

years. During his long and eventful legal career, he appeared in various cases not only in India but also in England at the House of Lords.

A widely travelled person, Shri Chauduri represented the country twice as a delegate to United Nationals General Assembly, first in 1949 and again in 1951. he also served on the Law Commission of India between 1959-61.

As a Minister in the Union Council of Ministers, Shri Chauduri held the Finance portfolio during 1966-67.

Shri Chauduri took keen interest in sports and games and other social and cultural activities and was associated with various organisations in different capacities.

Shri Sachindra Chauduri passed away on 12 June, 1992 at the age of 89 years after a prolonged illness.

In his passing away, the country has lost of prominent public figure and a distinguished jurist.

We deeply mourn the loss of these friends and I am sure the House will join me in conveying our condolence to the bereaved families.

The House may now stand in the silence for a short while as a mark of respect to the deceased.

11.10 hrs.

The Members then stood in silence for a short while

—————
(Interruptions)

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE (Dumdum): Sir, We have given notice of Adjournment Motion and Suspension of Question Hour.

(Interruptions)

11.11 hrs.

RE: INCIDENCE OF KILLINGS IN
KUMHER (RAJASTHAN)

[Translation]

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN (Rosera): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have given a notice under rule 388 about the Kumher incident. It is well known to the people as to how the children and Dalits were killed and how a human sacrifice was made. Workers belonging to all parties have visited the site. Shri Buta Singh is present here, B.J.P. members are also present here. They have also visited the place. Shri Balram Jakhar is present here. I don't know why he is keeping mum. Shri Natwar Singh also has gone there. All have seen the situation with their own eyes. I think no there has never been such a heinous massacre till today as the incident of Kumher in the history of India.....(Interruptions)

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA (South Delhi): Mr. Speaker, Sir, what happens in Bihar? (Interruption)

SHRI DAU DAYAL JOSHI (Kota): Mr. Speaker, Sir, there was no incident of human sacrifice. It has been refuted by his own partymen. (Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Well, I can understand your feelings. This is Question Hour, that is your Hour. Let us continue with the Question Hour. We can take it up later on, if you like.

(Interruptions)

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: We expect the Finance Minister to come up with a statement on the bank scam.....(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI CHANDULAL CHANDRAKAR (Durg): Mr. Speaker, Sir, labourers have been killed brutally.

(Interruptions)

SHRI RAM VIALS PASWAN: Mr. Speaker, Sir, leader of the opposition is present here. He should say something *(Interruptions)*

SHRI KRISHAN DUTTA SULTANPURI (Shimla): Mr. Speaker, Sir, the way the massacre has taken place....*(Interruptions)*

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: Now, today is the first day and this is the first hour of this session. It is not necessary for us to start the business with agitated minds. We can take up this matter at the appropriate time.

[*Translation*]

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: Mr. Speaker, Sir, the Hon. Prime Minister is present here. He should say something on the incident that has occurred.....*(Interruptions)*

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: We can take it up at the appropriate time. Questions can be raised and replies can also be given. Mr. Jaswant Singh, if it is necessary, I will allow you later on.

(Interruptions)

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: We expected that the other issue should have been mentioned in the business list today.....*(Interruptions)*

[*Translation*]

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (Chittorgarh): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to state that these are tragic incidents and nobody like these whether they occur in Andhra Pradesh, Bihar or Rajasthan. When this issue is raised in case of Rajasthan.....*(Interruptions)*

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: You can raise it later on.

[*Translation*]

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I also want the same. I share the feelings of Shri Ram Vilas Paswan. I want that the discussion should take place in a proper manner. The Rajasthan Government has demanded C.B.I. enquiry into the incident within 24 hours and has ordered a Judicial enquiry within 24 hours. One lakh rupees have been given to each victim.

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: Let us understand that we are all aware of the important issues which we would like to discuss and I am told that no Member of the House is unwilling to discuss them. They are ready and willing to put all the facts before the house for its consideration. That is why it is not necessary to take up these matters in the Question-Hour which is Members' hour. In the Question Hour you are going to get the information from the Government and if you raise such other matters, that opportunity will be lost.

So, my request to you is, I understand your feelings and I can understand the agitation also in your mind, let us take it up immediately after the Question-Hour. It is not necessary to agitate at this point of time. Buta Singh ji I will also allow you to speak later on.

[*Translation*]

SHRI GUMAN MAL LODHA (Pali): Mr. Speaker, Sir, seven people have been killed at Tinbigha in West Bengal. I have given a notice to you.....*(Interruptions)*

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE (Lucknow): Mr. Speaker has given a good advice. Question Hour is the hour for the Members., We have full right to ask questions from the Government. We can make a query from the Ministers. After this Hour we can ask question according to our wish. We can also demand suspension of Question Hour. We can also create uproar to suspend the Question Hour. But it is the dignity of the House and regard for the Parliamentary

procedure that we should allow the Question Hour and do whatever we like in the Zero Hour.

[English]

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA (Bankura): Sir, we consider this hour to be very important.

