

**DELAY IN COMMISSIONING OF CCTV
SURVEILLANCE SYSTEM, IRREGULAR
LTC CLAIMS AND AVOIDABLE
EXPENDITURE ON HIRED SERVERS**

[Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their One Hundred and Twenty-fourth Report (16th Lok Sabha)]

MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS

PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2020-21)

NINETEENTH REPORT

SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA



सत्यमेव जयते

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI

PAC NO. 2200

NINETEENTH REPORT

PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2020-21)

SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA

**DELAY IN COMMISSIONING OF CCTV
SURVEILLANCE SYSTEM, IRREGULAR LTC
CLAIMS AND AVOIDABLE EXPENDITURE ON
HIRED SERVERS**

[Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/ Recommendations of the Committee contained in their One Hundred and Twenty-fourth Report (16th Lok Sabha)]

MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS



Presented to Lok Sabha on: 19-09-2020

Laid in Rajya Sabha on: 19-09-2020

**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI**

September, 2020/Bhadrapada, 1942 (Saka)

CONTENTS

		PAGE
COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2020-21)		(iii)
INTRODUCTION		(iv)
CHAPTER I	Report	
CHAPTER II	Observations/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government	
CHAPTER III	Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government	
CHAPTER IV	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration	
CHAPTER V	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies	
APPENDICES		
I	Minutes of the 4 th Sitting of the Public Accounts Committee (2020-21) held on 28 th August, 2020.	
II	Analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee contained in their One Hundred and Twenty Fourth Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha)	

COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2020-21)

Shri Adhir Ranjan Chowdhury - Chairperson

MEMBERS

LOK SABHA

2. Shri T. R. Baalu
3. Shri Subhash Chandra Baheria
4. Shri Sudheer Gupta
5. Smt. Darshana Vikram Jardosh
6. Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab
7. Shri Ajay (Teni) Misra
8. Shri Jagdambika Pal
9. Shri Vishnu Dayal Ram
10. Shri Rahul Ramesh Shewale
11. Shri Rajiv Ranjan Singh alias Lalan Singh
12. Dr. Satya Pal Singh
13. Shri Jayant Sinha
14. Shri Balashowry Vallabhaneni
15. Shri Ram Kripal Yadav

RAJYA SABHA

16. Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar
17. Shri Naresh Gujral
18. Shri C. M. Ramesh
19. Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Ray
20. Shri Bhupender Yadav
21. Vacant
22. Vacant

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri T. G. Chandrasekhar - Joint Secretary
2. Shri. M.L.K. Raja - Director
3. Smt. Bharti S. Tuteja - Additional Director
4. Ms. Malvika Mehta - Under Secretary

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairperson, Public Accounts Committee (2020-21), having been authorised by the Committee, do present this Ninteenth Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their One Hundred and Twenty-fourth Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) on 'Delay in Commissioning of CCTV Surveillance System, Irregular LTC Claims and Avoidable Expenditure on Hired Servers' relating to the Ministry of Home Affairs.

2. The One Hundred and Twenty-fourth Report was presented to Lok Sabha/laid on the Table of Rajya Sabha on 19 December, 2018. Replies of the Government to the Observations/ Recommendations contained in the Report were received on 25 October, 2019. The Committee considered the draft Report on the subject and thereafter adopted the Report at their sitting held on 28 August, 2020. Minutes of the sittings form appendices to the Report.

3. For facility of reference and convenience, the Observations and Recommendations of the Committee have been printed in bold in the body of the Report.

4. The Committee place on record their appreciation of the assistance rendered to them in the matter by the Committee Secretariat and the office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India.

5. An analysis of the Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations contained in the One Hundred and Twenty-fourth Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) is given at Appendix-II.

NEW DELHI:
17 September, 2020
26 Bhadrapada, 1942 (Saka)

Adhir Ranjan Chowdhury
Chairperson
Public Accounts Committee

CHAPTER – I

REPORT

This Report of the Public Accounts Committee deals with action taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their One Hundred and Twenty-fourth Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) on "Delay in commissioning of CCTV surveillance system", "Irregular Leave Travel Concession claims" and "Idling of servers and software and avoidable expenditure on rent of hired servers" relating to Ministry of Home Affairs.

2. The One Hundred and Twenty-fourth Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) was presented to the Parliament on 19.12.2018. It contained six Observations/Recommendations. Action Taken Notes have been received from the Ministry of Home Affairs in respect of all the Observations/Recommendations and are broadly categorised as follows:

- | | | |
|-------|--|--------------------------|
| (i) | Observation/Recommendations which have been accepted by the Government
Para Nos. 1 - 6. | Total:06
Chapter II |
| (ii) | Observation/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of the replies received from the Government
NIL | Total:Nil
Chapter III |
| (iii) | Observation/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration
NIL | Total: Nil
Chapter IV |
| (iv) | Observation/ Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies
NIL | Total: Nil
Chapter V |

3. The detailed examination of the subject by the Committee had revealed that Delhi Police (DP) and Ministry of Home Affairs (MHA/Ministry) failed to assess and determine technical requirement for CCTV surveillance system in high security areas which resulted in a CCTV surveillance project awarded in February 2013 for New Delhi and Central District remaining incomplete despite an expenditure of ₹42.94 crore; the inflated Leave Travel Concession claims submitted by employees in some

offices of Delhi Police were passed without due scrutiny resulting in irregular reimbursement amounting to ₹2.56 crore; Delhi Police failed to synchronize the purchase of server and software with the procurement of leased internet lines resulting in idling of servers and software for three and half years and avoidable expenditure of ₹1.11 crore on hired servers.

4. The Committee had recommended various measures to be undertaken by Ministry of Home Affairs and Delhi Police as well as NIC for effective coordination between various agencies and to streamline and expedite contracts for procurement.

5. The Action Taken Notes submitted by the Ministry on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their One Hundred and Twenty-fourth Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) have been reproduced in the relevant Chapters of this Report in the succeeding paragraphs. The Committee will now deal with the Action Taken by the Government on some of their Observations/Recommendations made in the original Report which merit comments.

