

Committee on Public Undertakings on Oil and Natural Gas Commission—Extra expenditure of Rs. 70.31 lakhs on the purchase of pour point depressant and Minutes of the sittings of the Committee relating thereto.

12.04 hrs.

RE: COMPTROLLER AND AUDITOR GENERAL'S REPORT ON BOFORS GUN DEAL—CONTD.

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: I am only concerned with the functioning of the House. I can allow you a discussion. You discuss it. I cannot do anything else.

12.04 hrs.

At this stage, Shri Satyagopal Misra and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Where are you advancing?

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: I am very much pained. I cannot say much more than that if this is the way the House is to run.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: If you want to say certain things, you say it but not like this.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: There must be some decorum in the House. You are exceeding all the limits. You are trying to murder democ-

racy. This House is meant for discussion. I am really pained.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: What is this? If you have got no decorum what can I do? This is a question of discussion with arguments. This is a question of democracy you discuss it. you can bring a No-Confidence Motion and I will admit that.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: No, not like this. I am not going to do it. I can allow a discussion...

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I am really sorry. I feel pained. It is highly deprecable. It is highly deplorable...

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I adjourn the House till two o'clock.

12.06 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Fourteen of the Clock

14.00 hrs.

The Lok Sabha re-assembled at Fourteen of the Clock

[MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

(*Interruptions*)

**MOTION RE: EXTENSION OF TIME FOR
PRESENTATION OF REPORT OF COM-
MITTEE OF PRIVILEGES**

[English]

SHRI JAGAN NATH KAUSHAL (Chan-
digarh): I beg to move:

"That this House do further extend upto the last day of the first week of the next session the time for the presentation of the Report of the Committee of Privileges in regard to allegation made by Shri K.P. Unnikrishnan, M.P., against the Minister of State in the Ministry of Commerce (Shri Priya Ranjan Das Munsri) on 10th December, 1987, during discussion on 'No Confidence Motion.'"

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: The ques-
tion is:

"That this House do further extend upto the last day of the first week of the next session the time for the presenta-
tion of the Report of the Committee of Privileges in regard to allegation made by Shri K.P. Unnikrishnan, M.P., against the Minister of State in the Ministry of Commerce (Shri Priya Ranjan Das Munsri) on 10th December, 1987, during discussion on 'No Confidence Motion.'"

The motion was adopted

14.01 hrs.

RE: COMPTROLLER & AUDITOR GEN-
ERAL'S RE: PORT ON BOFORS GUN
DEAL—Contd

[English]

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Now, Mat-
ters under Rule 377.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please lis-
ten to me. You have every right to speak on
this.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: If you want
to demand the resignation of anybody, you
have the right to speak. Therefore, you can
move a motion. If you want to move a motion,
you can do that You can move No Confi-
dence Motion also.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: There are
rules and procedures which we have to
follow.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: How can I
compel him? I cannot compel him. I cannot
compel anyone. I can only suggest to you
that as per the rules of the House, you can
bring forward any motion. That you can
move and you can speak on that; I have no
objection If you want to speak on this matter,
there is already an item in the Agenda. There
is a motion under Rule 193 which has al-
ready been listed in the Agenda. Prof. Madhù
Dandavate's name is listed under this item
and he can speak on that.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: If you want
to go further, you can move a No Confidence
Motion and speak on that also.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I have no
objection to that. Whatever the rules permit,

I will allow you to follow. Apart from that I cannot do anything. Because you framed the rules, I have to follow them.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: You have the right to speak. I have no objection. But you have to follow the rules and regulations and act according to them.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: That is not my business.

(Interruptions)

SHRIV. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO (Vijayawada): Sir, I have a point of order.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: No point of order.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, I have a submission to make. I said in the morning..... *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: You can speak on this under Rule 193.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I can permit you to speak on this under Rule 193.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record.

*(Interruptions)**

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE (SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKSHIT): Sir, there is an item in today's agenda for discussion under Rule 193. It is listed in the name of Prof. Madhu Dandavate. Why don't we discuss that?

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Nobody is following the rules. If all of you speak like that, how can I hear?

(Interruptions)

SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKSHIT: You have got it in the Agenda paper today. Why don't you discuss that? It is in the List of Business. Why don't you discuss that? *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Now we are only taking up Matters under Rule 377.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Do you want to obstruct the whole proceedings of the House or do you want to participate in the proceedings of the House? If you allow me to run the House, I can do it. If you are not prepared to allow, how can I run it?

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: You raised this issue. You have given it under Rule 193. You can speak under that.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: If you are not satisfied even with this, you bring a No-Confidence Motion and you can speak on that.

