

LOK SABHA DEBATES

1

LOK SABHA

Tuesday, July 28, 1987/Sravana 6, 1909
(Saka)

The Lok Sabha met at Eleven of the
Clock

[MR SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

MOTION UNDER RULE 388 RE SUS-
PENSION OF QUESTION HOUR

(Interruptions)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER Please sit down Please
sit down Please order

(Interruption)

MR. SPEAKER: What I understand from
democracy is that this institution is for dis-
cussion and not like this. I am not going to
allow anything out of the rules What I am
going to do is simply to allow everything
under the rules for discussion on the floor
of the House

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER Please sit down Please
sit down

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER I am on my legs Please
sit down.

(Interruptions)

2

MR SPEAKER Nothing will go on
record

*(Interruptions)***

MR SPEAKER If you do not listen what
can I do ? I can hold discussion I can only
order discussion I cannot go through this
rigmarole. If you do not want this House to
continue I will adjourn the House

(Interruptions)

MR SPEAKER If you do not listen what
can I do ?

(Interruptions)

MR SPEAKER Can I listen to any-
thing ? Can I decide anything like this ?

PROF MADHU DANDAVATE
(Rajapur) I have given notice under rule
388 for suspension of the Question Hour.

(Interruptions)

MR SPEAKER If you listen to me then I
will decide If Mr Jaipal is going to have his
own shouting, how can I decide ?

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER I am not going to be
dictated by any party I am not going to be
dictated by any majority or minority.
Nothing doing.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER. If you do not want to
listen it is not my problem. My problem is

to run this House according to the rules you have given to me.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I cannot allow like this. Nothing goes on record...

*(Interruptions)***

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Sir, I am prepared to give.

[*English*]

If somebody allows me, I can say, but if nobody allows me, what can I do? I am a simple man. If hundred people shout, what can I do? Can I do something? You will have to listen to me. Ask your friends to sit down, then I will see, There is no problem...

(Interruptions)

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Basi rhat): Sir, we have not been informed that our Adjournment Motion has been rejected...*(Interruptions)*.

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: I am explaining, please sit down. If you do not listen, how will you come to know. If you are only to speak and not to listen to me, it is upto you.

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY (Katwa): We do listen to you.

MR. SPEAKER: You do not listen. You are in a hurry. What can I do. By doing so.....

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Look, I am not afraid of threats. Whatever I will do, I will do it properly as per rules.

(Interruptions)

[*English*]

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, it is a pleasure to listen to your ruling.

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: I shall do, but have patience. I have received your motion.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Under rule 388.

MR. SPEAKER: Yes, it has come under Rule 388. I was just going to tell you about this that.....

[*English*]

it is on the floor of the House that I am going to decide it. I am going to allow you to move a motion for the suspension of Rule 32 under Rule 388 and if the House so agrees, then I have no problem.....

(Interruptions)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Listen to me, please listen to me.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: It is for you to decide. Now why are you doing so? I have listened to you. Now you may please resume your seat.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Well, I have listened to you, let me listen to him also.

[*English*]

PROF. K.K. TEWARY (Buxar): Sir, I have also given a motion for discussion.....

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: Let one man speak. Why all of you speak at a time? You may please sit down. Let one man speak, then I shall listen.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down I have listened to you. I have already explained to you. Now please let me listen to him also.

(Interruptions)

[English]

PROF. K.K. TEWARY. Sir, I have also given a motion for a discussion on a CIA letter for destabilisation of the country and many of...

(Interruptions)

PROF MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, he himself has been destabilised...

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. I say, all of you may please sit down. Why don't you sit down?

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: What are you doing, I do not understand? Please sit down. Give your reply when your turn comes. His motion has been received, I will look into it.

(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: As per established practice, I have to.....

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: Order, Order, what are

you doing? Don't you feel a bit ashamed? You please sit down.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down.

[English]

I am on my legs. As per practice I have to.....

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: I have heard you.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. What do you want? Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I deal with every subject as per practice, whether it comes from this side or that side.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please allow me to listen. What is going on? Try to understand the method. Please sit down. Why do you waste time? I have already told you.

[English]

I am going to do according to the rules.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, we could not listen to him. Let him repeat.....

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: I asked one person to speak at a time. He has already spoken first. Now let me listen to him also.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You asked me to listen to each person, I listened to him.

