

[डा० रामजी सिंह]

"देश में गोवध पर पूर्ण प्रतिबंध लगाये जाने की अपनी मांग के समर्थन में श्री विनोबा भावे द्वारा आमरण अनशन आरम्भ करने से उत्पन्न स्थिति।"

SHRI VASANT SATHE (Akola):
Once it is laid on the table, it becomes a public document. Till you re-examine, let him not lay it on the table.

MR. SPEAKER: The question is that it does not make any difference. But, if there is any policy difference, I shall get it examined; I shall ask my office to examine to see whether there is any departure from the policy statement in which case I would request them to study the matter.

Now, Call Attention. Dr. Ramji Singh.

SHRI JYOTIRMAY BOSU (Diamond Harbour): Sir, I have given a notice to you.....

MR. SPEAKER:.....Don't record, I have not selected the notices.

(Interruption)**

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI H. M. PATEL):
Sir, We deeply regret that Acharya Vinoba Bhawe has commenced his indefinite fast. As the House is aware, all possible efforts were made to persuade the Acharya not to undertake such a fast and to give all of us more time to bring about adequate changes in the position obtaining in West Bengal and Kerala. Leaders for all parties and groups in the House accompanied me to meet the Acharya. He agreed to reconsider his decision if the Governments of West Bengal and Kerala would accept the principles in the judgement of the Supreme Court on the question. The Prime Minister spoke to the concerned two Chief Ministers. As a result, they met the Acharya on 18th April, and ex-

plained their points of view. But these efforts have not been of any avail till now.

It was suggested that it would help matters if States other than West Bengal and Kerala were to suitably amend their laws to prevent transport of cows and other cattle to slaughter houses outside their States. Such a provision exists in Karnataka. I accordingly requested all the other concerned Chief Ministers that they may consider immediate amendments to laws in force in their States. The response so far from the States is encouraging. If the inter-State movement of cows and other cattle is strictly enforced, the number of cows available for slaughter above the age of 14 in West Bengal and 10 in Kerala would get automatically reduced.

It has also been suggested that voluntary agencies should be encouraged, particularly in West Bengal and Kerala, to make appropriate arrangements for looking after old animals so that the slaughter of cows could be prevented. We would certainly extend all our co-operation in such endeavours.

We sincerely believe that West Bengal and Kerala would take due note of the Acharya's feelings as well as the feelings of large sections of people in the country on the subject. Our efforts to persuade them to fall in line with the rest of the States would also continue. I would once again make an earnest appeal to the Acharya to reconsider the matter and give all of us more time.

डा० रामजी सिंह : अध्यक्ष महोदय, इस प्रकार का अनशन एक बार १० राम चन्द्र शर्मा ने किया था तो बंगाल ही नहीं, सम्पूर्ण भारत में कवि बृज रवीन्द्र नाथ ठाकुर ने कविता लिखी थी। मैं यह ध्यानाकर्षण प्रस्ताव कोई राजनीतिक हित या उद्देश्य के लिए उठा रहा नहीं कर रहा हूँ बल्कि एक प्रार्थना-मूलक भाव से कर रहा हूँ रवीन्द्र नाथ ठाकुर ने गाया था :

प्राणघातकेषु बद्धी करिते धिक्कार
हे महात्मा प्राणों विन्ते चाग्रो आपनार

तोमार जनाई नमस्कार ॥

रबीन्द्र नाथ ठाकुर ने कहा था कि आपने मुक पशुओं के लिए, उनके प्राण बचाने के लिए अपने प्राणों की बाजी लगा दी है—हम आपको नमस्कार करते हैं। आज विनोबा जी का इसमें कोई व्यक्तिगत उद्देश्य नहीं है। जीवन में कभी उनकी कोई आकांक्षा नहीं रही है। हम उनके विचारों से सहमत हों या न हों लेकिन आज उन्होंने अपने प्राणों की बाजी लगा दी है। सभी के लिए आज यह विन्ता का विषय है। (व्यवधान) सचमुच में, विनोबा जी कौन हैं यह तो मैं कह सकता हूँ लेकिन मैं उनका परिचय देने की धृष्टता नहीं कर सकता हूँ। जब अंग्रेजी सत्ता से लड़ने का सत्याग्रह चला तो गांधी जी ने आचार्य विनोबा को प्रथम सत्याग्रही घोषित किया था इसलिए उनकी देश भक्ति और निष्ठा पर कुछ कहने की आवश्यकता नहीं है।

