with constant variations ought to be avoided. If there had been a case for this increase, if the money was needed for expenditure estimated for by the Hon'ble the Finance Member, I would have warmly supported it. I am not opposed to this tax in principle; I have said that repeatedly. I repeat that I would have been quite willing to agree to it if there had been any justification for it. I submit that there is no justification for it. I therefore submit that this and this alone is the proper time, when a surplus is absolutely assured, to urge upon Government that this additional taxation should not be levied. And if I have thought proper to bring it forward at this stage, it is because it is an appropriate opportunity for so doing.

"In conclusion, I again ask, in spite of what the Hon'ble Member has suggested, that my appeal on behalf of the poorer classes will lead to its consideration by the Government of India. Whatever may be the fate of my Resolution, I trust that, in view of the pathetic appeal made by the Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya, the Government, in a meeting of their Executive Council, will very carefully and dispassionately consider the reasons which we have urged against this increase to the salt tax, and that they will, just as by an executive order they imposed an additional duty, also do away with it by an executive order.

"Sir, feeling as I do in the matter of levying fresh taxation for a surplus, I do not propose to withdraw this Resolution."

The motion was put and rejected.

[*Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee.*] [9TH MARCH, 1916.]

RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF THE PROVINCIAL GRANT FOR ANTI-MALARIAL OPERATIONS.

The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee:—"Sir, I have the honour to move the following Resolution:—

"That this Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that the grant to the Province of Bengal be increased by six lakhs or such other suitable sum as may be deemed necessary for carrying on anti-malarial operations in selected areas."

"Sir, this is a necessary corollary to the Resolution which I had the honour to move in this Council in February last, and which the Government graciously accepted. I moved that the Government would be pleased to issue instructions to Local Governments to take vigorous measures for the prevention of malaria. The Government of India, in accepting that Resolution, issued prompt instructions in accordance with its terms. But, Sir, the adoption of vigorous measures necessarily implies the expenditure of money for the purpose. Questions of administration after all, when analysed, resolve themselves into questions of finance, and none in a greater measure than the question of the prevention of malaria. The American Government spent a mint of money in reclaiming the tract of land about the Panama Canal. I cannot indeed invite the Government of India, in the present circumstances, to emulate the generosity of the American Government, but something has to be done. Government cannot sit still when people are dying in their thousands and tens of thousands through a preventable cause, and when the Government has instructed subordinate administrations to take vigorous measures for the removal of that cause.

"The chief obstacle in this, as in many other measures, is money. We want large sums of money for anti-malarial operations, and I will quote the authority of Dr. Bentley, the Sanitary Commissioner to the Government of Bengal, in this respect. This is what he says in his report on antimalarial operations in the Dinajpur district—

"The chief obstacle is the inability of the country at the present time to meet the enormous expenditure required for carrying out the measures with the necessary completeness in places which are not favourable for such work."

"We take it therefore that where the circumstances are less unfavourable an enormous expenditure of money might be avoided. Some money however has to be spent if prompt measures are to be taken for the prevention of malaria; and, Sir, I will say this that the public funds could not be applied to a more useful or a more righteous purpose than the saving of human life and the alleviation of human suffering. Measures for the public health constitute the first charge upon the public funds. That, I take it, is the fundamental creed of all civilised Governments. Expenditure in other directions might be curtailed, but not in a supreme question like this affecting the life and the happiness of millions of people. And, Sir, I make a very moderate demand. All that I want is six lakhs of rupees to be applied to anti-malarial purposes in selected areas. Our efforts in the past have been spasmodic, without system, and therefore futile. What I would recommend is, that a definite plan of campaign should be organised, applicable to a particular area and carried out in a thorough and business-like manner. The proper thing to do would be to take up two or three districts where malaria is most prevalent and where the circumstances that conduce to the success of anti-malarial operations, are more or less well-known to the authorities. I have in my mind three districts: the district of Burdwan, the district of Murshidabad, (from which my two Hon'ble friends here come), and the district of Naddea. Malaria has decimated these districts. My Hon'ble friends can testify to that fact. The birth-rate has decreased and the death-rate has increased. The country is full of wild jungle. I think these districts ought to be taken up, and the knowledge that would be acquired by the application of a particular method to a particular area would be useful in anti-malarial operations elsewhere.

[9TH MARCH, 1916.] [Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee; Sir C. Sankaran Nair.]

"I know the difficulties of the Government; the finances press; but the question is one of supreme importance. I hope and trust that no technical grounds will be permitted to interfere with the acceptance of this Resolution by the Government. Various arguments against it may be adduced. I might be told 'go and apply to your own Government about this matter.' Further, I might be told 'you are a friend of provincial autonomy: this is inconsistent with the principles of provincial autonomy.' I think we ought to brush aside all these technicalities in view of the supreme need that exists in Bengal and elsewhere for the prevention of malaria. I hope and trust that my Hon'ble friends, when replying to this motion, will not take their stand on these grounds, but will deal with the question in the broad spirit of liberal statesmanship which ought to distinguish the Government of India in approaching a question of life and death affecting the happiness of millions of my countrymen. For these reasons, I beg to lay this Resolution before the Council."

The Hon'ble Sir C. Sankaran Nair :—"I oppose this proposition. My Hon'ble friend wants the Government of India to grant to the Province of Bengal a certain sum of money. But the Government of Bengal have not asked us for anything. They have not told us that they are going to take any anti-malarial measures for which they want money. If they have anything in contemplation, they have not told us what those measures are likely to cost. Without knowing all that, it is almost impossible for us to say whether we should grant any money, and what amount we should grant. The Resolution, on the face of it, seems premature.

"My Hon'ble friend is a member of the local Legislative Council. All the arguments that he put forward here should be addressed to the Government of Bengal in order to persuade them to put forward anti-malarial measures for the consideration of the Government of India, and to ask us for any money if they might want it. It has to be remembered that the Government of Bengal have also got a large balance, though they cannot now draw upon it except under special conditions. While, therefore, that is the state of things, and while we have to meet a heavy deficit by fresh taxation, it is out of the question to make such an anticipatory grant as my Hon'ble friend suggests. I have therefore to oppose this Resolution."

The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee :—"I take it, Sir, from the observations which have fallen from my Hon'ble friend, the Member in charge of the Department, that he is in sympathy with the main objects of this Resolution. His objection is to the *modus operandi* which I have thought fit to follow in this case. My Hon'ble friend says that the Government of Bengal has not asked for any money, and that he does not know what the intentions of the Government of Bengal are in regard to this matter. Well now, suppose the Government of Bengal were to ask for some money, would the Hon'ble Member be prepared to give it?"

The Hon'ble Sir C. Sankaran Nair :—"That matter would be considered on its merits."

The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee :—"I am very pleased to hear it. The difficulty of the situation is that the Government of Bengal cannot spend their money, as my Hon'ble friend has just pointed out. They have been instructed not to spend any Imperial grant without the previous sanction of the Government of India. I am not permitted to disclose the secrets of my prison-house, and I certainly am not going to do so in the presence of an official of the Bengal Government sitting here. But, as a matter of fact, I know—I may say so without revealing any secrets at all—that the Government of Bengal is most anxious to start anti-malarial operations. I believe they are willing to start those operations in connection with two or three districts; but the money is wanting, and I am glad to have the assurance

274 RESOLUTIONS *RE* INCREASE OF THE PROVINCIAL GRANT FOR ANTI-MALARIAL OPERATIONS AND FOR THE EQUIPMENT OF THE CALCUTTA UNIVERSITY COLLEGE OF SCIENCE.

[*Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee; Sir Sankaran Nair.*] [9TH MARCH, 1916.]

of my Hon'ble friend opposite that if the Government of Bengal were to ask for money, and if they were to communicate to him their schemes in regard to anti-malarial operations, he would consider, and I take it favourably consider, them and sanction the expenditure. May I have that assurance?"

The Hon'ble Sir C. Sankaran Nair :—" I did not say all that. "

The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee :—" No, but I want an assurance from the Hon'ble Member. I take it from the silence of my Hon'ble friend that he is inclined to accept this view of the matter. Under those circumstances, I withdraw my Resolution. "

The Resolution was by permission withdrawn.

RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF THE PROVINCIAL GRANT FOR THE EQUIPMENT OF THE CALCUTTA UNIVERSITY COLLEGE OF SCIENCE.

The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee :—" Sir, I have the honour to move the following Resolution —

'That the grant to the Province of Bengal be increased by three lakhs for meeting the cost of equipping the Calcutta University College of Science.'

" Sir, the Calcutta University College of Science owes its birth to the philanthropy of two distinguished men, two of the most illustrious Bengalis of the present generation, the late Sir Tarakanath Palit and Sir Rash Behari Ghose. Their benefactions in this connection have shed a lustre upon their province, and I have no doubt will stimulate philanthropic efforts among our countrymen in all parts of India. Sir Tarakanath Palit gave away the whole of his fortune—his princely fortune—of 15 lakhs of rupees, built up by himself, for he was not born with a golden spoon in his mouth, for the spread of higher scientific education in Bengal. Sir Rash Behari Ghose followed his example by making a gift of 10 lakhs of rupees. I believe that the nation is the heir to what remains of the fortune of Sir Rash Behari Ghose and what he may still accumulate by his earnings. The proceeds of Sir T. Palit's endowment are to be applied to the creation of two chairs, one of Chemistry and the other of Physics in the new College of Science and of a number of research scholarships. The proceeds of the endowment of Sir Rash Behari Ghose are to be applied to the founding of four chairs of Botany, Applied Mathematics, Physics and Chemistry, and eight research scholarships. The University of Calcutta, on receipt of this grant, proceeded to construct a building for the College out of its own funds at a cost of 3 lakhs. The building is now nearly complete. In December, 1912, the University of Calcutta applied to the Government of India for a non-recurring grant of 15 lakhs of rupees, with a full statement of the endowment and of the responsibility which the endowment imposed upon the University. In October 1913, the University of Calcutta again approached the Government with an application for a recurring grant of Rs. 84,000 a year, so that the College of Science may be in a position to commence its full career of work and open the departments of Botany, Zoology, Physics, Chemistry and Applied Mathematics. The Government replied saying that it was impossible to make a grant at that time, but that the question would be considered. In June, 1915, the University of Calcutta laid an exhaustive statement of its financial position before the Government, and also a scheme for organising the College of Science upon a satisfactory footing.

RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF THE PROVINCIAL GRANT 275
FOR THE EQUIPMENT OF THE CALCUTTA UNIVERSITY
COLLEGE OF SCIENCE

[9TH MARCH, 1916.] [Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee; Sir C. Sankaran Nair.]

