

12.21 hrs.

RE. ADJOURNMENT MOTION—  
*contd.*

SHRI KRISHNA CHANDRA HALDER (Ausgram): Sir, we want a discussion on the motion of adjournment of Shri Bhogendra Jha.

MR. SPEAKER: No, it is not in order.

SHRI BHOGENDRA JHA (Jainagar): Sir, I move that this House adjourn to discuss the unprecedented scarcity of foodgrains....(*interruptions*).

MR. SPEAKER: Sometimes at least you have to be reasonable. I am not allowing it. It is not in order.

SHRI BHOGENDRA JHA: Why is it not in order?

MR. SPEAKER: You have already discussed it in this House. You had a regular discussion on it. How can I allow it again and again when it is an identical one?

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA (Begusarai): Do you know that sugar is selling at Rs. 6.20 a kilo? (*Interruptions*).

SHRI C. M. STEPHEN (Muvattupuzha): Sir, you have a responsibility to the House. You have to ensure that the business of the House goes on. Now there is consistent obstruction. When an adjournment motion is sought to be moved, you have to give your ruling on permission being granted. There is no provision in the rules whereby the question whether an adjournment motion has to be admitted or not can be discussed. But that is what is going on. The adjournment motions are before you. You have got to be moved or not. If they are not to be moved or not. If they are not permitted to be moved, the business as on the agenda should be taken up. Now Parliament is being made the laughing-stock by this sort of proceeding. We cannot go on like this. It is

contempt of the House that is going on. This is a breach of privilege. The business of the House has to go on. How long are we to go on like this....(*Interruptions*).

SHRI BHOGENDRA JHA: Sir, what about my adjournment motion?

MR. SPEAKER: I am sorry, I am not allowing it. I have considered all the points. The motion is not in proper order. It is a continuing matter over which you had a discussion. I am sorry, I cannot allow it. If you do not allow the Chair to express its views, the Chair also will have to adjust itself to that. What else can I do? This matter has been discussed in this House in the current session and it is a continuing matter. How can you discuss the same matter a second time? So, I am not allowing it.

I am not calling anybody. The discussions have already been held in this very session. There are definite rules about it. You mean to say that I should exercise my discretion every time at the cost of other matters? If you were not given an opportunity earlier, then there was a genuine grievance. This is not the way to do it. If you think the Parliament can run like this, you go on.

I am really very sorry. I am watching these things not only for months but for two years. There should be some limit.

श्री इय्यास नन्दन मिश्र : हम सब लोग इस बात के हक में हैं कि इस से ज्यादा महत्वपूर्ण बात देश और जनता के लिए नहीं हो सकती— हर दिन इन की नीतियों की वजह से कीमतें बढ़ती जाँय तो क्या हम लोग यहाँ खामोश बैठे रहें। आप का यह कहना कि इस पर बहस हो चुकी है, ठीक नहीं है, हम ने इस पर कब बहस की है? एसेण्शल कमाडिटीज बिल के वक्त हम ने उस के लीगल प्रासपैक्ट्स पर बहस की थी, हम ने इस के इकानामिक प्रासपैक्ट पर कहाँ बहस की है ?

**अध्यक्ष महोदय** लेकिन हम को  
रूल के मुताबिक चलना पड़ेगा।

**श्री श्याम नन्दन मिश्र** उम वक्त  
हम लेजिस्लेशन पर बहस कर रहे थे।

12 35 hrs.

**MR SPEAKER:** There is no question of any point of order on it now. We have already had a discussion on it. It is a continuing matter.

**SHRI H N MUKERJEE** (Calcutta—North-East) We are having you here, Sir, but Government is absent. What business has the Government to show disrespect to the House and to you? We are helping them and you are trying to help them but they have not the guts to help you. They have not the courage to help you. Shri Raghu Ramiah is sitting behind. Can he not speak a word?

