

among themselves.

• **SHRI HEM BARUA (Mangaldai) :** It is a matter of privilege, Sir, You were pleased to make a statement on the floor of the House that day saying that the Government should see that a Parliamentary Delegation should be sent to Ladakh to study the situation there. That is the statement you made. What happened? Before your suggestion was in the air, the Chief Minister, Jammu and Kashmir State issued a statement opposing your suggestion. I say, Sir, this is an infringement of the right of this Sovereign Parliament, sovereign forum of this nation, as also your right. The constitution has guaranteed a sort of all India character to Parliament and by issuing that kind of statement the Chief Minister of Jammu and Kashmir has violated not only the constitution but the very sanctity of this honourable House. When you allow that Privilege motion against a Chief Minister of Andhra Pradesh, and you don't allow this Privilege motion against the Government of Jammu and Kashmir, the people might think otherwise, Sir.

SHRI NATH PAI (Rajapur) : There is a qualitative difference between the two motions. I would not even remotely insinuate that you encouraged the other motion and are against this one. But I would point out that when this point was mentioned regarding what was happening in Ladakh, you are on record as having said that Shri Limaye, Shri Joshi and Nath Pai could go to Hyderabad, but you hastened to point out that so far as Ladakh was concerned, a delegation would have to be organised and Government would have to assist. It is because Chief Ministers are gradually arrogating to themselves the authority to defy and bring into contempt whatever you say that we have brought this motion. I am not concerned whether it is Shri Sadiq or Shri Brahmananda Reddy, but these provincial satraps need to be informed and disciplined a little that they cannot go on making a mockery in this way of the authority of Parliament. It is this point that is important.

MR. SPEAKER : Once the House has taken a decision, the point becomes

clear. Shri Hem Barua said that I admitted the other motion; I was not here at that time.

SHRI NATH PAI : You called Shri Brahmananda Reddy.

MR. SPEAKER : I said, before I left, that I would forward it to the Prime Minister. Later on I was not here at the time it was taken up here. On that the House has taken a decision that there is absolutely no privilege involved. Now I say there is much less case in this. But that does not prevent the Government of India from sending some people. You may not call it a parliamentary delegation. If you go through the records, you will see that this is what I said. I said Government might consider it because it is a far-flung place; sending a delegation or deputation was a matter Government might consider. Even now Government may consider it. That stands. What I said on that day stands.

But as I said, there is no privilege in this case.

12.43 hrs.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE
FOURTH FIVE YEAR PLAN DRAFT

MR. SPEAKER : Shrimati Indira Gandhi.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE (Kanpur) :
On a point of order.

श्री जार्ज फरनेन्डीज (बम्बई दक्षिण) :
अध्यक्ष महोदय, इस विषय पर मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है।

MR. SPEAKER : There is no *Vyavasta* now.

SHRI P. K. DEO (Kalahaudi) : There are conflicting reports in the press about the deliberations of the NDC. We want to know the factual position.....

MR. SPEAKER : I will take up one by one. Shri Fernandes.

श्री जार्ज फरनेन्डीज : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं

घ्राडर पेपर को लेकर व्यवस्था का प्रश्न उठा रहा हूँ। आप घ्राडर पेपर को पढ़ें। घ्राइटम नं. 3 में है :

Shrimati Indra Gandhi to lay on the Table a copy of the 'Fourth Five Year Plan 1969-74-Draft.'

फाइव ईयर प्लान का जो ड्राफ्ट है उस-पर नेशनल डेवलपमेंट कौंसिल में पिछले दो दिनों बहस चली। कल और आज के अखबारों में हमने पढ़ा कि तीन राज्यों के मुख्य मंत्रियों ने इस पर मिनिट आफ डिसेन्ट देने का भी काम किया है.....

MR. SPEAKER : He is going into the merits which is not allowed.

श्री जार्ज कारनेन्डीज : मैं मेरिट्स में नहीं जा रहा हूँ।

यह जो घ्राडर पेपर सकुलेट किया गया है फोर्थ फाइव ईयर प्लान के ड्राफ्ट पर, उसपर कल और परसों बहस हुई, शुक्रवार को यह सकुलेट किया गया, इसपर मिनिट्स आफ डिसेन्ट भी दिये गये हैं, ऐसी दशा में घ्राडर पेपर पर जो लिखा है वह भ्रष्टा है, इसमें पूरी बात नहीं बताई गई है, ड्राफ्ट के साथ-साथ मिनिट्स आफ डिसेन्ट भी इस सदन के सामने आने चाहिए थे क्योंकि नेशनल डेवलपमेंट कौंसिल में एक मत से इसको पास नहीं किया गया है, केवल कन्सेन्स से ही इसको पास करने का काम किया गया है।

SHRI P. K. DEO : In view of conflicting reports appearing in the Press regarding the proceedings of the NDC, we would like to know if the Draft has been endorsed by the NDC in full or has been endorsed by the majority (*Interruptions*). Also we like the proceedings of the NDC to be supplied to us to find out what were the opinions expressed.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE (Kanpur) : My objection is this. It is quite clear from the newspapers that at least three

Chief Ministers have sent a note of dissent.

MR. SPEAKER ; Everybody knows that there is dissent.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : Unless the draft that is now being placed before the House has also that dissenting note we do not know the full picture. There should be some indication in the Plan what concensus was arrived at and what particular changes have been suggested but were not agreed to, etc.

श्री मधु लिमये (मुंगेर) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आज के घ्राडर पेपर पर इस चीज को लेकर एक दूसरे विषय के सम्बन्ध में श्री तापुरिया का बयान आने वाला है। चौथी योजना का जो मसविदा अभी श्रीमती इंदिरा गांधी येश करने जा रही हैं उसका बहुत सारा हिस्सा अखबारों में पहले ही आ चुका मैं।... (ब्यवधान)... पहले पार्लियामेंट के सामने आना चाहिए।... (ब्यवधान)... चूंकि यह सवाल उठ रहा है इसलिए मैं चाहता हूँ कि इसका भी खुलासा किया जाये।

MR. SPEAKER : Let the draft be placed on the Table and only then we shall know whether the notes of dissent are there and what it contains. This is not the end of the matter ; it will be discussed in the House. I have given Mr. Fernandes a chance and he should not rise again when I am on my legs. The draft Plan should be placed on the Table of the House and only then you may know whether it is upto the mark and whether the dissenting notes are there or not.

SHRI TENNETI VISWANATHAN (Visakhapatnam) : I shall not go into merits. This morning when I was coming in the train I read the whole Plan printed in the *Hindustan Times*. What is it she is now going to place before Parliament ?

MR. SPEAKER : The N. D. C. meets and so many Chief Ministers and other Ministers are there. To say that it

[Mr. Speaker]

will not go to the Press at all is to say the impossible.....(Interruptions.) it has been coming bit by bit, so many times. There will also be a discussion on this Plan. So many Members of the Planning Commission, committees and the Sub-committees all met and it has all come in the Press now and then.

श्री रवि राय (पुरी) : पहले लोक सभा में भ्राना चाहिए था ।

श्री मधु लिमवे : अध्यक्ष महोदय, एक बात की धोर ध्यान दिया जाए कि एन० डी० सी० का कोई आफिशल स्टेटस नहीं है ।

MR. SPEAKER : The Prime Minister will lay it on the Table of the House.

THE PRIME MINISTER, MINISTER OF ATOMIC ENERGY AND MINISTER OF PLANNING (SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI) : I lay on the Table a copy of the "Fourth Five Year Plan 1969—74—Draft."... (Interruptions)

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : What about the notes of some Chief Ministers ?

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : ...and an attached brief note... [Placed in Library. See No. LT—823 /69. (Interruptions)]

MR. SPEAKER : I shall allow a discussion.

REPORTS OF THE INDIAN DELEGATION TO THE TWENTY-FIRST WORD HEALTH ASSEMBLY HELD AT GENEVA IN MAY, 1968

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY PLANNING AND WORKS, HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT (DR. S. CHANDRASEKHAR) : On behalf of Shri K. K. Shah I lay on the Table a copy of the Report of the Indian Delegation to the Twenty-first World Health Assembly held at Geneva in May 1968. [Placed in Library. See No. LT—824 /69].

श्री जार्ज करनेन्डीज : अध्यक्ष महोदय

मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है । हेल्थ मिनिस्टर के बयान पर मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है ।

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Fernandes has had his say and must resume his seat. There are other hon. Members who want to participate. Shri Mukerjee.

SHRI H. N. MUKERJEE (Calcutta North-East) : I only wanted to ascertain if it was fair to the House and to say that as soon as ever it was possible to have the chance of discussing it we must do so because of certain reports circulated in the Press.

MR. SPEAKER : He wants only a discussion. We agree to discuss it ; we have always discussed it.

श्री जार्ज करनेन्डीज ; ब्राइटम 4 पर मैं ने व्यवस्था उठाई थी, आपने मुझे सुना ही नहीं ;

इस व्यवस्था के सम्बन्ध में मेरा आपसे निवेदन है कि आप जरा इस ब्राइटम को पढ़ें :

"Shri K. K. Shah to lay on the Table a copy of the Report of the Indian Delegation to the Twenty-first World Health Assembly held at Geneva in May, 1968."

एक साल पहले डब्ल्यू० एच० प्रो० के कांस्टीट्यूशन के आधार पर जो वर्ल्ड हेल्थ असेम्बली जेनेवा में हुई इसमें देश का एक प्रतिनिधि भंडल गया था । एक वर्ष के बाद उसकी रिपोर्ट इस सदन के सामने पेश की जा रही है ।

COAL MINES (CONSERVATION AND SAFETY) AMENDMENT RULES

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PETROLEUM AED CHEMICALS AND MINES AND METALS (SHRI JAGANATH RAO) : I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the Coal Mines (Conservation and Safety) Amendment Rules, 1969, published in Notification No. G. S. R. 938 in Gazette of