

**Plan to Handle Emergences In  
Nuclear Power Plants**

661. SMT. BASAVARAJESWARI:  
SHRI H.N. NANJE GOWDA:  
SHRI G.S. BASAVARAJU:

Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government have for the first time prepared a plan to handle emergencies arising out of accidents in any of its nuclear power plants; and

(b) if so, the details thereof ?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENTS OF OCEAN DEVELOPMENT, ATOMIC ENERGY, ELECTRONICS AND SPACE (SHRI K.R. NARAYANAN): (a) and (b). There are comprehensive and detailed plans at each station to cope with situations arising out of a reactor accident. These plans contain details of the emergency action to be taken both within the plant (on-site) and in the public (off-site) domain.

11.09 hrs.

MOTION *RE* SUSPENSION OF MEMBER

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Bhagat.

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF FOOD AND CIVIL SUPPLIES (SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT): I beg to move:

"That Shri Ajoy Biswas, Member, Lok Sabha, be suspended from the service of the House for misbehaviour quite unbecoming of a Member on the floor of the House on Tuesday, the

28th July, 1987, for the rest of the session."

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO (Vijaywada):  
Sir, I am on a point of order....

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: For the knowledge of hon. members, I have got a written letter from Shri Ajoy Biswas. I will like to read it to the House...

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA(Basirhat): You should not have allowed the hon. Minister to move his motion, before you read out his letter.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur): Courtesy demands that he also should have waited till you read the letter.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: This is his letter:

"During the sitting of the House today, you are aware that there was considerable commotion in the House and hon. members from both sides were agitated..."

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Let me finish.

"During the said period, on the spur of the moment, I took away from the hands of Shri K.C. Pant, hon. Minister of Defence, some papers which he was holding in his hand.

I am sincerely sorry that such an incident happened. I can assure you that there was no.....

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please Let me finish.

"I can assure you that there was no premeditation on my part.

I have the highest respect for the hon. House and the hon. members thereof and I express my sincere regret for the incident that took place in the House."

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Look here, I have not finished yet. Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, in the highest traditions of parliamentary life, the motion moved by.....(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You please sit down.

[Translation]

Wasnikji, please sit down. In the Parliamentary procedure and parliament.....

(Interruptions)

[English]

MR.SPEAKER: Order please. I would like to point this out. Just now, Prof. Madhu Dandavate mentioned about highest parliamentary traditions. I respect that and I appeal to all of you to respect those high traditions.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: There is a difference between what one says and what one does.

[English]

I will like you all not to say something and then do someting different. We should bridge the gulf between 'saying' and 'doing' . And that is what it is.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: Why don't you listen to me? What is troubling you? I want to say one thing that you should understand and do it like that. To err is human but there is nothing greater than forgiveness.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: Muttemwarji, please listen to me; I know, you will do according to your own will. My writ is not going to run but I can simply request. Even then if it happens, then there is no use of forgiving or doing anything.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I want to ask, why do you interrupt? Why don't you realise that what the people will say? Why don't you think what for we have come here. You are free to speak but fifty people stand up at a time.I will be able to run this House only when you behave properly. Otherwise it is not essential for me to run the house like that.

[English]

I will close.

[Translation]

I will close my both ears and eyes. I cannot tolerate lthis unruly behaviour.

[English]

It is very bad. it reflects on all of us. It reflects on the democratic institutions of

this great country. it does not behave us.  
That is what I appeal to you.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Why should you do it?

[*Translation*]

If I have my own way, I can express regret at once on behalf of Ajayji. If you don't agree, it is your sweet will.

[*English*]

I will allow neither your dictatorship nor their dictatorship. I am not going to bow down to any pressure, whatsoever..

[*Translation*]

It is upto you, I cannot do it

[*English*]

SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT: We have the highest respect for your feelings and sentiments. But unfortunately, the behaviour is unprecedentedly bad. That is why I insist that the Motion should be put.

*(Interruptions)*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: I would like to remind you what they did in 1977. They held the House to ransom for two months.

*(Interruptions)*

[*Translation.*]

MR. SPEAKER: I can allow one or two persons, but first of all there should be decorum in the House.

[*English*]

SHRI T. BASHEER (Chirayinki): The same thing had happened in the Kerala

Assembly where one Member was suspended and also in the West Bengal Assembly.

*(Interruptions)*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, we share your sentiments, but we want to point out to you that yesterday, when myself and Inderjit Gupta were sitting in our seats, some hon. Members brought certain papers and banged them on our table. We did not say anything.

*(Interruptions)*

Sir, did you see yesterday, when two Members came here and banged the papers on my table? Did you see that? Did you see that yesterday, when two of the ruling party members came to our table, and banged the papers here?

*(Interruptions)*

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: I have been listening you to always. *(Interruptions)*

[*English*]

Unruly behaviour I have always condemned. *(Interruptions)*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: The Minister of Parliamentary Affairs did not object to it then. We did not take those Members seriously—Members who banged the table with the papers. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI T. BASHEER: What have you done in West Bengal and Kerala?

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: That I have heard. Have you to say something else.

[*English*]

SHRI T. BASHEER: For the same thing, in the Kerala Assembly your leader moved that motion...*(Interruptions)*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Two members from the Treasury benches came to our table. Did you object to that? Was their explanation asked for?

MR. SPEAKER: I always object to such unruly behaviour by anybody. I do not differentiate between this side and that—whosoever is involved, it is bad. Now I have to put it to vote.

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY (Katwa): Under what rule? Sir, what is your reaction? Why don't you speak about the Treasury benches who banged the tables here with papers? Why don't you listen to us?

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: When they did it yesterday, we did not object. They came here...*(Interruptions)*

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: May I put it to the vote?.....*(Interruptions)*

[*English* ]

I have no other option. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY: Before you put it, we have to say something. You can allow us one by one.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Dolpur): What was the motion? We could not hear it here.

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: There is a motion from the ruling party that Ajay Biswas be suspended from the House for the whole term for creating disorder.

[*English*]

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: Suspension for how long?

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: There is a Motion from the ruling party that he may be suspended from the House for the rest of the present session.

[*English*]

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: I have given a notice to you, of an amendment, after Mr. Bhagat moved his motion.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA (Bankura): I want to make a submission, Sir.

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Yes, what is the submission?

[*English*]

SHRI T. BASHEER: Let the House decide.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: This is most unprecedented. In spite of the regret expressed by the hon. Member, he is being suspended.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Not all I cannot do it.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Sir, you have expressed your sentiments also. He should have responded to those sentiments.

SHRI T. BASHEER: What happened in West Bengal?

SHRI A. CHARLES (Trivandrum): In Kerala, what happened?

SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT: Sir, you will agree that it was a very unprecedented thing. You should take disciplinary action against him.

*(Interruptions)*



PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: With your permission, Sir,.....(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Order Please.

[*Translation*]

I will do it. I will give time to you also.

[*English*]

I will give you time. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, fully appreciate the sentiments that you have expressed about preserving the dignity of the House.

(*Interruptions*)

Please allow us to have our say.

(*Interruptions*)

Please bring the House to order

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. I am calling the minister.

[*English*]

After him I will call you. Mr. T. Basheer, I will just call you.

SHRI T. BASHEER: I think this is not a debatable point.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I will call upon you.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: I will call both the sides and discuss it, don't worry.

[*English*]

SHRI T. BASHEER : I do not want to speak. I think this is not a debatable point.

The House is supreme. Let the House decide. The Minister has already moved the motion. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: I will call you. I will allow you. Mr. Saifuddin, don't be angry.