हमारे कुछ मित्रों ने कहा कि आज जब देश में हरिजनों की हत्याएँ हो रही हैं, अल्पसंख्यकों की हत्याएँ हो रही हैं... (व्यवधान) आप कम से कम मुन से कि आचार्य विनोबा ने हरिजनों के लिए तथा अल्पसंख्यकों के लिए क्या किया। पुरानी पीढ़ी के जो लोग यहाँ बैठे हैं वे बतायेंगे कि केरल में जो सत्याग्रह हुआ था उसमें गांधी जी ने हरिजनों के मन्दिर प्रवेश के लिए विनोबा जी को भेजा था। हरिजनों के साथ मन्दिर प्रवेश के समय पण्डों ने जो प्रहार किया था उसी का कारण है कि विनोबा जी बहरे हो गए। आपको मालूम होगा कि जब हिन्दुस्तान में हिन्दू मुसलमान बंटा हुआ था तो गरीब मंत्रों को उन्होंने बसाया था। (व्यवधान) इसकी आवश्यकता नहीं है कि आप मेरे विचारों से सहमत हों लेकिन मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि आज देश का प्रत्येक व्यक्ति चाहता है कि इस विद्वान समर्पित व्यक्ति के प्राणों की रक्षा होनी चाहिए। यही कारण है कि लोकनायक जयप्रकाश जी ने भी अपनी रणनीति पर पड़े हुए दो राज्यों से पुनः अनुरोध किया है कि विनोबा जी की बातों को आप स्वीकार करें और उन के प्राणों की रक्षा करें। (व्यवधान)

कुछ लोग जो अपने को अधिक सेकुलर कहते हैं उनको मालूम होना चाहिए कि जब हिन्दुस्तान का संविधान बन रहा था तो अनुच्छेद (48) जिसके द्वारा गोवध पर प्रतिबंध लगाया गया है, वह सर्वसम्मति से पास हुआ था और एक मुस्लिम सदस्य सारी साहब ने कहा था

"My own submission to this House is that it is better to come forward and incorporate a clause in the Fundamental Rights that cow slaughter

is henceforth prohibited rather than to leave it vogue in the Directive Principles."

यह केवल संविधान सम्मत ही नहीं है बल्कि सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने भी अपना निर्णय देते हुए उसका समर्थन किया है। विनोबा जी जो कह रहे हैं वे अपनी सनक आपके सामने नहीं रख रहे हैं बल्कि जिस का संविधान में समर्थन दिया और जिस को सुप्रीम कोर्ट ने समर्थन दिया। इस को आप आधिक कारणों से कहते हैं कि नहीं हो सकता। यह रिपोर्ट आप दि एक्सप्रेस कमेटी आन प्रिक्सेशन आफ स्लाटर आफ काऊज है। इसमें पहले ही यह दिया है। मैं पढ़ कर आप को सुनाता हूँ :

The existing legislation against slaughter is proving more or less ineffective in cities because the legislation is applicable only to a few areas and not to the whole country.

यह जो समिति है, यह भारत सरकार की समिति है। इस के चेलाबा आप रिपोर्ट आप दि कटिल प्रीजरवेशन एण्ड डेवलपमेंट को देखें, जिसके सदस्य थे सर्व श्री दातार सिंह, सरदार बहादुर हरचन्द सिंह, हरदेव सहाय, जयेंती लाल मनकर, धर्मलाल सिंह और पी० एन० नन्दा इन सब लोगों ने स्पष्ट कहा है :

Slaughter of cattle should be prohibited totally as early as possible.

मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि आज कुछ लोग कहते हैं कि आर्थिक दृष्टि से यह संभव नहीं है और हमारे राजन भाई और बैस्ट बंगाल की गवर्नमेंट ने कुछ कितानें दी हैं लेकिन श्री सी० एम० बकील ने, जो एक एकोनामिस्ट हैं, जो पचा दिया है "एकोनामिस्ट आफ काऊ प्रोटेक्शन, उस में उन्होंने यह कहा है :

"The enclosed note on the economics of cow protection brings out the fact that it is essentially an economic problem affecting all classes of people in the country irrespective of religion. It establishes the fact that if the problem is viewed dispassionately from all points of view, it will be realised that the cow is a source of gain, alive or dead, to the people of the country and never a loss. It is to be hoped that all concerned thus realise the importance of the cow as the most important basic factor in the economy of the country."

