

[Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar]

Is that correct?...*(Interruptions)* Tell us whether what he wrote about you is correct or not...*(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to ask the hon. Prime Minister as to whether there was no Kargil war after Pokhran-II and also whether the Chinese did not invade our Arunachal Pradesh...*(Interruptions)* Is it not correct that a big part of our Armed Forces was deployed on the borders after Pokhran-II?

Sir, our armed forces remained on the borders for ten months. We tried to put pressure on Pakistan, but of no avail and ultimately, we withdraw our forces from the borders. He says that Pokhran-II is a big turning point in our history...*(Interruptions)* I want to read out an article here written by George Fernandes. At his matance this article is a repetition of the book "The Guilty Man of 1962" written by D. R. Mankekar long back. In it, Shri George Fernandes has written a Forward dated 17 December, 1998. According to the Report of Subramaniam Committee, the interference in Kargil Sector had already started. I like to quote here the contents of the Forward written by George Fernandes at that time.

[English]

"The well-fostered myth that the danger of India's security comes from Pakistan has been exploded."

[Translation]

Our Defence Minister is saying that the danger from Pakistan is a myth...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Your time is over. Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar, please conclude now. I am going to call the hon. Prime Minister.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR : He says that the danger from Pakistan...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : Now, the hon. Prime Minister.

[Translation]

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR : I would like to ask the hon. Prime Minister as to what type of a Defence Minister he has appointed...*(Interruptions)* He should reply to the question that I am putting at the last moment and in your presence...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing will go on record except the speech of the hon. Prime Minister.

*(Interruptions)**

[English]

PROF. UMMAREDDY VENKATESWARLU (TENALI) : Sir, please give me a chance for two minutes...*(Interruptions)* The second speaker from the Telugu Desam Party should be given an opportunity...*(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Now, please listen.

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, before I speak on No-Confidence Motion, I would like to congratulate you for the way you have conducted the House for the last two days...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI RAMDAS ATHAWALE : Mr. Speaker, Sir, please see this side.

MR. SPEAKER : Athawaleji, the hon. Prime Minister is on his legs. Please sit down. I will allow you to speak afterwards.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Ramdasji, what do you want? Once the hon. Prime Minister concludes. I will allow you to ask one question. Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : What do you want to ask.

SHRI RAMDAS ATHAWALE : During debate, you have allowed everyone to speak, please allow me too. Why should I not speak? Why this injustice is being done to me? You have allowed each and every party to speak. This is not to good thing, what is the need to speak them?...*(Interruptions)*

Not Recorded.

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : Go ahead, permission is granted.

SHRI RAMDAS ATHAWALE (PANDHARPUR) : I was not granted permission earlier. Have you allowed me?

MR. SPEAKER : Please speak whatever you want to say.

SHRI RAMDAS ATHAWALE : What should I speak now as I am in no mood of speaking. This is not a good thing.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, I do not want to say much here. The discussion is going on the No-Confidence Motion brought by Sonia Gandhiji. I rise to welcome Atalji and Advaniji. I rise because you are left with one hour before you leave...*(Interruptions)* I do not want to say much. I like to say a poem :

"Atalji, apka najdik aya ha, Jaane ka waqt,
Kyonki NDA ke kuchh log ban rahe hain hamare bhakt,
Ab hamara ek hi lakshya hai, NDA ko satta se hatana."

Out another aim is to bring all, Sonia Gandhiji, Chandra Shekharji, Sharad Pawarji, Mulayam Singhji, Somnath Chatterjeeji, Paswanji, Devegowdaji...*(Interruptions)* Prakash Ambedkar and Laloo Prasadji...*(Interruptions)* Our aim is to bring them in power...*(Interruptions)* The Government of Atalji...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI PRAKASH PARANJPE (THANE) : Your party has been divided into eight pieces...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Prakash Paranjpeji, please don't disturb him.

(Interruptions)

SHRI RAMDAS ATHAWALE : Mr. Speaker, Sir, Atalji ki Sakar bahut hai...*

Adnyaksh mahodaya, ish sarkar ke viruddha mein kya-kya bolun

Atalji aapke pass hoga DMK ka Baalu

Magar hamare paas hai majboot RJD ka Laloo

Atalji apke raj mein garibon ko nahi mil raha aaloo,

Ish sarkar ke khilaf bolna mein kaise talun

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

Desh ko bachane ki jimmedari mein kis par dalun,

Advaniji hain apse bhi bahut...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Ramdasji, now please conclude. Now everyone have become aware that who is such person.

