

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Naik, if you don't lose temper then I will be able to do my work.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please listen to him. Mr. Ramdhan, please speak.

SHRI RAMDHAN : Mr. Speaker, Sir, first let an atmosphere be created in which it becomes possible for me to speak.

14.45 hrs.

PERSONAL EXPLANATIONS BY MEMBERS

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : You may speak freely. Whatever allegation has been made against you, you can tell about, it and refute it.

SHRI RAM DHAN (Lalganj) : I was about to say the same thing when there was pavdemonium *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Order, Order. Now finish the matter quickly.

SHRI RAM DHAN : Mr. Speaker, Sir, Shri Tewary has alleged in his statement that I have hurled unprintable abuses against him.

SHRI C. MADHAV REDDI (Adilabad) : Unspeakable.

MR. SPEAKER : It is the same thing.

SHRI RAM DHAN : I want to say that the whole country knows those persons who are habitual offenders. And if I have said anything like this.....

(Interruptions)

[English]

PROF. K.K. TEWARY (Buxar) : You give me one minute.

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : You will also give your explanation.

(Interruptions)

SHRI RAM DHAN : On oath I say that whatever I have said he may repeat it. *(Interruptions)* .. I only told him as to why he should behave like this and because of such kind of behaviour he has apo gised in the House in the past and removed from the Council of ministers. This much I have certainly said. This enraged him so much that had hon. Minister Shri Sontosh Mohan Dev not intervened and made him set Shri Tewary could have gone to any extent. I don't want to say anything more in this regard. I don't want to add anything more to the remarks you have made. I want to say one thing more. You have allotted me seat here and my division number is also here. Still Shri T. Basheer and two-three other Members came to me from behind and pressurised me to change my seat and go to the other side.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I will make the recommendation. You are a Member of the Congress Party. Why do you make a noise.

(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI SHANTARAM NAIK (Panaji) : This is like a school boy's complaint.

[Translation]

SHRI RAM DHAN : About what are you going to recommend ? Kindly give your ruling.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I accept that whatever you have said in the House is not unparliamentary, or it is not an abuse or it has not been said with mala fide intentions. I accept it. Please sit down...

(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI SURESH KURUP (Kottayam) : There cannot be any debate on personal explanation.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SURESH KURUP : The rule clearly says that no debate will be allowed....

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER : Why don't you sit ?

SHRI RAM DHAN : Let me say what I have to say.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAM DHAN : I am only a suspended Member of the Congress Party and I have not been expelled from it....

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : That is why you have been allowed to sit here.

SHRI RAM DHAN : I never say anything. Have at least the patience to listen to what I have to submit. I want to say that this seat is mine and you have granted me the right to sit here. If I also start behaving in the same manner in which members sitting behind me have behaved then there could be exchange of blows and disgraceful conduct in the house. You should therefore give your ruling on it. Why do other Members do like this ?

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : That is why I was recommending. Please sit down.

SHRI RAM DHAN : I want to submit that these Members should not try to attack me.

[*English*]

PROF. K. K. TEWARY : Mr. Speaker, Sir; I would not like to join issues with Mr. Ram Dhan, or to whip up any controversy on this unfortunate incident that took place in the forenoon. I have always had the maximum degree of respect for the hon. House, (*Interruptions*) for the rules...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Order, order. Please listen.

PROF. K. K. TEWARY : And I have

shown the same degree of respect for the hon. Chair.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translations*]

MR. SPEAKER : What are you doing ? Let this item in be completed.

[*English*]

PROF. K. K. TEWARY : Even to my honourable colleagues in the House, I have always been respectful and very friendly. what happened is this : You made certain observations, and I clarified with your permission, that whatever Mr. Ram Dhan said-I am not going to repeat them, since he has explained it; and bringing that again into this will further add to the controversy; therefore, I would not like to repeat the words that he uttered. Of course, you did not hear—but from my side, I must clarify that I did not mean to threaten him or to create any sense of insecurity in his mind.

About his expression that I am a habitual offender...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : No, no. For me, all members are good. That is what I feel.

PROF. K. K. TEWARY : It is for this hon. House to decide, but the track record of Mr Ram Dhan establishes his...