डा० रामजी सिंह]

अध्यक्ष महोदय, समयाभाव के कारण मैं ज्यादा नहीं कहना चाहता लेकिन मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि कुछ लोग यह कहते हैं कि यह सबमुच में हिन्दू-मुसलमानों का प्रश्न है। उनसे मैं यह निवेदित करना चाहूँगा कि वे इतिहास को देखें कि बबर से लेकर औरंगजेब तक किसी ने गौ-बध नहीं किया था, हैदरअली ने गौ-बध नहीं किया था और शाह आलम ने नहीं किया था। इसलिए वे लोग जो यह कहते हैं कि यह सांस्कृतिक प्रश्न है, वे यह देखें कि कुरान शरीफ की एक भी आयत में यह नहीं लिखा है कि गौ-मांस खाना घोबलीगैटरी है। आप यह भी देखें कि मीर मुस्ताक साहब ने भी इसके बारे में क्या कहा है और हमारे सम्मानित कुरेशी साहब यहां पर बैठे हुए हैं, काश्मीर जो मुस्लिम बाहुल्य प्रान्त है, वहां पर भी इसकी बंदिश है और जो ऐसा करता है उसको 10 वर्ष तक की सजा हो सकती है।

एक बात मैं और कहना चाहता हूँ। भारत-वर्ष में वेस्ट बंगाल और केरल में जो विरोधी दलों की सरकारें हैं, मैं उनके सामने सर झुकाता हूँ। मैं स्टोमोलेर नहीं लाना चाहता हूँ लेकिन मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि हिन्दुस्तान के सभी राज्यों में जब यह कानून लागू है, जब संविधान का निर्देश है और उच्चतम न्यायालय का इस पर निर्णय है और अर्थशास्त्र का भी सिद्धान्त है, तो उनको भी इस को मानना चाहिए.. (अवधान)

मैं एक चीज और कहना चाहूँगा कि कुछ लोग, दीनेन बाबू आप भी विनोबा जी से मिलने गये थे।.... (अवधान).... आज यह विवाद का विषय नहीं है और चाहे हम उनके विचारों से सहमत हों या न हों, लेकिन विनोबा जी देश की एक विभूति हैं और वे जो कह रहे हैं, वह संविधान सम्मत है। कुछ लोग कहते हैं कि गांधी जी इस तरह के लेजिसलेशन के खिलाफ थे। मैं उनसे कहना चाहता हूँ कि वे "यंग इंडिया", 7 जुलाई, 1927 में गांधी जी ने कहा था "काऊ इन मैसूर", उसको देखें। अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप कर्नाटक के रहने वाले हैं। "काऊ इन मैसूर" में उन्होंने कहा था :

"The cow in Mysore: I have received letters from Cow Protection Societies in Mysore, protesting against my letter to the Mysore Cow Protection Committee appointed by the State. My letter was in answer to the questionnaire issued by that committee. Extracts from that letter published in the

Madras Press led the Cow Protection Societies to think that I was totally against legal prohibition of cow slaughter under any circumstances whatsoever. I am surprised to receive these letters and I wondered whether, in a moment of forgetfulness or inadvertence, I had ever said that there should never be any legislation against cow slaughter.

MR. SPEAKER: You have taken lot of time. Please conclude.

डा० रामजी सिंह : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं ज्यादा नहीं कहना चाहता। मुझे ख़ुशी है कि राष्ट्र के सारे नेता, चाहे वे किसी भी दल के हों, ज्योति बाबू और श्री बामुदेवन नायर से उन्होंने विनोबा जी के प्राण रक्षा की अपील की है। लोक सभा में इस सम्बन्ध में मेरा संकल्प पास भी हुआ है। तो मैं गृह मंत्री जी से बहुत प्रार्थनापूर्वक कहना चाहूँगा कि वे विनोबा जी की प्राण रक्षा के लिए वेस्ट बंगाल की सरकार से और केरल की सरकार से कहें। मैं चम्पाण साहब से अपील करूँगा और विरोधी दल के नेता श्री स्टीफन से भी अपील करूँगा कि उनकी भी पार्टी यह कह रही है कि विनोबा भावे की प्राण रक्षा हो, उसके वास्ते वे इन राज्य सरकारों से अपील करें और कहें कि संविधान की मान्यताओं का आदर....

MR. SPEAKER: I think, you must follow the orders. I have given you a lot more time than is ordinarily being done. I would not allow any more recording.

Do not record.

