

[Sh. Salman Khursheed]

land cultivable in Maharashtra. Similar efforts can be made in Rajasthan and Gujarat. Until we increase the export and earn foreign exchange, we would not be able to import things which are necessary for the health of our children in the country. Export is made not to make personal gains but to satisfy the basic needs of the people and to purchase things which are required in the country. Our policy is to establish a balance between export and import.

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN : The question is:

"That the Bill, as amended, be passed."

The motion was adopted.

17.05 hrs.

BHOPAL GAS LEAK DISASTER (PROCESSING OF CLAIMS) AMENDMENT BILL

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, we shall take up the next item, the Bhopal Gas Leak Disaster (Processing of Claims) Amendment Bill. Dr. Chinta Mohan.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF CHEMICALS AND FERTILIZERS (DR. CHINTA MOHAN): Sir, I beg to move:

"That the Bill to amend the Bhopal Gas Leak Disaster (Processing of Claims) Act, 1985, be taken into consideration."

I would like to say a few words as to why we are introducing this Bill in Parliament today. The Bhopal Gas Leak Disaster had taken place in December, 1984. This is one of the worst industrial disaster in this country

and a lot of people had died in that disaster. Immediately, the relief operations started. After that, in month of October, 1991, the Supreme Court had given a judgment after a prolonged legal battle. They had given for months time to the Government to start the adjudication process. By the end of February, 1992, we started the adjudication process. We have started the Court proceedings, we have appointed a Welfare Commissioner and we have appointed a Deputy Commissioner also. We have given them permission to appoint about 1,000 people to start the adjudication process, as early as possible and the Government also has given indicative guidelines.

Sir, an amount of Rs. 1,400 crores is lying in the Reserve Bank of India. The Government had received a number of complaints that there is some delay in the disbursement of this compensation amount to the victims. Now, we have decided that there should not be any further delay in the disbursement of compensation amount to the victims. The Welfare Commissioner is sitting in Bhopal and the Government is functioning from Delhi and that is why, the Government is deciding to give more powers to the Welfare Commissioner. Therefore, we are introducing this Bill today, for the consideration of this House. If the hon. Members want to say anything about this Bill, the Government would very much like to know about it. With these few words, I move the Bill.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Motion moved:

"That the Bill to amend the Bhopal Gas Leak Disaster (Processing of Claims) Act, 1985, be taken into consideration."

There are some amendments to the motion for consideration.

Shri Mohan Singh—Not present.

Shri Girdhari Lal Bhargava—Not present.

Shri Dau Dayal Joshi.

SHRI. DADU DAYAL JOSHI (Kota):
Sir, I beg to move:

"That the Bill be circulated for the purpose of eliciting opinion thereon by the 20th October, 1992." (3)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Prof. Rasa Singh Rawat.

PROF. RASA SINGH RAWAT (Ajmer):
Sir, I beg to move:

"That the Bill be circulated for the purpose of eliciting opinion thereon by the 21st October, 1992." (4)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Shri Rajendra Agnihotri—Not present.

Shri Harin Pathak—Not present.

SHRI SUSHIL CHANDRA VERMA (Bhopal): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I thank you for giving me this opportunity to make my submission in regard to the amending Bill that is proposed to the Bhopal Gas Leak Disaster Act, 1985. The amendments have not come a day too soon. In fact, these were overdue and the amendments are undoubtedly unexceptionable and so, we wholly support them.

The first amendment, namely to Section 6 says:

"The Commissioner and the Officers subordinate to him authorised to discharge functions under this scheme shall be deemed to be a civil court for the purposes of Section 195 and Chapter 26 of the Cr. P.C."

This amendment presumably seeks to give some kind of protection, prestige, dignity to the people who will be handling the compensation cases. This is very necessary. They would be performing quasi-judicial function and they need all the protection

and privileges that go with any court in this country.