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI RAM DHAN : I have not said anything. The way he has been talking, the way he has abused the Hanjans of the country and insulted them deserves to be condemned,

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAM DHAN : He has said about me like this..

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER : You are not explaining his conduct. You are explaining your conduct.

PROF. K. K. TEWARY : I have not said anything...(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : I do not want to allow anybody to impute motives to anybody..(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Whether they are Mr. Tewary's remarks or anybody else's remarks. Please sit down.(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI RAM DHAN : He wanted to make such remarks about me...

MR. SPEAKER : He has said nothing..

SHRI RAM DHAN : If he wants to open a new chapter against your testimony then let me also reply.

MR. SPEAKER : I had disallowed everything for your sake.

[English]

PROF. K.K. TEWARY : I have already said that maximum restraint should be exercised by the hon. Members because the whole world...

MR. SPEAKER : I want your explanation.

PROF. K.K. TEWARY : The entire country is watching the proceedings in the House. Therefore, from my side, I assure you that I will not offer any opportunity to any hon. Member in the House to take offence to that; and whatever happened, that was preceded by a certain incident in the House. I was merely referring to that. I did not make any reference to Ram Dhan Ji, and I did not mean—I again repeat, I did not mean to threaten him—what I said is this, I merely said: 'The views that you hold, you are not entitled to be on this side. You are entitled to be on the other side.' This is all that I said.

MR. SPEAKER : So, you did not mean to threaten him.

PROF. K.K. TEWARY : No, Sir; I did not mean to threaten him. Not at all. I will be the last person... (Interruptions) Why should I hold out a threat to him. (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Order, order,

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA (Bankura) : He must tender an apology.

MR. SPEAKER : I have heard the two explanations, both from Shri Ram Dhan and Prof. K.K. TEWARY and find that there were some misgivings. Now, I think, as the hon. members have said neither of them had any bad intention; neither Shri Ram Dhan, because he had completely gone by the hon. members' regard to the House and to other members; he did not want to say anything.. Once he advanced towards that, I said, he was advancing menacingly..

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I did say and that is why I asked for his personal explanation; and that is why, in the meantime, I had also postponed it. I wanted to clarify the position. Prof. Tewary, in all good faith said that he did not mean anything. In view of all this, let us close this and let the matter rest here. (Interruptions)

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS : No.

(Interruption)

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Buta Singh.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

(Interruptions)

SHRI RAM DHAN : Mr. Speaker, Sir, you have changed your decision.

(Interruptions)

[English]

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (S. BUTA SINGH) : Mr. Speaker Sir...

[Translation]

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Dinesh Goswami, please listen.

(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA : You must ask him to apologise.

MR. SPEAKER : He has said no bad words, no abuses, no epithets, nothing.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I am satisfied.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Now I can read from the Handbook for Members Lok Sabha. On page 117, point (40) reads as follows :

“If any statement is imputed to another member and the latter says that he did not make that statement, the contradiction should be accepted without demur.”

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : No.

(Interruptions)

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS : No.

S. BUTA SINGH : Some of the hon. Members from the opposition direction on the other side tried to raise an issue about the presence of the Central Police Organisation in some parts of Nagaland and Assam. (Interruptions) They wanted to know as to why the CRPF and the BSF are present in that area.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I had accepted it because there was nothing on record. If there was anything on record...

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : If there was something on the record, I would not have accepted it. Now, they have made me satisfied. It is my observation. If there was anything on record, I would have made him to apologise. So, there is no problem.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I have done my best...

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI RAM DHAN : Mr. Speaker, Sir, what is all this happening ? If you

don't do anything, then this House will not be allowed to function in this manner.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : It is alright. If you don't want, then I will adjourn the House. What do I lose ? (Interruptions)

If you do not want the House to function, what can I do ?

(Interruptions)

15.00 hrs.

SHRI RAM DHAN : This will not do.

(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN (Babraich) : You are not fair.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I think the hon. Member is transgressing his limits by expressing this.

