

MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE

REVIEW OF PROGRESS OF ALL AIIMS

COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES
(2021-22)

TWELFTH REPORT

(SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA)



LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI

TWELFTH REPORT

COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES

(2021-22)

(SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA)

MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE

REVIEW OF PROGRESS OF ALL AIIMS

(Presented to Lok Sabha on 21 December, 2021)



LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT

NEW DELHI

21 December 2021/ 30 Agrahayana1943(S)

CONTENTS		Page No.
Composition of the Committee on Estimates (2020-21)		(ii)
Composition of the Committee on Estimates (2021-22)		(iii)
Introduction		(v)
PART-I		
CHAPTER-I	Introductory	1
CHAPTER-II	Budget Allocation	5
CHAPTER-III	Review of Progress	10
CHAPTER-IV	Other Issues	23
PART-II		
	Observations/Recommendations	38
PART-III		
	ANNEXURES	63
APPENDICES		
(i)	Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 08.04.2021	64
(ii)	Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 27.10.2021	67
(iii)	Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 16.11.2021	69
(iv)	Minutes of the sitting of the Committee held on 16.12.2021	71

COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES (2020-2021)

Shri Girish Bhalchandra Bapat – Chairperson

Members

2. Shri Kunwar Danish Ali
3. Shri Kalyan Banerjee
4. Shri Sudharshan Bhagat
5. Shri Pradan Baruah
6. Shri Nand Kumar Singh Chauhan
7. Shri P.P. Chaudhary
8. Shri Parvatagouda Chandanagouda Gaddigoudar
9. Shri Nihal Chand Chauhan
10. Dr. Sanjay Jaiswal
11. Shri Dharmendra Kumar Kashyap
12. Shri Mohanbhai Kalyanji Kundariya
13. Shri Dayanidhi Maran
14. Shri K. Muraleedharan
15. Shri S.S. Palanimanickam
16. Shri Kamlesh Paswan
17. Dr. K.C. Patel
18. Col. Rajyavardhan Singh Rathore
19. Shri Vinayak Bhaurao Raut
20. Shri Ashok Kumar Rawat
21. Shri Magunta Srinivasulu Reddy
22. Shri Rajiv Pratap Rudy
23. Shri Francisco Cosme Sardinha
24. Shri Jugal Kishore Sharma
25. Shri Prathap Simha
26. Shri Pinaki Misra
27. Smt. Sangeeta Kumari Singh Deo
28. Shri Kesineni Srinivas
29. Shri Ajay Bhatt
30. Shri Parvesh Sahib Singh Verma

COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES (2021-2022)

Shri Girish Bhalchandra Bapat – Chairperson

Members

2. Shri Kunwar Danish Ali
3. Shri Kalyan Banerjee
4. Shri Sudharshan Bhagat
5. Shri P.P. Chaudhary
6. Shri Nihal Chand Chauhan
7. Smt. Sangeeta Kumari Singh Deo
8. Shri Harish Dwivedi
9. Shri P. C. Gaddigoudar
10. Dr. Sanjay Jaiswal
11. Shri Dharmendra Kumar Kashyap
12. Shri Mohanbhai Kalyanji Kundariya
13. Shri Dayanidhi Maran
14. Shri Pinaki Misra
15. Shri K. Muraleedharan
16. Shri Jual Oram **
17. Shri S.S. Palanimanickam
18. Shri Kamlesh Paswan
19. Dr. K.C. Patel
20. Col. Rajyavardhan Singh Rathore
21. Shri Vinayak Bhaurao Raut
22. Shri Ashok Kumar Rawat
23. Shri Magunta Srinivasulu Reddy
24. Shri Rajiv Pratap Rudy
25. Shri Dilip Saikia
26. Shri Francisco Cosme Sardinha
27. Shri Jugal Kishore Sharma
28. Shri Prathap Simha
29. Shri Parvesh Sahib Singh Verma
30. Shri Kesineni Srinivas

**** Elected as a Member of Estimates Committee vide Bulletin Part-II no. 2897 dt. 29.07.2021**

Secretariat

1. Smt Jyochnamayi Sinha - Director

INTRODUCTION

I, the Chairperson of the Committee on Estimates, having been authorized by the Committee to submit the Report on their behalf, do present this Twelfth Report on the subject 'Review of Progress of All AIIMS.'

2. Setting up of new AIIMS was envisaged under Pradhan Mantri Swasthya Suraksha Yojana (PMSSY) (a Central Sector Scheme), to correct the regional imbalances in the availability of affordable and reliable health care services coupled with the objective of improving quality of medical education in India. Land for setting up of new AIIMS is provided by the concerned State Government which spans around 200 acres. Under PMSSY division, consolidated allocation of funds is being done for all AIIMS. Out of 22 new AIIMS, six AIIMS (at Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna, Raipur and Rishikesh) have become fully operational whereas 16 AIIMS are at different stages of construction. Out of 16 AIIMS, 4 are at initial stage.

3. The Committee on Estimates (2020-21) selected the subject 'Review of Progress of All AIIMS' for in-depth examination and report to the House. The Committee on Estimates (2021-22) continued with the examination of the subject.

4. In this report, the Committee have dealt with various issues like different status attributed to AIIMS other than AIIMS, New Delhi, gaps in recruitment process, encumbrance free site for construction of new AIIMS, online medical education, proposal for setting up of new AIIMS, budgetary allocations for all AIIMS together with research activities. The Committee have analyzed these issues/points in detail and have made Observations/Recommendations in the report.

5. The Committee held three sittings on 8.04.2021, 27.10.2021 and 16.11.2021, to take oral evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare. In connection with the examination of this subject, the Committee had an on the spot study visit to AIIMS, Kalyani, West Bengal on 27.09.2021. The Committee considered and adopted the draft Report on the subject at their sitting held on 16.12.2021.

6. The Committee wish to place on record their sincere thanks to the representatives of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, who appeared before them and placed their considered views on the subject and furnished the information required in connection with the examination of the subject.

7. For facility of reference and convenience, the Observations/Recommendations of the Committee have been printed in bold in Part-II of the Report.

NEW DELHI;
17 December, 2021
26 Agrahayana, 1943 (Saka)

GIRISH BHALCHANDRA BAPAT
CHAIRPERSON
COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES

PART – I

CHAPTER-I

INTRODUCTION

The Pradhan Mantri Swasthya Suraksha Yojana (PMSSY), a Central Sector Scheme, was announced in August 2003 with the objectives of correcting regional imbalances in the availability of affordable and reliable tertiary healthcare services and improving the quality of medical education in India. The scheme had two broad components, viz. setting up of AIIMS like Institutions (later re-named as new AIIMS) and up-gradation of old Government Medical Colleges (GMCs). In pursuance of this announcement, a proposal was taken to the Expenditure Finance Committee in November 2004 and EFC approved setting up of six AIIMS-like apex healthcare institutes in the States of Bihar at Patna, Chhattisgarh at Raipur, Madhya Pradesh at Bhopal, Odisha at Bhubaneswar, Rajasthan at Jodhpur, and Uttarakhand at Rishikesh.

1.2 The EFC also approved formation of a Central Apex Society under societies Registration Act, with the responsibility for establishing and running these six AIIMS-like institutions. After obtaining the approval of the EFC, a proposal was taken to the Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs in March 2006 and CCEA approved six AIIMS-like institutions as well as formation of a Central Apex Society, for establishing and running these institutions. While approving the Revised Cost Estimates, there was some cost escalation. A proposal was taken again to the Cabinet in February 2010. while approving the RCE, the Cabinet also underline the role of the Central Apex Society in establishing and running these six AIIMS-like institutions. Therefore, from 2006 to September 2012, these AIIMS-like institutions were not part of the AIIMS Act and existed outside it, governed by a Central Apex Society. In September 2012, there was an amendment in the AIIMS Act, which was notified. This amendment incorporated these new AIIMS-like institutions in Section 27 (a) of the Act and provided that all provisions of the Act shall apply to these institutions also. Once a decision was taken in September 2012 to

make those six AIIMS as part of the amended AIIMS Act, the Central Apex Society ceased to exist.

1.3 The Scheme envisages 100 percent funding by the centre for setting up of new AIIMS, The Ministry of Health and Family Welfare Government of India is responsible for the overall administration of the Scheme with the PMSSY Division of the Ministry headed by a Joint Secretary entrusted with its implementation and monitoring.

Following are some of important provisions of the AIIMS Act, 2012:

Section 11 Staff of the Institute

(1) There shall be a [chief executive officer of every Institute] who shall be designated as the [Director of such Institute] and shall, subject to such rules as may be made by the Central Government in this behalf, be appointed by the Institute:

[Provided that the first Director of every Institute (other than the existing Institute), established on and after the commencement of the All-India Institute of Medical Sciences (Amendment) Act, 2012, shall be appointed by the Central Government:

Provided further that in case a Director of a society has been appointed by the Central Government before the commencement of the All-India Institute of Medical Sciences (Amendment) Act, 2012, such Director shall be deemed to be the first Director of the concerned corresponding Institute.]

[(1A) The Director shall hold office for a term of five years from the date on which he enters upon his office or until he attains the age of sixty-five years, whichever is earlier:

Provided that any person holding office as a Director immediately before the commencement of the All-India Institute of Medical Sciences and the Post-Graduate Institute of Medical Education and Research (Amendment) Act, 2007, shall in so far as his appointment is inconsistent with the provisions of this sub-section, cease to hold office on such commencement as such Director and shall be entitled to claim compensation not exceeding three months' pay and allowances for the premature termination of his office or of any contract of service.]

(2) The Director shall act as the Secretary to the Institute as well as the Governing Body.

(3) The Director shall exercise such powers and discharge such functions as may be prescribed by regulations or as may be delegated to him by the

Institute or the President of the Institute or by the Governing Body or the Chairman of the Governing Body.

(4) Subject to such rules as may be made by the Central Government in this behalf, the Institute may appoint such number of other officers and employees as maybe necessary for the exercise of its powers and discharge of its functions and may determine the designations and grades of such other officers and employees.

(5) The Director and other 'officers and employees of the Institute shall be entitled to such salary and allowances and shall be governed by such conditions of service in respect of leave, pension, provident fund and other matters as may be prescribed by regulations made in this behalf.

(c) Vide Section 23 of the All India Institute of Medical Sciences (Amendment Act) 2012, a Section 27(A) has been inserted which provides that: Each of the Institute, registered as society under the Societies Registration Act, 1860 (21 of 1860) and mentioned in column (2) of the Table below shall be a body corporate having perpetual succession and common seal and shall by its name mentioned in column (3) of that Table, sue and be sued.

1.4 In the meanwhile, with the aim of expeditious operationalization and to attract reputed faculty from AIIMS, New Delhi and other Institutes of National Importance (INIs),as well as other premier Institutions, to head new and upcoming AIIMS, it was a policy decision, decided in November 2018 with the approval of Department of Expenditure and Hon'ble Minister for Health & Family Welfare to have a post of Executive Director (ED) to operate on either / or basis with the post of Director, who will act as CEO of the Institute. In the case of ED, the appointment can be up to maximum age of 70 years, with the upper age limit for eligibility for consideration being 67 years. The manner of selection of ED however would be the same as stipulated for the post of Director. Also, the eligibility criteria in respect of qualification and experience for consideration for appointment as ED will be the same as the post of Director.

1.5 On being asked whether there is a provision of the Act, the Secretary Ministry of Health in his candid submission before the Committee has stated that the Act does not make a reference to Executive Director.

1.6 In the first phase of PMSSY, establishment of six AIIMS, one each at Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna, Raipur and Rishikesh was envisaged with an approved

cost of Rs. 820.00 crore per AIIMS. Academic session for MBBS at the six AIIMS was started in September, 2012 for 50 students and 100 students each in subsequent years and B.Sc (Nursing) for 60 students from September, 2013. A total of around 1047 PG seats and 750 MBBS seats for year 2020-21 are in these 6 AIIMS.

1.7 Basket of services in these six AIIMS has been expanded and presently, on an average, more than 16000 patients are visiting OPD daily besides more than 18000 patients getting treatment in IPD every month. Also, about 8000 major and minor surgeries are being performed every month in these six AIIMS.

1.8 Hospital services in these 6 AIIMS are operating with substantial capacity as all the Specialties and most of Super-specialties are functional at each of these six AIIMS. All key hospital facilities and services such as Emergency, Trauma, Blood Bank, ICU, Diagnostic and Pathology are functioning. Medical education, Healthcare and Research are also functional substantially in these six AIIMS. The total bed capacity of 6 AIIMS is at present 5542 against the sanctioned bed capacity of 5760. Dedicated hospitals blocks for treatment of CoVID -19 patients and CoVID test Labs were also made functional in these AIIMS.

1.9 In the succeeding chapters, the Report shall deal with the budget allocation vis-a-vis actual utilization of funds at different AIIMS, together with a broad overview of progress of different AIIMS. The Report also highlights several other pertinent issues which need greater focus and attention.

CHAPTER II

BUDGET ALLOCATION

The present chapter details the budget allocation, grants in aid released and utilized for the setting up of new AIIMS. Section 15 of the AIIMS ACT 1956 as amended in the year 2012, has stated that :

"The Central Government may, under appropriation made by Parliament by law in this behalf, pay to 1[every Institute] in each financial year such sums of money and in such manner as may be considered necessary by that Government for the exercise of its powers and discharge of its functions under this Act."

2.2 The allocation of funds is made for all the projects under PMSSY Division which include setting up of All India Institute of Medical Sciences (AIIMS) as well as up gradation of Government Medical Sciences (GMCs). Its further allocation / release is being done by Ministry of Health & Family Welfare. The bifurcation of budget allocations along with actual expenditure of the additional fund allocations under AIIMS is as under:

“

(Rs. in cr.)

REVENUE SECTION	2018 - 19			2019 - 20			2020 - 21		
	B.E.	R.E.	Actual	B.E.	R.E.	Actual	B.E.	R.E.	Actual
GiA (General)	449.40	664.40	664.40	652.60	826.50	826.50	1300.00	1300.00	1297.90
GiA (Capital)	350.00	395.00	395.00	700.00	700.00	700.00	1320.00	837.25	837.25
GiA (Salaries)	950.00	650.00	650.00	750.00	1200.00	1200.00	1200.00	1400.00	1400.00
Others	100.70	140.70	133.68	758.10	849.10	826.16	1532.10	1532.10	874.30
TOTAL REVENUE	1850.10	1850.10	1843.08	2860.70	3575.60	3552.66	5352.10	5069.35	4409.45
CAPITAL SECTION									
Mach. & Equip.	812.90	612.90	612.89	487.30	687.30	636.17	300.00	300.00	299.08
Major Works	1110.00	1310.00	1307.96	600.00	400.00	442.66	315.90	2095.90	2081.27
others	52.00	52.00	32.60	52.00	52.00	52.00	52.00	52.00	50.00
TOTAL	1974.90	1974.90	1953.45	1139.30	1139.30	1130.83	667.90	2447.90	2430.35

CAPITAL									
TOTAL BUDGET	3825.00	3825.00	3796.53	4000.00	4714.90	4683.49	6020.00	7517.25	6839.80

Actual expenditure includes expenditure out of HEFA funding:

REVENUE SECTION	2021 - 22 (as on 1-11-21)		
	B.E.	R.E.	Actual
GiA (General)	1500.00		614.25
GiA (Capital)	1350.00		397.40
GiA (Salaries)	1500.00		1373.67
Others	803.13		500.17
TOTAL REVENUE	5153.13		2885.49
CAPITAL SECTION			
Machinery & Equipments	300.00		133.89
Major Works	1494.85		871.12
others	52.02		0.00
TOTAL CAPITAL	1846.87		1005.01
TOTAL BUDGET	7000.00		3890.50

Others include budget allocated for Consultancy, Swacchta Action Plan (SAP), North East Budget, Principal and Interest Payment for loan from Higher Education Finance Agency (HEFA) and other minor Miscellaneous heads like T.A, Office Expenditure etc.

2.3 The additional fund allocation through HEFA and expenditure against each AIIMS is also given below :

“ [Rupees in Crores]

AIIMS	2018-19	2019-20	2020-21	TOTAL
Mangalagiri	140.17	230.30	95.84	466.32
Nagpur	138.71	334.89	50.23	523.82
Kalyani	132.09	297.87	76.31	506.28
Gorakhpur	194.21	328.60	-	522.81
Bathinda	98.91	229.48	94.22	422.61
Guwahati	92.50	165.00	-	257.50

Bilaspur	172.20	277.67	74.25	524.12
Deoghar	0	150.67	19.58	170.25
Jammu	0	-	50.00	50.00
Rae Bareli	47.00	176.54	60.00	283.54
TOTAL	1015.79	2,191.02	520.44	3,727.25

The funds released through HEFA till 2020 – 21 has been completely utilized.“

The Release of Budget allocation, effective release of budget allocation and actual expenditure from the year 2018-19 to 2021-22 is in Annexure-1.

2.4 During the course of examination, the Ministry in its presentation submitted the following with regard to budget projection, allocation and utilization under PMSSY:-

“

PMSSY – Budget Projection, Allocation and Utilization					
(Rs. In crore)					
Financial Year	Projected Requirement	Budget Estimates (B.E.)	Revised Estimates (R.E.)	EBR (HEFA) Funding	Expenditure*
2016-17	4362.10	2450.00	1953.24	--	1953.16
2017-18	5660.00	3975.00	3175.00	--	3159.81
2018-19	8398.20	3825.00	3825.00	1015.79	4812.31
2019-20	4062.10	4000.00	4714.90	2191.02	6874.51
2020-21	5733.35	6020.00	7517.25	520.43	7360.23
2021-22	8965.14	7000.00	--	--	3903.41
					**

***Including HEFA;**

****As on 22.10.2021”**

2.5 On being asked to furnish the details and quantum of additional funds required to meet the running expenditure of already functional six new AIIMS indicating the fields on which the desired funds would be utilized, the Ministry replied as under:

“For additional works of six AIIMS a total of Rs. 2908.82 Cr was approved. However, due to closure of HEFA financing this could not materialize. AIIMS-wise, component wise breakup is appended below:

AIIMS	Demand Projected (Rs. in cr.)			Year-wise Demand Projected (Rs. in cr.)			
	Civil Works	Medical Equipment	Total	2019-20	2020-21	2021-22	Total
Bhopal	136.92	352.28	489.20	146.38	192.36	150.46	489.20
Bhubaneswar	153.77	370.21	523.98	56.68	357.60	109.70	523.98
Jodhpur	504.79	111.64	616.43	153.70	396.69	66.04	616.43
Patna	279.61	90.00	369.61	75.50	220.50	73.61	369.61
Raipur	299.60	0.00	299.60	80.00	109.80	109.80	299.60
Rishikesh	510.00	100.00	610.00	87.50	302.75	219.75	610.00
Total	1884.69	1024.13	2908.82	599.76	1579.70	729.36	2908.82

2.6 The Committee wanted to know if the Ministry of Finance consulted Ministry of Health and Family Welfare to assess the fund requirement AIIMS wise, the Ministry submitted its reply as under :-

“Currently, there is a combined allocation of funds for all the new AIIMS under PMSSY. For this purpose, fund requirement under appropriate Heads is projected by the MoHFW and submitted to M/o Finance through the Budget Division of the ministry. The final budgetary allocation is however made by the M/o Finance. This allocation is under two Heads- Revenue and Capital. Allocation under Revenue Head is released to new AIIMS which are functional or partially functional, under three Heads, namely Salary, General and Creation of Capital Assets. Requirement of funds under Grant-In-Aid is discussed and decided in the meetings of Standing Finance Committee of each Institute and releases are made on the basis of proposals received from them.

The allocation under Capital Head on the other hand is released by MoHFW to the Executing Agency and Procurement Support Agency to be utilized for Major Works and purchase of equipment, which are part of setting up of a new AIIMS project. Releases are made on the basis of

progress of work, requirements projected by EAs and utilization of funds released in past.

It is clarified that only the total combined allocation under PMSSY is made by the Ministry of Finance. Its further allocation / release is done by MoHFW in the manner described above.”

2.7 Further the Ministry informed the Committee of the following :-

“As per the existing arrangement for setting up of any new AIIMS, an Executing Agency (EA) is appointed out of empanelled CPSUs. Empanelment of CPSUs is done by the MoHFW and out of the such empanelled CPSUs, EA is appointed by the Ministry through a process of tender. EAs are empowered to appoint Design Consultant and EPC Contractor. EAs are entrusted with the responsibility of completion of the AIIMS project in time bound manner, from design to complete construction alongwith all the services. EAs are also empowered to handle all contractual matters related to the project.”

2.8 The Committee are further informed, during one of the evidences, as under:

“There are 16 AIIMS projects which are going on for which we require fund allocation under capital head to complete the civil works as well as procurement of machinery and equipment. As new AIIMS start becoming functional, their running expenditure will also be required. Right now, we need it only for six AIIMS or some more where MBBS and OPD has started. But once IPD and all those also start, the running expenditure for those AIIMS, that is Grants in Aid for operating expenses or providing services, salary or any additional capital investment that they might need to make in terms of additional civil construction or additional 08.04.2021 Committee On Estimates 3 machinery or replacement of the machinery, requirements for these heads will increase. Our projection is that we will require about Rs.49,800 crore in the next five years, whereas the availability of funds that has been indicated to the Ministry for the next five years is about Rs.39,000 crore.”

CHAPTER – III

REVIEW OF PROGRESS

As stated earlier, setting up of 22 new AIIMS have been approved under PMSSY, six of which are functional. Of the remaining 16, MBBS classes and OPD services have been started in 7 new AIIMS at Raebareli, Gorakhpur, Mangalagiri, Nagpur, Kalyani, Bathinda, and Bibi Nagar. In another 5 new AIIMS at Deoghar, Bilaspur, Guwahati, Rajkot and Jammu, MBBS classes have been started. Remaining 4 are in the initial stages.

3.2 During the course of examination, one of the representatives of the Ministry who deposed before the Committee made a presentation which depicted the following with regard to the status of 16 new AIIMS:- (Ref. PPT of Sitting – 27.10.21)

Details of 16 New AIIMS under construction

S No	Location of AIIMS	Date of Cabinet Approval	Project Cost (Rs Cr)	Fund released (Rs Cr)	Cabinet Approved date of completion	Expected date for completion	Physical Progress
1.	Rae Bareli in Uttar Pradesh	05.02.2009 [RCE was approved by EFC on 22.06.2017]	823	665	April, 2020	Nov, 21	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• OPD Block & Residential Complex: Completed• Hospital & Academic Campus: Completed
2.	Mangalagiri in Andhra Pradesh	07.10.2015	1618	924.31	Oct, 2020	Dec 21	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Phase I - OPD Block & Residential Complex: Substantially completed.• Phase II – Hospital and Academic Campus: 84%

							IPD for COVID-19 treatment with COVID Lab functional
3.	Nagpur in Maharashtra	07.10.2015	1577	1013.01	Oct, 2020	Nov, 21	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Phase I - OPD Block & Residential Complex: 100% Phase II - Hospital and Academic Campus: Substantially completed. IPD for COVID-19 treatment with COVID Lab functional
4.	Kalyani in West Bengal	07.10.2015	1754	1123.01	Oct, 2020	Nov, 21	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Phase I - OPD Block & Residential Complex: Substantially completed. Phase II - Hospital and Academic Campus: Substantially completed.
5.	Gorakhpur in Uttar Pradesh	20.07.2016	1011	810.58	April, 2020	Nov, 2021	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Construction in EPC Mode in progress (88.50%)
6.	Bathinda in Punjab	27.07.2016	925	698.77	June, 2020	Nov, 2021	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Construction in EPC Mode in progress (88.70%)

7.	Guwahati in Assam	24.05.2017	1123	505.44	April, 2021	Sep, 2022	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction in EPC Mode in progress (57.50%)
8.	Bilaspur in Himachal Pradesh	03.01.2018	1471.04	1017.71	Dec, 2021	June, 2022	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction in EPC Mode in progress. (72%)
9.	Madurai in Tamil Nadu	17.12.2018	1264	12.35	Sep, 2022	Oct, 2026	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Site finalized at Madurai. • Pre-investment work in progress. • Preparatory survey by JICA Mission commenced in Feb, 2020. • Loan Agreement signed on 26.03.2021. • Appointment of Project Management Consultant in progress.
10.	Darbhanga in Bihar	15.09.2020	1264	0	Sep, 2024	Sep, 2024	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Site at Darbhanga finalized for the establishment of new AIIMS in the State. • State Govt. yet to handover encumbrance free land • EA for pre-

							investment appointed <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Appointment of EA for main construction work in process
11.	Samba in Jammu	10.01.2019	1661	470.68	Jan, 2023	Jan, 2023	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction in EPC Mode in progress (32%)
12.	Awantipura in Kashmir	10.01.2019	1828	353.67	Jan, 2025	Jan, 2025	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction in EPC Mode in progress (6%)
13.	Deoghar in Jharkhand	16.05.2018	1103	490.63	Feb, 2022	Jun, 2022	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction in EPC Mode in progress (58.0%)
14.	Rajkot in Gujarat	10.01.2019	1195	179.23	Oct, 2022	Oct, 2022	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Construction in EPC Mode in progress (12%)
15.	Bibi Nagar in Telangana	17.12.2018	1028	28.16	Sep,2022	Nov, 2023	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pre-investment work in progress. • Executing Agency (EA) for the main work appointed. • Design Consultant appointed. • Master Plan finalized. • Tender floated for appointment of contractor

							for main work by EA.
16.	Manethi in Haryana	28.02.2019	1299	0	Feb, 2023	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Encumbrance free land yet to be handed over by State Govt.

3.3 While detailing the progress of AIIMS at Deoghar, one of the senior representatives who deposed before the Committee submitted as under :-

“सर, देवघर में जो एम्स के कंस्ट्रक्शन का काम चल रहा है, वह अभी तक 30 प्रतिशत पूरा हुआ है। उसके लिए कम्प्लीशन का हमारा टारगेट मार्च, 2022 तक है। वहां पर आलरेडी एमबीबीएस क्लासेज चल रही हैं। एक बैच एडमिट हो गया है, अगला बैच थोड़ी बड़ी साइज का होने की उम्मीद है। अभी वहां एक पंचायत ट्रेनिंग इंस्टीट्यूट है, वहां से उसकी एमबीबीएस क्लासेज चल रही हैं, लेकिन नेक्स्ट बैच के लिए शायद वह पर्याप्त नहीं होगा। इसलिए हमने चीफ सेक्रेटरी के स्तर पर उनसे रिक्वेस्ट की है। वहां पर कुछ बिल्डिंग्स कम्प्लीशन के लिए तैयार हैं, जैसे उनका 'आयुष' ब्लॉक है, हम उनसे कह रहे हैं कि इसमें जल्दी कर दें तो जो अभी टेम्पररी फेसिलिटी से क्लासेज चल रही हैं, उनको वहां पर शिफ्ट कर सकते हैं।”

3.4 Responding to the specific query of the Committee as to why it has been decided that AIIMS, Madurai would be set up with loan from an international agency even though the fund has already been allocated and sanctioned for this purpose and whether funds from private/international agency has also been utilized for setting up any other proposed new AIIMS, the MoHFW replied as follows:

“Ministry of Health & Family Welfare vide proposal dated 30-9-2016 requested Ministry of Finance, Department of Economic Affairs to include funding the expenses in connection with the establishment of AIIMS, Gorakhpur, Uttar Pradesh and AIIMS, Bathinda, Punjab in the Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) Rolling Plan. The JICA authorities had also got the site visit carried out. However, while this process was on, the Ministry had also proceeded further with the project execution by appointing Executing Agency. Executing Agency in turn appointed Design Consultant and subsequently the design was also finalized. Since the work at these two places have already started, the JICA authorities were not willing to consider the funding as they wanted to be associated with the execution process right from the initial conception stage and onwards.

Thereafter as the proposal of establishment of AIIMS in the State of Tamil Nadu was just in initial stages, JICA authorities had shown keenness for considering the financing for this project. Accordingly, a proposal was sent to Department of Economic Affairs, to include the AIIMS, Madurai Project in the rolling plan of JICA vide proposal dated 18-9-2018. The same was included in the rolling plan and the process started. The loan agreement with JICA for the project of establishment of AIIMS in Madurai, Tamil Nadu was signed on 26-3-2021 by the Government of Japan and Government of India.

Union Cabinet had approved the establishment of new AIIMS at Thoppur in Madurai District at a cost of Rs 1264 Crore on 17.12.2018. However, 'In-principle' approval of the Cabinet was also sought for allowing escalation over and above the 20% ceiling, and for allowing time over run, in case of availing loan from JICA. The total revised cost of the project for establishment of the new AIIMS at Thoppur in Madurai District, Tamil Nadu is estimated at Rs. 1977.8 crore, with construction of additional Infectious disease block with equipment, furniture and an enlarged auditorium and classrooms.

Loans from private/international agency have not been utilized for any other AIIMS project. It is also clarified that no institute wise allocation of fund is done for PMSSY. Further, first we will spend from the combined allocation then the reimbursement would be claimed from JICA.”

3.5 While reviewing the progress of AIIMS, Dharbhanga, the Committee desired to know the reasons for the delay by the State Government in providing the encumbrance-free land for AIIMS, Darbhanga the details of steps/measures taken by the Ministry to negotiate with the State Government in this regard. To this, the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare made following submission :-

“The site identified by the State Government at Darbhanga was accepted for establishing the second new AIIMS in Bihar, subject to State Govt. fulfilling following commitment:

- i. Four-lane connectivity from Institute to NH-57 shall be provided by the State Govt.
- ii. Required railway over-bridge construction cost shall be borne by the State Govt.
- iii. 75 acres of encumbrance free land on one side would be made available by the State Govt in 6 months' time. The State Government will also make available the remaining side free of any encumbrances for which the State Government will share detailed timeline for handing over the rest of the encumbrance free land at the earliest.
- iv. Required 20 MW electricity shall be provided by the State Govt for full-fledged operationalization of AIIMS.

- v. Sufficient water supply shall be made available by the State Govt,
- vi. Cost of required sand filling on the site (around 3-4 ft) to bring the site at a level about 1.5 meters below the adjacent railway track level as per requirement, shall be borne by the State Govt.
- vii. Nearest functional bio-medical waste disposal plant, to be made available by the State Govt.
- viii. Proper sewage and effluent waste disposal facilities from the site to be made available by the State Govt. at operational stage of the AIIMS.
- ix. Removal of all hindrances from the site by the State Government, including making provision for dismantling of old buildings and to make encumbrance free land available.
- x. Necessary clearances from various State Govt Departments to be provided by the State Govt in a fast track single window mode.

