

12.09 hrs.

STATEMENT RE. CERTAIN INFORMATION GIVEN IN ANSWER TO STARRED QUESTION NO. 961 REGARDING PROPOSAL TO BUY PLANES FROM SOVIET UNION FOR INDIAN AIRLINES.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA (Begusarai) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, Under Direction 115, I want to point out the incorrect and misleading statements in the replies of the Minister of Tourism and Civil Aviation on the 4th May, 1973 to Question No. 961 and some of its supplementaries :

1. On the 4th of May, 1973, while replying to the Starred Question No. 961 by Shri B. S. Bhaura and Shri Sukhdeo Prasad Verma on the purchase of aircraft from the Soviet Union for the Indian Airlines, the Minister of Tourism and Civil Aviation, Dr. Karan Singh stated :

"Soviet teams have visited New Delhi recently and discussed the operational and technical aspects of their TU-154 and YAK-40 aircraft with Indian Airlines. The fleet planning studies of Indian Airlines are still in progress and their proposals are expected next month."

This is at variance with what appears to be the factual position.

I have with me the Indian Airlines Fifth Five Year Plan report—mind you it is the Fifth Five-Year Plan, not the approach to the Fifth Five-Year Plan—which is a hard cover document dated the 15th March, 1973. This document appears to be the final report as :

- (a) It commences with an acknowledgement letter signed by the Chairman, Mr. N. P. Sen (Pages 1 and 2).
- (b) The aircraft considered and proposed for purchase are clearly indicated (Page 62, Chapter D6, Para D-6-1 and Appendix 10, Page 83).

(c) The final **FLEET MIX SOLUTIONS** (Page 68, Chapter D-9) on which the Government will have to take a decision are also proposed in the report. Selection Criteria (Page 72, Para D-11-1) states :

"The present study provides nine multiple objective solutions for the fleet Mix of IA during the Fifth Five Year Plan. The various parameters relevant for a selection have been quantified."

This document would appear to be the final document and it is this document that will be presented next month. *There are therefore, no fleet planning studies in progress within Indian Airlines as claimed by the Minister.*

2. The Minister has not also told the truth when he said in reply to a supplementary question by Shri B. S. Bhaura the following :—

"As I said a number of aircraft are being considered, and the Soviet aircraft *are* among those."

Shri Bhaura had asked :

"Will the Hon Minister consider the greater suitability of the Soviet Aircraft which does not require concrete or tar runway as against the Boeing."

Only one Soviet aircraft is considered in the Indian Airlines report (PAGE 63 PARA D-6-5 and APPENDIX 10, PAGE 83) and this is the TU-154 which does require a concrete runway as against the YAK-40 which does not. *The YAK-40 has not even been mentioned in the I. A. Report.*

3. Further, the Minister did not correctly state the position when he said in reply to a supplementary by Shri Bhagwat Jha Azad regarding definite prejudice in favour of BOEING that "To the best of my knowledge there is no question of prejudice."

In the Indian Airlines report (Page 68 Chapter D-9 FLEET MIX SOLUTIONS and page 83 Appendix 10) only Five types of aircraft have been considered for purchase. These are :

BOEING 737	USA
TU-154	USSR
MERCURE	FRENCH
FOKKER F-28	DUTCH
BAC-111	BRITISH

In all the NINE POSSIBLE FLEET MIX SOLUTIONS in the Indian Airlines report (page 72 para D-11-1 and page 69 para D.9.5) on which the Government will have to make a decision. There is *not one single solution* which does not propose the purchase of ADDITIONAL BOEING 737's. *This clearly establishes a definite prejudice in favour of Boeing* as claimed by Shri Bhagwat Jha Azad.

4. While replying to the same question by Shri Bhagwat Jha Azad the Hon. Minister Dr. Karan Singh said :

"As I said in my reply two Russian Teams had been here recently and an Indian Airlines team is going to Moscow next week and we are giving very full and fair consideration to their plane."

This is again an incorrect statement. In para H. 2.1 page 115 of their report it seems that Indian Airlines have already made up their minds and condemned the purchase of TU-154 as para H. 2.1 having compared the TU-154 to the BOEING 737 states:

"A fleet mix of only TU-154 and our existing fleet, therefore, would not satisfy demand during the plan period."