Second amendment to Section 7 says:

"The Central Government may by notification delegate powers among others to the Welfare Commissioner."

I am really surprised why this was not done earlier. It is the Commissioner who will be handling most of the cases at Bhopal and it is under his guidance that the other subordinate judges would be functioning. He is entitled to have been given the Powers of the Central Government. This Act has two parts. The first part tells the people you do not bother about your claims, about your damages; the Government will take care of that. This became necessary because having been in Bhopal myself at the time of tragedy, I saw that a large number of U.S. lawyers descended on Bhopal. I have been in Bhopal since 1956, when re-organisation took place. I never saw so many foreigners in that city. Of course, there were photographers; there were correspondents who had come from all over the world. But there were so many lawyers from the United States of America. It aroused my curiosity to find out what exactly they were doing. What they were doing was, they were collecting the signatures of the residents of Bhopal so that they may be able to file suits in the courts of U.S.A. against the Union Carbide. I am informed, in that country, there is a system that a lawyer need not be paid his fee in advance he files the case and if he wins, then a part of the decree amount is taken by him as fee. What the U.S. Lawyers were doing in Bhopal in full view of everybody, and in the presence of the Government. I myself was approached by several Americans who were there to give them Power of attorney so that they could file suit in the United States of America.

As you know, the damages or compensation that has to be paid in that country is comparatively very very high. It is not like our

[Sh. Sushil Chandra Verma]

country, that is when a railway accident takes place or air crash occurs and some people die, their dependents get one lakh or two lakhs of rupees. Compensation to be paid in U.S.A. is very very high and that brought these lawyers Bhopal to get the power of attorney. When the Government saw this, they took a very right decision that so far as the victims' claims are concerned, whatever damages they seek by way of redressal, it is the Government which will protect their interest. The Government will fight out the case for those people. That was the correct step taken at that time. That steps was taken. But the point is: whether Government has actually been able to give relief to the people? I pose this question because the second part of the Act is that those who have suffered would be properly compensated. The Government has laid down an arrangement of appointing Welfare Commissioner and the subordinate staff who will deal with the compensation cases and make award. It is very unfortunate that although eight years have elapsed since the tragedy took place, not a single compensation case has been decided so far. The very purpose of the Act has been defeated. It is rather unfortunate.

I will give the history of how things moved. The Act was passed on 29th March, 1985. After the Act was passed, the Government of India filed a suit in a court at New York because we had no jurisdiction. The Company was U.S.-based. So, the legal opinion was that the correct procedure to be followed was to file a suit in that country. The suit was filed on April 8, 1985. Fortunately, for us, there was a very sympathetic Judge, Judge Keenan who suggested:

"Why do you not settle these cases in your own country? Why need you come to the United States because it will be very expensive and you do not know all the intricacies of the American Law."

So, he suggested a way out there were

also application from both the sides that the venue of adjudication should shift to Indians Judge Keenan made an observation. He said: "The opportunity to stand all before the world and to pass judgement on behalf of its own people." That is the comment made by him. He said: "Well, it is a good move and the case must move over to India." That happened in 1986. An appeal was preferred. The highest Judge, also said that the decision taken by Judge Keenan was all right and the case should shift to India. The happened in 1986. The American Court has expressed a lot of concern and they acted very fast in taking the decision. Then, the scene shifted to Bhopal. The case was filed before the District Judge. On behalf of the Government, a claim was made for 3300 millions. As the Minister has just now mentioned, that was finally compromised for 47½ millions by the Supreme Court. But that is not the point I am referring to at this stage. But the District Judge passed the order on 13th December 1987. Then, an appeal was preferred by the Union Carbide and by other parties before the High Court. The High Court passed the Order in 1988. After that, the case came to the Supreme Court and that famous judgement of compromise was passed on February 14, 1989. Finally, the last order of the Supreme Court is dated 3rd October, 1991. So, you will see that from 1984 to 1991 the case is just in the Courts. What about the people who suffered? I have seen the sufferings with my own eyes. In fact, I have no hesitation even to confess here that I myself made an attempt to run away from my nose when the gas descended on the area. On the following morning, I occasion to visit the hospitals. I need not describe because that is all known all over the country and the world. How were the people dying like flies; People who brought the sick I saw them dying. People who brought the sick never returned home. They also died on-the-spot. They never expected, they never thought, they never apprehended that they would also die. I have seen them dying most unexpectedly. This kind such was the tragedy that within three to four days, 3000 Lives were lost. Now the tally is much more. It is five thou-

