

LOK SABHA

Wednesday, August 21, 1968/Śravana
30, 1890 (Saka)

The Lok Sabha met at Eleven of the
Clock

(MR. SPEAKER in the Chair)

RE: SITUATION IN CZECHOSLO- VAKIA

SHRI RANGA: I am sorry to trouble you. Before you start the proceedings of the Question Hour, will you be good enough to give us some time to raise the question of invasion of Czechoslovakia and the destruction of human rights.

MR. SPEAKER: I have received adjournment motions, call-attention notices and all sorts of motions. Naturally Government also perhaps will be considering ...

THE PRIME MINISTER, MINISTER OF ATOMIC ENERGY, MINISTER OF PLANNING AND MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI-MATI INDIRA GANDHI): We did send a message that I would make a statement but I would prefer to make it a little later in the afternoon... (Interruptions).

श्री रवि राय (पुरी): प्रधानमंत्री को इस की निन्दा करनी चाहिए। यह मानवाधिकारों का सवाल है, इस पर डिस्कशन होना चाहिए।

SHRI M. L. SONDHI: You stand condemned. There is no sense of urgency ... (Interruptions) There should be some reaction... (Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER: Order, order. So many of you are standing. What can I do?

SHRI KANWAR LAL GUPTA: Why should you tolerate this cold-blooded

murder? Government should condemn it. You must come out with a substantive motion... (Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER: Will all of you please sit down? After all, it is not a question of any party. Dozens of Congress members have also given this. All of us, including the Congressmen, the whole country, is horrified at this. There are no two opinions about it. It is not a question of any party. Let us do what we can do without shouting, in a dignified way. This morning a number of hon. friends met me and we have been discussing...

श्री रवि राय: हम सब आप से मिले थे। यह ह्यूमन राइट्स का सवाल है।

MR. SPEAKER: The Prime Minister also sent a word. Dr. Ram Subhag Singh conveyed it to me. Let me see. There are no two opinions about it that we should discuss and express our opinion.

श्री रवि राय: प्रधानमंत्री निन्दा करें तो ठीक है।

MR. SPEAKER: We are all horrified. Naturally we will have to express in some shape the opinion of the country and the people. Parliament reflects the people. So, let us do it. But please give me time. In the afternoon we shall see how we shall do and what we shall do ... (Interruptions).

SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK: Here is a very urgent matter. The armies of three or four countries are marching towards Czechoslovakia. If we take some time to express our opinion, by that time this poor country will be eaten away by those countries which have invaded it, and there will be no use. Therefore, it is very important that we give expression to the view, not of any party but of the whole country, the feeling of horror and condemnation, immediately.

SHRI M. R. MASANI: Will the Prime Minister assure us that at 12 O' Clock she will come forward and tell us what she wants to do. We must have an answer by 12 O' Clock.

श्री जार्ज करनेग्नीज : जेकोस्लोवाकिया सरकार से उन के पास कोई पत्र या सन्देश आया है या नहीं इस का भी खुलासा होना चाहिए।

श्री सिव नारायण : यह बड़ा गम्भीर प्रश्न है। प्राइम मिनिस्टर ने एग्जोरेंस दिया है स्टेटमेंट देने का। उन को सोच कर मुनासिब बयान देना चाहिए।

श्री रवि राय : आज 8 बजे आल इंडिया रेडियो से यह खबर आई कि तीनी देशों की सेनाओं ने मार्च किया है जेकोस्लोवाकिया की टेरिटरी में। इस में सब से बड़ा सवाल मानवाधिकारों का है। इस लिये यह अच्छा होगा कि आज सारे राष्ट्र की ओर से और लोक सभा की ओर से हम इस की निन्दा करें। यह प्रधान मंत्री का कोई अपना सवाल नहीं है। प्रधान मंत्री को इस को कंडेम करना चाहिए।

SHRI NATH PAI: I want to make a procedural point. What I have to say substantially, I will say later.

You have already spoken not only for this House but for the entire Indian nation. We have been horrified by this brutal act of aggression of the small nation under the name of friendship.

We shall say what we want to say later on. But at this stage, may I plead with you that under Direction 2, you may be pleased to direct that the business before the House be suspended and our substantive motion be taken up for discussion by the House immediately?

SHRI HANUMANTHAIYA: This House has great respect for you, and in a few words, you have crystallised the feeling of the House and also of the country. I am not speaking in a partisan way. I appreciate the earnestness of the Leaders of the Opposition and the Members of the Opposi-

tion parties. They themselves say that the Prime Minister must make a statement in a particular manner.

SHRI M. L. SONDHI: Condemning the aggression. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDI: Even on such an issue as this, the Congress Members want to shout?

SHRI HANUMANTHAIYA: They must be able to sit with the Prime Minister and have a little talk over the matter. Without that joint talk, how can a satisfactory statement be evolved?

Secondly, we have to know all aspects of the matter before we take a decision. Once we take a decision we stick to it. It must be appreciated not only by every party in this country but also by world opinion. Therefore, if it is a matter of one or two hours, nothing is lost. On the other hand, the forging of a united front on this matter by every political party could easily be achieved.

I am one of those who have been pleading again and again with the Leaders of the Opposition parties to see areas where we could come to an agreement with Government so that this House can act unitedly and purposefully.

SHRI NATH PAI: Let us adjourn so that we can go for discussions with the Prime Minister. We can adjourn immediately and meet her.

SHRI M. L. SONDHI: They are stooges...(*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL WELFARE AND IN THE MINISTRY OF PETROLEUM AND CHEMICALS (SHRI MUTHYAL RAO): I object to this kind of remark. Why should he say that we are stooges?

SHRI M. L. SONDHI: You are condemned. You stand condemned. If this country becomes a stooges we shall not stand it. We represent the youth of India, and we represent the future. Let the past bury itself. You

are a double stooge. You do not think for yourself. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDI: Should the Congress Members shout even on an issue like this.

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL: Are we to tolerate such remarks?

SHRI HANUMANTHAIYA: My hon. friend Shri M. L. Sondhi must purposefully channel his patriotic and righteous indignation instead of calling us names. We do not deserve to be called names.

श्री रवि राय : आप भी पैट्रियट हैं ।

SHRI HANUMANTHAIYA: We in the Congress also are with them in the matter of...

SHRI NATH PAI: In condemning the aggression.

SHRI HANUMANTHAIYA: ...expressing a common opinion; and a common opinion cannot be had by shouting at one another.

AN HON. MEMBER: Let us express our righteous indignation.

SHRI HANUMANTHAIYA: I may tell you that there are other parties, the Communist Parties, and we must take them also into our confidence. They are not foreigners to our country....

SHRI NATH PAI: They are welcome to join us.

SHRI HANUMANTHAIYA: Therefore, I would suggest that this country should evolve a consensus of opinion on national matters, particularly in foreign affairs. It is for them and the Leader of the House to think over this subject for one or two hours and then evolve a statement.

SHRI HEM BARUA: May I make one submission? When Egypt was attacked, we did not go in for any confabulations with the Prime Minister. The Prime Minister came to the House and condemned this attack roundly and she did a very right thing. Now, what is happening is that Czechoslovakia has been invaded.

Therefore, the Prime Minister should immediately come forward and condemn the aggression.

SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK: We are aggrieved, because this issue was raised about three days back and we had given a joint motion and the Government of India have refused to come out with a clear statement. We expected the Prime Minister to come out with a clear statement.

MR. SPEAKER: I am afraid this would not help us...

SHRI RANGA: I am told that AIR has not yet come out with this news. Is that correct?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI B. R. BHAGAT): It has come out with the news. It is a tragedy that the hon. Member does not listen even to our radio.

श्री कंबर लाल गुप्त : लेटेस्ट न्यूज यह है कि राष्ट्रपति को घेर लिया गया है। रशियन फोर्सोंने राष्ट्रपति के पैलेस को घेर लिया है।

SHRI RANGA: I am glad to find that the Minister of External Affairs who is generally tongue-tied and constipated in his expression of the resentment of the House and the opinion of this country has at last become suddenly excited and also eloquent. I have not heard what he has said..

MR. SPEAKER: He has said that the radio has announced the news.

SHRI RANGA: I said that I spoke subject to correction. I am glad that All India Radio has given this news. But how long is it going to take for the Government to consider this matter and place their view and also help us to place our view before the country as well as the world?

Again I am told, I speak subject to correction again, that the Soviet and other troops have already surrounded Prague and are now trying to capture the whole of that Government and the whole of that country and destroy the soul of that country. Are we going to wait for too many

hours? My hon. friend Shri Hanumanthaiya was talking about consensus and said that we should explore areas of agreement and see whether it would be possible for us all to express our opinion taking a national view of things. But what is it that the Prime Minister has done? What is it that the whole of her Cabinet has done?...

MR. SPEAKER: I am afraid hon. Members have already begun a discussion.

SHRI RANGA: While we were trying to reach you, did they ever try to consult any of us, to reach us and to enlighten us and give us information and take us into their confidence?

श्री एस० एम० जोशी : जो कांग्रेस के नेता श्री हनुमन्तय्या जी ने कहा है कि उन लोगों को भी चिन्ता है और दुख है और भोर्नि है, उसको मैं मानता हूँ। मैं जानता हूँ कि जैसे हम लोगों को चिन्ता इसके बारे में है वैसे ही उनको भी है। यह भी मैं मान्य करने के लिए तैयार हूँ कि यहां एक दम कोई प्रस्ताव नहीं लाया जा सकता है। लेकिन हमारी जो भावनायें हैं उनको हमें अगर जाहिर करना है तो हमारे मित्र ने जो प्रस्ताव रखा है कि हाउस को इस वक्त हम एडजर्न कर दें और उधर और उधर के सभी नेता बैठ कर इस पर विचार करें कि कैसा सबस्टेविंग मोशन होना चाहिये और उसके बारे में फैसला करके फिर अपनी कार्रवाई को शुरू करें, तो ज्यादा अच्छा होगा।

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI: If I may deal with what my hon. friend Shri Ranga has said, we were having a meeting amongst ourselves naturally, first, and then because it was a Question Hour and it is Question Hour for me, I had to come here immediately. It is not right for hon. Members of the Opposition to presume what I am going to say. They do not know what I am going to say. What I had requested was...

SHRI M. L. SONDHI: She had misled the House in her last statement.

MR. SPEAKER: She has a right to reply. This kind of interruption cannot be tolerated.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI: These are very serious matters and if the Opposition would like to meet me, certainly we can meet together. But if Shri Nath Pai will permit me to say so, I do not think that it would be right to adjourn the House for this.

SHRI RABI RAY: Why not?

SHRI M. L. SONDHI: Why not?

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI: No. That these are serious developments. What we say is not going to make any difference there; the Soviet tanks are not going to be recalled by our saying anything here. Our Government has to consider every word before it makes a statement. That is why, I have said that I shall make a statement afterwards; I shall be here in the House until after 12 noon, and it is only after that that I can do it....

SHRI M. L. SONDHI: Procrastination.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI: But I have said that I shall make the statement some time this afternoon..

SHRI M. L. SONDHI: You are following Chamberlain's policy that it is a far away country.

SHRI M. R. MASANI: Under rule 32 I would request you to adjourn the House: The rule says that the first hour shall be devoted to questions, but you Sir, have a right to direct otherwise. Therefore, I would request that you may be pleased to direct that the question Hour be suspended. Let the House adjourn immediately, and let the Prime Minister tell us her proposals about how we should deal with this matter at 12 noon. You have the right to suspend the Question Hour under rule 32.

MR. SPEAKER: On this matter, I would not like the House to divide. If the House wishes to adjourn, I have no objection. But I shall not myself take that decision. Nor do I want the House to divide on this issue

If the Leaders want to meet the Prime Minister, they can certainly go and meet her. The rest of the members can continue with the Question Hour. If the Prime Minister is making a statement today, we shall have a discussion about it this afternoon.

SHRI BALRAJ MADHOK: At the earliest today.

MR. SPEAKER: I am myself saying that. Therefore, let us not do anything now which will bring down the standard we have kept up.

SHRI KANWAR LAL GUPTA: Does the Prime Minister agree to meet the Leaders of the Opposition?

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI: Not now; after the Question Hour. If they do not want me to be present in the House now, then Shri Bhagat can deal with the questions concerning my Ministry.

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDI: We have this assurance that sometime in the afternoon we will discuss this matter and that the Prime Minister will make a statement.

MR. SPEAKER: Yes. But I cannot assure him on which motion we shall discuss because there are a bundle of motions before me.

श्री राम सेवक यादव : प्रश्न चल सकते हैं लेकिन—

MR. SPEAKER: I am on my legs. No second round of discussion now. If the Leaders want to meet the Prime Minister even during the Question Hour, I would suggest they could go. Shri Bhagat and the other Ministers here will carry on with the Question Hour and answer on behalf of Government. It all depends on the Leaders and the Prime Minister. But I would suggest that we shall go ahead with the Question Hour.

श्री राम सेवक यादव : प्रधान मंत्री और नेता लोग अभी जा कर आपस में बातचीत कर सकते हैं।

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

DEPRIVATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS IN TIBET

+

*571. **SHRI RANGA:**

SHRI K. M. KUSHIK:

SHRI GADILINGANA

GOWD:

SHRI C. C. DESAI:

SHRI M. L. SONDI:

SHRI N. K. SOMANI:

Will the Minister of **EXTERNAL AFFAIRS** be pleased to state whether, in view of the changed circumstances in the Asian political situation and of the declaration of 1968 as the Human Rights Year by the United Nations, the Government of India would sponsor or co-sponsor a Resolution in the next session of the U.N. General Assembly against the continued deprivation of the Human Rights in Tibet and an appeal to humanity as a whole to the conscience of China to release the Tibetans from her stranglehold?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI B. R. BHAGAT): The Government will support any General Assembly Resolution calling for the cessation of practices which result in the deprivation of fundamental Human rights in Tibet.

SHRI RANGA: Just now the House is so full of what is happening in Czechoslovakia and the destruction of her human rights. Now the House should be in a position to appreciate even much more poignantly what has been happening for the past twelve years, if not for a much longer period, in Tibet. Why is it that the Government of India do not wish to take any initiative even now, at such a late hour, in asking the UN to take necessary steps and measures to get this question examined on the basis of human rights and enlighten the whole world as to what exactly and to what extent and in what horrible manner the civil and human rights of the people of Tibet are being destroyed?