

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: The Prime Minister is absent, the Defence Minister is absent.....

MR. SPEAKER: I cannot say anything on that.

[Translation]

What is in my hand ask you to come to the house?

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Why not? Do I have in power to

[English]

When there is such a serious indictment and when the entire Opposition is demanding his resignation why is the Prime Minister absent?

MR. SPEAKER: The Government is here.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI VIRDHI CHANDER JAIN (Barmer): Mr. Speaker, Sir, the following item may be included in the next week's agenda:

The Department of Communications has not provided S.T.D. facilities in the border districts of Barmer and Jaisalmer in Rajasthan so whereas the same have been provided in almost all the district headquarters of the State.

I, therefore, urge upon the Ministry of Communications to provided S.T.D. facilities in the two border district headquarters of Barmer and Jaisalmer in Rajasthan before October, 2, 1989.

Mafia groups operating in the country have ample financial resources at their command and network of their influence has proliferated to various levels. Moreover, these gangs enjoy political patronage.

Therefore, I would like to urge upon the Central Government to take concrete steps against the Mafia active in the country.

[English]

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT): Sir, I would place these submissions before the Business Advisory Committee.

12.19 hrs.

[English]

BUSINESS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Seventy—Second Report

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT): I beg to move:

"That this House do agree with the Seventy-second Report of the Business Advisory Committee presented to the House on the 20th July, 1989, subject to the modification that in Para 3 of the Report-

for "Thursday, the 20th July, 1989" "Monday, the 24th July, 1989" be substituted."

MR. SPEAKER: The Motion reads like this:

"That this House do agree with the Seventy-second Report of the Business Advisory Committee presented to the House on the 20th July, 1989, subject to the modification that in para 3 of the Report-

for "Thursday, the 20-th July, 1989" be substituted."

[English]

(Interruptions)

SHRI BADUDEB ACHARIA (Barkura):
What is this?

MR. SPEAKER: This is about the Business Advisory Committee Report.

[Translation]

You have considered the point just now and you want the Debate to be held on Monday.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: I do, not want it.

(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: You do not want a discussion?

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: No. (Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: If you do not want the House to function it is a different matter.

[English]

I do not want to take any harsh step. I want this House to run. But, if you do like this, what can I do? If you flout all the rules, what can I do? I am helpless.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I had a meeting with you and if you do not abide by what was decided at the meeting, what can I do? I agreed that if you do not want to move the motion, somebody else would move it. If you do not want to do it, what can I do?

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: There is no fun in doing like this. Then, I have either to take some harsh step or I have to adjourn the House. I do not know what

(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: All right, you go on shouting. Nothing goes on record.

(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Gentlemen, I tried to accommodate all your views. I called you to a meeting and we took a decision. Now if you do not want to do it what can I do? I went to any length. Whatever was in my power I did. Now if you want to withdraw your names from the Motion and you do not want to move then it is your wish. Still if you do not want to do it, I am helpless. I did everything to accommodate your point of view but if you do not want to do it what can I do?

I adjourn the House upto 2 p.m.

12.26 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till fourteen
of the Clock.

14.00 hrs.

The Lok Sabha re-assembled after Lunch
at Fourteen of the Clock

[MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER in the Chair]

(Interruptions)

BUSINESS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Seventy-Second Report—Contd.

[English]

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: It is left to
you whether you want to discuss it or not.

(Interruptions)

SHRIV. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO
(Vijayawada): Was any CAG's report dis-
cussed earlier? (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: No, it is left
to you.

(Interruptions)

I am not an authority. In the House, you
have to decide.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY
(Katwa): Sir, can you discuss matters relat-
ing to President of India in the House? You
cannot. (Interruptions)

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA (Bankura):
CAG is a constitutional authority.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Whether it is
constitutional or not, it is only moved by the
Members.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: It is left to
you whether you are going to press it or not.
I don't know. That is left to you.