(Interruptions)

[*English*]

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Is he talking about his own destabilisation? We could not follow.

(Interruptions)

PROF. K.K. TEWARY: Speaker Saheb, my submission is.... I think you should listen to me. I have also given a motion.

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: I have already listened to you.

(Interruptions)

[*English*]

PROF. K.K. TEWARY: These people, CIA.....

(Interruptions)

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY: Under what rule is he speaking?

(Interruptions)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: You want me to allow.....
(Interruptions)

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You may please sit down.

(Interruptions)

[*English*]

SHRI S. JAIPAL SINGH (Mahbubnagar): I am on a point of order.

MR. SPEAKER: There is no point of order in the Question Hour.

[*Translation*]

You may please sit down. There is no point of order in the Question Hour.

(Interruptions)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing goes on record.

(Interruptions)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: You please give notice. I will look into it.

(Interruptions)

[*English*]

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Does the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs agree with my Motion for suspension of Question Hour?

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: I have got it suspended. You have now again started it. What can I do?

(Interruptions)

[*English*]

SHRI BHOLANATH SEN (Calcutta South): What is your ruling on Mr. Tewary's submissions?

(Interruptions)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: I will do if you allow me to do. What is there in it. You please make him seated. I feel ashamed of it. There is no

justification for doing so. I do not bar anything...

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You have again started it. If this gentleman does not remain calm, what can I do? Do the people of India send us here for doing this?

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Allow me to speak. You do not listen to me. You do not at all feel ashamed.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Does it have any effect, does it make any difference? Argument will have its effect. Do not you feel a bit ashamed? I say that everything will be done according to rules.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I have already told you that I shall get every thing discussed that has been given by you.

SHRI HARISH RAWAT (Almora): I have also given.

MR. SPEAKER: I shall get it discussed. I have never said that I shall not get it done. I do everything as per rules. Rules have been made by you and not by me. If you people do not want to run the House as per rules, I will adjourn the House, I have no objection.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Jaipalji, you may please keep quiet. If you keep quiet, you will be able to listen to me. Whatever I am telling you it is in your interest. There are so many things on which you want one thing and they want something else. Then it becomes my duty.....

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: We want to know what do you want?

MR. SPEAKER: I want that you may please sit quietly. Whatever motions you will give, I will get them discussed one by one.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You may please sit down. When something is being agreed upon, why do you put some hindrance in it? If you do so, what the people will think of us. Do all of us gather here to do like this? Whatever motion you have given, I will put it to the House for its approval. If they do not have any objection, everything will be all right. The second thing which I want to say is that you have given me.....

(Interruptions)

You may please sit down.

(Interruptions)

[English]

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (Idukki): Sir, we have also given a motion.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: I tell you, Sir. I have told you that as per rules I will ask for facts.

[English]

I will have to ascertain the facts and then come to you.

[Translation]

You have given me an adjournment motion.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Earlier, I gave you a motion under Rule 388.

MR. SPEAKER: That will be taken up after that. I have already given a ruling that I will get it done

[English]

I will get it done. I will just put it.

[Translation]

The second thing is about the discussion. You have given an adjournment motion. As a matter of fact, this subject matter cannot be discussed under an adjournment motion. In spite of that, if you want, I can allow the discussion just now.

[English]

I will get that motion straight away from this side.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Adjournment Motion has the element of censure. We want to censure the Government.

MR. SPEAKER: No, no. I cannot admit anything which is not based on facts. If there are undisputed facts, I will always allow a discussion. In the matter of facts, if it deserves an adjournment motion, I will allow that. Don't worry.

(Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF FOOD AND CIVIL SUPPLIES (SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT): Sir, may I make a submission? (Interruptions). Please sit down for a minute. (Interruptions). You cannot shout me down.

I wish to say, Sir, that so far as the motions given by the Opposition and by our Congress Members are concerned, it is for you to decide on merits. So far as Bofors is concerned, our Government has given a motion for the appointment of a Committee...(Interruptions). Please listen. We want that motion to be taken up immediately. We are prepared to suspend the Question Hour so that we can discuss the Bofors straight off. The Government is keen on that.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: On the question of admissibility of the adjournment motion, allow us a submission.