(Interruptions)

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO: Sir, I have a point of order.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: No point of order. Let them sit in their seats.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: If all of you sit, I can call you.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Nothing goes on record.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please listen to me. This is the highest forum where you can raise whatever issues you want to. If you feel that the Government is wrong, you can bring a No-Confidence Motion.

(Interruptions)

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Basirhat): Sir, I am on a point of order. Some Members on the treasury benches are apparently relying on today's business where there is an item number ten... *(Interruptions)*

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PERSONNEL, PUBLIC GRIEVANCES AND PENSIONS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM): We will hear you if you hear us also. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: I am on a point of order.... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI P. CHIDAMBARAM: If I raise a point of order will your Members keep quiet then?... *(Interruptions)*

Indrajit Guptaji, I will listen to you but you must listen to us also... *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I want to make it clear. If you want to follow the Agenda, I am ready to conduct the House. If you are not interested, then I have only to adjourn the House. That is all I can do....

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Can we take up matters under Rule 377 first and then the discussion under Rule 193?

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I have not allowed anything to go on record.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: First, all of you may go back to your seats. Then only I can hear all of you. If you do not, I cannot listen. I cannot allow. This is the highest forum. You have to follow certain discipline. All of you may go to your places and take your seats. Then only I can listen.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: I told you very clearly. All of you may take your seats. Then only I can allow.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I adjourn the House for half-an-hour. We will reassemble at 2.45 P.M.

14.16 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Forty-five minutes past Fourteen of the clock

14.45 hrs.

The Lok Sabha re-assembled at Forty-five minutes past Fourteen of the Clock

[MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

RE: COMPTROLLER & AUDITOR GENERAL'S REPORT ON BOFORS GUN DEAL-
Contd

(Interruptions)

[*English*]

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please listen to me. Don't disturb the proceedings of the House. Please cooperate with me. If you cooperate, then definitely you can say what you want to say.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: That you can demand when you speak. This is the highest forum of the land. You will be allowed to speak. You can say whatever you want to. You can demand whatever you want to. I

have no objection. But you should follow the rules and procedure.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I cannot understand why you are doing like this.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: She will say something. Please listen to her. I will call you after that. Madam, please tell what you want to.

(Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE (SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKSHIT): Sir, I want to make it clear that the Government is ready to discuss anything. It has nothing to hide. In today's List of Business, Prof. Madhu Dandavate's and Shri Jaipal Reddy's discussion under Rule 193 has already been listed. Now they want to run away from it... *(Interruptions)* They do not want to discuss it. They have no arguments. They only want to shout. The Speaker took the unprecedented decision to allow a discussion on the C&AG's Report to clear the air... *(Interruptions)* But they do not want to follow any such method. They want the resignation of Shri Rajiv Gandhi... *(Interruptions)*. They do not want to bring in a No Confidence Motion because they only want to adopt unconstitutional and undemocratic means. *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: There is the point of order. Prof. Dandavate, are you willing to initiate the discussion under Rule 193?

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please sit down. I request all of you to sit down. Any one of you can say and let the others sit down. Otherwise I cannot allow. I am ready to listen to you provided all the hon. Members take their seats.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: You please take your seat. I cannot allow anyone.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: First, take your seat. Then I will call you.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Let them sit. Ask your friends to sit. Without that I cannot listen to you.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: First, take your seat. Then only I will allow you.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Without that, I won't allow.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: All of you may take your seats.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Unless Members take their seats, I cannot listen to anyone.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: First, let them sit, then only I can allow.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: No, no. Take your seat. I am ready to listen to you provided all the Members take their seats. First, let them sit.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: First, take your seats.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Once again, I request all of you to take your seats and then I will listen to you. Without that, I cannot. Members on this side are sitting in a disciplined manner. You also take your seats. Then only I can allow. If you are not listening to me, how can I listen to you. I asked them to take their seats and they have done that. This is not the way for the opposition Members to behave. I adjourn the House once again. We will re-assemble at 3.45 P.M.

14.53 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Forty-five minutes past Fifteen of the clock

15.45 hrs.

The Lok Sabha re-assembled at Forty-five Minutes past Fifteen of the Clock

[MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

RE: COMPTROLLER & AUDITOR GENERAL'S REPORT ON BOFORS GUN DEAL—*Contd.*

(Interruptions)

[*English*]

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I told you to

have a realistic approach. I request all of you to take your seats. Without that, how can we proceed? First take your seats. Please don't waste the time of the House and also the public money. First take your seats. (*Interruptions*)

I am allowing you to discuss this matter. Please take your seats. (*Interruptions*) Otherwise, what shall I do? Please tell me. (*Interruptions*) I have no right to ask anyone to resign. That is not my duty. If you have a right, you can speak on the subject, and demand the resignation. That is all I can say. (*Interruptions*) I cannot take any other decision. (*Interruptions*) This is not the way. (*Interruptions*) First take your seats; then only I can proceed. Otherwise not.