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN : No. You asked me to apologise; I apologised.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I never expected this from you. Look here. What I said was, if this shouting, if this noise making and voice making machine is allowed to go on, assuming I have allowed it, I would have demanded an apology, as I did earlier. Otherwise, I would have asked him to withdraw from the House if there was anything on the record. It was on my personal visual inspection I said those words. If I had been partial, I would not have said that. But he said, “No, I did not mean it” I think it is all right. I will listen to Shri Madhav Reddi.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI RAJ KUMAR RAI (Ghosi) : You have yourself seen and said this. What more is required ?

(Interruptions)

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN : I said this to you not to the Home Minister or the Government. But you asked me to apologise and I tendered my apology.

MR. SPEAKER : It is right. You tendered an apology.

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN : Your** in this way in this House...

(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : You are not even sparing me.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Had this thing been in my mind, I would have never said that he advanced menacingly.

[English]

SHRI V. KISHORE CHANDRA S. DEO (Parvathipuram) : You are treating me in a partisan manner.

(Interruptions)

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN : You have ** You cannot have **

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur) : Mr. Speaker, I have a request. Let not a wrong impression go on record. You have taken the attitude that both of them have clearly expressed that they did not mean any threat or any insult to each other. But, I humbly point out that Arif Mohammadji said "I did not mean any insult to any Member in this House". Despite that you insisted that he must tender apology and he did apologise. But when that Member says, "I did not mean a threat" you are prepared to accept it. What is it?

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : How do I understand this? I do not understand this.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I agree with you, Professor Sahib. I fully endorse what you have said. I do not retrace my steps, and I do not hide anything behind anybody's face. I do not have anything to gain if I am partial. I cannot be.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI RAM DHAN : What did you say earlier and what have you said later?

MR. SPEAKER : Please listen to me, Mr. Ram Dhan. You had said that I am a gentleman.

SHRI RAM DHAN : Mr. Speaker, Sir, there is no doubt in that. Had you done proper justice, I would have no objection and would not have said anything.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I am firm on my stand. What I have said is final. I have never budged from my stand. I have said what I saw.

(Interruptions)

SHRI RAM DHAN : Mr. Speaker, Sir, you do not know about me. I had fought against the Britishers.

MR. SPEAKER : I agree.

SHRI RAM DHAN : I was behind the bars for 20 months during emergency and was never afraid of anyone. So, I would like to say to you.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : It is a bad thing to intimidate any one, but it is even worse to yield to such intimidations. He is a bad man who does injustice but one who yields to injustice is worse than him. I agree with you. I have never said anything out of fear. Whatever I have said in this House I have remained firm on that. I expelled Mr. Tewary from this very House because I was firm on that point.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Why do you not hear me?

(Interruptions)

**Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

MR. SPEAKER : Kindly listen to me.

(Interruptions)

I am saying it correctly that had I some thing in my mind and had I not said what I had seen that Mr. Tewary was looking very meek then I would have been guilty but I have said what I saw. If it not like this ? But an hon. Member of this House rises and says on the floor of the House that I might have seen wrongly and he did not say that from that angle and his intention was clear. In that case, I should accept that.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : After that he did not say a single word. Had even one word was spoken...

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Guptaji, listen to me. If he had uttered a single word...

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Basirhat): Sir, do you agree that what you have seen and what you have said is wrong ?

MR. SPEAKER : I have to agree what he has said.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Listen to me. I did not hear what he has said. He said that he did not abuse and he says that he had abused. But he says that he did not abuse and therefore I had to accept his version.

He said that he had no such intention, he did not want to intimidate him. Coming from an hon. Member I should accept that.

(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : As a Member of this House, have I got the right to say that I have hit Prof. Dandavate but I have no intention of hitting him ? (Interruptions)

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO (Vijaywad) : He must apologise.

(Interruptions)

(Translation)

MR. SPEAKER : If you do not want the House to function, I can adjourn it.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Now he should come in the House and say (Interruptions). Had he said that word, I would have surely asked him to apologise. It was a gesture which I saw. Now he says that he has not uttered any such word...

(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : If you do not want to run, the House I will adjourn it.

[Translation]

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY (Katwa) : What step will you take if some Member leaves the House in this way ?