[*English*]

THE MINISTER OF ENERGY (SHRI VASANT SATHE): I want to say a word. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Mahbubnagar): You have already allowed Prof. Madhu Dandavate.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: With your permission I was allowed to speak. Kindly restrain the Minister from speaking. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Please wait for two minutes only. Please stop it.

[*English*]

I will just call you.

(*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Mr. Speaker, we welcome the sentiments that you have expressed .....

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Please wait, Sit down. Do not interrupt.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I will allow you.

[*English*]

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, we welcome the sentiments

that you have expressed about the maintenance of the dignity of the House. Let me make it explicitly clear, as my colleague, Mr. Biswas himself had very clearly said in his letter....(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: It would be better, if you could kindly resume your seat.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please wait.

[English]

I will allow you ample time.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: In this House, we never speak whatever is approved by them; we speak according to our conscience and conviction. (Interruptions) Even if 400 people shout, they cannot drown my voice, let it be made clear. (Interruptions) Can you lend your ears to me?

MR. SPEAKER: I always lend them.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Are you listening to me or to Prof. Tewary? (Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Tewary, if you please sit down and wait for two minutes, I will call you also.

[English]

I will not allow you; I will allow you but not like this.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down and wait for two minutes, I will call you also.

[English]

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, every time I have to begin from the beginning.

Mr. Speaker, I welcome the sentiments that you have expressed about the dignity of the House. Just as there are certain standards and norms about the dignity of the House, there are certain conventions even when dignity is violated. Sir, in the heat of the moment there are cases, when, in the last few years .... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Purushothaman, please sit down.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: If I have said anything unparliamentary kindly put it out of record.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: There are certain traditions of the dignity of the House. In certain moments of heat and storm if some incident takes place and also even the dignity of the House is violated and in that event also, there are certain traditions and conventions of the House. There are occasions, so many, when some members got up from here and went to the Podium of the Speaker in Lok Sabha and got hold of the microphone. The Opposition did not justify it. The concerned Member expressed his regrets and apology and after that the Speaker himself has said that in the heat of the moment the Member has acted like that. But I would like you to.....(Interruptions) I will give you any number of instances, not

(Prof. Madhu Dandavate)

one. Yesterday, you may remember that, two Members of the ruling party came with photo copies of *Blitz* and came to Shri Indrajit Gupta and me.....(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I will allow you also.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: They came to our table. [*Interruptions*]. Not only snatching the paper is bad---I also do not approve of what my colleague has done by snatching the paper from the hands of the hon. Minister---but even if the same treatment is given to us,.....

THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRI K.C. PANT): Sir, may I ask him a question? When Prof. Dandavate says that he does not also approve of somebody snatching the paper and destroying it, is he putting those two incidents at par, the two Members coming and giving a paper to Shri Indrajit Gupta and Mr. Biswas snatching the paper from my hands? What do you mean by 'also' (*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: I do not want to compare. In a small or bigger degree the dignity of the House is violated. I only want to request the House through you, that the dignity of the House lies in the fact that if the Member has expressed his categorical regret for what he has done and assured that it will not happen again, the dignity of the House demands that we should close the matter and therefore I demand that the Resolution should be withdrawn.

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD (Bhagalpur): Mr. Speaker, I wish I could agree to the suggestion of Prof. Dandavate.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Do agree.

SHRI BHAGWAT JGA AZAD: Please listen. Or, if you do not listen, then the same thing will continue.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER; Choubeyji, please sit down, you have because old now, you should not be agitated.

[*English*]

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD: I wish I could agree with Prof. Dandavate. The example given of the podium---yes, that happened in this House, not once, I remember but twice. Since 1952, Sir, when I have been in this parliament, barring two times, never was such outrageous behaviour displayed by members.

(*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: On the question of Kanti Desai issue they held the House to ransom for over two months....(*Interruptions*)

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD: I would like to put a question to the hon. Members. Do they want to plead for the acceptance of this apology or do they want to threaten us to accept this?

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: No.

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD: Then please stop this behaviour.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: I used the words 'appeal to the House.'

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD: Then I would request the hon. Members to hear us what we have also to say. We are not going to be cowed down by this threat to accept their apology--what I want to say is that Prof. Dandavate complimented you and expressed his sentiments in support of that. I also support that. You also complimented him....

MR. SPEAKER: I also compliment you,  
!

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD : Quoting a line "Aho Roopam Aho Dhanayam". I am

reminded of this compliment. But, sir, I am also reminded.. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER; You please sit down.

[*English*]

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD: I am reminded of Dr. Jekyll and Mr. Hyde who was keeping all sentiments of good things during the day and doing just the reverse in the night. We have a professor who talks of democratic principles and democratic institutions but himself hundred times breaks that tradition. What happened to his sentiments yesterday when you were pleading.....(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Let him speak, what are you doing?

[*English*]

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD: We did not like to propose this extreme punishment, but in the light of the rising.....(*Interruptions*) Yes, Prime Minister is our leader. We are not like you who do not care for their leader....(*Interruptions*) Therefore, in the light of growing violence, I mean verbal violence bordering on physical as shown yesterday, I think, there must be an exemplary punishment for the Member, as was done in Kerala and West Bengal Assemblies. Therefore, Sir, we are not inclined to agree to this suggestion. Let the motion be put to the vote of the House.

PROF. K.K. TEWARY (Buxar): What happened yesterday is really shameful and the whole nation is watching us and our wanton behaviour in this House. This sovereign House which represents the will of the people of India, is being taken so lightly and all norms and principles are being violated. What is more important

than this is that an organised attempt and this we must....(*Interruptions*) There is an organised attempt to obstruct the proceedings of Parliament and to show to the people that this institution cannot be allowed to conduct the proceedings. I say that this outrageous behaviour of the Members was not on the spur of the moment. What is happening outside Parliament? Concocted charges, manipulated charges are being bandied around in the country and the same dis-information is sought to be discussed in this House.

Sir, what we are saying is that till you agree to their suggestion...(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: If you interrupt, there will be disorder.

(*Interruptions*)

PROF. K. K. TEWARY: They will not allow the proceedings or the House to be conducted peacefully. Therefore, I plead that the behaviour of the Member was part of that obstructive tactics. Therefore, I plead, as my senior colleague said, Sir, that when prof. Dandavate talks of democracy here, we need not have a lecture from Dandavate Ji on democracy....(*Interruptions*).

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Why are you interrupting?

[*English*]

Please sit down. I have not given you the floor. Now sit down please.

PROF. K.K. TEWARY: Sir, Mr. Dandavate should not forget that when he brought a revolver in the House in the last parliament, the Seventh lok Sabha, it was not an act which was done at the spur of the moment. It was a very well thought out plan....(*Interruptions*) that he brought a

(Prof. K. K. Tewary)  
revolver land brandished that revolver in  
the House. We remember the role of Mr.  
Dandavate....(*Interruptions*).

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. Why  
are you talking? Please sit down. let me do  
my Job.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

PROF. K.K. TEWARY: Therefore, Sir,  
what we plead is, in order to protect the  
prestige, preserve the prestige of  
Parliament, in order to preserve the  
sovereignty of this House, and in order to  
implore the faith of people that  
parliamentary democracy will sustain in  
the country, we must award an exemplary  
punishment to this arring man.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI (Guwahati):  
Mr. Speaker, Sir, what I am submitting is  
not to compel the Members of the ruling  
party, I am making my submissions for the  
purpose of record. It will be upto the ruling  
party to accept it or not to accept it. I want  
to make it very clear that I do not approve  
of the action of Mr. Ajoy Biswas yester-  
day. It was unfortunate. But the question  
remains what should be the punishment.  
Sir, if you look, my friends have referred to  
Kerala Assembly and West Bengal  
Assembly. I do not think this Parliament  
should look to Kerala Assembly and the  
West Bengal Assembly. Let this Parlia-  
ment look to the House of Commons for  
guidance....(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: For all purposes and  
not for only this one, that you note it.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: In the  
House of Commons, whenever a Member  
has expressed his apology...  
(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

AN HON. MEMBER: Hon'ble Member is  
only wasting the time of this House.