MR. SOMNATH CHATTERJEE
(Bolpur): Mr. Deputy Speaker, here you
cannot express any doubt about the veracity
of the constitutional position of the C.A.G.
(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I am not
giving my opinion. I never said like that.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: It is only left
to the Members whether they want to dis-
cuss or not. That is left to you.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I want to
make it clear that I am not at all commenting
on anyone.

(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Nothing goes
on record.

(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: If you speak
one by one, I can hear. If all of you speak
simultaneously, how can I hear? I am having
only two ears; that also only on two sides.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: In the morning, already Shri H.K.L. Bhagat had moved a motion relating to the Business Advisory Committee. Only that I am having before me. First I want to put that motion to the vote of the House. It is left to you to accept it or not.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur): Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, I want to make a submission to you. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI A. CHARLES (Trivandrum): We are supporting you for the discussion. Why did you go away? *(Interruptions)*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: C&AG has made a complaint that when he asked for the files from the Defence Ministry about Bofors, they were withheld for two years. This means... *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I cannot hear anything. Unless all of you take your seats, I cannot hear you.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: If all of you are shouting, how can I hear? I am not in a position to hear.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Will you listen to my submission?

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Let all of them take their seats. Then I will listen.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, I want to make a submission to you.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: First let them sit. Then I will listen to you.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Your listening does not depend upon their sitting.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: First let them take their seats. Then I will listen to you. Why can't you ask your friends to take their seats?

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: When you are not prepared to listen to them, how can I ask them to listen to you? I cannot be partial.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I am ready to listen to you. Please let them take their seats first.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, I am rising on a point of order regarding..... *(Interruptions)*

PROF. N.G. RANGA (Guntur): I take strong objection to that word. Have they conducted themselves properly? It does not lie in your mouth to talk about conduct, Mr. Dandavate. You go on shouting like that and you talk of conduct! *(Interruptions)*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir...

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI SONTOSH MOHAN DEV): Yes, Sir...

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: I thought

[Prof. Madhu Dandavate]

that the Deputy-speakership was decentralised!

I was enquiring from you. I have given two notices of privilege motion; one notice is, on the basis of CAG's report it is clear that for two complete years 1986-88 the Defence Ministry tried to withhold from the C.A.G. the files and documents that they had asked for. *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: You have given two privilege motions.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Two Privilege motions which you have given have already been referred to the Defence Minister and also to the Prime Minister. We are waiting for their comments.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: There are two independent privilege notices.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: We have already referred them to the Defence Minister and to the Prime Minister for their comments.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, one privilege notice says that on 20th April, 1987, the Defence Minister in a written statement and Prime Minister in his oral reply to Mr. Datta has said that in Bofors deal there is no middleman and no commission and today the CAG says that there was commission...

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please order, order.

SHRI T. BASHEER: You start the discussion and then you can tell all this in your discussion. *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Prof. Dandavate, I have already told you that we have received two notices and we have also referred them to the Defence Minister and to the Prime Minister. We are waiting for their comments. After getting the comments, we will let you know.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: That means they are pending.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Yes, they are pending.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: What is their explanation?

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: We have not received their comments. The reminders have also been sent and after getting their comments, I will let you know.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, the Prime Minister should come to the House and give an explanation for the untruth which he has uttered. *(Interruptions)*

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE (SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKSHIT): Sir, I have a point to make. *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I have listened to you. Now, why don't you let me listen to her? Hon. Minister wants to say something. Let me listen to her and then you can say whatever you want. Yes, Madam.

SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKSHIT: Sir, I have a point to make. Prof. Madhu Dandavate has asked about the two Privilege motions; one against the Defence Minister and the other against the Prime Minister. You have told him about those motions. You

have given enough time to them to give their comments. Now, we should go on with the business of the House. The opposition members just want to shout all the time as if only they want to raise their points and nobody else has to say anything. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO (Vijayawada): Let me submit my point of order.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I have called Professor. Let him speak.