MR. SPEAKER : He says that Shri Ram Dhan has abused and Shri Ram Dhan says that he has not abused. I said that he is a gentleman and his statement be accepted.

(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO : I am on a point of order.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : What can be done if one makes a mountain of a mole hill ?

AN HON. MEMBER : This is not so.

MR. SPEAKER : I did not ask the Minister. In the case of Shri Shukla, it was quite unfair. I did not delay it even for a single minute. I have not seen it. I did say that when a person says on the floor of the House...

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Had he used some such word, I would have definitely asked him to apologise.

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN :
I told you that I did not say ** to the Minister but I referred to the Government.

MR. SPEAKER : Sir, it is written here. You can see the record.

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN :
I am submitting that you may expunge it from the record.

MR. SPEAKER : I will get it expunged.

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN :
I have said it correctly that because you have asked, I have apologised.

MR. SPEAKER : It is unparliamentary.

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN :
Otherwise, to say ** to the Government is not unparliamentary. To you **

MR. SPEAKER : You are doing a wrong thing again.

[English]

I think the hon. Member is transgressing all his limits.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : What are you saying ?

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN :
But there can be no compromise on this issue. You may expel us but we will**

[English]

S. BUTA SINGH : I take serious objection to the insinuations made on the Chair by Shri Arif.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : No insinuations are allowed.

S. BUTA SINGH : Sir, I am on a point of order. My point of order is ..

(Interruptions)

**Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

[Translation]

SHRI RAMESHWAR NEEKHRA
(Hoshangabad) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, just now he was abusing.

(Interruptions)

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN :
I not intend it.

(Interruptions)

SHRI RAMESHWAR NEEKHRA :
Just now you were saying that the hon.

Speaker is**

Is it not abusing ?

[English]

S. BUTA SINGH : Sir, the House cannot digest this kind of insinuation, this kind of the Chair. Therefore, Sir, my request to you is that you must control the Member. He must withdraw these words...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI RAMESHWAR NEEKHRA :
Mr. Speaker, Sir, this is contempt of the House.

(Interruptions)

SHRI PIYUS TIRAKY (Alipurduars):
He should first apologise. The matter of suspension will be taken up later.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : It is for me to decide.

(Interruptions)

AN HON. MEMBER : It cannot go on like this in the House.

(Interruptions)

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN :
Sir, the Chair of the Speaker is such that even if one person suspected that integrity of the Chair in the past, the Speaker resigned. You have to bear in mind these glorious traditions and will have to make the House feel that you are discharging your duties in an impartial manner. The

**Expunged as ordered by the chair.

House has bad glorious traditions. Such things should not happen.

MR. SPEAKER : Today after new thing is happening. Arif Sahib is telling me of glorious traditions. Are you teaching me the new glorious traditions ?

[English]

SHRI SHANTARAM NAIK (Panaji): Sir, how long are we going to hear this ? The Speaker's dignity and the dignity of the House...

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Gupta, will you take up Bhopal issue today ?

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : We have the Constitution (Amendment) Bill first on the agenda. (Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : If there were any words, I would have made him apologise.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : I expelled him and also called for his explanation. I have done everything but when somebody says...

(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY : One thing you can do, Sir. You can condemn the very move of the member...

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : That is what I said. . . (Interruptions)

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Now look here. If I have missed, then I miss you also certain times...

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : That is what I have said.

[Translation]

But when a gentleman says that I have not done a particular thing, what can I do ?

(Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF FOOD AND CIVIL SUPPLIES (SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT) : Sir, I want to make one thing clear that the personal aspersions which Arif Mohammad Khan is making on the Chair, will not be tolerated. Let me say this. He has to withdraw... (Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN : Now again also !

(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I want to make one thing clear that Mr. Arif Mohammad Khan's making aspersions against the Chair will not be tolerated. (Interruptions) He has to withdraw it. He must apologise. We will not tolerate such aspersions on the Chair. (Interruptions) No, you must withdraw that aspersion and apologise to the Chair. (Interruptions) You are making aspersions on the Chair. What is it that he has got to do ? (Interruptions.) No, no. You must apologise to the Chair immediately... No question of tolerating the aspersions on the Chair.. (Interruptions) You are treating the Chair in a detestable and shameful manner. You talk of democracy. You are casting aspersions on the Chair. We are tolerating this today for a long time. You are spoiling everything for political reasons. We know how great you are. (Interruptions). You must apologise apologise to the Chair for the way you are behaving.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN : I thank the hon. Minister of Parliamentary Affairs for giving me a certificate on behalf of this incompetent and corrupt Government. I am fighting this incompetent and

corrupt Government and there cannot be a better certificate than this for me. Many thanks for this certificate.

(Interruptions)

[*English*]

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN : I am grateful for the certificate given by the Parliamentary Affairs Minister. I am proud of the certificate given by him. *(Interruptions.)* It is ** Government. It is an incompetent Government. Let them throw me out.

MR. SPEAKER : It will not go on record.

*(Interruptions)**

[*Translation*]

SHRI RAMESHWAR NEEKHRA : Mr. Speaker, Sir, he is committing contempt of the House. Those who are trying to throttle democracy, should be taught a lesson.

[*English*]

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA (Mahasamund) Sir, where is the leader of the House ? The House needs his guidance and his assistance. The leader of the House should come here and assist the House.

(Interruptions)

S. BUTA SINGH : Sir, before anybody says something about the leader, let them understand the cardinal principle of the parliamentary democracy. It is to obey the ruling of the Chair. It is the ruling of the Chair which you should accept. Let everybody accept the ruling of the Chair. Why is Prof. Madhu Dandavate keeping silent ? Why is he allowing the ruling of the Chair to be flouted ? The ruling of the Chair is the final word in this House. This House is governed by the Chair's ruling. The Chair's ruling must be respected. The Chair has given a ruling. Let everybody accept the ruling. This House cannot be run through shouts.

(Interruptions)

S. BUTA SINGH : The Chair's ruling is the final verdict. He has given the ruling which is the final word. Let everybody accept the ruling. Why is Prof. Madhu Dandavate keeping silent ? I do not know. *(Interruptions)* The Chair is being flouted.

(Interruptions)

[*Translation*]

SHRI RAM DHAN : We have accepted the Chair ruling but they have not.

[*English*]

S. BUTA SINGH : Mr. Speaker, Sir, no amount of calumny, no amount of gimmickry... *(Interruptions)* can be allowed in this House. The question is that House has to be managed by the Chair and the Chair's ruling is final.

[*Translation*]

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN : You cannot be a mute spectator while he is being insulted.

[*English*]

S. BUTA SINGH : Mr. Speaker, Sir, you have accepted the explanation of both the Members and both the Members explained their conduct and you have given the ruling. After the Speaker's Ruling, where is the question ? The House has to respect the Speaker's ruling. *(Interruptions)* Yes, Speaker's ruling has come.

(Interruptions)

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : Mr. Speaker, Sir, will you permit me, Sir, for one minute to take Mr. Tewary's place ? That means, please imagine that I am Mr. Tewary. I am not joking, I am speaking as follows :

"Although I had no intention of threatening Shri Ram Dhan, it seems I moved in a manner which gave you, Mr. Speaker, the impression that I had moved in a threatening manner. For giving you this impression I express my regret."

** Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

This is the best thing he can do with

grace. The whole House will be happy to accept it. What is wrong with it ?

(Interruptions)

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : We are trying to find a solution, Sir.

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: Whenever such occasions arise, I have felt that we try to walk on an edge of a sword in a way that we down funble because I know that if we did something wrong, it shall not be good either for the House or for the Chair. when an occasion arose, I dealt with that promptly and whatever I felt right, I did it. If I wanted to conceal anything. I would have avoided the issue. But I simply said.

Even then if some hon. Members cast aspersions on the Chair or say that I am partial, I am pained.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS : Shame.

MR. SPEAKER : Why don't you allow me to speak ? By crying 'shame' nothing is going to be solved.

(Interruptions)

I want to say one thing more. If an hon. Member stands up and denies that he had not said like this, is it less than an apology ? Had there been some such word...