[Translation]

SHRI BUTA SINGH (Jalore): This House should not take the incident of Kumher and Durg as routine work (Interruptions) I am speaking with your permission. I would like that this incident should not be taken as routine and the tradition of the House should not be violated. These incidents are occurring in every State. Today it is not the question of B.J.P. Government. It has occurred at Durg in Rajasthan where B.J.P. Government happens to be in power unfortunately.

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: You can say the same thing afterwards, Butaji.

[Translation]

SHRI BUTA SINGH: B.J.P. Members should not get irritated at this. Shri Vajpayee stated that both sides can make allegation against each other. This is not a question on which there should be controversy. It is a national problem. Dalits are being killed like insects in the country. If we do not discuss this question there, what will our countrymen think? (Interruptions) So the Question Hour should be suspended and this matter should be discussed so that people of the country may know that the House gave priority to this issue. It is not related with any particular party. We had gone to Kumher.....(Interruptions) Members of all the parties visited the place. Members of all the parties have taken a decision to suspend the Question Hour and to discuss this matter just now so that the people of the country may be told that Dalits.....(Interruptions).....

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Buta Singh, as a

senior Member, when I am standing, you should sit down, please.

[Translation]

SHRI BUTA SINGH: You have placed it in routine work. We do not want it to be placed in routine work. It should be given priority.....(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: This is not correct, Mr. Buta Singh.

[Translation]

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Dalits have been killed in several States. So I demand that the Question Hour should be suspended and this matter should be discussed first. (Interruptions)

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH (Fatehpur): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I shall not go into the incident and(Interruptions)

SHRI DAU DAYAL JOSHI (Kota): Mr. Speaker, Sir, he had made a wrong statement in Jaipur and is making wrong statement here also.....(Interruptions)

SHRI VISHWANATH PARATAP SINGH: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I shall not go into the incident because you had assured that you would give an opportunity to discuss it. We can consider this incident seriously. Therefore, I would not like to go into the other aspects of the incident. I would like to submit that it would be proper to suspend the Question Hour and take up this incident for discussion. Sir, it is a heart-rending incident.....(Interruptions) The whole House is sad over this incident, but they do not want to lend their ears to their agony. An impression is being created before the country that they do not want to pay heed to their agony. They suppress the every voice raised about Kumher incident. I would like to say that the Members of treasury benches as well as of the opposition are disappointed. Sir, it is the first day of Monsoon session. Therefore, they should create such an impression before the whole nation that this House attaches utmost

importance to Kumher incident. It gives top most priority to this issue than any other issue. It will satisfy them and they will feel that the apex body of the country has discussed it. The greatest question is the agony of Dalits and of atrocities committed on them. Therefore, the Question Hour should be suspended and this incident should be discussed in the House. We do raise questions in this House, either it is about Kumher or Bhilai or any other issue. We raise questions but no reply is given. the democracy will come to an end if we stop raising questions. Therefore, I request you not to go into the incident and suspend the Question Hour immediately to take up the issue of Kumher.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI (Gandhi Nagar): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I fully agree with the former Prime Minister Shri Vishwanath Pratap Singh.....(*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAJNATH SONKAR SHASTRI (Saidpur): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to ask the Leader of the opposition whether the Members of his party do not want a discussion on the incident of Kumher. They are making such a noise that it seems that they do not want to discuss this issue.....(*Interruptions*)

SHRI KALKADAS (karolbagh): We want discussion on it.

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. I have called him.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAJNATH SONKAR SHASTRI: Whenever any issue is raised, they all start shouting together, whether it is an issue relating to Harijans or any other issue. First ask them whether they are ready——

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down first.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I think nobody will disagree with the former Prime Minister Shri Vishwanath Pratap Singh that the heart rending incident has taken place in Kumher. It is causing concern to all. All are feeling distressed over this incident. If that concern

and agony will not be expressed in the Parliament then where will it be expressed. Therefore, I think nobody disagree on discussing that, in the Parliament.....(*Interruptions*) Mr. Speaker, Sir, you may remember that Shri Vajpayeeji had also mentioned it earlier. In other words he had specified the circumstances in which Question Hour should be suspended. We have no objection. If you allow suspension of the Question Hour and hold discussion on it. We are ready for that. But.....(*Interruptions*)

SHRI CHANDULAL CHANDRAKAR (Durg): Labourers have been killed in Bhilai.....(*Interruptions*)

SHRILAL K. ADVANI: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I object to the raising of this question without your permission and levelling charges against the Government of Rajasthan. I think the Government of Rajasthan acted promptly. It took action immediately. It ordered an enquiry into it through C.B.I. and it also ordered a judicial enquiry.....(*Interruptions*) Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would not like to raise the questions of Andhra Pradesh or the killings of Dalits by Haryana Police some days ago but I will request that it will not be proper for the Parliament as well as it will be against the spirit of constitution of the country, if the Parliament is misused for criticising and condemning the Legislative assemblies or the State Governments. Our party is ready to discuss this issue, if you permit so, but if you don't permit. I would like to submit.....(*Interruptions*) Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to give a suggestion that a meeting should be convened to consider as to in which circumstances Question hour should be suspend, because without your consent motion of suspending Question Hour can't be moved. We should also know the attitude of the Government in that regard. In this connection you should call a meeting of the Members of all parties. If any individual party or a Member has to express his feelings and he thinks that he would be doing injustice, if he waits for it even upto 12 O'clock, and he tries to raise it at 11 O'clock itself. Then I think an unanimous decision should be taken to deal with such situations and a precedent should be set in which the Government

should also be a party. As far as the question of Kumher is concerned, I have full information about Kumher incident. On the basis of the I can say that I myself and my party have no objection, if you suspend the Question Hour and hold discussion it.