sand to six thousand. What kind of relief have we been able to provide? Although we passed an Act very expeditiously with good intentions and making provisions for various contingencies yet it is very unfortunate, as I said earlier, that not a single case of compensation has yet been awarded. But I admit and, I must praise the Government which was here in 1990, that they sanctioned some kind of interim relief. The then Prime Minister sanctioned the interim relief after a brief visit to Bhopal. Even though our new Government, the BJP Government had not taken over, he came and saw the situation returned to Delhi and an order was passed saying that in the 36 wards of Bhopal-Bhopal has 56 wards- people would be paid interim relief at the rate of Rs.200 per month. The total amount placed at the disposal of the State Government was around Rs. 320 crores. With interest, it was supposed to rise to Rs.360 crores. The expenditure estimated was Rs.120 crores per year to be paid to five lakh persons residing in those 36 wards of Bhopal at the rate of Rs.200 per month. But it was very baffling how would they differentiate people residing in one ward from the other ward? If you see the map of Bhopal city and this situation obtain in any other city, there is a road that generally divides the wards. How could it be comprehended that the gas would stop at a particular road and it would not cross that road and enter into any other ward? That was a very unjust decision taken by the Government. We have been agitating since then that the interim relief should be extended to all the 56 wards of Bhopal. Otherwise, There is no justification whatsoever to restrict the relief to only 36 wards. The situation would show now and it was even earlier that the claims filed by the people for compensation are from all over the city, Not even restricted to Bhopal but people who happened to be in Bhopal that day or are now living abroad, filed their claims for compensation. We have been repeatedly approaching the Central Government, the present Government also to extend the interim relief to all the 56 wards. But somehow that has not happened. Even in regard to 36 wards, the then Government estimated that only five lakh persons were

entitled to receive interim relief. The State Government wrote to the Government of India that this was only an approximate figure and actually the number would be around six lakhs- one lakh more than what was earlier estimated- and the additional amount required was Rs.72 crores. In spite of repeated representations to this Government and also to the earlier Government- we are not concerned with the earlier Government and we are concerned with the Government that is in position today— we have not met with success. The prevailing situation is so iniquitous so unjust, so unfair to declare on the one hand that all those residing in 36 wards would get interim relief and yet restrict relief to five lakh people when there are six lakh persons. Even then Government does not provide the funds that we have asked for. Per force people had to go to the court. And I am informed, I read in the newspapers that judgment is yet to be seen. That the Supreme Court judge which is hearing the case has perhaps orally mentioned that the Central Government would be asked to make provision for giving interim relief to the additional one lakh people. I would request the Minister that in his reply he may kindly clarify this position, if he is in possession of all the facts.

There are quite a few things which the Central Government has yet to do. Just passing these two amendments will not serve much of a purpose. As the hon. Minister knows himself, the amount of Rs.1300 or 1400 crore is not with the Central Government; it is with the Supreme Court. It is under the Registrar General of the Supreme Court. This money has to come to the Welfare Commissioner who is in charge of handling the whole problem. There is a provision made in the scheme itself that a fund has to be created. I am surprised- I do not know and may be the Central Government has done it and perhaps the Minister would be able to tell us something about it- that steps are to be taken to create a claims account fund under para 9 of the scheme which has been prepared by the Central Government. Under Para 10 there has to be claims and relief fund. The paragraph says:

[Sh. Sushil Chandra Verma]

"There shall be created and maintained by the Central Government a fund called the Claims and Relief Fund. The Fund shall include amounts received in satisfaction of the claims and any other amount made available to the Commissioner as donations for relief purposes."