MR. SPEAKER: No submission.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: We want to censure the Government because it is a corrupt Government. The documents show that they have misled the Parliament/

MR. SPEAKER: Not allowed.

(Interruptions)**

MR. SPEAKER: I have seen all the *pros* and *cons* and I am not supposed to give my reasons, verbal or written, but what I decide is on the basis of facts. The subject matter is before you. At this moment I will start it.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE. Sir, allow us to make a submission on how the adjournment motion is admissible.

MR. SPEAKER: No.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: You have listened to him. Kindly listen to us.

MR. SPEAKER: I will allow discussion on this, but no adjournment on this subject.

(Interruptions)**

MR. SPEAKER: No, I don't allow. Not allowed.

(Interruptions)**

MR. SPEAKER: My ruling cannot be discussed. You can start just now. If you have got any other subject for adjournment motion, I will consider.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: We want to censure the Government.

MR. SPEAKER: There are other subjects

under which you can do it, not on this. You can start discussion immediately.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I do not allow anything. Nothing more. No arguments, this way or that way. Not allowed.

*(Interruptions)***

MR. SPEAKER: No. You do not listen. I have not said "No" to all the motions. On this subject, I have not allowed the adjournment motion.

*(Interruptions)***

MR. SPEAKER: No. Gentlemen, this is my prerogative and this is my discretion. Sit down. I will not allow anything out of the rules. Under the rules, I allow everything and I am going to allow everything. This is my promise. You can start the discussion just now. But there is no adjournment motion on this.

*(Interruptions)***

MR. SPEAKER: I can give you adjournment motion when you are on some other subjects like communal disturbances.

*(Interruptions)***

MR. SPEAKER: No. My ruling is final.

*(Interruptions)***

MR. SPEAKER: If you want to say on this, you can say.

*(Interruptions)***

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA (Bankura): Under what ground you have rejected our adjournment motion?

MR. SPEAKER: You see the rules book.

*(Interruptions)***

MR. SPEAKER: Not allowed. I am not allowing.

*(Interruptions)***

SHRI T. BASHEER (Chirayinkil): Sir, you have allowed the discussion and you have not barred the discussion. We are all for the discussion.

*(Interruptions)***

MR. SPEAKER: Are you going to move or not?

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY: Why not?

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Sir, are you satisfied?

MR. SPEAKER: I am always satisfied. I am satisfied. That is all. It is for professor to move.

[Translation]

Professor Saheb, will you please move?

(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: I have received 16 notices of Motion under Rule 388 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha for suspension of Rule 32 relating to Question Hour today in its application to the motion regarding alleged failure of the Government to prevent the payment of huge commissions in various defence deals with the Indian Government as revealed by the Swedish Audit Bureau's Report on Bofors deal....

I have given my consent to the moving of the motion by Prof. Madhu Dandavate whose notice is the first in point of time. Let the House decide. Prof. Dandavate may now move the motion.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I explained to you, Mr. Tewary.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Your notice has just come. I will take every step to find out what is the step to be taken and can decide upon it. I will. You just give me your notice. I will look into it.

(Interruptions)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: You may please sit down, you may do it later on.

[*English*]

I will undertake to find the facts and then come to conclusions.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Since you have given your consent to allow me to move for the suspension of the Question Hour, under Rule 388, I move that Rule 32 relating to Question Hour be suspended to take up discussion on my adjournment motion.

(Interruptions)

SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT: So far as the Government is concerned, it is keener than them...

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Let him tell about himself. He can tell whether the Government is keen about it. Why should he tell about us?

(Interruptions)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Now you please sit down, why do you speak? You question it, why do you want to procrastinate it?

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You may please sit

down. Look, you are creating confusion. It is very bad, please sit down.

[*English*]

SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT: Government has given a motion for appointment of a Committee for investigation into Bofors. We want this motion by Mr. K.C. Pant to be taken up immediately.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Because I have disallowed the adjournment motion, we shall take up the Government motion.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Only he has the floor. Nobody else.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I will put the motion to the House. The question is:

"That the motion for suspension of Rule 32 relating to the Question Hour by Prof. Madhu Dandavate be adopted."

The motion was adopted.

MR. SPEAKER: Now, Shri Pant.

THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRI K.C. PANT) rose—

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned till lunch time.

11.35 hrs.

*The House adjourned for lunch till
Fourteen of the Clock.*