6. The Committee desire the Ministry of Home Affairs to furnish Action Taken Notes in respect of Observations/ Recommendations contained in Chapter I within six months of the presentation of the Report to the House.

Recommendation at Para No. 2

7. *The Committee had observed that the Ministry approved the use of 1,888 surplus CCTV cameras and associated equipment left over from the Commonwealth Games 2010 (CWG) items for use during Phase 2(b) of the installation of the CCTV Surveillance System by Delhi Police (DP) across its policing jurisdiction to monitor and resolve crimes and address security challenges. The contract for the supply, installation, and commissioning of CCTV Surveillance System in the high security areas was awarded to M/s Electronics Corporation of India Limited (ECIL) in February 2013 and was to be completed within 150 days of receipt of road cutting permission from civic agencies for the respective sites. The Committee were aghast to note that the CCTV Surveillance system could not be made operational due to non-receipt of sufficient quantity of CWG items for three years between July 2012 and June 2015. The Committee were further dismayed that while the leftover CWG equipment lay idle for so many years, DP incurred wasteful expenditure of a huge amount of ₹ 21.02 lakh per month for renting CCTVs causing double loss to the Government exchequer. While noting that Delhi Police along with ECIL sent numerous letters to Ministry of Youth Affairs and Sports and other agencies*

concerned for transfer of equipment by the venue owners viz. Sports Authority of India, Delhi University and Jamia Millia Islamia University, the Committee were disappointed to note that DP did not seek MHA's intervention to pursue the matter and the Ministry of Youth Affairs and Sports (MYAS) for no obvious reasons, slept over the requests. The Committee were unhappy to note that apart from writing letters, DP did not proactively engage with the Ministries and organizations concerned to expedite supply of CWG equipment. The Committee had desired to know why MHA did not monitor the implementation of the project and aggressively pursue the matter with the concerned organizations despite itself giving the approval for the same. The Committee had recommended that in matters requiring coordination between several agencies/ organizations, a committee may be formed by MHA and all other ministries as the case may be, consisting of a representative each from the organizations concerned to enable effective coordination and speedy resolution of issues. The Committee had further exhorted the MHA to set up a monitoring mechanism for all such ongoing projects.

8. The Ministry of Home Affairs in the Action Taken Notes have submitted as under:

"The progress of CCTV project was reviewed regularly in the Ministry of Home Affairs and during the review meetings both Delhi Police and M/s ECIL assured completion of the project in a time bound manner. The physical as well as financial progress of all Schemes/ projects is reviewed regularly at various levels in MHA. Project Monitoring Committee comprising all the stakeholders monitors the progress of projects under Delhi Police Building Programme. A High Powered Committee on Traffic Management in the NCT of Delhi was set up on 28.09.2018 with all the stakeholders. As recommended by the Public Accounts Committee, a Committee comprising all the stakeholders; namely, MHA, Delhi Police, South Municipal Corporation of Delhi (South MCD), New Delhi Municipal Council (NDMC) and M/s Electronics Corporation of India Ltd. (ECIL), has been set up in MHA on 10.05.2019 to monitor implementation of Phase 2(b) CCTV System."

9. The Committee had noted that the CCTV Surveillance system to be installed using surplus equipment left over from the Commonwealth Games 2010(CWG) could not be made operational due to non-receipt of sufficient quantity of CWG items for three years between July 2012 and June 2015. While the leftover CWG equipment lay idle for so many years, DP incurred wasteful expenditure to the tune of ₹ 21.02 lakh per month for renting CCTVs, causing loss to the Government exchequer. The Committee had desired to be apprised of the reasons as to why the Ministry had not monitored the implementation of

the project and pursued the matter with the organisations concerned and exhorted that a monitoring mechanism for all such ongoing projects may be set up. The Committee had, further, recommended that a committee be formed by MHA and all other ministries consisting of a representative each from the organizations concerned to enable effective coordination and speedy resolution of issues. The Committee note from the action taken replies of the Ministry that the progress of CCTV project was reviewed regularly in the Ministry of Home Affairs and during the review meetings both Delhi Police and M/s ECIL assured completion of the project in a time bound manner. The Committee are astonished to note that despite being well aware of the delay in the completion of project, Ministry did not take any action to expedite procurement of the CWG items. The Committee while noting that the lackadaisical monitoring by the Ministry resulted in wasteful expenditure on renting CCTVs recommend that the Ministry may review progress of all ongoing projects under them and apprise the Committee of the status of completion within six months of the presentation of this Report. The Committee also reiterate their recommendation that a robust monitoring mechanism be set up and periodic review of the projects undertaken to ensure their timely completion. The Committee, while acknowledging that a Committee has been formed to monitor the implementation of the aforesaid project, desire to be apprised of the status of installation of the surveillance system.

Recommendation at Para No. 3

10. *The Committee had noted that on account of technological advancement in the period between 2012 and 2015 and availability of better CCTV Cameras which provided improved picture quality in comparison to the CCTV cameras procured and installed through M/s ECIL and of CWG cameras, it was decided by Delhi Police to change the specifications to procure the latest Technology CCTV cameras to be installed in high sensitive areas and VIP/VVIP movement/route areas of New Delhi District. The Committee had also noted with consternation that despite numerous deliberations and revisions by DP, MHA and ECIL, the amended proposal had still not been finalised till date. This indicated lack of coordination between MHA and DP. While noting that the project would be completed within 2 years from the date of execution/signing of revised contract for phase 2(b), and in view of the criticality of the surveillance system, the Committee had recommended that MHA along with DP*

may take the necessary steps to resolve pending issues and ensure finalization of the contract with ECIL so that the CCTV surveillance system may be operationalised urgently. While also noting that ECIL bills for Phase 2(a) and Phase 3 were kept pending for atleast two years, the Committee had desired that MHA/DP may evolve a mechanism to ensure timely payments to vendors/service providers. The Committee had further recommended that since technological advancements are fast paced, there should be periodic assessment of the quality of cameras and equipment being used and where necessary; the same should be upgraded at the earliest and the MHA/DP may consider adding provision to this effect in the contract. The Committee had also exhorted the MHA/DP to ensure regular maintenance of the CCTV surveillance system for efficient functioning of the same.