(Interruptions)

SHRI RAMDAS ATHAWALE : Mr. Speaker, Sir,

"Atalji, Advaniji ko khilao soft Hindutva ka Aaloo,

George Fernandes nahin hai jyada...*

Unke liye kafi hain hamare Laloo."

So, I support the No-Confidence Motion moved by Smt. Sonlaji. You should rule the country for poor and Dalits. Atalji the colour of my Jacket is blue and colour of you Jacket is also blue. My party's colour is blue but your party's colour is not blue. Untill colour of your party turns blue...*(Interruptions)* You will not learn the secularism...*(Interruptions)* So I want to say that colour of your party should be blue...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : I shall expunge unparliamentary expressions from the record. I shall also expunge the words which give the sense of allegation.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SHIVAJI MANE (HINGOLI) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, is it proper to speak such things in the House...*(Interruptions)*

THE MINISTER OF POWER (SHRI ANANT GANGARAM GEETE) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, there should be some norms of Parliament, country's most...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : The words which I consider not proper and which are not according to the rules, shall be expunged.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Ramdasji please sit down because Prime Minister is speaking.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have witnessed so many No-Confidence Motion but I have yet to come across such a No-Confidence Motion. The scene that have emerged before moving the motion and after that during discussion is really different.

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

[Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee]

23.00 hrs.

Nothing is coherent. But this is the way. At last when it was asked why this No-Confidence Motion is being brought I didn't get any satisfactory reply. You can say that what is the need for a reply. Who understands the reply, they have got it. No-Confidence Motion is moved when Government is on the brink of a fall and No-Confidence Motion is used when the ruling combine is likely to break. However, in general situation No-Confidence Motion is used as a weapon to keep the government aware and to express one's views on any particular issue. But at this moment I am unable to understand its purpose. There is no question of breaking the government because this government would not break. You also do not want to topple this government this is a good thing because grapes are sour. Otherwise the Governments formed and toppled by you are in good number. Our coalition government is still untouched by you. But two days debate had not been able to throw any light on any new strategy to topple this government.

The nine point charges have been levelled. There are nine points and one charge sheet. It has set a bizarre convention that parties are levelling charges against each other. There should be proper communication and discussion among the parties. Nobody should speak in ultimatum language that we are levelling charges against you because you have put the defence security system in danger. This is not an ordinary charge that we have jeopardised the defence security system. The second charge is that we have weakened the national security in totality. What does it mean? How the security is in danger? How we have weakened our internal security? They should have substantiated their charges by producing concrete evidence. Can such allegations be levelled in Parliament? I do not want to go through all the nine points. An effort to destroy the public sector...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Your leader will give reply. There is no need to give reply by everyone.

(English)

She will reply. She has the right to speak in the end.

(Interruptions)

(Translation)

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : That very day Steel Authority got a new life. It has got established in a new form. Is not it something to enjoy?

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Enjoy what?

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : It should be enjoyed. But it is said that we are destroying everything. Even after destruction people keep us here. This is not a good thing on your part...*(Interruptions)* Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have been a Member of Parliament since 1957. Groups were never formed on the question of Foreign policy.

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR : You brought the motion in 1962 while our armed forces were fighting with the China. You brought the motion when our Jawans were dying. This dates back to 8 November, 1962...*(Interruptions)*

(English)

MR. SPEAKER : Whatever any Member speaks without my permission should not be recorded.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please sit down. Please do not speak.

(Translation)

Mani Shankarji sit down. Hon'ble Prime Minister is speaking.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : I don't interrupt anyone...*(Interruptions)*

(English)

MR. SPEAKER : Please keep quiet.

(Translation)

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : I mean to say that there has been a consensus in the country regarding foreign policy. It existed earlier and exists even now. But it has been said that we mortgaged the foreign policy of India, such allegations have been made. What does it mean to mortgage; what was mortgage?...*(Interruptions)* That is why we refused to send troops...*(Interruptions)*

(English)

MR. SPEAKER : Hon. Members are requested not to interrupt the hon. Prime Minister.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : A bilateral discussion took place when the question of sending troops surfaced and nothing is hidden there. Even for that doubt is being created that the troops didn't go because of us otherwise they would have gone there. How they could have gone? By your orders? But this thing has no meaning. Should I tell you now these things about foreign policy such as who decided to send the troops or that the people from that side were united, what was their first opinion and it changed later on...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Basu Deb Acharia, please do not interrupt the hon. Prime Minister.

[Translation]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : There is no time to tell about it. It has hurted me. There may be differences on internal matters. We are having a democratic war. We want to bring change peacefully. There is no objection to it if you would like to change the Government. But will the country be divided like this even on the question of foreign policy?...*(Interruptions)* This is not the way to rule the country. That is why I feel doubt when you speak of running the country. It'll be good if you run the country.