The Central Government would be able to pass these funds to the Welfare Commissioner only after making provision in their own budget. Just because the money is available with the Supreme Court does not mean that they can draw upon that Fund and give it to the Welfare Commissioner. There has to be a drill to be followed of making budget provision and then placing the money at the disposal of the Welfare Commissioner. I am sure this must be receiving the attention of the Government and they would soon be taking action.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

SHRI SUSHIL CHANDRA VERMA: I think I would be taking the entire time allocated to my party.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Your party has 25 minutes.

SHRI SUSHIL CHANDRA VERMA: I do not think I have taken 25 minutes.

MR. CHAIRMAN: As it is you have taken 18 minutes. You can continue.

SHRI RAM NAIK (Bombay North): All other BJP Members will give their time to him. He was the Chief Secretary of Madhya Pradesh. He knows the problem. So the House also will agree to it.

MR. CHAIRMAN: He does not need anybody to argue on his behalf. I will give him the time.

(Interruptions)

SHRI RAM NAIK: If such is the attitude,

then the question is that there is non quorum in the House. I raise the issue of quorum.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Let the quorum bell be rung.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now there is quorum. The hon. Member, Shri Sushil Chandra Verma may continue.

SHRI SUSHIL CHANDRA VERMA: As per the decision of the Supreme Court of October 1991, 40 courts are to be set up in Bhopal to deal with the compensation cases. The Supreme Court has very specifically directed that the courts must set up within four months of the order passed by them. The order was passed in October and now we are in July; but only 16 courts have been set up so far. If this is the way in which the things are going to be handled, the future does not seem to be very bright nor very hopeful. The courts have been able to dispose of only 4,000 cases so far whereas the number of claims filed is more than six lakhs.

It is for the Central Government to sit up and think as to what steps should be taken by them so that there is expeditious disposal of the cases. As I said earlier, the people who suffered, particularly in the higher age group and the children, are all dead; and those who were in the middle age bracket are getting older. I represent that Constituency; When I go to them, visit these areas, they ask me as to whether in their life-time they would ever get any compensation. When I say, do not be so despondent, do not be so pessimistic; the Government is taking all possible steps to see that you get financial assistance", they say, "Well, Look, the tragedy took place in 1984; we are now in 1992 and nothing much has happened. What kind of hope can you give us? What kind of future you can hold up for us?" This is a matter of great concern. I would very strongly urge the Minister, through you, Sir, to make a specific provision in the scheme, that the Welfare Commissioner will follow the summary procedure as laid down in the Civil Procedure

Code to deal with these cases. This has not been mentioned anywhere.

I would very strongly urge that these directions, these instructions, the advice must go and emanate from the Central Government. Unless this is done, I do not see any prospect of the six lakhs cases being decided even in the next 20 years. We will not derive any benefitably passing this Act and the purpose of taking all the steps that you are taking, would be completely defeated.

There are one or two more things which should have been done, which need to be done immediately by the Central Government. The first is in regard to the insurance cover. I am really surprised that although this is a routine action to be taken. Why has it not been taken in spite of the directions of the Supreme Court?

This insurance is for those people who are not showing any signs of suffering today. But they are likely to suffer, say, in the next three or four years or eight years. It is very shocking to see the kind of effect this MIC can have on human body. The children born of women, who were pregnant at the time the gas leaked, are deformed. Oh, I have seen so many children with deformed bodies, with no eyes, with missing limbs. When I go to those areas, the women come out of their huts with their babies in their hands and tell me, "look, this is what you have done. This is what the Government has done. What relief has been given to me?" The reality also is that, we have not been able to give them the succour that they need, wipe tears from their eyes. It is very unfortunate.

