231 Suspension of sub-rule MARCH 25, 1975 St. Res. re Proclamation 292 (2) of Rule 206 in relation to Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G.

SHRI SEZHIYAN (Kumbakonam). I am raising a point only to help the Minister. He wants to suspend rule 206 (2) for the purpose of granting Vote-on-Account. If you see the List of Business, the Supplementary Demands for Grants have also to be voted. Rule 215 of the Rules of Procedure says that Supplementary, additional, excess and exceptional grants and votes of credit shall be regulated by the same procedure as is applicable in the case of demands for grants, subject to such adaptations, whether by way of modification, addition or omission, as the Speaker may deem to be necessary or expedient Therefore, what is obtainable for the Vote-on-Account should be done for the Supplementary Demands also. Now the Supplementary Demands are going to come next. At that time, he will be forced to come with another motion for suspending the rule, unless he does that at this stage for both Vote-on-Account as well as the Supplementary Demands.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Burdwan): If you kindly see the motion. it purports to suspend a part of rule 206(2) as relates to "a statement of the detailed estimate under each grant divided into items".

If you see rule 388, it says:

"Any member may, with the consent of the Speaker, move that any rule may be suspended in its application to a particular motion before the House"

So, a rule can be suspended in its entirety, but not a part of it. I raised this question earlier also but no decision was given. The question is whether a rule of this nature can be suspended in part. I can understand their not wanting to comply with any particular rule as such. But the rules do not contemplate the suspension of a part of a rule. It is not permissible: either do away with the whole rule or do not do it.

MR. SPEAKER: In this case the difficulty is very genuine. On an earlier occasion also, it was the last

day and so an exception was made.

Now it can be asked, when it was done on that day, why not today also? There is no other alternative. If we are always particular of even a comma, sometimes it may not be possible, because of the shortage of time or the peculiar circumstances. I leave it to your decision as to what should be done in such circumstances.

I ask Shri Sezhiyan whether he has any suggestion to make. There is no day left now. So, we have to consider whether it is in the interest of that State. Whatever has gone wrong, we cannot help it. So, we have to give a liberal interpretation of the rules, because the circumstances are very exceptional. Further, it is only a Vote-on-Account. It will come up for discussion.

The question is:

"That in relation to the Demands for Grants for expenditure of the Government of Nagaland during the financial year 1975-76, so much of sub-rule (2) of Rule 206 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, as relates to 'a statement of the detailed estimate under each grant divided into items', may be suspended for the purpose of granting Vote-on-Account by this House"

The motion was adopted.

12.50 hrs.

STATUTORY RESOLUTION RE-APPROVAL OF PROCLAMATION IN **RELATION TO NAGALAND, NAGA-**LAND BUDGET, 1975-76-GENERAL DISCUSSION. DEMANDS* FOR GRANTS ON GRANTS ON ACCOUNT (NAGALAND), 1975-76, AND SUP-DEMANDS* FOR PLEMENTARY GRANTS (NAGALAND), 1974-75.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AF-FAIRS (SHRI K. BRAHMANANDA REDDY): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to move the following Resolution:

•Moved with the recommendation of the President.

233 St. Re. re. Proclamation CHAITRA 4, 1897 (SAKA) in relation to 234 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G.

"That this House approves the Proclamation issued by the Presi-dent on the 22nd March, 1975, under article 356 of the Constitution in relation to the State of Nagaland."

At the general elections held in February, 1974, in Nagaland, the U.D.F. secured 25 seats, the NNO 23 and the Independents 12, in a House of 60 Members. 7 Independents joined the UDF and 5 the NNO, with the result that the UDF became 32 strong and the NNO 28. The UDF thus formed the Ministry head by Subsequently, 6 NNO Shri Vizol. Members went over to the UDF. On March 9, 1975, 13 UDF Members joined the NNO, leading to the resignation of the Vizol Ministry and formation of an NNO Ministry led by Shri Jasokie on March 19, 1975. On March 19, 1975, the leader of the UDF claimed before the Governor that his party had the majority in the Legislative Assembly. The Governor advised him that since the Assembly was in session, the trial of strength should take place on the floor of the House. The Legislative Assembly of Nagaland met on March 20, 1975, but was adjourned by the Speaker sine dir. The trial of strength could not take place. According to a letter received by the Governor from the Secretary to the Assembly the Speaker had adjourned the House sine die because the Ministers had 'started taking the floor on their own, charging that the Opposition party had taken away 3 of their Ministers and in addition 7 Members were also taken and necessary enquiry should be carried out before the House could take up any business of the day'.