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : You are running it.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : We are not running it rather we have presented before you a framework of a coalition government and that coalition government is running for the five years even after your opposition and people are showing faith in the coalition government which is a good thing. Congress too needs friends now. Who can now come forward as a friend and which kind of friendship he will show? Will the behaviour of Congress change or not? Anyone who will become new friend will get pinned down again. I think these things are not clear. Coalition governments are the order of the day. Our country is great, it has its own culture and ancient civilization, means of production and it is marching vigorously on the path of progress. At the moment, it is natural that there may be undecided political situation. You should decide which way to go and which way is the best? But there must be some basic things on which there should be consensus. There must be unanimity somewhere if not in the policy then in the expression, feelings, language, style. I was shocked to read Shrimati Sonia Gandhi's speech. She has gathered all the words in a single para.

[English]

"The BJP-led Government has shown itself to be incompetent, insensitive, irresponsible and brazenly corrupt."

[Translation]

Differences are bound to appear with those who work together in the political field for the country. Is this your evaluation about those people, is this your way of expressing the differences? It looks like a dictionary was opened and words were selected after a thorough search,

[English]

"Incompetent, insensitive, irresponsible."

[Translation]

But this is not a game of words.

It is said further.

[English]

"It was a Government that has betrayed the mandate of the people."

[Translation]

We are here because we have been elected by the people and we will be here as long as people's mandate is with us. What do you mean by your mandate?

[English]

"It is a Government that has betrayed the mandate."

[Translation]

Who has made you a judge. You are not ready for trial of strength here, but once elections will be held then we will fight against each other. But what is this? If you want to fight, there is civilized manner for that. Mind the dignity of this country. Problems will not get solved by sheer abuse.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, when I became Minister of External Affairs first time and delivered my first speech, I mentioned the names of every Minister of External Affairs preceding me. They all belonged to Congress party but had been the Ministers of External Affairs. I respect them all, but now it appears that values have been changed and we are

[Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee]

leaving behind all decorum in the huddle of politics. I would say that each charge of none point chargesheet should be explained. You just see the way it has been told. Had done just nothing for farmers and agricultural labourers...

(Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF YOUTH AFFAIRS AND SPORTS (SHRI VIJAY GOEL) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, you please stop Shri Basu Deb Acharia from intervening...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : It is habit of Shri Basu Deb Acharia. Shri Basu Deb Achariaji, please do not intervene after each word.

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI : We do not want to speak, we want to listen. When Madam Soniaji was speaking why did not you remember these decorums?...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : When Madam was speaking then also peace could have been maintained. There should be equal justice, as it is now.

(Interruptions)

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Mr. Speaker, Sir, there is democracy and there is responsibility in democracy. We level charges against you and you think every one should prostrate before you, every one should pay a proper compliment to you, this is not going to happen. Those days are gone. What do you mean by charge? What kind of language it is?...*(Interruptions)* If you have decided to change the format of language, I do not have any objection. But while competing with each other, we should not put a pressure upon each other's patriotism. We should not challenge each other's patriotism, should not cast a doubt over each other's patriotism. There must be a basic consensus, which is not taking place.

There was a discussion on foreign policy and I am issued with a FATWA that we have mortgaged the country's foreign policy. Let them reveal as to whom we have mortgaged our foreign policy and at what cost? Do you think that India is so cheap that it can be mortgaged? Don't you feel ashamed before mortgaging it? What do you mean by saying that India has been mortgaged, foreign policy has been mortgaged... The same Pokhran issue has been raised. Had you not wanted to make atom bomb?...*(Interruptions)*

(English)

MR. SPEAKER : Let the Prime Minister reply. Please do not interrupt him. I request all the Members

(Translation)

that Prime Minister must not be disturbed. This will result in disturbing each other while speaking. Let him say whatever he wants to say.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : You can put this question after his speech is over. how can you put on your question right now? this is not the procedure to interrupt him while delivering the speech.

(Interruptions)

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : It is an open secret that preparations for conducting a nuclear explosion were since in the offing in our country. Is it not true that the Congress Governments also working in the same direction? The reason may differ. We can understand it by discussing together, but you were under pressure. Our Government could not be pressurised by USA. Shri Venkatraman has written a letter to me. He was your President.

SHRI SATYAVRAT CHATURVEDI : He was the President of the country.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : He was our President also.