The University pointed out that the arrangements made in Bengal for the spread of higher scientific education were inadequate. The Presidency College had M.A. classes which taught only Physics and Chemistry. The Dacca College had M. A. classes only in Chemistry. They also observed that the College of Science would be an institute for research, and that the professors would be in a position to carry on research work unburdened from the exacting duties of their routine professorial work in College. In July 1915, the University out of its own funds made a small grant of Rs. 15,000, and partially fitted up the laboratory of the College. M. Sc. classes were opened with 8 students. Sir, this is the work that has been done by private philanthropy aided by the resources of the University, and I appeal to the Government to come forward with adequate funds for the purpose of placing the College of Science upon a satisfactory footing. I have got a statement to show the actual needs of the College at the present moment. It is a statement which has been drawn up by an expert acquainted with all the facts of the case. He says that a sum of 8½ lakhs of rupees would be required as a non-recurring expenditure; the detailed items being as follows :—

- Rs. 75,000 for the physical laboratory ;
- Rs. 75,000 for the chemical laboratory ;
- Rs. 75,000 for the biological laboratory,
- Rs. 10,000 for the experimental psychological laboratory,
- Rs. 25,000 for the workshop,
- Rs. 50,000 for the library,

and Rs. 40,000 for the completion of the building, fencing, etc., making altogether Rs. 8½ lakhs. My Resolution recommends a grant of only Rs. 3 lakhs. These items might be revised or the grant for the library might for the present be suspended. I do hope that Government will come to the help of this institution. The Government of India have always been the generous patron of learning. During the Viceroyalty of His Excellency Lord Hardinge scientific education has received a stimulus all its own. Our great scientist, Doctor J. C. Bose, has been furnished with ample funds through the beneficence of the Government, so that he may carry on those researches which have extended the bounds of human knowledge, and have shed lustre upon the Indian name. Sir, I think it is right and proper that this College of Science, which owes its origin to the philanthropy of two distinguished Indian gentlemen, and in which the University of Calcutta has taken such a keen interest, should receive the generous and practical support of the Government of India. With these observations, I beg to move this Resolution."

The Hon'ble Sir C. Sankaran Nair.—"Sir, I have to oppose this Resolution for reasons very similar to those which I advanced in opposition to the last Resolution. I am not concerned now either to accept or to deny the various facts or arguments which have been put forward by my Hon'ble friend. I shall only say for the present that there is no application either by the University or by the Government of Bengal pending before the Government of India for any grant of money. My friend knows a good deal about the facts and about the correspondence that passed between the Government of India and the University or the Government of Bengal; but he is apparently not informed of a fact which is subsequent to all that he has referred to, and that is, that we have asked for certain information in October 1915, information which we have not yet obtained. We shall consider the request when made by the Government of Bengal on its own merits. We may then reject the application *in toto*, or we may see reasons to grant it either in whole or in part. About that I can for the present make no promise. But it has also to be noticed as I said

276 RESOLUTION *RE* INCREASE OF THE PROVINCIAL GRANT FOR THE EQUIPMENT OF THE CALCUTTA UNIVERSITY COLLEGE OF SCIENCE; FINANCIAL STATEMENT.

[*Sir. C. Sankaran Nair; Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee; Mr. C. H. A. Hill.*] [9TH MARCH, 1916.]

before that the Government of Bengal have got their own large balance, though it might be true that they are not entitled to draw upon it except under special circumstances. In these circumstances at this stage the Government of India, when they have to meet a deficit by taxation, do not see their way to make any promise or to make any grant."

The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee:—"Sir, it is news to me that the University has not applied; but as a matter of fact from the statement which I have just placed before the Council it will have been seen that the University applied more than once, in 1912 for a non-recurring grant of 15 lakhs and again in 1913 for a recurring grant of Rs. 84,000 annually, for the Science College, and the Government of India said in reply to one of these requests that the matter would be considered, as at that time funds were not available. Therefore, although the University might not have made a recent application, the fact remains that, since the foundation of the college, the University has again and again been coming to the Government of India for grants. I shall certainly ask the University authorities to make a further application in this connection in accordance with the suggestion which has just been thrown out by the Hon'ble Member.

"If the University is able to make out that a grant is necessary in order that the College may be placed on a satisfactory footing, I hope the money will be forthcoming. I hope my Hon'ble friend is able to give us that assurance, not a promise, I do not ask for a promise, but for an assurance, a sympathetic assurance of a benevolent attitude in regard to the College of Science. Unless the money is forthcoming, I am afraid the College cannot carry out its work satisfactorily; Rs. 25,00,000 are practically locked up, the University building is not finished, the laboratory is not what it should be, there is no library—all these are essential conditions for the successful working of the College of Science. Unless the Government of India comes to our help, I am afraid it will not be possible to fulfil the high objects which the illustrious donors had in view, and which inspired their generosity. I hope when a scheme has been made out and is supported by the Government of Bengal, my Hon'ble friend will see his way to issue instructions for unlocking the funds of the Government for this purpose. I beg to withdraw the Resolution."

The Resolution was by permission withdrawn.

FINANCIAL STATEMENT.

SECOND STAGE.

The Hon'ble Mr. C. H. A. Hill opened the second stage of the discussion on, and introduced the following heads of, the Financial Statement for 1916-17:—

<i>Revenue.</i>	<i>Expenditure.</i>
Land Revenue.	Land Revenue.
Provincial Rates.	Provincial Rates.
Forest.	Forest.
Scientific and other Minor Departments.	Scientific and other Minor Departments.
Irrigation.	Famine Relief.
Civil Works.	Protective Works, Irrigation.
	Irrigation.
	Civil Works.
	Capital outlay on Irrigation.

He said:—"I now beg to introduce the heads of Revenue and Expenditure standing against my name. The subjects of Land Revenue and Famine Relief have been so fully set forth in the Financial Statement that I have nothing to add regarding them. As has already been explained by the Hon'ble the Finance

[9TH MARCH, 1916.]

[Mr. C. H. A. Hill.]

Member, expenditure has had to be so rigorously curtailed, both during the current and in budgeting for the coming year, whether on Agriculture or Forests, that there is, perhaps, less to explain than usual this year. I may observe, however, that this fact has not prevented Government from endeavouring in connection, specially with Agriculture, to pave the way for the time when funds will again be available for well-devised expenditure. We are, in fact, utilising the time during which expenditure must be restricted, by preparatory and experimental work, as will appear a little further on.

"In regard to Forests, the revenue which is almost entirely provincial, has continued, as was the case last year, to suffer from the prevalence of war, but we have been able to provide, from Imperial revenue, funds for the services of a Tannin expert, who has been engaged for two years, to investigate and report on the feasibility of promoting the industry on a large scale hereafter. The appointment of Forest Engineer, which was sanctioned for two years in 1913, has been extended for a further period of three years, and the Engineer is now employed in the United Provinces. In Bombay and the United Provinces, a Chief Conservator has been sanctioned, while a large increase of the controlling staff in the United Provinces, involving the addition of 10 Imperial officers, 2 Deputy Conservators, and 16 Extra Assistant Conservators, has also been sanctioned. The reorganisation of the controlling staff sanctioned for Assam will have to be deferred until Budget provision can be made.

"As instancing the work of preparation which is going on in anticipation of the recurrence of more favourable financial conditions, I may mention that three important Conferences connected with Agriculture have been held during the current year. The first of these was the Inter-Provincial Jute Conference, held in Calcutta in August, 1915, the recommendations of which are now under the consideration of Government in consultation with the Local Governments concerned. It is hoped that, in due course, good results will ensue from the deliberations which then took place. The second Conference was the one recently held to discuss the subject of Agricultural Education, just before the meeting of the Agricultural Board at Pusa last month. Considerable interest has recently been displayed in various quarters on the subject of agricultural education generally, and, as there seemed to be a certain amount of confusion of thought on the subject, it was considered desirable to convene representatives from most of the provinces to discuss the subject, mainly from the Agricultural standpoint. Government are still awaiting the report of the proceedings of the Conference, and it would, of course, be premature to say anything committal on the subject at the present moment. It may, however, be useful to those interested in the matter if I mention that the Conference, in the course of its proceedings, took into consideration a good deal of literature on the subject from America and from elsewhere, and approached it primarily from the point of view of the promotion of improved agricultural methods throughout the country and a consequential advance in its economic resources. In view of what has already appeared in the Press, it will also be permissible to remark that the Conference came to the general conclusion that the direct teaching of Agriculture in the ordinary schools of India was impracticable, although it was desirable, so far as possible, to adapt the text books of rural schools to the ordinary surroundings and occupations of the pupils. In regard to the direct teaching of Agriculture, the Conference was very favourably impressed with the results achieved in the course of the experimental vernacular schools for Agriculture in the Bombay Presidency, and suggested that the question of extending these should be considered.

"The third important Conference was the ordinary periodic meeting of the Board of Agriculture at Pusa. There, one of the most important matters discussed was a paper, prepared by the Agricultural Adviser, outlining a scheme for improving the cattle of India from the dairying point of view, and the Board, in considering this paper, also discussed at some length the question of measures for the improvement of the breeds of plough cattle also. The importance of this subject cannot be overstated in its relation to the general Agricultural resources of the country.

“ Another matter of importance to India, which is receiving attention, is the possibility of reviving the indigenous silk industry. For this purpose, we have obtained the services for one year of Mr. Maxwell-Lefroy, who had done eminent service in research work as Imperial Entomologist at Pusa. Mr. Maxwell-Lefroy is at present touring through India on his mission, and we hope to receive his report before the close of the current calendar year.

“ Not the least important subject which is receiving special attention at the present time is the possibility of reviving the natural indigo trade. As Hon'ble Members are aware, German manufacturers have succeeded in producing, by chemical processes, a paste of uniform composition admirably suited to the needs of dyers all over the world. The problem that presents itself to India is, in the first place, how to improve the cultivation of indigo in such a way as to increase the output of Indian in the natural plant, and, secondly, how to standardise the product, so that it shall be able to compete in the matter of convenience as well as economy with the synthetic article. The question of appointing an expert chemist to study the matter from the point of view of the manufacture of the natural produce is at present under consideration. It is, however, recognised that no permanent advantage can accrue from an attempt to resuscitate this industry unless it is found possible to establish it on a permanent basis after the war is over. It is essential, if this end is to be attained, that planters should make some arrangement to bulk their products and to adopt some form of co-operation both in manufacture and marketing. Government have indicated their preparedness to help planters with the expert advice of the chemist, provided they receive the assurance that the planters on their part will co-operate and assist Government in the matter. Without their help and without having reached an understanding that they will spare no endeavour so to prepare their product as to be able to compete, in convenience and quality, with the synthetic paste, it would be futile for Government to undertake the investigation into the possibility of bringing this about.

“ Apart from these special investigations, which have for their object permanent improvements after the war is over, the general work of agricultural research is making steady and very satisfactory progress, and the results promise to be very far-reaching. Hon'ble Members are probably aware—at least those of them who are interested in Agriculture—that research work in Pusa has already resulted in the selection of more than one new variety of wheat which have been found to give a larger and better milling yield than the local varieties. One in particular, known as Pusa No. 12, promises to give results which will be of the greatest possible value in promoting the betterment of the economic condition of agriculturists over a large area in India. We hope in process of time to establish a regular grade for this wheat in the English market, and to secure for the farmer higher prices than are paid for the ordinary Indian wheats. A small provision was included in the Budget for the current year for this purpose, and a similar sum is being repeated in the Budget for 1916-17. Investigation into the varieties of cotton, sugar-cane, and so forth, is also being pushed on at Pusa, Coimbatore, and elsewhere, and I think I may say that, within the limits of an all too small establishment, the work not only at Pusa, but in the provincial agricultural institutions, is now proceeding on well-considered and more hopeful lines. The administration of the results of research, whether conducted in the laboratories at Pusa or in the laboratories of Local Governments, is entrusted of course to the Governments of the provinces interested, and I do not propose to say more on this head.

“ At the present moment, it is not only finance which hampers the development of the Provincial Departments of Agriculture, but also the difficulty of procuring suitable officers. The large scheme of reorganisation which has been sanctioned for the Madras Presidency will have to be brought into operation very gradually and the additional expenditure involved, which amounts to about 2½ lakhs a year, cannot be incurred immediately. Additional posts of Deputy or Assistant Directors, which have been sanctioned for Burma, Assam,

[9TH MARCH, 1916.]