The second step which again the Central Government has not taken so far is the setting up of a hospital. The Supreme Court said that the Union Carbide must make available Rs. 50 crore to set up the hospital in Bhopal so that there is a proper surveillance of cases, proper care of people who may suffer in future. I am afraid, despite the fact that the State Government has made available land for the hospital within two months of the passing of the Supreme Court's

order, no further action has been taken to set up that hospital.

Finally, it is very pertinent to draw the attention of the House to certain observations made by the courts about the need to dispose of the cases expeditiously.

"When thousands of innocent citizens were in near destitute conditions, without adequate subsistential needs of food and medicine and with every coming morrow haunted by the spectre of death and continued agony, it would be heartless abstention, if the possibilities of immediate sources of relief were not explored.

The Law's delays are, indeed, proverbial. It has been the unfortunate bane of the judicial process that even in ordinary cases, where evidence consists of a few documents and the oral testimony of a few witnesses, require some years to realise the fruits of litigation. This is so even in cases of great and questionable urgency, such as, fatal accident actions brought by the dependants. All these are hard relatives."

These realities of the situation should not be lost sight of.

The courts further be observe:

"It is said that this is an instance of lost opportunity to this apex court to give the law the new direction on vital issues emerging from the increasing dimensions of the economic exploitation of the developing countries by economic forces of the rich ones."

This Union Carbide, as you must have heard earlier, was set up in Bhopal without following all the safeguards, all the precautionary measures that should have been taken while setting up a factory of this nature with highly poisonous gas, deadly gas.

The factory is located almost in the

[Sh. Sushil Chandra Verma]

heart of the city. They are such factories in the US also. If you go and see them, as I have read in the newspapers, you would find that they have lot of restrictions about the working, safeguards and precautions to be taken. This was not done so far as Bhopal factory was concerned. People who gave licence for this factory, both Central Government and the State Government- I would not even spare the State Government- did not show the care and concern expected of them. These days we talk of so many multi-nationals coming to this country were inviting them with open arms, but we have to be careful that the situation like the one which developed in Bhopal is not repeated again in India. I quote the Supreme Court's warning:

"The prospect of exploitation of cheap labour and of captive-markets, it is said, induced multi-national to enter into the developing countries for such economic exploitation and that this was eminently an appropriate case for a careful assessment of the legal and constitutional safeguards stemming from these vital issues of great contemporary relevance." But in the present case, the compulsions of the need for immediate relief to tens and thousands of suffering victims could not, in our opinion, wait till these vital questions, though they may be, are resolved in the due course of judicial proceeding. "Tremendous suffering of thousands of persons compelled us to move into this direction for immediate relief."

We must praise the Supreme Court it was bold enough to pass a decree of compromise. It was very much criticised on that account. There were protests, marches and shoutings going on very close to the Supreme Court building but they stuck to their guns and provided relief to the people.

The last point is about the criminal cases. I would like to draw the attention of the Minister to this point because having been a District Magistrate myself for no less than six

years, I know what law is so far as criminal cases are concerned. The CBI had launched a case against the then Chairman of the Union Carbide, Mr. Warren Anderson. He happened to come to Bhopal after the tragedy. I do not know what kind of wisdom the State Government then had. They put him under arrest and after two or three hours, they provided him a State plane to have the right to go to Delhi. I do not know if that was the correct way in which a person who was responsible for the suffering of thousand and thousands of people was to be treated. Anyway, Now, the CBI has filed cases against him. The court has attached the property but the point is whether there is extradition treaty between India and the US. Unless there is extradition treaty, it will never be possible to get that man to India to face trial and to take the punishment which the court may award. I made a reference here to the library and I got a note saying that there is no extradition treaty between US and India. Of course, the Minister would verify. There was an old treaty of 1932, a copy of which I have got with me, between the then Government of the United States and the Government of England. India was then a dominion. By implication we may say that there is an extradition treaty. But in effect, I don't think we can depend on that treaty of 1932 between the two Governments of the day. This also is a matter which the Central Government would perhaps like to examine.