**श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी** (बंगाली)  
अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप इस पर थोड़ा विचार कर लीजिए।

**अध्यक्ष महोदय** इस पर क्या विचार करना है। अगर एक का करूंगा तो सब को करना पड़ेगा। जिस चीज पर हाउस में पहले बहस हो चुकी है, वह दोबारा कैसे आ सकती है?

**श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी** मेरी  
गहना है कि आप इस पर अभी कोई अन्तिम निर्णय मत कीजिए। मूल्यों का मामला बहुत गम्भीर मामला है, सदन को उम पर बहस करने का मौका मिलना चाहिए। इन लिए आप इस पर फिर से विचार कर लें ताकि किसी और रूप में यह मोशन आ सके।

**अध्यक्ष महोदय** इस बात से मेरी कोई खिद नहीं है। लेकिन रूल में साफ लिखा है कि जिस बात पर बहस हो गई हो, जो रीसेन्ट अकॉरेस न हो, कन्ट्रान्यूइंग मॉटर हो और उस पर बहस हो चुकी हो, उस पर

दोबारा बहस नहीं हो सकती। ऐसी हालत में इस को कैसे लिया जा सकता है। इस पर ता एक दफा नहीं बई दफा बहस हो चुकी है। आप लोगों ने रूल का बनाया है, तो क्या आप यह चाहते हैं कि उन को ऐसे ही हवा में उड़ा दूँ। इस तरह में नहीं चल सकेगा।

**SHRI SEZHIYAN** (Kumbakonam): The price of sugar has gone up to Rs 6 25 a kg only a couple of days ago. The House will be sitting only for two days more, and this is a new situation which calls for the attention of the House.

**अध्यक्ष महोदय** आप इस पर शार्ट-  
नॉटिस क्वेश्चन भेजिए या स्टेटमेंट की डिमाण्ड कीजिए, स्टेटमेंट बरवा देने है। लेकिन इस वक्त कैसे लिया जा सकता है?

**SHRI SEZHIYAN** Let Government come forward with a statement. The prices have gone up. The House has only two days more to sit. Let Government come forward with a statement so that the House can have a discussion on it. Please direct Government to make a statement....

**MR SPEAKER:** I am unable to listen to him. There is so much of interruption.

**SHRI C M STEPHEN:** No, Sir. Stage by stage, it will be interrupted. We are not going to take up anything except what is listed on the Order paper. We shall not allow anything else (Interruptions).

**MR SPEAKER:** May I request hon. Members not to interrupt? Let me listen to Mr. Sezhiyan.

**SHRI B. V. NAIK** (Kanara): We shall also contribute to the discussion after he has finished.

**MR SPEAKER:** This is a very dignified session of Parliament. Why are hon. Members interrupting?

**SHRI SEZHIYAN:** Regarding the adjournment motion of Shri Bhogendra Jha, I agree with your ruling that it has substantially been discussed here already and it cannot be brought again on an adjournment motion. We agree with you on that point. But the point is that the commodity prices, especially the prices of sugar have gone up; the price of sugar has gone up to Rs. 6.25 a kg. only a couple of days ago.

**MR. SPEAKER:** It is a continuing matter. Every day there is some rise in prices. I cannot admit an adjournment motion on it every day.

**SHRI SEZHIYAN:** I appeal to you that this is a new factor. The price of sugar has gone up to Rs. 6.25 a kg. only a couple of days ago. The House will be sitting only for two days more, and we shall be meeting again only after three months. Therefore, let Government come forward with a statement on the price position so that the House could have a discussion on the matter before we adjourn. I would appeal you to persuade Government to come forward with a statement.

**SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DAS MUNSI (Calcutta—South):** For the last three days, you have been observing and we have also been observing that hon. Members from the Opposition have been trying to put many questions on issues related to the business of the House or issues related to licensing and many other matters either in the form of motions or in the form of privilege issues.