However, State Govt. is yet to hand over the encumbrance free land for AIIMS, Darbhanga. Also, the confirmation of commitments on the part of State Govt. is awaited. The matter has been taken up with the State Government several times, including at the level of Chief Secretary, Bihar. The matter is being regularly pursued with the State Govt. for early handing over of the encumbrance free land and fulfilment of other commitments pending on the side of State Government. A meeting between Secretary MoHFW and Chief Secretary, Bihar was held through VC on 20th August, 2021 to expedite the matter. The State Government has committed to hand over land by end of December.”

3.6 The status of OPD and MBBS Classes in AIIMS at Deoghar, Guwahati, Rajkot and Jammu are as:

S.No.	AIIMS	MBBS	OPD
1	Deoghar	Started from August, 2019	Has been operationalized from Ayush Building.
2	Guwahati	Started from Jan, 2021	Yet to operationalize
3	Rajkot	Started from Jan, 2021	Yet to operationalize
4	Jammu	Started from Jan, 2021	Yet to operationalize

3.7 While completion of any AIIMS project takes 4 – 5 years, endeavour of the Government is to start services in a phased manner, starting with MBBS classes. The constraints faced in this regard are availability of space for running classes and hostel for students. To address such issues, temporary accommodation is identified. Help and co-operation of State Government is also taken for this purpose.

3.8 The Public Accounts Committee in their 134 Report had noted that the approval of six new AIIMS was obtained in March 2006 based on preliminary feasibility study instead of a comprehensive assessment of scope of work. The Committee noted that the area required in the initial proposal had been under estimated by approximately 37 percent and the green building norms and requirements in terms of Energy Conservation Building Code had not been catered for. Clarifying the above deficiencies, the Ministry submitted that the Expenditure Finance Committee considered the complete DPRs being prepared with inputs from experts and approved the estimates of the six new AIIMS, in September 2009. Moreover, there was no standardization for AIIMS to compare with at the time of inception of the project. Further, the requirement for equipment had also been under assessed thus cumulatively resulting in delay in final approval of the scheme till March 2010 holding up commencement of work on many packages. The Committee were aghast to note the shortcomings / deficiencies in planning of the scheme and therefore, recommended the Ministry / AIIMS to streamline the bottlenecks in planning and approval for the time execution of the future projects under the Scheme.

3.9 On being asked to state whether all the shortcomings pointed out as above have been rectified, the steps being taken for carrying out comprehensive assessment of scope of work for correct estimate of the land requirement as well as requirement of equipment, the Ministry has stated that :

“Instructions of the Committee has already been noted and the same is implemented in the newly AIIMS with regard to requirement of land as well as requirement of equipment.

These bottlenecks have been resolved and the process of conceptualization, execution and functionalisation cycle for setting up of new AIIMS has been streamlined. A check list and standard document have been prepared to monitor the processes since Budget Announcement to awarding of projects to Executing Agencies for initiation of works.

3.10 The following Table details the series of chronological steps envisaged for the setting up of any new AIIMS in the country:

Sl. No.	Chronological steps for establishment of new AIIMS
1.	Announcement in budget speech or any way by Finance Minister
2.	The State Govt. to be immediately asked to offer alternative sites. Check-list has been made for seeking detailed information about various alternative sites offered by the State Government to enable evaluation of the sites under "challenge method".
3.	Central Team Visit (constitution-JS/Dir./MS(Delhi)/Architecture/Officer with Engineering background to follow
4.	Report of the Central Team to be submitted to Ministry
5.	Sub-committee (JS(PMSSY)/JS(other division)/Architecture/Director) to be constituted to evaluate the report of Central Team.
6.	Evaluation of the report by the Site Selection Committee (Secretary-Chair/AS/JS/Member from Niti Aayog/(Dir. If needed). A standing Site Selection Committee has been constituted.
7.	Approval to be obtained from Hon'ble HFM on the final evaluation of the Selection Committee
8.	Standard conditions like provision of connecting road, electricity, water etc. besides other site specific requirement to be fulfilled by the State Government are incorporated in the site approval letter addressed to the State Government.
9.	A standard MoU format has been developed clearly bringing out responsibilities and commitments from the State Government.
10.	Selection of Executive Agency for pre-investment work.
11.	Preparation of PPR (Preliminary Project Report) by the Executive Agency. For this purpose, the physical infrastructure and facilities to be provided in such new AIIMS has been standardized. A standard list of medical equipments has also been prepared in consultation with domain experts.
12.	Expediting processes pertaining to EFC appraisal and Cabinet approval. With close coordination, coupled with sensitization of officers and staff in the PMSSY Division. It has been possible to complete the EFC appraisal and Cabinet approval within a period of 3-4 weeks and even lesser, in cases of several AIIMS.
16.	After Cabinet approval, Executive Agency for main work (consultancy fee ranging from 2-5%; generally @4%) is selected. For this purpose a panel of PSUs has been formed to simplify the process of selection of Executing Agency.

COURSE SYLLABUS AT AIIMS

3.11 With regard to the course syllabus at AIIMS, the Ministry informed the Committee that Undergraduate curricula was revised in 2019 and along with the revision of Graduate Medical Education Regulation, which was also revised at the same time, was notified / published and is available on NMC website. Since the pattern of revision of Undergraduate curricula has been changed to competency-based curricula, the MCI and thereafter NMC has held extensive training programmes for teaching Medical College teachers on various aspects of the revised curricula by holding two training programmes – Curricula implementation support programmes (CISP) I & II, to train the Medical College teachers in the changed curricula.

3.12 Further, to help the teachers, understand the intricacies of the new curricula, MCI/NMC through Academic Cell has prepared and published eight teaching modules which are available on the NMC website. All trainers and Medical college teachers (trainees) were provided handouts of guidance and PPTs of course content and all other relevant teaching learning content. MCI / NMC through Academic Cell has prepared through various Expert Groups competency-based guidelines for PG Medical Education teachers by preparing the following documents and uploading them on the NMC website:

- Diploma : 19 curricula
- MD : 30 curricula
- MS : 06 curricula
- DM : 15 curricula
- MCH : 07 curricula

3.13 Further, these curricula are undergoing periodic revisions and upgradations. With regard to skill-based exit assessment, under Section 15 of NMC Act 2019, there shall be a common final year Medical Examination (National Exit Test) for granting license to practice Medicine as medical practitioner and it is expected to conduct the exam from 2023. The National Exit Test will assess the competence acquired by the candidate during the training and internship.

3.14 When the Committee asked the Ministry to furnish details of the syllabus of MBBS Courses at different AIIMS and their approval thereof, the Ministry detailed as under :-

“AIIMS Bhopal

MBBS and all other Academic curriculum approved by the Standing Academic Committee is in place.

AIIMS Bhubaneswar

The syllabus of MBBS course of AIIMS, Bhubaneswar has been finalized and approved.

- a. The syllabus has been modified by experts from different subjects of the Institute in consultation with experts from other institutes of national repute. The curriculum is assessed by Board of studies, approved by the Standing Academic Committee/Academic Committee, and ratified by the Institute Governing Body.
- b. Feedback was taken from all stakeholder’s (students and teachers) about the existent curriculum being followed in AIIMS, Bhubaneswar. A 3-day workshop was conducted on Curriculum Development in 2017.

4th Standing Academic Committee recommended assessment of the revised MBBS curriculum and put it up in the next SAC meeting. Board of studies assessed the MBBS curriculum in February 2018 and was approved for implementation in the 5th Meeting of Academic Committee on 1st May 2018.

The revised curriculum has been ratified by the subsequent GB meeting of the Institute

AIIMS Jodhpur

- (a) MBBS Syllabus at AIIMS Jodhpur has been finalized and approved by first the Board of Studies of the departments, then discussed in Standing Academic Committee of the Institute.

Further it was approved by the Standing Academic Committee of the Institute and then ratified by the Governing Body/Institute Body of the Institute.

AIIMS Patna

- (a) Syllabus of MBBS Course has been finalized and approved by Standing Academic Committee at AIIMS Patna.
- (b) Standing Academic Committee of AIIMS Patna approves the syllabus of MBBS course which was further ratified by Instituted Body. Module of revision is allowed and has to be ratified by SAC.
- (c) Syllabus of AIIMS Patna got approved by Standing Academic Committee of AIIMS Patna in its 1st meeting dated 22.04.2014 which was further ratified by Institute Body in its 2nd meeting dated 19 September, 2016.

AIIMS Raipur

- (a) The new curriculum for MBBS course has been finalized and approved at AIIMS Raipur and implemented from MBBS 2019 batch onwards.
- (b) The Standing Academic Committee of AIIMS Raipur has approved the curriculum of MBBS Course and the same has also been ratified by Governing Body of the Institute. The revision in the curriculum may be done with due approval of Academic Committee of the AIIMS Raipur.
- (c) The new MBBS curriculum has been approved by the Academic Committee of AIIMS Raipur in its 4th meeting held on 11.03.2019.

AIIMS Rishikesh

As per provisions of All India Institute of Medical Sciences (AIIMS) Act, 1956, substituted by the All India Institute of Medical Sciences (Amendment) Act, 2012 (Act No. 37 of 2012), the Standing Academic Committee is constituted under the provision of section 10 of AIIMS Act.

AIIMS Rishikesh has prepared the curriculum of each courses being executed by Institute, which is approved by Standing Academic Committee of Institute.”

REQUESTS FROM STATES FOR SETTING UP OF AIIMS

3.15 During the cross examination, the Committee queried the Ministry if it has any proposal for setting up of new AIIMS in the states which presently neither have any AIIMS like institution nor any announcement in this regard has been made so far. On

this query of the Committee, the Secretary who deposed before the Committee made his submission as under:

“I come to the AIIMS in Kerala, Karnataka and Haryana, apart from the others that you mentioned, namely, Manipur, Mizoram, Nagaland. Keeping in view the cost benefit analysis, presently, apart from AIIMS Guwahati, the Government is not actively considering any other AIIMS in the North East. It is because the North East already has NEIGRIHMS in Shillong. It has RIPANS and RIMS also which are Central Government institutions. However, we are actively considering an AIIMS in Kerala, Karnataka and in Haryana. As Mr. Sharan pointed out, there are some land related issues. We have to take a view on it and then take it to the Ministry of Finance for their approval. Then, we would be starting these.”

3.16 Further, in one of its written replies, the Ministry further stated as under:-

“Government of India has plans to set up AIIMS in each state in a phased manner. This Ministry has requested Ministry of Finance to convey 'in-principle' approval for setting up of AIIMS in Kerala.”

3.17 When asked about the response of Ministry of Finance, the Committee have been apprised as under:-

“In response to this Ministry’s proposal to convey in-principle approval for setting up of AIIMS in Kerala, Ministry of Finance vide its OM No. 18(15)/PF-II/2019 dated 19.11.2020 has stated that since 15th Finance Commission Report is expected soon, it is requested to include the proposal in the next phase of PMSSY. The matter is again being taken up with Ministry of Finance for conveying their ‘In-Principle’ approval for establishment of a new AIIMS in the State of Kerala.”

CHAPTER – IV
OTHER ISSUES

The present chapter deals with several other issues of vital nature which are interlinked not only with the construction of AIIMS but also the progress as documented in the provisions of the AIIMS Act.

I. LAND ACQUISITION FOR NEW AIIMS

4.2 Land for setting up of AIIMS is required to be provided by the concerned State Government. Requirement of land for setting up of new AIIMS is about 200 acres. Details of land provided by State Government for different AIIMS is as under:

“

Sl..	State	AIIMS	Status of Land
1	Uttar Pradesh	Raebareli	Out of approximately 148 acre land identified for the project, 97 acre land handed over by State.
2	Andhra Pradesh	Guntur	Approximately 193 acre land identified for the project has been completely transferred by the State Government.
3	Maharashtra	Nagpur	Approximately 150 acre land identified for the project has been completely transferred by the State Government.
4	West Bengal	Kalyani	Approximately 179.82 acre land identified. Land completely transferred from State Government to Central Government.
5	Uttar Pradesh	Gorakhpur	Approximately 112 acre land identified for the project has been completely transferred by the State Government. However, the area was reduced to 92 Acre due to change in

			Master Plan by State Govt.
6	Punjab	Bathinda	Approximately 175 acre land identified for the project has been completely transferred by State Government.
7	Assam	Guwahati	Approximately 189 acre land identified for the project has been completely transferred by the State Government to Central Government.
8	Himachal Pradesh	Bilaspur	Approximately 247 acre land identified for the project has been completely transferred by the State Govt.
9	Tamil Nadu	Madurai	Approximately 222 acre land identified for the project has been completely transferred by the State Government.
10	Jammu	Pulwama	Approximately 226.84 acre land identified for the project has been completely transferred by the Sate Govt.
11	Kashmir	Awantipora	Out of 221 acre of land, 187 acre of land has been handed over for establishment of AIIMS. Balance 34 acres of land is likely to be made available by the State Govt in the near future.
12	Jharkhand	Deoghar	Approximately 236.92 acre land identified for the project has been completely transferred by the State Government.
13	Gujarat	Rajkot	Approximately 200 acre land identified for the project has been transferred by State Government.
14	Telangana	Bibinagar	Approximately 201 acre land identified for the project has been transferred by

			State Government.
15	Haryana	Manethi	Approximately 200 acre land was identified for the project but the site did not get FCA clearance. State Govt. is yet to offer alternate site.
16	Bihar	Darbhanga	Approximately 200.02 acre land identified for the project, is yet to be handed over by the State Govt.

From the above table, it is evident that land site for AIIMS Darbhanga has not been received yet.”

4.3 In this regard, the Committee queried the Ministry the reasons for the delay in handling ever of encumbrance free land site for two projects of establishment of new AIIMS, one at Darbhanga in Bihar and the other at Manethi in Haryana. To this query of the Committee, the Ministry furnished its reply as under :-

AIIMS at Darbhanga in Bihar

“The site offered by the State Govt. for AIIMS at Darbhanga is low lying. Further, at the site there are some buildings like water tank, power station, post office, BSNL yard & office and Police Stations. The site of AIIMS, Darbhanga was finalized subject to certain conditions to be fulfilled by the State Government. These conditions inter alia related to completion of pre-construction activities by the State Govt., such as making the site free of all encroachments and land filling of the site & meeting its expenditure, besides proper road connectivity of the site of the institute to NH 57 and adequate water supply, among others. These conditions were communicated to the State Govt. vide letter of even no. dated 08.01.2020 and also after approval of the project by the Union Cabinet, vide letter dated 15.10.2020, requesting the State Govt. to take necessary action on priority in respect of all commitments. Though the matter has been regularly followed up with the Govt. of Bihar, there has been delay in fulfillment of commitments by the State Government. To expedite the matter, a meeting between Secretary (HFW) and Chief Secretary, Govt. of Bihar was also held on 20.8.2021, during which, it was assured by Chief Secretary, Govt. of Bihar that 75 acres of encumbrance free land, with land filling completed, will be handed over to Government of India by 15th Dec, 2021 and the remaining 125 acres of encumbrance free land, with existing buildings demolished, will be handed over to Government of India by end of Dec, 2021. The process for appointment of Executing Agency for execution of the project will be

undertaken immediately after encumbrance free land is made available by the State Government.