11. The Ministry of Home Affairs in the Action Taken Notes have submitted as under:

"Approval of the Competent Authority for revised contract for Phase-2(b) was conveyed on 13.02.2019 (Annexure-II), at an estimated cost of Rs. 147.07 crore for installation of 2727 Nos. CCTV Cameras at six areas/locations with the following conditions:-

1. While executing the contract by M/s ECIL with Delhi Police, as and when a firm cost is finalized after their tendering action for procuring items/services, for execution of instant project, the same will be informed to Delhi Police along with the details and due justification about reasonableness of the final cost; and Delhi Police will take necessary action for obtaining the approval of competent authority on the final cost accordingly.
2. Delhi Police in consultation with their Internal Financial Adviser (IFA) will ensure due adjustment of advance lying with M/s ECIL unutilized as per extant orders cum standard accounting norms.
3. Revised contract may be finalized by Delhi Police in consultation with IFA/Delhi Police in accordance with the provision of GFR 2017, MoF, 2017 for procurement of goods & service and CVC guidelines on the subject. Delhi Police may also ensure the incorporation of suitable provision as per the advice as mentioned in para (i), above, besides incorporating essential clauses regarding "Fall Clause", firm delivery schedule, Liquidated damage, responsibility for obtaining permission from various local bodies/administrative department etc.

In pursuance of the approval, a letter of Intent was issued by Delhi Police to ECIL vide letter No: 2532/Ph-2(b)/Revised TC Prop./CSA/Q-I(B)/P&L dated 20.02.2019 (Annexure-III) for acceptance. The same has been accepted by M/s ECIL vide letter No. EC/ISG/SSPD/DPP II/18-19 (Annexure-IV). As further reported by Delhi Police, necessary provision/clause has been incorporated in the contract as under:

- (i) Clause No. 6.1: with regard to finalization of firm cost after tendering process by M/s ECIL for procuring items/services, for execution of the

instant project alongwith the details and due justification about reasonableness of the final cost.

- (ii) Clause No. 6.6: adjustment of advance lying with M/s ECIL against phase-2(b), timeline for firm delivery period, Liquidated Damage, responsibility for obtaining permission from various local bodies/administrative department etc.
- (iii) Clause No. 6.13: provision of "Fall Clause".

After necessary incorporation and compliance/comments of condition laid down in the approval dated 13.02.2019, revised draft contract for Phase-2(b) is under process for vetting by IFA/Delhi Police before executing the same with M/s ECIL.

As regards, pending bills for phase-2(a) and Phase-3 CCTV project, it is submitted that payment of Rs. 41.28 Crore has been released by Delhi Police to M/s ECIL during the financial year 2018-19 (till 31.03.2019) against the bills of approx. Rs. 55.13 Crore, after recovery of liquidated damage of Rs. 8.50 Crore (Annexure-V). Besides, remaining bills/claims of approx. Rs. 15.00 Crore are under scrutiny in Delhi Police for approval and payment will be released after completing the due process and after obtaining sanction of the competent authority during the current financial year 2019-20.

The Technical specifications and quality of the CCTV camera system of Phase-2(b) CCTV project has been revised as per technological advancement by the technical committee/ Delhi Police and accordingly the revised approval for installation of 2727 CCTV cameras has been obtained from the Competent Authority on 13th February 2019. Further, the quality of cameras and equipment used shall be assessed periodically by the monitoring committee at user district level and by P&L Unit/ Delhi Police on regular basis. Accordingly, a provision under clause 14.9 (iii)-"Ad-hoc works" has been incorporated in the contract, as per details given below (Annexure-VI):

"Such works also includes up-gradation of any equipments viz. cameras, storage, back-up etc., if required necessary for effective functioning, on chargeable basis."

Monitoring of the regular maintenance of the CCTV surveillance system will be done at different levels in Delhi Police i.e (i) at district/ unit level (being user), (ii) Provisioning & Logistics office of Delhi Police collecting regular status report about functioning of CCTV systems from different user offices of Delhi Police and M/s ECIL and (iii) meeting through DCP/P&L for coordinating with different agencies to discuss the issues related to functioning/ maintenance of CCTV system.."

12. The Committee had noted that on account of technological advancement in the period between 2012 and 2015 ,it was decided by Delhi Police to change the specifications to procure the latest Technology CCTV cameras to be installed in high sensitive areas and VIP/VVIP movement/route areas of New Delhi District. However, despite numerous deliberations and revisions by DP, MHA and ECIL, the amended proposal could not be finalised. While noting that the project would be completed within 2 years from the date of

execution/signing of revised contract for phase 2(b), the Committee had recommended that MHA along with DP may take necessary steps to resolve pending issues and ensure finalization of the contract with ECIL so that the CCTV surveillance system may be operationalised urgently. The Committee note from the action taken reply submitted by the Ministry that after incorporation and compliance of conditions laid down in the approval dated 13.02.2019, the revised draft contract for Phase-2(b) was under process for vetting by Internal Financial Advisor /Delhi Police before execution of the same by M/s ECIL. The Committee are concerned to note the inordinate delay in execution of contract of such crucial nature and enjoin upon the Ministry to immediately finalise the contract with ECIL and ensure operationalisation of the CCTV surveillance system and apprise the Committee thereof.

Recommendation at Para No.6

13. *The Committee note that at present, the ZIPNET-Zonal Integrated Police Network project is participated by 8 States i.e. Rajasthan, Haryana, Delhi, U.P., Chandigarh, Punjab, Uttarakhand & Himachal Pradesh, under the Inter-State Co-ordination of Crime/Criminal Information wherein the information of missing persons, un-identified dead bodies, un-identified persons found, stolen vehicles, un-claimed vehicles, stolen missing Mobiles, is provided in public domain. The Committee are of the considered opinion that it is vital that such information may be shared across India for early solution of related cases. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the MHA may take necessary steps within a stipulated timeframe to integrate the rest of the States and Union Territories under the Inter-State Co-ordination of Crime/Criminal Information to enable real time information exchange.*

14. The Ministry of Home Affairs in the Action Taken Notes have submitted as under:

"As reported by Delhi Police, at present the ZIPNET application is hosted in Data Centre, SCRB, 3rd Floor, PS Kamla Market, New Delhi and information is shared/accessed at Inter-State level as well as general public for the following member States:-

1. Delhi
2. Rajasthan
3. Haryana
4. Uttar Pradesh
5. Uttrakhand
6. Chandigarh

7. Punjab
8. Himachal Pradesh

05 Internet Leased Lines (ILL) – 10 Mbps each, is subscribed with M/s MTNL are being utilized by DP for information and dissemination to all concerned corners. Moreover, the same resources are used for On-Line Criminal Dossier System, Crime and Criminal Information System (CCIS), Conviction/Involvement System, Citizen Services of CCTNS, MACT (Motor Accident Claims Tribunal), Interactive district web pages, Criminal Tagging System, Motor Vehicle Theft (MVT) App., Property Theft App. and Lost Report App.

As regards the Committee's recommendation to integrate the rest of the States and Union Territories under the Inter-State Co-ordination of Crime/Criminal Information to enable real time information exchange, MHA is implementing Interoperable Criminal Justice System (ICJS) with the objective to integrate the pillars of criminal justice system namely, Police, Courts, Prisons, Forensics and Prosecution and share the crime and criminal data with the Law Enforcement Agencies across India on near real time basis. ICJS also contains data on missing persons, un-identified dead bodies, un-identified persons found, stolen vehicles, un-claimed vehicles, stolen missing bodies, etc. and access has been provided to the Central Investigating Agencies and Police in States/ UTs."

15. Audit in this regard have given the following vetting comments:-

"Interoperable Criminal Justice System (ICJS) for real time information exchange is stated to be under implementation, however, the time frame for completion of the same and progress made thereof is yet to be intimated."

16. The Ministry of Home Affairs in the Action Taken Notes have further submitted as under:

"The system will become operational in Financial Year 2019-20 and will be available to States/UTs for use."

17. The Committee, while noting that the ZIPNET-Zonal Integrated Police Network project covered 8 States i.e. Rajasthan, Haryana, Delhi, U.P., Chandigarh, Punjab, Uttarakhand & Himachal Pradesh, under the Inter-State Co-ordination of Crime/Criminal Information system, had recommended that MHA may take necessary steps, within a stipulated timeframe, to integrate the rest of the States and Union Territories under the project to enable real time information exchange. The Committee observe from the action taken reply that the Ministry is implementing Inter-operable Criminal Justice System (ICJS) with the objective to integrate the pillars of criminal justice system namely, Police, Courts, Prisons, Forensics and Prosecution and share the crime and criminal data with the Law Enforcement Agencies across India on real time basis. The

Committee desire to be apprised of the status of implementation of the said system and the resultant impact of the same in enabling real time information exchange. The Committee note that under ICJS, access has been provided to the Central Investigating Agencies and Police in States/ UTs whereas under ZIPNET project, information is shared/accessed at Inter-State level as well as general public in the member states. The Committee desire that rest of the States may also be covered under the ZIPNET project to enable information sharing and access across the country within a defined time frame.

CHAPTER II

OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH HAVE BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE GOVERNMENT

Observation/Recommendation

The C&AG of India in their Report no. 4 of 2018, Compliance Audit, Union Government (Civil) brought out certain observations related to the Ministry of Home Affairs (MHA). The Committee examined three Audit Paras viz. 10.1, 10.2 and 10.3 of the said report pertaining to "Delay in commissioning of CCTV surveillance system", "Irregular Leave Travel Concession claims" and "Idling of servers and software and avoidable expenditure on rent of hired servers" respectively. In Para 10.1, Audit observed that the Delhi Police (DP) and Ministry of Home Affairs failed to assess and determine technical requirement for CCTV surveillance system in high security areas which resulted in a CCTV surveillance project awarded in February 2013 for New Delhi and Central District remaining incomplete as of October 2017 despite an expenditure of ₹42.94 crore. Further, the Delhi Police had been incurring a monthly expenditure of ₹ 21.02 lakh on hiring CCTV cameras for these areas. In para 10.2 it was revealed that employees in some offices of Delhi Police submitted Leave Travel Concession (LTC) claims with inflated air fares in violation of Government orders. These were passed without due scrutiny resulting in irregular reimbursement amounting to ₹2.56 crore to 435 employees. According to para 10.3, Delhi Police failed to synchronize the purchase of server and software with the procurement of leased internet lines resulting in idling of servers and software for three and half years and avoidable expenditure of ₹1.11 crore on hired servers. The observations/ recommendations of the Committee on important issues are contained in the succeeding paragraphs.

[Para 1, Part – II, of 124th Report of Public Accounts Committee
(16th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

Para (1) above is Audit observations reproduced and hence no reply is recorded.

Audit's vetting comments on Ministry's ATN

No further comments.

