

[Mr. Speaker]

given permission to any other motion. You may write to me ten times. Unless I give you the permission, 'how can you move it? Why do all of you get up when there is no intimation from you? Why do you all get up when you do not know whether your motion has been permitted to be moved or not. Do not do that.

12.39 hrs.

**RE DISTRIBUTION OF ALLEGEDLY  
OFFENSIVE CALENDARS TO  
M. Ps.**

**SHRI S. A. SHAMIM (Srinagar) :** May I raise the privilege motion?

**MR. SPEAKER :** There is no privilege motion at all. You cannot move that. You may only make a submission.

**Shri S. A. SHAMIM :** Let me make a submission. And let this House decide whether there is privilege involved.

**MR. SPEAKER :** There is no question of the House deciding about that. Please do not do that.

**SHRI S. A. SHAMIM :** It is a question of privilege. If that is not a question of privilege, you may decide about that.

**MR. SPEAKER :** If somebody had distributed calendars, how can this be considered as a breach of a privilege of this House?

At the most, he can invite the attention of the House to it. It is not a question of breach of privilege. No, I am not allowing it.

**SHRI S. A. SHAMIM :** An objectionable calendar is being distributed among Members of Parliament and it continues to be distributed.

**MR. SPEAKER :** By whom?

**SHRI S. A. SHAMIM :** By the Parliament Secretariat.

I want the entire House to see this calendar published by the Punjab Government. It is highly offensive and highly communal. We have a National Integration Council and we are celebrating the 800th anniversary of Baba Farid. But this is the calendar which is being published and it is being circulated by the Parliament Secretariat. This is published by the Punjab Government. I would like the House to know what this calendar contains. An offence under section 153 IPC is being committed in the House.....

**MR. SPEAKER :** I do not know if there is anything wrong with it.

**SHRI S. A. SHAMIM :** It is a question of exposing scenes like this.

**SHRI PILOO MODY (Godhra) :** Are you sitting in judgement on what is happening? Otherwise, why should you say that you do not see anything wrong with it? I see plenty of wrong with it.

**SHRI S. A. SHAMIM :** Kindly allow me to make my submission. You will have to see this before you decide.

**श्री सतिश कुमार (दिल्ली) :** इस कैलेंडर को ब्रेन कर देना चाहिए और जिस प्रेस में यह छपा है, उस को जप्त कर लेना चाहिये। इन बारे में हम सब लोग सहमत हैं। यह बहुत गलत है।

**श्री सतपाल कपूर (पटियाला) :** इस कैलेंडर को पंजाब गवर्नमेंट ने नहीं छपा है।

**MR. SPEAKER :** I have not allowed it today.

**SHRI K. LAKKAPPA (Tumkur) :** It only pertains to the Punjab Government. He has not raised any issue which is relevant for being discussed here.

MR. SPEAKER : What is it that has happened in this House if something is being distributed outside.

SHRI S. A. SHAMIM : What has happened is that it is being distributed through the Parliament Secretariat.

SHRI H. N. MUKERJEE (Calcutta—North-East) : If Parliament Secretariat inadvertently distributes to Members of Parliament a blatantly communal document with illustrations in a spirit which goes entirely against national integration, surely it is a matter of which the House should take note and it should stop that practice.

MR. SPEAKER : So many things come and they are sent for distribution, like calendars and diaries etc.

SHRI S. A. SHAMIM : Not so many things. The relevant Direction is Direction No. 125, under which only certain specified things can be circulated. This is not a post office for any private agency.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Alipore) : It is a Government firm.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA (Begusarai) : I want to make a submission. First of all, we would like to know what the complaint exactly is so that we as a House may be in a position to know whether a breach of privilege has occurred or not.

SHRI S. A. SHAMIM : Why don't you permit me to explain about the breach of privilege? That is a fundamental right.....

MR. SPEAKER : I have not allowed anything today. I had called the Law Minister on the question of Pondicherry Budget.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA : The point is that an hon. Member of the House wants to submit that a breach of privilege has occurred. The

House would like to know what is the offence that has been committed, so that the House may be in a position to make up its mind on whether a breach of privilege has occurred or not. Why are you depriving the Members and subsequently the House of the right to know whether a breach of privilege has occurred or not?

MR. SPEAKER : Let him please sit down. Some calendar is being circulated and that is all.

SHRI S. A. SHAMIM : Not some calendar. But it is a Government publication, which is highly communal.

MR. SPEAKER : All right, it is a Government publication. Whether it is within the proper limits or not, it is distributed to the Members, and the hon. Member can make a submission but not on a point of privilege.

SHRI S. A. SHAMIM : Please allow me to make my submission. Why don't you allow me?

MR. SPEAKER : I do not allow it today. I have not allowed anything today.

SHRI S. A. SHAMIM : It continues to be distributed by the Parliament Secretariat...

MR. SPEAKER : Will he kindly sit down now? I have not allowed any motion today.

SHRI S. A. SHAMIM : I submit that the distribution of the same must be stopped for the time being till you finally make up your mind.

MR. SPEAKER : That can be considered.

श्री जयु लियवे (बांका) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरा पायट भाक भांडर है। कुछ दिन पहले एक कांग्रेस के सदस्य ने ही मुझे यह कैलेंडर दिखाया था और उस को देखने के बाद मुझे ऐसा लगा कि यह बहुत नाजुक मामला है, और अगर इसके बारे में पहले ही कार्यवाही हो जायेगी और सबन में यह मामला नहीं आयेगा, तो अच्छा होगा। इस लिए मैंने उन को सलाह दी कि वह प्रधान मंत्री और गृह मंत्री से बात करे। कम से कम उस के बाद इस कैलेंडर को बिदडा कर लिया जाता, लेकिन मुझे अफसोस है कि ऐसा नहीं किया गया। मैं यह मामला पंद्रह दिन पहले उठा सकता था। लेकिन विभिन्न समुदायों के बीच दुश्मनी पैदा न हो, इस लिए मैंने उन को यह सलाह दी थी। अगर सरकार इस बारे में कार्यवाही नहीं करती है, तो फिर सदस्यों के सामने दूसरा क्या रास्ता रह जाता है? इस लिए प्राप सरकार को आदेश दे कि वह इस पर विचार करके इस कैलेंडर को वापिस ले ले।

श्री सतपाल कपूर : अध्यक्ष महोदय, इस कैलेंडर को मैं भी कनडेम करता हूँ। मैं चढ़ीगढ़ गया था। जिस कोऑपरेटिव सोसायटी की तरफ से यह कैलेंडर छपा है, उस के—मार्केट के—मैनेजिंग डाइरेक्टर, श्री ए० एम० पुनी, ने कहा है कि हम यह कैलेंडर बिदडा कर लेंगे।

श्री जयु लियवे : इस पर ज्ञानी जैलमिह का सदेश है।

श्री सतपाल कपूर : वह गवर्नमेंट का सदेश नहीं है। मैं भी इस कैलेंडर का कनडेम करता हूँ। इस को बैन करना चाहिए। लेकिन यह कहना उचित है कि इस को पंजाब गवर्नमेंट ने छपा है।

SHRI S. A. SHAMIM : The Punjab Government which has printed it is ashamed of its publication and says this is objectionable. But you in your wisdom say that there is nothing objectionable in this.

MR. SPEAKER : Please sit down. I have seen these pictures. I have seen a lot of them in Punjab, not only in calendars produced by Government, but everywhere, in museums, in colleges and schools.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU : Shame.

MR. SPEAKER : There is no question of shame.

SHRI S. A. SHAMIM : This is maligning a particular community. This is preaching communalism...

MR. SPEAKER : Please sit down. Do not talk like that.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU : You should make an observation condemning this.

MR. SPEAKER : I have nothing to say on it. But it needs examination.

SHRI S. A. SHAMIM : Do you give me the right to raise this issue later?

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : On the bottom of the sheet of this calendar, it is clearly written that is produced by the Punjab Government Co-operative Marketing Federation.

SHRI S. A. SHAMIM : The Joint Secretary, Development, has published it.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : First of all, there must be pictures like this in museums and other places.

MR. SPEAKER : Yes.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : But the fact remains—you have seen these pictures—that they are pictures of all sorts of alleged gruesome and ghastly atrocities committed by a particular community against a particular community. Do you think that it is right for such pictures to be incorporated in a calendar and that calendar to be distributed through your office to all the MPs? Why should that be done?—Just to hurt the susceptibilities of some people against others? It goes against the whole secular concept and atmosphere.

MR. SPEAKER. It is not a question like that. Many things, like calendars, diaries and other things come. When, of course, a Government sends these things, there is bound to be no suspicion about it.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA. It is very bad.

MR. SPEAKER. But one thing is very clear. Besides this, there are some pictures about the fight against the British. There is the Panya Sahib. There are also pictures of fight against the tyranny of some Moghul rulers or others.

SHRI S. A. SHAMIM. I am afraid you are lending justification to it. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER. After all they are there. They are historical reproductions. Tomorrow you will say that there are many places in Delhi, why are they standing there as permanent reminders of certain tyranny? The case is not like that and so simple.

SHRI S. A. SHAMIM. Does it mean that history is to be written like this?

MR. SPEAKER. It is a few individuals, not the whole community. We are very proud of our good relations with Muslim community but not tyrants. Why identify community with them?

THE PRIME MINISTER, MINISTER OF ATOMIC ENERGY, MINISTER OF ELECTRONICS AND MINISTER OF SPACE (SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI)

*rose—*

SHRI A. K. GOPALAN (Palghat). It is not a question of only a calendar being distributed. There is no objection if a calendar is distributed by the Secretariat. But the calendar that is distributed contains pictures which go against the policy of Government in regard to national integration and also communal harmony. It

shows two communities fighting against each other. Suppose this calendar is hung in a house where young boys see it, where two communities are fighting against each other, not only fighting but brutality is being committed. What will be the result? The calendar is for seeing, it will be hung in a house and even children will see that. So the question is not that the office here is distributing the calendars. The question is what will be the effect of this distribution of these calendars by this Secretariat? Will it not go against the very principle and policies of the Government when every day they are saying that there must be national integration and communal harmony? That is the main question.

SHRI H. N. MUKERJEE *rose—*

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI. Why should you get up Mr. Mukerjee? I had got up, but in deference to Mr. Gopalan, I sat down. The Speaker even looked at me and asked me to get up.

Sir, this is a very delicate subject, and, if my hon. friends opposite will excuse me, I think no useful purpose will be served in prolonging a discussion on it.

SOME HON. MEMBERS. Stop it. *(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI. I may be mistaken, but I was told that the distribution has stopped.

AN HON. MEMBER. No. *(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI. This was the information which was given to me. If it is incorrect, I shall look into it again.

SHRI PILOO MODY. And also dismiss the person who gave you wrong information.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** The hon. House is quite right in being concerned about the pictures or written matters which can hurt any one community or all communities or anybody, and Government certainly is not in favour of such things. But some events are part of history. I do not say that they should be portrayed or not, but we should also be able to see them in perspective. I think that we should so train our children and our young people as well as others not to get excited about something that has happened long ago.

**SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA :** Have you seen the pictures ?

**SHRI S. A. SHAMIM :** Old men also are excited.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** All right; old men also are.

**SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA :** Historical pictures should not have been depicted in this particular fashion. Please have a look at them. (*Interruptions*).

**MR. SPEAKER :** Will you please listen to the Prime Minister ?

**SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU :** Out of 12 pictures, seven are definitely bad. We certainly welcome the other five pictures which depict fighting against British imperialism. (*Interruptions*). Please have a look at them.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** I think that we are all aware of the sense of the House now, and we can take action accordingly. No purpose will be served by having a discussion here.

**SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA :** The point is that it has already been distributed. What do you say about its distribution by a State Government which is an act against the policy of the Government of India. What is the effect of this ? (*Interruptions*).

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** The State Government may be mistaken. I am not condoning these pictures at all. I have strong feelings about pictures, and I do not particularly like this type of pictures, but unfortunately in India—I do not mean just this particular calendar—such pictures which are supposed to be realistic pictures, as the hon. Speaker has said, are distributed and they do exist. I am not condoning them in any way, because my views happen to be different. But we have to see the matter in the context of what has been happening in the country.

Now, the question is, (a) whether they should have been distributed. That is for the hon. Speaker to decide and take a decision for the future on such distribution.

**SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA :** Such things are there elsewhere also.

(*Interruptions*)

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** Elsewhere—we should certainly look into it. As I said, I may have been given wrong information, but I was under the impression that the distribution has been stopped. If it has not been stopped, it will be looked into. I should like to make one other comment. The Government of Punjab might have acted unimaginatively but I do not think there was any deliberate intention to hurt anybody or to go against our secular policy. I must say the Punjab Government is an entirely secular Government and the Ministries are specially concerned about the minorities.

**SHRI S. A. SHAMIM :** You are actually condoning this, whatever you may say.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** I am not condoning it. I am merely saying that it is a delicate subject and let us not say something which may provoke other repercussions and reactions. This is all I am

saying. So far as this particular subject is concerned, we can look into it. If the distribution has not been stopped, then it will be looked into.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur) : Mr. Speaker, Sir....

(Interruptions)

This is a different matter. I am raising something else.

I have brought to your notice a very serious issue.

MR. SPEAKER : What is that ?

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : You know that the Prime Minister is visiting Poona on the 6th of this month. One of the Ministers of Maharashtra has declared that when the Prime Minister goes to Poona on the 6th of this month, 5,000 Congressmen should go to Poona with unbroken bamboos to beat the opposition. A report which has appeared in 'Maratha' has carried the full facts of what he has said.

(Interruptions)

This is destroying the freedom of organisation. We have no objection to the Prime Minister going to Poona. She has the right to express her views.

(Interruptions)

But, the report says that 5,000 Congressmen should go to Poona with unbroken bamboos to beat the opposition.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please do not get up without my permission. I have not allowed any motion. Today, we have to hear Mr. Gokhale.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Sir, you can see the report for yourself. I am prepared to lay on the Table of the House.

Today, so many papers have been laid on the Table of the House. This is one more. This is an interesting report.

MR. SPEAKER : No question of laying it. I have not allowed it.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : We want protection. In the name of the Prime Minister, some Minister should not say something.

(Interruptions)

The Minister of a State Government says that 5,000 Congressmen should go to Poona to beat the opposition.

MR. SPEAKER : You cannot get up abruptly and bring any matter before the House without previous notice to the Speaker. Today, we have to hear Mr. Gokhale.

श्री मधु दानवटे : मंत्री महोदय बाड़ी का प्रयोग करने की मलाह लोगों को नहीं दे सकते ।

(Interruptions)

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : I only want to draw your attention and the attention of the hon. House to the threat which was given by the Mayor previously, before this reply was given. In the heat of the moment and argument, the Minister may have said something.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : We are maintaining utmost restraint. The Prime Minister has the right to express her views in a public meeting. We do not deny that right to the Prime Minister.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : After all, the Speaker must have previous intimation. Do not get up abruptly. I have no knowledge about any motion. You get up abruptly and then say something.