(English)

"I admire your courage and wisdom in launching the successful nuclear test. As early as 1983 when I was the Defence Minister, all the preparations for an underground test at Pokhran were completed and I myself went down to the shaft. But it was shelved because of the international pressure. the same thing happened in 1995."

(Translation)

You were making efforts in this direction which is a good thing. I want to congratulate you for that. But, what I did, you did not like. You should have some greatness. You participated in freedom struggle first alongwith others. You led the country, it is a matter of great pleasure, but at least, on the issue of foreign policy, we all should stand united. If there is grave danger to integrity of the country,

we all have to unite to fight it out. I remember the day when Panditji was the Prime Minister of the country and Indo-China war had broken out. At that time even the Swayam Sevaks of Rashtriya Swayam Sewak Sangh were invited to participate in the Republic Day Prade taken out on January 26. Even though he himself had difference of opinion with the Rashtriya Swayam Sewak Sangh but since there was threat to the country, he called upon them to be united...*(Interruptions)*

Yesterday Priya Ranjan Dasmunsiji made a mockery of my emphasis on unity.

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : I did not make a mockery but how one would work with Narendra Modi, you must have experienced that...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : I might have been mistaken. You were admiring me but I took it otherwise.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, during this two days discussion one heartening development has taken place. The long boycott of my friend and colleague Shri George Fernandes has come to an end...*(Interruptions)* Mr. Speaker, Sir, it is no laughing matter. He is our colleague. He has been a freedom fighter as well as a trade union leader. To treat him like this and say that he cannot speak in the Parliament and if he speaks, there will be walk-out, what kind of new untouchability is this? Should we behave with each other in such a way? However I would like to Congratulate George Saheb that he stuck to his guns. He endured humiliation and faced insult but did not deviate from his path of duty. In Tehelka scandal, neither any charge was levelled against him, nor he was convicted and nor any explanation was sought from him.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Where is the Commission's report?

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : That report is with me. But it is true that the Congress Party has made changes in its stand. It is a gesture of greatness on their part but our communist friends walked out.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : They will also follow us.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : If a sense of victory and defeat prevails in the mind, God alone can save this country.

[English]

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Please answer this

simple question. He had given an undertaking to the country that he would not come back until he was exonerated. Why did you take him in? Please answer this simple question... *(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : To whom? It is not true. He did not come back on his own. It is we who have taken him in.

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA : Why have you taken him in?

[English]

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : The Commission of inquiry appointed in this case is still on. Why did you take him in?

[Translation]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Mr. Speaker, Sir, it has been proved in the Parliament that false charges are being levelled against Shri George Fernandes.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : You had accepted his resignation then why have you taken him in?

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : The charges were levelled against him, therefore, he had been removed. After all, it is with in the power of the Prime Minister to appoint a Minister. He did not want to come back...*(Interruptions)* Now I do not want to debate on this issue any longer.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : What is the justification of that commission?

[English]

There is no justification for that commission of inquiry, which was appointed after his resignation...*(Interruptions)*

DR. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : Sir, he has no right to disturb the hon. Prime Minister when he is speaking...*(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : We would like to ask the Prime Minister, we are seeking clarification from him.

MR. SPEAKER : Let the hon. Prime Minister reply.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Mr. Speaker, Sir, Shri

[Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee]

George Fernandes has sincerely discharged his responsibilities. Whether it is desert or snow clad valley of Siachen, whenever he has gone to border, he has always boosted the morale of our soldiers which has not been done by any other Defence Minister before. To level false charges without any proof...*(Interruptions)* and then not to allow him to speak, was justice done to him? All of you were collectively involved in doing injustice to him? You people got afraid of one George?

[English]

SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DASMUNSI : No we are not at all. We are afraid of your own reputation...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : Please sit down. Nothing will go on record.

*(Interruptions)**

[Translation]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Mr. Speaker, Sir, so many questions have been raised during discussion...*(Interruptions)*

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : Please let the Prime Minister's speech be completed. The Leader of the Opposition has the right to reply and she can reply to those points.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : So I shall request you not to interrupt him.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : All of us accept that everyone should be given a chance to express one's view point during discussion. After all, we have our own achievements during the last five years. If you have a right to express your views before the country, being in majority and from treasury bench, don't we have the right to express our views?

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Who is preventing you?

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : You are preventing, you are interrupting.