MR. SPEAKER: You sit patiently.  
Whatever I am doing, I am doing rightly.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Sir, in the  
House of Commons there have been  
occasions when there have been physical  
assaults. Even then, when the Member  
has expressed his regret.. [*Interruptions*]

PROF. K.K. TEWARY: Sir, on a point of  
order....(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: No point of  
order...(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Tewaryji, please sit  
down.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: Please take your  
seat....(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Prof. Saheb, please  
resume your seat.(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: No, I am not allowing  
you....(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please. I am not  
allowing you, Sir.....

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: What is he doing? You cannot take the House for a ride.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Sir, may I point out that the House has always been indulgent if a Member has expressed apology, particularly when the view has come from the hon. Speaker that such apology should be accepted. But by rejecting it, the House will be casting reflection on the sentiments expressed by the Chair (*Interruptions*). Therefore, my submission is that in view of the apology, no action should be taken, though we disapprove of the action of Mr. Ajoy Biswas.

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Sir, all I would like to add to what my hon. colleague Shri Bhagwat Jha Azad has said....(*Interruptions*).

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: I allowed you. First of all I allowed you.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I will allow you.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I have allowed one. I can't allow all.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: Sir, it is not a party matter.

MR. SPEAKER: No, it is not a party matter.

[*Translation*]

I can not allow all.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: I am not going to challenge your authority. They are challenging your authority and sentiments, I am not going to do that.

MR. SPEAKER: No, you are doing it the same way...

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY: Sir, you will have to call me....(*Interruptions*)...

[*English*]

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: Where is the leader of the House? A Member is being treated in this manner.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI VASANT SATHE: When hon. Prof. Madhu Dandavate and some of his colleagues were on the Treasury Benches, this House can never forget the incident particularly the one where for the so-called breach of privilege of Fourth Lok Sabha an elected Member and ex-Prime Minister of this House was not only condemned without...

(*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: No regret was expressed.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI VASANT SATHE: But they also get perturbed...(*Interruptions*)

No guilt was proved and even then, just because they had the majority, they expelled the Member from the House.

(*Interruptions*)



PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Did Mrs. Gandhi Express regret?

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI VASANT SATHE: She did not because she had not committed any crime. What regret could she have made?

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY: Do you understand the meaning of regret?

SHRI VASANT SATHE: I know.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: She had tampered with the proceedings of the Lok Sabha.

SHRI VASANT SATHE : No.  
*(Interruptions)*

Actually Shri Shankaranand was the member of the Privileges Committee. It was shown that there was...*(Interruptions)*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: He sent a note.

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI VASANT SATHE: The question to-day is, if we want to maintain the dignity and decorum of this House.....

*[Translation]*

MR. SPEAKER: It does not seem so.

*[English]*

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Mistake can always be made. But a deliberate mischief cannot be forgiven. If you forgive a mischief there will be no end to mischief and, therefore, mischief must be firmly put down. And in our magnanimity we are saying....*(Interruptions)*

We are here on behalf of the people. We are here elected by the people. We know what the view of the people is. My request to you is, since mischief was

deliberately, brazenly committed-a man goes to the Minister, and snatches the papers, tears them and throws them---Is it called a mistake. It is a deliberate mischief. If you really want to restore decorum and dignity of this House, mischief must be put down and that is why the Resolution-for the entire Session, the man must be suspended.

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI C.MADHAV REDDI (Adilabad): It is very unfortunate that inspite of expressing unconditional regrets the Motion has come before us. I suggest before you put the Motion to vote, you kindly adjourn the House for some time...

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No.

SHRI C. MADHAV REDDI: You talk to the leaders in the Chamber and then take a decision...*(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

SHRI NARAYAN CHOUBEY (Midnapur): Why you are worried now?

*[English]*

SHRI C. MADHAV REDDI: Teaching a lesson to the Opposition-that the objective of the Government? Because there is a verbal violence as he said and he wants to teach us a lesson, then I can tell him that he is not going to be the only member. Every member of the Opposition has to be expelled by this House before the end of the Session.

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT: With profound respect and apology to Prof. Madhu Dandavate, Shri Dinesh Goswami, other members and also my affection for Shri Ajoy Biswas, I wish to say with greatest humility that what is being said now, I may be excused for using a strong word 'it is shedding crocodile tears'.

*(Interruptions)*



SHRI NARAYAN CHOUBEY: As you do always (*Interruptions*)

SHRI H.K.L.BHAGAT: It is shedding crocodile tears. (*Interruptions*).

Sir, firstly, no action has been taken against the Members who went willfully to the well of the House. Your authority was defied. Again it is shedding crocodile tears. Your authority has been defied by these very hon. Members. Some of them who are speaking now have defied your authority. What respect they have for you, for your sentiments and authority? We know that. They are shedding crocodile tears. Secondly, Sir, as I said this whole thing is unprecedented. (*Interruptions*) Why do they not join us in condemning his action? If they do not condemn his action, nothing we can do for him. So, Sir, I feel that you will be doing a disservice if you do not take action against the Member as suggested by me. Therefore, I request that the motion be put to vote.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No, no.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: There is an amendment to the Motion moved by Prof. Madhu Dandavate.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Venkatesh, you have misbehaved yesterday and again you are misbehaving today. you are exceeding your limit. Please do not do it and this is going to mar the very foundation of democracy in this country.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: There is an amendment by Prof. Madhu Dandavate. It reads as follows:

"I give notice of the following amendment to the motion moved by Shri H.K.L. Bhagat regarding the incident in the House on 28-7-1987.

"Delete the reference to suspension of Shri Ajoy Biswas"

and add the following para:-

"In view of the regrets expressed by Shri Ajoy Biswas about his conduct in the House on 28th July 1987, the House considers the matter closed."

Now, Prof. Madhu Dandavate may move his amendment.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: I beg to move:

"In the motion moved by Shri H.K.L. Bhagat regarding the incident in the House on 28-7-1987-

"Delete the reference to suspension of Shri Ajoy Biswas"

and add the following para:

"In view of the regrets expressed by Shri Ajoy Biswas about his conduct in the House on 28th July, 1987, the House considers the matter closed."

I appeal to the Parliamentary Affairs Minister, in all his good sense, to please accept this amendment. It is not threat, but an appeal. Remember that this will set a precedent for the future.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: The question is:

"In the motion moved by Shri H.K.L. Bhagat regarding the incident in the House on 20-7-1987-

"Delete the reference to suspension of Shri Ajoy Biswas"

and add the following para:

"In view of the regrets expressed by Shri Ajoy Biswas about his conduct in

(Mr. Speaker)

the House on 28th July, 1987, the House considers the matter closed."

Let the lobbies be cleared---

Lobbies have been cleared. I shall now put the amendment to the vote.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: The position is that Prof. Madhu Dandavate moved an amendment to the motion moved by Shri H.K.L. Bhagat regarding the incident in the House on 28-7-1987. I will put it to the vote of the House now.

(Interruptions)

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Are you putting first Prof. Madhu Dandavate's amendment?

MR. SPEAKER: Yes, that is what I am saying, Sir.