I would like to submit to you that the business of the House is very important and the time at our disposal is too short to dispose of the business of the Government. Government business does not mean the business of the Congress Party but it means the business of the people also; because unless these items of business are disposed of, the people will not get adequate benefit for which the people outside have been waiting.

Through you, I would like to make one request to the Members of the Opposition. There are many important issues which they may raise every day in the House, and you allow them to raise them also because those are very important issues. Now, call-attention is over, and then submissions under rule 377 are also over. So, every opportunity for raising these matters has been lost now. Now, only some important issues which are related to the people's cause may be brought up by Members of the Opposition in the House. You may accept it or you may not accept it, but you have to judge whether those are important matters, and whether they have already been discussed or whether they are under the process of discussion. I feel that most of the things which they are wanting to raise have already been discussed and some matters may be discussed on other occasions also. There are many other matters also which are coming up. For them also you may find time

But what I have been finding since this morning is that in the name of the Business Advisory Committee's decision or in the name of any other motion, a section of the Members of the Opposition is trying to obstruct the business of the House in a manner which is likely to deadlock the Parliamentary System and whole proceedings. I would like to make an appeal to you here; as the Speaker of the House, do you not feel that if there is really a crisis in the House, whether it comes from one section or the other, you, as a judge, have to give a decision and that judgment has to be followed by the entire House? They may accept the judgment or may not accept it, but you as a judge have to give your judgment and continue to maintain the prestige of the House, and we shall stand by that judgment. So, let the rest of the business continue. They cannot interfere and deadlock the business in this manner every day. Here, I would like to ask the Members from the Congress Party, in the interests of the nation, whether every day we have to keep quiet like

this when they are doing this kind of thing; it cannot go on like this every day. Let the people know what is going on. Government business is the business of the people. We must see to it that that business is transacted. What do they think? It is not a fundamental right or inherent right that they can come and create a problem every day and deadlock the House. We cannot tolerate this kind of thing. We are also Members of the House and we want to go on with the business of the House. So, I would request you, Sir, to give your judgment finally.

SHRI C. M. STEPHEN: What is in the List of Business must take precedence over everything else?

MR. SPEAKER: May I make one request to hon. Members? Whatever be their differences whether on the Business Advisory Committee's decision or on the presentation of business before the House and so on, since some time past, I have been seeing this practice developing that instead of their settling matters themselves by sitting together, the whole House is obstructed....

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: I is due to the obduracy of Government.

SHRI C. M. STEPHEN: We are entitled to take that position. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: If something keep on coming, after all, we have to run this Parliament as Parliament. Suppose something is not coming, hon. Members can express their views, but there is no sense in holding the House to ransom. (*Interruptions*) Whoever does it. Everybody knows who does it.

SHRI H. N. MUKERJEE: What about your ultimate finding on the submission made by Mr. Sezhiyan?

MR. SPEAKER: I have already said that in the case of a continuing matter, such as prices increasing and

so on, every day we cannot have a new adjournment motion and keep on discussing it. I do not agree there.

SHRI H. N. MUKERJEE: What about the alternative suggested by Mr. Sezhiyan?

MR. SPEAKER: I can ask them to make a statement. But this is not the way out; if I say that it is not admissible, they cannot go on insisting on it and obstructing the business of the House in this manner.

SHRI SEZHIYAN: Ask the hon. Minister to make a statement. Sugar price has gone up to Rs. 6.25 a kg. Let Government make a statement.

MR. SPEAKER: I can ask Government to make a statement on this.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: Not only in respect of sugar. It relates to all essential commodities. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: If hon. Members want to run this House purely on political lines and purely on party lines, letting down each other it is no use. After all, this is Parliament and this forum is meant for the free expression of views by hon. Members. I shall be asking Government to make a statement.