DR. RAMJI SINGH: **

SHRI H. M. PATEL: The hon. Member has given expression to the reasons why Acharya Vinoba Bhava has proceeded on his fast. I do not think, he has asked any question. The only question that has been asked by him is whether we would make further efforts to persuade these two State Governments to ban the cow slaughter. I have already said that we would continue to do that.

SHRI CHITTA BASU (Barasat): I am really happy that the hon. Home Minister has said that he would once again make an earnest appeal....

श्री श्रीमन्नारायण त्वागी (बहराइच) : इन्होंने पूछा था कि इनकॉर्ट लिस्ट में इस विषय को रखेंगे ? इसका उत्तर नहीं दिया है ।

MR. SPEAKER: He said that he would make every possible effort in this respect.

SHRI CHITTA BASU: With all sincerity at my command, on behalf of myself and West Bengal Left-front express deep sense of concern and anxiety for the life of Vinobaji who has undertaken a fast. But with all humility, I beg to submit that the Governments of West Bengal and Kerala have in detail explained the position to Shri Vinoba Bhave with regard to his demand of total ban on cow slaughter. I have something to point out to the hon. Members regarding the erroneous statement being made in this statement. The whole purpose of the statement has been to single out the West Bengal Government and the Government of Kerala as if these two State Governments are not falling in line with the decision of the Supreme Court. The fact is not that; the fact is otherwise. Would you kindly note that in some other States like Bihar, Uttar Pradesh, Madhya Pradesh, Orissa, Union Territory of Delhi, there is a ban on the slaughter of cow and calves, but no ban on the slaughter of the bullocks and bulls.

SHRI A. C. GEORGE (Mukandapuram): Sexual discrimination.

SHRI CHITTA BASU: There is no legislation whatsoever on cow protection in Nagaland, in Meghalaya, Union Territories of Arunachal Pradesh, Mizoram, Goa, Daman and Diu, Lakshadweep, and there is no ban in the North Cachar and Mithi districts of Assam. In Tripura and Manipur also, there is no such legislation about cow protection. Thus, the purpose of the statement has been only to single out these two States; where the Governments enjoy the confidence of the

people and the minority community as a whole. Therefore, if I am not incorrect, there are certain forces who are out to create trouble in these two States on this unfortunate affair of Vinobaji's fast.

I want some few minutes' time to explain the difficulties of the Governments of West Bengal and Kerala. I hope, the hon. Members of this House will rise above the partisan attitude and appreciate the feelings and difficulties of these two Governments. The West Bengal Government has mentioned that there are no laws in several States concerning the subject, but in West Bengal there is a law. In West Bengal there is a law, West Bengal Animal Slaughter Control Act, 1950 which was enacted by the state legislature as far back as 1950, under which only those animals which are over 14 years of age and unfit for work or breeding or have become permanently incapacitated for work or breeding due to age, injury, deformity or any incurable disease can be slaughtered. With regard to Kerala, there is provision in the rules of Kerala under which slaughter of animals under 10 years is banned in the panchayat area and the rules are now being modified to cover municipal areas also.

My friend mentioned the name of Mahatma Gandhi. I should only like to quote a passage from Shri P. C. Sen's letter addressed to Nandaji in 1966 on this issue; Shri Sen, it will be acknowledged, has faith and belief in the principle of Gandhism:

"You would no doubt appreciate that the existing West Bengal Animal Slaughter Control Act, 1950, which practically bans the slaughter of all useful cattle in this state, safeguards the fundamental spirit of article 48 of the Constitution of India. In order to organise animal husbandry 'on modern and scientific lines' with a view to improving the breeds of milch and draught cattle, it is absolutely necessary to eliminate old, diseased and otherwise useless cattle, especially in view of the

[Shri Chitta Basu]

pathetic dearth of green fodder. Hence in our opinion, no further action in the direction is considered desirable so far as at least this state is concerned."

This was written by an ex-Chief Minister, Shri P. C. Sen, now a Member of this House, who believes in the principle of Gandhism.

Another Gandhian and ex-Chief Minister of West Bengal, Mr. Ajoy Mukherji, in his letter says:

"In our opinion, the existing West Bengal Animal Slaughter Control Act, 1950 which practically bans the slaughter of all useful cattle in this State, and the West Bengal Livestock improvement Act, 1950 which provide for preservation and improvement of the cattle in this State—safeguards the fundamental spirit of article 48 of the Constitution of India. We may however in due course amend the West Bengal Animal Slaughter Control Act 1950 for the purpose of its more effective application and the Act which at present applies to Calcutta and in other municipalities in the State, may gradually be extended to new areas,...."