The immediate problem of authorisation of expenditure from the beginning of the next financial year had to be dealt with. The Governor explored the possibility whether the A3sembly could restart sittings within the next few days. The Speaker's observation was that he was fully cognizant of the constitutional impli-

.. .

(Nagaland)

cations but that he had made up his mind not to resume sittings of the Assembly for about a month as, in his judgment, that was the period necessary for the tension to die down and normal atmosphere to be created. The report of the Governor of Nagaland dated March 20, 1975, already laid on the Table of this House explains the circumstances which necessitated the issue of a Proclamation under article 356 of the Constitution. The issue of Proclamation was ordered by the President on March 22, 1975.

I would request the House to grant its approval to the Proclamation issued by the President on March 22, 1375. in relation to the State of Nagaland

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU (Diamond Harbour): Sir, I have given an amendment stating:

"That this House approves the Proclamation issued by the President on 22nd March, 1975, be valid for one day from that date and direct the Governor to invite the leader of the majority party in the Assembly to form the Ministry."

MR. SPEAKER: You don't give even the breathing time. After all, there should be some limit to it. I was just seeing the order of business.

The Statutory Resolution approving the Proclamation, the General Discussion on the Budget for the State of Nagaland, the Demands for Grants on Account and the Supplementary Demands for Grants are all clubbed together. Item Nos. 14, 15, 16 and 17 are all clubbed together.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Burdwan): On that, on taking them up together, I have a point of order.

MR. SPEAKER: That is the practice.

St. Res. ve Proclamation MARCH 25, 1975 in relation to Nagaland 336 235

SHRI SEZHIYAN (Kumbakonam): Sir, yesterday, when we raised it, myself and others, you said that this can be discussed today, that is, about the validity of the order. You may take up that first.

MR. SPEAKER: I will take that up first.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: I have a submission to make. Rule 206 has been partly suspended. The speech of the Minister of Revenue and Expenditure itself visualises that the rules with regard to Vote on Account would be suspended. But no motion for suspension relating to Vote on Account, which is a separate rule ultogether, Rule 214, has been brought. Rule 214 has not been suspended. It requires the items of expenditure to be mentioned and they are not mentioned. So, what was visualised in the speech of the Minister has not been done.

I am reading from the speech of the Minister:

"In the special situation of this occasion. I seek your consent and the indulgence of the House to agree to suspend the rule for the purpose of granting Vote on Account for the three months of 1975-76."

Vote on Account is not covered by rule 206 at all; it is covered by rule 214, and he has not got that rule suspended. Therefore, the discussion on Vote on Account cannot be taken up.

MR. SPEAKER: We considered this and we came to the conclusion that what was needed was got. Why should we bring in unnecessary matters which are not needed?

Yesterday, some hon. members raised some points. They may take a few minutes each.

Mr. Sezhiyan.

SHRI SEZHIYAN (Kumbakonam). Yesterday I raised this point-other members also raised it-questioning the validity of the form in which the

and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

Presidential Order has been issued on 22nd March this year. I am confining myself only to this point. This is not a general discussion on the merits of the decision. Of course, we all feel, and we will speak on that later, that the extraordinary powers given in the Constitution to bring a State under President's rule should be used only where a real emergency exists and that these powers should not be misused. That is a different aspect. Here having taken the decision-which decision we are going to contest later-, the President and the Government have come forward with the Proclamation dated the 22nd March, 1975, which has been issued under article 356 of the Constitution. Article 356 of the Constitution provides that

"If the President on receipt of a report from the Governor of a State otherwise, is satisfied that a or situation has arisen in which the government of the State cannot be carried on in accordance with the provisions of this Constitution, the President may by Proclamation:

- (a) assume to himself all or any of the functions of the Government of the State
- (b) declare that the powers of the Legislature of the State shall be exercisable by or under the authority of Parliament;
- (c) make such incidental and consequential provisions as appear to the President to be necessary or desirable for giving effect to the objects of the Proclamation "

13.00 hrs.