श्री मधु लिमये (वाका) : अग्र्यक्ष महोदय, यह बात सही है कि दाम निरन्तर बढ़ रहे हैं। लेकिन विगत कुछ दिनों में जहाँ चीनी 5.20 पैसे, 5.25 पैसे बिक्री विक्रि रही थी, आजकल हर दिन सबेरे शाम उस के दाम बढ़ रहे हैं। ...  
 (अवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: I have already said that I will ask him to make a statement. I am not going to allow any speech.

SHRI KARTIK ORAON (Lohardaga): On a point of order. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I am going to take up the next item. There was a time when only one Adjournment Motion used to be allowed in a year or two. I cannot allow it every day. Yesterday we had an Adjournment Motion. We cannot have Adjournment Motions every day.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: In the past things had not become so intolerable. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SAMAR GUHA: On a point of order, Sir.

MR. SPEAKER: It is not a point of order. You have been only disrupting the proceedings of the House. These are all points of interruption. I am not allowing you....

SHRI SAMAR GUHA: I have a point of order. You have allowed that side.

MR. SPEAKER: No, please.

Now, I think, there are some privilege motions.

One by Shri Madhu Limaye, Mr Samar Guha, please sit down. There is no question of point of order. I am passing on to the next item now.

SHRI SAMAR GUHA: Before you pass on to the next item, I have a point of order. (*Interruptions*).

MR. SPEAKER: I have asked the Minister to make a statement.

SHRI H. N. MUKERJEE (Calcutta—North-East): We do not want a statement merely to be laid on the Table of the House and then thrown away. Let there be a discussion. Without a discussion, there is no point in having a statement. A statement and a two-hour discussion, we want. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SAMAR GUHA: You have not heard me.

MR. SPEAKER: You have been raising points of order every minute. I have allowed you so many things. But there is no point of order.

SHRI SAMAR GUHA: I want to draw your attention to a regular procedure.

SHRI C. M. STEPHEN: We will now pass on to the next item.

SHRI KARTIK ORAON (Lohardaga): On a point of order, Sir.

MR. SPEAKER: What do you want?

SHRI KARTIK ORAON: I rise on a point of order. The whole House has been witnessing for the last couple of days that every minute the Rules of Procedure are violated. At least 50 people get up every minute on points of order. What does all this amount to? We have not been able to carry on our business and I will definitely say that what is being done amounts to disruption of the House and obstruction of the business of the House. In this connection, I want to draw your attention to Rule 374 of the Rules of Procedure which says:

"The Speaker may, if he deems it necessary, name a Member who disregards the authority of the Chair or abuses the rules of the House by persistently and wilfully obstructing the business thereof."

13.00 hrs.

These things you are not able to observe. They ought to have been pulled up for acting in this manner, for obstructing the business of the House, Sir. The number goes on increasing. I request you to pull up such persons who obstruct the business of the House. I do not mind this side or that side, you can pull up anybody who is obstructing the business of the House. You are doing grave injustice to the House in the sense that very important items of the business of the House are not being

discussed. The important business of the House, for instance, relates to one item, the discussion on the report of the Commissioner of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. This has to be brought up for discussion immediately. Without meaning any disrespect to the members of the opposition, I might say, that they are taking up 75 per cent of the time in shouting, in sabrerattling, in mud-slinging. This is what they are doing. Please call the House to order. Please try to see that the business is carried on. If you do it even only with one person, everything will be set right. This is my submission.

SHRI SAMAR GUHA: You have permitted very orderly point of order. I want to draw your attention to rule 58....

MR SPEAKER: What about his suggestions?

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी इन का सजेक्शन मान लीजिए और हम सब को निकाल दीजिए।

SHRIMATI PARVATHI KRISHNAN: May I say something?

MR. SPEAKER: I am on my legs. May I tell you, it is no use obstructing the business of the House, by this means or that means.

After all, how long can we continue in this manner?

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: A deadlock is created; you don't want to resolve that deadlock.

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Mishra, every time you come up like this and I quietly watch. You do not think that I am not so insensitive that I do not realise it. (*Interruptions*) Order please. Please don't do like this. Let us behave as gentleman.