(*Interruptions*)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: All these remarks will not go on record.

(*Interruptions*)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I am not allowing anything. Nothing goes on record. Please take your seats. I am not allowing anything.

(*Interruptions*)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I want to make a request: if you are so particular about this issue, you can take up the issue under rule 193: You can take it up immediately. (*Interruptions*) Do you all accept it?

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS: No.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: You do not want it; then, what else do you want? Tell me. (*Interruptions*) You are not interested in discussing that subject. You are not interested in accepting my suggestion. Then, what do

you want? Tell me. I am agreeable to discussion under rule 193. Or, you move a no-confidence Motion and discuss it. Please move it, if you are so particular that the Government should resign. First you move the no-confidence Motion. That will save our time. Ours is a democratic forum. We are the highest body. We are the representatives of the people. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA (Bankura): The Prime Minister has misled the House. (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Then you move a privilege Motion. (*Interruptions*) If you feel that the Prime Minister has misled the House, then you move a privilege motion, if you want. It is absolutely all right. (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I repeat my request to all of you, to take you seats.

(*interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I have once again to repeat this that the Opposition is not interested in having a discussion. Therefore, once again, I am adjourning the House. We will re-assemble at 4.30 P.M.

15.50 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Thirty minutes past Sixteen of the Clock.

16.30 hrs.

The Lok Sabha re-assembled at Thirty minutes past Sixteen of the Clock

[MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

RE: COMPTROLLER & AUDITOR GENERAL'S REPORT ON BOFORS GUN DEAL

*(Interruptions)**

[*English*]

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Nothing goes on record.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Let us take up Matters under Rule 377.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I am not allowing anybody. Please take your seats.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I request the hon. members once again to resume their seats. I thought you might have thought over the matter and you might come back and take your seats.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: How can you behave like this? This is a forum where you can speak anything you want. If you want to discuss this matter and focus the attention on this matter, which you want to raise, I am giving you an opportunity under the rules. Whatever are the rules we have to follow them. You can speak on that. I have no objection.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: This is a forum where only by discussion issues can be resolved, not by assembling in groups and

making noise. If you go on making noise like this I cannot listen and I cannot run the House.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I am giving one more chance. Please try to think over it. I am adjourning the House till Five O'Clock.

16.35 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Seventeen of the Clock

17.00 hrs.

The Lok Sabha re-assembled at Seventeen of the Clock

[MR DEPUTY SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

**RE : COMPTROLLER & AUDITOR GENERAL'S REPORT ON BOFORS GUN DEAL-
CONTD.**

(Interruptions)

[*English*]

SHRIV. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO (Vijayawada): Have you received the letter of resignation? ...*(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: That is not my business

(Interruptions)

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA (Bankura): I am on a point of order...*(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: No point of order. I am not allowing any point of order. First all of you take your seats. Then only I can allow point of order.

(Interruptions)

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO (Vijayawada): I am on a point of order...*(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: If you want to raise any point, first you take your seat and follow the rules.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: All of you are standing and speaking at the same time. Is this the way?

(Interruptions)

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Basirhat): I wanted to raise a point of order much earlier, but you never permitted me. You said that I should resume my seat and I resumed my seat...*(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I want all the hon. Members to take their seats. Then only I can listen.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur): How is he responsible for others standing? *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: It depends on the cooperation of all hon. Members, not individuals. When all other Members are standing and shouting, how can you speak and how can I hear? First, you take your seats. Then only I can listen.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I once against adjourn the House till 5.45 PM.

17:03 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Forty-five minutes past Seventeen of the Clock

17:45 hrs.

The Lok Sabha re-assembled at forty-five minutes pasts Seventeen of the Clock

[MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

EXTENSION OF TIME FOR SITTING OF THE HOUSE

[*English*]

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE (SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKSHIT): May I suggest that we sit upto 7.00 p.m. today?

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Can the House be extended upto 7.00 p.m.? Because we have not carried out any legislative business today.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS: Yes.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: We have decided to sit upto 7.00 p.m.

(Interruptions)

17:46 hrs.

At this stage Shri Satyagopal Misra and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWAR (Vijayawada): What is this? How can you extend the House like this? *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: If you challenge, division will take place.

(Interruptions)