I am very grateful to you for giving me this opportunity and I would reiterate that the Central Government must immediately decide about the extra amount that has to be made available in those 36 wards and it should also consider whether interim relief which was very arbitrarily confined to only 36 wards could be extended to 56 wards.

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH (Rajgarh):
Hon. Chairman Sir, I rise to support this Bill which confers powers on the Welfare Commissioner. I am sure that the Welfare Commissioner that the Government has appointed is competent enough to fulfil all the responsibilities to the best of his ability.

We have total faith not only in his sense of judgment, but in his ability also.

But there is one thing. The Petroleum Ministry must closely monitor the adjudication of claim cases in Bopal. There should be some kind of a built-in mechanism so that the total cases adjudicated by the Welfare Commissioner, Assistant Welfare Commissioners and their organisation can be assessed on a weekly or a fortnightly manner. Also, from time to time, they may be consulted to find out whether they are facing any legal problems. Then those problems should be removed.

Because of the delay being caused in the disbursement of the claim cases and their adjudication the victims are losing faith. People are literally dying and on the top of it, the State Government, in its own wisdom left out almost 1,00,000 people who should have been paid the interim relief compensation of Rs.200 per month. The Minister dealing with these cases has stated that they have not been paid adequate money by the Government of India and that is why, they could not pay compensation to the additional one lakh people. It is very unfortunate that a responsible member of the Madhya Pradesh Government should say so. After all, there is no point in casting aspersions and blaming each other. But, if the other four lakh people could be given some relief and if those four lakh people include those who live in the least affected areas and in areas where IAS officers and other well-to-do people are living, and when they are being paid a compensation of Rs.200 per month, could not these one lakh people be paid the interim relief? But the hon. Minister of the State Government of Madhya Pradesh has stated that he did not have enough money to pay to these one lakh people - very poor people, who are residing very close to the factory premises of the Union Carbide. So, they were left out without any compensation! It goes to the credit of our voluntary organisations that they went to the Supreme Court. Only after the Supreme Court gave a directive, the process of giving compensation to these people also has started.

The BJP has shown its true character. The State Government of Madhya Pradesh has always been a supporter of the 'haves' and is opposed to the 'have nots'. This is just one of those instances where well-to-do people are given a compensation of Rs.200 per month, whereas the most affected poor people are left out.

The payment of interim relief compensation was decided upon in 1990 by the Government of Shri. V.P. Singh, when the State Government was being headed by Shri Sunder Lal Patwa. So, the earlier interim relief was given to almost all the people of Bhopal. I have objection to that also. In fact the more people you involve in this the more you dilute the compensation to be paid to the really affected persons. Sir, the process is so slow that in the last 4 months, only 400 to 500 cases have been decided upon. If this pace is adhered to it will take some 4 to 5 years more to decide the cases.

The procedure is; notice is issued to the claimant, the claimant then has to submit the papers. Papers are then scrutinised. Lawyers are having a field day. For every case there are lawyers with claims and counter-claims and the poor claimant, the poor sufferer and the poor victim watches the claim being decided upon. Arguments and counter-arguments are put forward. All this will take a long time.

Then about the medical categorisation. I had referred to it earlier also. The most unfortunate part of the whole gas tragedy is that the essence of establishing claims, that is of correct medical categorisation was one field which the State Government neglected the most with the result today the State Government has done the medical categorisation of only 60 percent of the total claimants. Out of this more than 90 per cent are characterised with no-injury or minor injury. I know a number of cases who have been really affected but somehow or the other, they have neither the means nor the influence to get themselves medically examined and also to have a right kind of categorisation done. There has been an element of corruption in the issuance of medical certificates and

[Sh. Digvijaya Singh]

medical categorisation which has led to total lack of faith. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI DAU DAYA¹. JOSHI: All these things have happened when your party was in power.