(Interruptions)

MR SPEAKER : Mr. Vasantji, you did not listen to me. I said that I am putting Prof. Madhu Dandvate's amendment because we have to dispose of the amendment first. Then we have to put the main motion. So, I am putting Prof. Madhu Dandvate's amendment to the vote of the House.

The question is:

"In the motion moved by Shri H.K.L. Bhagat regarding the incident in the House on 28-7-1987-

"Delete the reference to suspension of Shri Ajoy Biswas"

and add the following para:

"In view of the regrets expressed by Shri Ajoy Biswas about his conduct in the House on 28th July 1987, the House considers the matter closed."

*The Lok Sabha divided:*

12.00 hrs.

*Division No.1*

**AYES**

Abdul Hamid, Shri  
Acharia, Shri Basudeb  
Ahmed, Shri Saifuddin  
Appalanarasimham, Shri P.  
Banatwalla, Shri G.M.  
Barman, Shri Palas  
Bhandari, Shrimati D.K.  
Bhattam, Shri Srirama Murty  
Bhoopathy, Shri G.  
Biswas, Shri Ajoy  
\* Buta Singh, S.  
Chatterjee, Shri Somnath  
Chinta Mohan, Dr.  
Chowdhary, Shri Saifuddin  
Dandavate, Prof. Madhu  
Das, Shri R.P.  
Datta, Shri Amal  
Dora, Shri H.A.  
Gill, Shri M.S.  
Goswami, Shri Dinesh  
Gupta, Shri Indrajit  
Hannan Mollah, Shri  
Iyer, Shri V.S. Krishna  
Kakade, Shri Sambhajirao  
Kalpana Devi, Dr. T.  
Khan, Shri Mohd. Mahfooz Ali  
\* Kinder Lal, Shri  
Kurup, Shri Suresh  
Mahata, Shri Chitta  
Mandal, Shri Sanat Kumar  
Masudal Hossain, Shri Syed  
Mishra, Shri Vijay Kumar  
Mukherjee, Shrimati Geeta  
Patel, Dr. A.K.  
Pathak, Shri Ananda  
Patil, Shri D.B.  
Penchalliah, Shri P.  
Raju, Shri Vijaya Kumar  
Rao, Shri A.J.V.B. Maheswara  
Rao, Dr. G. Vijaya Rama  
Rao, Shri Srihari  
Ratnam, Shri N. Venkata

Reddi, Shri C. Madhav  
 Reddy, Shri B.N.  
 Reddy, Shri Bezawada Papi  
 Reddy, Shri C. Janga  
 Reddy, Shri E. Ayyapu  
 Reddy, Shri K. Ramachandra  
 Reddy, Shri M. Raghuma  
 Reddy, Shri P. Manik  
 Reddy, Shri S. Jaipal  
 Riyan, Shri Baju Ban  
 Roy, Dr. Sudhir  
 Roypradhan, Shri Amar  
 Saha, Shri Ajit Kumar  
 Saha, Shri Gadadhar  
 Sait, Shri Ebrahim Sulaiman  
 Sambu, Shri C.  
 Shahabuddin, Shri Syed  
 Swamy, Shri Katuri Narayana  
 Tanti, Shri Bhadreswar  
 Thomas, Shri Thampan  
 Tiraky, Shri Piyus  
 Tulsiram, Shri V.  
 Venkatesh, Dr. V.  
 Yadav, Shri Vijoy Kumar

### NOES

Abbasi, Shri K.J.  
 Abdul Ghafoor, Shri  
 Adiyodi, Dr. K.G.  
 Agarwal, Shri Jai Prakash  
 Ahmad, Shri Sarfaraz  
 Ahmed, Shrimati Abida  
 Akhtar Hasan, Shri  
 Alkha Ram, Shri  
 Anand Singh, Shri  
 Anjiah, Shrimati Manemma  
 Ansari, Shri Z.R.  
 Anthony, Shri Frank  
 Antony, Shri P.A.  
 Arjun Singh, Shri  
 Arunachalam, Shri M.  
 Athithan, Shri R. Dhanuskodi  
 Azad, Shri Bhagwat Jha  
 Baghel, Shri Pratapsinh  
 Bairagi, Shri Balkavi  
 Bairwa, Shri Banwari Lal  
 Baitha, Shri D.L.  
 Bajpai, Dr. Rajendra Kumari

Balaraman, Shri L.  
 Bali, Shrimati Vyjayanthimala  
 Banerjee, Kumari Mamata  
 Barman, Shri Palas  
 Basavarajeswari, Shrimati  
 Basavaraju, Shri G.S.  
 Basheer, Shri T.  
 Bhagat, Shri B.R.  
 Bhagat, Shri H.K.L.  
 Bhakta, Shri Manoranjan  
 Bharat Singh, Shri  
 Bhardwaj, Shri Parasram  
 Bhatia, Shri R.L.  
 Bhosale, Shri Prataprao B.  
 Bhoys, Shri R.M.  
 Bhoys, Shri S.S.  
 Bhumij, Shri Haren  
 Bhuria, Shri Dileep Singh  
 Birbal, Shri  
 Birendra Singh, Rao  
 Birinder Singh, Shri  
 Brahma Dutt, Shri  
 Budania, Shri Narendra  
 Bundela, Shri Sujan Singh  
 Chandrasekhar, Shrimati M.  
 Chandrashekharappa, Shri T.V.  
 Chandresh Kumari, Shrimati  
 Charles, Shri A.  
 Chaturvedi, Shri Naresh Chandra  
 Chaturvedi, Shrimati Vidyavati  
 Chaudhary, Shri Manphool Singh  
 Chaudhry, Shri Kamal  
 Chavan, Shri Ashok Shankar. rao  
 Chavan, Shrimati Premalabai  
 \*Choubey, Shri Narayan  
 Choudhari, Shrimati Usha  
 Choudhary, Shri Jagannath  
 Choudhary, Shri Nandlal  
 Choudhury, Shri A.B.A. Ghani Khan  
 Dabhi, Shri Ajitsinh  
 Dalbir Singh, Ch.  
 Dalbir Singh, Shri  
 Dalwai, Shri Hussain  
 Damor, Shri Somjibhai  
 Das, Shri Anadi Charan  
 Das, Shri Bipin Pal  
 Das, Shri Sudarsan  
 Dennis, Shri N.  
 Deora, Shri Murli  
 Dev, Shri Sontosh Mohan

Wrongly voted for NOES.

Devarajan, Shri B.  
 Devi, Prof. Chandra Bhanu  
 Dhariwal, Shri Shanti  
 Digal, Shri Radhakanta  
 Dighe, Shri Sharad  
 Digvijay Singh, Shri  
 Dikshit, Shrimati Sheila  
 Dogra, Shri G.L.  
 Dube, Shri Bhishma Deo  
 Engti, Shri Biren Singh  
 Faleiro, Shri Eduardo  
 Fernandes, Shri Oscar  
 Gadgil, Shri V.N.  
 Gadhvi, Shri B.K.  
 Gaikwad, Shri Udaysingrao  
 Gamit, Shri C.D.  
 Gavit, Shri Mani Karao Hodlya  
 Gehlot, Shri Ashok  
 Gholap, Shri S.G.  
 Ghorpade, Shri M.Y.  
 Ghosal, Shri Debi  
 Ghosh, Shri Bimal Kanti  
 Ghosh, Shri Tarun Kanti  
 Gohil, Shri G.B.  
 Gomango, Shri Giridhar  
 Gopeshwar, Shri  
 Gowda, Shri H.N. Nanje  
 Guha, Dr. Phulrenu  
 Gupta, Shri Janak Raj  
 Gupta, Shrimati Prabhawati  
 Halder, Prof. M.R.  
 Harpal Singh, Shri  
 Jagannath Prasad, Shri  
 Jagathrakshakan, Dr. S.  
 Jaideep Singh, Shri  
 Jain, Shri Nihal Singh  
 Jain Shri Virdhi Chander  
 Jangde, Shri Khelan Ram  
 Jatav, Shri Kammodilal  
 Jayamohan, Shri A.  
 Jeevarathinam, Shri R.  
 Jena, Shri Chintamani  
 Jhikram, Shri M.L.  
 Jitendra Prasada, Shri  
 Jujhar Singh, Shri  
 Kamal Nath, Shri  
 Kamat, Shri Gurudas  
 Kamble, Shri Arvind Tulshiram  
 Kamla Kumari, Kumari  
 Kamson, Prof. Meijinlung  
 Kaul, Shrimati Sheila  
 Kaushal, Shri Jagan Nath