(*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Has she offered clarification about my Privilege Notices? I seek your clarification about them?

SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKSHIT: Prof. Madhu Dandavate already wanted to have a Motion under Rule 193. I want to know whether they want to have it or not. (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: All of you sit. Then only I can listen.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: If the House comes to order, then only I can listen to the point of order.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: If you want that the point of order is to be heard, then both sides must compromise. If I allow one hon. Member from this side, then I will have to allow one hon. Member from the other side also. If both sides are able to hear patiently, then only I can allow. If one side goes on speaking and the other side goes on shouting, then I can't listen. Let the House come to order; I am ready to listen to everyone. I will give opportunity to everyone. Al-

ready Prof. Dandavate has spoken. You now allow Madam to speak; then afterwards, I will call you. I will give you opportunity, if all of you co-operate.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO: I am on a point of order.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Let me listen to him. I could not hear you.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: First you listen to the hon. Minister from this side. Then I will call you.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO: First you hear my point of order. (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: First you take your seat. After listening to this side, I will come to you.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I cannot listen to everybody in this way. I am prepared to listen to everybody but not in this way.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI RASUDEB ACHARIA (Bankura): First you listen to us. (*Interruptions*)

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE (Jadavpur): No.

SHRI ASUTOSH LAW (Dum Dum): No.

SHRI T. BASHEER (Chirayinki): No.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record without my permission.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Hon. members, please go to your seats. Please go back to your seats.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Humbly, I request all of you to take your seats.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: You have a right to speak on any point.

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO: Sir, you may call the Minister, Shrimati Dikshit.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I will call her. I am calling her. If she is not ready, I will call you next. Please take your seats.

Shrimati: Sheila Dikshit.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Order, please.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Now I call the Madam to speak. After that I will listen to you.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I am not allowing anybody else.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Order please. I do not want the hon. Members to speak as they like. Please listen to me. Without my permission, I do not want anybody to speak.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: First, take your seats. I have told you that I will listen to you. I will keep my word. You also have to keep your word.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Now I call the Madam to speak. Order, please.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Without my permission nothing will go on record.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: How much strain you are putting yourselves to! You are exhausting all your energies. Why are you wasting it like that? I am ready to give you an opportunity and ready to listen to you. If you spoke in an orderly way I would have allowed every one to speak. After listening to Madam, I would have called the next. Like that I would have given opportunity to every one. But you are wasting unnecessarily your time as well as the time of the House. Public money is also being wasted. Please cooperate with me.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Can I put the motion moved by Shri H.K.L. Bhagat to the vote of the House?

SOME HON. MEMBER: No, no.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS: Yes, Sir, you put the motion to the vote of the House...
(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please order...

(Interruptions)

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO: I am on a point of order, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: There is no question of point of order, as I told you. Nothing is transacted now. Only I listened to Prof. Madhu Dandavate and I have given my ruling on that. Now Madam Sheila Dikshit wants to speak. Only after that there can be any point of order...

(Interruptions)

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO: Sir, you promised to me that you will hear my point of order.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I will listen to you also, but first let the Madam speak...

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please listen to me what I am telling...

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: The question is:

"That this House do agree with the Seventy-second Report of the Business Advisory Committee presented

to the House on the 20th July, 1989, subject to the modification that in para 3 of the Report—

for "Thursday, the 20th July, 1989" "Monday, the 24th July, 1989" be substituted."

Those in favour may say 'Aye'.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS: Aye.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Those against may say, No.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I think that Ayes have it, the Ayes have it.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: The 'Noes' have it.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Let the Lobbies be cleared.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Now, the Lobbies have been cleared. The question is:

"That this House do agree with the Seventy-second Report of the Business Advisory Committee presented to the House on the 20th July, 1989 subject to the modification that in para 3 of the Report—

for 'Thursday the 20th July, 1989,' 'Monday, the 24th July, 1989' be substituted."

The motion was adopted

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please, order.