SHRI SHYAMANDAN MISHRA: I said, it is a deadlock; you should help to resolve it.

MR. SPEAKER: I never expected that you in your wisdom would act like that; we are here as friends; we can say things peacefully.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: It is a very peculiar posture that the Chair takes that even when I am saying things very peacefully, the Chair interprets it to be otherwise.

MR SPEAKER: I don't have this grievance against others but in your case I have got it. I am so sorry.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: I could not follow what you have said just now.

MR SPEAKER: Frowning and threatening posture; I advise you not to do it.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: I never do it. I would also advise you to be very polite to the House. Every honourable Member is as honourable as the honourable Speaker. Please don't put wrong construction on what I am submitting to you.

MR SPEAKER: He is doing it in the same way, frowning, fretting and threatening.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: You have been also frowning upon me taking advantage of (*Interruptions*) You are speaking almost from a pedestal.

MR. SPEAKER: I cannot abroad to frown upon you. I expect you not to do it also.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: We want this tangle to be resolved.

MR. SPEAKER: I have heard enough of the points of orders. Let us act proceed in a very orderly manner, in a friendly manner and in a manner keeping in view the dignity and honour of this House. If this goes on like this, sometimes one is not in

[Mr Speaker]

the same mood sometimes this may lead to desperation

**SHRI SAMAR GUHA** My point of order is this. For the last fifteen minutes I have been trying to raise my points of order Everyone has been able to raise his point of order I am not able to raise my point of order though I have been standing for the last fifteen minutes

**MR SPEAKER** Mr Guha, kindly sit down I allowed so many points of order Why do you do it every time?

**SHRI SAMAR GUHA** I have raised the point of order But not a single word had been uttered by me My point of order is this According to rule 58, there are restrictions on right to make motion When I asked for the Government's making a statement your contention was that it might be done only when the matter was a continuing one I was told that this matter had already been discussed earlier That is perhaps not a correct statement I want to refresh the memory of the House that in this session the price rise has not been discussed although discussion took place on the Essential Commodities Bill Sir day before yesterday in the report of the Reserve Bank of India the words hyper inflation have been used This is not a continuing matter To-day the price has risen to 272 points And Government is going to consider the question of granting the Dearness Allowance

**MR SPEAKER** This is not a point of order Please sit down

**SHRI SAMAR GUHA** Sir this is not a continuing matter Look at the jump in the price rise—quantum jump This is not a continuing matter and therefore my adjournment motion is on a very serious matter Sir we have to go back to our Constituency. With what face we can see

the people in our constituency The price is rising We are not discussing this matter. That is why I say there should be a discussion on the price rise in this session

**SHRI S M MANERJEE** Now you have disposed of the adjournment motion Now please permit me to make my submission to you I would request the Minister, through you, to make a statement on the abnormal rise in price of essential commodities. Either you allow us to raise a discussion under Rule 193 or under 189 Everyday the motion is coming up Please allow a discussion on the rising prices

13 10 hrs

#### RE QUESTION OF PRIVILEGE

**अध्यक्ष महोदय** इमाका मतलब तो यह हुआ कि एक एक आइटम पर क्लिग देना जाऊ और इनकी बात मानना चला जाऊ वही काम चल सकता है। ऐसे कामे काम चलेगा? वही मुश्किल है।

**श्री मधु लिनये :**

**श्री मधुलिनये (बाका):** बल चूकि मदन मे शोरगुल था इसलिए श्री गोखले को न मैं सुन सका और न ही आप सुन सके। इनके वक्तव्य म मे दो जुमले मैं आपके सामने रखना चाहता हू।

'Sir this is our view that these matters can be looked into only by a court of law The proper agency the statutory agency that can investigate into the matter is the court Perhaps that stage may come later on after the investigation is completed And then this House can decide about this.'

आज तक तो मैं यही समझता रहा हू कि एक भाई प्रार फाइल करने के बाद पुलिस