I only want to quote one Chief Minister, another Chief Minister, Siddhartha Shankar Ray, who is a known lawyer and he has interpreted article 48.

MR. SPEAKER: We are not on legal things.

SHRI CHITTA BASU: It is an important matter.

MR. SPEAKER: It is a call attention.

SHRI CHITTA BASU: I am just finishing. He said referring to the 1950 Act of West Bengal:

"This provision is in consonance with article 48 of the Constitution of India. This legislation, it appears, is also in line with the interpretation of the Supreme Court in the case of Md. Hanif Qureshi and others versus the State of Bihar and others (AIR 1958 SC 731) to the effect that 'the protection recommended by this part of the directive is confined only to cows and calves and to those animals which are presently or potentially capable of yielding milk or of doing work as draught cattle but does not from the very nature of the purpose for which it is obviously recommended, extend to cattle which at one time were milch or draught cattle but which have ceased to be such.'"

The position with regard to the Supreme Court decision has also been negated by the letter written by Shri Siddhartha Shankar Ray to the Government of India on the subject.

The present position of the West Bengal Government has been succinctly explained by the Chief Minister of West Bengal as follows:

"This Government shares the view that the West Bengal Slaughter Control Act, 1950 should be extended to the entire State. At present it is enforced in all the Municipalities and Corporations and the State Government is making all efforts to ensure that the provisions of the Act are enforced. We would like to bring the entire State under the provisions of this Act as soon as we have built up the necessary infrastructure for enforcing its provisions. You will kindly appreciate that mere extension of the Act without the supporting machinery to enforce the provisions would not be correct."

Therefore, the stand of the West Bengal Government is that the Act is being enforced and further efforts have to be made for the stricter enforcement of the Act. But it is not possible to impose a total ban.

Gandhiji's name has been mentioned. I quote....

MR. SPEAKER: Please conclude now.

SHRI CHITTA BASU: Give one minute for Gandhiji.

MR. SPEAKER: Not for Gandhiji, but for you.

SHRI CHITTA BASU: Gandhiji said:

"The Hindu religion forbids cow slaughter for the Hindus but not for the whole world. The religious prohibition comes from within. Any imposition from without means compulsion. Such compulsion is repugnant to religion."

Therefore, in all humility, I appeal to Vinoba Bhave to give up his fast. (Interruptions). I also want to know from the hon. Minister whether it is not a fact that there are some elements in this country who are out to take advantage of the fast of Vinoba Bhave and encourage forces of obscurantism, Hindu revivalism and Hindu rashtravad and embitter the relations between community and community and whether it is a fact that this has become a source of fear and insecurity to the minority community in the country? If that is so, will the Minister take adequate precautions to see that these forces which represent obscurantism, Hindu revivalism and Hindu rashtravad are not encouraged? Also...

MR. SPEAKER: You must conclude now. Don't record.

SHRI CHITTA BASU:**

(Interruption)**

SHRI H. M. PATEL: Sir, the hon. Member spoke on the basis of the statement I read out and he thought that I signed out West Bengal and

Kerala as being out of line with the rest of the country. That is why he has asked this question, which to my mind is not relevant really to the Calling Attention, which refers to the situation arising out of the indefinite fast of Shri Vinoba Bhave. He referred to the north-eastern States. Shri Vinoba Bhave has expressly said that he does not want that the ban may be made applicable to the North Eastern States. So, that does not arise. Therefore, the only States that remain were the three States at the time when he announced that he would go on fast, namely, West Bengal, Kerala, Goa, Diu and Daman. Goa has agreed to fall in line..... (Interruptions). If you listen, I can tell you. Goa said that it will take action to fall in line with the Supreme Court judgement. If I may point out to my hon. friend the Supreme Court has emphasized these points and summarised them, whatever Shri Siddharath Shankar Ray may say. They are:

"(1) that a total ban on the slaughter of cows of all ages and calves of cows, the buffaloes, male and female, is quite reasonable and is in consonance with the Directive Principles laid down in article 48;

(2) that a total ban on the slaughter of she-buffaloes or breeding bulls or working bullocks as long as they are capable of being used as milch or draught cattle is also reasonable and valid; and

(3) that a total ban on the slaughter of she-buffaloes, bulls and bullocks, if they cease to be capable of yielding milk, or breeding, or working as draught animals cannot be supported as reasonable in the interests of the general public and is invalid."