AIIMS at Manethi in Haryana

Setting up of AIIMS in Manethi, Haryana was approved by Union Cabinet on 28.02.2019 at a cost of Rs 1299 Crore. However forest clearance for construction of AIIMS at the identified site could not be obtained by the State Govt. Subsequently, in a meeting held in the Cabinet Secretariat on 25-9-2020, it was informed by the State Government representative that an alternate land parcel measuring approx 175.85 acre in a village adjoining Manethi has been identified and the process for consent purchase of this land has been initiated. It was clarified that cost of land acquisition will be borne by Haryana Government. Additional Deputy Commissioner, Rewari, informed that an additional adjacent land of about 25 acre is also planned to be taken over so as to meet the total land requirement of 200 acres. The matter is being regularly pursued with the State Govt. at various levels including at the level of the Chief Secretary, Govt. of Haryana.”

4.4 Further, while deposing before the Committee one of the representatives submitted as under :-

“With regard to the land issue, as I said, land is to be provided by the State Government. All the clearances are also to be obtained by the State Government. So far as going to the Cabinet for setting up of any AIIMS is concerned, we go to the Cabinet only after the land has been identified.

....The land is offered by the State Government. It is technically examined, by a team sent by the Central Government, in terms of size of the land, whether it is one parcel of land or divided into different parcels, is it a low-lying area, and is it encumbrance free. These things are seen by a technical committee, which goes there, and finally there is a selection committee. If the State offers options, there are more than one site, the selection committee takes a decision on that. The offer is made by the State Government and the decision is taken by the Central Government.”

II RECRUITMENT

4.5 At AIIMS, recruitment to various positions is done on need basis keeping in view the range of additional services and facilities planned to be added in the hospitals. The incumbency position at various AIIMS is monitored regularly and vacancies are advertised from time to time depending on their requirement. However, as high

standards have to be maintained in selection, keeping in view the stature of these Institutes of National Importance, all the advertised positions do not get filled up.

4.6 The Ministry while giving presentation during one of the Sitting of the Committee submitted the following information in respect to status of posts created and filled in six functional AIIMS:-

SL.	AIIMS	No. of Posts Created			No. of Posts filled up (Regular + Contractual)		
		Project Cell Posts	Faculty Posts	Non-Faculty Posts	Project Cell Posts	Faculty Posts	Non-Faculty Posts
1	Bhopal	8	305	3776	6	209	1584
2	Bhubaneswar	8	305	3776	6	189*	1663**
3	Jodhpur	8	305	3776	5	219	2106
4	Patna	8	305	3776	4	134	1394
5	Raipur	8	305	3776	5	160	2423
6	Rishikesh	8	305	3776	6	225	2974

* Excluding 05 posts filled on contract basis.

** Including 20 posts on deputation, excluding 78 posts on contractual basis and 704 posts on outsource basis

(i) The present position of sanctioned, filled up and vacant post of faculty and non-faculty is given below:

Faculty and Non-faculty strength of first six AIIMS

S.No.	AIIMS	Faculty strength			
		Sanctioned posts	Filled up	% filled up	Vacant
1	Bhopal	305	209	68.5%	96

2	Bhubaneswar	305	189*	62.0%	116
3	Jodhpur	305	219	71.8%	86
4	Patna	305	134	43.9%	171
5	Raipur	305	160	52.5%	145
6	Rishikesh	305	225	73.8%	80
Total		1830	1136	62.1%	694

* Excluding 02 posts filled on contract basis.

S.No.	AIIMS	Non Faculty strength			
		Sanctioned posts	Filled up	% filled up	Vacant
1	Bhopal	3776	1584	41.9%	2192
2	Bhubaneswar**	3776	1663**	44.0%	2113
3	Jodhpur	3776	2106	55.8%	1670
4	Patna	3776	1394	36.9%	2382
5	Raipur	3776	2423	64.2%	1353
6	Rishikesh	3776	2974	78.8%	802
Total		22656	12144	53.6%	10512

** Including 20 posts on deputation, excluding 78 posts on contractual basis and 704 posts on outsource basis.”

4.7 The Committee noted that there exists huge gap between post sanctioned and post filled up. The Ministry informed the Committee that following steps have been taken to fill up the vacant posts at different AIIMS: -

“

- To facilitate expeditious filling up of vacancies, Standing Selection Committee (SSC) has been constituted for each of the aforesaid six AIIMS.
- The upper age limit for direct recruitment against the posts of Professor and Additional Professor in the six AIIMS has been raised from 50 years to 58 years.

- Filling up of vacant Faculty posts in the new AIIMS by taking serving Faculty from Government Medical Colleges/Institutes on deputation basis has also been allowed.
- Contractual engagement of retired Faculty of Government Medical Colleges/Institutes up to 70 years of age has also been allowed to meet the shortage of Faculty in the six new AIIMS. Walk-in-interview for engagement of Faculty on contract basis has also been allowed as a stop gap arrangement.
- Visiting Faculty scheme in new AIIMS has been formulated to allow national and international faculty to work in new AIIMS for teaching and academic purposes.
- Down-gradating of the posts of Additional/Associate professor to the level of Assistant Professor has been allowed for a fixed period by the AIIMS with the approval of their respective Governing Body.
- Temporary diversion has been allowed on loan basis for faculty which may be filled up on "contractual appointment" while keeping in mind the HR provisions in the standard stalling pattern.
- Relaxation of one year for Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribes has been allowed as per Rules/ Guidelines issued by DoP&T.
- Running advertisement with one-year validity have been allowed to expedite the recruitment of faculty after which fresh running or normal advertisement to be issued again depending upon faculty strength. In the one year Running Advertisement, short advertisement or web site notices may be issued several times as may be required, depending upon actual progress of recruitment, with clear mention of cut off dates for submission of application and eligibility, each time.
- It has been decided that AIIMS, New Delhi is to conduct centralized recruitment process for nursing cadre for all the AIIMS. AIIMS, New Delhi is to conduct entrance examination for PG courses for all the AIIMS as well. In addition, it has also been decided to adopt the RRs for various posts of AIIMS, New Delhi for new AIIMS as well which will bring uniformity across all the AIIMS.”

4.8 On being asked to provide the criteria applied for recruitment of Directors of AIIMS along with the age limit set for the said post, the Ministry submitted as under:

“This Ministry last appointed the Directors for AIIMS Mangalagiri, Nagpur and Kalyani. The Search cum Selection Committee (SCSC) constituted with the approval of Hon HFM and DoPT carefully assessed the

respective merits, academic credentials, publications, research contributions, and the Standing in the field of Medical Sciences of the candidates and on the basis of the information furnished in the respective applications, unanimously recommended the panel of names in order of merit for appointment to the post of Director, AIIMS Mangalagiri, Director, AIIMS Nagpur and Director, AIIMS Kalyani. The panel so recommended by the SCSC was sent to DoPT for obtaining the approval of ACC. ACC approved the name of one candidate from each panel.

As per the AIIMS Act, the tenure of Director is 5 years or till the age of 65 years, whichever is earlier.

In case of Executive Director, the education qualification, experience is the same as that of Director. However, his tenure will be for a period of three years which can be extended upto 5 years or upto the age of 70 years, whichever is earlier.”

4.9 During one of the evidences, the Committee desired to know the reasons which distributed different status quo to the AIIMS, New Delhi apart from six new different AIIMS. The Committee further pinpointed that part from AIIMS, New Delhi, six other new AIIMS were headed by Executive Director leading to differentiation to the part of the Supervisory Authority. To this, the Secretary, Ministry of Health and Welfare who deposed before the Committee replied as under :-

“आप अवगत हैं कि भारत में जो आईआईएम्स हैं, उन प्रत्येक आई.आई.एम. के लिए कोई अलग से एक्ट या कानून नहीं है। आप इससे भी अवगत हैं कि ‘एम्स नई दिल्ली’ एक सेपरेट एक्ट के तहत स्थापित संस्थान है और जो क्षेत्रीय एम्स हैं, उनकी स्थापना और व्यवस्था के लिए अलग से व्यवस्था है। संभवतः जब कैबिनेट के पास यह मामला गया होगा तो यह कारण रहा होगा कि तब दो विभिन्न प्रकार की सर्विस की टर्म्स एंड कंडीशन्स हों, लेकिन हम पुनः इसके कागजात देखकर आपके समक्ष प्रस्तुत होंगे। सर, मोटी बात यह है कि आप इससे अवगत हैं कि ‘एम्स नई दिल्ली’ एक अलग कानून के तहत स्थापित किया गया है और बाद में जो रीजनल एम्स बने हैं, उनके लिए अलग व्यवस्था है। उनके लिए अलग से कैबिनेट का अप्रूवल लिया गया था।

सर, जहां तक 65 वर्ष से ऊपर की आयु के लोगों को एग्जीक्यूटिव डायरेक्टर के रूप में विभिन्न क्षेत्रीय एम्स में लेने की व्यवस्था है तो आप इससे भी अवगत हैं कि क्षेत्रीय एम्स की जो संकल्पना है, वह वर्ष 2000 में की गई थी और उस समय ‘प्रधानमंत्री स्वास्थ्य सुरक्षा योजना’ नहीं बनी थी। उस समय तत्कालीन प्रधानमंत्री माननीय अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी जी के समय 6 एम्स की संकल्पना की गई थी। वे 6 एम्स ऋषिकेश, भोपाल, जोधपुर, पटना और रायपुर में बनाए गए थे। उस समय यह पाया गया था कि जिस तरह की क्वालीफिकेशन रखी गई थी, उससे निदेशक आसानी से विज्ञापन करने पर उपलब्ध हो जाते थे, लेकिन बाद में जब इन 6 एम्स की संख्या बढ़कर 21 हो गई तो मंत्रालय ने यह पाया और यह मंत्रालय के पुराने कागजातों में दर्ज भी है कि आसानी से निदेशक के पद

पर उपयुक्त संख्या में उम्मीदवार उपलब्ध नहीं हुए। ऐसी स्थिति में यह सोचा गया कि अगर एक अन्य पद सृजित किया जाए, जिसको एग्जीक्यूटिव डायरेक्टर या कार्यकारी निदेशक कहा जाए और उसके लिए 70 वर्ष की आयु सीमा रखी जाए तो संभवतः हमें रिटायर्ड डॉक्टर्स उपलब्ध होंगे। सर, केवल एग्जीक्यूटिव डायरेक्टर पद के लिए 70 वर्ष की सीमा रखी गई थी। अभी निदेशक के पद पर जो लोग आते हैं, उनके लिए 65 वर्ष की ही समय सीमा है। एग्जीक्यूटिव डायरेक्टर, जिसका बकायदा विज्ञापन होता है, उसमें 70 वर्ष की समय सीमा है।

4.10 During one of the evidences, the Committee took note of the fact that recruitment process has not been streamlined and commented as under:-

“आपने रिप्लाई में पेज नम्बर-17 में कहा है कि सुपर स्पेशियलिटी के पोस्ट्स क्यों खाली हैं, तो आपने उत्तर दिया कि बहुत कम उम्मीदवार पास होते हैं, इसलिए ये पोस्ट्स खाली हैं। अभी एम्स पीजी का जो पेपर हुआ है, उसमें भी एम्स की सारी जगह सुपर स्पेशियलिटी के पोस्ट्स खाली रखे हैं। आपका सिस्टम नीट पीजी से अलग है, आप इंटरव्यू भी लेते हैं और आपने उतने ही उम्मीदवार सिलेक्ट किए, जिससे कि एम्स दिल्ली की पोस्ट भरी जा सकें। आप एक तरफ कह रहे हैं कि सुपर स्पेशियलिटी के लिए उम्मीदवार नहीं मिलते हैं और हर साल आप छह एम्स में सुपर स्पेशियलिटी की 25 से 30 सीट लूज करते हैं। पटना में देखें, तो केवल दो पोस्ट ही भरी गई हैं। जैसे नीट पीजी में मार्क्स बेसिज पर एडमिशन होता है, आप भी वैसे ही कीजिए। हमें आज मालूम हुआ कि एम्स, दिल्ली दूसरे सभी एम्स से अलग है और एम्स, दिल्ली वाले इंटरव्यू लेते हैं और अपने यहां के बच्चों को सिलेक्ट करते हैं और बाकी जगह सीट खाली रहती हैं। आज समझ में आया कि वे क्यों चिंता नहीं करते हैं। पिछले तीन सालों से यही हो रहा है कि सुपर स्पेशियलिटी की सीट्स खाली रह रही हैं। ज्यादा ऑपरेशन्स वही करते हैं जो एमसीएच कर रहे हैं या डीएम कर रहे हैं। आप इस व्यवस्था को ठीक कीजिए। आप एम्स की कंसल्टेटिव कमेटी में भी थे। मनसुख मांडविया जी ने भी हमें उस समय आश्वासन दिया था कि हम कोई भी सीट खाली नहीं छोड़ेंगे। फिर भी आपने एम्स की सुपर स्पेशियलिटी की सारी सीट्स खाली छोड़ दी हैं।”

4.11 To this query of the Committee, the Secretary, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare submitted as under :-

“About EWS quota, super specialty vacant positions and using the NEET PG test, we will get back to you after doing a review at our level. The fact that certain vacant positions in AIIMS Patna have not been advertised, we have noted it down. We will be talking to Dr. Singh, the Director there as well as to Dr. Arora, the President of the Institute. We will ensure that no selective advertisement of vacancies is done. It is because we have permitted all AIIMS to have a revolving advertisement. It basically means that once you have advertised a position, then that has no deadline. People can apply if they think that they are qualified for that job.”

III IRREGULARITIES AT AIIMS PATNA

4.12 The Governing body of Patna AIIMS in its meeting held in the year 2012 had found some irregularities in appointment in various faculty posts. Updating the status of the enquiry and action taken against the appointee, the Ministry informed that the report of the High Level Committee was placed before the IB, GB of AIIMS Patna. The GB in its 3rd meeting dated 18.02.2021 vide agenda no. 3/11 decided the following:

“

- (a) GB accepted the recommendations of the High Level Committee and the recommendations of committee constituted by the President of the Institute.
- (b) After accepting the recommendations of both committees, it was transpired that there was no irregularity in appointment of Faculty except for three cases viz. Dr. A.K. Saxena, Dr. Sushmita Das and Dr. Alok Ranjan.
- (c) GB directed AIIMS Patna to initiate process of termination of services of these three Faculty members.

Accordingly, a charge sheet dated- 26.05.2021 has been issued to the three faculty members whose appointment was found irregular by the Governing Body. Reply from them has been received. IO/PO is being appointed for further necessary action.”

4.13 In view of the submissions made by the Ministry, the Committee remarked as under:

“So, autonomy means independence. Autonomy does not mean monarchy. Things are happening like a monarchical system in AIIMS. I will give you an example. The contractual people who are in AIIMS Patna for seven years, they were working efficiently. You can remove them but they should be removed by a permanent staff. If you want to remove contractual people, it is fine. But how can you remove contractual people with another contract person? How can we say that we are going to build 23 AIIMS with all these corrupt things? I mean it is complete anarchy. I am seeing the AIIMS Patna. They intentionally did it.”