SHRI DIGVIJAY SINGH: You are Mr. Clean.

[*English*]

The basis of medical categorisation as such should not be taken if you really want to help the victims. Some kind of scheme has to be worked out so that the whole process could be expedited. One way of doing it is as follows whatever you may say, although I have my own reservations but the practical aspect has to be seen. So, as it stands today, victims of 36 wards have been taken. They have been given Rs. 200 per month as interim relief. Some kind of a comprehensive scheme should be taken up by the Government or by the Welfare Commission so that a minimum flat amount could be given to all those persons who have received this interim relief and directly deposit into the bank accounts of all the victims.

If that happens, Sir, most of them will be satisfied that they have got something. People who have been genuinely injured, who have received serious injuries, their cases should be taken up case-by-case and adequate compensation should be fixed. So, what is happening today? There are a large number of cases which are to be decided, because of that, the really affected people are being neglected. The full attention of the Welfare Commissioner, the State Government and the Government of India must be concentrated on those families which were in the thick of it; which were the most affected. Then only Sir, justice would be done.

Sir, as I had mentioned earlier, there are

certain guidelines. I do not know how those guidelines were arrived at. It is because, they are not only inadequate but I feel ashamed even to say that those guidelines were decided by the Government of India here in Petroleum Ministry. They have put us to such an embarrassment before the victims, that they must be reviewed and not only reviewed, but the Welfare Commissioner should be asked not to be misguided by the guidelines issued by the Government of India. At the same time, in all humility, I must say that in spite of the best efforts of the Welfare Commissioner and the people he has around him, the right of the claimants to appeal for justice to higher Courts should not be denied. We should also not be absolutely rigid that we have to pay all our compensation in a water tight compartment of Rs. 1400 crore. What is most important is adequate compensation to the victims. If that exceeds the money that has been deposited by the Union Carbide, either we should take it up again or the Government of India should be prepared to take up the cause of the victims. just because so much money we have got, beyond that we cannot give compensation, we should not be guided by such theories.

Sir, the State Government - I am not blaming this Government but the earlier State Government- thought that by means of this money, they could create infrastructure also. I was appalled to see a scheme in which, the State Government had provided money for the construction of roads, bus terminals and even Airports from the money that was given as compensation. Sir, we should be very careful in accepting this kind of project or scheme. Rather, we should not accept such project or scheme.

Sir, today, I have reasons to believe that the State Government of Uttar Pradesh is really fascinated with issues such as beautifying towns, no matter, the slums and rural areas may go to dogs.

But as far as the cost for beautification is concerned, they are extremely happy even to spend lakhs of rupees on erecting statues at street junctions. I do not mind, if they pay

for it out of their own share. Anyway, I am not really sure about the beautification schemes of Bhopal, but the Government of India must scrutinise the money that was spent by the Government of Madhya Pradesh. The Government of India must scrutinise the accounts of the State Government. So, there has to be a special audit..... (*Interruptions*).

The Government of India must scrutinise the funds that have been spent by them.

I would conclude by this fact that a number of people in the country and most of the people in this country and in this House are not aware of a very interesting fact of this gas tragedy. You would be surprised to know that in the most affected area, the people who got drunk affected; the people who took alcohol, somehow,

the gas did not have any effect on them.

I know of a person who was a Gorkha Chokidar of a Paper Board Company. Throughout the night, he gave his duty; he was dead drunk and he did his duty but he was not affected by the gas.

So, a study has also to be done on the effect of alcohol on the MIC gas victims.

With these words, I conclude.

MR. CHAIRMAN: The House stands adjourned to meet tomorrow, 21st July, 1992, at 11 A.M.

18.01 hrs

*The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Eleven of the Clock on Tuesday, July 21, 1992
Asadha 30, 1914 (Saka).*