Chapter H. 1 Page 105 to 114 of the Indian Airlines report assess all the financial implications between the five aircraft considered for purchase.

The Indian Airlines report also includes in :

APPENDIX 9A	Page 81
APPENDIX 11	Pages 84 to 97
APPENDIX 12	Pages 98, 100, 102, 104
APPENDIX 13A	Pages 107A, 107F

All the economic and technical comparisons between the TU-154, the BOEING 737 and the MERCURE and all these comparisons and graphs show the BOEING 737 to be the best solution; *why has then the Indian Airlines sent a team to evaluate the Soviet TU-154* when it appears to have already been evaluated on the basis of comparison with and assessment of other aircraft in the Indian Airlines.

5. To a supplementary by Shri P. M. Sayeed as to whether the WIDE BODIED JETS were being considered and were under the study of Indian Airlines the Hon. Minister for Tourism and Civil Aviation replied categorically "YES". The Hon. Minister informed the House that there were three so called WIDE BODY JETS. Two American and one European Airbus.

The Indian Airlines report (Chapter H.3 SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS Para H.3.4) clearly states: "The fleet solutions studied here do not take into account the possible introduction into service of the WIDE BODY aircraft." The Indian Airlines report makes it clear elsewhere (Para D.6.7 page 64) that the reason for this is that the major American manufacturers (Lockhead, Douglas and Boeing) may be producing twin engine versions of their WIDE BODY AIRCRAFT.

So, these are incorrect and misleading statements which had been made by the Hon. Minister and they require clarification.

THE MINISTER OF TOURISM AND CIVIL AVIATION (DR. KARAN SINGH): Sir, the document dated the 15th March, 1973 referred to by the hon.

[Dr Karan Singh]
Member, contains the Fifth Five-Year Plan proposals of Indian Airlines, which are yet to be studied by the Ministry and the Planning Commission

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA
It is nowhere mentioned

DR KARAN SINGH It is only a proposal

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD It is not mentioned as to why should a proposal go in for Boeing 747

DR KARAN SINGH It provides a broad indication of the Corporation's objectives during the next Plan period and deals with such diverse matters as the level of investment in aircraft and other projects its contribution to the national economy return on investment profitability, employment potential industrial relations, welfare schemes and foreign exchange earnings. The document also deals with alternative fleet mixes but no particular fleet mix has been specifically recommended. This is obviously therefore not a proposal for the purchase of specific aircraft. In fact a team from Indian Airlines is right now in Moscow to study the details and economics of the Soviet TU 154 and YAK 40 aircraft. I may add that the Chairman of the Corporation is visiting Moscow in this connection. It is only after the team returns and its information is studied and assessed by Indian Airlines that the final recommendations for purchase will be submitted by the Corporation to Government. This is expected next month and after that it will be for Government to take a final decision on the number and type of planes to be purchased.

As I have already mentioned, an Indian Airlines team is in Moscow studying details of both the TU-154 and the YAK-40. The TU-154 has been included in the Plan document, but I had suggested that the YAK-40

should also be thoroughly assessed, particularly in view of its reported suitability for short and sub-grade runways. That was my second addition.

It must be borne in mind that the seven Boeing aircraft in the fleet of Indian Airlines have been in satisfactory and profitable operation for over two years. Indian Airlines has invested not only in the planes but in a simulator, sizable stocks of spares and the training of pilots and engineers. These aspects have evidently been kept in view by the Corporation on practical considerations, and there is no question of prejudice.

As mentioned above, no decision has been taken and both the Soviet planes will receive full and fair consideration. I say this with full authority. I am submitting that a study team is in Moscow. Information for TU 154 is not available. Though the team had visited Moscow still more information is required. And so the team has gone to Moscow. The Chairman of the Corporation will also be going. After all the information is collected a final proposal will be made. I have no idea as to what the final proposal will be.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA
But all these studies were rejected

DR KARAN SINGH Because the information was not adequate, it was to get the information that the team had gone to Moscow.

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD Why should they submit the proposal?

DR KARAN SINGH Indian Airlines have given consideration to the introduction of wide-bodied Jets into their fleet and propose to continue these studies, so that if necessary suitable additional proposals can be made to Government in due course.

I submit therefore that I have at no stage given any incorrect information to the House.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA : We demand a full-fledged discussion. There seems to be a big scandal behind it and we should have some opportunity to clarify the points.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU (Diamond Harbour) : Sir, on a point of order, arising out of what the Minister has said.

MR. SPEAKER : If you want to say something, why do you use the point of order?

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD (Bhagalpur) : The Indian Airlines have made up their mind. I thank the Minister for changing that. They are all wrong information and even this statement will require further clarification. How do they make these plans before hand? They all go in for American 737....(Interruptions). The Indian Airlines is trying to scuttle the Indian fleet in favour of Americans; we protest against this..

MR. SPEAKER : If you want to discuss it, you give notice; do not shout now.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU : Only the other day serious corruption charges were levelled against the IAC officials in the matter of the purchase of the aircraft.

MR. SPEAKER : Order, please. We go to the next item.

12.20 hrs.

MATTERS UNDER RULE 377

(i) RE-DAMAGED BRIDGE ON RIVER CHAMBAL ON AGRA-BOMBAY NATIONAL HIGHWAY.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी (ग्वालियर) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप की अनुमति से मैं नियम 377 के अन्तर्गत एक महत्वपूर्ण मामला उठाना चाहता हूँ।

आगरा-बम्बई राज मार्ग पर चम्बल नदी पर एक पुल बना हुआ था जो कई मास से टूटा हुआ पड़ा है। पुल अचानक टूट गया। टेकेदार ने जो पुल के सम्बन्ध में गारन्टी दी

थी उससे पहले ही पुल पानी में धंस गया। परिणाम यह हुआ है कि आज भारी ट्रकों को निकलने के लिए चम्बल नदी पर कोई पुल नहीं है। जो पौन्टून ब्रिज बनाया गया है उस पर छोटी गाड़ियां जा सकती हैं, लेकिन 16 टन के ट्रक नहीं निकल सकते हैं। उन ट्रकों को दिल्ली पहुंचने के लिए अध्यक्ष महोदय, 200 मील का चक्कर लगाना पड़ता है। वह ग्वालियर से झांसी, कालपी, औरैया, इटावा तथा फतेहाबाद होकर दिल्ली आ सकते हैं। इसके परिणाम-स्वरूप उनके लाने का, माल ढोने का व्यय बढ़ गया है।

सेना ने कुछ दिनों के लिए चम्बल नदी को पार करने की दृष्टि से एक फ़ैरी सर्विस चलायी थी। उस ने अच्छा काम किया है और हम सेना के इंजीनियर्स को उस कार्य के लिए धन्यवाद देना चाहते हैं। लेकिन वह फ़ैरी सर्विस भी अब बन्द कर दी गई है।

परिवहन मंत्री सदन में मौजूद हैं, मैं जानना चाहूंगा कि ऐसा पौन्टून ब्रिज क्यों नहीं बनाया जा सकता है जिसके ऊपर से 16 टन के ट्रक निकल सकें? और मैं यह भी जानना चाहता हूँ कि यह चम्बल का पुल स्याई तौर से कब बन कर तैयार होगा?

नौबहन तथा परिवहन मंत्री (श्री राज बहादुर) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, इस दुर्घटना पर सबको खेद है, और जैसे ही यह दुर्घटना हुई इसकी जांच कराई गई और जो भी अंतरिम व्यवस्था हो सकती थी, उसके लिए कोई कोर कसर उठा नहीं रखी गई। तुरन्त डिफ़ेंस के जरिये से, सुरक्षा सेना के जरिये से फ़ैरी सर्विस का इंतजाम किया गया। पौन्टून ब्रिज 25 अप्रैल को खोल दिया गया, और एक कमेटी बैठा दी गई है जांच करने के लिए क्योंकि यह बहुत गम्भीर मामला है, इसमें टेक्नीकल और एंजिनियरिंग, दोनों ही सवाल उठते हैं।

यह दुर्घटना, आप जानते हैं कि चम्बल नदी के ऊपर वहां हुई है जहां चम्बल जमुना से मिलती है, उससे थोड़ी ही दूर पहले ही यह दुर्घटना