4.14 The Secretary assured the Committee as under :-

“There was the issue regarding irregular appointment of faculty in AIIMS Patna. We have taken this very seriously because you had raised it multiple times. Within the Ministry, we are following it on a weekly basis. We have decided that after those inquiry officer and other officers have been appointed to take action against the three faculty members whose

appointments were found to be irregular, we will conclude this transaction in the next two months and ensure that appropriate action is taken. It is because now whatever approvals had to be taken have been taken of the institute body, of the governing body, appointment of conducting officers, and other issues.”

IV MEDICAL EDUCATION

4.15 SARAL is a MODULE based online platform developed by AIIMS, New Delhi. It allows faculty to upload educational content related to their lectures for students to access. Students can also post queries and discussions on the platform. It also maintains student records and enables them to upload their applications, protocols and theses etc. to minimize paperwork. It is currently operational in AIIMS, New Delhi. In addition to SARAL, AIIMS, New Delhi has used online meeting platforms such as Google Meet, JITSI and GoTo Meeting for conducting classes. Other AIIMS are also being using platforms such as Zoom or Webex for disseminating teaching content.

4.16 E-learning course has been designed for training large number of doctors all over India and would be launched soon by AIIMS, New Delhi to prepare them for a possible third wave. Hosted several webinars through its YouTube channel which has over 50,000 subscribers and these had over 4 lakh views. AIIMS, New Delhi also hosted COE Training programs for various regional centers on Covid related issues and for training various state doctors on Covid-19. More recently Covid preparedness for pediatric cases was also hosted with a very wide viewership

4.17 During one of the evidences, the Committee took note of the fact that an amount of Rs 39,000 crore would be spent on the infrastructure at different AIIMS and hence remarked as under:

“Why are we ready to spend Rs. 39,000 crore for buildings? Why do we not spend Rs. 50 crore to make a web portal where all quality teachers are available? No other AIIMS have got the knowhow to train their Grade-IV employees as well as Grade-III employees. It is specific to AIIMS, New Delhi. There are so many new medical colleges which are coming up. The students now are not getting the kind of education which we used to get. I do not remember exactly but there was a lady who came to me one year back that AIIMS

is making a web portal for educating the students. With the help of AIIMS, you make a small institution where you invite professors of different AIIMS or different medical colleges who can teach on the subject properly. Students have got two facilities. They can be taught by the teachers and can also get the quality education. So, my first request will be that this SARAL idea is very good. It should be implemented for each and every medical college and let us make one more institution where we can give web teaching to all the other AIIMS institutions.

V PATIENT BED RATIO

4.18 The total number of beds functional at six new AIIMS turned out to be just 5602 in number as against envisaged strength of 5760 (where 960 beds per AIIMS). During the cross examination, the Ministry informed the Committee that the number of OPD patients for the year 2020-21 stood out at the figure of 1589443 as against IPD patients number of 142725. The total surgeries carried out were 123258 for the financial year 2020-21. Further, the Ministry submitted following data on sanctioned bed strength (up to 13.04.2021) at AIIMS, New Delhi:

“

Hospital / Centre	Hospital				Total Bed Strength
	General Beds (including day care)		Private Wards		
	928 (general beds)	69 (Day Care)	Old = 60	New = 105	
Main Hospital	997		165		1162
Cardio-Thoracic Centre	226		33		259
Neuro Science Centre	174		31		205
Dr. R.P. Centre	288		22		310
Dr. BRAICH	167		15		182
NDDTC (GHAZIABAD)	50		00		50

CCM (BALLABGARH)	50	00	50
JPNA TRAUMA CENTRE	226	22	248
C.D.E.R.	20	00	20
GRAND TOTAL	2198	288	2486

4.19 Commenting on the long waiting list of surgeries in AIIMS, New Delhi, during one of the evidences, the Committee remarked as under:

“मैं सर्जरी के विषय में कहना चाहता हूँ कि हमारे पास ज्यादातर सिफारिशें सर्जरी की डेट लेने के लिए आती हैं। लोग सर्जरी के लिए दो महीने, चार महीने, छह महीने और यहां तक कि एक या दो साल बाद की डेट लेकर भी आते हैं, यह कुछ हद तक हास्यास्पद प्रतीत होता है। आपने स्वयं स्वीकार किया है कि आपकी ओपीडी की बहुत क्षमता है। सरकार ने स्वास्थ्य के क्षेत्र में बहुत काम किया है। आयुष्मान योजना के तहत भी लोगों को स्वास्थ्य लाभ मिल रहा है। कई ऐसे छोटे आपरेशन्स हैं, जो किसी छोटे प्राइवेट अस्पताल में हो सकते हैं, लेकिन फिर भी लोग विश्वास के कारण एम्स में कराना चाहते हैं। मेरा कहना है कि क्या कोई ऐसा फार्मूला बनाया जा सकता है कि जिन आपरेशन्स की इतनी लम्बी डेट मिली है, वह आस-पास के दूसरे अस्पतालों में जल्द किया जा सके, क्योंकि पैसा तो सरकार को ही खर्च करना है चाहे वह एम्स में हो या किसी अन्य योजना के तहत सरकारी अस्पताल में हो। हमारी सरकार में स्वास्थ्य के लिए पैसे की कमी नहीं है।“

VI RESEARCH PROJECTS

4.20 At AIIMS, research funding sources for the faculty and scientists have been predominantly extramural. However last 4 years, AIIMS has started various intramural schemes so as to encourage research and especially provide seed money to young faculty and young researchers for facilitating research.

4.21 Similarly, AIIMS also initiated various intramural project schemes to initiate research for COVID-19, Long COVID and mucormycosis.

4.22 Table below details the breakup of total research funding based on source of funding.

Extramural Funding for the following schemes from 01.04.2020 to 31.03.2021

Funding Agency	Number of Projects	Grant received (Rs.)
Department of Science and Technology, GOI	133	15,75,31,521
Department of Biotechnology, GOI	101	17,63,73,400
Indian Council of Medical Research, GOI 315	315	55,42,45,840
Other funding agencies	329	66,29,48,222
TOTAL	878	1,55,10,98,983

4.23 The Intramural Funding for the following schemes from 01.04.2020 to 31.03.2021 is as under:

S. No.	Scheme	No. of Projects awarded	Amount awarded in Rs.
1.	Early Career Intramural Research Project	166	5,54,96,329
2.	AIIMS-Collaborative	15	1,95,47,000
3.	AIIMS-IITD Collaborative Projects	45	3,43,62,284
4.	AIIMS-THSTI Collaborative Projects	08	59,54,000
5.	AIIMS-UCL, London	08	34,69,440
6.	Undergraduate Mentorship Scheme	24	42,74,790

4.24 The under-mentioned table outlays the details of receipts and expenditure of Research Section, AIIMS together with the details of actual disbursements made for the last three consecutive financial years:

Details of Receipt received from the following sources

Sl. No.	Expenditure	Actual 2018-19 Rs. in Lakh	Actual 2019-20 Rs. in Lakh	Actual 2020-21 Rs. in Lakh
1	Own Sources	56669089	61047861	92333524
2	Central/State Governments	1020932683	1180066668	1229137799

3	Foreign agencies	25930154.6	348594029.7	269649877
4	Private/Corporate	59206647.68	58162195.19	52311307

Sl. No.	Expenditure	Actual 2018-19 Rs. in Lakh	Actual 2019-20 Rs. in Lakh	Actual 2020-21 Rs. in Lakh
1	Recurring	1028336000	1294447165	1111386524
2	Non-Recurring	79379966	15416484	106737866
	Total Expenditure (1+2)	1107715966	1448611449	1218124390

4.25 From the above tables of Receipts, it is evident that the actual receipts for the year 2018-19 from all the available sources amount to Rs 1,162,738,574.28 lakh where as the actual expenditure for the same window period stands out to be Rs 1107715966 lakh thereby indicating a difference of Rs 55,022,608.28 lakh. For the years 2019-20 and 2020-21, the actual cumulative receipts amount to Rs 1647870753.89 lakh and Rs 1643432507 lakh respectively, in contrast to actual expenditure on research for the years 2019-20 and 2020-21 are of Rs 1448611449 lakh and Rs 1218124390 lakh respectively. This is indicative of the fact that for the last three consecutive financial years, Research Unit has not been able to utilize the entire receipts available from sources like foreign agencies, central/state Governments, Private/corporate and even own sources.

PART-II
OBSERVATIONS/RECOMMENDATIONS

1. An Overview

The Committee note that with the dual objective of correcting regional imbalances in the availability of affordable healthcare services and improving the quality of medical education in India, Pradhan Mantri Swasthya Suraksha Yojana (PMSSY) was announced in the year 2003. Under this Scheme 22 new AIIMS have been sanctioned. This include establishment of six AIIMS, one each at Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna, Raipur and Rishikesh in the first phase and the remaining 16 AIIMS have been added from the year 2009 onwards. Six of the approved AIIMS in the first phase are functional and remaining 16 new AIIMS are in various stages of construction. The Committee note that there is a combined allocation of funds for all the new AIIMS under PMSSY.

One of the major constraints identified in the setting up of new AIIMS was availability of land site. In case of AIIMS Dharbhanga, Madurai and Manethi, the project has surpassed the timelines and would get completed on revised date of completion and Project Management Consultant (PMC) have not been appointed for AIIMS in three States viz. Haryana, Tamil Nadu and Bihar. In AIIMS Mangalgiri in Andhra Pradesh, initially there was some delay due to non-availability of sand for construction work. There was also some delay in completion of activities to be undertaken by the State Government which included arrangement of water supply, storm water disposal drain, main approach road to campus and shifting of existing NDRF Campus and COVID -19 pandemic also affected the progress of work. The Committee note that some States have been sending requests to the Ministry for the proposal of setting up of AIIMS in States where till date neither any AIIMS has seen light of the day nor any announcement has been made so far. The Committee note that at AIIMS, New Delhi there are 31 Specialties and 20 Super Specialties where teaching, learning of MD, MS, DM, MCH as well as patient

care services are done. However, in other AIIMS only 17 Super Specialties and 18 Specialties have been sanctioned.

The examination of the progress of all AIIMS by the Committee and their observations/recommendations on the issues relating to urgent need for providing encumbrance free land for setting up of new AIIMS, expediting the recruitment process, minimising the gap between authorized and sanctioned bed strength, ensuring the same status of new AIIMS like that of AIIMS, New Delhi, need for providing quality medical education and services in new AIIMS and periodic review of the progress of AIIMS. These are detailed in the succeeding paragraphs.

2. Need for bringing parity in the status of all new AIIMS

On the issue of differences between the status of AIIMS, New Delhi and other six new AIIMS, the Committee are informed that for years of their operation, these AIIMS remained outside the ambit of AIIMS Act and were governed by a Central Apex Society, therefore, some of the features of these AIIMS are different from AIIMS, New Delhi. For example, AIIMS, New Delhi, some departments have been delegated greater financial and administrative powers in different centers and have their own administrative and procurement officers like Rajendra Prasad Centre for Ophthalmology, Cardio & Neuro Centre, National Cancer Institute. This is not the case with other AIIMS. In AIIMS, New Delhi there is a Director and Medical Superintendent, and a centralized structure is there while in other AIIMS there are Executive Director and Head of Departments. In AIIMS, New Delhi, over the years, there are now 31 Specialties and 20 Super Specialties. Here teaching, learning of MD, MS, DM, MCH and patient care services are done. However, in the new upcoming AIIMS, there are 17 Super Specialties and 18 Specialties. AIIMS, New Delhi conducts Bachelors Programme (UG course) for five Para Medical Sciences and nine M.Sc. courses which is not the case with most other AIIMS. AIIMS, New Delhi also runs 33 one-year Fellowship Courses in various Specialities which is not the case with other AIIMS. AIIMS, New Delhi usually follows a time period of a month for applications to be received in respect of

advertisements for vacant faculty positions whereas in other AIIMS, there is a system of rolling or running advertisements with one-year validity.

The Committee strongly feel that when all the new AIIMS are being governed by the AIIMS Act 1956 as amended in the year 2012, there should not be any differences in terms of delegated financial and administrative powers for procurement of equipment and in terms of having specialties and super specialties teaching in AIIMS, New Delhi and other AIIMS. If the differences will be continuing, people will continue to rush to AIIMS, New Delhi instead of going to other AIIMS. As a result the objective of PMSSY Scheme for correcting regional imbalances in the availability of affordable/reliable territory healthcare services will remain a distant dream. Therefore, the Committee strongly recommend that the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare should take necessary measures to treat all the AIIMS at par with AIIMS, New Delhi.

3. Need for parity in the post of Director across all AIIMS

The Committee are surprised to note that except for AIIMS, New Delhi which is headed by Director (with the age limit of 65) while other new 16 AIIMS are being headed by Executive Director (with the age limit of 70) who is in-charge of the institution as a whole.

The Committee are informed by the representatives of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare during oral deposition as well as in their written replies that Pradhan Mantry Swasthya Suraksha Yojana (PMSSY), was announced on 15th August, 2003 to establish six new hospitals with modern facilities like those available at AIIMS, New Delhi. In pursuance of this announcement, a proposal was taken to the Expenditure Finance Committee (EFC) in November 2004. The EFC approved the setting up of six AIIMS-like apex healthcare institutes in the States of Bihar at Patna, Chhattisgarh at Raipur, Madhya Pradesh at Bhopal, Odisha at Bhubaneswar, Rajasthan at Jodhpur, and Uttarakhand at Rishikesh. The EFC also approved formation of a Central Apex Society under societies

Registration Act, with the responsibility for establishing and running these six AIIMS-like institutions. After obtaining the approval of the EFC, a proposal was taken to the Cabinet Committee on Economic Affairs in March 2006 and CCEA approved six AIIMS-like institutions as well as formation of a Central Apex Society, for establishing and running these institutions. While approving the Revised Cost Estimates (RCE), because of cost escalation, a proposal was taken again to the Cabinet in February 2010. While approving the RCE, the Cabinet also underline the role of the Central Apex Society in establishing and running these six AIIMS-like institutions. Therefore, from 2006 to September 2012, these AIIMS-like institutions were not part of the AIIMS Act and existed outside it, governed by a Central Apex Society. In September 2012, there was an amendment in the AIIMS Act, which was notified. This amendment incorporated these new AIIMS-like institutions in Section 27 (a) of the Act and provided that all provisions of the Act shall apply to these institutions also. Once a decision was taken in September 2012 to make these six AIIMS as part of the amended AIIMS Act, the Central Apex Society ceased to exist.

The Committee note that Article 11 of AIIMS Act provides that there shall be a Chief Executive Officer (CEO) of the Institute who shall be designated as the Director of the Institute. Section 31 of AIIMS Regulations, 2019 further provides in this regard that the Director shall have a term of five years from the date of assumption of charge of the post or till he attains the age of sixty five years, whichever is earlier.

In the meanwhile, with the aim of expeditious operationalization and to attract reputed faculty from AIIMS, New Delhi and other Institutes of National Importance (INIs), as well as other premier Institutions, to head new and upcoming AIIMS, it was a policy decision, decided in November 2018 with the approval of Department of Expenditure and Hon'ble Minister for Health & Family Welfare to have a post of Executive Director (ED) to operate on either / or basis with the post of Director, who will act as CEO of the Institute. CIB had approved two designations for new AIIMS. One is Director where the provision of 65 years

remains as stipulated in the Act and the other nomenclature is 'Executive Director' where the provision of 70 years.