Keyur Bhushan, Shri  
 Khan, Shri Aslam Sher  
 Khan, Shri Khurshid Alam  
 Khan, Shri Rahim  
 Khan, Shri Zulfiquar Ali  
 Khattri, Shri Nirmal  
 Khirhar, Shri R.S.  
 Kidwai, Shrimati Mohsina  
 Kisku, Shri Prithvi Chand  
 Kolandaivelu, Shri P.  
 Konyak, Shri Chingwang  
 Krishna Kumar, Shri S.  
 Krishna Singh, Shri  
 Kshirsagar, Shrimati Kesharbai  
 Kuchan, Shri Gangadhar S.  
 Kujur, Shri Maurice  
 Kumaramangalam, Shri P.R.  
 Kunjambu, Shri  
 Kunwar Ram, Shri  
 Kuppuswamy, Shri C.K.  
 Kurien, Prof. P.J.  
 Lachchhi Ram, Shri  
 Law, Shri Asutosh  
 Lowang, Shri Wangpha  
 Madhuree Singh, Shrimati  
 Mahabir Prasad, Shri  
 Mahajan, Shri Y.S.  
 Mahalingam, Shri M.  
 Makwana, Shri Narsinh  
 Malik, Shri Dharampal Singh  
 Mallick, Shri Lakshman  
 Malviya, Shri Bapulal  
 Mane, Shri Murlidhar  
 Manorama Singh, Shrimati  
 Manvendra Singh, Shri  
 Mehta, Shri Haroobhai  
 Meira Kumar, Shrimati  
 Mishra, Shri G.S.  
 Mishra, Dr. Prabhat Kumar  
 Mishra, Shri Ram Nagina  
 Mishra, Shri Shripati  
 Mishra, Shri Umakant  
 Misra, Shri Nityananda  
 Modi, Shri Vishnu  
 Mohandas, Shri K.  
 Mohanty, Shri Brajamohan  
 More, Prof. Ramkrishna  
 Mukhopadhyay, Shri Ananda Gopal  
 Murmu, Shri Sidha Lal  
 Murthy, Shri M.V. Chandrashekara  
 Mushran, Shri Ajay  
 Muttemwar, Shri Vilas

Naik, Shri G. Devaraya  
 Naik, Shri Shantaram  
 Naikar, Shri D.K.  
 Namgyal, Shri P.  
 Narayanan, Shri K.R.  
 Natarajan, Shri K.R.  
 Nawal Prabhakar, Shrimati Sunderwati  
 Neekhara, Shri Rameshwar  
 Negi, Shri Chandra Mohan Singh  
 Netam, Shri Arvind  
 Odedra, Shri Bharat Kumar  
 Odeyar, Shri Channaiah  
 Oraon, Shrimati Sumati  
 Pakeer Mohamed, Shri E.S.M.  
 Pandey, Shri Madan  
 Pandey, Shri Manoj  
 Panigrahi, Shri Chintamani  
 Panigrahi, Shri Sriballav  
 Panja, Shri A.K.  
 Pant, Shri K.C.  
 Panwar, Shri Satyanarayan  
 Parashar, Prof. Narain Chand  
 Pardhi, Shri Kesharao  
 Paswan, Shri Ram Bhagat  
 Patel, Shri Ahmed M.  
 Patel, Shri Mohanbhai  
 Patel, Shri Ram Pujan  
 Patel, Shri U.H.  
 Pathak, Shri Chandra Kishore  
 Patil, Shri Balasaheb Vikhe  
 Patil, Shri Prakash V.  
 Patil, Shri Shivraj V.  
 Patil, Shri Veerendra  
 Patil, Shri Yashwantrao Gadakh  
 Patnaik, Shrimati Jayanti  
 Pattnaik, Shri Jagannath  
 Pawar, Shri Balasaheb  
 Peruman, Dr. P. Vallal  
 Poojary, Shri Janardhana  
 Potdukhe, Shri Shantaram  
 Pradhan, Shri K.N.  
 Pradhani, Shri K.  
 Puran Chandra, Shri  
 Purohit, Shri Banwari Lal  
 Purushothaman, Shri Vakkom  
 Pushpa Devi, Kumari  
 Qureshi, Shri Aziz  
 Raghuraj Singh, Chaudhary  
 Rai, Shri I. Rama  
 Rai, Shri Raj Kumar  
 Raj Karan Singh, Shri

Rajeshwaran, Dr. V.  
 Rajhans, Dr. G.S.  
 Ram, Shri Ram Ratan  
 Ram, Shri Ramswaroop  
 Ram Awadh Prasad, Shri  
 Ram Prakash, Ch.  
 Ram Singh, Shri  
 Ramachandran, Shri Mullappally  
 Ramamurthy, Shri K.  
 Rampal Singh, Shri  
 Rana Vir Singh, Shri  
 Ranganath, Shri K.H.  
 Rao, Shri J. Chokka  
 Rao, Shri J. Vengala  
 Rao, Shri K.S.  
 Rao, Shri, V.Krishna  
 Rath, Shri Somnath  
 Rathod, Shri Uttam  
 Raut, Shri Bhola  
 Ravani, Shri Navin  
 Saha, Shri Gadadhar  
 Sahi, Shrimati Krishna  
 Sahu, Shri Shiv Prasad  
 Sait, Shri Azeez  
 Sakargaym, Shri Kalicharan  
 Salahuddin, Shri  
 Sangma, Shri P.A.  
 Sankhwar, Shri Ashkaran  
 Satyendra Chandra, Shri  
 Sathe, Shri Vasant  
 Scindia, Shri Madhavrao  
 Sen, Shri Bholanath  
 Sethi, Shri Ananta Prasad  
 Sethi, Shri P.C.  
 Shah, Shri Anoopchand  
 Shailesh, Dr. B.L.  
 Shaktawat Prof. Nirmala Kumari  
 Shankarnand, Shri B.  
 Shanmugam, Shri P  
 Shanti Devi, Shrimati  
 Sharma, Shri Chiranji Lal  
 Sharma, Shri Nand Kishore  
 Sharma, Shri Nawal Kishore  
 Sharma, Shri Pratap Bhanu  
 Shastri, Shri Hari Krishna  
 Shervani, Shri Saleem I.  
 Shingda, Shri D.B.  
 Shivendra Bahadur Singh, Shri  
 Siddiq, Shri Hafzi Mohd.  
 Sidnal, Shri S.B.  
 Singaravadivel, Shri S.  
 Singh, Shri Chandra Pratap Narain

