

12.09 hrs.

I

COMMITTEE ON PRIVATE MEMBERS' BILLS AND RESOLUTIONS

THIRTY-EIGHT REPORT

SHRI G. LAKSHMANAN (Madras North): Sir, I beg to present the Thirty-eight Report of the Committee on Private Members' Bills and Resolutions.

SHRI SATYASADHAN CHAKRABORTY (Calcutta South): What about my Calling Attention on the shortage of wheat in Delhi ration shops? Only today I did not get my wheat from the ration shop. (Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER: I have not rejected; it is under my consideration. Nothing goes on record. Shri Eduardo Faleiro.

(Interruptions)*

12.10 hrs.

CALLING ATTENTION TO MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE

REPORTED DEATH OF MILCH CATTLE DUE TO INJECTION OF SUB-STANDARD VACCINE AGAINST RINDERPEST

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO (Mormugao): Sir, I call the attention of the Hon. Minister of Agriculture to the following matter of urgent public importance and I request that he may make a statement thereon:—

“Reported death of about five thousand milch cattle due to injection of substandard vaccine against rinderpest supplied by Indian Veterinary Research Institute. Izatnagar, Bareilly.”

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE AND RURAL DEVELOPMENT AND CIVIL SUPPLIES (RAO BIRENDRA SINGH): The outbreak of rinderpest was

reported in the Union Territory of Delhi in late September, 1981. The affected areas were visited by the officers of the Ministry of Agriculture, who had extended advice to the concerned officers of the Delhi Administration. The Deputy Commissioner, Livestock Health had visited the affected area on 31st October, 1981 alongwith the Deputy Director, Animal Husbandry of Delhi Administration. Instructions were issued on the spot and followed by a D. O. letter from the Animal Husbandry Commissioner addressed to the Development Commissioner, Delhi on 6th November, 1981 giving the details of the action to be taken for combating the epidemic.

The Assistant Commissioner (Rinderpest) of the Ministry of Agriculture had a meeting with the Development Commissioner, Delhi Administration on 3rd November, 1981 as a further follow up measure. The Animal Husbandry Commissioner had also visited the affected areas on 1st December, 1981 and had given, on the spot instructions, which were followed up by a note on the visit sent to the Development Commissioner, Delhi Administration, on 2nd December, 1981, incorporating recommendations to be immediately followed, for control of the epidemic.

A task force comprising Joint Commissioner (Livestock Health), Head Division of Virology of I. V. R. I. and Deputy Director (Animal Husbandry), Delhi Administration, was constituted to suggest short term and long term measures to control the disease outbreak. A.D.O. letter dated 11-12-1981 from the Secretary (Agriculture and Cooperation) to the Chief Secretary, Delhi Administration was sent giving the recommendations made by the Task Force. The D.O. letter had highlighted the fact that the advice rendered by Animal Husbandry Commissioner, which had been communicated to the Delhi Administration has not been fully implemented. The D.O. letter also made suggestions regarding the sanitary disposal of the carcasses.

12.12 hrs.

[MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER *in the Chair*].

The Chief Secretary, Delhi Administration, in his reply dated 22nd December, 1981 had acknowledged the valuable advice and suggestions rendered by the Animal Husbandry Commissioner and informed that 60,000 vaccinations had been carried out till then against rinderpest.

I would like to inform that the Indian Veterinary Research Institute is the premier Research Institute in the country conducting research on various aspects of livestock health and production. The Division of Biological Products of I.V.R.I. is producing a number of vaccines against important livestock diseases and one of them is Tissue Culture Vaccine against rinderpest. The Institute had supplied 1,40,250 doses of Tissue Culture Rinderpest vaccine between 22-10-1981 and 1-3-1982 to the Delhi Administration. All the batches of vaccine supplied were well within the effective period of utilisation and had been subjected to safety tests before issue. Therefore, to say that the vaccine against rinderpest supplied by I.V.R.I. was sub-standard is not correct.

Under the Drugs and Cosmetic Act, it is required that labelling should display general monogram on viral vaccines. Each ampoule or at least 50 per cent of the ampoules in a lot should contain at least the following print:—

1. T.C.R.P. Vaccine
2. Batch number and year
3. General information for use

This information is printed on the vials. This requirement of the Act was complied with by the I.V.R.I. in all cases of the vaccine supplied to Delhi Administration.

It has been ascertained that the vaccine against rinderpest had also been obtained by the Delhi Administration from State Biological Products Units of Rajasthan and Punjab located at Jaipur and Ludhiana respectively.

The Head of the Division of Virology of the I.V.R.I. had visited the site of outbreaks and the biological products Units of Rajasthan and Punjab. According to his report the vaccines, both goat tissue vaccine and tissue culture vaccine, supplied to Delhi Administration by all the three sources did conform to the prescribed standards. He had further observed that the proof of the efficacy of the tissue culture vaccine of the I.V.R.I. lies in the control of rinderpest outbreaks in Ghazoli Dairy Colony under the Delhi Administration.

As regards the exact number of deaths due to rinderpest, it had not been possible to obtain the correct information till last night from the Delhi Administration. Now I may add that it has been reported that 958 cattle died from rinderpest from these four colonies.

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO: Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, this is one of those matters which highlight in this House the wide gap that exists between practice and profession. Day in and day out we all in this House, most of us, at least, make it a point to express our sympathy and our concern for the poor farmers in this country. We go on saying that they are the backbone of our economy and I have no doubt that what we express in this House is expressed genuinely and is a sincere expression of our intentions. But how a callous, inefficient and careless administration can destroy all these intentions and bring all these intentions to nought is shown in this Call-Attention; this Call-Attention brings to light how the backs of our poor farmers can be broken, how our economy can be destroyed, in the very heart of the country, in Delhi itself. The allegations are supply of sub-standard vaccine and the inefficient way in which the whole situation of this rinderpest epidemic in different dairies in Delhi, within the jurisdiction of the Delhi Administration, has been handled. It has killed 5,000 heads of cattle and if the allegation is not denied by the hon. Minister...

RAO BIRENDRA SINGH: I have denied. It is 958 and not 5,000.

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO: In the original reply it is said that it has not been possible to ascertain the exact number of deaths...

RAO BIRENDRA SINGH: I have mentioned just now.

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO: I stand corrected. Still I would request the hon. Minister to go into this because my information has not come from the newspaper, my information has come from people who have been in these dairies that the number of deaths is much higher. I can go further and say that no less a person than my illustrious and distinguished colleague, Shri H. K. L. Bhagat, a Member of Parliament from Delhi, who has been expressing his greatest concern for the people of Delhi, for the poor of Delhi, has been bringing this matter to the notice of the Ministers, senior Ministers—I say 'Ministers', in plural,—of the Government of India for the last two months. And what has happened? The result is that the epidemic continues. Anyway, let us not lose our temper on this. Let us address ourselves to the plight of these poor people who have been suffering.

The epidemic started in the month of September in Gazipur, within the Delhi Administration. Who were the sufferers because of this epidemic? The poorer among the poor, the farmers who had been settled in that area some time in 1976-77. Some of these people own not more than ten heads of cattle. A person coming from rural areas knows that a buffalo costs Rs. 4,000 or more and the cattle has been bought with loans. If ten heads of cattle die in a family, it will take two or three generations for the family to recover from that. This is the consequence.

Let us see how the whole situation has been tackled. The hon. Minister has rightly pointed out that this epidemic started in late September, 1981. In September, 1981, deaths started taking place, but it was not until about one and a half months later that the police issued instructions at the request of the Delhi Administration.

The Delhi Administration took steps so that the police issued instructions to declare this Gazipur dairy area as an area affected by rinderpest, so that the cattle do not go out of this area. It was, as I said, about one and a half months later that the Deputy Commissioner of Police issued instructions to stop the movement of the cattle outside that area. But still the cattle from that area are roaming throughout Delhi because there are no sufficient precautions. There is no sufficient control to prevent the spread of the cattle in all directions. The cattle have been dying. So, having died, what are the precautions taken to see that the disease does not spread? As you know, rinderpest is highly contagious among the cattle population. It moves in an epidemic form and very fast. Do you know what are the precautions being taken? Precautions being taken are nil to dispose of the carcasses. As far as I know there are no arrangements for incineration in Delhi to dispose of the carcasses. Carcasses are not buried. What is being done is that the private contractors are taking these carcasses, remove the skins and leave them there for the vultures to take hold of them. This is the position and the carcasses can be seen all over Ghazipur, Gharoli and Madanpur Khadar. They can be seen all over these areas, and they are exposed to the vultures and it is spreading in this way. The skin is removed and is used as leather. As you know, the skin itself is a transmitter of the epidemic. This way this epidemic is going all over India due to lack of proper precautions in controlling this epidemic and in disposing of the carcasses. That is what I would mention at this stage.

The point that has been made with a certain amount of anguish is that the vultures who come there—here in Delhi affect the aircraft. Sometime ago you know—I think it was a couple of months back—in Agra one jet plane, just because a feather got into the engine, suffered serious damage and the plane crashed. This way it is going on. What has happened now? There are many aspects of the inefficient way in which the Delhi Administration has been tackling the

situation. These cattle moved out to the next area which is Gharoli. It is proved and it is accepted that in Gharoli this epidemic has already spread. No less a person—I will just quote here from a report of Mr. R.P. Bansal, Head, Division of Virology, IVRI, Mukteswar—Camp Delhi, dated 26th February 1982—then the Head of the Division of Virology of IVRI, Mukteswar Say—he is giving a report regarding the suspected outbreak of rinderpest in Delhi colonies—in para 1:

“The disease was first noticed on 17th January, 1981 by the Veterinary Asst. Surgeon in Shed No. 71 where the affected animals were brought from Gharoli Dairy Complex.”

So the affected animals were brought from the Gharoli Complex. Uptill now there have been several deaths and it has been proved and there is enough proof that this epidemic is spreading in Gharoli and yet Gharoli has not been declared as an area where the epidemic rinderpest is existing. Up to this day it has not been so declared and the cattle move freely and there is no control and the machinery have not been geared to deal with the situation in Gharoli itself. This report deals with the outbreak of rinderpest in this colony of Madanpur Khadar. Coming from a senior officer of the division, it does show the way the Delhi Administration operates. He had requested the Disease Investigation Officers—I quote from this letter:

“The Disease Investigation Officer has been requested to collect the requisite material from this dairy (that is the Madanpur Khadar dairy) for confirmation of the diagnosis. But, unfortunately, the material once collected was sent...”

Imagine, it was sent by post and subsequently it did not reach Mukteswar though so many days have lapsed. Can you believe it, can you imagine the callousness and the carelessness and lack of perspective of a man, the Veterinary Officer, who sends the organs of the dead animals by post?

And they never reached at all. This is the way they are working.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: It cannot be sent by post. The Post Office will not accept it.

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO: Well, Sir. This is what Mr. Bansal said. He is the in-charge of the Virology Division. He is saying this. I am repeating it again.

“The Disease Investigating Officer had been requested to collect the requisite material from this dairy for confirmation of the diagnosis. But, unfortunately, the material once collected was sent by post.”

This is the way it was sent.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Why unfortunately?

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO: Not only unfortunately, Sir. It is most unreasonable. There are no words which can describe this type of action. This is the way it has been going in. These absolute callousness—I repeat callousness—on the part of the Delhi Administration in dealing with the whole affair.

Now we shall come to the main point which is the point of vaccine. The Hon. Minister has mentioned this here of course, on the information received by him, that under the Drugs and Cosmetics Act, it is necessary that labelling should display on the materials general monogram containing the type of vaccine batch number, year and general information for use.

If the hon. Minister or Government today goes and seizes this material, it will be found out. To begin with in the veterinary hospital in this particular colony of Madanpur Khadar, he will find that a large number of vials have no labelling at all. My definite information is that these ampoules and vials and these materials were received without any labelling; nor have they the place of origin, the source, the date of expiry etc. None of these things were mentioned in these ampoules. This is my information. Even today the samples are there. I request the Government to order an enquiry into this and immediately seize

[Shri Eduardo Faleiro] these samples for further investigation. The samples will show that, for instance, the material is absolutely substandard. The colour of the ampoules is supposed to be something like light pinkish but, in many of the samples, it is reddish. Before a large gathering of veterinarians an experiment was made by one of the doctors. He inserted a wire inside the ampoules which are supposed to be airtight. This was done in the presence of the doctors present at that time. More than this, the Government itself admits that these vaccines are ineffective. The cattle was vaccinated and, in several of the farms, they were revaccinated five times more than the dose prescribed. In some places where there is no outbreak of the disease such a thing was done. The only conclusion from this can possibly be, as the Government itself, the Administration itself, admits, that the vaccine is ineffective. Therefore, the dose not less than five times the prescribed dose had to be given. I can give you an example. Cross-bred cows of CDF, Madanpur Khadar got full immunity with single normal dose given in November, 1981. Again they were revaccinated on 23-2-82 with 5 times the normal dose of TCV, keeping in view the outbreak of this disease—amongst buffaloes in the dairy farm. Two of the immuned cross-bred cows who were revaccinated with 5 times the normal dose on 24-2-82 died on 4-3-1982 and 5-3-1982. Post-mortum was conducted and the report confirmed the diagnosis of rinderpest. Then again, Holstein Friesian bred cows of Government Breeding Farm at Setbari who were vaccinated already with normal dose, were revaccinated with 5 times the normal dose. So, Sir, I would like to know whether the hon. Minister will order seizure of the ampoules and also seize the registers from the place these ampoules were issued to find out the date of manufacture and also to verify whether the validity had expired quality and also seize the records and registers of the receiving places to find out whether the same vaccines or some other vaccines were used. Will the Government order an inquiry as to why five times dose was necessary and why it was given even in those farms where there was no epidemic?

Now, Sir, this inefficiency goes from the top of Delhi Administration down to Assis-

tant Veterinary Surgeons. Assistant Veterinary Surgeons are in a state of absolute frustration. There are no chances of promotion in this line. A man recruited as Assistant Veterinary Surgeon. Retires as Assistant Veterinary Surgeon. Their scales of pay are the lowest. Let me give the details.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: How is it relevant here?

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO: It is relevant in pointing out that of the administration and the people who are incharge of executing certain laws are frustrated and feel injustice is being done to them then the whole scheme will be destroyed and it would be better to pay them something more rather than lose crores of rupees. We are losing unspecified amount of money. Sir, even our exports of leather can get affected once the word goes out that the leather being exported is affected.

Now, Sir, the pay-scales are:

Haryana	.. Rs. 850-1500
Punjab	.. Rs. 900-1700
U.P.	.. Rs. 725-1725
Delhi	.. Rs. 550-900

The pay-scale is the lowest in Delhi. This situation has got to be corrected. Frustration should not be there.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Are the qualifications the same?

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO: The qualifications and the duties are the same but the pay-scales are different.

Sir, on the check-posts the cattle which come from outside should be checked and vaccinated but I understand staff is not there and even the cabins required for this are not there. At Badarpur one cabin or the wooden khokha broke down three years ago but till today it has not been repaired although Rs. 55,000/- have been allotted for this purpose and the work may not cost more than Rs. 3,000/- to Rs. 4,000/-.

So, Sir, will Government ensure that the vaccine is not sub-standard and also seize the ampoules at Madanpur Khadar? Will

the Government seize the records of the place of issue of these ampoules and also of the place of receipt to verify whether they are the same vaccines which were actually injected?

Will the Government tighten and control this, so that it does not spread further? In short will the Government awaken the Delhi Administration, to do something at least now immediately: because, a good example is better than a lot of words?

RAO BIRENDRA SINGH: The outbreak of this epidemic in Delhi is a very unfortunate event.

We have been thinking that Northern India particularly had been free from this disease for a long time. But, I must say this, that India can rightly claim the credit for more or less eradicating this epidemic from the country. During the mid-fifties the incidence of rinderpest in India was 196 cattle per lakh per year; whereas now it is only 1 animal per lakh population per year. But still it is a fact that the disease broke out in Delhi. Sir, I must strongly refute the charge of the hon. Member when he said that Mr. H. K. L. Bhagat met one Minister or so many Ministers and no action was taken by the Government of India. Sir, the fact remains that as soon as Mr. Bhagat brought it to my notice, in this very presence, immediately, I telephoned the officers concerned and ordered them to go to these camps, and to call scientists from I.V.R.I. Izatnagar. Immediate action was taken on the very next day. The very next day teams of officers visited these camps. Delhi Administration also took immediate action. Immediately the incidence of this disease was reported, they started vaccinating the cattle, right from the 26th of September. The first report was received by them according to my information, on the 25th of September. So, they have taken immediate action thereon. Delhi has a population of about 2 lakh cattle and buffaloes. The outbreak of this disease was reported only in 4 colonies. The position at present is that in 3 of these colonies, Ghazipur, Gharoli and Masoodpur, no further disease is there; no animal is affected at present. It is only in Madanpur Khadar colony that 25 cattle are still reported to be affected. But we have been able to control this epidemic. Since the first report was received in September, more

than 80,000 cattle have been vaccinated. From the 1st of April of last year, till now, more than 1,86,000 animals have been vaccinated. The vaccine was also issued within the period within which it was efficacious, as per the information received from the IVRI and other sources. No vaccine has been issued after the expiry period. It was properly tested by the manufacturers as to what is the period within which it has to be used. It is just possible that during transit, during transportation, some slips might have been removed. The vacuum on the ampoules can be released. Some ampoules may have been found, as the hon. Member has said, with discoloured vaccine. It is bound to happen if there is no vacuum existing in the ampoules, but these types of vials are not supposed to be used by the veterinary doctors. It is a very ordinary thing which even a layman would know. If it is not properly sealed it is not to be used. All this stuff has to be rejected and thrown away. But this does not mean that all that stock supplied was discoloured. Anyway, one thing is certain that when vaccine is issued by any manufacturing institute, it is certified as being valid for the period till which it is found to be efficacious for use. It is also true that some cattle were vaccinated with five times the dose. When an epidemic breaks out, for boosting up the immunity in the cattle and to make it doubly certain that the cattle are not affected, sometimes larger doses are administered by veterinarians. This is a general practice. There is nothing wrong about it. May be some cattle were also revaccinated. They might have been vaccinated earlier in the normal course. They were again vaccinated after the outbreak of this epidemic. It is only because it is very difficult to identify in a particular camp and to pinpoint as to which cattle were vaccinated and which not vaccinated earlier. Therefore, to be on the safe side, it does not cause any harm if a booster dose is again administered. I do not know, what is so exciting about all these points that the hon. Members has mentioned.

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO: It is a basic thing in the manual that the cattle are segregated and kept separately. They have to be identified. One which has been vaccinated has to be identified by some mark on them etc.

RAO BIRENDRA SINGH: I hope you will be able to go and visit these colonies and see for yourself how these cattle are huddled up, and ask the owners whether they themselves would be able to say which cow or buffalo was vaccinated and which was not vaccinated. The owners themselves would know it.

As I have already said this vaccine was produced in three institutes. IVRI is one of our premier institutions for veterinary sciences. The vaccine that is being produced in India is found to be quite useful and efficacious, and it is only with this vaccine indigenously produced that we have been able to control this disease throughout the country. But as it is at present if there are still any doubts existing in the minds of the hon. Members, I have no objection in sending my officers again to see for themselves the conditions and also to look into the allegations of callousness on the part of the Delhi Administration. And if we find that they have been slow in taking action, we shall certainly point it out to the head of the Administration that is the Lt. Governor, and ask him to take proper action.

SHRI K. LAKKAPPA (Tumkur): Sir, at the outset, I would like to say that we do not mean any confrontation with the hon. Minister personally on this question. We are speaking for the animals, the dumb mute millions, on whom depends the livelihood of millions of farmers. The hon. Minister must have some sympathy towards the animals at least. This subject has not been raised as a consequence of the news items in the newspaper only, we are, in fact, very much interested in helping the hon. Minister to streamline the administration. We want to bring it to the notice of the hon. Minister, how the bureaucrats and the machinery to look after these things functions. This Parliament which is the sovereign body, has every right to discuss this subject. The hon. Minister should not feel that we have any confrontation with him. And he can repudiate the charges. 'Sub-standard vaccine kills 5,000 cows' is a news item which has appeared in the newspapers. This is apart from the information that we have gathered. Already my friend, Shri Faleiro, has submitted the information a little exhaustively. This is not based on imaginary facts, out on the facts

collected by the local people, representatives of the people and from various other sources and expert-opinion; and from the reports of the IVRI, functioning since 1977. It has been reported and is based on the press clippings that I have gone through. It is based on the functioning and differences among the scientists who produce the results, on what is called the inventions; their researches, their conclusions and deliberations doubting themselves, clashing themselves regarding the administration of that. This is a premier institution of this country where the great scientists have evolved this and made research. The question is whether the vaccine which was developed in the institute showed that it was the proper vaccine. Whether the research was made on the basis of proper analysis, whether the research operations were properly done, and it was properly packed, properly distributed: whether there were any ampoules passed. These are the questions which are to be looked into.

Rinderpest is a dirty disease; it is a deadly disease. This is a disease which spreads like wild fire.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: The information given is 958. You correct yourself. 5,000 is not correct.

SHRI K. LAKKAPPA: The information supplied by the Hon. Minister is not in conformity with the subject that we have raised. The subject raised was whether the vaccine killed 5,000 cows. Of late he has admitted. He had not supplied the information to us earlier. Now, he has stated that still he is collecting the information. Therefore, he is in the process of collecting the information on the basis of the Calling Attention notice. Now, he has come out partly, because the information must have been suppressed by the Administration or Officers.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Information has got to come from Yama! There he has taken sometime.

SHRI K. LAKKAPPA: Sir, widespread rinderpest is a reality. The question is how has this disease been treated?

The recent reports of the Delhi Administration and of the stalwarts of the Veterinary Department, of great scientists have come out with a conclusion and I will read out their deliberations. It is a long history.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please don't. It will take time

SHRI K. LAKKAPPA: Why not, Sir. It will be helpful to the Minister to take stock of the situation.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Calling Attention has to be completed within half an hour. Not only today every day we take at least two hours.

SHRI K. LAKKAPPA: Sir, there is no hard and fast rule. It is a very serious matter.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: If you quote rule, then I will abide by the rule.

SHRI K. LAKKAPPA: Sir, don't we owe our duty to Parliament in cleansing the Administration and bringing out meaningful deliberations and conclusions?

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Mr. Lakkappa, you have got to conduct the proceedings of the House, according to the rules.

SHRI K. LAKKAPPA: Sir, within the four corners of the rules, I am holding the floor now. I would like to submit the observations made not by me, not by any other Member. I am submitting because our hon. Minister is strong enough to take action. That is why I want to bring this to his notice.

One Dr. Zail Singh complained about the non-availability of refrigerator, syringes, needles, aspirins, gum-boots, sterilisers. And most of the hospitals in the rural areas of Delhi complained about the frequent failures of electricity during the operations on animals. The poor farmers are dependent on milk from these buffaloes and cows owned by them. (They sell their milk and eke out their livelihood. They are all farmers. Our

20-point economic programme is in operation to help farmers—and even these animals. The poor farmers have lost these animals because of negligence and dereliction of duty by these officers. Have these animals been insured or not? We do not know what has happened.

The Minister has not collected full information. His information is also not related to the disease mentioned in the question raised. This dirty disease is spreading for the last one year. Even one Dr. Doop Singh has complained about the non-availability of medicines in various parts of Delhi.

RAO BIRENDRA SINGH: Is he a doctor?

SHRI K. LAKKAPPA: There are so many people having doctorates, and names like Sharma etc.

Of course, the Minister said that they have controlled rinderpest in Northern India. He has not said it about the South. That is why I kept quiet.

This is the biggest tragedy for the dumb animals, for whom we must speak in Parliament to-day. We must have sympathy for them, and shed tears. To-day our economy is dependent on buffaloes and other animals. We are dependent on Haryana buffaloes and cows. And there are buffaloes in other parts of the country. We are proud of these buffaloes in Haryana.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur): One correction, Sir; we are not dependent only on buffaloes from Haryana, but also on the Agriculture Minister who is from Haryana.

RAO BIRENDRA SINGH: He has forgotten the Haryana bulls.

SHRI K. LAKKAPPA: There are different categories of animals in other parts of the country. So, protecting them is very necessary.

Here is a case where even the carcasses have been removed and dumped in wrong places. The doctors were

[Shri K. Lakkappa]

afraid that this fact might be disclosed to the people. So, ultimately the doctors worked in collusion with those people. If the dirty disease spread to the other animals, then the milk also will not be sold. So, they were in collusion, and dumped the dead animals in such a manner. According to the report with me, the dead cattle were disposed of in a most unhygienic manner. The carcasses were dumped on the ground or were secretly buried. Scientifically speaking, they should have been burnt, to prevent this contagious disease spreading further.

My friend was also mentioning about vultures. We have seen the vultures in Delhi. The vultures have the intelligence to smell things from a distance. These animals have died because of dereliction of duty of certain people. Proper treatment was not given to these animals. They were buried in this manner, with the risk of the disease spreading further, and also increasing the menace of vultures in Delhi; and vultures have been creating trouble for the travelling public.

So, we have to take all these things into consideration. Information has been suppressed from the Minister. The Minister must take serious action against officers responsible for dereliction of duty—whoever they may be. He must get the full facts and assess the situation. Will the Minister do this, and also find out whether these animals had been covered by insurance? Have they been provided any reimbursement of money for the animals they had lost due to the negligence on the part of the officials for not giving them proper treatment at the proper time, owing to the gamut of the whole administration? The scientific researches in this premier Institute are also not helping them. I should not become a hotbed of controversy. The benefits of the scientific research must reach the poor farmers and the Government should see that the animal wealth of this country is protected. On the basis of the performance of the department concerned and the Ministry, some responsibility has to be fixed.

I would like to ask the hon Minister whether he will take serious action against the officers who are found guilty due to dereliction of duty. Would he also issue instruction to them to supply vaccines to the farmers and also find out what remedial measures are necessary in this regard? Would he also conduct further research into this and see that such kind of disease should not spread either in Delhi or elsewhere in this country? Would he also see that the anomalies that exist in the pay-scales of the employees of the Department are also removed so that there is no dissatisfaction in the employees; and also no discrimination should be there.

If necessary, we will also visit the premier Institute and see if there are further remedial measures to be adopted for streamlining the whole thing and also helping my hon Minister to strengthen its administration. We are prepared to offer our services in this regard. Will the hon. Minister try to answer all my questions?

RAO BIRENDRA SINGH: I have already given the information that I was able to collect. I have already said, I am very unhappy about the whole thing. It has been believed that rinderpest was eradicated from these parts of the country; and I do not see any reason why such a large number of animals should have died from a disease which it has been found possible to control or for which vaccines exist and people also know what steps to take to prevent it from spreading. The actual administration is the Delhi Administration in the field. I do not know what action I can take against the delinquent apart from asking my officers in the Ministry of Agriculture to go further into the whole question of the complaints that the hon. members have voiced and to bring everything to the notice of the Delhi Administration or the Home Ministry. The hon. Minister of Home Affairs is also sitting here. He can also look into this matter on his own. I would certainly satisfy myself further as to what action was taken by the officers of my Ministry

after I had instructed them to go all out to see that this disease was controlled; and if I find that they have been wanting or there has been any laxity on the part of officers of the Animal Husbandry Department of my Ministry, I will be responsible for taking action against them.

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: You have said something about compensation.

RAO BIRENDRA SINGH: We have no scheme about compensation with the Government of India. It is for the Delhi Administration and the Home Ministry to consider these suggestions and they are being noted.

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO: What about financial assistance and loans?

SHRI K. LAKKAPPA: The hon. Minister is really sympathetic to give compensation. There should be some coordination between the Delhi Administration and them for all these things.

13.00 hrs.

Therefore, it needs only two minutes to reply to the Call Attention. The Home Ministry, the Delhi Administration and the Agriculture Ministry, all are concerned. Something should be done regarding this matter.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: He has noted all your points.

RAO BIRENDRA SINGH: I cannot enter into any controversy about the number of deaths that have taken place. I have to rely on... (Interruptions).

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT (East-Delhi): It does not come in this because this is a Call Attention Motion. But the fact is that they should be given some financial assistance or easy term loans. This matter was taken up by me with the Finance Ministry and I was advised to contact the Agriculture Ministry. I would just want him to see and tell us what has happened.

RAO BIRENDRA SINGH: I have to reply upon the figures supplied by the

Delhi Administration with regard to the number of deaths.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Fortunately, all of you happen to be ruling Party Members. Therefore, you can do something in the matter.

SHRI K. LAKKAPPA: Not in that way. We never want any such discrimination.

RAO BIRENDRA SINGH: Mr. Lakkappa has pointed out about shortage of some equipment like syringes, needles, gum boots and other things. But the report received by me from the Delhi Administration says that there is no shortage of equipment, as reported by the hon. Member. In any case I am glad for the manner in which hon. Members have raised this question in the House because I myself feel that something more has to be done to look after our cattle wealth in this country. The number of veterinary hospitals is not enough. We are also short of medicines. I hope the States would be able to increase the number of veterinary hospitals, have properly trained people to look after the cattle wealth of the country, because the welfare not only of the farmer, but of the entire country and agriculture depends upon our animal wealth and we have to depend more and more on animal draught power too, because with the cost of diesel rising the prices of machinery are also going up. I entirely agree with hon. Members that this is not a question to be brushed away. We want to further look into all the aspects of the matter which have been raised by hon. Members.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Shri Krishna Kumar Goyal.

श्री कृष्ण कुमार गोयल : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय . . .

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please do not take too much time.

श्री कृष्ण कुमार गोयल (कोटा) : मैं कुछ नई बातें आपके सामने कहूंगा जो अभी तक कही नहीं गई हैं और जिन

[श्री कृष्ण कुमार गोयल]

को मंत्री महोदय से जानबूझ कर छिपाया गया है। जो बातें रिकार्ड पर हैं, वही आपकी नालिज में लाऊंगा।

सबसे पहले तो मैं माननीय अध्यक्ष महोदय का इस ध्यान आकर्षण प्रस्ताव को स्वीकार करने के लिये आभारी हूँ, साथ ही अपनी गम्भीर घटना हिन्दुस्तान टाइम्स के कारस्पोंडेंट श्री अरुण कुमार हमारी नालिज में लाये हैं, जिसके आधार पर हम यहां बहस कर पा रहे हैं, इस के लिये मैं उन को भी धन्यवाद देता हूँ। उन्होंने इस में कई प्वाइन्ट्स हाइलाइट किये थे, जिनका आपने अपने स्टेटमेंट में जवाब दिया है। लेकिन कृषि मंत्री जी, मैं आप से यह कहूंगा कि जानबूझकर कई फैक्ट्स आपसे छिपाये गये हैं जो रिकार्ड पर हैं और किसी छोटे व्यक्ति के पास नहीं बल्कि आप ही की मिनिस्ट्री से एटेच्ड एनीमल हस्बैंड्री कमिश्नर के पास रिकार्ड पर हैं। उनके पास रिकार्ड में सब चीजें लाई गव हैं कि किस प्रकार से ये दवायें, वक्सीन जो इस बीमारी के लिये काम में लाई जाती हैं, सब-स्टैंडर्ड थीं, किस प्रकार वे एम्प्यूल खाली थे और उसके कारण जो प्रयोग किया गया वह असफल रहा।

मैं मंत्री महोदय से पूछना चाहता हूँ—क्या यह सही है कि 9 फरवरी, 1982 को डा० आर० पी० बंसल, आई० वी० आर० आई०, जो वायरोलाजिस्ट है और मुक्तेश्वर, यू० पी० के हैं, उन की अध्यक्षता में एक कान्फरेंस ओल्ड सैक्रेटेरियट, दिल्ली एडमिनिस्ट्रेशन में हुई, जिस को डिप्टी डायरेक्टर, एनिमल हस्बैंड्री, दिल्ली ने भी एटेण्ड किया? क्या यह सही है कि उस मीटिंग की मिनिट्स लिखी गई, कुछ निर्णय लिये गये और वे मिनिट्स तथा निर्णय आपके

एनीमल हस्बैंड्री कमिश्नर, गवर्नमेंट आफ इण्डिया कृषि मंत्रालय, कृषि भवन, को भेजे गये? यह बहुत लम्बा चौड़ा है, जिस को मैं पूरा नहीं पढ़ना चाहूंगा लेकिन इसमें से कुछ कोट करना चाहूंगा। मैं यह पूछना चाहूंगा कि क्या आपको इसकी जानकारी है। मैं बताना चाहता हूँ कि जो सूचना आप को दी गई है, वह गलत है और यह जानना चाहूंगा कि उच्च स्तर पर इस घटना के बारे में जो बात छिपाई गई, क्या आप उस की जांच करवाएंगे? क्या आप होम मिनिस्ट्री के माध्यम से यह भी जांच करवाएंगे कि इसमें जो लापरवाही हुई है, उसके लिए कौन जिम्मेवार हैं और जहां से ये वैक्सीन सप्लाय की गई और जोकि सब-स्टैंडर्ड थीं जैसा कि शिकायत आई है, उसके लिए जो लोग दोषी पाए जाएंगे उन को केवल नौकरी से सस्पेंड करने या नौकरी से हटाने की ही बात नहीं होगी, बल्कि क्या आप उन को प्रोसीक्यूट भी कराएंगे सम्बन्धित कानून के अधीन।

उपाध्यक्ष जी, जिस का मैं रेफेंस दे रहा हूँ, उस के पैरा 3 की तरफ मैं राव साहब का ध्यान आपके माध्यम से आकर्षित करना चाहूंगा। उसमें यह दिया हुआ है:

“Dr. V. K. Kashyap further pointed out that ampoules of RP vaccines do not contain any information regarding the date of manufacture, date of expiry, batch number, name of the manufacturer, name of the vaccine and the doses per ampoule.”

क्या इस घटना से यह साबित नहीं हो जाता कि जो तथ्य समाचारपत्रों के माध्यम से सामने लाये गये, वे सत्य हैं। क्या इससे यह साबित नहीं हो जाता कि

जो वैक्सीन थी, वे सब-स्टैंडर्ड थीं ? क्या यह बात सत्य नहीं है। इसके बाद पैरा 4 में यह कहा गया है :

"Dr. V. K. Kashyap further pointed out that ampoules of RP vaccines supplied to the hospital for the control of this disease did not contain the same quantity of medicine and some of the ampoules were defective, some of them were discoloured and some of them were not properly sealed. These ampoules were brought by him for demonstration in the meeting, with the permission of the Chair. Dr. Kashyap stressed that this is one of the factors..."

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: He should not read it. I will not allow it.

SHRI KRISHNA KUMAR GOYAL: I am not reading. I am giving a quotation.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: You can put a question. I will not allow reading. I am not permitting it. This is a calling Attention. You know the rules; you are a senior Member; you have been a Minister and all that.

SHRI KRISHNA KUMAR GOYAL: I am not reading it... (Interruption)

An HON. MEMBER: Why are you so angry?

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am not angry. I am always very kind. But please do not read it. I will not allow you to read it. In the form of a question, you can not make a speech.

I want to make it very clear that the time allotted for the Calling Attention every day is half an hour. But it is 2 O'Clock by the time it is over. Therefore, you please put the question.

SHRI KRISHNA KUMAR GOYAL: I would have finished it by now, if you had not interrupted me.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: That is all right. I will not allow you to read it. If you want to read anything, you should have given a copy, to the Speaker, which should have been approved by the Speaker.

Then only you can read it. I am not allowing it. You put the question.

श्री कृष्ण कुमार गोयल : क्या यह सही है कि जिस मिनट का मैं ने अभी रेफेंस दिया है, उस में डा० कश्यप ने सब-स्टैंडर्ड होने के बारे में, एम्प्यूल खाली होने के बारे में उन का रंग बदल जाने के बारे में शिकायत की थी ? क्या यह भी सही है कि डा० कन्हैया लाल ने उसी मीटिंग के अन्दर यह भी कहा था कि जी० टी० वी० और टी० सी० बी० का जो प्रयोग हो रहा है, वह डिजीज को इरेडीकेट करने के लिए इफैक्टिव नहीं है ?

राव बहारेन्द्र सिंह : कौन है, कितना बड़ा साइंटिस्ट है ?

SHRI KRISHNA KUMAR GOYAL: I am not going into that controversy. Simply, I am...

RAO BIRENDRA SINGH: It is the opinion of somebody. How can you quote it? If you want information from the Government. I will give you all the information. Why are you quoting Tom Dilk and Harry from the country?

SHRI KRISHNA KUMAR GOYAL: That is not my purpose. (Interruptions). Don't take it otherwise.

श्री कृष्ण कुमार गोयल : : मैं कह रहा हूँ कि क्या यह रिपोर्ट जो कि एक जिम्मेदार व्यक्ति के द्वारा दी गयी थी, कमिश्नर के द्वारा एग्जामिन की गयी थी और की गयी थी तो एग्जामिन करने के बाद उसने अपनी कोई रिपोर्ट दी है ?

उपाध्यक्ष जी, इस रिपोर्ट का मैंने हवाला दिया है और आप की इजाजत से इस रिपोर्ट को मैं सदन की मेज पर रख रहा हूँ। इस रिपोर्ट के आधार पर

[श्री कृष्ण कुमार गोयल]

मैं आप से निवेदन करूंगा कि अब उचित स्तर पर जांच कराएं और पता लगाएं कि तथ्य क्या हैं। कितने पशु मरे हैं ?

आपको मैं जानकारी देना चाहूंगा कि पहले जो प्रकाशनरी मेजर्स लिये गये थे, मास चेकिंग के, डाक्टर आदि के वे अब अबालिश कर दिये गये हैं। उसी का परिणाम यह है कि यह रूप धारण कर गया है और रिण्डरपेस्ट तक आ गयी है। जो पशु मरे हैं उनके बारे में तथ्य यह है कि बड़े कीमती पशु जो हमने इम्पोर्ट किए थे वे पशु भी इस बीमारी का शिकार हो चुके हैं।

अन्त में मैं इस रिपोर्ट* को सदन की टेबल पर रखता हुआ यह निवेदन करूंगा कि देश के हित में इसकी उचित स्तर पर जांच कराएं और दोषी व्यक्तियों को दंडित करें।

RAO BIRENDRA SINGH: Kindly put it on the Table of the House.

AN HON. MEMBER: How can he put it? He cannot put it on the Table.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I will examine it; not on the Table.

राव वीरेन्द्र सिंह : डिप्टी स्पीकर सर, माननीय सदस्य ने जो सवाल उठाये हैं उनका तफसील में मैं पहले जवाब दे चुका हूँ। मैं मानता हूँ कि दिल्ली जैसे बड़े शहरों में जहाँ कि ज्यादा पशु रखे जाते हैं, बीमारी का ज्यादा खतरा पैदा हो जाता है। वहाँ के लिए कायदे कानून भी अच्छे बनने चाहिए और बने भी हुए हैं। उनको लागू भी अच्छी तरह से किया जाना चाहिए।

मैं नहीं समझता कि जिस तरह से दूध के पशुओं की कालोनियां बन रही हैं उनमें सफाई का खास इंतजाम रखा जाता है। दिल्ली शहर से बाहर निकालने के लिए दिल्ली एडमिनिस्ट्रेशन ने हुकूम दिया है, लेकिन वहाँ भी सफाई का जो स्टैण्डर्ड अपनाया जाना चाहिए, वह अपनाया जाता है या नहीं, इसकी मैं देखभाल करूंगा।

कुछ इन्होंने जिक्र किया कि दिल्ली एडमिनिस्ट्रेशन के किसी अफसर ने या किसी और ने वेक्सीन खराब और डिकलर्ड पाया। यह बात मैं पहले मान चुका हूँ कि ट्रांसपोटेशन के वक्त वेक्सीन खराब हो जाता है, डिकलर्ड हो जाता है या उस पर चिट अलग हो सकती है। कोई बच ऐसा आ जाता है कि उस पर चिट नहीं होती। लेकिन जिस पर चिट नहीं होती उसके बारे में इस बात का सर्टिफिकेट होना चाहिए कि इस डिब्बे के अन्दर यह बैच है और उसकी एक्सपायरी डेट यह है। जहाँ तक आपका यह कहना है कि हमारे महकमे के नोटिस में पहले यह बात लायी गयी थी तो उसकी मैं जरूर देखभाल करूंगा कि जहाँ जहाँ वेक्सीन तैयार होती है, वहाँ खास तौर पर अपने अफसरों को भेज कर जांच कराऊंगा कि जब वे पैक करते हैं, या सील करते हैं तो उस वक्त पूरी एहतियात बरतते हैं या नहीं। इस मामले में सरपराइज्ड चेकिंग भी कराऊंगा। यह एक बहुत जरूरी चीज है। इसका स्टैण्डर्ड कायम रहना चाहिए। इसकी तरफ आपने तवाज्जु दिलायी है कि ये ठीक तरह से पैक कराये जाएं। यह ठीक है कि अगर ये बातें न हों तो यह बीमारी दूर नहीं कर सकते हैं और उन लोगों के खिलाफ यह धोखा होगा। अगर किसी इंस्टीच्यूट में यह पाया जाता है तो कायदे

*The Speaker not having subsequently accorded the necessary permission the Report was not treated as laid on the Table.

कानून के मुताबिक जो भी एक्शन लिया जा सकता है, वह जरूर लिया जाएगा। इसकी तसल्ली मैं आपको कराता हूँ।

मिनट्स जो आपने बतायें, वे मेरे नोटिस में नहीं हैं। क्या मिनट्स थे, किसने दिये थे, मैं उनको जरूर देखूंगा और जरूर पड़ताल करूंगा। अगर किसी की तरफ से उसमें ढिलायी पायी गयी तो जरूर एक्शन लिया जाएगा।

SHRI CHINTAMANI JENA (Balsore): I am thankful to the hon. Minister that he has understood the seriousness of the problems. We all know that this matter relates to the lives and deaths of animals who cannot express their feelings and sufferings like human beings. I am thankful to him that he has assured this House that he will look into the matter personally and see that if there is any lacuna or that any slackness among the officials will not be tolerated. The hon. Minister in his statement has told that the number of deaths of the cattle is 958. I do not agree with him. Let him conduct an enquiry through proper agency about the fact of the actual deaths. Even the cattle owners are not going to disclose the reason of death of the cattle by rinderpest disease. They have a fear that the area may be declared as rinderpest zone. The cattle owners are maintaining their livelihood by selling milk etc. If they disclose this disease they will be prohibited to sell the milk. Because of that fear they are not reporting the matter to the authority. As per my information the number is more than 5,000. This includes buffaloes, cow and calf. This may kindly be got verified.

The hon. Minister stated that this disease was previously confined to Ghazipur, Mehrauli and Madanpur which are not even urban areas. Because proper action was not taken, therefore, the disease spread and contaminated urban areas. So, the responsibility should be fixed as to why it was not checked at the primary stage.

The hon. Minister in his reply has stated that Animal Husbandary Commissioner had visited the affected area on 1st December, 1981 had given on the spot instructions which were followed by a note on the visit, sent to the Development Commissioner, Delhi Administration, on 2nd December, 1981 incorporating recommendations to be immediately followed for control of the epidemic. I would like to know those instructions? Is it a fact that one of the instructions was to increase the dose of vaccine to five times. After these instructions 1200 cattle were re-vaccinated. But most of these died. What was the reason of the advice to increase the dose by five times?

One thing, I cannot understand. In spite of the d.o. letter from the Secretary in the Department of Agriculture and Co-operation to the Chief Secretary, Delhi Administration, the cattle which died due to rinderpest, are thrown in the open field and in the open air. This is another reason for the contamination and spreading of this rinderpest disease. In spite of the D.O. letter from the Secretary, Agriculture and Co-operation, the Delhi Administration has not followed it up. It was not carried out. Then, how can we expect that this type of epidemic disease can be checked and the miserable lives of the poor cattle saved? I would request the hon. Minister kindly to take up this issue with the concerned Ministries so that in case of any default or slackness on the part of the Delhi Administration, that can be suitably tackled.

In his statement, the hon. Minister has stated that under the Drugs and Cosmetic Act, labelling should display general monogram on viral vaccines. About 50 per cent of the ampoules in a lot should contain, at least, the following print:—

- (i) T.C.R.P. Vaccine
- (ii) Batch No. and year
- (iii) General information for use.

But one thing, I could not understand, why the date of expiry was not displayed on those vaccines? The hon. Minister may kindly clarify. The Minister, in his statement, has stated that the Head of

[Shri Chintamani Jena]

the Division of Virology of the IVRI had visited the site of the outbreaks and the biological units of Rajasthan and Punjab. According to his report, the vaccines, both goat tissue vaccines and tissue culture vaccines supplied to Delhi Administration by all the three sources did conform to the prescribed standards. In this connection, I would draw the attention of the hon. Minister to the serious allegations against the IVRI for the last three or four years. Should we rely on the report of the IVRI? I would request the hon. Minister kindly to see that the vaccine which has already been sealed, is verified through the reliable agencies other than the IVRI.

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: The Minister has already mentioned in the reply earlier. You are repeating many things from the same reply.

SHRI CHINTAMANI JENA: My submission is that we should not rely on the report of the IVRI. I would request the hon. Minister kindly to verify the genuineness of these vaccines through other reliable agencies.

Before concluding I would like to know about the rehabilitation of the poor cattle owners who lost their cattle which were purchased by taking loans of some thousand rupees. My hon. friend Mr. Lakkappa has already told about the rehabilitation of the loaner, and it should be taken with utmost sincerity.

I would request the hon. Minister to take up the issue with the Delhi Administration and the concerned Ministries including the Finance Ministry about which my friend Mr. Bhagat has already taken up. I would request the Minister to kindly take up this issue and see that these poor cattle owners are rehabilitated.

RAO BIRENDRA SINGH: Sir, I have taken note of all the suggestions given by the hon. Member.

As the hon. Member knows, this is a contagious disease. We shall draw the attention of Delhi Administration to-

wards the need for enforcing rules for sanitation in these cattle colonies. This is most important because it is necessary that diseased animals are segregated, pure water is supplied to healthy animals and there is no overcrowding also of cattle population in any particular area. We shall look into all that through the Delhi Administration. The instructions exist on how to print the monograph on ampoules. They also have to provide a slip with every package giving all the information about the date of manufacture, the date of expiry and the type of vaccine, etc. If there is any carelessness in packing in any of the Institutes, we shall again reiterate the instructions and we shall ensure that they are observed.

डा० ए० यू० आज़मी (जौनपुर) :
डिप्टी स्पीकर साहब, हमारे हिन्दुस्तान में बहुत से ऐसे लोग हैं जिनके पास न ज़मीन है, न उद्योग है, न मुलाजमत है और न जायदाद है जिससे अपनी गुज़र-बसर कर सकें। उनमें से बहुत से मजदूरी करते हैं, जानवरों की सवारी खींचते हैं और दूध बेच कर अपनी रोज़ी कमाते और लोगों की ज़रूरत पूरी करते हैं। ऐसी सूरत में सरकार ने अपने प्रोग्राम का कोई ऐलान किया है कि हम इनकी मदद भी और हित्फ़ाजत करेंगे? वैक्सिन बनाने का सेन्टर हरियाणा में भी है। देश के लोगों की दूध की ज़रूरत को यह ख़ाले लोग पूरा करते हैं; लेकिन अफ़सोस है कि सरकार के इतने इंतज़ाम के बावजूद भी प्रति आदमी दूध कंजमेशन का रेट गिर रहा है। 1945 में जब हम आज़ाद नहीं थे। तब एक आदमी को 150 ग्राम दूध मिलता था, 1951 में 130 ग्राम रह गया और अब कहा जाता है कि 110 ग्राम प्रति व्यक्ति है। लेकिन अगर प्रोडक्शन (पैदावार) और आबादी के रेशियो को जोड़ा जाय तो प्रति व्यक्ति 100 ग्राम से भी कम पड़ता है। इतनी केयरलेसनेस हो रही है जिसका नतीजा यह हुआ कि अच्छी

ब्रीड के जानवरों का प्रोटेक्शन नहीं कर सके और लापरवाही की वजह से तकरीबन 5,000 जानवर मर गये। अखबार में निकला है कि बैज न० नहीं है, मैन्युफैक्चरिंग और ऐक्सपायरी डेट नहीं है और वैक्सीन डिस्कलर हो गई थी। इस सिलसिले में मंत्री जी ने इस बात को डिनाई किया है। मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि जब भी कोई मैटर हम लोग रोज करते हैं तो वह नेशनल इंटरैस्ट में कहते हैं। लेकिन हमारा ट्रेंड है कि जब भी कोई बात कही जाती है तो पूरा डिपार्टमेंट इस बात की कोशिश करता है कि इसको डिनाई किया जाये। मैं आप से उम्मीद नहीं करता हूँ कि आप भी ऐसा ही करेंगे बल्कि कोशिश करनी चाहिये कि जो नुकसान हो रहा है उसको रोका जाय, पूरा किया जाय।

अब देखिये हिन्दुस्तान में फसादात होते हैं, गोलियां चलती हैं, इन्सानी जानें जाती हैं, उसकी केयर तो गवर्नमेंट करती नहीं है, जानवरों की केयर क्या करेगी? हमें तो उमीद नहीं है कि इसमें कोई एक्शन लिया जायेगा, लेकिन हमारी अपोजिशन वालों की खासतौर से ड्यूटी यह है कि उन तक बात पहुंचा दें।

मैं मंत्री जी से रिक्वेस्ट करूंगा कि इसकी इन्क्वायरी डिपार्टमेंट पर न छोड़ी जाये, डिपार्टमेंट का हर आदमी मिस-गाइड करेगा। कल से जब से कार्लिंग अटेंशन नोटिस मंजूर हुआ है, तभी से दौड़धूप हो गयी होगी कि ऐसी रिपोर्ट तैयार करें कि मंत्री जी को सही बात मालूम न हो और वह कोई एक्शन न ले सकें। मैं रिक्वेस्ट करूंगा कि इसकी एक इन्क्वायरी कमेटी बैठानी चाहिये और अगर आप बिठायें तो एम० पी० की एक कमेटी बनाये। उसके साथ-साथ यह भी अर्ज करूंगा कि उस कमेटी की रिपोर्ट जब आये तो उसको

भी अनुर करें ऐसा न हो कि जैसे लेट श्री ज्योतिर्मय बसु ने ब्लैक शीप (Black-sheep) पर अपनी जो रिपोर्ट दी थी उसमें जिन लोगों को मुजरिम गर्दाना गया था, उनको बाद में प्रमोशन दे दी गई। ऐसा न हो कि मेम्बर पार्लियामेंट की इन्क्वायरी कमेटी रिपोर्ट करे और डिपार्टमेंट के लोग मिस-गाइड कर के आपको और कुछ बता दें और उन जिम्मेदार लोगों को ही प्रमोट करके किसी को अमरीका और किसी को जापान भेज दिया जाये?

आई० वी० आर० आई० सन् 1881 में कायम की गई थी वैक्सीन तैयार करने के लिये, जो कि प्रिवैन्टिव मेजर में इस्तेमाल की जा सके और जानवरों की हिफाजत हो सके। उसका बजट करोड़ों का था, लेकिन अभी भी 5 करोड़ का है। उसका नतीजा यह है कि जो वैक्सीन तैयार करते हैं, जो वैक्सीनेशन किया जाता है, उससे 5 हजार जानवर मर गये और बीमारी देहातों से शहरों में फैल जाती है।

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Do you want a Committee of Parliament? You have put all your questions. It is enough. Now the Hon. Minister would reply.

DR. A. U. AZMI: I will mention only the last point.

राव बीरेन्द्र सिंह : बाकी बातें मुझे लिखकर भेज दीजिये।

डा० ए० यू० आजमी : मिनिस्टर साहब को लिखकर दे देंगे, लेकिन जबानी भी कहकर देंगे। जो कुछ हो रहा है, दुनिया देख रही है।

क्या इस हादसे में 5 हजार से ज्यादा बेजबान जानवर मौत की नींद नहीं सो गये? इस बारे में जिन मेम्बरान

[डा० ए० यू० आजमी]

ने कॉलिंग अटेंशन मोशन दिया था क्या उसके जवाब में मंत्री जी कोई इन्क्वायरी कमेटी एम० पी० जी० की बिठायेंगे, जो थोड़े दिनों में इसके बारे में अपनी रिपोर्ट दे ? क्या इस रिपोर्ट को पिछली रिपोर्टों की तरह रही की टोकरी में न फेंक कर मंत्री महोदय मुजरियों के खिलाफ सख्त कार्यवाही करेंगे ताकि आइन्दा कोई ऐसी सूरत न हो सके ?

राव बीरेन्द्र सिंह : माननीय सदस्य ने बातें तो वही कहीं है जो पहले सारी आ चुकी हैं और मैं जवाब भी दे चुका हूँ। अफसोस इस बात का है कि एक बार अखबार पढ़ने के बाद 5,000 की फिगर आनरेबल मेम्बर्स के दिमाग में ऐसी जम गई है कि वजीर के 6 बार कहने के बाद भी कि 5,000 नहीं, 958 मौतें हुई हैं, वह 958 की बात उनके दिमाग में घुस नहीं पाती और 5,000 की बात निकल नहीं पाती। अखबार पर उन को ज्यादा एतबार है, इसका मेरे पास इलाज नहीं है। यह तो मेरी मजबूरी है।

मवेशियों की मौत चाहे 11 हजार की हुई हो, चाहे, 5,000 की हुई हो, अगर कम से कम भी हुई है तो भी मुझे अफसोस उतना ही है। मैं कह चुका हूँ कि मौत नहीं होनी चाहिये, यह वाकई बुरा है और हमें इसका अफसोस है। बाकी जो कुछ किया जा सकता है, एनक्वायरी कर के जिस किसी की कमी पाई जा सकती है, उसके मुताल्लिक हम कदम उठावेंगे। मेरी निगाह में इससे मेम्बराने-पार्लियामेंट की कमेटी का सवाल पैदा नहीं होता। जिस श्री ज्योतिर्मय बसु की कमेटी का माननीय सदस्य ने जिक्र किया है, वह मेम्बराने-पार्लियामेंट की कमेटी नहीं थी, बल्कि वह कमेटी खुद आई० सी० ए० आर० ने बनाई थी, जिसके वह मेम्बर थे। हम दो साल तक उस रिपोर्ट की इन्तजार

करते रहे। उनकी जिन्दगी में वह रिपोर्ट नहीं आई। श्री ज्योतिर्मय बसु की नागहानी कफ़ात के बाद उनके साहबजादे ने वह रिपोर्ट मुझे पहुंचाई। (व्यवधान) पहले कुछ आई थी, लेकिन कम्पलीट रिपोर्ट उनकी जिन्दगी में नहीं आई। उसकी आखिरी किस्त बाद में पहुंची। मेम्बराने-पार्लियामेंट की कमेटी की रिपोर्ट पर सरकार पूरा ध्यान देती है। यह नहीं होता कि उस पर ध्यान नहीं दिया जाता। यह मामला ऐसा है कि इस बारे में महकमाना कार्रवाई ही काफी होगी। यह दिल्ली एडमिनिस्ट्रेशन का मामला है। हम इसकी जितनी देख-भाल कर सकेंगे, करेंगे।

डा० ए० यू० आजमी : इसकी एनक्वायरी डिपार्टमेंट से न कराइए, बल्कि सी० बी० आई० से कराइए। आज जो रिपोर्ट आपको मिली है वह रिपोर्ट का थर्ड पार्ट है। रिपोर्ट का यह पहला और दूसरा पार्ट वह अपनी जिन्दगी में भेज चुके थे।

13.36 hrs.

MATTERS UNDER RULE 377

(i) Damage to standing rabi crops in Madhya Pradesh by recent hailstorms.

SHRI MADHAVRAO SCINDIA (Guna): This year rains in the months of October and November, 1981, had brightened the prospects of a good rabi crop in Madhya Pradesh. According to official estimates, the total value of average crop before hailstorms was expected to be Rs. 11834.83 lakhs. Unfortunately, on the 10th January 1982, widespread hailstorms occurred simultaneously in ten districts. The hailstorms and heavy rains continued till the 4th February and as many as 35 districts out of the total of 45 districts were affected due to the natural calamity. The worst-affected districts where damage to the crop is more than fifty per cent are Vidisha, Khargone, Bho-