On being asked to clarify whether there is an enabling provision in the Act to empower the Government to take such decision, the Committee are informed that Section 11(4) of the Act says, "Subject to such rules as may be made by Central Government in this behalf, the Institute may appoint such number of other officers and employees as may be necessary for the exercise of its powers and discharge of its functions and may determine the designation and grades of such officers and employees."

The Committee strongly feel that other officers and employees cannot be above the Director. The Secretary Ministry of Health in his candid submission before the Committee has stated that the Act does not make a reference to Executive Director.

The Committee note that the Act does not make a reference to Executive Director and the decision has been taken after taking the consent of CIB as well as the consent of Hon'ble Minister for Health & Family Welfare and the Ministry of Finance and Department of Expenditure with the aim of expeditious operationalization of the new AIIMS and to attract reputed faculty from AIIMS, New Delhi and other Institutes of National Importance (INIs), as well as other premier Institutions, to head new and upcoming AIIMS. The Committee acknowledge the urgency of the decision taken at the highest level at the time of setting up of new AIIMS but at the same time wish to emphasize that since 17 years has been completed after the approval of EFC for setting up of new AIIMS and the Ministry have enough experience, now they must strictly follow the provision of the Act for appointment of Director in each new AIIMS instead of appointment of Executive Director to head the new AIIMS. Further, when in any Institute of national importance in India including AIIMS, New Delhi, there is no provision of appointing any person for heading administrative posts above 65 years of age, the Committee wish to reemphasize that the provision of the Act of

Parliament should be maintained across all AIIMS and there should not be any scope of difference among them. The Committee would like to see AIIMS as an epitome of medical excellence which shall only be possible with experienced talents coupled with physical viability; which does not seem viable with an age limit of 70 years.

The Committee strongly feel that the Ministry should not overlook the fresh talent and the career opportunities of the existing professors for the appointment to the post of Director in new AIIMS. Henceforth, the Committee strongly recommend that the Ministry of Health and Family welfare to take all measures not to make any compromises in the qualities of new AIIMS and to ensure the objective of the PMSSY i.e. to augment quality medical education in the country and strictly adhered to the provision of the AIIMS Act.

4. Need for ensuring adequate Beds.

The Committee note that at each six new functional AIIMS viz. Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna, Raipur and Rishikesh, the envisaged bed capacity was 960 beds respectively. The total sanctioned bed strength of functional AIIMS comes to 5760. Against this till date only 5602 beds were found to be operational in all AIIMS. The remaining 158 beds will be available after the availability of Specialist and Super Specialists. Further, the Committee observe that AIIMS Bhubaneswar had sent three proposals to open one Cardio Centre, Neuro Centre and Cancer Centre. At present there are only 20 beds in this Centre. The minimum requirements for each centre 100 to 150 beds. At present there is no action on these proposals. As people in the eastern part of India chew betel leaves, the cases oral cancer/dental patients are rising. Therefore, there is an urgent need to open a dental centre in AIIMS Bhubaneswar. The Committee observe that from the year 2018-19 to 2020-21 there is less expenditure against the effective release by the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare. During the year 2018-19 against the release of Rs. 300.98 crore the expenditure was Rs. 288.29 crore. During the year 2019-20 the expenditure was Rs. 401.84 crore against the release of Rs. 416.69 crore. During the year 2020-21 the expenditure

was Rs. 450.88 crore against the release of Rs. 477.85 crore. During the year 2021-22 the expenditure is Rs. 75.57 crore against the release of Rs. 181.98 crore. The Committee deplore the underutilization of scarce budgetary resources, slow progress of opening up of many centres in AIIMS Bhubaneswar, availability of required beds and required specialists and super specialists. The Committee strongly desire that the Ministry should make concerted efforts to achieve the physical as well as financial targets and ensure the availability of sanctioned bed, specialties and super specialties. The Committee further desire that the Ministry should apprise the Committee about the progress made in this regard.

5. Proposal to set up more AIIMS-like institutions in the country

The Committee observe that the Ministry has plans to set up AIIMS in each State in a phased manner. The Ministry has received requests from Karnataka, Kerala, Goa, Tripura, Sikkim, Mizoram and Manipur for setting up AIIMS-like institutes in their States. During the course of examination, the Committee are informed that keeping in view the cost benefit analysis, presently, apart from AIIMS Guwahati, the Ministry is not actively considering any other AIIMS in the North East. The Committee note that the State Government of Kerala has identified four places viz. Thiruvananthapuram, Nettukaltheri, which is very near to the airport; the land in industrial estate in Calicut, the northern part of Kerala; Kottayam near Medical College; and HMT land, Kalamassery, but the request for setting up of AIIMS is still pending. During cross examination, the Ministry informed the Committee that it has requested the Ministry of Finance to convey 'in-principle' approval for setting up of AIIMS in Kerala. The Committee hope that the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare and Ministry of Finance, Department of expenditure will take proactive steps for setting up of AIIMS like institution in each State in the next phase of PMSSY and include it in the 15th Finance Commission Report. The Committee would like the Ministry to reconsider the requests from other States and take necessary steps to set up an AIIMS like institute in each State in a time bound manner.

6. Need for fixing up of timelines for each step in the guidelines for setting up of new AIIMS

The process of setting up of a new AIIMS at any place in India initiates with its announcement by the Finance Minister followed by offer of land site by the concerned State Government where the AIIMS is proposed to set.

The Committee note that initially the Ministry had not formulated any guideline for the implementation of the PMSSY and was guided by instructions issued from time to time and decisions taken by the Central Project Monitoring Committee (PMC) on case to case basis. This resulted in various ad-hoc decisions taken with respect to fund management, selection of consultants, assignments of project task, award of management of contracts. In the year 2018, a two-member Committee was constituted to draw up scheme guidelines for PMSSY with the experience and learning from prior cases.

The Committee are informed that the Ministry had circulated the draft “Guidelines for implementation of PMSSY” to all stake holders i.e. State Governments for their input on the same. Report from some of the States has been received. Reminder has been issued to all the State Governments by the Secretary, MoHFW to expedite comments in this regard. However, based on the learning from implementation of the Scheme, the process of conceptualisation, executing and functionalization of project have been streamlined.

The Committee note that now there is a well defined check list/standard documentation for process of streamlining on setting up of AIIMS. However, the Committee are pained to note that even after 18 years of announcement of PMSSY, the inputs from some of the State Governments on the draft guidelines for implementation of PMSSY are still awaited and no time line has been fixed for each step mentioned in the check list for establishment of new AIIMS as detailed in Chapter III. The Committee strongly feel that without prescribing the time lines in each action point in the guidelines, the Ministry would not be in a position to monitor the progress effectively. Therefore, they desire the Ministry to fix

prescribed timelines for each action plan and take concerted steps to adhere the prescribed timelines. They may be apprised of the steps taken in this regard.

7. Need for robust online Medical Education

The Committee note that SARAL, a module based online platform, has been developed by AIIMS, New Delhi which allows faculty to upload educational content related to their lectures for students to access. But the Committee are astonished to note that SARAL is just specific to AIIMS, New Delhi. No other AIIMS have got any well defined module (as SARAL) of their own to impart medical education. The other AIIMS conduct training programme for its own staff including nurses and faculty as well as participants from other medical colleges for up gradation of their skills. The Ministry admitted that the suggestion of the Committee for the extensive use of e-learning has been noted for its implementation. The Committee are of the firm opinion that the issue of medical education has to be given a thorough thought well before hand and recommend extensive use of e-learning as the need of the hour and also for the future. The Committee would like to urge the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare to issue instructions/guidelines to all AIIMS to draft and put in place a comprehensive module for online medical education for benefitting all categories of staff. The Committee are of the view that AIIMS, New Delhi should take a lead and help other AIIMS to develop a module of their own with the inbuilt feature of integration with different modules of other AIIMS as well.

8. Need for handing over encumbrance free land for new AIIMS

The Committee observe that the land for setting up of AIIMS is required to be provided by the concerned State Government. Requirement of land for setting up of new AIIMS is about 200 acres. The Committee are informed that the site offered by the State Government for AIIMS at Darbhanga is low lying and the site already has some construction like water tank, power station, post office, BSNL yard & office and Police Stations. Further, the site of AIIMS, Darbhanga was

finalized subject to certain conditions to be fulfilled by the State Government. The Committee are informed that the setting up of AIIMS in Manethi, Haryana was approved by Union Cabinet on 28.02.2019 at a cost of Rs 1299 Crore. However forest clearance for construction of AIIMS at the identified site could not be obtained by the State Govt. In the matter of AIIMS, Manethi, the Committee observe that an alternate land parcel measuring approx 175.85 acre in a village adjoining Manethi has been identified and the process for consent purchase of this land has been initiated. On the issue of monitoring the clearance of land for construction of AIIMS, the Committee are informed that there are two mechanisms for monitoring. One is at the level of the Ministry which is headed by the Additional Secretary and Financial Advisor in the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare and it has the Joint Secretary of the concerned State Government as well as the executing agency to whom the work has been awarded. The other mechanism is at the level of the Prime Minister's Office. These mechanisms review the position of not only the transfer of land but also the progress of construction. After such regular monitoring there has been progress in some cases. Keeping in view the delay in completion of new AIIMS which ranges from 2 to 12 years, the Committee wish that the existing two mechanisms to review the progress of new AIIMS will function in a pro-active manner in expediting the handover of encumbrance free land to the Ministry. The Committee desire that in case of any further delay in getting the clearance of land or any other issue, the Ministry should bring it to the notice of concerned Member of Parliament for taking up of the matter with their respective State Government. The Committee should be apprised of the progress made in this regard.

As pointed out at Manethi, the problem of environmental clearance should be taken up with Ministry of Environment, Forests and Climate Change on urgent basis so that the revised deadline for completion of setting up of AIIMS is achieved in time.

9. Need for well structured Recruitment Process

The vision of balanced medical services across the geographical boundaries of the country has been one of the guiding forces for setting up of new AIIMS. But mere infrastructure would fail to serve the objective in the absence of well trained and qualified human resources. The requirement of posts for the New AIIMS has been worked out as per norms of Academic Council of AIIMS, New Delhi. Based on the recommendations of the Expert Committee, various posts were finalized as required for each of the new AIIMS. A total of 4089 posts consisting of 8 Project Cell posts, 305 Faculty posts and 3776 Non Faculty posts have been sanctioned for each of the six functional AIIMS viz. Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna, Raipur and Rishikesh. The Committee note that at many AIIMS, there exist huge gaps between posts sanctioned and post filled up thereon, thereby affecting the strength of teaching faculty at different AIIMS. The Committee also note that various posts of specialists and super specialists remain vacant owing to lack of availability of requisite candidates. The Committee note that at none of the six new AIIMS viz. Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna, Raipur and Rishikesh, 305 number of faculty posts created has been filled up. Against the 305 number of posts, the posts filled up in each AIIMS are only 209, 189, 219, 134, 160 & 225 faculty respectively. This is indicative of the fact that at these AIIMS, only 68.5%, 62.1%, 71.8%, 43.9%, 57.5% and 73.8% vacancies have been filled up respectively. Similarly is the case of non-faculty post at above mentioned six AIIMS. The numbers of non-faculty posts filled up are 1584, 1663, 2106, 1394, 2423 & 2974 respectively. The Committee note that the Ministry should take urgent steps to fill up the vacancies in time so that medical education and services do not suffer owing to shortage of faculty posts. Even the task of redrafting of reservation roster in light of EWS quota should be sped up so that faculty positions (both regular and contractual) are filled up regularly. The Committee would also recommend the Ministry to explore the possibility of enlarging the ambit of 'visiting faculty' at each new AIIMS so as to enrich the medical education and guidance till the time regular posts are filled up.

The Committee note that in all the six AIIMS, the number of filled faculty posts and non-faculty posts are both regular and contractual. There is no bifurcation in the regular and contractual posts. The recruitment for contractual appointment is made against the vacancy of regular sanctioned posts when the process of regular appointment is delayed due to various administrative reasons such as non-finalization of Recruitment Rules. Contractual appointments are resorted against similar other sanctioned posts to meet the essential services when these posts are not available under regular sanctioned posts and to meet urgent requirement of patient care services and other essential requirement. As per the information received from AIIMS, no contractual appointment of faculty and non-faculty has been made as a replacement for the contractual manpower.

The Committee are of the view that the absence of such bifurcation (between the regular and contractual appointment) will lead to corruption and malpractice and this may lead to compromise in the quality of education and services. Therefore, the Committee strongly recommend the Ministry to evolve a policy decision to have clear cut bifurcation of appointment in various posts on regular and contractual basis. The Committee wish to urge the Ministry to keep the contractual appointment to bare minimum so that the quality manpower is available for the Medical Education Service.

10. Need for well defined connectivity to AIIMS

The Committee note that one of the conditions underlying the land site for AIIMS is four-lane connectivity from Institute to the national highways shall be provided by the State Governments. The Committee observe that most of the AIIMS are located in the outskirts area of the main cities. During the Study Visit of the Committee to AIIMS Kalyani, the Committee observed that the distance between main city of Kolkata to AIIMS Kalyani is approximately 70 kms. There is no proper fastest communication from the main city to the AIIMS. The Committee feel that the issue of road connectivity should be taken up more stringently in all

AIIMS and the Ministry should actively monitor road conditions so that four-lane connectivity is essentially met at each AIIMS project.