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Why don't you listen ? Had there been some such word, the situation would have been different. Last time, when Prof. K. K. Tewary said something he had to leave the House. He did not say anything today.

[English]

I made it. It was I...

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Kurup, kindly keep silent for a minute Shri Arif has said even more what he said Mr. Arif has said

a lot about the Chair. He has not even spared the Chair. This is the reason why I am in agony. Think of me also. I too have a consence. I want to say that this was not such a big thing. When a person stand up and says that he did not do it, there has been some misunderstanding and he had no such intention—

[English]

it amounts to the same thing. I accepted it.

[Translations]

He said it in the House and also outside that he was abused. But when Shri Ram Dhan denied it, I had to accept the gentleman's words.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I did not hear it at all. Had I heard it I would have definitely said so. If he did not feel as aschamed in saying so or did not realise it that he did so if he had felt it in his heart, he would have definitely not said so.

(Interruptions)

[English]

(Interruptions)

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO : It was quite intentional.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Bolpur): Was he going out of the House ?

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : What should I do ? He denies having said so. He says I had only asked him to change his seat. There was no other intention. How can I take action on a word which is not wrong, abusive or unparliamentary, when he has accepted it, why don't you accept it ?

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I would have done the same thing today as on that day. That day also he had said that he did not speak anything against Professor Sahib...

[English]

But I made him suffer for that. I made him suffer for that, I did it.

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY : Why had you to suffer for that ?

MR. SPEAKER : No, I did not suffer. He had to suffer. He had to go out. Why should I suffer ? I have never done anything wrong. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : That is why, I took exception.

(*Interruptions*)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Whatever he has said, I have accepted it. Had he the courage to threaten then he would not have said that he did not say this.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Had he the courage, he would have said that he said this.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Acharia, had he the courage to threaten, he would not have said that he did not say this.

[English]

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA : Let him express his regret. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : He should have the guts to admit his mistake. (*Interruptions*).

MR. SPEAKER : I adjourn the House, if you want. (*Interruptions*).

S. BUTA SINGH : Mr. Speaker, Sir, today..... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA : He should express his regret.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : He has no courage. (*Interruptions*).

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : You may sit down. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAM DHAN : What happened

to Shri Indrajit Gupta's formula ?

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Now you may sit down. (*Interruptions*)

[English]

S. BUTA SINGH : After the Question Hour proceedings, some of the hon. Members were trying to raise some issue regarding the presence of Central Police organisation in certain parts of Nagaland and Assam. You were very kind to remark..... (*Interruptions*).

[Translation]

SHRI RAM DHAN : What you have said..... (*Interruptions*).

MR. SPEAKER : I say you may please sit down. Accede to my request.

SHRI RAM DHAN : If some hon. Member is attacked in this House.....

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : You may sit down.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAM DHAN : Mr. Speaker, Sir, now this is being done. I accept your earlier ruling.

[English]

SHRI SHANTARAM NAIK : False statements are going on record.

MR. SPEAKER : Without my permission, nothing will go on record. I have not allowed it. (*Interruptions*)*

[Translations]

MR. SPEAKER : Why are you dictating ? Please sit down. (*Interruptions*).

MR. SPEAKER : Now you want to be dictatorial. (*Interruptions*).

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Ram Dhan, you are a thorough gentleman. You seemed to be quite gentle. You used to say that you are quite a gentleman. Now sit down.

SHRI RAM DHAN : Nothing is audible to me what you are saying. I want

* Not recorded.

to submit to you that you should not establish a practice that if an hon. Member is attacked in the House.....

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : I have not allowed anything.

(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Ram Dhan, some consideration should be given to the House and the country. I have said this keeping in view the interests of all and I have said nothing improper or against the interest of any one or have not said anything which may be humiliating to any one. I fully intend to respect every one. Giving respect to you and the House will result in my own respect and the respect to every one else. Therefore, when you have agreed, you should not pursue it further. Now you may please sit down.

(Interruptions)

SHRI RAM DHAN : The case is now being disposed of in this way.