When we talked to Shri Vinoba Bhave he said that if the States accept the position as set out in the Supreme

[Shri H. M. Patel]

Court judgement, he would be quite satisfied. Now this is what has been put to the two Governments. But, as I said in my statement, these two Governments, for reasons which they certainly consider to be adequate, do not find it possible to do so. I have said nothing more than that. I think this should answer the doubts of my hon. friend.

श्री कंवरलाल गुप्त (दिल्ली सदर) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, गोवध देश में पूर्णतया बन्द हो यह किसी एक पार्टी की नीति नहीं है। यह सारे देश की नीति है। यह देश की भावनाओं के साथ जुड़ा हुआ है विशेषतः किसानों के लिए जिनकी सारी गजर गऊ पर आधारित होती है। इस देश में जितने राजनैतिक दल हैं जिनकी जड़ें भारत की भूमि के साथ बंधी हैं वह इसका समर्थन करते हैं और जिन पार्टियों की जड़ें भारत के बाहर हैं वह इसका विरोध कर रही हैं। अभी एक बात मिस्टर चित्त बसु ने कही कि केरल में और बंगाल में भी कुछ उम्र की गायों के वध पर पूर्ण पाबन्दी है। मैं उनसे पूछना चाहता हूँ कि क्या यह सही बात नहीं है कि यह पाबन्दी होने के बाद भी वहाँ पर छोटे छोटे बछड़े और नौजवान गायें भी काटी जाती हैं?.... (अवधान).... मैं दावे से कहता हूँ कि एक नहीं हजारों गायें काटी जाती हैं, लाखों गायें काटी जाती हैं।.... (अवधान).... मैं चैलेंज के साथ कहता हूँ, ये एन्क्वायरी करा लें कि वहाँ पर जो बछड़े हैं और जो नौजवान गायें हैं क्या वह नहीं काटी जाती हैं? मैं इनको चैलेंज करता हूँ, जूडिशियल इन्क्वायरी हो जाये बंगाल के अन्दर। इसलिए अगर गोवध बन्द होना है तो पूर्णतया होना चाहिए।.... (अवधान)

इनका कहना यह है चित्त बसु जी का कि यू० पी० में और दूसरी स्टेट में नहीं है, तो क्या वह जो दूसरी स्टेट्स हैं उनकी लाइन पर चलने के लिए तैयार हैं? अगर हैं तो वह कहें कि जो यू० पी० में होगा वह बंगाल में और केरल में वह कालो करेंगे, ऐसा वह कहें। वह तैयार नहीं हैं। मेरा कहना यह है.... (अवधान).... गोवध पर पूर्ण प्रतिबन्ध लगाने के सम्बन्ध में नेशनल सोन से बाहर केवल ये दो राज्य केरल और बंगाल हैं, इन दोनों राज्यों को मैं कहूँगा कि ये कम्यूनलिज्म को बढ़ावा दे रहे हैं।

It is nothing but political arrogance, and they want to indulge in a cheap type of communalism.

I am quoting the resolution passed by CPI(M). The heading is. "CPI(M) calls Bhave's Fast 'Religious Fanaticism'". I say it is the height of political fanaticism to call Shri Vinoba Bhave's fast religious fanaticism. You want to have political blackmail, you want to arouse communal tension. You will not be allowed to do it. These two Governments should not be allowed to fish in troubled waters.

मेरा पहला सवाल यह है कि विनोबाजी ने जो व्रत रखा है उसमें उनकी संतुष्टि के लिए इस विषय को आप विधान में संशोधन करके कान-करेंट लिस्ट में लायेंगे या नहीं?

मेरा दूसरा सवाल यह है कि आपने सभी स्टेट्स को डायरेक्शन दी है कि वहाँ से गायें बाहर न जायें, केरल और बंगाल में, तो उसमें क्या प्रोग्रेस हुई है और उन्होंने क्या जवाब दिए हैं?

मेरा तीसरा सवाल यह है क्या आप बीफ का एक्सपोर्ट पूरी तरह से बन्द करेंगे?

SHRI H. M. PATEL: As far as I know, there is already a ban on the export of beef. So far as the other question is concerned, constitutional amendments, etc., that is a long-term question which can be examined.

SHRI KANWAR LAL GUPTA: What is your attitude?

SHRI H. M. PATEL: We will examine it.

SHRI KANWAR LAL GUPTA: What is the reaction of other States to your direction about the export of cattle?

SHRI H. M. PATEL: I have already said in my statement that it is encouraging. I have seen all the replies I have received so far. Each reply is in favour of complying with whatever I have asked.