11. Physical progress of All AIIMS

The Committee note that AIIMS in Raibareli was initially approved by Cabinet on 05.02.2009. And the revised cost of expenditure was approved by EFC on 22.06.2017. The Cabinet approved date of completion was April, 2020. The revised date for completion has been shifted to November, 2021. Therefore, there is a delay of 1 year and 7 months. In this AIIMS OPD Block, hospital and academic campus and residential complex have been completed. MBBS classes and OPD facilities have been started. AIIMS Mangalgiri in Andhra Pradesh was approved on 07.10.2015. The Cabinet approved date of completion was October, 2020 and the expected date for completion is December 2021. Therefore, there is a delay of 1 year. In phase I OPD block and residential complex have been substantially completed. In phase II, 84% of hospital and academic campus have been completed, MBBS classes and OPD facilities have been started. IPD for COVID 19 treatment with COVID lab facilities has been made functional. The date of Cabinet approval for AIIMS Kalyani in West Bengal was 07.10.2015. The Cabinet approved date of completion was October, 2020 and the expected date for completion is November 2021. Therefore, there is a delay of 1 year. In this AIIMS, OPD block and residential complex have been substantially completed in phase I. In phase II, hospital and academic campus have been substantially completed. MBBS classes and OPD facilities have been started. The Committee during their study visit to this AIIMS in the month of September 2021 had observed that syllabus for the MBBS classes were yet to be approved by the academic committee and there were no lab facilities for the MBBS students. AIIMS Gorakhpur in Uttar Pradesh was approved by the Cabinet on 20.07.2016. The Cabinet approved date of completion was April 2020 and the expected date for completion is November 2021. There is 88.50% progress in construction in EPC mode. MBBS classes and OPD facilities have been started. AIIMS Bhatinda in Punjab was approved by the Cabinet on 27.07.2016. The Cabinet approved

date of completion was June 2020 and the expected date for completion is November 2021. There is 88.70% progress in the construction in EPC mode. MBBS classes and OPD facilities have been started. AIIMS Guwahati in Assam was approved by the Cabinet on 24.05.2017. The Cabinet approved date of completion was April 2021 and the expected date for completion is September 2022. There is 57.50% progress in the construction in EPC mode. Only MBBS classes have been started in this AIIMS. AIIMS Bilaspur in Himachal Pradesh was approved by the Cabinet on 03.01.2018. The cabinet approved date of completion is December 2021 and the expected date for completion is June 2022. There is 72% progress in the construction through EPC mode. Only MBBS classes have been started in this AIIMS. OPD facility is likely to start from December 2021. AIIMS Madurai in Tamil Nadu was approved by the Cabinet on 17.12.2018. The Cabinet approved date of completion is September 2022 and now this has been extended to October 2026. The extended period is almost four years. For this AIIMS site has been finalised, pre-investment work is in progress, preparatory survey by JICA Mission commenced in February 2020 and appointment of Project Management Consultant is in progress. Consultation with State Government and AIIMS Madurai is in progress to start MBBS classes from the current academic session from the temporary campus. AIIMS Dharbanga in Bihar was approved by the Cabinet on 15.09.2020. The Cabinet approved date of completion is September 2024 and it is expected to complete by this due date. However, the Committee note that till date site at Dharbanga has been finalised but the State Government is yet to handover the encumbrance free land. AIIMS Samba in Jammu was approved by the Cabinet on 10.01.2019. The Cabinet approved date of completion is January 2023 and it is expected to complete by this due date. However, the Committee note that there is only 32% progress in the construction through EPC mode. AIIMS Avantipura in Kashmir was approved by the Cabinet on 10.01.2019. The Cabinet approved date of completion is January 2025 and it is expected to complete by this due date. However, the Committee are concerned to note that there is only 6% progress in the construction through EPC mode. AIIMS Deoghar in Jharkhand was approved by the Cabinet on 16.05.2018. The Cabinet approved date of completion is February

2022 and the expected date for completion is June 2022. The Committee note that there is 58% progress in construction through EPC mode. MBBS classes and OPD facilities have been started. AIIMS Rajkot in Gujarat was approved by the Cabinet on 10.01.2019. The Cabinet approved date of completion is October 2022 and it is expected to complete by this due date. However, the Committee note that there is only 12% progress in the construction through EPC mode. Only MBBS classes have been started in this AIIMS. AIIMS Bibi Nagar in Telangana was approved by the Cabinet on 17.12.2018. The Cabinet approved date of completion is September 2022 and now it is expected to complete by November 2023. MBBS classes and OPD facilities have been started in this AIIMS. AIIMS Manethi in Haryana was approved by the Cabinet on 28.02.2019. The Cabinet approved date of completion is February 2023. However, the Committee note that till date the encumbrance free land is yet to be handed over by the State Government.

From the above mentioned facts the Committee observe that out of 16 AIIMS MBBS classes and OPD facilities have been started in 08 AIIMS. Only MBBS classes have been started in 04 AIIMS. The Committee further observe that all the 18 specialities are functional in all 06 AIIMS, namely, Bhopal, Bhubneshwar, Jodhpur, Patna, Raipur and Rishikesh. Out of 17 super speciality, the functionality status in Bhopal, Jodhpur and Patna is 14 respectively and in Bhubneshwar and Rishikesh it is 17 respectively. The dedicated COVID facilities have been operational in all AIIMS.

The Committee are aghast to note that in the six new AIIMS, viz Bhopal, Bhubaneswar, Jodhpur, Patna, Raipur and Rishikesh, many super specialty wards are still non-functional. This pinpoint at a greater laxity towards improper achievement of the targets set over time. Regarding the way forward to ensure completion of construction of all AIIMS in time and to make them fully functional the Committee are informed that regular review meetings of Ministry of Health and Family Welfare are being held with executive agencies and State

Governments. The progress is also being monitored at the level of Prime Minister's Office.

The Committee recommend that the Ministry should constitute a Project Review Panel for each AIIMS which would evaluate both physical targets of construction of buildings as well as medical facilities every quarter and report laxities, if any to the Ministry which can look into the difficulties and solve them in time. The Committee are happy to note that the "use of drone" in evaluating the progress is one of the agenda of the Ministry. The Committee would urge the Ministry to initiate such review at the earliest in order to ensure timely completion of all AIIMS without further extension of time and make them fully functional at the earliest under intimation to them.

12. Dedicated Research Activities

The field of medicine is predominantly dependent on continuous research for its efficacy and development. Research and Development is an inherent feature of medical field. On being asked whether in all AIIMS, lab facilities are functional with respect to both research and for patients, the Committee are informed that Lab facilities are in place in all the six functional AIIMS which are used for both patient services and research activities. Depending up on the functionalities of speciality and super speciality departments and availability of faculty, Institutes under take both extra mural and intra mural research. There is however, no separate allocation by the Ministry for research. The Committee are of the strong view that the Ministry of Health and Family welfare should take up this matter with the Ministry of Finance, Department of expenditure to have a separate allocation for research activities and fill up the required post of specialties and super specialties as it is linked with availability of lab facilities.

The Committee note that the extramural research funding by Department of Science and Technology, D/o of Bio Technology, Indian Council of Medical Research etc. have been taken up at AIIMS, New Delhi. However, the Committee are pained to note that institutions like AIIMS, New Delhi which is considered to be the epitome of health services does not fully spend funds under its research head. The Committee observe that for the years 2018-19, 2019-20 & 2020-21, the institution's total receipts (for research) were Rs. 1,162,738,574.28 lakh, Rs. 1647870753.89 lakh & Rs. 1643432507 lakh respectively. The total expenditure (on research) during the year 2018-19 is Rs. 1107715966 lakh, during the year 2019-20 is Rs. 1448611449 lakh and during the year 2020-21 is Rs. 1218124390 lakh. The Committee would like the Ministry to urge all the AIIMS to concentrate on research activities in full spirit, only then the full fledged development in the arena of medicine would be possible. The Committee are of the firm view that in a country like India where affordable medical aid is one of the essential need for majority of the population, well founded research has to be given full focus by pioneering medical institutions like AIIMS.

On being asked whether research team from AIIMS has conducted any studies on chemical contaminated water canals of Puniab and Haryana which is the major cause of cancer in those areas, the Committee are informed that "no such study has been conducted".

Keeping in view the gravity of the situation the Committee desire the Ministry to undertake proper research on this aspect and suggest remedial measures for the same.

13. Need for separate budget allocation for each AIIMS

The Committee note that Section 15 of the AIIMS ACT 1956 as amended in the year 2012 has stated that :

"The Central Government may, under appropriation made by Parliament by law in this behalf, pay to 1[every Institute] in each financial year such

sums of money and in such manner as may be considered necessary by that Government for the exercise of its powers and discharge of its functions under this Act."

The Committee are informed by the Ministry that the allocation is made for all the projects under PMSSY Division which include setting up of All India Institute of Medical Sciences (AIIMS) as well as up gradation of Government Medical Sciences (GMCs).

This allocation is a combined allocation and not institute-wise. Allocation under the Capital Head is used for Major Works and procurement of equipment form part of setting up of the project, whereas allocation under Revenue Head is provided to institutes, which are functional / partially functional to meet their requirements on salary and other administrative expenditure, including maintenance or purchase / replacement of medical equipment.

The Committee are dismayed to note that, when there is a provision in the Act to provide allocation to every institute in each financial year, the Government of India has not been making budgetary provision AIIMS wise. The Committee, during the sitting held on 8 April 2021, were informed by the representatives of the Ministry that there are 16 AIIMS projects which are going on for which they require fund allocation under capital head to complete the civil works as well as procurement of machinery and equipment. They will require about Rs. 49,800 crore in the next five years, whereas the availability of funds that has been indicated to the Ministry for the next five years is about Rs. 39,000 crore.

The Committee strongly feel that without earmarking an assured fund to each AIIMS, they cannot plan their future requirements viz construction of building, additional machineries as a result that will lead to ad-hoc planning and they can not undertake the implementation work as per the plan. The Committee note that releases are made on the basis of progress of work, requirements

projected by Executing Agencies (EAs). This in a way has a cascading effect on the specific AIIMS which are on a slow pace and would further get neglected. Therefore, the Committee wish to strongly recommend that the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, must take up the matter with the Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance to earmark an assured fund allocation to each AIIMS in the Demands for Grants in each Financial year as per the provision of the AIIMS Act.

14. Need for adequate budgetary allocation for all AIIMS

The Committee observe that under PMSSY, since years 2016-17 to 2021-22, there is a gap between projected requirements and allocations at BE stage. Except the years 2018-19 and 2019-20, there is a lesser allocation at RE stage in comparison to allocation at BE stage. During the year 2021-22 against the proposed allocation of Rs. 8965.14 crore the allocation at BE stage is Rs.7000 crore. The expenditure is Rs. 3903.41 crore till 22 October 2021. The Committee also observe that the expenditure is less than the effective release for various AIIMS except few aberration. The Committee observe that from the years 2018-19 to 2021-22 AIIMS Bhopal could incur expenditure of Rs. 980.83 crore against the effective release of Rs. 1357.07 crore. The percentage of expenditure is 72.27%. AIIMS Bhubneshwar could incur expenditure of Rs. 1216.58 crore against the effective release of Rs. 1377.50 crore. The percentage of expenditure is 88.31%. AIIMS Jodhpur could incur expenditure of Rs. 1694.11 crore against the effective release of Rs. 1822.10 crore. The percentage of expenditure is 92.97%. AIIMS Patna could incur expenditure of Rs. 1020.20 crore against the effective release of Rs. 1314.06 crore. The percentage of expenditure is 77.63%. AIIMS Mangalgiri could incur expenditure of Rs. 117.99 crore against the effective release of Rs. 196.87 crore. The percentage of expenditure is 59.93%. AIIMS Kalyani could incur expenditure of Rs. 24.60 crore against the effective release of Rs. 75.89 crore. The percentage of expenditure is 32.41%. AIIMS Guwahati could incur expenditure of Rs. 5.53 crore against the effective release of Rs. 19.9 crore. The percentage of expenditure is 27.78%. AIIMS Bibi Nagar could incur expenditure of

Rs. 38.41 crore against the effective release of Rs. 98.22 crore. The percentage of expenditure is 39.10%. AIIMS Gorakhpur could incur expenditure of Rs. 79.78 crore against the effective release of Rs. 122.82 crore. The percentage of expenditure is 64.95%. AIIMS Bhatinda could incur expenditure of Rs. 44.26 crore against the effective release of Rs. 75.46 crore. The percentage of expenditure is 58.65%. AIIMS Deoghar could incur expenditure of Rs. 14.58 crore against the effective release of Rs. 62.25 crore. The percentage of expenditure is 23.42%. AIIMS Bilaspur could incur expenditure of Rs. 6.96 crore against the effective release of Rs. 17.53 crore. The percentage of expenditure is 39.7%. AIIMS Raipur could incur expenditure of Rs. 1105.65 crore against the effective release of Rs. 1416.58 crore. The percentage of expenditure is 78.05%. AIIMS Rishikesh could incur expenditure of Rs. 1882.34 crore against the effective release of Rs. 2274.51 crore. The percentage of expenditure is 82.75%. AIIMS Raibareli could incur expenditure of Rs. 49.95 crore against the effective release of Rs. 181.15 crore. The percentage of expenditure is 27.57%. AIIMS Nagpur could incur expenditure of Rs. 129.10 crore against the effective release of Rs. 222.54 crore. The percentage of expenditure is 58.01%. AIIMS Vijaypur in Jammu has nil expenditure against the effective release of Rs. 1 crore. AIIMS Awantipur in J&K has nil expenditure against the effective release of Rs. 1.50 crore. AIIMS Rajkot could incur expenditure of Rs. 9.10 crore against the effective release of Rs. 18.46 crore. The percentage of expenditure is 49.29%.

The representatives of the Ministry of Health and Family welfare have submitted the fact that they need additional allocations for the running expenditure. Right now, they need it only for six AIIMS or some more where MBBS and OPD have been started. But once IPD start all the AIIMS will require running expenditure for operating expenses, like providing services and salary or any additional capital investment for additional civil construction, procurement of additional machinery or replacement of the existing machinery. They will require about Rs. 49,800 crore in the next five years, whereas the availability of funds that has been indicated to the Ministry for the next five years is about Rs. 39,000 crore.

Therefore the Committee strongly recommend the Ministry to take up the matter with the Ministry of Finance at the highest level for providing additional allocations as per the requirement of each AIIMS. At the same time the Committee wish to emphasize the Ministry to ensure the full utilization of allocation. The Committee may be apprised of the action taken in this regard.

The Committee observe that funding through Higher Education Financing Agency (HEFA) was made available as an Extra Budgetary Resource to supplement the budgetary support for PMSSY. HEFA funding was however discontinued vide O.M. No. 13(04)PFC-II/2016 dated 7-9-2020. However no specific reason was assigned for the discontinuation. It was further stated in the above mentioned O.M. that as regards the projects already approved under HEFA, further funding will be provided from the Budget, as needed. No further borrowing shall be undertaken by HEFA in respect of these projects.

As HEFA has been discontinued, the Committee desire the Ministry to ensure adequate budgetary provision for all AIIMS so that no projects of any AIIMS remain fund starved.

15. Authorized and existing specialist and super specialist in AIIMS, New Delhi

The Committee observe that the total sanctioned strength of faculty in AIIMS, New Delhi is 1115. Against this the total in-position faculty is 746 in Regular posts and 55 in Contractual. The total vacancy is 314. Out of total vacancy position of 314; 157 vacancies are in upcoming Centres / Block / Facilities.

The Committee are informed that efforts are being made to fill the vacancies. These vacancies would have been advertised in 2020 on regular basis with existing Reservation Roster, but were withheld due to Government instruction received from the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare vide letter dated 23.02.2027 to re-draw the Reservation Rosters for recruitment of faculty in AIIMS. The Institute is in the process of re-drawing the Reservation Roster as per

Reservation in Teachers Cadre Act, 2019. A Committee has been constituted for the purpose and the Reservation Roster is being finalized and onwards vacant post will be advertised soon.

The Committee hope that the Ministry would take appropriate action for filling up of the vacant posts without further loss of time and apprise them about the final action taken in this regard.

16. Irregularities in AIIMS Patna

The Governing body of Patna AIIMS in its meeting held in the year 2012 had found some irregularities in appointment in various faculty posts. Updating the status of the enquiry and action taken against the appointee, the Committee are informed that the report of the High Level Committee was placed before the IB, GB of AIIMS Patna. The GB in its 3'd meeting dated 18.02.2021 vide agenda no. 3/11 decided the following:

- (a) GB accepted the recommendations of the High Level Committee and the recommendations of committee constituted by the President of the Institute.**
- (b) After accepting the recommendations of both committees, it was transpired that there was no irregularity in appointment of Faculty except for three cases viz. Dr. A.K. Saxena, Dr. Sushmita Das and Dr. Alok Ranjan.**
- (c) GB directed AIIMS Patna to initiate process of termination of services of these three Faculty members.**

Accordingly, a charge sheet dated 26.05.2021 has been issued to the three faculty members whose appointment was found irregular by the Governing Body. Reply from them has been received. IO/PO is being appointed for further necessary action.

The Committee are distressed to note that even after lapse of long nine years, the position remains the same. The Committee deplore the callous attitude of the Ministry to such irregularities. Therefore, the Committee urge the Ministry to complete the action as desired by the Governing body at the earliest without any further loss of time and apprise them about the final action taken in this regard.