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA : Mr. Speaker, Sir, one thing should be clarified. Shri Tewary has said that he was not going to threaten. You have said that he was going to threaten. For this at least a clarification should come from Shri Tewary as to what he was going to do. Was he going to shake hands with him or was he going to congratulate him? What for he was going out? Was he not going to threaten him?

MR. SPEAKER : I have told you that I have heard his version. Whatever he has said should be accepted.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I have no option but to adjourn the House.

[English]

I cannot do anything else.

(Interruptions)

[Translations]

MR. SPEAKER : I have seen that. Had there been any such expression, I would have asked him to tender an apology for that and would have expunged that from the proceedings. He says that he has not said like this; there seems to be some misunderstanding. Now what can be done in such a situation?

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : Then you should say that your impression was wrong. (Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJI : Your impression was correct.

MR. SPEAKER : Whatever he has said and clarified, I am saying on that basis. Whatever I have seen I have said. To me it looked as if he was being threatened.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJI : That was correct.

MR. SPEAKER : Listen to me. Whatever I felt I have said. He has said that he was going to ask him as to why he should not sit in his seat; why he was sitting there?

[English]

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO : Why did he get up on his feet?

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : Why don't you pull him up?

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Why did he get up from his seat?

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Kindly don't express regrets. I hope you do not express regrets for having said that he was moving menacingly towards the hon. Member.

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : I have said what I saw, Mr. Professor. I am not afraid of any one except the God.

*Not recorded

[English]

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Why did he get up ? Why did he move to his seat ?

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA : For what purpose ?

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : He says that he was going to ask him not to sit there and that he should sit somewhere else as it was not his seat.

(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : That is what he said.

[Translation]

If someone has the courage to do something, he does not retrace and if he retraces, then what else can be a bigger thing than this ? Mr. Rai, why are you interrupting ? Sit down.

(Interruptions)

SHRI C. MADHAV REDDI (Adilabad) : If you think that whatever he said is an apology, then we accept that...

(Interruptions)

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN : There cannot be any compromise on the question of honour or the hon. Members and the House. You may do whatever you like...(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : If someone withdraws what he has said, then there cannot be a better case of apology. You said it and you have accepted it.

(Interruptions)

SHRI ARIF MOHD. KHAN : I did not say.

MR. SPEAKER : You said this and

I repeated that. Prof. Dandavate is present here. I say that if I commit a wrong, I am ready to apologise. Had he the courage, he should have conceded that he said that. That would have been bigger than asking for apology...(Interruptions)

SHRI RAJ KUMAR RAI : A coward does not have the courage.....

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Then why do you bother for him ?

(Interruptions)

SHRI RAJ KUMAR RAI : If some one commits a mistake, he should be punished for that...(Interruptions)

SHRI RAM DHAN : Over your seat 'Dharmchakra Pravartanaya' is written. Things of this nature should not happen. If the same injustice which is meted out to us outside is meted out in this House also, then you should come to our rescue.

(Interruptions)

[English]

S. BUTA SINGH : Sir, he is defying your ruling.

(Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF FOOD AND CIVIL SUPPLIES (SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT) : Sir, I want to make one thing clear. He is not obeying the ruling of the Chair. I, as the Chief Whip of the Congress Party, have issued a Whip to him and to Mr. Rai—to both of them—to obey the Congress Party Whip and not to challenge the ruling of the Chair. If they want to disobey the Whip, let them do it knowingly. (Interruptions) I have issued the Whip and I am entitled to issue this Whip to both of them.

[Translation]

SHRI RAM DHAN : This Government has lost the confidence of the entire country.

(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : No. Not allowed.

(Interruptions)**

S. BUTA SINGH : Nobody can challenge the ruling of the Chair. The ruling of the Chair is the property of the House and the House must accept the ruling of the Chair.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I do not find the situation such as will allow us to work. I find nothing except that I can name the

**Not recorded;

Members, which I do not want to do. I want to work. I want that this House should run.

[Translation]

You compel me. You do not allow the House to run.

[English]

I adjourn the House till 11.00 A.M. tomorrow.

15.41 hrs.

*The Lok Sabha then adjourned till
Eleven of the Clock on Wednesday,
November, 18, 1987/Kartika 27, 1909
(Saka)*