DR. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA : You are preventing.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Can anybody deny that country has made economic progress during the past five years? I don't want to explain it point to point. You know it yourself and you like it. Here, I would like to add one more thing. Recently, I visited China and afterwards I came to Kolkata. At that time, all the Marxist or Communist leaders who met me there, all of them appreciated me for taking right start in talks with China...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Sometimes, you have done well.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : But, you did not say so after my arrival...*(Interruptions)* Anyway, this is not the time to delve on it. I would like to say that if someone takes an initiative to amend the foreign policy so as to solve intricate international problems, it should be welcomed and at the same time if it is not welcomed for some reason and if some mistakes are committed for want of information, these need to be redressed. But for this, there has to be some kind of discussion on it and discussion should aim at evolving some consensus so that differences may not arise later on. Such discussion should take place in cordial atmosphere.

During a short period, I have got a chance to work with many leaders of the world. We are recognised by E.U. We are creating a place for ourselves in ASEAN. We are not only receiving their corporation but also giving cooperation to them. This whole area has always been influenced by Indian culture. We had never focussed on it. Even if we paid attention towards it earlier it was very little. Now, there is a need to pay full attention to it. The circumstances of the world are changing very fast. No one knows what may happen next day in our neighbourhood. I am pointing toward Afganistan neighbourhood. Will the terrorist again come to power there? All the foreigners who come to see me, I always ask them as to what they are doing in this direction. Merely sending army and removing the terrorists from there will not do. Now, there is a need to adopt another measure. There is a need for forming a national army. Unless the leader of various small parties there do not unite and work together, nothing can be achieved. But at the same time there are also difficulties, which we can't afford to ignore. If we keep apprised of the situation ourselves and the whole country groped in dark and even you are not apprised of the situation, it will also not work. To cooperate and weak together is the need of the hour. As I said it earlier and now I reiterate that there will always be difference of opinions in economic matters.

§

but there will be honesty even in these differences. Now our friends from communist party are changing themselves in West Bengal, they are gradually changing themselves.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : You just returned after abusing us...*(Interruptions)* You did not do a right thing.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : I had carried along a gift for you but you did not accept it...*(Interruptions)* Mr. Speaker, Sir, I will not take more time. This motion is destined to be defeated. We can not do anything in this regard. We can not help you out. But you have to help yourself. The question of division should not arise and as you must remember that we had lost for the sake of one vote.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : You lost for the sake of Ms. Mayawati.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Not for Ms. Mayawati ...*(Interruptions)* We were defeated by Congress for the sake of one vote and that time I had told that we would be back again as victorious by the margin of same one vote. You did not listen, you did not acknowledge it and we bounced back as victorious. Now elections are here again and contest lies ahead. I would like to tell our friend Mulayam Singhji that whatever happened, it was not with the connivance of centre as I have received the information, it is handiwork of state government. There is a need to have a check on it.

SHRI SHRIPRAKASH JAISWAL : You are telling that it was all handiwork (Karastani) of the State Government...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : 'Karastani' is a good word. Atleast, it does not point towards any ill will.

(English)

SHRIMATI SONIA GANDHI (AMETHI) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, when the Prime Minister began his intervention, he said that he was not aware if a No-Confidence Motion had been placed at a time when the Government was stable and that they could only be placed when the Government was on the verge of falling...*(Interruptions)*

(Translation)

MR. SPEAKER : Please listen to the Leader of the Opposition.

(Interruptions)

(English)

MR. SPEAKER : Please sit down.

(Translation)

SHRI KIRTI JHA AZAD (DARBHANGA) : Please tell Mani Shankar Aiyar to give his reply.

(English)

SHRIMATI SONIA GANDHI : There were a number of such instances when No-Confidence Motions were placed to expose the failures of various Governments and not to replace the Government. We can give these instances to the Prime Minister. In fact, at least two such instances were quoted in the afternoon.

I also understood, from what the Prime Minister has said, that No-Confidence Motion's wording was not to his liking. But surely a No-Confidence Motion by the Opposition has to be worded according to the Opposition's liking.

The Prime Minister also wondered why we are commenting on the state of the economy. I would like to say that if the economy is advancing so well...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

(Translation)

MR. SPEAKER : That issue is not being discussed right now. Please listen the speech. I have allowed the Leader of the Opposition. Please sit down...*(Interruptions)*

(English)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Sir, the Prime Minister very kindly spoke that we must respect each other. Now in his presence and in the presence of the entire Cabinet, this is happening. Nobody is taking any step...*(Interruptions)*

(Translation)

SHRI RAGHUNATH JHA : Will the Leader of the Opposition read out her speech?...*(Interruptions)*

(English)

MR. SPEAKER : As per Rules, she is allowed to refer to the papers, which she is doing with my consent. Shrimati Sonia Gandhi, you please continue.

SHRIMATI SONIA GANDHI : I would like to know if