The Committee also observe that for the post of Hostel Warden some of the AIIMS has advertised for the post of Junior Warden and not the Senior Warden. The qualification for the post of Junior Warden is 10th Pass. The Committee are perturbed to note that for the reputed institutions like AIIMS downgrading the qualifications to such low will definitely have an adverse impact on the quality of Services. Therefore, the Committee urge the Ministry to examine this matter with utmost sincerity and appoint quality persons to various with proper qualifications and apprise them the action taken in this regard.

17. Proficiency of New AIIMS

About the steps being taken at all the new proposed AIIMS to make them proficient enough to provide same level of medical facilities and medical education as being provided in AIIMS, New Delhi, the Committee are informed that AIIMS have adequate facilities to cater the needs of patient care. However, with the increasing patient load, innovations and advances in medical field, new facilities are incorporated/ advanced subject to availability of Specialists and Super Specialists. There is a high standard of selection of faculty in new AIIMS. The educational qualification, research or teaching experience required for selection at new AIIMS are same as those for AIIMS, New Delhi. To keep the skill level or knowledge base of faculty, updated, they are sent for training / attending the conferences from time to time.

New AIIMS have student centred, problem based, integrated and community oriented teaching consisting of foundation course, medical ethics, evidence based medicine, clinical teaching.

The Committee note that there is large scale vacancies in many teaching and non teaching posts in various AIIMS. Various posts are of contractual in nature and there is delay in filling up of various posts. At present there is no provision of rotation/transfer of Faculties from one AIIMS to another AIIMS. Till date there is no specialties/Super specialties' in AIIMS Raipur in the field of gastroenterology, surgical gastroenterology, neurology, medical oncology and nuclear medicine. In AIIMS Patna there is no specialties'/super specialties in the field of Nephrology, Neurology, Endocrinology and Metabolic diseases. In AIIMS Bhopal there are no specialties/super specialties in the field of gastroenterology, medical oncology and clinical hematology. In AIIMS Jodhpur, there are no specialties/super specialties in the field of medical oncology and clinical hematology.

In view of the above backdrop the Committee are of the strong view that the Ministry should take necessary measures to fill up the above mentioned posts in various AIIMS so that patients services can be provided in all the AIIMS. The Committee also wish to recommend that the Ministry should explore the feasibility to have provision of rotation/transfer of Faculties from one AIIMS to another AIIMS, so that the quality of education as well as services in all the new AIIMS will be at par with AIIMS, New Delhi.

- 18. Need for uniform syllabus for the MBBS courses in all AIIMS, rules and regulations for completing the course, conducting examination and a robust evaluation process.**

With respect to the syllabus of MBBS Courses for each new AIIMS, the Committee observe that the AIIMS in Bhopal, Bhubneshwar, Jodhpur, Patna, Raipur and Rishikesh have MBBS course and the Academic curriculum have been approved

by the Standing Academic Committee of the respective institute. During the study visit of the Committee to AIIMS Kalyani, the Committee learnt that proper course structure has not been finalised by the Standing Academic Committee of that Institute. The Committee are apprehensive of the fact whether all the 16 new AIIMS are having the syllabus for their MBBS course or not. Therefore, the Committee desire the Ministry to apprise about the status of the syllabus in all the new AIIMS. The Committee are also of the view that all the AIIMS should have uniform syllabus for the MBBS courses in all AIIMS and they should follow proper rules and regulations for completing the course, conducting examination and a robust evaluation process. Therefore, the Committee wish to recommend the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare to evolve mechanism to ensure to have uniform syllabus for the MBBS courses in all AIIMS, uniform rules and regulations for completing the course, conducting examination and a robust evaluation process. They may be apprised of the steps taken in this regard.

NEW DELHI;
21 December, 2021
30 Agrahayana, 1943 (Saka)

GIRISH BHALCHANDRA BAPAT
CHAIRPERSON
COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES

Annexure

Total budget projected, actual allocation made and expenditure incurred during the last three years

	2018-19			2019-20			2020-21		
	Projecti on	Actual Allocati on	Expenditu re	Projection	Actual Allocatio n	Expenditur e	Projectio n	Actual allocation	Expenditure
Revenue:									
GIA Salaries	1700.00	1605.00	1616.68	1685.00	1685.00	1736.16	1800.00	1800.00	1760.14
GIA General (including for HEFA)	768.00	750.50	875.11	1000.00	993.00	1039.28	1032.96	1032.96	1045.01
SAP	Not projecte d	50.00	17.44	Not projected	Not projected	13.63	7.00	7.00	6.84
Capital :									
GIA Creation of Capital Assests	1145.00	873.00	873.20	800.00	550.00	525.82*	800.00	650.00	648.67
Total	3613.00	3229.00	3382.43	3485.00	3228.00	3314.89	3639.96	3489.96	3460.66

*Ministry sanctioned Rs. 717.19 crore under the Capital head during the year 2019-20. An amount of Rs. 191.37 Crore(717.19-525.82) remained unspent. Out of Rs. 191.37 crore, Ministry vide its email dated 07.04.2020 had already revalidated Rs. 167.19 Crore under Capital head for the F.Y. 2020-21. Further, Rs. 24.18 Crore (191.37-167.19) may also be revalidated for the FY 2020-21.

MINUTES OF SEVENTEENTH SITTING OF THE COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES (2020-21)

The Committee sat on Thursday, the 8th April, 2021 from 1200 hrs. to 0215 hrs. in Committee Room No. '1', First Floor, Block-A, Parliament House Annexe Extension Building, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Shri Girish Bhalchandra Bapat - **Chairperson**

MEMBERS

- 2 Shri Kunwar Danish Ali
- 3 Shri Sudarshan Bhagat
- 4 Shri P.P. Chaudhary
- 5 Shri Nihal Chand Chauhan
- 6 Dr. Sanjay Jaiswal
- 7 Shri Dayanidhi Maran
- 8 Shri K. Muraleedharan
- 9 Col. Rajyavardhan Singh Rathore
- 10 Shri Vinayak Bhaurao Raut
- 11 Shri Ashok Kumar Rawat
- 12 Shri Rajiv Pratap Rudy
- 13 Shri Francisco Cosme Sardinha
- 14 Shri Jugal Kishore Sharma
- 15 Shri Pinaki Misra
- 16 Shri Kesineni Srinivas
- 17 Shri Parvesh Sahib Singh

SECRETARIAT

1. Smt. A. Jyothirmayi - Additional Director
2. Shri R.S. Negi - Deputy Secretary

WITNESSES

1. Shri Nilambuj Sharan - Joint Secretary, Economic Adviser
2. Dr. Randeep Guleria - Director, AIIMS

2. At the outset, the Chairperson welcomed the Members to the Sitting of the Committee and briefed them about the agenda of the Sitting viz. evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (MoHFW) in connection with the examination of the subject 'Review of Progress of All AIIMS'. After a brief discussion, the representatives of MoHFW were called in to depose before the Committee.

3. The Chairperson welcomed the representatives of MoHFW and asked them to introduce themselves to the Committee and drew their attention to Direction 55(1) of the Directions by the Speaker, Lok Sabha regarding confidentiality of the proceedings of the Committee.

4. Thereafter, the representatives of MoHFW made a power point presentation. Then the Members raised several queries/suggestions on the issues related to the subject which inter-alia included slow progress in setting up of certain new AIIMS; funding from JICA; land acquisition; status/progress of all new AIIMS and stipulated time-frame for their completion. Some Members also queried about funding from other international agencies like World Bank; reasons for not considering other States of the country including Kerala for setting up of AIIMS; whether there was any new proposal(s) for setting up of AIIMS in other parts of the country. Members also highlighted issues of irregularities at AIIMS, Patna. Some members also raised queries with regard to Covid-19 viz. utilization of train coaches for COVID-19 treatment and fund allocated/released/utilized for the same; facilities in dedicated Covid-19 hospital blocks; vaccination for Covid-19 and surge in number of Covid-19 cases; disposal of biomedical wastes of COVID-19 patients in home quarantine; fund allocated for research work to develop Covid-19 vaccines; and steps taken/being taken to expedite establishment of rural health centres especially during the spread of Covid-19 cases. Members also suggested to introduce a web portal for imparting higher medical education and SARAL platform;

research programme for treatment/eradication of cancer; and setting up of cancer hospitals/research centres, etc.

5. The queries of the Members were duly responded to by the representatives of the Ministry. The Chairperson then thanked the witnesses for giving useful information and asked them to furnish written replies to the points which could not be responded to during the Sitting.

6 The verbatim proceedings of the sitting of the Committee has been kept on record.

The Committee then adjourned.

MINUTES OF FIFTH SITTING OF THE COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES (2021-22)

The Committee sat on Wednesday, the 27th October, 2021 from 1130 hrs. onwards in Committee Room No. '1', First Floor, Block-A, Parliament House Annexe Extension Building, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Dr. Sanjay Jaiswal - **Convener**

MEMBERS

- 2 Shri Kunwar Danish Ali
- 3 Shri Kalyan Banerjee
- 4 Shri Sudarshan Bhagat
- 5 Shri Nihal Chand Chauhan
- 6 Smt. Sangeeta Kumari Singh Deo
- 7 Shri Mohanbhai Kalyanjibhai Kundariya
- 8 Shri Dayanidhi Maran
- 9 Shri Pinaki Misra
- 10 Shri K. Muraleedharan
- 11 Col. Rajyavardhan Singh Rathore
- 12 Shri Ashok Kumar Rawat
- 13 Shri Rajiv Pratap Rudy
- 14 Shri Francisco Cosme Sardinha
- 15 Shri Kesineni Srinivas

SECRETARIAT

1. Smt. Jyochnamayi Sinha - Director
2. Smt. A. Jyothirmayi - Additional Director

WITNESSES

1. Shri Rajesh Bhushan - Secretary, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare
2. Shri Nilambuj Sharan - Economic Adviser, PMSSY

2. In the absence of Chairperson, the Committee choose Dr.Sanjay Jaiswal MP and Member of the Committee to preside over the sitting as per Rule258(3) of the Rules and Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha.
3. At the outset, the Convenor welcomed the Members to the Sitting of the Committee and briefed them about the agenda of the Sitting viz. further evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (MoHFW) in connection with the examination of the subject 'Review of Progress of All AIIMS'. After a brief discussion, the representatives of MoHFW were called in to depose before the Committee.
4. The Chairperson welcomed the representatives of MoHFW and drew their attention to Direction 55(1) of the Directions by the Speaker, Lok Sabha regarding confidentiality of the proceedings of the Committee.
5. The representatives of MoHFW made a power point presentation. Thereafter, the Members raised several queries on the issues related to the subject which inter-alia included delay in completion of AIIMS (Madurai, Raebareli and Mangalagiri); delay in approval for Covaxin from WHO; timeline of Covid-19 vaccination for children; non-filling up of posts at different AIIMS with special focus on reviewing recruitment process; non existence of common syllabus at different AIIMS and reason for non approval of the syllabus etc. The Committee also expressed its dissatisfaction at according different status to all AIIMS other than AIIMS, New Delhi and instructed the Ministry to furnish written replies on the above points at the earliest.
6. Some queries of the Members were duly responded to by the representatives of the Ministry. The Chairperson then thanked the witnesses for giving useful information and asked them to furnish written replies to the points which could not be responded to during the Sitting.
7. The verbatim proceeding of the Sitting of the Committee has been kept on record.

The Committee then adjourned.

MINUTES OF SIXTH SITTING OF THE COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES (2021-22)

The Committee sat on Tuesday, the 16th November, 2021 from 1130 hrs. onwards in Committee Room No. '2', First Floor, Block-A, Parliament House Annexe Extension Building, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Shri Girish Bhalchandra Bapat - Chairperson

MEMBERS

2. Shri Kunwar Danish Ali
3. Shri Sudharshan Bhagat
4. Shri P.P. Chaudhary
5. Shri Nihal Chand Chauhan
6. Dr. Sanjay Jaiswal
7. Shri Dayanidhi Maran
8. Shri Pinaki Misra
9. Shri Jual Oram
10. Shri Kamlesh Paswan
11. Shri Magunta Srinivasulu Reddy
12. Shri Rajiv Pratap Rudy

SECRETARIAT

1. Smt. Jyochnamayi Sinha - Director
2. Smt. A. Jyothirmayi - Additional Director

WITNESSES

1. Shri Rajesh Bhushan - Secretary, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare
2. Shri Manohar Agnani - Additional Secretary, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare
3. Shri Nilambuj Sharan - Economic Adviser, PMSSY

2. At the outset, the Chairperson welcomed the Members to the Sitting of the Committee and briefed them about the agenda of the Sitting viz. further evidence of the representatives of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (MoHFW) in connection with the examination of the subject 'Review of Progress of All AIIMS'. After a brief discussion, the representatives of MoHFW were called in to depose before the Committee.

3. The Chairperson welcomed the representatives of MoHFW and drew their attention to Direction 55(1) of the Directions by the Speaker, Lok Sabha regarding confidentiality of the proceedings of the Committee.

4. The representatives of MoHFW made a power point presentation. Thereafter, the Members raised several queries on the issues related to the subject which inter-alia included. Tenure of Director, policy adopted for appointing Director/Executive Director, filling up of vacancies in various posts particularly the post of Professors, lesser qualification for the post of Hostel warden in various AIIMS, monitoring mechanism to pursue with the State Governments for clearance of land and handing over for construction of new AIIMS and reasons for lack of time bound action etc.

5. Some queries of the Members were duly responded to by the representatives of the Ministry. The Chairperson then thanked the witnesses for giving useful information and asked them to furnish written replies to the points which could not be responded to during the Sitting.

6. The verbatim proceedings of the Sitting of the Committee has been kept on record.

The Committee then adjourned.

MINUTES OF THE SEVENTH SITTING OF THE COMMITTEE ON ESTIMATES (2021-22)

The Committee sat on Thursday, the 16th December, 2021 from 1500 hrs. to 1545 hrs. in Room No. 52-B, Chairperson's Office, Parliament House, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Shri Girish Bhalchandra Bapat – Chairperson

Members

2. Shri Kunwar Danish Ali
3. Shri Sudharshan Bhagat
4. Shri P.P. Chaudhary
5. Smt. Sangeeta Kumari Singh Deo
6. Shri P. C. Gaddigoudar
7. Dr. Sanjay Jaiswal
8. Shri Dharmendra Kumar Kashyap
9. Shri Mohanbhai Kalyanji Kundariya
10. Shri Pinaki Misra
11. Shri S.S. Palanimanickam
12. Shri Kamlesh Paswan
13. Dr. K.C. Patel
14. Col. Rajyavardhan Singh Rathore
15. Shri Vinayak Bhaurao Raut
16. Shri Magunta Srinivasulu Reddy
17. Shri Rajiv Pratap Rudy
18. Shri Dilip Saikia
19. Shri Francisco Cosme Sardinha
20. Shri Jugal Kishore Sharma
21. Shri Prathap Simha
22. Shri Kesineni Srinivas

SECRETARIAT

1. Smt. Jyochnamayi Sinha - Director

2. At the outset, the Chairperson welcomed the Members to the sitting of the Committee. The Committee then took up for consideration and adoption of draft Report on the subject 'Review of Progress of all AIIMS' pertaining to the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare.

3. Then, the Committee authorised the Chairperson to make any consequential changes and finalize the draft Report on the basis of factual verification by the concerned Ministry and present the same to Lok Sabha.

The Committee, then, adjourned.