Observation/Recommendation

The Committee observe that in July 2012, MHA approved the use of 1,888 surplus CCTV cameras and associated equipment left over from the Commonwealth Games 2010 (CWG Items) for use during Phase 2(b) of the installation of the CCTV Surveillance System by Delhi Police (DP) across its policing jurisdiction to monitor and resolve crimes and address security challenges. The contract for the supply, installation, and commissioning of CCTV Surveillance System in the high security areas was awarded to M/s Electronics Corporation of India Limited (ECIL) in February 2013 and was to be completed within 150 days of receipt of road cutting permission from civic agencies for the respective sites. The Committee are aghast to note that the CCTV Surveillance system could not be made operational due to non-receipt of sufficient quantity of CWG items for three years between July 2012 and June 2015. The Committee are dismayed that while the leftover CWG equipment lay idle for so many years, DP incurred wasteful expenditure of a huge amount of ₹ 21.02 lakh per month for renting CCTVs causing double loss to the Government exchequer. While noting that Delhi Police along with ECIL sent numerous letters to MYAS and other agencies concerned for transfer of equipment by the venue owners viz. Sports Authority of India, Delhi University and Jamia Millia Islamia University, the Committee fail to understand why DP did not seek MHA's intervention to pursue the matter and the MYAS for no obvious reasons, slept over the requests. The Committee are unhappy to note that apart from writing letters, DP did not proactively engage with the Ministries and organizations concerned to expedite supply of CWG equipment. The Committee would also like to know why MHA did not monitor the implementation of the project and aggressively pursue the matter with the concerned organizations despite itself giving the approval for the same. The Committee recommend that henceforth, in matters requiring coordination between several agencies/ organizations, a committee may be formed by MHA and all other ministries as the case may be, consisting of a representative each from the organizations concerned to enable effective coordination and speedy resolution of issues. The Committee further exhort the MHA to set up a monitoring mechanism for all such ongoing projects.

Action Taken

The progress of CCTV project was reviewed regularly in the Ministry of Home Affairs and during the review meetings both Delhi Police and M/s ECIL assured completion of the project in a time bound manner. The physical as well as financial progress of all Schemes/ projects is reviewed regularly at various levels in MHA. Project Monitoring Committee comprising all the stakeholders monitors the progress of projects under Delhi Police Building Programme. A High Powered Committee on Traffic Management in the NCT of Delhi was set up on 28.09.2018 with all the stakeholders. As recommended by the Public Accounts Committee, a Committee comprising all the stakeholders, namely, MHA, Delhi Police, South Municipal Corporation of Delhi (South MCD), New Delhi Municipal Council (NDMC) and M/s Electronics Corporation of India Ltd. (ECIL), has been set up in MHA on 10.05.2019 (Annexure-I) to monitor implementation of Phase 2(b) CCTV System.

Audit's vetting comments on Ministry's ATN

No further comments

Observation/Recommendation

The Committee note that on account of technological advancement in the period between 2012 and 2015 and availability of better CCTV Cameras which provided improved picture quality in comparison to the CCTV cameras procured and installed through M/s ECIL and of CWG cameras, it was decided by Delhi Police to change the specifications to procure the latest Technology CCTV cameras to be installed in high sensitive areas and VIP/VVIP movement/route areas of New Delhi District. However, the Committee note with consternation that despite numerous deliberations and revisions by DP, MHA and ECIL, the amended proposal has still not been finalised till date. This indicates lack of coordination between MHA and DP. While noting that the project would be completed within 2 years from the date of execution/signing of revised contract for phase 2(b), and in view of the criticality of the surveillance system, the Committee recommend that MHA alongwith DP may take the necessary steps to resolve pending issues and ensure finalization of the contract with ECIL so that the CCTV surveillance system may be operationalised urgently. While also noting that ECIL bills for Phase 2(a) and

Phase 3 were kept pending for atleast two years, the Committee desire that MHA/DP may evolve a mechanism to ensure timely payments to vendors/service providers. The Committee further desire that since technological advancements are fast paced, there should be periodic assessment of the quality of cameras and equipment being used and where necessary; the same should be upgraded at the earliest and the MHA/ DP may consider adding provision to this effect in the contract. The Committee also exhort the MHA/DP to ensure regular maintenance of the CCTV surveillance system for efficient functioning of the same.

[Para 3, Part – II, of 124th Report of Public Accounts Committee
(16th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

Approval of the Competent Authority for revised contract for Phase-2(b) was conveyed on 13.02.2019 (Annexure-II), at an estimated cost of Rs. 147.07 crore for installation of 2727 Nos. CCTV Cameras at six areas/locations with the following conditions:-

4. While executing the contract by M/s ECIL with Delhi Police, as and when a firm cost is finalized after their tendering action for procuring items/services, for execution of instant project, the same will be informed to Delhi Police alongwith the details and due justification about reasonableness of the final cost; and Delhi Police will take necessary action for obtaining the approval of competent authority on the final cost accordingly.
5. Delhi Police in consultation with their Internal Financial Adviser (IFA) will ensure due adjustment of advance lying with M/s ECIL unutilized as per extant orders cum standard accounting norms.
6. Revised contract may be finalized by Delhi Police in consultation with IFA/Delhi Police in accordance with the provision of GFR 2017, MoF, 2017 for procurement of goods & service and CVC guidelines on the subject. Delhi Police may also ensure the incorporation of suitable provision as per the advice as mentioned in para (i), above, besides incorporating essential clauses regarding "Fall Clause", firm delivery schedule, Liquidated damage, responsibility for obtaining permission from various local bodies/administrative department etc.

In pursuance of the approval, a letter of Intent was issued by Delhi Police to ECIL vide letter No. 2532/Ph-2(b)/Revised TC Prop./CSA/Q-I(B)/P&L dated 20.02.2019 (Annexure-III) for acceptance. The same has been accepted by M/s ECIL vide letter No. EC/ISG/SSPD/DPP II/18-19 (Annexure-IV). As further reported by Delhi Police, necessary provision/clause has been incorporated in the contract as under:

- (iv) Clause No. 6.1: with regard to finalization of firm cost after tendering process by M/s ECIL for procuring items/services, for execution of the instant project alongwith the details and due justification about reasonableness of the final cost.
- (v) Clause No. 6.6: adjustment of advance lying with M/s ECIL against phase-2(b), timeline for firm delivery period, Liquidated Damage, responsibility for obtaining permission from various local bodies/administrative department etc.
- (vi) Clause No. 6.13: provision of "Fall Clause".