[*Mr. C. H. A. Hill.*]

the Central Provinces, and the Andamans, have not yet been filled owing to the continuance of the war.

"Before concluding my remarks on the subject of Agriculture, I think I ought to advert to the fact that the Department will shortly be losing the services of Mr. Coventry, who has been connected with it since its inception, and has for 12 years now performed with energy and success the important duties of Director of the Agricultural Research Institute, and for the past four years has combined these duties with the work of Agricultural Adviser to the Government of India. Mr. Coventry's services will not, however, be lost to India, as he is taking up another appointment connected with Agriculture in Central India, and we shall hope to continue to benefit by his valuable experience.

"Of the Departments classed as 'Scientific' and 'Miscellaneous,' I need only refer to the Survey Department, whose work has been restricted by the reversion of a number of Imperial officers to military duty and by the employment of many provincial officers on military work. The curtailment of programmes of field work has been inevitable, but the Department has managed to keep up its scientific investigation, and the results of its observations with the plumb line, which were recently explained by Sir Sidney Burrard in his interesting lecture at Lucknow, promise to make an important addition to our knowledge of the earth's crust. The mapping offices have had to meet large demands for the supply of new maps for military purposes, and I believe that these offices have fully risen to the occasion. Maps have also been published of nearly the whole frontier between Turkey and Persia as a result of the labours of the detachment under Colonel Ryder, which accompanied the Commission to that frontier. Computations are now being made at Dehra Dun of the valuable observations taken by Major Wood when accompanying Cavaliere Filippo de Filippi's expedition to Karakoram, and the Survey Department has recently published a most interesting account of a remarkable achievement in linking up the triangulations of India with those of Russia. It may be doubted whether the labour involved in such achievements is generally appreciated. But in the last named instance, it has been emphasised by the sad loss which the Department sustained in the death of Lieutenant Bell of the Royal Engineers.

"The Meteorological Department has recently arranged for the distribution of information regarding the weather by broadcast wireless messages from various Indian ports. Such information should be of great value to ships in the Bay of Bengal and on the Arabian Sea.

"The important subject of Co-operative Credit Societies has recently been exhaustively examined by a strong committee under the presidency of the Hon'ble Sir Edward Maclagan. As many of the questions—and they were very numerous—raised by that Committee are still under consideration, I do not propose to go into them to-day, but I think it will be agreed that the manner in which Co-operative Credit Societies have withstood the severe shock to credit caused by the outbreak of war the year before last, is admirable evidence of their stability, and justifies the hope that the co-operative movement has, despite some possible failings, now been established upon a thoroughly sound basis.

"I have mentioned the loss which the Agricultural Department is sustaining in the retirement of its head, Mr. Coventry, and I should like here also to express our acknowledgment for his good work to Mr. Mercer, who, for the past 8 years, has presided over the Forest Research Institute and College at Dehra Dun. That Institution, within its own sphere, has, in the same degree as the Institute at Pusa, done, under his efficient guidance, much extremely valuable work.

"I now turn to the operations of the Public Works Department, and will refer first of all to 'Irrigation.' During the year now drawing to a close, productive irrigation works, after meeting all charges for maintenance and repairs, as well as interest on capital, returned a net profit to the State of 272½ lakhs, or slightly less than the corresponding figure of last year, which was 281 lakhs. For the ensuing year, we anticipate

a net revenue of 274½ lakhs, which closely approximates to the actuals anticipated for the current year. Now that the triple canal project of the Punjab has come to completion with the inauguration of the Jhelum Head Works at Mangla, performed by His Excellency last January, an appreciable increase of irrigation revenue will, it is hoped, be realised in the near future.

"In the course of the discussion on the Budget for 1915-16, the Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya suggested this time last year that the allotments for irrigation might all be shown in one place in future, and Sir Robert Carlyle promised to consider the matter in regard to the ensuing year's Budget. I am glad to say that it has been found feasible to give effect to this suggestion, and that the allotments will be shown together in one place in the Budget which will be presented to Council on the 21st of March, and the figures will be shown in the memorandum explaining the details of the estimate.

"The provision made for capital outlay for major irrigation works during the ensuing year is, under '49—Productive Works,' Rs. 186.75 lakhs and under Protective Works Rs. 62.10 lakhs—Total 197.85 lakhs. This total shows a decrease of 17.25 lakhs as compared with the provision for new major works in the revised estimates for the current year, which stands at 215.10 lakhs, and this reduction is, of course, necessitated by the general policy of curtailing expenditure as far as possible.

"The Hon'ble the Finance Member, in his introductory speech, has already briefly alluded to the present phase of some of the large irrigation projects which are under consideration. I may perhaps be allowed to make a few observations in supplement to his remarks. As Hon'ble Members are aware, the great Sukkur Barrage scheme was submitted to the Secretary of State some three years ago, but was returned for reconsideration by the Government of India, in consequence of the advice tendered to the Secretary of State by a Committee convened by him that there was not sufficient evidence that irrigation in Sind had suffered in the past, or would be likely to suffer in the future in consequence of further withdrawals of water from the Punjab rivers, and, further, that it seemed doubtful whether the project as designed would prove to be a productive work. The scheme has since been reinvestigated by the Irrigation Engineers of the Government of Bombay in consultation with the Inspector-General of Irrigation, and a revised project resulting from all this consideration is now about to be drawn up for approval. The Sukkur Barrage project presents many problems of considerable difficulty, and it is possible that considerable advantage may accrue from the further investigation to which the original project has now been submitted. In any event, in view of present financial circumstances, it is improbable that any money could possibly have been spent upon it, even if the project had met with approval on its first submission.

"Another large scheme to which reference has been made is that for the utilisation of the waters of the Sarda river. The original scheme provided for a division of the available water-supply between the United Provinces and the Punjab. In regard to the Punjab, the design was to augment the supply of the Eastern Jumna Canal by means of a feeder channel from the Ganges river which in turn was to be replenished by the water from the Sarda river. By this arrangement, it was intended that the Western Jumna Canal in the Punjab should be able to draw more largely upon the waters of the Jumna, and thus to extend irrigation to the dry tracts in the Rohtak and Hissar districts lying within its command. So far as the United Provinces were concerned, the project only provided for the irrigation of the western districts and none for Oudh. Considerable difficulties, both of a technical and administrative character, were inherent in this scheme, and the Government of the United Provinces have recently submitted an alternative which aims at the utilisation of the Sarda water within the confines of the province and the extension of irrigation to Oudh. The original exclusion of the province of Oudh from the benefits of the earlier scheme was due to the belief that the Talukdars of Oudh were strongly opposed to the introduction of irrigation. Not only, however, have circumstances recently altered but the cost

[9TH MARCH, 1916.] [Mr. C. H. A. Hill; Sir C. Sankaran Nair.]

of well irrigation has considerably increased, and it is now clear that there is a keen desire on the part of the province of Oudh to participate in the irrigation from the Sarla. This alternative proposal, now before the Government of India, is only a part of the complete scheme, and does not preclude the possibility of extension in accordance with the original design.

"In the matter of the division of the waters of the Cauvery river between the Government of Madras and the Mysore Darbar, both disputants have been given and have exercised the right of making representations, regarding the arbitration award and of replying to each other's observations. The case is now before the Government of India, and it is hoped that final orders will be passed during the current month.

"As regards Civil Works, I have nothing to add to what is stated in the Financial Statement regarding Capital expenditure on the New Capital at Delhi. The total Imperial grant provided for '45—Civil Works,' exclusive of sums allotted for expenditure to be incurred in the Civil Department mostly in the several minor administrations and in the administrations of the North-West Frontier Province and Baluchistan, is 80 lakhs as compared with 100 lakhs provided in the Budget for 1915-16. The purposes to which the grant of 80 lakhs mentioned above will be applied are the following :—

- | | | |
|-----|-------|--|
| (a) | 8.74 | for the Delhi Province Ordinary, <i>i.e.</i> , apart from New Delhi. |
| (b) | 1.00 | Archæological expenditure. |
| (c) | 5.93 | Payments in England on account of stores, furlough allowance, etc. |
| (d) | 27.33 | Original works new, and in progress. |
| (e) | 31.86 | Repairs, Establishment and Miscellaneous charges. |
| (f) | 4.14 | Reserve for unforeseen expenditure. |

80.00

The Hon'ble Sir C. Sankaran Nair introduced the following heads of the Financial Statement for 1916-17—

<i>Revenue.</i>	<i>Expenditure.</i>
Education.	Medical (Sanitation). Education.

He said :—“Sir, I introduce the following heads of the Financial Statement, that is, Education and Sanitation details of which will be found in the Explanatory Memorandum, paragraph 98, from which the Hon'ble Members will see that the Budget estimate for expenditure in 1916-17 is about 18½ lakhs in excess of the revised estimate for 1915-16, that is the one being 475 lakhs and odd, the other being 488 lakhs and odd. I have no doubt the Hon'ble Members will consider this satisfactory, considering the financial position.

“There is nothing else of any great interest to which I need refer. I will, however, draw the attention of Hon'ble Members to the fact that out of the estimate for 1915-16, 44 lakhs has lapsed, and that out of the estimate for 1916-17, Government have been able to keep in reserve only a sum of 1.81 lakhs.

“With reference to Sanitation, I have very little to add to paragraphs 103, 109, 110, 111, 114 and 234 of the Finance Secretary's Memorandum which explain the details of the estimates. In regard to the estimates for 1915-16, out of a reserve of 7.70 lakhs, one lakh has been allotted to the United Provinces for the improvement of the pilgrim route from Kedarnath to Badrinath, two lakhs to the North-West Frontier Province for the benefit of the Peshawar Municipality in aid of their scheme of drainage and water-supply, and .70 lakhs to Delhi for sanitary improvements. The balance of the reserve, which comes up to four lakhs, has lapsed in view of the need for economy. Out of the five lakhs which were allotted to the Indian Research Fund in 1915-16, we have spent Rs. 2,52,216 for anti-malarial schemes in Delhi and the United Provinces; to the Bombay School of Tropical Medicine, we have

[*Mr. C. Sankaran Nair; Mr. Sharp; Sir William Clark.*] [9TH MARCH, 1916.]

allotted a lakh of rupees and we have given Rs. 80,000 to carry out a scheme of experimental research in Lucknow. I might also bring to the notice of Hon'ble Members that the Research Association has conducted various inquiries at its own expense into cholera, water analysis, plague, diabetes and tuberculosis. For the year 1916-17, no fresh grants have been made for Sanitation. We have allotted three lakhs to the Indian Research Fund, two lakhs to the Peshawar Municipality, and the residue of four lakhs will be temporarily resumed in view of the financial situation. It will be made available for expenditure on Sanitation later on, on a return to normal conditions.

"I do not think there is anything else of interest which I have to bring to the notice of the Council."

The Hon'ble Mr. Sharp:—"Sir, in connection with the head 'Education,' I lay on the table the annual narrative of educational progress. It is important to notice that, in the general tables which it contains, an anomaly has been removed whereby, in previous years, the figures for certain Native States were included. This fact has to be remembered in comparing the general tables of 1913-14 with those of 1914-15. If the figures for these States be excluded from the general tables of both those years, then we find that in 1914-15 the number of educational institutions increased by over 4,000, pupils by 260,000 and expenditure by about 120 lakhs. These figures of increase may be taken as probably under-estimates; for it has been impossible to get precise figures for some of the areas which have now been excluded, and I have therefore made an estimate for them which probably errs on the side of moderation. These figures suffice to show that the effect of the large educational grants which were made by the Government of India are by no means cancelled by war conditions, and that progress is steadily maintained. The details of this development and of the various improvements carried out will be found in the narrative."

At this stage the Hon'ble **Sir William Clark** left the Chair, which was taken by the Hon'ble **Sir Reginald Craddock**.

The Hon'ble Sir William Clark introduced the following heads of the Financial Statement for 1916-17:—

<i>Revenue.</i>	<i>Expenditure.</i>
Salt.	Salt.
Excise.	Excise.
Posts and Telegraphs.	Customs.
Stationery and Printing.	Posts and Telegraphs.
State Railways.	Stationery and Printing.
Subsidised Companies.	Protective Works, Railways.
	Subsidised Companies.
	Miscellaneous Railway Expenditure.
	Capital outlay on State Railways.

He said:—"Sir, I beg to introduce the heads, Salt, Excise, Customs, Post Office and Telegraphs, Stationery and Printing and Railways. As in previous years, I will ask my Hon'ble friend the President of the Railway Board to deal with Railways, and in discussing the other heads, I will confine my remarks to matters of general interest, detailed explanations of the estimates being already before Hon'ble Members in the memorandum.

"The total revenue of the Post and Telegraph Department for the year 1914-15 was £3,499,800. According to the Revised Estimates the amount for the current year will be £3,627,100 representing an increase of £127,800, and we anticipate that, unless there is a material alteration in the conditions

[9TH MARCH, 1916.]

[Sir William Clark.]

prevailing at present, there will be further increase of £137,500 during the coming year.

"The total expenditure for the year 1914-15 amounted to £3,178,900, and we hope to keep within £3,191,700 for the current year.

"In the matter of capital outlay on the Telegraph service, the Budget Estimate for 1916-17 is £277,900 exclusive of the share of establishment charges, as compared with a Revised Estimate of £1,160,000 for the current year and a sum of £168,000 actually spent during 1914-15. Since the commencement of the war every effort has been made to keep down capital expenditure, and the anticipated increase is due mainly to the rise in the prices of English stores and the replacement of material supplied to the Army Department for issue to the Expeditionary Forces.

"As regards Salt, Hon'ble Members will be interested to learn that, in the salt areas under the control of the Commissioner of the Salt Revenue in Northern India, widespread and successful efforts have been made to stimulate the export of saltpetre, which is urgently required by Great Britain and her Allies for the manufacture of explosives. The result of these efforts has not only been to afford a substantial degree of assistance to the Allied cause, but has also incidentally given a fresh stimulus to the industry of saltpetre which is carried on by the poor and hard-working class of Nuniyas.

"In regard to Customs, I can add nothing to what my Hon'ble Colleague the Finance Member has already said regarding our customs revenue, and the various causes which have affected it during the past year. Freights were already high during the first portion of the year, and in consequence of the large demands subsequently made upon the British and Allied mercantile marine for the movement of troops in the Mediterranean theatre of war, they rose in the latter portion of the year to heights altogether unprecedented. That there has not been a greater falling-off in Indian exports is no doubt due to the fact that a large number of these are in such demand outside India, that importing nations are ready to pay the very greatly increased prices which the rise in the freights has caused. Recently, however, there has been a most welcome decline from the high pitch which was latterly reached, although there is no ground for hope of a return during, at any rate, the period of war to anything like the normal freights previously prevailing. The demands on the care and vigilance of our customs staff have continued to increase, with the closer watch which is being maintained on goods destined for neutral ports and on dealings with enemy firms in neutral countries. The grip of the British blockade upon the very slender volume of commerce which still finds its way to the enemy, grows ever tighter; the fresh expedients which are constantly being devised on the part of enemy importers, are being met with ever increasing precaution. Last year I paid a well-deserved tribute to the customs staff to whom a very heavy burden was thrown by our war trade policy, and to the mercantile public for their ready acquiescence in these necessary restrictions. I again desire to renew my appreciation of the work of the Customs Department and to express our thanks to the commercial community for the way in which they have seconded our efforts.

"Among the more important activities of the Commerce and Industry Department during the past year, have been certain incursions which it has been necessary for us to make into a sphere which is generally considered somewhat outside the scope of a Government department. Chief among these was the scheme for the Governmental control of the purchase and export of wheat. I need not go into details about the working and results of this scheme, since it was dealt with fully by my Hon'ble Colleague the Finance Member in his Financial Statement. At present, owing to the nature of the past season, shipment by Government is in abeyance, but the prohibition on export is still in force and will continue to be so, and the machinery created last year remains ready for employment against the time when circumstances may warrant a resumption of our exports.

"There have also been other commercial activities which are important, not only from the assistance which they have given to the Allied cause, but

[*Sir William Clark; Sir Robert Gillan.*] [9TH MARCH, 1916.]

also in their economic aspect in this country. The great jute manufacturing centre of Calcutta has been called upon, under an arrangement made through the Commerce and Industry Department, to supply vast quantities of sandbags and cloth to Great Britain and the Allies for use in military operations. The arrangement entered into with the Calcutta mills has now been in operation for nearly six months, and the smoothness with which it has worked has drawn from His Majesty's Government a warm appreciation of the zeal and patriotism of the Calcutta manufacturers. His Majesty's Government have also invited the Department to express their thanks to the Calcutta shipowners for the handsome reductions which they made in the then high level of freights in favour of jute manufactures shipped for military purposes to the United Kingdom.

"The resources of the Indian manganese and wolfram fields have become of the very greatest importance in the provisions of munitions of war. The former industry was fully organised and required little stimulation or assistance from Government, otherwise than in the provision and regulation of railway transport. The wolfram mining industry, however, is carried on in the comparatively undeveloped country of Lower Burma, where it was necessary for Government to give a large measure of direct assistance by the provision of labour, the improvement of communications, the temporary relaxation of the mining rules and the furnishing of the advice and assistance of mining and geological experts, in all of which matters the Burma Government have taken a vigorous and important share. The result, it is hoped, will be not only to furnish valuable assistance to Great Britain and her Allies in the conduct of the war, but also to stimulate the growth of an important industry and the development of the resources of the province."

The Hon'ble Sir Robert Gillan:—"Sir, in the Railway Department, as in every Department of the Government and every private concern throughout the country, there is one word that recurs on every page and every paragraph of current history, and that word is 'war.' I wish to develop this in three directions—as regards railway finance, as regards congestion, and as regards the manufacture of munitions.

"In the matter of finance, the effects of the war were very plain from what the Hon'ble Sir William Meyer told us the other day. On the capital side in the current year, for instance, against an original grant of 8 million pounds we now propose to spend only £1,900,000; and for next year the provision is no more than £3,000,000. But it will be clear that a very large restriction of expenditure was in any case inevitable, both because we were precluded from going to the Home market for money, and because materials were not available, even if we could have got more money. The second point is very important; indeed, only the other day the Secretary of State informed us that he was very doubtful whether we should be able to get materials for even a three million programme. The Council will be interested, however, to know that in view of this difficulty, we have definitely reserved a certain sum in our Budget to enable us to purchase rolling-stock if available in India, and that no indent goes home without a special examination to satisfy us both that the materials are absolutely necessary, and that no part of the manufacture involved can be carried out in this country. Thus, we hope to give a little assistance to Indian industry, and at any rate we avoid interference with the important work of manufacture of munitions at home. On the Revenue side, the position this year is that we now hope to make £2,370,000 more than the Budget estimate, without exceeding the Budget grant of expenditure. This of course is not a result that would normally have been expected. Normally, if railways earned £2,370,000 in additional traffic, they would spend a proportion of that sum—perhaps 25 per cent or £600,000—more in working expenses. The actual result has been secured by the efforts made by railways, which the Railway Department wish to acknowledge, in order to secure the utmost possible economy in working. In the Revenue Budget for next year, we have still to aim at the same great object of contributing the maximum net revenue to the Empire. But here some

[9TH MARCH, 1916.] [*Sir Robert Gillan.*]

special factors come into play. For instance, the price of materials and stores will be very much higher. Then, of course, on the supposition that the war continues throughout the year, we shall have again to carry a large proportion of military and coal traffic, the cost of working which is high in proportion to the receipts. But the main point is that, under the conditions of railway working, restriction of expenditure becomes more difficult the longer it is continued. Thus, to meet an emergency, we may postpone expenditure on maintenance of ways or repairs to engines, but as engines continue to be laid up and the condition of the permanent-way declines, a point comes at which expenditure is absolutely essential or the capacity of the line is affected. This will explain why the percentage of working expenses to receipts, as estimated for next year, is 53.60 against 52.68 in the revised estimates of the current year; and it is interesting to observe that in the last normal year—1913-14—this percentage was 52.13. But of course in considering these figures the special factors I have mentioned have to be taken into account.

"Next as regards congestion. This too is the result of the war, because it has arisen from the great shortage of tonnage. The coal carried by sea from Bombay to Calcutta alone was well over a million tons a year, and all this has been thrown on to the railways in addition to their ordinary traffic. What has to be said on this subject, I think, is, first, that no railways could possibly be expected to be so equipped and organised as to carry, without some dislocation and delay, new traffic of this description, that the Railway Department and Railway administrations have co-operated to improve, where possible, and everywhere to make the fullest possible use of the facilities by all existing routes, that we have not been unsuccessful so far, we have at any rate carried on and hope to continue to do so. But about the prospects of the next busy season I do not know what advice our commercial friends would give us. Is the pressure then going to be more severe than it has been recently? Probably the factors are so indeterminate as to make it very difficult to give an answer to this question.

"Then I come to the manufacture of munitions. This is a new thing for railways, and some people were very doubtful whether we could do it. Well we have done it. And it is not only a railway business. It is a business in which a number of private concerns have co-operated very energetically and successfully. I suppose it would scarcely be proper for me to give out the exact number of shells we are turning out every week, but it is a considerable number and it is increasing from week to week. And it is surely a matter for great congratulation to every one of us that these products of Indian hands, made out of Indian materials—because we rely on the enterprise of Messrs. Tata for our raw materials—are being employed against the common enemy. They are a weighty and a striking proof of the devotion of India to the cause of the Empire.

"Naturally, Sir, the railways of India have had much to do with India's share in the war. They have had, for instance, heavy work in connection with the movements of troops, and they have been very proud to receive the commendations of His Excellency the Commander-in-Chief on the way in which this work has been carried out. They have given a number of their officers for active service. They have not only contributed something in the way of munitions themselves, but they have done what they can to avoid interference with the manufacture of munitions at home.

"I have been asked, is this policy, involving as it does a restriction of expenditure, a sound policy from the railway point of view? But it seems to us that in these days railways cannot afford to have a separate policy of their own. The improvement of their property is a matter of the highest importance, but the first thing to provide for is its security, and the primary object of railways, as of every other interest in the Empire, must be the successful prosecution of the war."

At this stage, the **Hon'ble Sir Reginald Craddock** left the chair, which was taken by the **Hon'ble Sir William Clark**.

[*Sir Reginald Craddock.*] [9TH MARCH, 1916.]

The Hon'ble Sir Reginald Craddock introduced the following heads of the Financial Statement for 1916-17 :—

<i>Revenue.</i>	<i>Expenditure.</i>
Registration. Jails. Police. Medical.	Registration. General Administration. Courts of Law. Jails. Police. Medical.

He said :—“ Sir, the departments with which the Home Department is concerned, are departments which are extremely useful and necessary to the State, but are generally accepted, as they are, without much discussion, and I propose to make only a very few remarks on this occasion. Under ‘ General Administration ’ I should just like to notice that, in spite of the financial difficulties that prevail, the scheme for the revision of ministerial establishments and improvement of their pay in district and other offices in the United Provinces, involving an actual cost of Rs. 6,73,000 a year, was given effect to from April 1st, 1916. It will be very satisfactory to Council, who have by their Questions and Resolutions shown their interest in the pay of the humbler ministerial servants of Government, that this long desired improvement of the prospects of the ministerial employes of the United Provinces was not postponed in spite of the financial difficulties prevailing.

“ Under Police, as I have in previous years remarked, a steady rise in the expenditure has continued and is bound to continue. I do not think that any member of this Council will dispute the expediency of ensuring that the pay of the subordinate police constitutes a living wage. It has constantly been a complaint in the press and among the public generally that the humbler policemen, constables and head-constables, are not given enough to live upon, and you cannot expect that they will always keep their hands clean and do their duty as they ought to if their pay is inadequate. Several schemes have been sent up by the Provinces; some have been sanctioned, and some of them put into force, or will very soon be put into force, for improving the pay of constables and bringing them more into accordance with the increased cost of living. The recommendations of the Police Commission, it is true, brought about certain progress in the pay of these humble servants, but by the time that the recommendations had come into force, the cost of living had already risen to such an extent, that the recommendations themselves did not go as far as had been anticipated. Consequently, in the present and subsequent years, we may expect a small increase, at all events, under this head. I have in previous years taken this opportunity of paying a tribute to the great value that the police services are to this country, and of deprecating any exaggeration of their defects which people are sometimes prone to make, forgetting that the few cases where they fail are brought much more prominently before the public than the vastly more numerous cases in which they render the most faithful and honourable service. During this year the police have been called upon, more especially in the Punjab and in Bengal, to cope with anarchy and increase of crime, and I would like to say on behalf of the Government of India how greatly the Government of India appreciate the way in which the police have responded to the extra call, in those Provinces especially, and generally all over India.

“ Under ‘ Medical ’ a great part of the expenditure falls under the head ‘ Sanitation.’ Perhaps I may be able to persuade my Hon'ble Colleague, the Finance Member, to break up the figures so that I may have some entirely my own to speak about. At present this has not been done, and under this head I only mention that, as in other branches of the public service, important schemes have had to be kept in abeyance, and anticipated progress has not been found possible. One of these schemes is the large Central Lunatic Asylum at Ranchi, the expenditure on which has been curtailed; and in the case of the School of Tropical Medicine in Calcutta, financial stringency

FINANCIAL STATEMENT; RESOLUTION *RE* VERNACULAR 267
MEDICAL TRAINING.

[9TH MARCH, 1916.] [Sir Reginald Craddock; Sir William Meyer;
Dr. M. N. Banerjee.]

has made it necessary to delay the progress of the scheme that we had hoped might have been made by this time.

“ Under ‘ Jails ’ I have only to renew the expression of regret I made last year that the promised Jail Commission remains in abeyance ; but at all events we may hope that the time will not be long before that inquiry will take place, and that on a thorough examination of the jail system many anticipated improvements may be brought into realisation.”

The Hon'ble Sir William Meyer introduced the following heads of the Financial Statement for 1916-17 :—

<i>Revenue.</i>	<i>Expenditure.</i>
Opium.	Refunds.
Interest.	Opium.
Mint.	Stamps.
Receipts in aid of superannuation.	Income-tax.
Exchange.	Interest on obligations other than the
Miscellaneous.	Public Debt.
	Mint.
	Civil Furlough and Absentee allowances.
	Superannuation Allowances and Pensions.
	Exchange.
	Miscellaneous.
	Reduction or Avoidance of debt.

He said.—“ Sir, I need not add anything to what has been said on these matters in my opening speech introducing the Financial Statement and in the Secretary's Explanatory Memorandum.”

**RESOLUTION *RE* VERNACULAR MEDICAL
TRAINING.**

The Hon'ble Dr. M. N. Banerjee :—“ Sir, the question of supplying sufficient men, trained in the western methods of treatment, for the civil and military administration of the country and for supplying the medical needs of the people, has engaged, from time to time, the attention of the Government since the commencement of medical education. As far back as 1839, Hindustani classes were opened in connection with the Calcutta Medical College to train a class of men called the native military assistants for military service. In 1852, Bengalee classes were opened to supply Hospital Assistants for civil administration. In 1873, the number of students in these classes numbering over 800, it was thought desirable to form them into a separate school at Sealdah. Vernacular medical schools of the same standard were also started in other parts of Bengal and in other Provinces. We have now fifteen such medical schools in all India—2 in Bengal, 2 in Bihar and Orissa, 1 in Assam, 3 in Bombay, 3 in Madras, 2 in the Punjab, 1 in the United Provinces and 1 in Burma.

“ The course of study and standard of examination in the other Provinces are more or less the same as in Bengal. The idea underlying the constitution of these schools was briefly a lower preliminary education, a shorter course and a lower standard examination, the higher standard being reserved for the five Medical Colleges at Calcutta, Bombay, Madras, Lahore and Lucknow.

“ But though the theory of a lower standard for obtaining the maximum number of trained medical men has been accepted and acted on by Government for such a long time, it has not been properly developed, as the object aimed at is often lost sight of. The students in the schools are not trained for the special purposes for which they are required, but are made to go over nearly the whole course of medicine as in the colleges, and to waste a great portion of their time and energy in acquiring such knowledge and doing such work

[*Dr. M. N. Banerjee.*] [9TH MARCH, 1916.]

which can be of no use to them in after-life. The result is they are fitted neither for the higher nor for the lower standard of medical practice.

" Sir, in 1878, a Committee was appointed by the Bengal Government for the purpose of reporting on medical institutions and medical expenditure generally. The members of the Committee were J. O'Kinealy, C. Macaulay, A. G. Payne, J. Jones, S. O. Maekensie, A. S. Lethbridge, R. Harvey. The following extracts from their report will illustrate my point :—

' In the opinion of the Committee, it is distinctly proved that, in spite of the elaborate education offered, they fail to become practitioners, and are by no means always useful assistants.'

' The teachers at Sealdah are able men, especially selected for the post. Why then is the result so unsatisfactory? The Committee would answer, because it aims too high, is too theoretical and too little practical for the class of men who have to be taught. The men leave the school with a minute book-knowledge of anatomical details, which they will not apply in practice and which are soon forgotten, but who cannot extract a tooth or set a fracture; men who will glibly run off pages of description of diseases of the heart and attempt to diagnose them by placing a stethoscope on the right nipple, who will pass an examination in Chemistry, but cannot test a specimen of urine, etc., etc.'

' Several medical officers consulted by the Committee deprecate any lowering of the standard of education. There seems to be some confusion of ideas, however, between the standard aimed at and that actually realized or realizable. The former is a complete medical education; the latter is probably the lowest achieved by any medical school. The object of medical education is to train men to battle with disease; but this great end is often in danger of being overlooked in a misapprehension of the means to gain it. We turn out pretended chemists and anatomists instead of doctors, and a student's time is so taken up with the encyclopedic details of the many subjects in which he has to satisfy his examiners, that he has nothing left for that practical work by which alone he can learn to apply his theoretical knowledge to the relief of disease, etc., etc.'

' The Committee believe that under a more practical system of education the realisable standard may be very greatly raised without increasing the length of the curriculum from 3 years to 4 as has been proposed, etc., etc.'

' The experience of the medical members of the committee lead them to the belief that Hospital Assistants educated at schools at Agra, Nagpur and Lahore, are as a rule much better qualified than those educated at Sealdah, although none of these schools have so large a teaching staff or is so well supplied with appliances for teaching as in the Sealdah School.'

' It cannot be too frequently repeated that the object of the school is to train Hospital Assistants and humble village practitioners who are expected to be satisfied with incomes ranging from Rs. 10 to Rs. 60 a month.'

" Sir, nothing could have made clearer the intention of the Government or the object to be aimed at. And no words of mine can put more strongly the reasons for the present Resolution, the concluding paragraph being its very essence.

" But in spite of the intention of the Government, and in spite of the clear definition of the aim given by the Committee, the vernacular schools, impelled by the force of advancing western medical science and by a natural desire to improve themselves, have continued to raise their standards and have come to a point when they can scarcely be called vernacular schools. The local Acts of Medical Registration have completed the transformation. Lectures were already being given in English. The examining bodies appointed by the Acts have now ruled that the examinations also are to be conducted in English, and have raised the preliminary qualification to Matriculation. These rules about lectures and examinations have already affected the private institutions which have come into existence during the last quarter of a century to supply the demand for more medical education, and which followed the same standard as the old vernacular school. One of them has ceased to exist, and another is, I understand, going to wind up in April next. The inevitable result of all this will be to reduce still further the number of trained men, which has never been great for the purposes of ordinary practice. In Bengal, in spite of its facilities for medical education, for it had the largest number of medical institutions (including the four private), the number of men with registrable qualifications is under 3,000. Is it not appallingly small for a population of 50 millions, in comparison with 30,000 qualified men for a population of 30 millions in England? It seems strange that with so few qualified

[9TH MARCH, 1916.] [Dr. M. N. Banerjee.]

men for the medical register, the passed students of the private medical institutions should be excluded from it. I venture to think it was neither wise nor just. It was not wise, as their inclusion would have more than doubled the number of registrable medical men, and it was not just as, when the Medical Acts passed in England, all those who were practising before the enactment were included in the register.

"So while the standard of medical education is being raised and the practising medical men are being weeded out, the dumb millions are entirely forgotten and allowed to die without medical treatment or left at the mercy of the quacks. It may be said that there are the *Kavirajes*, *Hakims* and practitioners of other methods. But times are changed and the majority of the population are for the western method of treatment, being impressed with its efficiency.

"What is the remedy? Sir, I humbly suggest that the only remedy lies in going back, if possible, to the old standard for medical schools, or, if that is not possible, to start new institutions with the humbler aim of training humble village practitioners. These institutions should have the same distinguishing features, *viz.*, a lower preliminary qualification, medium of instruction chiefly vernacular, and a short course. The first and second will be the same as for the old Hospital Assistants. But as regards the third, a thorough revision of the course of study is necessary.

"This is not a place for going into details. But the main principle is this. The students should have a thorough practical training which will make them efficient country practitioners. They must not waste their time in learning the details of such subjects as Chemistry, Botany, Anatomy, Physiology and Pathology. They should have a general knowledge of medicine, surgery and midwifery, and a thorough practical knowledge of diseases they will have to treat. Their hospital practice should be mainly at the out-door, as there they will find most of these cases. A hospital consisting of 25 to 50 beds, admitting those cases only with which they are concerned will be good enough for their in-door practice. Cases of unusual occurrence, or those requiring great surgical skill, such as appendicitis, hernia, cataract, ovarium tumours, etc., are out of place in such hospitals.

"These institutions are expected to turn out men who can set a fracture or reduce a dislocation, or do some minor surgery, men who can cure or give relief in diseases which prevail in this country, such as cholera, dysentery, bronchitis, pneumonia, tuberculosis, malaria, kala-azar, enteric and fevers.

"The modern methods for the treatment of some of these diseases are striking in their effects. Sir, I have seen cholera patients snatched away from the very jaws of death by intravenous saline injections. Antitoxin has taken away the horrors of diphtheria. Ayurvedic medicines have given way to injection of emetin in dysentery. Diabetic gangrene which was, in the early days of my practice, considered as universally fatal, has yielded to Staphylococcus vaccine. The effects of Salvarsan are a marvel. For kala-azar, which is as much a curse in this country as malaria, we have at last found a cure in the intravenous injection of antimony.

"Will our benign Government deny the benefit of all these modern methods of treatment to the dumb millions by not supplying men who can make use of them? Thousands can be saved if these men are supplied. The lives of the people are a valuable asset to the State. Will not the State be richer by rendering these treatments accessible to the people?

"The question then is not as to the necessity of institutions which will supply such men, but as to how far it is within the range of private politics. I have already said, and it has been admitted by the Bengal Committee mentioned above, that elaborate equipments and hospital arrangements are not necessary for them. With our very moderate equipments at Belgatchia, we have passed out from our vernacular classes a number of capable men who, though outside the Register, have been useful as country practitioners and as medical

[Dr. M. N. Banerjee.] [9TH MARCH, 1916.]

assistants in the service of Government and of the various industries, such as tea, jute, mining and shipping. Our house physicians, selected from the same class, are quite competent to give intravenous injections or use other modern methods and appliances, and are entrusted with those duties at our hospital. I, therefore, feel confident that a school with moderate equipments and with a hospital of 25 beds and an out-door department attached to it, will serve the purpose. It will not be very costly, and when a few model schools of this description are started by Government, and the main difficulty of the medical institutions, the maintenance of a large hospital, is removed, private enterprise will follow the example, and, as it has done in the Arts and Sciences, numbers of private institutions will spring up to supplement the work of Government and supply the country with the much-needed medical help on a large scale.

"When these institutions come into existence, the question of examination will come up for consideration. A lower standard examination may be instituted either by the examining bodies now existing, or by any examining boards specially appointed for the purpose. The passed students need not have degrees or diplomas, they may be called medical assistants, native doctors, or by any other name. But one thing is certain. They must be recognised by the Government as qualified practitioners, or the scheme is bound to fail.

"I have read with interest a scheme proposed by the Mysore Government which is apposite to the point I am discussing. With your permission, Sir, I will read a few extracts from the statement of the Financial Secretary:—

'The facts of the case are simple. Thousands of men in the rural parts of the State die every year for want of medical treatment even of the simplest kind. The country is poor. We cannot maintain highly qualified medical men in every *hobli*. Under these circumstances, should we adhere with fatal pride to a high ideal of professional efficiency and leave the rural population to suffer and to die with no medical help? The problem stares us in the face and cries out for solution, etc., etc.'

'The Sub-Assistant Surgeon, as he is now trained, is useless for the object we have in view, viz., the provision of village doctors. He is much above it.'

'We must revert to something like the native doctors of the old times. We must have a lot of men who, while able to render useful medical help, will be satisfied to live as villagers among villagers on a modest income, etc., etc.'

'I think if we get hold of students who have read up to the lower secondary standard, and train them in a special institution for a period of two years, we may have the desired type of men.'

'Lieutenant-Colonel F. H. Foulkes, I.M.S., who has been consulted about this proposal, writes—I have been thinking of your scheme, and I like it the more I think of it. At first sight it does not seem sound, but it grows.'

"From this paper I also learn that a class of persons very much like the village doctor, and discharging the same functions, and called Practicantes exists in Spain. After an entrance examination they have a course of medical study for two years, at the end of which there is an examination for the diploma. If such a system is found necessary and useful in Spain, how much more necessary is it for India which is a much poorer country?

"These are facts which strengthen my case. I have taken pains to ascertain the views, in my Province, of the unofficial medical profession and of representative men outside the profession, and I can assure the Council that my Resolution has the hearty approval of all I consulted.

"In conclusion, may I be permitted to suggest, though the suggestion is not covered by the terms of my Resolution, that, if the Government takes a favourable view of my Resolution, they may advise the Local Administrations to appoint Committees consisting not only of medical experts but others who are not experts who will leaven expert knowledge with larger considerations and a wider knowledge of human affairs. Expert knowledge, in association with close grasp of actual needs and free from prejudices which technical knowledge is apt to engender, will, I hope, provide a solution of this difficult problem which will satisfy the needs of the country and the demands of public opinion.

[9TH MARCH, 1916.] [Dr. M. N. Banerjee; Sir Pardey Lukis.]

"With these words, Sir, I beg to move the Resolution which stands in my name, namely :—

'That this Council recommends to the Governor General in Council that Local Governments be asked to consider the advisability of establishing institutions for the purpose of giving medical students a special course of training conducted in the vernaculars so as to qualify them for ordinary medical practice in rural areas, and of encouraging and assisting deserving private enterprise to provide such medical education.'

The Hon'ble Sir Pardey Lukis:—"Sir, I have listened with much interest to the able speech of the Hon'ble Dr. Banerjee—a speech which raises a most important question in connection with the general medical education of Indian students, and one which must be regarded from an Imperial standpoint and not merely from a Provincial standpoint. As my Hon'ble friend has pointed out formerly, in the Government medical schools all over India, Sub-Assistant Surgeons (or Hospital Assistants, as they were then called) received their instruction in the vernacular of the province concerned, and it is only within the last few years that English has been adopted as the teaching medium. This change to the English language was necessitated by the paucity of vernacular works on scientific and medical subjects. I understand, however, that this dearth of suitable text-books is not as important a factor now-a-days as it was a few years ago, and I have it on the authority of the Editor of the 'Calcutta Medical Journal' that at any rate, so far as Bengal is concerned, several vernacular works now exist which are suitable for the lower standards of medical education. I am informed, moreover, that especially in Bengal there is a steady and increasing demand for medical men of a somewhat lower standard than that of the Sub-Assistant Surgeon, and it has been suggested that new medical schools should be started for imparting medical education in the vernacular, the object being to secure for the rural areas a class of practitioner corresponding very closely to the old type of Native Doctor, which has now practically disappeared. In support of this demand it is urged that the income obtainable from private practice in a village is not sufficient to attract either an Assistant Surgeon or Sub-Assistant Surgeon or at any rate not a highly trained one, but that it would probably prove sufficiently attractive to a passed student of a vernacular medical school who would be content to settle down there for the whole of his professional life.

"This is, I take it, the demand which the Hon'ble Dr. Banerjee has in view in proposing the Resolution now before the Council. If so, I am glad to be able to say that he has my most cordial support, even though I could not agree to the lowering of the standard of existing medical institutions. In giving this support, however, I should like to lay down three conditions which, personally, I consider essential to the success of the scheme. In the first place, it must be clearly understood that these vernacular schools should be entirely separate institutions. There must be no attempt to graft vernacular education upon any English teaching school which either is, or is about to be, affiliated to a recognised Indian University, or to a State Medical Faculty, or to any other duly authorised examining body, such as the College of Physicians and Surgeons of Bombay. One reason for this reservation is obvious. Any educationalist of experience will, I think, agree with me that there are grave objections to any attempt to combine in one and the same institution two grades of instruction, the objects and the medium of which are entirely different. But there is another reason which may possibly not occur to laymen and which is peculiar to medical schools, and does not affect the ordinary lay teaching institution. As Hon'ble Members are aware, every medical school has its attached hospital, the wards of which are filled by patients of the poorer class who, in return for gratuitous treatment, allow themselves to be regarded as teaching material, and who have to submit to examination by the students, to enable the latter to obtain practical skill in diagnosis. There is, however, a limit to physical endurance, and, in the interests of the sick and suffering, it is impossible to allow more than a limited number of students to examine a given patient. I ask Hon'ble Members to consider, for instance, what would be the condition of a patient suffering, let us say, from heart-disease, after his chest had been auscultated and percussed, first by the University

[*Sir Pardey Lukis*; *Sir Reginald Craddock*; *Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee*.] [9TH MARCH, 1916.]

students; then by those going up for the membership or License of the State Medical Faculty; and finally, by the vernacular class. One feels inclined to add—last of all the man died also. Now, this is to my mind the strongest reason why these vernacular schools should not be grafted upon any of the existing institutions. The next condition I should like to lay down is, that these vernacularly trained village practitioners should only be allowed to practise in rural areas. They are not wanted in the large towns from which I constantly receive complaints that there are already far too many practitioners, and that the income of these gentlemen is diminishing every day as a result of competition by retired compounders and men of that class. The advent, then, in the large towns, of yet another competitor in the shape of the village practitioner would not be welcomed by the members of the independent medical profession. My third and last condition would be, that Government, whilst encouraging and assisting deserving private enterprises, should insist on some form of outside control and inspection so as to ensure strict adherence to whatever standard might ultimately be decided on. This is, I consider, essential in the interests of the public, for it must be remembered that, even as regards the proposed class of village practitioner, there is, as I pointed out in Council the other day, a limit below which it is not safe to go without incurring the risk of bringing into discredit the western system of medicine. With the reservations, however, which I have mentioned, and on the distinct understanding that this new class of medical man will be introduced for a definite object, and with a limited sphere of action, I consider that he will serve a useful purpose, and for that reason, it gives me great pleasure to support the Resolution which, I trust, the Government of India will be able to accept."

The Hon'ble Sir Reginald Craddock:—"Sir, the Resolution of the Hon'ble Dr. Banerjee has been worded in general terms, and we are therefore able to accept that Resolution, and as the Hon'ble Surgeon General Lukis has stated, there are many reasons why we should feel sympathy with the objects which Dr. Banerjee has in view. I think most of us remember men of the hospital assistant class, as they were called, who had been trained in a vernacular school and who had no knowledge of English, and I know that some at least of these men, had obtained the confidence of the public, were very well regarded by their Civil Surgeons, and certainly made considerable private practice. We have not had time in the interval, since Dr. Banerjee proposed his Resolution, to look up the whole history of the subject and to find out exactly why, in the several Provinces, vernacular instruction has dropped, and whether there were at that time reasons other than financial for not continuing schools of this type.

"This history we shall now be very glad to investigate, and in the meantime we are perfectly ready to ask the Local Governments to consider the advisability of establishing such institutions for the purposes mentioned, and of encouraging and assisting deserving private enterprise to provide such medical education, if full and complete examination of the subject shows that that course is both desirable and feasible. We, of course, cannot commit ourselves further than this. The Hon'ble Surgeon General Sir Pardey Lukis has mentioned certain reservations which would limit any practical recommendations to which he would be prepared to subscribe, and it is possible that the Local Governments may find other reasons or other reservations that they would like to make on this subject. But we are perfectly willing to address Local Governments in this sense, and to do anything that we can in order to see that the subject is thoroughly examined and is not summarily rejected by those consulted.

"I have much pleasure, therefore, on behalf of the Government, in accepting this Resolution of Dr. Banerjee."

The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerji:—"Sir, I just want to say a word or two with reference to this Resolution. I beg to support the Resolution, which is in accordance with Bengal public opinion, as my friend the

[9TH MARCH, 1916.] [Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee; Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya.]

Mover has observed, and as I have been able to ascertain in consultation with medical friends. The need of medical practitioners of the kind who will be *alumni* of these schools is obvious. The other day the Magistrate of Bankura reported that in his district 30,000 people died without medical aid of any kind whatsoever. That is an official statement made by a district officer upon his own responsibility and after inquiring into the facts of the case. In the same district we have another telling fact. The doctor was ill—I think he was in charge of a sub-divisional dispensary—and he could not get any medical aid at all. It was a case of 'physician heal thyself.' That being the state of things, it is obvious that a Resolution of this kind, if accepted by Government and given effect to, will do a great deal of good.

"But, Sir, I have a word or two of comment with regard to the reservations and the qualifications which have been suggested by the Hon'ble the Surgeon-General. With reference to one of these qualifications I find myself in complete disagreement with him. He says that the graduates of these colleges—call them graduates or call them *alumni*, as you please, it does not matter—ought to be debarred from practising in the towns. I do not think, Sir, that any disqualification of that kind ought to be imposed upon them. It is a case of the survival of the fittest. Some of these doctors may turn out to be eminent medical practitioners, gifted with a genius for diagnosis, born physicians or born surgeons who might be able to do a lot of good. And why should you exclude them from practising in the towns? Why should you deprive the urban population of the benefits of their skill, whatever that may be?"

"It seems to me that that is a disqualification, a reservation, which cannot commend itself to public opinion, and I for one am not in favour of it. There ought to be no disqualification of that kind. Let the public make their choice. If they want one of these rural doctors, why should they not be allowed to avail themselves of his services? I do hope that that disqualification will not be insisted on, and that it will be withdrawn after mature consideration."

"Subject to these comments, and having in view that the public opinion of the Province which I have the honour to represent in this Council is entirely in favour of this Resolution, I beg to accord my cordial support to it."

The Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya:—"Sir, I beg to support this Resolution. It has not been brought a day too soon before Government for consideration. The want of sufficient medical assistance has been a matter which has again and again been brought to the notice of Government; even in moving this Resolution the Hon'ble Doctor Banerjee has pointed out how small is the number of medical men qualified to render assistance to people who need it. I hope, however, that the proposal before us will not be regarded as any excuse or as any reason for not endeavouring to multiply the number of medical men of the higher type who ought to be available to the country. The need for such medical men is great, and the number of medical institutions which exist in the country for turning out men of University qualifications in medicine is small. The restrictions that have been imposed, and are being imposed, are regarded as creating difficulties in the way of people obtaining even the medical assistance which is available to them at present. But apart from that, I think that there is room and great room for a step in the direction which has been recommended. Such a step ought to have been adopted long ago, but it is a matter of thankfulness that the Government is now going to recommend it to the consideration of the Local Governments. The vernacular ought to be the medium of instruction for every subject, except a language, and in no subject could this medium be more usefully employed than in giving instruction in medicine. I agree that this matter ought to be taken up by Local Governments, and I hope that when it is, all the questions which have been raised here, and others which may suggest themselves, will be carefully gone into before a scheme is devised."

"One thing I wish to add. I join with my friend the Hon'ble Babu Surendra Nath Banerji in the view that the reservations as to the area in

[*Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya ; The Vice-President ; Mr. Vijiaraĝhavachariar.*] [9TH MARCH, 1916.]

which such practitioners should practise ought to be removed. Apart from every other consideration, such a reservation will most certainly defeat the object which the scheme has in view. Once announce that students who have been trained in the proposed institutions shall not be permitted to practise their profession except in rural areas, and you will shut out a number of students who would otherwise be willing to join them. This is an aspect to which full consideration should be given. I hope that when the matter comes before the Provincial Governments and Committees are appointed, as has been suggested, they will go thoroughly into the question.

"There is one other point to which I should like to invite attention for a moment, and that is the great need, the insistent need, for the Government to recognise, even at this day, the justice of providing means for imparting instruction in the indigenous systems of medicine. The Mover of the Resolution has said a great deal in regard to the need for promoting instruction in western medical science. I do not yield to anybody in my admiration for the triumphs which that science, and particularly modern surgery, have made. I feel thankful, as much as any other member, to those who have brought about those results for the amelioration of human suffering. But I know how vast is the service, how immeasurable is the service, which the indigenous systems of medicine have rendered to mankind in this ancient land and this extensive Empire. Even to-day these systems attract and serve a much larger number of the population than the western system of medicine, and I think it is only right that the Government should consider whether it ought not to help and encourage these systems."

The Hon'ble the Vice-President:—"Order, Order. I must ask the Hon'ble Member to keep strictly to the Resolution. This does not arise on the present Resolution, which deals with the ordinary system of medicine and not with the indigenous systems."

The Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya:—"I bow to your ruling, Sir. I will take another opportunity to say what I wish on this point. I hope that the need for supplying the country with men trained in the medical systems which are best suited to serve the people of this country, will be much more carefully looked into and much better provided for than it has been in the past."

The Hon'ble Mr. Vijiaraĝhavachariar:—"I have only one word to say, Sir. I do not quite understand the Resolution nor its scope. I do not very well understand the nature of support given to it by the Hon'ble the Surgeon General Sir Pardey Lukis, and the Hon'ble the Home Member on behalf of the Government.

"I view this Resolution altogether with suspicion. It is a sorry device invented by those who want to support the Bogus Medical Degrees Bill. I said so at the time when it was mentioned to me. I am not a believer in 'born surgeons'. We occasionally hear of a born poet or a born singer, but not of a born architect or a born surgeon. I am one of those who believe that in the matter of medicine, the saying—'Drink deep or taste not the Pierian spring'—applies. The Hon'ble Mr. Surendra Nath Banerjee told us that a large number of people at Bankura died for want of medical aid; but he has not told us whether medical aid, such as is contemplated by this Resolution, would add to the mortality or diminish it. What is the good of a Resolution like this? It is better to leave things to nature, to pure water and pure air and even to grandmother's cures than to trust to medical men of this kind, ill-equipped, ill-taught—taught in a language in which they could not exactly understand the words translated. May I know the words in general vernaculars for oxygen, or hydrogen? May I know what the word for kidney is? What are the exact words for white corpuscles and coloured corpuscles of blood, and what are the particular vernacular words for the various glands? What is the good of putting forward a Resolution without first realising the

[9TH MARCH, 1916.] [*Mr. Vijayaraghavachariar*; *Rai Ghanasyam Barua Bahadur*; *Mr. Madhu Sudan Das.*]

consequences of that Resolution? I believe that vernacular education in western medical science would be a huge farce—a very huge farce. What is here contemplated is, if we can, to catch hold of some poor students and to give those students a travesty of lessons in western medicine and western surgery. A far better position would be to catch hold of institutions for Unani and Ayurvedic systems of medicine, and there to impart in English language, instruction in Physiology and Anatomy and Chemistry. Where there is such real education, with some substantial knowledge of Physiology and Chemistry, the students would know where and how to look for more knowledge. Ayurvedic and Unani students might then be so equipped with the necessary elementary knowledge—elementary but accurate knowledge so far as it goes—in western science as probably to be able to dress the wounds of a man fairly well. And therefore I am obliged to say frankly and freely that I suspect this Resolution, I am bound to oppose it and I oppose it.”

The Hon'ble Rai Ghanasyam Barua Bahadur :—“Sir, the Resolution has already been accepted by the Hon'ble Surgeon General Sir Pardey Lukis and the Government, and there is no need of speaking any more in support of it. I have no doubt there is great force in the reasons advanced by the Hon'ble Dr. Banerjee that such a class of medical practitioners will be useful, and that there is room for them. I am sorry I do not quite follow the Hon'ble Mr. Vijayaraghavachariar in the objections he has put forward. Even if such a class of practitioners happen to kill men, they will certainly kill less than the ordinary run of untrained quacks, and I think they will be very good auxiliaries to the higher classes of practitioners. I have risen simply to associate myself with my friend the Hon'ble Mr. Surendranath Banerjee in the protest he has made against the third condition laid down by the Hon'ble Member who replied to the Resolution. I would point out that, in addition to the reasons which have been given by the Hon'ble Mr. Banerjee, there is another strong reason why that condition should not stand. What are the poor of the towns going to do? These practitioners are meant for the poor. The bigger practitioners in the towns of course cannot be approached by these poor people, and it cannot be that all these poor people will be able to get the necessary aid from the hospitals. Some of them will require medical aid in their homes, and if they are to get it, we must let these practitioners practise in towns too. There is not much reason for the apprehension that the superior classes of practitioners will be injuriously affected by them; if any body is capable of interfering with them, it will only be by virtue of superior natural talent. In many cases I think they will rather be very useful assistants to the better qualified grades of the profession. I, therefore, say that there is very strong force in the reasons put forward by the Hon'ble Mr. Surendranath Banerjee against the third condition proposed by the Hon'ble Sir Pardey Lukis, and I hope he will be pleased to omit it. With these remarks, I support the Resolution.”

The Hon'ble Mr. Madhu Sudan Das :—“Sir, I did not expect that there would be any opposition to a Resolution of this kind. This is a Resolution which aims at ameliorating the condition of suffering humanity of the poorer class. Objection has been made on the ground that these men would not have sufficient scientific education, and by way of illustration reference was made to certain organs of the human body, and it was said that vernacular students would not be familiar with the English names for these things. Does the quack who administers medicine which he has learnt from his grandmother understand what is the meaning of the word 'kidney'; does he know the location of the kidney in the human body? Perhaps he would look for it in the head. These are the people who are now entrusted with the precious lives of millions who constitute the backbone of the nation. The Hon'ble Sir Pardey Lukis, with his experience of the country and with his sympathetic attitude towards Indians, has supported this Resolution. The poor people under this

[*Sir. Madhu Sudan Das; Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya; The Vice-President; Dr. M. N. Banerjee.*] [9TH MARCH, 1916.]

arrangement would have doctors whose services would be available to them within their means. The object of this Resolution is not to increase mortality in the villages, but to improve public health, and it is because I believe in that object, that I support this Resolution.

"There is one point, however, Sir, that I do not understand. It may be that sitting here as I do at a distance I could not follow the speeches. In the matter of speeches, distance does not lend enchantment, as the poet says. The Hon'ble Mover said—and I understood the Hon'ble Mr. Banerjee said—that so far as Bengal was concerned, books were available; but there are other parts of India where books in the vernacular are not available."

The Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya:—"Are you sure?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Madhu Sudan Das:—"I said 'other parts'?"

The Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malaviya:—"Are you sure of the other parts?"

The Hon'ble Mr. Madhu Sudan Das:—"Other parts' does not mean the part you know."

The Hon'ble the Vice-President:—"Order, order."

The Hon'ble Mr. Madhu Sudan Das:—"Well in that case, I suppose when the Resolution is accepted, I hope it is the intention of Government that every effort shall be made to introduce books,—to invite men to write books in the vernacular. The Government have to do something in that direction if this Resolution is to have any practical effect. One thing I should like to say, and that is, that it is not impossible to teach in the vernacular, because I have come across lady students in the Cuttack Middle School—which teaches up to the standard of Sub-Assistant Surgeon—who do not know a word of English, but who have passed successfully and are doing useful work. Of course we have to import into the vernacular certain English terms. With these remarks, I beg to give my most hearty support to the Resolution."

The Hon'ble Dr. M. N. Banerjee:—"Sir, I am pleased to find that Hon'ble Members have all spoken in support of my Resolution, with the exception of one, Mr. Achariar. With regard to what Mr. Achariar has said, I should like to say one or two words. I think it is rather late in the day to question whether medicine can be taught in the vernacular, because it is an actual fact that, in Bengal at least, it was being taught for over half a century. As I said in my speech, in 1852, vernacular classes were started in the Calcutta Medical College. And until 4 or 5 years ago medicine was being taught in the vernacular languages, and the students who passed out of those vernacular schools were the hospital assistants who have been very serviceable not only to Government, but also to the people at large. They were the regular doctors in rural areas and in villages. So that we have not to go on theories, but on what is an established fact. As regards the medical literature, I can say this, that an application was made to the Government of Bengal by the 'Bangiya Sahitya Parishad' praying that teaching of medicine in vernaculars be not done away with. It was about a year ago, and the Government sent this for consideration to the State Medical Faculty of which I am a member. I took with me medical books in Bengali in all the subjects and showed them to the members of the Faculty. The books were good, and the illustrations in some of them were exceptionally good and attracted the attention of the members. One member thought that the only disqualification was, that the illustrations were from German plates. The question was

[9TH MARCH, 1916.] [*Dr. M. N. Banerjee.*]

discussed and the outcome of the discussion was that Dr. S. P. Sarbadhikari and myself, who were for reverting to vernacular teaching in the schools, were outvoted by the majority of officials, but not on the ground that there are no books in the vernacular.

"Then as regards Mr. Achariar's statement that the passed students of the lower standard schools would add to the mortality, I can assure him that they would reduce the mortality by nearly 50 per cent., from my experience of the students of the vernacular schools elsewhere and at the institution at which I have been teaching for the last 25 years, I can tell him that even if they do not reduce it by 50 per cent., they would reduce it materially. I will remind Mr. Achariar of a proverb which we have in Bengal that 'a blind uncle is better than no uncle.' One would like to have, when ill, a doctor who, though not highly qualified, will serve his purpose than to have no doctor at all.

"I am very grateful to Sir Pardey Lukis for having accepted my Resolution with certain reservations. As regards the reservation about the lowering of the standard in existing institutions, I think he is right, because it appears that there is need for all those institutions, which have assumed a higher standard of education. As regards control and inspection by Government, of course that is quite essential. Otherwise, there will be one standard for one school and another for another school, as we have at present in the existing private institutions, and there will be great confusion. The standard of medical education of the proposed institutions should be uniform, and Government ought to be responsible for maintaining that standard. But as regards the condition which he imposes that those passed students should not be allowed to practise in urban areas, I think it is undesirable and very difficult of application. For, when the law allows any quack to practise in towns, why should a trained man be disallowed by law from practising in town areas. I think it will go against the success of the whole scheme. I hope Sir Pardey Lukis will reconsider the matter. As for the other restrictions I accept them without any reservation; and I express my thanks to Government for having accepted this Resolution."

The Resolution was put and accepted.

The Council adjourned to Wednesday, the 15th March, 1916.

A. P. MUDDIMAN,

*Secretary to the Government of India,
Legislative Department.*

DELHI :

The 17th March, 1916.

APPENDIX A.

(Referred to in Answer to Question 1.)

Statement showing the number of elected members as compared with the total number in the Municipalities and the District Boards of the different Provinces of India from 1910-11 to 1914-15.

Province.	Year.	NUMBER OF MEMBERS.			
		MUNICIPALITIES.		DISTRICT BOARDS.	
		Elected.	Total.	Elected.	Total.
Madras	1910-11	466	940	314	696
	1911-12	449	896	359	765
	1912-13	490	947	356	770
	1913-14	492	961	364	772
	1914-15	504	980	362	779
Bombay	1910-11	897	2,133	248	544
	1911-12	913	2,130	242	544
	1912-13	949	2,151	243	546
	1913-14	963	2,166	246	554
	1914-15	(a)
Bengal	1910-11	887	1,506	207	509
	1911-12	861	1,513	210	509
	1912-13	880	1,523	211	509
	1913-14	887	1,526	209	509
	1914-15	886	1,526	213	513
United Provinces	1910-11	898	1,175	617	892
	1911-12	900	1,165	619	893
	1912-13	900	1,196	613	895
	1913-14	877	1,181	624	897
	1914-15	855	1,147	630	929
Panjab	1910-11	573	1,320	364	1,123
	1911-12	566	1,224	392	1,117
	1912-13	541	1,162	383	1,101
	1913-14	543	1,179	387	1,124
	1914-15	549	1,174	349	1,114
Burma (b)	1910-11	85	571
	1911-12	96	570
	1912-13	97	570
	1913-14	97	560
	1914-15	99	561

(a) Figures not yet available.

(b) There are no District or Local Boards in Burma.

Statement showing the number of elected members as compared with the total number in the Municipalities and the District Boards of the different Provinces of India from 1910-11 to 1914-15.

Province.	Year.	NUMBER OF MEMBERS.			
		MUNICIPALITIES.		DISTRICT BOARDS.	
		Elected.	Total.	Elected.	Total.
Bihar and Orissa	1910-11	362	771	149	388
	1911-12	408	776	149	391
	1912-13	435	798	147	390
	1913-14	469	772	147	390
	1914-15	471	775	151	390
Central Provinces and Berar	1910-11	478	758	371	509
	1911-12	480	758	377	517
	1912-13	451	759	377	517
	1913-14	433	762	379	520
	1914-15	463	764	381	521
Assam	1910-11	56	167	177	316
	1911-12	56	167	176	316
	1912-13	60	167	180	316
	1913-14	62	197	184	318
	1914-15	68	211	184	318
North-West Frontier Province	1910-11	...	180		218
	1911-12	...	118		218
	1912-13	...	118		218
	1913-14	...	119		219
	1914-15	...	119		219
Coorg	1910-11	7	53	2	18
	1911-12	9	51	2	18
	1912-13	9	50	2	19
	1913-14	8	50	2	19
	1914	8	55	2	19

APPENDIX B.

(Referred to in Answer to Question 4.)

Memorandum of measures taken by the Railway Board since 1905 to promote the comfort and convenience of Intermediate and 3rd class passengers.

Immediately after assuming charge of their office in 1905 the Railway Board issued a special letter to all the principal railway administrations calling their attention to the desirability of making early provision in respect of the following matters :—

- (a) Facilities for passengers to obtain their tickets a longer time before the departure of the trains by which they intend to travel.
- (b) Facilities for examining the tickets of 3rd class passengers, both at terminal and roadside stations, to enable them to have ready access to the proper platforms and take their seats without the crush which is liable to occur.
- (c) Adequate sitting accommodation for 3rd class passengers in carriages so as to prevent the overcrowding of trains.

The Consulting Engineers were asked to watch the progress made by railways under their control in regard to the provision of the several facilities, and the reports received indicated that a great deal had been done to give effect to the wishes of the Railway Board.

Section 62 of the Railways Act gives Government power to require any railway administration to provide and maintain in proper order, in any train worked by it which carries passengers, such sufficient means of communication between passengers, and the railway servants in charge of the train as they approve. Special action was taken by the Railway Board in 1906 to ensure that wherever practicable such means of communication should be provided. Appendix 20 of the Administration Report for the year 1914-15 shows for each of the more important systems the number of mail, passenger and mixed trains which had been so fitted up to the 31st March 1915 and the total number of trains run. Instructions have also been issued by the Railway Board for the fixing of a notice in each carriage indicating the method of using the means of intercommunication provided.

The Railway Board have issued orders directing that boards should be attached to the outside of each compartment reserved for women indicating, in English and the vernacular of the districts in which the carriage is run, that these compartments are for women only. A suggestion has recently been made that a figure of a woman painted on the doors of carriages reserved for women would prove of advantage as an indication to illiterate women of the carriages which have been specially reserved for them. Experiments are at present being made on the North Western Railway to ascertain whether this method of distinguishing women's reserved compartments will serve a useful purpose.

Another matter which has engaged the attention of the Railway Board is the improvement of the supply of refreshments for Indian passengers. Special enquiries were undertaken by the Board to ascertain the nature and efficiency of the arrangements made by various railways for the inspection of licensed refreshment vendors. The practice of railway administrations is not uniform, but in each case means have been adopted for inspecting the wares offered for sale by these vendors, and for ensuring, so far as possible, that they shall be clean and wholesome.

Some years ago the Madras and Southern Mahratta Railway Company introduced special cars fitted with conveniences for the sale of refreshments for Indian passengers and accommodation for washing before taking food in accordance with caste requirements. These carriages are run on all important mail and passenger trains on the system. The Railway Board brought this to the notice of all the principal railway administrations, supplying them with

a note showing in detail the arrangements made by the Madras and Southern Mahratta Railway. As a result, several of the more important administrations have experimented with the running of dining cars for Indian passengers. The experiment, owing it is understood to the caste prejudice of passengers, has proved a failure on the East Indian, Bengal Nagpur, and Eastern Bengal Railways. In the Punjab, on the other hand, it has proved eminently successful, and the North Western Railway propose to build a number of refreshment cars for Indian passengers. At present the Railway Board are in communication with railway administrations regarding the further improvement of the arrangements made for supplying refreshments to Hindu and Mahomedan passengers.

In 1909 the Railway Board, as an experimental measure, authorised the appointment on the North Western and Oudh and Rohilkhand Railways of a number of officials of a new class designated "Passenger Superintendents." These officers were recruited from among retired Indian officers of the Indian Army. They were given a distinctive uniform and placed under the charge of a special officer of the Traffic Department. Their duties were—

- (i) to attend to the complaints of the humbler class of passengers and to assist them to find room in trains by directing them to carriages where accommodation was available;
- (ii) to supervise the supply of refreshments by platform vendors, and generally to do what is in their power to secure the greater comfort and convenience of passengers at railway stations.

The experiments having proved successful, the appointment of these Passenger Superintendents has become permanent on the railways on which they were first introduced and similar appointments have been created on several other railways.

It is impossible to give in detail a statement of all the works which have been carried out during the last decade with a view to increasing the comfort and convenience of 3rd class passengers, but it may be stated that a great deal has been done in the following general directions:—

- (i) The construction of enlarged and improved waiting shed accommodation.
- (ii) The substitution of high for low level platforms at the more important passenger stations.
- (iii) The substitution of new and improved 3rd class passenger carriages generally of the bogie type and of the same dimensions as those used for passengers of the higher classes. These modern carriages are fitted with latrines, upper berths and racks, while the roofs are of improved design with greater heat-resisting properties.
- (iv) The provision of passenger instead of mixed trains on all the more important routes and the introduction of 3rd class express trains running at practically the same speed as mail trains.
- (v) The introduction of improved lighting, mainly electric, in 3rd and intermediate class carriages.
- (vi) The improvement of the arrangements made on special occasions at places of pilgrimage or fairs. Of what has been done in this direction, the account recently communicated to the press, of the arrangements made by the Oudh and Rohilkhand Railway on the occasion of the Kumbh Mela at Hardwar in April last, is an indication.

Any further improvement in the immediate future in the direction of the provision of more 3rd class accommodation is at present rendered extremely difficult, apart from the necessity for economy imposed upon railways by the war, on account of the impracticability of obtaining raw material required for the building of coaching vehicles. What is possible will, however, be done during 1916-17 by the rebuilding of obsolete stock.

The Railway Board have recently arranged for a special census of the actual number of passengers in each train daily on the routes regarding which

there have been most complaints of overcrowding. The reports received show that, though there has undoubtedly been serious overcrowding on occasions, overcrowding is the exception even on these routes specially selected for examination on account of complaints received.

The results are at present being examined by the Railway Board with a view to seeing whether by any re-arrangement of train service the overcrowding can be reduced. A special report has recently been received on the conveyance of pilgrim traffic, and is now under the consideration of the Railway Board. They propose to adopt immediately such of the recommendations contained in this report as are found on enquiry to be practicable.