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: We are prepared for it.

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV (Azamgarh): The Members of his party had not allowed the Question Hour for three days on the issue of Bara.....(*Interruptions*)

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Does it justify the meassacre at Bara? You have given a certificate to the Government of Bihar.....(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: The Minister of Parliamentary Affairs would like to say something about it.

(*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF LAW, JUSTICE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS (SHRIRANGARAJAN KUMARAMANGLAM): The incident is one in which all of us are concerned about. It is very serious and we are all willing to discuss it at any time.

With regard to suspension of Question Hour, it is your jurisdiction (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Basudeb Acharia, you first listen to me.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: You first listen to us.

MR. SPEAKER: I will help you. Mr. Basudeb Acharia, please take your seat. I think in the House it is only Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee and the Chair who want that the Question Hour should be continued. All others are saying, you decide, you decide, as if you

do not have your own opinion about it.

I have received not one notice but many notices to suspend the Question Hour on different topics. One is one Bhilai, second is on bank matter and the third is on Kumher. Supporting, I allow one matter to be taken to be discussed, others also in the like manner may stand up and say that they want another matter to be discussed. So, it cannot go on like this and nobody is saying that you do not discuss it. We are saying, "Let us fix up time and let us discuss it." Now you have yourself seen. You wanted to discuss it, but you could not concentrate on the topic on which you wanted to concentrate. So, if you do not do it in a proper manner, the very purpose is not served. That is why I am requesting the Members to wait until the Question Hour is over and then we will take it up. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: Mr. Speaker, Sir, why? Why the proceedings of this very House were suspended for two or three days on 7th-8th August on a statement of Shri Madhavarao Scindia. The Question Hour was also suspended.....(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: I am allowing Shri Basudeb Acharia. Now, let me hear Shri Basudeb Acharia.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Sir, we have given notices to suspend this Question Hour. We consider this Hour to be very important. It is our hour. But when issues like Kumher and Bhilai are there, or issues like the security scam come, they are very important issues. When Dalits are killed, when Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe people are killed in police firing in Bhilai, we consider such issues even more important than the Question Hour. How are Dalits killed in Kumher? That is very important. I do not understand why the BJP Members are keeping quiet. We are not here to condemn the State Government. It may be that the BJP is in power in Madhya Pradesh. But the whole House should condemn the incident

and what has happened in Kumher. The whole House should condemn the incident when 25 tribal workers were killed. Shri Jaswant Singh has referred to the CBI Inquiry. An inquiry was instituted by the Madhya Pradesh Government but not a single culprit has been arrested.

MR. SPEAKER: I am calling Questions now.

SHRI BASUDEB ACAHRIA: The tribal were killed in Rajasthan

MR. SPEAKER: Now, that is enough, Shri Acharia. You have had enough, please sit down. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIBASUDEB ACAHRIA: That is why we want the Question Hour to be suspended immediately. What has happened in Kumher in Rajasthan should be taken up.

[*Translation*]

SHRI RASHEED MASOOD (Saharanpur): Mr. Speaker, Sir, whether it is an issue of Kumher or Bhilai or of Bihar.....(*Interruptions*) All these issues are serious.....(*Interruptions*) The people who are dividing the country in the name of religion and caste should be condemned.....(*interruptions*) Whether it is the statement of B.J.P., Janata Dal or of the Congress, we should be most cautious about the dividing forces. I would like that the Question Hour should be suspended. There are some other issues also. The House has its own dignity and that dignity should be maintained. These issues should be taken up after the Question hour. Not only the issue of Kumher but other incidents of atrocities on Harijans and minorities should also be taken up along with it.

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: Please understand. It is not possible to take up all the matters at one and the same time without properly putting them before the House. If you want one matter to be taken up, there are others who would like other matters to be taken up.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I am not replying to you. I am trying to give directions about the proceedings in the House. Now enough is enough. Let us go on with the Question Hour. I call upon Shri Vijayaraghavan.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI ANBARASU ERA (Madras Central): Sir, I am on a point of order.

MR. SPEAKER: There is no point of order in Question Hour.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: Mr. Speaker, Sir, when the leader of the Opposition as well as the Members of the Congress are prepared for the discussion then what is the objection to the Chair.....(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: We will take it up later. Thank you very much for cooperating after half an hour's discussion.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Bolpur): Sir, please, fix appropriate time for this.

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Vijayaraghavan.

11.36 hrs.

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

[*English*]

Civil Services (Preliminary)
Examination, 1992

+
*1. SHRI V.S. VIJAYARAGHAVAN:
SHRI RAM NARESH SINGH:

Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state: