

**FUNCTIONING OF DIRECTORATE OF
ESTATES**

MINISTRY OF HOUSING & URBAN AFFAIRS

PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2021-22)

FORTY FIRST REPORT

SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA



सत्यमेव जयते

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI

PAC NO. 2249

FORTY FIRST REPORT

PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2021-22)

(SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA)

FUNCTIONING OF DIRECTORATE OF ESTATES

MINISTRY OF HOUSING & URBAN AFFAIRS



Presented to Lok Sabha on: 08.12.2021
Laid in Rajya Sabha on: 08.12.2021

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI

December 2021/ Agrahayana1943 (Saka)

CONTENTS

		PAGE
	COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2021-22)	(iii)
	COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2020-21)	(v)
	INTRODUCTION	(vii)
	PART – I	
	Report	1
A.	Introduction	1
B.	Computer Software and websites for management and allotment of housing stock	2
C.	Housing Stock	2
D.	Inaccuracies in housing stock figures	7
E.	Physical verification of housing stock	8
F.	Level of Satisfaction in various housing pools	10
G.	Delay in revision of Licence Fee	12
H.	System of posting of Licence Fee	13
I.	Outstanding Licence Fee of Rs. 2.94 crore for the period up to June 1992	15
J.	Recovery of outstanding Licence Fee of Rs. 10.19 crore in respect of various types of accommodation	16
K.	Inordinate delay in taking possession of habitable houses	17
L.	Multiple occupation of houses by the allottees	18
M.	Dangerous and unsafe houses	21
	PART - II	
	Observations/Recommendations of the Committee	22
APPENDICES		
I	Measures taken to augment housing stock	31
II	Minutes of the Third Sitting of PAC (2020-21) held on 21 August, 2021	35
III	Minutes of the Sixth Sitting of PAC (2021-22) held on 15 September, 2021	38

COMPOSITION OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2021-22)

Shri Adhir Ranjan Chowdhury - Chairperson

MEMBERS LOK SABHA

2. Shri T. R. Baalu
3. Shri Subhash Chandra Baheria
4. Shri Sudheer Gupta
5. Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab
6. Shri Jagdambika Pal
7. Shri Vishnu Dayal Ram
8. Shri Pratap Chandra Sarangi¹
9. Shri Rahul Ramesh Shewale
10. Shri Gowdar Mallikarjunappa Siddeshwara²
11. Shri Rajiv Ranjan Singh alias Lalan Singh
12. Dr. Satya Pal Singh
13. Shri Jayant Sinha
14. Shri Balashowry Vallabhaneni
15. Shri Ram Kripal Yadav

RAJYA SABHA

16. Shri Shaktisinh Gohil
17. Shri Bhubaneswar Kalita
18. Dr. C.M. Ramesh
19. Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Ray
20. Shri V. Vijayasai Reddy³
21. Dr. M. Thambidurai
22. Dr. Sudhanshu Trivedi⁴

SECRETARIAT

1. Shri T.G.Chandrasekhar - Joint Secretary
2. Shri Tirthankar Das - Director
3. Smt. Bharti S. Tuteja - Additional Director
4. Ms. Malvika Mehta - Under Secretary

¹ Elected w.e.f. 29.07.2021 vice Smt. Darshana Jardosh, MP appointed as Minister of State w.e.f. 07.07.2021.

² Elected w.e.f. 29.07.2021 vice Shri Ajay Kumar Mishra, MP appointed as Minister of State w.e.f. 07.07.2021.

³ Elected w.e.f. 09.08.2021 vice Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar, MP appointed as Minister of State w.e.f. 07.07.2021.

⁴ Elected w.e.f. 09.08.2021 vice Shri Bhupender Yadav, MP appointed as Union Minister w.e.f. 07.07.2021.

**COMPOSITION OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2020-21)**

Shri Adhir Ranjan Chowdhury - Chairperson

MEMBERS

LOK SABHA

2. Shri T. R. Baalu
3. Shri Subhash Chandra Baheria
4. Shri Sudheer Gupta
5. Smt. Darshana Vikram Jardosh
6. Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab
7. Shri Ajay (Teni) Misra
8. Shri Jagdambika Pal
9. Shri Vishnu Dayal Ram
10. Shri Rahul Ramesh Shewale
11. Shri Rajiv Ranjan Singh alias Lalan Singh
12. Dr. Satya Pal Singh
13. Shri Jayant Sinha
14. Shri Balashowry Vallabhaneni
15. Shri Ram Kripal Yadav

RAJYA SABHA

16. Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar
17. Shri Naresh Gujral
18. Shri Bhubaneswar Kalita*
19. Shri Mallikarjun Kharge*
20. Shri C. M. Ramesh
21. Shri Sukhendu Sekhar Ray
22. Shri Bhupender Yadav

* Elected w.e.f. 11 February, 2021.

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairperson, Public Accounts Committee (2021-22), having been authorised by the Committee, do present this Forty-first Report (Seventeenth Lok Sabha) on "**Functioning of Directorate of Estates**" based on Chapter 19 of C&AG Report number 11 of 2016, Union Government (Civil), Compliance Audit Observations relating to the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs.

2. The Report of Comptroller and Auditor General of India was laid on the Table of the House on 2 August 2016.

3. The Public Accounts Committee (2020-21) selected the subject for detailed examination and report and the subject was carried forward for examination by the successor Public Accounts Committee during their term (2021-22). The Committee took oral evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs, Directorate of Estates (DoE) and Central Public Works Department (CPWD) at their sitting held on 21 August, 2020. The Committee considered and adopted this Report at their sitting held on 15 September, 2021. The Minutes of the sittings are appended to the Report.

4. For facility of reference and convenience, the Observations and Recommendations of the Committee have been printed in **bold** and form Part-II of the Report.

5. The Committee thank their predecessor Committee for taking oral evidence and obtaining information on the subject.

6. The Committee would like to express their thanks to the representatives of the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs, DoE and CPWD for tendering evidence before them and furnishing the requisite information to the Committee in connection with the examination of the subject.

7. The Committee also place on record their appreciation of the assistance rendered to them in the matter by the Committee Secretariat and the office of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India.

NEW DELHI:
07 December, 2021
16 Agrahayna 1943 (Saka)

ADHIR RANJAN CHOWDHURY
Chairperson,
Public Accounts Committee

Part-I
Report

A. Introduction

1. The Directorate of Estates (DoE) is responsible for administration and management of Government of India owned residential and official accommodation, Holiday Homes, Touring Officers' Guest Houses markets and shops in metropolitan and other cities. Its responsibilities include maintenance of housing stock, registration of applicants for allotment of houses, preparation of waiting lists, updating information in respect of occupied and vacant houses, allotment of houses, cancellation of allotment on retirement, resignation, dismissal/death, penal action in case of subletting, misuse, accounting of Licence Fee etc. The Central Public Works Department (CPWD) is responsible for, project conception to completion and maintenance management in the post construction stage as well as maintenance services to the General Pool Residential Accommodation (GPRA) and Central Government Buildings.

2. The Public Accounts Committee (2020-21) decided to take up for detailed examination and report, Chapter 19 of C&AG Report number 11 of 2016 (Union Civil Compliance) on the subject "Functioning of Directorate of Estates". This chapter pertained to the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs (MoHUA), the erstwhile Ministry of Urban Development (MoUD).

3. In Chapter 19, Audit reviewed the functioning of DoE for the period from January 2008 to March 2015 and examined records available in the DoE, CPWD, NIC (National Informatics Centre) and MoHUA (then MoUD). Audit also analysed electronic data in GAMS (Government Accommodation Management System) and on DoE website with reference to the allotment related transactions for the period from January 2011 to July 2014 since the Automated System of Allotment (ASA) was introduced progressively from May 2010 onwards for different types of houses and most of the higher type houses were covered by January 2011.

4. Audit found that DoE did not have an accurate record of the housing stock available with it. Augmentation of housing stock in the various pools was done in an inequitable manner. Licence Fee Collection and Monitoring System was not fully functional resulting in DoE not being able to monitor the receipt of the Licence Fee. Database of DoE and CPWD were not interlinked leading to delays in the reflection of vacancy position of houses in the GAMS database. DoE did not have accurate details of houses which are declared as unsafe or dangerous. The quality of data in the Government Accommodation Management System (GAMS) database was also found to be poor.

5. The Public Accounts Committee (2020-21) took oral evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs, Directorate of Estates and CPWD on the aforementioned chapter at their sitting held on 21 August 2020 and also obtained written information on various aspects of the issues under consideration. Based on the oral evidence and written submissions made, the Committee have carried out in-depth examination of the subject as detailed in the succeeding paragraphs.

B. Computer Software and websites for management and allotment of housing stock

6. MoUD introduced a computer software viz. Government Accommodation Management System in November 2001 with the aim of creating a transparent, corruption free and efficient allotment system for the housing stock units available with DoE. <http://estates.nic.in> is the website of DoE which provides all the information regarding government accommodation available for the applicants/allottees and public in addition to circulars, policy orders, compendium, information about booking of Vigyan Bhawan/Holiday Homes etc. www.gpra.nic.in is the frontend of GAMS database used by the applicants/allottees etc. to get information about the housing stock, vacancies, allotments and waiting list etc.

7. The portal www.eawas.nic.in was developed for internal work of DoE and online licence fee posting by Drawing and Disbursing Officers (DDOs). This portal has been interlinked with www.cpwdsewa.nic.in (e-Sewa), web based software developed by CPWD for management of maintenance, for online vacancy reporting etc.

C. Housing Stock

8. According to Audit, the demand for houses as well as the available housing stock in Delhi as on 31 December for the years 2008 to 2014, as published in the Annual Reports of MoUD, is given below:

Satisfaction level across pools (as on June 2014) (Number of houses)

As on 31 December	Demand	Availability	Shortfall
2008 [#]	98789	63167	35622
2009	77506	63262	14244
2010	88578	63196	25382
2011	105773	63921	41852
2012	95475	63945	31530
2013 [@]	106317	61836	44481
2014	97984	61407	36577

[#] Data as on 31 March 2009

[@] Data as on 31 March 2014

9. Audit found that the availability for GPRA in Delhi varied from 61,407 to 63,945 and the shortage of government accommodation ranged between 14,244 and 44,481 during the period from March 2009 to December 2014. Acute shortage of Government

housing, especially in the National Capital Region (NCR) in various categories, created a long waiting list of Government officials for eligible housing.

10. In this regard, the MoHUA submitted the following action taken notes:-

“It is noted that the shortage of accommodation during the period from March 2009 to December 2014 varied on account of the fact that post 6th Pay Commission on account of higher House Rent Allowance (HRA) the demand became less and most of the employees started moving to their own house or buying private flats from the market. However, in subsequent years due to non-availability of houses in the NCR region at a reasonable price the demand for GPRA escalated. In order to augment the housing stock the Ministry of Urban Development has approved and initiated a number of measures which are given in **Annexure**. Notably the redevelopment projects in Kidwai Nagar (East) and the Seven other colonies i.e. Sarojini Nagar, Nauroji Nagar, Netaji Nagar, Kasturba Nagar, Tyagraj Nagar, Srinivas puri, Mohammadpur have been taken up which will increase the available number of units to approx. 15,000 units and also proposed construction of new flats at Ghitorni etc. would increase the number of dwelling units to around 24,000 in the coming years. This would reduce the waiting list of Government officials for eligible housing.”

11. On the query of Audit regarding proposed timelines for the augmentation, the Directorate of Estates replied as follows:-

“The project for redevelopment of East Kidwai Nagar has been undertaken in 2014. This is likely to be completed by 2019. The redevelopment of 7 colonies namely, Netaji Nagar, Sarojini Nagar, Nauroji Nagar by NBCC and Kasturba Nagar, Srinivas Puri, Mohammadpur and Thyagraj by CPWD on similar lines. This project will be completed in the year 2022. Directorate of Estates has already initiated the necessary action by allotment of alternate houses to the allottees through Automated System of Allotment (ASA) under compulsory shifting due to redevelopment of these 7 colonies.”

12. Regarding augmentation of housing stock, MoHUA submitted the following in their background note dated 18 August, 2020:-

“The position of demand and availability for General Pool Residential accommodation in Delhi is.... The overall percentage of satisfaction level is 66.58% as on 14.07.2020.

The Government has taken various steps to bridge the gap between demand and availability by construction of new residential units, purchase of ready-built flats or redevelopment of exiting Government colonies. The details of new residential units taken in housing stock/under construction/ redevelopment project till date is at ... Total 4599 houses have been added and approximately 30,000 more will be added.

In pursuance of M/o Finance (D/o Expenditure) OM number 2/5/2017-E.IIB dated-05.03.2019, Directorate of Estates has dispensed with the condition of applying of Government accommodation and furnishing of “No Accommodation Certificate” for admissibility of House Rent Allowance. Now, Government employees can stay in own/rented accommodation without applying for Government accommodation, as a result, demand for Government accommodation will decrease.

The issue of demand of houses is dynamic and shortage may remain there as demand continues to increase."

13. However, in their updated background note dated 12 July 2021, the MoHUA submitted the following revised figures:-

"The overall percentage of satisfaction level is 66.62% as on 05.07.2021... Total 6254 houses have been added and approximately 26,000 more will be added."

14. In this regard, when asked to provide details of the shortage of Government accommodation in each of the years since Audit made its observation, the Ministry gave the following written submission:-

"The housing stock and all the data related to it such as shortage, demand and availability is extremely dynamic, it is not possible to determine the shortage, demand or availability of houses in past. Therefore, the details of the present status of housing stock along with shortage, demand and availability has been analysed and enclosed as ..."

15. The following are details of demand versus shortfall submitted *inter-alia* by the Ministry:-

As on	Demand	Availability	Shortfall
21 September 2020	82803	54712	30844
14 July 2020	82206	54734	27472
05 July 2021	76734	55476	24598

16. When asked whether the project for redevelopment of East Kidwai Nagar which was to be completed in 2019 has been completed and if not, the reasons thereof, the Ministry gave the following written reply:-

"96% of the work in Kidwai Nagar (East) has been completed and the entire work is likely to be completed by November, 2020. The delay is on account of ban on construction work from November, 2019 to December, 2019 by Hon'ble Supreme Court and spread of pandemic of COVID 19."

17. On being asked about the status of all the projects and details of difficulties being faced by them, if any, in completing the projects, the Ministry replied the following:-

"Status of four colonies being redeveloped by CPWD is as under: -

1. **Mohammadpur** :708 Housing units are likely to be available by June, 2021. Delay on account of grant of permission for re-plantation of trees by Delhi Forest Deptt.

2. **Thyagraj Nagar** :(703 Housing Units). Out of these; 144 units are near completion. Water and electricity fitting are in progress. The work is likely to be completed by 30.06.2021. Delay occurred due to issue of tree transplanted similar to other colonies.

3. **Srinivaspuri: Phase I** (2408 Housing units) Likely to be completed by 31.12.2021. Approval from Delhi Forest Deptt. is awaited.

Phase II: Tender shall be floated after ensuring availability of funds in escrow account as decided by Capital Management Committee (CMC) under the Chairmanship of AS(DandUT) in the meeting held on 09.06.2020.

4. **Kasturba Nagar:**

Phase-I (2406 Housing Units): Likely to be completed by 02.03.2022. Project delayed due to various reasons. Now, all approvals obtained except re-plantation of trees which is awaited from Delhi Forest Department. Work has just started.

Phase-II: Tender shall be floated after ensuring the availability of sufficient funds in escrow account as decided by CMC during the last meeting held on dt.09/06/2020.

Status of three colonies being redeveloped by NBCC is as under: -

1. **Nauroji Nagar:**

Status: The preparatory work has been completed. All buildings have been vacated and demolished. The work related to removal/ re-plantation of trees was also completed. The work remained suspended from 02.07.2018 to 27.02.2020 owing to several PILs filed in NGT and High Court of Delhi.

Difficulties faced:

Delayed vacation of premises due to School, Market, Community Centre, CGHS dispensary, Kendriya Bhandar, NDMC housing and services, IGL Gas Pipeline, Water and Sewerage line, etc. Added to this; the encroachment by slums, religious structures, Street Vendors, etc. have caused more delay in commencement of work. Encroachments still exist.

For a work of this magnitude of approximately 3.00 Lac sqm BUA, 20 number of approvals and NOCs were to be obtained from various statutory bodies. In addition, there were cases in the Hon'ble High Court of Delhi and NGT. The environmental hazard due to high degree of generation of waste and pollution thereof was one of the difficulties.

2. **Sarojini Nagar and Netaji Nagar**

Status: All statutory approvals; as per the concept plan, were obtained from DUAC (Delhi Urban Arts Committee), Delhi Fire Service, DMRC, AAI

and Environmental Clearance. Due to filings of several PILs by individuals and NGOs, all work remained suspended from 02.07.2018 to 27.05.2019. As per the directives of the Hon'ble High Court, Delhi, Complete plan was changed and revised approvals were obtained again for Environmental, CTE from DPCC, DUAC, Delhi Fire Service and Building Plan (Principle), approval from NDMC for the project. NGT approval and approval from UNIFIED TRAFFIC AND TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE (PLANNING and ENGINEERING) CENTRE (UTTIPEC) is in process.

Difficulties faced:

Timely vacation of Premises: - As on date 53 numbers of housing units at different locations are yet to be vacated. In certain cases, occupants have not vacated their quarter due to non-habitability of their allotted quarters. Encroachment by jhuggies and unauthorized constructions causes abnormal delay in commencement of work. Encroachments are still existing. Few occupants; who are presently posted in remote parts of the country and their family are residing in the colony as they have moved to the court for non-allotment of quarters as per their choice.

Tree Re-Plantations/ Unified Traffic and Transportation Infrastructure (Planning and Engineering) Centre (UTTIPEC) Approval:

All efforts have been made to minimise tree plantation/ felling of trees within the Redevelopment area as per the directive of the Court. Suitable land for the re-plantation of trees have been also identified and mapping etc. done. However obtaining final approval is a time taking process and considerable delay for the same cannot be eluded. Similarly, for UTTIPEC approval all statutory procedures are being followed because of which project is getting delayed.”

18. To a query raised during oral evidence on the matter of the proposal to add 30, 000 houses, the Ministry submitted the following reply:-

“The redevelopment project of 7 GPRA colonies and the construction of new homes in Ghitorni are being proposed by NBCC (National Buildings Construction Corporation Ltd.) and CPWD. By 2020, 4272 houses have been made available by Kidwai Nagar (East) project and 3402 houses have been allotted.

According to information received from CPWD, the work of 9900 houses (Redevelopment of GPRA) at Mohammadpur, Thyagaraja Nagar, Srinivas Puri, Kasturba Nagar, Delhi by the Central Public Works Department is in progress and is likely to be completed by March 2022.”

19. When asked about the plan proposal regarding gap in demand and supply and shortage of houses in Type-II and III (categories), the Ministry gave the following reply:-

“A total of 1805 accommodations of type –II and type-III has been constructed/ will be constructed by the end of this year. Another 15541 houses type-II and

type-III are being built under the redevelopment plan of 6 GPRA colonies. The satisfaction level of type-II and type-III will increase considerably whenever these proposed 15541 houses will be made available for allotment after their completion. Further, there is a proposal for construction of new GPRA in Ghitorni. This will fulfill the requirement of demand for accommodation and satisfaction level will increase. As far as completion of these, NBCC/CPWD can comment.”

D. Inaccuracies in housing stock figures

20. Audit found inaccuracies in the housing stock figures maintained by DoE on which MoUD had also expressed its concern. In a note dated 26 December 2007 initiated by Additional Secretary (UD). While admitting the inaccuracy in the figures of housing stock, DoE assured MoUD vide note dated 10 January 2008 that internal verification/corrections were being done vigorously and hopefully the housing stock directly managed by DoE would be made 100 *per cent* accurate before next periodical review by the Ministry.

21. Audit observed that the DoE's website, www.estates.nic.in, indicated that there were 64,239 houses as on 8 May 2013, whereas www.eawas.nic.in indicated a housing stock of 63,975 as on 10 May 2013. This showed that the problem of inaccuracy in the figures of housing stock was still persisting and an accurate figure of housing stock is not been reached as yet.

22. DoE replied in this regard that housing stock by nature is fluid. Houses declared unsafe, razed by CPWD for reconstruction/redevelopment, addition of new houses through new construction projects or from departmental pool are the factors that make the figure pertaining to available houses vary from time to time. DoE further replied that display of different figures at same time is due to non-updation at one place. DoE added that the housing stock as entered in GAMS is authentic figure and allotment made from it and that there is no way for such houses to remain vacant and being out of allotment cycle.

23. The details of the housing stock were again verified during October 2015. It was seen that www.eawas.nic.in which is for the internal use of DoE had indicated a housing stock of 68,471 on 28 October 2015 whereas www.gpra.nic.in indicated a housing stock of 68,584 on 29 October 2015 which depicts the discrepancy in the figures. Moreover, 'clicking' the "Recalculate" button in www.eawas.nic.in indicated a figure of 80,397 houses which also included a number of non – existent quarter types like 10, 11, 20, 30, 40, 70, 80 etc. raising questions on the authenticity of the figure of houses.

24. Further, it was seen that the DoE's website had indicated that there were 61,869 residential units in Delhi as on 31 March 2015. Moreover, DoE intimated in November 2015 that during April 2015 to October 2015, only 215 houses were added in the housing stock of GPRA. Thus, the number of residential units should have been only around 62,100 while it was around 68,000 as shown in the preceding paragraph. From the above, it can be seen that discrepancies in the figures of housing stock are persisting.

25. Audit was of the view that the differences in the housing stock at different places can be utilised by unscrupulous elements to keep houses outside the allotment cycle and may be used by unlawful elements for illegal activities. Hence, DoE should ensure that the authentic housing stock is reconciled and updated at all locations at the earliest.

26. In their presentation made while tendering evidence, the Ministry submitted the following on the matter of software development:-

“GAMS data is used for two applications-eAwas and GPRA. eAwas is for internal use and monitoring by DoE and GPRA is for applicants. Merging all applications into one is underway; shall resolve the issue (of inaccuracies in Housing Stock) in future.”

E. Physical verification of housing stock

27. Audit observed that in January 2008, Special Secretary (HUA), MoHUA had directed the CPWD to carry out physical verification of housing stock available in each of 137 Service Centres, so that DoE can update and ensure availability of accurate information about the housing stock. DoE, while apprising Secretary (HUA), MoHUA on 12 March 2008, stated that the information submitted by CPWD was not of much use to DoE as it was not submitted in the desired format with necessary details as required by DoE. CPWD was requested in July 2008 to re-check their housing stock and submit information in the format as required by DoE.

28. Audit did not find details of further developments in the matter of physical verification of housing stock in the records provided to audit. Audit was of the view that being the manager of the housing stock, DoE should keep a record of the physical verification done.

29. DoE replied in March 2015, that physical verification of houses is conducted by CPWD through the Executive Engineers of the Service Centres. DoE further stated that the audit observation had been noted for compliance.

30. In this regard, in their background note, the Ministry have submitted the following:-

“With respect to the information sought on the issue of “Inaccuracies in Housing stock figures” and “Physical verification of housing stock”, it is mentioned that the housing stock of the Directorate of Estates is maintained in the e-Awas database, which is extremely dynamic in nature as it gets affected by numerous factors like :-

- Addition of new housing stock
- Demolition of existing housing stock
- Changes in status of house in e-Awas like Unsafe, Under repair etc.
- Change of pool of houses like transferred to or from Department Pools

In addition to above, there are several other factors that affect the total housing stock available for allotment.

Therefore, the housing stock with its dynamic nature remains fluid affected by any or multiple factors acting at a time or at different times.

As far as the "Physical Inspection of housing stock" is concerned, the Directorate had worked out the concept of "Physical Enumeration" of all the houses of the Directorate of Estates and the pilot exercise of the same was conducted at the Minto Road colony of New Delhi wherein a total of 1417 houses were physically enumerated through a mobile app developed for the purpose, in the month of July-August, 2019.

Subsequently, "Physical Enumeration" drive for all houses in Delhi was planned for the month of April 2020 through the same mobile app. Due to the advent of the COVID-19 pandemic, the physical enumeration exercise was deferred for an indefinite period as physical contact with the allottees was not left as an option.

Foreseeing the prolonged effects of the pandemic, another mechanism of "Digital Enumeration" of houses has been planned and is being implemented through a newly developed module by NIC... The exercise aims at verification of information in respect to – house details, occupant details, rent assessment and synchronization between CPWD Sewa and e-Awas."

31. When asked to elaborate upon the mechanism within the DoE for maintenance of housing stock and the frequency of physical verification of the housing stock, the Ministry furnished the following written reply:

"The housing stock of Directorate of Estates is updated on the basis of actions like construction of new houses for allotment and demolition of old houses. The implementing agencies like CPWD and NBCC construct new houses and hand over the same to Directorate of Estates which are in turn added to housing stock and also made available for allotment.

Simultaneously, the old houses declared unsafe / dangerous and also unrepairable, are demolished by the *ibid* agencies. These houses are removed from allotment cycle on the basis of report received from the CPWD and NBCC.

Drive for physical verification of houses have been carried out from time to time in the past. On the similar lines it was decided to again carry out a comprehensive physical house verification drive from April, 2020. However, due to COVID-19 pandemic the physical verification has been put on hold. Meanwhile an exercise was taken up in July-August, 2020 to reconcile the stocks of houses in CPWD Sewa portal and Directorate of Estates eAwas portal which has been completed."

32. When asked to state if physical verification of stock as stated to be done through "Digital Enumeration" had been completed, the Ministry stated the following:-

“The “Physical Enumeration” of the housing stock, a pilot project, which was done at Minto Road will be resumed post the end of pandemic whereas the majority of “Digital Enumeration” exercise has been completed.”

33. When asked how the DoE had ensured that there are no such houses outside the allotment cycle which is being used by unlawful elements for illegal activities, the Ministry submitted the following:-

“All the houses are vacated through CPWD Sewa and the same is added in allotment cycle on real time basis, without any gap. Only those houses which are certified as inhabitable by CPWD are kept out of allotment cycle.”

34. On being asked about the steps taken by DoE and CPWD to remove discrepancies which remain despite the interlinking of databases of the DoE and CPWD, the Ministry furnished the following reply:-

“The interlinking of DoE and CPWD has been re-strengthened by mapping of all the House IDs between the two applications. The digital enumeration exercise will reaffirm the mapping of information between the two applications.”

35. In response to a question raised by the Committee during oral evidence, whether digital enumeration had been completed by August, 2020, the Ministry furnished the following written reply:-

“Digital computation has been completed and discrepancies between CPWD and e-Awas database have been removed. Data has been made compatible via computer application by the technical teams of CPWD and e-Awas.”

36. DoE further stated in their updated background note furnished on 12.07.2021 that digital enumeration which was started in July, 2020 was completed in October, 2020.

F. Level of Satisfaction in various housing pools

37. Satisfaction level for each type of accommodation refers to availability position of residential accommodation for the Central Government Employees with reference to their demand. A Prioritization Committee set up in the then MoUD prescribed satisfaction levels of 50 *per cent* in cities other than Delhi and 70 *per cent* in Delhi. However, the details of all the meetings of the Prioritisation Committee and copies of the minutes thereof sought from DoE have not been made available to audit.

38. Scrutiny of data relating to the waiting list of applicants and housing stock figures from the GAMS database for the month of June in the years 2011, 2012, 2013 and 2014 revealed wide variation in satisfaction levels across various pools (GP (General Pool), TP (Tenure Officer's Pool), TN (Tenure Pool), LM and LS (Lady Officers Pools for Married and Single ladies) for houses in types (4S, 5A, 5B and 6A) as indicated in the table below.

Satisfaction level across pools (as on June 2014)

Pool \ Year	Availability of houses				Demand of houses				Satisfaction level (in per cent)			
	2011	2012	2013	2014	2011	2012	2013	2014	2011	2012	2013	2014
GP	2262	2262	2262	2262	5089	7585	6308	7311	44.45	29.82	35.86	30.94
LM	200	200	200	200	556	842	723	855	35.97	23.75	27.66	23.39
LS	84	84	84	84	121	171	153	162	69.42	49.12	54.90	51.85
TN	91	91	91	91	276	314	286	342	32.97	28.98	31.82	26.61
TP	1173	1173	1173	1173	1446	1441	1393	1450	81.12	81.40	84.21	80.90

39. It can be seen that while the satisfaction level for the four years from 2011 to 2014 remained at more than 80 per cent for TP, less than 45 per cent for GP, less than 36 per cent for LM, less than 70 per cent for LS and less than 33 per cent for TN pools. For the biggest pool GP, the satisfaction level further declined from 44 per cent in 2011 to 31 per cent in 2014 whereas for TN pool, it further declined from 33 per cent in 2011 to 27 per cent in 2014.

40. As per Audit, in 2014, the satisfaction level was more than that prescribed by Prioritisation Committee only in respect of TP while in respect of all other pools, it was much less than the prescribed average satisfaction level of 70 per cent. The wide variation in the satisfaction levels amongst various pools indicated imbalanced augmentation of different pools. DoE noted in August 2015, the audit observation for future compliance and stated that it is taking steps to increase the house stock like issuing more no objection certificates for construction of residential quarters to different departments/organizations, taking up construction of higher types of houses etc.

41. In their action taken notes, the Ministry submitted the following on the matter:-

“As regard to variation in satisfaction level among various pools is concerned, separate pools have been created in view of requirements and to have a better satisfaction levels in these pools compared to General Pool. However, the demand for accommodation in General Pool is very high due to large number of applicants and less availability of General Pool Residential Accommodation. Although, the higher satisfaction level in TP, TN Pools being more than GP, is due to sufficient number of quarters have been provided in these pools so that officers who come under Central Staffing Scheme (CSS) for fixed tenure of 5 years don't have to wait for long time considering limited period of tenure. The guidelines have also been framed to automatically shift General Pool Residential Accommodation units from Tenure Pool to General Pool which remain unallotted for two consecutive months.”

42. In their background note, the following was submitted by the Ministry:-

“The satisfaction level in GP and other pools will, however, increase and will be comparable to TP/TN pools, once the additional 30,000 houses are added in GPRA.”

43. When asked how satisfaction levels are calculated and what steps have been taken by DoE to ensure that the wide variation in satisfaction levels amongst pools is reduced through equitable distribution of available houses amongst pools, the Ministry responded as under:-

“Satisfaction levels are the ratio between the Availability of Houses and the Demand of Houses. Some of the steps taken by DoE for equitable distribution amongst the pools are-

- Reversion of a house to General Pool from TP / TN Pool in case they are not allotted for 2 months.
- Redevelopment of 7 colonies resulting addition of houses in housing stock

Augmentation of pools to ensure equitable satisfaction level in each category and pool.”

44. When asked about the action taken on complaints of seepage in newly constructed East Kidwai Nagar Complex, New Delhi, the Ministry submitted:

“The newly constructed apartments faced the first rainy season after their occupation. There were some technical issues and the same have since been attended. Hopefully there would not be any such problems during the next rainy season.”

45. There were reports of seepage or wear and tear in the newly built houses in Kidwai Nagar and other areas. Questioned on the reasons for the same, status of rectification of the problems and the system followed in maintenance of the newly built flats, the Ministry, in reply stated:

“To prevent seepage or wear and tear, in newly built flats of High rise buildings, the NBCC (India) Limited generally carry out routine preventive maintenance at regular intervals to prevent clogging of sewer line, wear and tear of accessories etc. But due to continuous pandemic situation, the maintenance team is not allowed inside the flats to carry out the same due to which NBCC have these issues. This will be resolved as soon as situation of pandemic improves.”

46. When the Committee sought to know why the details of all the meeting of the Prioritization Committee and copy of the minutes thereof sought from the Directorate of Estates had not been made available to the Audit, the Ministry submitted the following reply”-

“This has been referred to CPWD for replying.”

G. Delay in revision of Licence Fee

47. Audit observed that in terms of the provisions of SR 324(4) for revising Licence Fee on expiry of 3 years from the date of last revision, the Licence Fee last revised with

effect from 1 July 2007 became due for revision with effect from 1 July 2010. CPWD forwarded its proposal of revisions only in October 2010 and DoE notified the revised rates of Licence Fee only on 28 April 2011 with retrospective effect from 1 July 2010. Similarly, subsequent revision which should have taken effect from 1 July 2013 could not be notified till November 2013. Though revision of Licence Fee is a regular exercise to be taken up every three years, while requesting CPWD on 16 January 2013, DoE did not furnish necessary information required for such revision. The required details were provided by DoE on 19 July 2013 leading to the delay of five months in notifying the revised rates of licence fee.

48. DoE intimated in March 2015, that revision of Licence Fee involved analysis of data received from multiple agencies and required communication to multiple agencies and approval of IFD (Integrated Finance Division) and Hon'ble UDM (Urban Development Minister) through Secretary (UD). Thus, the delay in notifying the revision of Licence Fee w.e.f. 1 July 2010 as well as 1 July 2013 was purely unavoidable procedural delays.

49. In this regard, the Ministry submitted the following in their background note:-
 "The earlier practice of consulting CPWD for fixing Licence Fee has been done away with by amending the CGGPRA Rules, 2017. Now as per Rule 74 of CGGPRA Rules, 2017 the normal licence fee for accommodation is revised every 3 years based on the Average All India Consumer Price Index (CPI). Accordingly, the new rate of licence fee for GPRA applicable throughout the country w.e.f. 01.07.2020, has been fixed timely under the Rules 2017 vide OM Number 18011/2/2015-Pol.III dated 07.07.2020."

H. System of posting of Licence Fee

50. The manual system of collection of Licence Fee was in vogue till June, 1992. Under this system, the work of maintenance of the licence fee records was distributed office-wise, irrespective of the type of accommodation. The System also provided for preparation of single Licence Fee ledger maintained for entry of recoveries from occupants of all types working in a particular office. This system was reviewed in 1992 as DoE felt that the system presumed availability of adequate staff strength to do justice to the workload involved and Rent Division was faced with the problem of depletion of its staff to the extent of 50 per cent. It was also noted by DoE that the rent posting work had gone into arrears owing to the dealing hands being entrusted with more housing stock than they were able to handle.

51. With a view to rationalise the work and also to accelerate the computerisation activities of DoE, it was decided in 1992 to amalgamate the functions of Allotment of houses and Recovery of Licence Fee which was being dealt with by separate sections in the allotment sections. It was decided to restructure the Rent Sections according to type of houses and work of entry of licence fee recoveries was accordingly distributed type-wise and locality-wise in DoE from July 1992. The licence fee ledgers were accordingly created type-wise and locality-wise. The formats of licence fee recovery schedules being sent by various offices, however, remained unchanged despite DoE

directions to them to reformat their schedules type-wise and locality-wise. The single copy of composite licence fee recovery schedule being sent by an office was found to be insufficient for rotation amongst all types/dealing hands. In the new system, the allotment sections were also to send Form J to the Accounts Compilation Section, indicating 'Cash Summary for the month' which includes 'Opening Balance', 'Assessment', 'Recovery' and 'Closing Balance'.

52. Computerisation of rent work, which was a prerequisite in the decision on the revised system brought into effect from July, 1992, could not make any major headway till 2003. Implementation of GAMS in 2003, with the overall guidance of NIC, could not achieve any significant success. As such, by March 2007, approximately 78 per cent of the records of past Licence Fee recoveries from July 1992 remained missing. As a result of this, the occupants of government accommodation were put to tremendous harassment due to inability of DoE to issue No Dues/No Demand Certificates promptly.

53. DoE stated in September 2014 that computerisation of rent wing was under process and would be completed very soon. DoE further intimated in March 2015, the current status of online recovery of Licence Fees from DDOs. DoE, further stated in August 2015 that as the data is so huge, 20 Data Entry Operators have been employed to complete this legacy data entry by December 2015. DoE further stated that even after this, there would be entries which were never received in the Department and would have to be updated by allottee.

54. In this regard, the Ministry submitted the following in their background note:-
 "Computerisation of Rent wing was completed in 2016-17 and all calculations on rental dues are done through the system. Further, as the salaries of most of Central Government employees are now being disbursed through PFMS portal and the recovery of licence fee is being made at that portal. Hence the PFMS portal and GPRA portal are being integrated to post the recovery of licence fee in the rent account of the allottees of GPRA automatically without any human interference. This will eventually solve the problem of non-posting of licence fee."

55. On being asked, about the current status of posting in the ledger of ACS and recovery, the Ministry submitted the following:-

"The rent accounts of this Directorate have been computerised now and ACS section was closed since 2015-16. The remaining dues were posted in the rent accounts of concerned allottees against their AAN (Allottee Account Number) numbers. When any of these allottees apply for NDC or once their rent assessment is generated, respective arrear amounts are added with their dues, and NDC in their favour will be issued only after clearance of all dues."

56. When asked about the reasons for not compiling the latest outstanding recovery details in respect of rent, the Ministry submitted the following:-

"The computerised system of assessment and recovery developed by NIC is having facility to assess and check dues and payments of an allottee. Thus the dues of any allottee can be checked from the system at any point of time."

I. Outstanding Licence Fee of Rs. 2.94 crore for the period up to June 1992

57. After the change of system of posting of licence fee recoveries from office – wise to type-wise, rent cards were to be opened and sorted out type wise/colony wise and sent to the concerned allotment section by 30 June 1992. The loose card in respect of property folio maintained in Allotment Section and the full details thereof were to be sent to the Arrear Clearance Section (ACS) for linking and charging the arrears up to 30 June 1992, if not already charged.

58. In order to achieve significant visible progress in the direction of implementation of GAMS, it was decided in 2003 that the Deputy Director (Computer)/Deputy Director (Rent) would prepare the list of allottees occupying houses before 30 June 1992 and continuing in the same. The list was to be passed on to the ACS to calculate the total dues outstanding against such occupants as on 30 June 1992 so that the same could be posted in the Rent Register under GAMS.

59. Audit observed that the above was not done and the ACS were working out the missing recoveries of Licence Fee up to June 1992 and adjusting them. Audit further noticed that the Director of Estates had stated on 23 March 2007 that *“Out of our total housing stock of 63,909 houses, approximately 78 per cent of the records of past Licence Fee recoveries from July, 1992 onwards are missing.”* He further noted that *“Occupants put to tremendous harassment due to non – posting resulting in inability of the DOE to issue No Dues/No Demand Certificates.”*

60. When asked to comment on the above, the Ministry submitted the following reply:-

“By appointing 20 DEOs in 2015, the records for recovery of license fee were updated in the system based on whatever records were available in this Directorate. Further efforts are being made to update the record of receipt of license fee based on the information available with them by contacting the concerned DDO. In addition to this, the license fee is updated in the system at the time of issuing No Dues Certificate to the retired allottees through manual certificate from the concerned DDO.”

61. Scrutiny of records revealed that a recovery of Rs. 2.94 crore was outstanding, as of January 2013, for the period prior to July 1992. Further, it is seen that the ACS has not furnished Form J to the Accounts Compilation Section after January 2013 and hence the amount outstanding was not reflected in the consolidated Form J thereafter. Further, it is seen that the consolidated Form J prepared by the Accounts Compilation Section was authenticated only upto December 2009 though the same appeared to have been prepared thereafter also.

62. MoHUA/DoE replied in September 2014 and March 2015 that the dues as on 30 June 1992 were available in the records of ACS sections which were being taken in GAMS. MoHUA /DoE intimated in August 2015, the current process of Licence Fee collection, online remittance of rent by DDOs, steps taken by DoE for streamlining the rent recovery system and efforts made by Rent Recovery Cell for updation of records. DoE also intimated that the department had been attempting its level best to update

these licence fee recovery schedules but the data was so huge (60,000 allottees at any particular time and their deduction schedule for last 30 years—18 lakh entries).

63. The reply of MoHUA/DoE does not indicate the present status of the recovery of Licence Fee for the period up to June 1992. Recovery of dues at the time of issuance of No Dues Certificate (NDC) not only results in avoidable delay in recovery of government revenues but also leaves scope for harassment of retired personnel applying for NDC.

64. In this regard, the Ministry submitted the following in their background note:-
 “Out of Rs.2.94 Crore, a sum of Rs.1.24 Crore was received in cash payment for the period up to 30.06.1992, details uploaded on the website of the Directorate of Estates. The missing recovery amounting to Rs.0.46 Crore has been posted in the ledger of ACS Section upto 30.06.1992. Remaining outstanding dues amounting to Rs.1,23,92,751/- for the period upto 30.06.1992 have been posted on the Government Accommodation Management System(GAMS) and added in rent accounts of allottees in respect of allottees who are still occupying the General Pool Residential Accommodation and recovery is being done by their respective DDOs. Out of Rs. 1,23,92,751/- a sum of Rs. 44,88,738/- has been recovered till date and the remaining amount will be recovered before their retirement.”

65. In this regard, during oral evidence, the following was also submitted in the presentation made by MoHUA/DoE:-

- “Manual posting of Licence fee is dropped.
- Online Licence Fee posting module.
- Licence fee deducted by DDO from salary and posted on GPRA.
- Integration of GPRA with PFMS.
- Posting of Licence Fee directly from the salary.
- Successful pilot is done with all DDOs in MoHUA.
- Out of 2989 DDOs in Delhi 432 DDOs have been integrated.
- Rent Assessment Module has been developed and is in use.”

J. Recovery of outstanding Licence Fee of Rs.10.19 crore in respect of various types of accommodation

66. Audit noticed from the Form J submitted by various sections dealing with different types of accommodation, that an amount of Rs.5.36 crore was outstanding against Members of Parliament (MPs)/Ex MPs as at December 2012, an amount of Rs. 3.77 crore was outstanding against allottees of Type 5 and higher houses as at March 2013, while an amount of Rs. 1.06 crore was outstanding (as at January 2012) in respect of Hostel and Type 4 special. The current position of the outstanding Licence Fee could not be ascertained as Form J indicating subsequent recoveries and latest outstanding recovery of rent had not been compiled in Accounts Compilation Section. During audit, the DoE was requested to provide the files/records of three months (April 2012, December 2012 and March 2013) in respect of assessment of Licence Fee, recovery thereof as well as outstanding Licence Fee with age wise break up. However, the age wise breakup of the total outstanding Licence Fee was not furnished to Audit.

67. DoE intimated in March 2015 that after merger of rent sections w. e. f. 01 July 1992, it was not possible to find out the data of defaulters in the manual system. As such instructions have been issued to the all DDOs to intimate the details of defaulter/transfer of allottees, so that DoE may take further necessary action in such cases. MoUD/DoE further intimated in August 2015, the process of Licence Fee collection, online remittance of rent by DDOs, steps taken by DoE for streamlining the rent recovery system, difficulties being faced in rent recovery/ updation of records and efforts made by Rent Recovery Cell for updation of records.

68. MoUD/DoE has not furnished the current status of the outstanding dues and recoveries, if any, in respect of various types of accommodation as pointed out by Audit.

69. In this regard, the Ministry submitted the following in their background note:-

“An amount of Rs.3.337 crore has been recovered against the total outstanding dues amounting to Rs.10.19 crore shown by Audit as on 31.03.13. Action has been taken to recover the remaining dues of Rs. 6.853 Cr. Damage recovery cases have been filed against Ex-MPs for recovery of dues. Efforts are being made to recover the dues from other allottees. The status is as follows:

Sl.Number	Name of Section	Dues (In crore)	Recovery	Bal. (In Cr.)
			(In Cr.)	
1	RP	5.36	0.745	4.615
2	Hostel/T-IV Spl.	1.06	0.572	0.488
3	Type -V	3.77	2.02	1.75
	Total	10.19	3.337	6.853

70. When asked about the recovery of Licence fee from Ex-MPs, the Ministry submitted the following written reply:-

“As per section 14 of The Public Premises (Eviction of Unauthorised Occupants) Act, a certificate of recovery of arrears in respect of 442 former MPs has been sent to collectors of their districts of permanent revenue for recovery as arrears of land revenue. They will recover the dues of the government through their system of recovery.”

K. Inordinate delay in taking possession of habitable houses

71. As per letter of allotment of accommodation in GPRA, allottees are requested to send their acceptance within 8 days from the date of issue of the allotment letter and obtain an authority slip from DoE and take possession of the allotted residence from the CPWD/NBCC Enquiry Office concerned by the date mentioned in the authority slip. Failure to take possession within the time specified in the authority slip would result in the vacant house being returned to concerned allotment section for cancellation of allotment. A test check of houses shown as habitable in the vacation table of GAMS

database, for the period January 2011 to September 2013, revealed delays ranging from 90 days to more than two years in occupation of the 579 houses by the allottees.

72. In this regard, the Ministry submitted the following in their background note:-

“As per the Maintenance Charter of CPWD, the stipulated time given for renovation of Quarters after vacation of previous allottee of Type I to Type IV is 60 days and for Quarters of Type V and above is 75 days. In cases, where no renovation is required, the physical possession is handed over immediately. Any delay in the timelines mentioned above are due to the additional time taken by CPWD to make the house habitable. In the cases where the allottees do not take the technical occupation of the house within 8 days of allotment, the houses are automatically withdrawn from the allottee and carried forward to the next bidding cycle and the debarment rules are applied on the allottee.

On allotment of an accommodation, an allottee has to give acceptance within 8 days and further within 5 days he has to take Technical Occupation. Now a provision has been made in e-Awas that in case the allottee does not take Technical Occupation within this period, the allotment is cancelled. Further, a check point has been provided in the system to monitor whether the allottee has taken Physical Occupation. If Physical Occupation is not taken due to house not made habitable by CPWD, CPWD is requested to expedite the work to make the house habitable. However, if the house is habitable and the allottee does not take possession the house is cancelled. Thus adequate steps are being taken to check in delay in possession.”

73. The Committee desired to know what effective steps have been taken by DoE to avoid delays in possession of habitable houses. The Ministry submitted the following:-

“Vide OM Number12035/15/97-Pol.II dated 02.01.2015 instructions were issued to Allotment Sections to send the details of houses which are not physically occupied even after 3 months after Technical Occupation. Review meetings are held with CPWD periodically to take stock of all the habitable houses for offering them for allotment.”

74. When asked what remedial measures had DoE sought to work out in consultation with CPWD, for addressing the problem of long delays, the Ministry furnished the following reply-

“Further, review meetings are being taken in this matter time-to-time and instructions are issued to CPWD/NBCC to expedite handing over of physical possession within 90 days of taking technical possession.”

L. Multiple occupation of houses by the allottees

75. Analysis of GAMS database provided to audit for the period January 2011 to July 2014 revealed that 536 allottees were occupying more than one accommodation (in two instances the allottees were occupying three houses). Thus, total 1074 residential units appeared to have been occupied by these 536 allottees.

76. In March 2015, DoE furnished possible factors for double occupation as (i) a number of allottees in double occupation are from Kidwai Nagar (East) who were under compulsory shifting. These allottees have been given alternate accommodation. However, because they neither took possession of the alternate accommodation nor did they surrender the original allotment at Kidwai Nagar East, they are being reflected as occupants of 2 flats simultaneously; (ii) in certain cases, where the allottee has either not deposited the authority slip or in cases where the vacant possessions have not been reflected in the system even though the allottee may have vacated the house, in such cases too, double occupation is reflected; (iii) in cases where allottee is already residing in a Government accommodation and is to shift in an alternate accommodation, due to non-handing over of house for any particular period of time, both houses, i.e., one in which the allottee will move in and the house currently occupied by the allottee will be reflected as double occupation; (iv) however, in this case where double occupation actually is there, the DoE is already in process of taking corrective action.

77. Subsequently, in April 2015, DoE contended that the allottees may not be in physical occupation of the houses (the change house in repair) or availing 15 days time that is provided to the allottee to vacate the previous house after occupation of new one and beyond which damage rent is charged.

78. In order to verify the contention of DoE that double occupancy might be due to availing 15 days time to vacate the previous house, Audit randomly checked 12 registration numbers from DoE website on 19 May 2015 (10000210, 10000358, 10000895, 10001029, 10002403, 10003648, 10003883, 10004792, 10005279, 10005774, 10021978 and 10032364 at serial number 1, 2, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 14, 71 and 101 respectively). Result is tabulated below:

Cases of double occupation as observed from the DoE website

Sl. Number	Serial number of Annexure	Registration Number	Accommodation one		Accommodation two	
			HID	Date of occupation	HID	Date of occupation
1.	1	10000210	295746		Single occupation	
2.	2	10000358	335364	17/07/2012	335155	02/11/2007
3.	5	10000895	339601	06/07/2010	318629	09/12/1994
4.	6	10001029	299849		306224	Details could not be obtained in GAMS

5.	7	10002403	295413	02/02/2011	281324	21/02/1991
6.	8	10003648	309648	24/07/2010	317216	24/02/2005
7.	9	10003883	300898		Single occupation	
8.	11	10004792	348479	18/08/2010	283634	14/03/2005
9.	12	10005279	329330	30/12/2005	331275	30/12/2005
10.	14	10005774	263191	08/06/2010	281180	30/06/1986
11.	71	10021978	263775	06/05/2011	283624	05/06/2000
12.	101	10032364	393261		244967	Details could not be obtained in GAMS

79. From the above it may be seen that in 10 out of 12 cases, double occupation is indicated even after lapse of years since the later occupation. As such, the contention of DoE, that double occupation might be because of availing 15 days time given to vacate the house, does not hold good.

80. In its further reply in August 2015, DoE stated that the 15 day period is calculated from date of physical occupation of new house and not allotment date. Hence longer delay would happen if house is under repair. Further, DoE provided specific replies in respect of 3 of the 12 cases pointed out by Audit. As regards the other cases, DoE stated that they are old cases and could have happened due to the non – linking of those houses.

81. It is seen from the reply that the system has a provision of stopping applicants from accepting only the third house. Hence, the possibility of an applicant occupying two houses cannot be ruled out.

82. In this regard, the Ministry submitted the following in their background note:-
 “Now after the computerization, it is possible to identify cases of double occupation by just giving a command in the automated system. Also, in such cases, licence fee in respect of one flat will be received and it will be easy to identify double occupancy as the licence fee of other flat will not be received. Such data may be obtained from the System.

Directorate of Estates has initiated linking of e Awas with Public Financial Management System (PFMS). With this, licence fee of only one flat will be

received and the other will be identified due to non-receipt of licence fee. Thus such cases shall be totally curbed.”

M. Dangerous and unsafe houses

83. As per normal practice, once a residential house is declared unsafe, it cannot be allotted to any person until it has been declared safe by the competent authority. However, analysis of GAMS database revealed 2,035 allotments made under category AACC (UNSAFE). Further, analysis of these cases revealed 106 cases wherein houses declared unsafe were allotted within 50 days.

84. DoE replied in March 2015 that initially the houses reported dangerous by CPWD for allotment of alternative accommodation on unsafe ground could not be entered in GAMS as there was no provision for that. DoE further stated that the position was expected to improve further as e-Sewa and e-Awas software's have now been connected w.e.f. 15 September 2014. DoE further stated in August 2015 that once the house is entered unsafe in GAMS, it does not go for bidding. With linking of e-Awas and e-Sewa such houses once declared unsafe by CPWD would automatically go out of bidding.

85. In this regard, the Ministry submitted the following in their background note:-
 “In connection to “Dangerous and Unsafe Houses”, it is stated that a house is declared unsafe / dangerous on the report of CPWD and the status of such houses is modified in e-Awas database which excludes it from the bidding cycle. Further, only on receipt of the report from CPWD, that the house has been made habitable, house is included in bidding.
 The Directorate monitors the status of inhabitable houses and holds periodic meetings with CPWD officers to make them habitable.”

86. MoHUA responded with the following submission in their post-evidence replies on the query regarding occupation of unsafe houses in Mandir Marg area and whether any cases in this regard are pending in the court:-

“CPWD has not received any court notice in this regard. List of unsafe flats at Mandir Marg area has been sent to DoE for cancellation of allotment and eviction.”

PART-II**Observations/Recommendations of the Committee**

From the Audit findings on the subject, 'Functioning of Directorate of Estates (DoE)' based on Chapter 19 of C&AG Report No. 11 of 2016, the Committee observe that there has been: persistent shortage of accommodation for Government servants in Delhi; no proper record of the housing stock available; inequitable augmentation of housing stock in the various pools; inadequate or partial functioning of the Licence Fee Collection and Monitoring System thereby resulting in DoE not being able to monitor the receipt of the Licence Fee; delays in the reflection of vacancy position of houses in the GAMS database owing to DoE and CPWD databases not being interlinked; possessing incorrect or inaccurate details of houses which are declared as unsafe or dangerous; poor quality of database in the Government Accommodation Management System (GAMS) etc. The Committee have recorded their observations and recommendations on those issues that merit consideration in the succeeding paragraphs.

Augmentation of Housing Stock

1. The Committee note that maintenance of housing stock is one of the primary responsibilities of the Directorate of Estates. The Committee observe that there has been a persistent and acute shortage of 36-37 percent in housing stock of General Pool Residential Accommodation. This is despite the fact that actual demand for houses had gone down from 98789 in 2008 to 82803 in September 2020. The Committee are intrigued by the inability of the Directorate of Estates (DOE)/ Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs (MOHUA) in augmenting the much-needed housing stock. The Committee note from the action taken notes submitted in this regard in 2016 that with a view to increasing the housing stock, redevelopment and construction projects were initiated at various locations across Delhi, for raising the number of dwelling units to approximately 24,000 by the year 2022. However, on examining the status of various redevelopment projects, the Committee find that there have been delays mainly on account of encumbrances pertaining to vacation of schools, markets, community centres, CGHS dispensaries, Kendriya Bhandars, IGL Gas pipelines etc., and also due to encroachments; as also delays in obtaining approvals for re-plantation of trees from Delhi Forest Department as well as other agencies involved, and PILs filed in

NGT and Delhi High Court. The Committee feel that due to lack of proper planning on the part of the Ministry, there has been an impasse. They are of the view that when such developmental/construction projects are taken up where schools, market places, Community Centres, CGHS Dispensaries etc. need to be shifted/re-located, preparatory works should have been initiated simultaneously in order to ensure that the project is executed in an unhindered manner. The Committee, therefore, recommend that the Detailed Project Reports of all the projects be reviewed and specific time frames prescribed for each task to be carried out and appropriate measures taken urgently for expediting all necessary approvals. The Committee may be apprised of the steps taken in this regard, project-wise, alongwith the timelines for augmenting the housing stock on priority. The Committee would also like to be apprised of the provisions pertaining to imposition of liquidated damages on contractors /sub-contractors of CPWD in cases of delays in adhering to timelines.

The Committee are perplexed to note that the figures pertaining to number of houses to be added is being constantly revised by the DoE. While in August 2020, the Ministry had informed that a total of 4599 houses had been added and approximately 30000 more were in pipeline, in July 2021, it was stated that 6254 houses have been added and approximately 26000 more houses are to be added. The Committee, therefore, desire to be apprised of the reasons for the variation in the number of houses to be added as stated at different points of time, that too at short intervals. The Committee would like to be apprised of the requests received from various 'departmental pools' seeking an increase in allotment of houses and the action taken by the DoE to cater to the needs expressed. The Committee further desire the DoE to seek from all the Ministries/ Departments /Organisations that they are servicing, an estimate of the number of houses that might be needed in the next 5-10 years and thereafter plan the required increase in the housing stock accordingly. The Committee also desire that the accommodation requirement of employees at the lower rung of the hierarchy i.e. employees of Group 'B' and 'C' categories may be assessed first and efforts made to provide accommodation to them on priority.

Physical Verification of housing stock

2. Physical verification of housing stock available with DOE is to be carried out by CPWD. The Committee note in this regard that while physical verification was carried out in 2008, according to DOE, it was not of much use as it was not executed and furnished in the desired format with the requisite details. The Committee understand that a comprehensive physical verification drive of the housing stock was to be carried out from April, 2020, which has been put on hold due to COVID-19 pandemic. Instead, as an alternative, digital enumeration of housing stock has been completed by reconciling the databases of eAwas and CPWD. As one of the premier managers of public real estate assets, it is imperative that DoE maintain an accurate record of housing stock which is updated at regular intervals. The Committee are of the view that physical verification of the housing stock needs to be done urgently by DoE in co-ordination with CPWD in a time bound manner, and the Committee apprised thereof. The Committee are also of the view that all the properties of the DoE need to be geo-tagged so as to enable regular monitoring and updating of the stock on real time basis. The Committee also desire that physical verification of housing stock be carried out at regular intervals.

Satisfaction levels

3. The Committee note that satisfaction level for each type of accommodation refers to availability position of residential accommodation for the Central Government Employees vis-à-vis the demand for housing. The Committee note that a Prioritization Committee set up in the MoHUA prescribed a satisfaction level of 50% in cities other than Delhi and 70 % in Delhi. The Committee observe that for the biggest pool i.e. GP (General pool), the satisfaction level which was already much less than the prescribed level at 44% in 2011, further declined to 31% in 2014 whereas for TN (Tenure Pool) pool, it declined further from 33% in 2011 to 27% in 2014. The Committee are aware that for addressing this issue, the MoHUA/DoE are striving to increase the number of housing units to approximately 24,000. The Committee are of the view that since the purpose of creation of 'exclusive pools' is to lessen the waiting time and ensure easy availability of houses to identified categories of applicants, the 'pools' need to be managed in such a way as to keep the 'satisfaction levels' in all the 'pools' at

comparable levels. The Committee, while noting the wide variation in the 'satisfaction levels' which results in longer waiting time for GP, TN, LM and LS pools desire that corrective measures be taken by way of timely exchange of houses amongst the pools as well as augmentation of the housing stock. The Committee are also of the opinion that measuring the 'satisfaction levels' should not only be based on mapping of availability of houses vis-à-vis the demand, but should also include aspects such as the actual level of satisfaction of residents and the quality of construction/ repair and services being offered by the maintenance agencies concerned.

The Committee, while noting that a number of complaints are being received regarding seepage or wear and tear in newly built houses, desire that periodic appraisal of the performance of agencies such as CPWD/NBCC be done so as to enable in improving the services provided by them. The Committee also desire that appropriate action be taken against the officials found responsible for negligence on the basis of the appraisal and penalties imposed on the contractors/ sub-contractors for 'unsatisfactory work' that may have been executed. The Committee may be apprised of the steps taken in this direction within three months of the presentation of this Report to Parliament.

The Committee desire that an assessment may also be made for ascertaining the costs incurred on providing accommodation to the Government employees *vis-a-vis* the efficiency and care with which 'housing stock' is being maintained.

Delay in computerization of data on Licence Fee collection

4. The Committee note that manual system of collection of Licence Fee was prevalent till June 1992. The system was revised in 1992 by merging the functions of Allotment of houses and Recovery of Licence fee which were earlier being done separately. In the new system, the allotment sections were also required to send the requisite form (Form J) to the Accounts Compilation Section, indicating 'Cash Summary for the month' which includes 'Opening Balance', 'Assessment', 'Recovery' and 'Closing Balance'. The Committee observe with utter dismay that computerization of 'rent work', which was scheduled to be carried out in 1992 was completed only in the year 2016-17 i.e. after 24 long years. This is indicative

of sheer apathy on the part of the MoHUA as well as DoE in regard to undertaking measures towards improving their functioning.

The Committee also note that out of Rs. 2.94 crore that was outstanding prior to July, 1992, Rs.1.24 crore was received in cash upto 30.06.1992; the untraceable amount of Rs.0.46 crore was posted in the ledger of Arrear Clearance Section and approximately Rs.1.24 crore was added for recovery in the rent accounts of allottees who continue to occupy the General Pool Residential Accommodation. The Committee note in this regard that Rs.44.88 lakh of the outstanding amount has been recovered, and the balance amount would be recovered before the retirement of the occupants. The Committee trust that the needful would be done, and DoE would effectively monitor the recovery of the outstanding amount. The Committee would also like to be apprised of the action taken in regard to recovery of Rs.0.46 crore lying in the ledger of Arrear Clearance Section.

The Committee note that following the computerisation of the Rent wing, all calculations on rental dues are done through the 'system'. The Committee also note that as the salaries of most Central Government employees are now disbursed through PFMS portal, the same is being integrated with the GPRA portal so as to post the recoverable licence fee in the rent account of the allottees of GPRA automatically. The Committee are, however, disconcerted to note that out of 2989 Drawing and Disbursing Offices (DDOs) in Delhi, only 432 DDOs have been integrated in the system so far. The Committee desire that the remaining DDOs be integrated with the GPRA in a time bound schedule and the Committee be apprised of the progress thereof.

Outstanding Licence Fee from various allottees

5. The Committee observe that a total of Rs. 10.19 crore was outstanding as on December 2012 and March 2013 against various categories of allottees including, allottees of Type 5 and higher categories of houses, and in respect of Hostels and Type 4 special categories. While noting that Rs.3.337 crore out of the total outstanding has been recovered, the Committee desire that DoE may earnestly pursue the Damage Recovery Cases filed under Section 14 of the Public Premises Act 1971 that have been forwarded to the Collectors. The Committee hope that with the disbursement of salaries through PFMS portal and the consequent posting of the status in regard to licence fee in the rent account of

the allottees, the problem of overdues will be resolved in near future. The Committee also note with disappointment that 'age-wise-breakup' of the total outstanding Licence Fee was not provided to Audit and desire that the same may be provided.

Inordinate delay in taking possession of habitable houses

6. The Committee note that a test check of houses shown as habitable for the period January 2011 to September 2013, reveals delays ranging from 90 days to more than two years in taking possession of as many as 579 houses by the allottees. The Committee note from the reply of DoE that the time taken in handing over a house to an allottee is dependent upon the condition of the house. However, the Committee note with consternation that DoE did not give specific reasons for delays of one to two years in some cases and even delays of more than two years which have been pointed out by Audit. The Committee observe that as per the present practice, on allotment of an accommodation, the allottee has to give his acceptance within 8 days and Technical Occupation is to be taken after a further period of 5 days. Now, a provision has been made in e-Awas that in case the allottee does not take Technical Occupation within this period, the allotment stands cancelled. Further, a check point has been provided in the system to monitor whether the allottee has taken Physical possession. If Physical possession is not taken owing to the house not made habitable by CPWD, CPWD is requested to expedite the work towards making the house habitable. However, if the house is habitable and possession is not taken, the allotment is cancelled. The Committee further note that as per the Maintenance Charter of CPWD, the stipulated time given for renovation of Quarters after vacation by the previous allottee of Type I to Type IV houses is 60 days and for Quarters of Type V and above categories it is 75 days. In cases where no renovation is required, physical possession is handed over immediately. Any delay in the timelines mentioned above are due to the additional time taken by CPWD to make the dwelling unit habitable. The Committee do not find merit in the logic extended in including a house for allotment without carrying out the necessary maintenance/ repair work following the vacation of the house. In order to avoid delays in possession, the Committee desire that once a house is vacated, its habitability should be immediately assessed by CPWD. If the house is

habitable, only then should it be demarcated for allotment. In case repairs/ renovation are required, CPWD may first take necessary action to ensure that the houses are repaired/ renovated as per the stipulations of the Maintenance Charter. The Committee also recommend that in case of non-adherence to the stipulations, accountability should be fixed on the officials responsible for delays.

Occupation of Multiple houses by allottees

7. The Committee note that for the period January 2011 to July 2014, Audit found that 536 allottees were occupying more than one accommodation for which various explanations were advanced by DoE, such as, allotments made for compulsory shifting, 'vacant possession' not being reflected in the system, non-handing over of house. In cases of change of accommodation, there would be allottees who are in occupation of two houses during the intervening period. The Committee observe from Audit's findings that during a test check of 12 registration numbers in 10 cases, double occupation was indicated even after a gap of years following the allottee occupying the second unit. The Committee note that now, if an allottee is found in physical occupation of two or more houses beyond 15 days, market rent is charged. The Committee also note that following computerization of records, it is easy to identify cases of double occupation in the automated system since, in such cases, licence fee in respect of only one flat will be received, and the fee in respect of the other flat will not be received. The Committee further observe that DoE has initiated linkage of eAwas with Public Financial Management System (PFMS) which would eliminate the possibility of multiple occupation of Government accommodation. The Committee desire to be apprised of the action taken by the MoHUA in the 10 cases of double occupation of Government accommodation pointed out by the Audit. Since Audit had done only a test check, the Committee exhort the Ministry to review all such cases to ensure that there are no instances of double occupation. The Committee further desire that the process of linking eAwas with PFMS may be expedited and completed within a time bound period. They would also like to be apprised of the status and the impact of the same on eliminating double occupancy in toto.

Maintenance of dangerous and unsafe houses by CPWD

8. While noting the stipulation that once a residential house is declared unsafe, it cannot be allotted to any person until it is declared safe by the competent authority, the Committee observe that an analysis of GAMS database revealed that 2,035 houses which were declared unsafe were allotted. The Committee find that in 106 cases where the houses were declared unsafe, these were allotted within 50 days of being declared as unsafe. The Committee, in this regard take note of DoE's reply that with the linking of e-Awas and e-Sewa such houses, once declared unsafe by CPWD would automatically go out of the process of being allotted, and only following the receipt of the report from CPWD, that the house has been made habitable, the same would be included in the process of bidding for allotment. The Committee also note that DoE monitors the status of inhabitable houses and holds periodic meetings with CPWD officers to turn them habitable. In this regard, the Committee, during oral evidence, had indicated an instance of flats in a particular Area in New Delhi that had been declared dangerous and unsafe, but, were not being vacated. While noting that the list of unsafe flats has been sent to DoE for cancellation of allotment and eviction, the Committee desire that DoE and CPWD take urgent steps to ensure that inhabitable and dangerous houses are vacated at the earliest and they are repaired/ renovated.

Web Portal services

9. The Committee note that there were 4 different portals viz. <http://estates.nic.in> for information regarding government accommodation available for the applicants/allottees and public in addition to circulars, policy orders, compendium, information about booking of Vigyan Bhawan /Holiday Homes etc.; www.gpra.nic.in, the frontend of GAMS database used by applicants/allottees etc. to get information about the housing stock, vacancies, allotments and waiting list etc.; www.eawas.nic.in which was developed for internal work of DoE and online license fee posting by Drawing and Disbursing Officers (DDOs); and www.cpwdsewa.nic.in (e-Sewa), web based software developed by CPWD for management of maintenance, for online vacancy reporting etc. The Committee note that all 'Web applications' have been merged into one and a web portal and mobile app named e-sampada has been launched

in December, 2020 which aims to provide a 'One Nation, One System' method. With the launch of e-sampada, the four websites (eawas.nic.in, grpa.nic.in, holidayhomes.nic.in and states.gov.in) and the two mobile apps (m-Awas and m-Ashoka5) of the Directorate of Estates have been integrated into one, paving the way for accessing all the services on the same platform. The new application aims to provide a single window for all the services which includes office space allotment to government organizations in 45 office complexes in 28 cities, allotment of over one lakh government residential accommodation, booking of the building at 5, Ashoka Road, New Delhi and 1,176-holiday homes for social functions, etc. *However, on logging into the site, it can be seen that many features and facilities such as booking of holiday homes, Touring Officers' Hostels etc. are not available as yet, for certain categories of employees even after 6 months of launch of the web portal.* The Committee desire that all the relevant information and facilities for booking etc. may be made available on the portal at the earliest. The Committee also desire to be apprised of the user feedback on the new site.

Furnishing records/documents to Audit

10. The Committee are dismayed to note that details of meetings of the Prioritisation Committee and copies of minutes thereof; minutes of the meetings of the Standing Committee; information regarding outstanding Licence Fee in respect of other types of accommodation etc. were not provided to Audit. The Committee are disappointed to note that the Ministry, instead of replying has referred the query regarding non-submission of documents to Audit to CPWD for furnishing the reply thereto. The Committee enjoin upon the Ministry to henceforth, make available the required records/documents to Audit and also desire the Ministry to explain the reasons for not providing the documents requisitioned by the Audit.

NEW DELHI:
07 December, 2021
16 Agrahayna 1943 (Saka)

ADHIR RANJAN CHOWDHURY
Chairperson,
Public Accounts Committee

To augment the housing stock under GPRA, the following measures have been taken by the Ministry of Urban Development in Delhi.

A. Recent augmentation and taken over for allotment:-

S. No.	Location	Mode of Acquisition	Type of accommodations	No. of Units
1.	CWG Village	Outright Purchase from DDA	Type V-B Type VI-B Type VIII Total	294 107 39 440
2.	Dev Nagar	New Construction	Type-III	400
3.	Deen Dayal Upadhyaya Marg	New Construction	Type V-B Type VI-A	138 103

(B) Details of GPRA quarters under construction:-

S. No	Location	T-II	T-III	T-IV	Target Date of Completion
1	DIZ Area (New Delhi)	-	-	30 Nos.	19.08.2016
2	Dev Nagar, (New Delhi)	-	384 Nos.	-	29.02.2016
Total		-	384 Nos.	30 Nos.	

(C) Redevelopment Proposals for Additional Stock of GPRA

1. Redevelopment Project under construction

Sl. NO.	Location	Existing Accommodation	Proposed Accommodation under Redevelopment Project	Additional Units Available
1.	Kidwai Nagar(E)	2444	4608	2164

The likely date for completion of the Kidwai Nagar (E) project is 30.11.2019. However, the handing over of the flats is likely to start from June 2018

2. In addition to above the project for redevelopment of General Pool Residential Accommodation (GPRA) in the following 7 colonies has been approved by the Cabinet in its meeting held on 05.07.2016. The details of the 7 colonies are :-

To be developed through NBCC

1. Sarojini Nagar
2. Netaji Nagar,
3. Nauroji Nagar

To be developed through CPWD

4. Kasturba Nagar
5. Tyagraj Nagar
6. Srinivaspuri
7. Mohammadpur

Against an existing housing stock of 12970 housing units of Type-I to IV would be replaced by approximately 25667 dwelling units of Type –II to VI, thereby increasing an additional number of 12697 housing units to the existing stock. The project will be completed in a time period of 6 years in a phased manner. The details of the project is kept at Annexure-A.1

(d) Augmentation Proposals under Planning :

New Constructions proposed in Delhi:

- a) Transit Hostel at DDU Marg
- b) Various types of residential units at Ghitorni as per the following units:-

Sl. No.	Location	Type of Unit	Proposed Dwelling Units			
			Unit Area (sq.m.)	GPRA	For Sale	Total
1.	Ghitorni	VIII	615.50	50	--	50
2.		VII	423.15	100	75	175
3.		VI	279.05	875	100	975
4.		V	209.66	826	512	1338
5.		IV(Spl.)	154.63	1520	510	2030
6.		IV	134.63	400	--	400
7.		III	82.55	1070	--	1070
8.		II	72.40	1600	--	1600
		Total		6441	1197	7638

- c) 798 Type IV(Special) flats at Dev Nagar
- d) 72 Type V flats at Vasant Vihar.
- e) 36 Type VI flats at Vasant Vihar.
- f) About 100 Type VII flats at Deen Dayal Upadhyay Marg
- g) 15 Type VII Bungalows at Sunehari Bagh
- h) 80 Type III flats at Probyn Road

- i) 4 Type-VIII Bungalows at Sunehari Bagh
- j) 432 Type-IV(Special) and 108 Type-V in Jorbagh.

On account of the above measures, the total of 24000 additional housing units (approximately) will become available for the employees over a period of 5-8 years. These high number of housing units are being planned for construction is due to the waiting list of around 30000 employees in which many employees are living below their entitlement and it is estimated that around 4000 newly recruited employees are also waiting outside the waiting list of Directorate of Estates as they have not applied for GPRA due to their priority dates not getting covered in next few years. The time span will vary upon some factors i.e. Land availability and clearances from various authorities, availability of funds and High Floor Area Ratio(FAR) in respect of new projects and relocation/shifting of staff to alternate accommodations in the case of redevelopment of colonies. For example in the case of new colonies like Ghitorni, DDU Marg where the land has been readily available, the period of completion of projects could take 5-6 years time whereas in the case of redevelopment of other existing colonies, it will take longer time of 7-8 years due to reasons mentioned above.

**PROJECT FOR REDEVELOPMENT OF GENERAL POOL RESIDENTIAL
ACCOMMODATION (GPRA) IN SEVEN COLONIES**

- The Cabinet, in its meeting held on 05.07.2016, has approved a proposal for redevelopment of seven GPRA colonies i.e. Sarojini Nagar, Netaji Nagar, Nauroji Nagar through National Buildings Construction Corporation Limited (NBCC) and Kasturba Nagar, Thyagraj Nagar, Srinivasपुरi and Mohammadpur through Central Public Works Department (CPWD).
- The project would augment the existing housing stock by optimum utilization of land resources as per MPD 2021 and using modern construction technology viz. steel frames, mivan shuttering and pre-fabrication with green building norms and in-house solid / liquid waste management facilities.
- The existing housing stock of 12,970 old and dilapidated dwelling units of Type I to IV with Build Up Area (BUA) of approx. 7.49 lakh sqm would be replaced by approx. 25,667 dwelling units of Type II to VI with BUA of approx. 29.18 lakh sqm. with supporting social infrastructure facilities.
- The project will also develop Government office accommodation for nearly 2.42 lakh sqm at Netaji Nagar including South Asia Regional Training and Technical Assistance Centre (SARTAC) and a separate office block of Ministry of Finance.
- The total estimated cost of the project is Rs. 32,835 crores which includes maintenance and operation costs for 30 years. The project shall be implemented on self-financing basis by sale of commercial BUA of 8.07 lakh sqm. constructed in Nauroji Nagar and parts of Sarojini Nagar, adjoining the Ring Road.
- The project will be completed in six years, in a phased manner.

MINUTES OF THE THIRD SITTING OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE (2020-21) HELD ON 21 AUGUST, 2020.

The Committee sat from 1100 hrs. to 1400 hrs. on 21 August, 2020 in Main Committee Room, Parliament House Annexe, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Shri Adhir Ranjan Chowdhury - Chairperson

MEMBERS

LOK SABHA

2. Shri T.R. Baalu
3. Shri Subhash Chandra Baheria
4. Smt. Darshana Vikram Jardosh
5. Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab
6. Shri Ajay (Teni) Misra
7. Shri Jagdambika Pal
8. Shri Vishnu Dayal Ram
9. Shri Rahul Ramesh Shewale
10. Shri Rajiv Ranjan Singh alias Lalan Singh
11. Dr. Satya Pal Singh
12. Shri Jayant Sinha
13. Shri Ram Kripal Yadav

RAJYA SABHA

14. Shri Rajeev Chandrasekhar
15. Shri Naresh Gujral
16. Shri Bhupender Yadav

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

1. Shri T.G. Chandrasekhar - Joint Secretary
2. Shri M.L.K. Raja - Director
3. Smt. Bharti S. Tuteja - Additional Director

REPRESENTATIVES FROM THE OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER AND AUDITOR GENERAL OF INDIA

1. Ms. Saubha Kumar - Dy. CAG
2. Ms. Ritika Bhatia - Principal Director
3. Ms. Rina Akoijam - Principal Director
4. Shri Shailendra Vikram Singh - Principal Director

REPRESENTATIVES OF THE MINISTRY OF HOUSING AND URBAN AFFAIRS

1. Shri Durga Shankar Mishra - Secretary
2. Shri Ved Prakash - Joint Secretary
3. Shri V.K.Jayaswal - DG, CPWD
4. Shri Anant Kumar - ADG (Tech.), CPWD
5. Smt.Ritu Sain - Director of Estates

2. At the outset, Hon'ble Chairperson, PAC welcomed the Members and Officers of C&AG of India to the sitting of the Committee and apprised the Members that the Committee would take oral evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs on the subject, "Functioning of Directorate of Estates" based on Chapter 19 of C&AG Report No. 11 of 2016. Then the representatives of C&AG of India gave a briefing to the Members on the aforesaid subject.

3. Thereafter, the representatives of the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs were called in. The Hon'ble Chairperson while welcoming the representatives of the Ministry, CPWD and Directorate of Estates, asked them to explain to the Committee the specific action taken by them on the observations made by the Audit.

4. The representatives of the Ministry gave a detailed account of the follow-up action taken by them on the audit findings. Thereafter, Hon'ble Chairperson and Members raised various issues such as rationalization of the means of assessing satisfaction levels; completion of digital enumeration of physical stock; status of addition of 30,000 houses in the 'accommodation pool'; condition of holiday homes; recovery and instances of waiver of licence fee; issue of no dues certificates; action taken on instances of illegal construction and sub-letting; cost and efficiency of management of their assets by the Directorate; system for renovation of flats especially MP Flats; delayed allotment of vacant houses; roadmap for resolution of demand and supply; contractual responsibility of the sub-contractor for quality of construction /renovation; periodicity of inspections for checking instances of sub-letting; categorization of litigation under three heads and habitation/ occupation of dangerous and unsafe apartments etc. Members, in view of various complaints received from the residents of the newly constructed East Kidwai Nagar Complex, suggested that a visit may be undertaken by the Committee to have first-hand information about the steps taken to maintain the complex.

5. The Secretary, MoHUA, the DG CPWD, the Director of Estates then replied to the queries raised by the Members on various issues raised by the Members. As some issues

required detailed information, the Hon'ble Chairperson directed the Secretary to send written replies to the queries raised by Members during the sitting, which remained uncovered or partially answered.

6. The Hon'ble Chairperson thanked the representatives of the Ministry, CPWD and Directorate of Estates for appearing before the Committee and for giving free and frank replies to the queries of the Members and the officers of the C&AG for assisting the Committee in their deliberation.

The witnesses then withdrew.

A copy of the transcript of audio recording of the proceedings of the sitting has been kept on record.

**MINUTES OF THE SITTING OF THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE
(2021-22) HELD ON 15th SEPTEMBER, 2021.**

The Committee sat on 15 September, 2021 from 1500 hrs. to 1700 hrs. in Room No. '53', Parliament House, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Shri Adhir Ranjan Chowdhury - Chairperson

MEMBERS

LOK SABHA

2. Shri Subhash Chandra Baheria
3. Shri Bhartruhari Mahtab
4. Shri Jagdambika Pal
5. Shri Vishnu Dayal Ram
6. Shri Rahul Ramesh Shewale
7. Shri Rajeev Ranjan Singh alias Lalan Singh
8. Dr. Satya Pal Singh
9. Shri Jayant Sinha
10. Shri Pratap Chandra Sarangi

RAJYA SABHA

11. Shri Shaktisinh Gohil
12. Shri Bhubaneswar Kalita
13. Dr. C.M Ramesh
14. Dr. M. Thambidurai
15. Shri V. Vijayasai Reddy
16. Dr. Sudhanshu Trivedi

LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

1. Shri T.G. Chandrasekhar - Joint Secretary
2. Shri Tirthankar Das - Director
3. Smt. Bharti S. Tuteja - Additional Director

REPRESENTATIVES FROM Ministry of Power

Sl. No.	Name	Designation
1.	Shri Alok Kumar	Secretary
2.	Shri Ashish Upadhyaya,	Additional Secretary & Financial Adviser
3.	Shri S.K.G. Rahate	Additional Secretary
4.	Shri Vivek Kumar Dewangan	Additional Secretary
5.	Shri Mritunjay Kumar Narayan	Joint Secretary
6.	Shri Raghuraj Madhav Rajendran	Joint Secretary
7.	Shri Vishal Kapoor	Joint Secretary
8.	Shri Jithesh John	Economic Adviser
9.	Shri Ghanshyam Prasad	Joint Secretary

REPRESENTATIVES FROM CPSES CONCERNED

Sl. No.	Name	Designation
1.	Shri Gurdeep Singh	CMD, NTPC Ltd.
2.	Shri A.K. Singh	CMD, NHPC Ltd.
3.	Shri K. Sreekant	CMD, Power Grid Corporation of India Ltd.(PGCIL)
4.	Shri Sanjay Malhotra	CMD, REC Ltd.
5.	Shri R.S. Dhillon	CMD, Power Finance Corporation Ltd.(PFC)

REPRESENTATIVES FROM THE OFFICE OF THE COMPTROLLER AND AUDITOR GENERAL OF INDIA

Sl. No.	Name	Designation
1.	Shri R. G. Vishwanathan	Dy. CAG
2.	MS. Sangita Choure	Dy. CAG
3.	Shri Deepak Anurag	Dy. CAG
4.	Ms Ritika Bhatia	Director General
5.	Shri D. K. Sekhar	Director General
6.	Shri A. V. Singh	Principal Director

2. At the outset, Hon'ble Chairperson, PAC welcomed the Members and Audit Officers to the Sitting of the Committee, convened to have oral evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Power and CMDs of CPSEs concerned on the subject, "Construction of toilets in schools by CPSEs" based on C&AG Report No. 21 of 2019 and also to consider and adopt Draft Reports on the following subjects: (i) "Functioning of Directorate of Estates" and (ii) "Excesses over Voted Grants and Charged Appropriations (2018-19)". The Chairperson also welcomed new Member, Shri V. Vijayasai Reddy to the Committee.

3. The Committee firstly took up the Draft Reports on (i) "Functioning of Directorate of Estates" and (ii) "Excesses over Voted Grants and Charged Appropriations (2018-19)" for consideration and adoption. The Committee, after some deliberations, adopted the draft Report on the subject "Functioning of Directorate of Estates" with minor modifications while the second Report on the subject "Excesses over Voted Grants and Charged Appropriations (2018-19)" was adopted without any modification. The Committee also authorized the Chairperson to finalise the aforesaid Reports on the basis of factual verification and present the same to the Hon'ble Speaker/ Parliament.

4. xxxx xxxx xxxx xxxx

5. xxxx xxxx xxxx xxxx

6. xxxx xxxx xxxx xxxx

7. xxxx xxxx xxxx xxxx

8. xxxx xxxx xxxx xxxx

9. xxxx xxxx xxxx xxxx

10. xxxx xxxx xxxx xxxx

11. xxxx xxxx xxxx xxxx

12. xxxx xxxx xxxx xxxx

A copy of the verbatim proceedings of the sitting has been kept on record.

The Committee then adjourned.