Singh, Shri K.N.  
 Singh, Shri Kamla Prasad  
 Singh, Shri Krishna Pratap  
 Singh, Shri Lal Vijay Pratap  
 Singh, Shri N. Tombi  
 Singh, Shri Santosh Kumar  
 Sinha, Shri Atish Chandra  
 Sinha, Shrimati Kishori  
 Sinha, Shrimati Ram Dulari  
 Sinha, Shri Satyendra Narayan  
 Sodi, Shri Mankuram  
 Solanki, Shri Kalyan Singh  
 Soren, Shri Harihar  
 Soundararajan, Shri N.  
 Sparrow, Shri R.S.  
 Sreenivasa Prasad, Shri V.  
 Subburaman, Shri A.G.  
 Sukh Ram, Shri  
 Sukhadia, Shrimati Indubala  
 Sukhbuns Kaur, Shrimati  
 Sultanpuri, Shri K.D.  
 Suman, Shri R.P.  
 Sundararaj, Shri N.  
 Sunder Singh, Ch.  
 Surendra Pal Singh, Shri  
 Suryawanshi, Shri Narsing  
 Swell, Shri G.G.  
 Tariq Anwar, Shri  
 Tewary, Prof. K.K.  
 Thakkar, Shrimati Usha  
 Thakur, Shri C.P.  
 Thambi Durai, Shri M.  
 Thangaraju, Shri S.  
 Thara Devi, Kumari D.K.  
 Thomas, Prof. K.V.  
 Thorat, Shri Bhausahab  
 Thungon, Shri P.K.  
 Tigga, Shri Simon  
 Tilakdhari Singh, Shri  
 Tomar, Shrimati Usha Rani  
 Tripathi, Shrimati Chandra  
 Tripathi, Dr. Chandra Shekhar  
 Tytler, Shri Jagdish

Vairale, Shri Madhusudan  
 Vanakar, Shri Punam Chand Mithabhai  
 Verma, Dr. C.S.  
 Verma, Shrimati Usha  
 Vijayaraghavan, Shri V.S.  
 Vir Sen, Shri  
 Vyas Shri Girdhari Lal  
 Wasnik, Shri Mukul  
 Yadav, Shri R.N.  
 Yadav, Shri Ram Singh  
 Yadav, Shri Shyam Lal  
 Yadava, Shri Bal Ram Singh  
 Yadava, Shri D.P.  
 Yashpal Singh, Shri  
 Yogesh, Shri Yogeshwar Prasad  
 Zainul Basher, Shri

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Subject to correction,  
 the result \* of the divisions is:

AYES : 66

NOES : 338

*The motion was negatived.*

12.00 hrs.

MR. SPEAKER: Now, I put the main  
 motion moved by Shri H.K.L. Bhagat.

(Interruptions)

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: Before you  
 proceed to put Mr. Bhagat's motion to  
 vote, may I say something, because you  
 are the custodian of the House, you are  
 the Speaker. You are the person most  
 concerned with the dignity and decorum of  
 the House. A very unfortunate thing  
 happened yesterday. We all agree. But  
 you as the Speaker and custodian, should  
 tell us whether you are not at all satisfied  
 with the unconditional regret expressed by  
 the Member.

\* The following Members also recorded their votes:

**AYES:** Dr. Datta Samant, S/Shri V. Sobhanadreeswara Rao, D. Narayana Swamy, B.B. Ramaiah, D.N. Reddy, V. Kishore Chandra S. Deo, Shrimati N. P. Jhansi Lakshmi, S/Shri Narayan Choubey, Sode ramaiah, Gopal Krishna Thota, Ramashray Prasad Singh, Prof. Parag Chaliha and Ram Narain Singh.

**NOES:** S. Buta Singh, S/Shri Kamla Prasad Rawat, Swami Prasad Singh, Lala Ram Ken. Prakesh Chandra, Kinder Lal George Joseph Mundackal and B.B. Ramaiah.



MR. SPEAKER: I have already said what I could say.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: If you are satisfied, then why are you allowing....

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: I have already said what I could say. But I am not supreme over the House.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: What is your view, I want to know. We are entitled to know your view. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: You cannot do it now like this. What I have said, I have said. But the House is supreme. I cannot override the wishes of the House.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: Suspension for the rest of the whole session?

MR. SPEAKER: That is the motion.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE :  
Mr. Speaker, Sir.

MR. SPEAKER: I cannot do anything now. What can I do? I cannot do anything.

The question is .....

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE :  
Mr. Speaker, are you satisfied with the conduct of the two Members of the Treasury Benches yesterday? Are you satisfied with it? *(Interruptions)*

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (S. BUTA SINGH): Here is the situation which is most unfortunate. Nobody is pleased to take this action. But unfortunately the whole Opposition have not condemned the action of the hon. Member. Instead of condemning his action, they are trying to make apologies for all. Therefore, the motion should be put to vote.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: After the voting process has started, I cannot do anything.

The question is:

"That Shri Ajoy Biswas, Member, Lok Sabha be suspended from the service of the House for misbehaviour quite unbecoming of a Member on the floor of the House on Tuesday, 28th July, 1987 for the rest of the session."

The Lobbies are already cleared.

The question is:

"That Shri Ajoy Biswas, Member Lok Sabha be suspended from the service of the House for misbehaviour quite unbecoming of a Member on the floor of the House on Tuesday, 28th July, 1987 for the rest of the session."

*The Lok Sabha divided :*

12.04 hrs.  
*Division No. 2*

### AYES

Abbasi, Shri K.J.  
Abdul Ghafoor, Shri  
Adiyodi, Dr. K.G.  
Agarwal, Shri Jai Prakash  
Ahmad, Shri Sarfaraz  
Alkha Ram, Shri  
Anand Singh, Shri  
Anjiah, Shrimati Manamma  
Ansari, Shri Z.R.  
Anthony, Shri Frank  
Antony, Shri P.A.  
Arjun Singh, Shri  
Arunachalam, Shri M.  
Athithan, Shri R. Dhanuskodi  
Azad, Shri Bhagwat Jha  
Baghel, Shri Pratapsinh  
Bairagi, Shri Balkavi  
Bairwa, Shri Banwari Lal  
Baitha, Shri D.L.  
Bajpai, Dr. Rajendra Kumari  
Balaraman, Shri L.  
Banerjee, Kumari Mamata  
Barman, Shri Palas  
Basavarajeswari, Shrimati  
Basavaraju, Shri G.S.



Basheer, Shri T.	Dube, Shri Bishma Deo
Bagat, Shri B.R.	Engti, Shri Biren Singh
Bhagat, Shri H.K.L.	Faleiro, Shri Eduardo
Bhakta, Shri Manoranjan	Fernandes, Shri Oscar
Bharat Singh, Shri	Gadgil, Shri V.N.
Bhardwaj, Shri Parasram	Gadhvi, Shri B.K.
Bhatia, Shri R.L.	Gaikwad, Shri Udaysingrao
Bhosale, Shri Prataprao B.	Gamit, Shri C.D.
Bhoye, Shri R.M.	Gavit, Shri Manikrao Hodlya
Bhoye, Shri S.S.	Gehlot, Shri Ashok
Bhumij, Shri Haren	Gholap, Shri S.G.
Bhuria, Shri Dileep Singh	Ghorpade, Shri M.Y.
Birbal, Shri	Ghosal, Shri Debi
Birendra Singh, Rao	Ghosh, Shri Bimal Kanti
Birinder Singh, Shri	Ghosh, Shri Tarun Kanti
Brahma Dutt, Shri	Gohil, Shri G.B.
Budania, Shri Narendra	Gomango, Shri Giridhar
Bundela, Shri Sujjan Singh	Gopeshwar, Shri
Buta Singh, S.	Gowda, Shri H.N. Nanje
Chandrashankar, Shrimati M.	Guha, Dr. Phulrenu
Chandrashekarappa, Shri T.V.	Gupta, Shri Janak Raj
Chandresb Kumari, Shrimati	Gupta, Shrimati Prabhawati
Charles, Shri A.	Halder, Prof. M.R.
Chaturvedi, Shri Naresh Chandra	Jagannath Prasad, Shri
Chaturvedi, Shrimati Vidyavati	Jagathrakshakan, Dr. S.
Chaudhary, Shri Manphool Singh	Jaidéep Singh, Shri
Chaudhry, Shri Kamal	Jain, Shri Nihal Singh
Chavan, Shri Ashok Shankarrao	Jangde, Shri Khelan Ram
Chavan, Shrimati Premalabai	Jatav, Shri Kammodilal
Choudhari, Shrimati Usha	Jayamohan, Shri A.
Choudhary, Shri Jagannath	Jeevarathinam, Shri R.
Choudhary, Shri Chandlal	Jena, Shri Chintamani
Choudhury, Shri A.B.A. Ghani Khan	Jhikram, Shri M.L.
Dabhi, Shri Ajitsinh	Jitendra Prasada, Shri
Dalbir Singh, Ch.	Jujhar Singh, Shri
Dalbir Singh, Shri	Kamal Nath, Shri
Dalwai, Shri Hussain	Kamat, Shri Gurudas
Damor, Shri Somjibhai	Kamble, Shri Arvind Tulshiram
Das, Shri Anadi Charan	Kamla Kumari, Kumari
Das, Shri Bipin Pal	Kamson, Prof. Meijinlung
Das, Shri Sudarsan	Kaul, Shrimati Sheila
Dennis, Shri N.	Kaushal, Shri Jagan Nath
Deora, Shri Murli	Ken, Shri Lala Ram
Dev, Shri Sontosh Mohan	Keyur Bhushan, Shri
Devarajan, Shri B.	Khan, Shri Aslam Sher
Devi, Prof. Chandra Bhanu	Khan, Shri Khurshid Alam
Dhariwal, Shri Shanti	Khan, Shri Rahim
Digal, Shri Radhakanta	Khan, Shri Zulfiquar Ali
Dighe, Shri Sharad	Khattari, Shri Nirmal
Digvijay Singh, Shri	Khirhar, Shri R.S.
Dikshit, Shrimati Sheila	Kidwai, Shrimati Mohsina
Dogra, Shri G.L.	Kisku, Shri Prithvi Chand

Konyak, Shri Chingwang  
 Krishna Kumar, Shri S.  
 Krishna Singh, Shri  
 Kshirsagar, Shrimati Kesharbai  
 Kuchan, Shri Gangadhar S.  
 Kujur, Shri Maurice  
 Kumaramangalam, Shri P.R.  
 Kunjambu, Shri  
 Kuppaswamy, Shri C.K.  
 Kurien, Prof. P.J.  
 Lachchhi Ram, Shri  
 Lal Duhoma, Shri  
 Law, Shri Asutosh  
 Lowang, Shri Wangpha  
 Madhuree Singh, Shrimati  
 Mahabir Prasad, Shri  
 Mahajan, Shri Y.S.  
 Makwana, Shri Narsinh  
 Malik, Shri Dharampal Singh  
 Mallick, Shri Lakshman  
 Malviya, Shri Bapulal  
 Mane, Shri Murlidhar  
 Manorama Singh, Shrimati  
 Manvendra Singh, Shri  
 Mehta, Shri Haroobhai  
 Meira Kumar, Shrimati  
 Mishra, Shri G.S.  
 Mishra, Dr. Prabhat Kumar  
 Mishra, Shri Ram Nagina  
 Mishra, Shri Umakant  
 Modi, Shri Vishnu  
 Mohandas, Shri K.  
 Mohanty, Shri Brajamohan  
 More, Prof. Ramkrishna  
 Mukhopadhyay, Shri Ananda Gopal  
 Murmu, Shri Sidha Lal  
 Murthy, Shri M.V. Chandrashekara  
 Mushran, Shri Ajay  
 Muttemwar, Shri Vilas  
 Naik, Shri G. Devaraya  
 Naik, Shri Shantaram  
 Naikar, Shri D.K.  
 Namgyal, Shri P.  
 Narayanan, Shri K.R.  
 Natarajan, Shri K.R.  
 Nawal Prabhakar, Shrimati Sunderwati  
 Neekhra, Shri Rameshwar  
 Negi, Shri Chandra Mohan Singh  
 Netam, Shri Arvind  
 Odedra, Shri Bharat Kumar  
 Odeyar, Shri Channaiah

Oraon, Shrimati Sumati  
 Pakeer Mohamed, Shri E.S.M.  
 Pandey, Shri Madan  
 Pandey, Shri Manoj  
 Panigrahi, Shri Chintamani  
 Panigrahi, Shri Sriballav  
 Panja, Shri A.K.  
 Pant, Shri K.C.  
 Panwar, Shri Satyanarayan  
 Parashar, Prof. Narain Chand  
 Pardhi, Shri Kesharao  
 Paswan, Shri Ram Bhagat  
 Patel, Shri Ahmed M.  
 Patel, Shri Mohanbhai  
 Patel, Shri Ram Pujan  
 Patel, Shri U.H.  
 Pathak, Shri Chandra Kishore  
 Patil, Shri Balasaheb Vikhe  
 Patil, Shri Prakash V.  
 Patil, Shri Shivraj V.  
 Patil, Shri Veerendra  
 Patil, Shri Yashwantrao Gadakh  
 Patnaik, Shrimati Jayanti  
 Pawar, Shri Balasaheb  
 Peruman, Dr. P. Vallal  
 Poojary, Shri Janardhana  
 Potdukhe, Shri Shantaram  
 Pradhan, Shri K.N.  
 Pradhani, Shri K.  
 Puran Chandra, Shri  
 Purohit, Shri Banwari Lal  
 Purushothaman, Shri Vakkom  
 Pushpa Devi, Kumari  
 Qureshi, Shri Aziz  
 Reghuraj Singh, Chaudhary  
 Rai, Shri I. Rama  
 Rai, Shri Raj Kumar  
 Raj Karan Singh, Shri  
 Rajeshwaran, Dr. V.  
 Rajhans, Dr. G.S.  
 Ram, Shri Ram Ratan  
 Ram, Shri Ramswaroop  
 Ram Awadh Prasad, Shri  
 Ram Prakash, Ch.  
 Ram Samujhawan, Shri  
 Ram Singh, Shri  
 Ramachandran, Shri Mullappally  
 Ramaiah, Shri Sode  
 Ramamurthy, Shri K.  
 Rampal Singh, Shri  
 Rana Vir Singh, Shri  
 Ranganath, Shri K.H.

Rao, Shri J. Chokka  
 Rao, Shri J. Vengala  
 Rao, Shri K.S.  
 Rao, Shri V. Krishna  
 Rath, Shri Somnath  
 Rathod, Shri Uttam  
 Ratnam, Shri N. Venkata  
 Raut, Shri Bhola  
 Ravami, Shri Navin  
 Sahu, Shri Shiv Prasad  
 Sait, Shri Azeez  
 Sakargaym, Shri Kalicharan  
 Salahuddin, Shri  
 Sangma, Shri P.A.  
 Sankhwar, Shri Ashkaran  
 Satyendra Chandra, Shri  
 Sathe, Shri Vasant  
 Scindia, Shri Madhavrao  
 Sen, Shri Bholanath  
 Sethi, Shri Ananta Prasad  
 Sethi, Shri P.C.  
 Shah, Shri Anoopchand  
 Shailesh, Dr. B.L.  
 Shaktawat, Prof. Nirmala Kumari  
 Shankaranand, Shri B.  
 Shanmugam, Shri P.  
 Sharma, Shri Chiranji Lal  
 Sharma, Shri Nand Kishore  
 Sharma, Shri Nawal Kishore  
 Sharma, Shri Pratap Bhanu  
 Shastri, Shri Hari Krishna  
 Shervani, Shri Saleem I.  
 Shingda, Shri D.B.  
 Shivendra Bahadur Singh, Shri  
 Siddiq, Shri Hafiz Mohd.  
 Sidnal, Shri S.B.  
 Singaravadivel, Shri S.  
 Singh, Shri Chandra Pratap Narain  
 Singh, Shri K.N.  
 Singh, Shri Kamla Prasad  
 Singh, Shri Krishna Pratap  
 Singh, Shri Lal Vijay Pratap  
 Singh, Shri N. Tombi  
 Singh, Shri Santosh Kumar  
 Sinha, Shri Atish Chandra  
 Sinha, Shrimati Kishori  
 Sinha, Shriamti Ram Dulari  
 Sinha, Shri Satyendra Narayan  
 Sodi, Shri Mankuram  
 Solanki, Shri Kalyan Singh  
 Soren, Shri Harihar  
 Soundararajan, Shri N.

Saparrow, Shri R.S.  
 Sreenivasa Prasad, Shri V.  
 Subburaman, Shri A.G.  
 Sukh Ram, Shri  
 Sukhadia, Shrimati Indubala  
 Sukhbuns Kaur, Shrimati  
 Sultanpuri, Shri K.D.  
 Suman, Shri R.F.  
 Sundararaj, Shri N.  
 Surendra Pal Singh, Shri  
 Suryawanshi, Shri Narsing  
 Swami Prasad Singh, Shri  
 Swell, Shri G.G.  
 Tariq Anwar, Shri  
 Tewary, Prof. K.K.  
 Thakkar, Shrimati Usha  
 Thakur, Shri C.P.  
 Thambi Durai, Shri M.  
 Thangaraju, Shri S.  
 Thara Devi, Kumari D.K.  
 Thomas, Prof. K.V.  
 Thorat, Shri Bhausaheb  
 Thungon, Shri P.K.  
 Tigga, Shri Simon  
 Tilakdhari Singh, Shri  
 Tripathi, Shrimati Chandra  
 Tripathi, Dr. Chandra Shekhar  
 Tytler, Shri Jagdish  
 Vairale, Shri Madhusudan  
 Vanakar, Shri Punam Chand Mithabhai  
 Verma, Dr. C.S.  
 Verma, Shrimati Usha  
 Vijayaraghavan, Shri V.S.  
 Vir Sen, Shri  
 Vyas, Shri Girdhari Lal  
 Wasnik, Shri Mukul  
 Yadav, Shri R.N.  
 Yadav, Shri Ram Singh  
 Yadav, Shri Shyam Lal  
 Yadava, Shri D.P.  
 Yogesh, Shri Yogeshwar Prasad  
 Zainul Basher, Shri

#### NOES

Acharia, Shri Basudeb  
 Appalanarasimham, Shri P.  
 Banatwalla, Sri G.M.  
 Barman, Shri Palas  
 Bhandari, Shrimati D.K.  
 Bhattam, Shri Srirama Murty  
 Biswas, Shri Ajoy

Chatterjee, Shri Somnath  
 Choubey, Shri Narayan  
 Chowdhary, Shri Saifuddin  
 Dandavate, Prof. Madhu  
 Das, Shri R.P.  
 Deo, Shri V. Kishore Chandra S.  
 Gill, Shri M.S.  
 Goswami, Shri Dinesh  
 Hannan Mollah, Shri  
 Jhansi Lakshmi, Shrimati N.P.  
 Kakade, Shri Sambhajirao  
 \*Kinder, Lal, Shri  
 Kurup, Shri Suresh  
 Mahata, Shri Chitta  
 Mandal, Shri Sanat Kumar  
 Masudal Hossain, Shri Syed  
 Mishra, Shri Vijay Kumar  
 Mukherjee, Shrimati Geeta  
 Patil, Shri D.B.  
 Raju, Shri Vijaya Kumar  
 Rao, Shri A.J.V.B. Maheswara  
 Rao, Dr. G. Vijaya Rama  
 Rao, Shri Srihari  
 Rao, Shri V. Sobhanadreeswara  
 Reddi, Shri C. Madhav  
 Reddy, Shri C. Janga  
 Reddy, Shri E. Ayyapu  
 Reddy, Shri K. Ramachandra  
 Reddy, Shri S. Jaipal  
 Riyan, Shri Baju Ban  
 Roy, Dr. Sudhir  
 Roypradhan, Shri Amar  
 Sait, Shri Ebrahim Sulaiman  
 Shahabuddin, Shri Syed  
 Swamy, Shri D. Narayana  
 Tanti, Shri Bhadreswar

Tulsiram, Shri V.  
 Yadav, Shri Vijoy Kumar

\* Wrongly voted for NOES

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Subject to correction,  
 the result \* of the Division is:

AYES : 326

NOES : 45

*The Motion was Adopted*

MR. SPEAKER: Now papers to be laid  
 on the Table. Shri Arjun Singh.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Sir, what  
 about the privilege motion?

(Interruptions)

12.05 hrs.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

[English]

**Profit and Loss Account and  
 Balancesheet of Department of  
 Communications for 1985-86.**

THE MINISTER OF COMMUNICA-  
 TIONS (SHRI ARJUN SINGH): I beg to lay  
 on the Table a copy of the Profit and Loss  
 Account and Balance Sheet (on  
 accrual basis) of the Department of  
 Telecommunications for the year 1985-86

The following Members also recorded their votes:

\*Wrongly voted for NOES.

**AYES:** Shrimati Krishna Saha, Shrimati Vijayanthimala Bali, Shrimati Abida Ahmed,  
 Shrimati Shanti Devi, Sarvashree Jagannath pattanaik, Kamaia Prasad Rawat, Nityanand  
 Mishra, Kunwar Ram, Shrimati Usha Rani Tomar, S/Shri Yashpal Singh, Akhtar Hasan,  
 Sripati Mishra, Virldhi Chandar Jain, Ch. Sunder Singh, S/Shri Prakash Chandra, M  
 Mahalingam, Kinder Lal and George Joseph Mundackal.

**NOES:** Dr. Datta Samant, Sarvashree Amal Datta, Bazawada Papi Reddy, Pius Tiraky,  
 Ajit Kumar Saha, N. Venkata Ratnam, V.S. Krishna Iyer, D.N. Reddy, Dr. T. Kalpana Devi,  
 S/Shri Mohd. Mahfooz Ali Khan, Ram Bahadur Singh, B.N. Reddy, P. Penchalliah, G.  
 Bhoopathy, M. Raghuma Reddy, Thampan Thomas, Katuri Narayana Swamy, Manik  
 Reddy, Dr. chinta Mohan, S/Shree Sode Ramaiah, Gadahar Saha, C. Sambu, Gokul  
 Saikia, H.A. Dora, Gopal Krishna Thota, Ramashray Prasad Singh, Dr. V. Venkatesh,  
 Prof. Parag Chaliha, Shri Saifuddin Ahmed, A.K. Patel and Ram Narain Singh.