After necessary incorporation and compliance/comments of condition laid down in the approval dated 13.02.2019, revised draft contract for Phase-2(b) is under process for vetting by IFA/Delhi Police before executing the same with M/s ECIL.

As regards, pending bills for phase-2(a) and Phase-3 CCTV project, it is submitted that payment of Rs. 41.28 Crore has been released by Delhi Police to M/s ECIL during the financial year 2018-19 (till 31.03.2019) against the bills of approx. Rs. 55.13 Crore, after recovery of liquidated damage of Rs. 8.50 Crore (Annexure-V). Besides, remaining bills/claims of approx. Rs. 15.00 Crore are under scrutiny in Delhi Police for approval and payment will be released after completing the due process and after obtaining sanction of the competent authority during the current financial year 2019-20.

The Technical specifications and quality of the CCTV camera system of Phase-2(b) CCTV project has been revised as per technological advancement by the technical committee/ Delhi Police and accordingly the revised approval for installation of 2727 CCTV cameras has been obtained from the Competent Authority on 13th February 2019. Further, the quality of cameras and equipment used shall be assessed periodically by the monitoring committee at user district level and by P&L Unit/ Delhi Police on regular basis. Accordingly, a provision under clause 14.9 (iii)-"Ad-hoc works" has been incorporated in the contract, as per details given below (Annexure-VI):

"Such works also includes up-gradation of any equipments viz. cameras, storage, back-up etc., if required necessary for effective functioning, on chargeable basis."

Monitoring of the regular maintenance of the CCTV surveillance system will be done at different levels in Delhi Police i.e (i) at district/ unit level (being user), (ii) Provisioning & Logistics office of Delhi Police collecting regular status report about functioning of CCTV systems from different user offices of Delhi Police and M/s ECIL and (iii) meeting through DCP/P&L for coordinating with different agencies to discuss the issues related to functioning/ maintenance of CCTV system.

Audit's vetting comments on Ministry's ATN

No further comments

Observation/Recommendation

The Committee note that Government of India (GOI) permitted all employees including non-entitled employees to travel by Air India to North East region and by any airline to Jammu and Kashmir (J&K) on Leave Travel Concession (LTC) in 2008 and 2010 which facility was extended from time to time. The air tickets for travel on LTC were to be purchased either directly from the airlines at booking counters/websites of the airlines or by utilizing the services of authorized travel agents. The Committee observe that on scrutiny of travel details of 1196 employees of Delhi Police, it was found that in the case of 435 employees, air tickets had neither been directly purchased from the airline nor from the authorized travel agents. Airfare amounting to ₹2.56 crore claimed by these employees and reimbursed by Delhi Police was also higher than the cost of tickets shown on the website of the airline charged from these employees and these employees had not submitted original tickets of the airline and the air fares claimed appeared to be inflated. However, the claims were allowed by the concerned authorities without exercise of due diligence and without ensuring compliance with the extant instructions. In this regard, the Committee note that 97% of the recovery has been effected and the remaining amount is being recovered; the Vigilance Unit of Delhi Police has been directed to scrutinize the claims of all 1196 cases and take necessary disciplinary action and that Delhi Police has initiated a vigilance enquiry into

the matter to fix responsibility of erring officials. The Committee desire that the vigilance enquiry is expedited so that erring officials are punished at the earliest. The Committee further note that directions have been given to all the Districts/Units of Delhi Police to strictly scrutinize all LTC claims as per extant guidelines besides verifying authenticity/ genuineness of the air tickets before releasing the payment. The Committee strongly feel that the fact that irregular LTC claims were passed and were only revealed after being pointed out by Audit, shows that the system of internal audit failed miserably in discharging its responsibility effectively. The Committee, therefore, recommend that a mechanism for strong internal control followed by internal audit may be put in place in Delhi Police to avoid recurrences of such irregularities.

[Para 4, Part – II, of 124th Report of Public Accounts Committee
(16th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

1. As per observations/recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee and instructions of GOI, Delhi Police has directed all the Districts/Units to verify the LTC claims and to effect recovery in case any excess payment is made. As reported by Delhi Police, LTC claims are being thoroughly checked and the air tickets submitted by the police personnel are randomly verified from the airline concerned for their genuineness. If any kind of misuse of LTC is detected, necessary disciplinary action will be initiated against the defaulters by Delhi Police, as per LTC rules. Undertaking from the applicant is also taken that he has purchased air tickets from the authorized agents or directly from the airlines booking counters/ website of airlines. Committee has been formed by Delhi Police at District/Unit level for strong internal control mechanism to avoid recurrences of such irregularities in future and for verifying the authenticity and genuineness of the air tickets from concerned airlines.
2. Verification of air fare claimed by the Government servant in respect of other cases is under progress and as soon as the reply is received from the airlines, further necessary action as per extant rules will be initiated by Delhi Police. The details of claims verified by the airlines as on date is as under:-

Block Year	No. of claims verified by airlines and referred for vigilance enquiry	Total amount to be recovered	Recovery made
2010-13	42	23,22,844	95,750

2014-17	56	36,88,869	1,10,212
---------	----	-----------	----------

3. As reported by Delhi Police, their Internal Audit also detected 331 LTC claims during scrutiny of records of Districts/Units and pointed out a recovery of Rs. 73,21,283/- from the employees concerned, after verification of tickets from concerned airlines.
4. 98.52% of recovery pointed out by AG (Audit) has been effected by Delhi Police as on 31.03.2019 and Rs. 1,63,092/- will be recovered shortly. An amount of Rs. 55146/- was shown twice by AG(Audit) who have been requested to reduce the amount from the total recovery. Further, sincere efforts for recovery of remaining amount of Rs. 2,83,326/- from retirees/expiry/death cases is already taken up by Delhi Police and is being followed up with the concerned for depositing the ineligible amount. In case the amount could not be recovered, approval of the competent authority for waiver of recovery will be obtained by Delhi Police.
5. As reported by Delhi Police, Vigilance Enquiry is still under way to find out the actual amount paid to the airlines and thereby, the difference of both the amount i.e. claimed by the LTC beneficiaries and the actual amount paid to the airlines concerned. However, it is clear from the Vigilance Enquiry conducted so far that various OMs issued by the Ministry of Finance (Department of Expenditure) as well as Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions (Department of Personnel and Training) have been over looked by the Dealing Assistants and their supervisory officers while clearing the LTC claims. The competent authority has approved regular departmental enquiry against the 07 Dealing Assistants and Show Cause Notice for censure to 05 supervisory officers without prejudice to the final outcome of the findings of Vigilance Enquiry.

Audit's vetting comments on Ministry's ATN

The final outcomes of all cases referred to vigilance inquiry may be intimated to PAC.

Ministry's comments on Audit's observations

Delhi Police has been directed to provide final outcomes of Vigilance inquiry for onward transmission to PAC.

Observation/Recommendation

The Committee note that the State Crime Record Bureau (SCRB) of Delhi Police under the Ministry of Home Affairs (MHA) initially hosted the Zonal Integrated Police Network (ZIPNET) for sharing information on missing persons/goods with the neighbouring States and the Online Criminal Dossier System (OCDS) for investigating officers on the server of the National Informatics Centre (NIC). The Committee observe that since NIC shut down Delhi Police applications from their server without any prior intimation, Delhi Police decided to host these applications on two alternate servers hired from a private agency through limited tender. The Committee also note that Delhi Police subsequently decided to host the two systems on in-house servers in SCRB to save the annual expenditure on hiring and procured and installed the same. The Committee further note that the same could not be utilized for more than three and a half years as tender for procurement of leased internet lines was not finalised. While Delhi Police took eight months to finalise the specifications, MHA raised several queries on the proposal finally conveying administrative approval after a year in May 2015 to finalise the contract in open tender on completing all codal formalities. Subsequent proposals of Delhi Police were also not approved by MHA due to the former's failure to adhere to the codal formalities prescribed in the General Financial Rules and incomplete documentation. Delhi Police could finally order the leased internet lines from MTNL in September 2016 after MHA delegated financial powers to Delhi Police in March 2016 for leasing of lines. The installation work of internet leased lines was completed in March 2017. In the first instance, the Committee are dismayed at the general response of NIC to a specific query of the Committee wherein it was submitted that as a matter of practice, NIC does not shutdown servers hosting websites. The Committee are alarmed to note that it is only upon receipt of Office Memorandum from Lok Sabha Secretariat that NIC requested Delhi Police for details in the matter. The Committee are distressed that there is no system in NIC to inform and address problems related to key organizations such as Delhi Police who have such an important responsibility towards the public. The Committee, therefore, recommend that NIC may institute a mechanism for prioritized redressal of issues related to important organizations. The Committee also feel that DP on its part failed to pursue the matter for not shutting the server with NIC in view of the importance of core policing information at the inter-state level and are further perturbed at the lack

of coordination between DP and NIC. The Committee desire that in the present arrangement with MTNL and inhouse servers, DP may ensure that any issue be resolved immediately and maintenance of the servers be done on a regular basis to avoid recurrence of such instances. The Committee also desire that DP may ensure proper documentation and compliance with GFRs while tendering for projects.

[Para 5, Part – II, of 124th Report of Public Accounts Committee
(16th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

NIC has informed that pursuance to the observation/ recommendations of the 124th Report of the Public Accounts Committee, NIC has devised a mechanism to address the issues reported by the key/ sensitive organizations of Government of India by defining an escalation matrix.

1. NIC officials posted in the Ministry will be informed about the issue (Response Level-1). He/ She will attempt to resolve the problem using his/ her expertise.
2. The officer at the response Level-1 will also intimate the service desk to initiate the redressal process, if required.
3. The same will be intimated to the Head of the NIC Division (HoD) simultaneously (Response Level-2). HoD will get in touch with the NIC service stakeholders to resolve the issue, if not done so at the earlier level.
4. If the problem is still not resolved within 10 hours, will be escalated to the Head of Group (HoG) (Response Level-3) for necessary intervention and action at the highest level.

Delhi Police has reported that the observation/recommendations passed by the Public Accounts Committee have been noted for meticulous compliance. Application/website of Delhi Police are running in Data Centre through Leased Line of MTNL etc. on in-house NIC servers etc. Delhi Police is using multiple networks acquired after following the procedures laid down in GFR, leaving no chance for dependency on any single network operation. Also Delhi Police is maintaining coordination with NIC at senior level. Besides, maintenance of the in-house servers installed for the purpose being done on a regular intervention to avoid recurrence of such instances. Apart from this, proper documentation and compliance with GFRs will be ensured by Delhi Police in future while tendering for projects.

Audit's vetting comments on Ministry's ATN

No further comments.

Observation/Recommendation

The Committee note that at present, the ZIPNET-Zonal Integrated Police Network project is participated by 8 States i.e. Rajasthan, Haryana, Delhi, U.P., Chandigarh, Punjab, Uttarakhand & Himachal Pradesh, under the Inter-State Coordination of Crime/Criminal Information wherein the information of missing persons, un-identified dead bodies, un-identified persons found, stolen vehicles, un-claimed vehicles, stolen missing Mobiles, is provided in public domain. The Committee are of the considered opinion that it is vital that such information may be shared across India for early solution of related cases. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the MHA may take necessary steps within a stipulated timeframe to integrate the rest of the States and Union Territories under the Inter State Co-ordination of Crime/Criminal Information to enable real time information exchange.

[Para 6, Part – II, of 124th Report of Public Accounts Committee
(16th Lok Sabha)]

Action Taken

As reported by Delhi Police, at present the ZIPNET application is hosted in Data Centre, SCRB, 3rd Floor, PS Kamla Market, New Delhi and information is shared/accessed at Inter-State level as well as general public for the following member States:-

9. Delhi
10. Rajasthan
11. Haryana
12. Uttar Pradesh
13. Uttrakhand
14. Chandigarh
15. Punjab
16. Himachal Pradesh

05 Internet Leased Lines (ILL) – 10 Mbps each, is subscribed with M/s MTNL are being utilized by DP for information and dissemination to all concerned corners.

Moreover, the same resources are used for On-Line Criminal Dossier System, Crime and Criminal Information System (CCIS), Conviction/Involvement System, Citizen Services of CCTNS, MACT (Motor Accident Claims Tribunal), Interactive district web pages, Criminal Tagging System, Motor Vehicle Theft (MVT) App., Property Theft App. and Lost Report App.

As regards the Committee's recommendation to integrate the rest of the States and Union Territories under the Inter-State Co-ordination of Crime/Criminal Information to enable real time information exchange, MHA is implementing Interoperable Criminal Justice System (ICJS) with the objective to integrate the pillars of criminal justice system namely, Police, Courts, Prisons, Forensics and Prosecution and share the crime and criminal data with the Law Enforcement Agencies across India on near real time basis. ICJS also contains data on missing persons, un-identified dead bodies, un-identified persons found, stolen vehicles, un-claimed vehicles, stolen missing bodies, etc. and access has been provided to the Central Investigating Agencies and Police in States/ UTs.

Audit's vetting comments on Ministry's ATN

Interoperable Criminal Justice System (ICJS) for real time information exchange is stated to be under implementation, however, the time frame for completion of the same and progress made thereof is yet to be intimated.

Ministry's comments on Audit's observations

The system will become operational in Financial Year 2019-20 and will be available to States/UTs for use.

CHAPTER III

OBSERVATION/RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH THE COMMITTEE DO NOT
DESIRE TO PURSUE IN VIEW OF THE REPLIES RECEIVED FROM THE
GOVERNMENT

-NIL-

CHAPTER IV

OBSERVATION/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH REPLIES OF
THE GOVERNMENT HAVE NOT BEEN ACCEPTED BY THE COMMITTEE AND
WHICH REQUIRE REITERATION

-NIL-

CHAPTER V

OBSERVATION/RECOMMENDATIONS IN RESPECT OF WHICH THE
GOVERNMENT HAVE FURNISHED INTERIM REPLIES

-NIL-

NEW DELHI:
September, 2020
Bhadrapada, 1942 (*Saka*)

ADHIR RANJAN CHOWDHURY
Chairperson,
Public Accounts Committee

MINUTES OF THE FOURTH SITTING OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2020-21) HELD ON 28TH AUGUST, 2020.

The Public Accounts Committee sat on Friday, the 28th August, 2020 from 1500 hrs. to 1715 hrs. in Committee Room 'C', Parliament House Annexe, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Shri Adhir Ranjan Chowdhury - Chairperson

Members

LOK SABHA

2. Shri T.R Baalu
3. Shri Subash Chandra Baheria
4. Smt. Darshana Vikram Jardosh
5. Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab
6. Shri Vishnu Dayal Ram
7. Shri Rahul Ramesh Shewale
8. Shri Jayant Sinha
9. Shri Balashowry Vallabhaneni

RAJYA SABHA

10. Shri Naresh Gujral
11. Shri C.M Ramesh
12. Shri Bhupender Yadav

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

1. Shri T.G Chandrasekhar - Joint Secretary
2. Shri MLK Raja - Director
3. Shri Paolienlal Haokip - Additional Director

REPRESENTATIVES OF THE OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER AND AUDITOR
GENERAL OF INDIA

1. Ms.Shubha Kumar - Dy.CAG
2. Shri K. Srinivasan - DG
3. Shri Sanjay Kumar - DG
4. Ms.Ritika Bhatia - PD
5. Shri S.V. Singh - PD

REPRESENTATIVES OF THE MINISTRY OF TEXTILES

PART-I

1. At the outset, the Hon'ble Chairperson, welcomed the Officers of the C&AG of India to the sitting of the Committee. Thereafter, he invited suggestions of the Members on the following Draft Reports:-

- (a) **** **** **** ****;
- (b) **** **** **** ****;
- (c) **** **** **** ****;
- (d) Action Taken by the Government on the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee contained in their 124th Report (Sixteenth Lok Sabha) on the subject, "Delay in Commissioning of CCTV Surveillance System", "Irregular Leave Travel Concession Claims" and "Idling of Servers and Software and Avoidable Expenditure on Rent of Hired Servers"; and
- (e) **** **** **** ****;

2. After deliberations, the Draft Reports were adopted by the Committee without any modifications/changes. The Committee authorized the Chairperson to finalize the Reports in the light of factual verification/vetting comments, if any and present the same to Parliament on behalf of the Committee.

3. The Chairperson, then, thanked the Members and the representatives of the Office of the C&AG of India for assisting the Committee in the examination of the subjects.

PART-II

The Committee then adjourned.

APPENDIX-II
(Vide Paragraph 5 of Introduction)

ANALYSIS OF THE ACTION TAKEN BY THE GOVERNMENT ON THE
OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS
COMMITTEE CONTAINED IN THEIR ONE HUNDRED AND TWENTY FOURTH
REPORT (SIXTEENTH LOK SABHA)

(i)	Total number of Observations/Recommendations	06
(ii)	Observations/Recommendations of the Committee which have been accepted by the Government: Para Nos. 1 to 6.	Total : 06 Percentage: 100%
(iii)	Observations/Recommendations which the Committee do not desire to pursue in view of % the reply of the Government: Para Nos. Nil.	Total : 00 Percentage: Nil
(iv)	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which replies of the Government have not been % accepted by the Committee and which require reiteration: Para Nos. Nil.	Total : 00 Percentage: Nil
(v)	Observations/Recommendations in respect of which the Government have furnished interim replies: %	Total : 00 Percentage: Nil