Now coming to the Proclamation dated the 22nd March, 1975, the President has used article 356()(a) to assume to himself all the functions of the Government of that State and all powers vested in or exercisable by the Governor of that State. That is alright. The second thing is-

"declare that the powers of the Legislature of the said State shall be exercisable by or under the authority of Parliament."

That is why, we are looking into this. The third point is the most important, and 1 am basing my argument on that. It says:

"make such incidental and conseto quential provisions as appear me to be necessary or desirable for giving effect to the objects of this Proclamation, namely ... "

Now, please see (ii);

(ii) the operation of the following provisions of the Constitution in relation to that State is hereby suspended..."

namely, so much of proviso to Article 3 as relates to... etc. As many as 19 items are given there. If the whole Article or part of the Article is suspended, as many as 19 items have been suspended. All of them 1 have put in the order. I will not take the time of the House. Only two items, I will mention, which, I feel, should not, need not and could not have been suspended by this Proclamation. They are as follows.

If you take the Proclamation, the second item after the suspension of the proviso to Article 3, it is clause (2) of Article 151 which lays down that the reports of the Comptroller and Auditor-General of India relating to the accounts of the State shall be caused to be laid on the floor of the legislative Assembly. This comes in Chapter V. Now, the reports of the C & A G shall be submitted to the President who shall cause them to be laid on the floor of the Parliament. Article 151(2) which is sought to be suspended reads as follows.

"The reports of the Comptroller and Auditor-General of India relating to the accounts of a State shall be submitted to the Governor of the State, who shall cause them to be laid before the Legislature of the State."

(Nagaland)

This is sought to be suspended by the Then, what is the Proclamation. effect? If a particular provision of the Constitution is suspended, by 8 proclamation, what is the effect? The effect is that this is completely taken out of the Proclamation as far as the State is concerned. Suppose if it is not taken out, what is the effect? If you take the Proclamation, clause (iii) says:

"any reference in the Constitution to the Governor shall in relation to the said State be construed as a reference there to the President and any reference therein to the Legislature of the State or the Houses thereof shall, in so far as it relates to the functions and powers thereof be construed, unless the context otherwise requires, as a reference to Parliament...."

Therefore, if you have suspended any of the Articles here, this one comes into operation that wherever the term 'Governor' is there, the reference is the to the President and wherever reference is to the Assembly. the reference is to the Parliament. So, the effect of this proclamation will be that the reports of the Comptroller and Auditor-General relating to the accounts of the State of Nageland shall be submitted to the President who shall cause them to be laid before the Parliament. That would have been there. Just now by suspending that Article, what have the Government done is that none of the reports of the C & A G relating to the accounts of the State which normally should have been placed before the Assembly and now, the Parliament, will not be laid and this Parliament is deprived of its powers which the Parliament derives under Article 356 This power has been deprived by this Proclamation which I shall say. to that extent gocs against the constitutional provision

My second objection is with regard to item 19-clause (2) of Article 323. There, the reference is to the reports of the Public Service Commission.

239 St. Res. rz Proclamation MARCH **35**, 1975 in relation to Nagoland 240 and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

There also it shall be the duty of a State Commission to present annually to the Governor of the State a report and the Governor shall cause the copy being placed on the Table of the legislature there. By suspending that one, you are depriving this House of an opportunity to discuss the reports of the Commission which should have been laid on the Table of the Legislature which legislature is now here, working in this House. This House has been deprived of an opportunity and authority and power which was vested with the legislature but it was deprived of it. These two are the main ones.

Why I object to this one is because in the Proclamation under Article 356 it has been said rightly that the President is empowered by Article 358(1) (c) to make such incidental and consequential provisions as may appear to the President to be necessary or desirable for giving effect to the objects of the Proclamation. And if you see this thing, what is really incidental and consequential? If you take the legal terms, you will find, these terms are all very much defined. You cannot just under the cloak of these things suspend something as you like, which is somewhat inconvenient to you and all that. Submission of the report of the Comptroller and Auditor-General is one such thing. Submission of the reports of the Public Service Commission is another such thing. If it is inconvenient, on that score, you just cannot do this thing This is my point. And, in this publication of legal terms in page 424 it has been said as under:

'Incidental or consequential:--Incidental or consequential orders are those which follow as a matter of course being necessary complements to the main order passed without which the latter order would be incomplete or ineffective.'

So, this is the position. That is to say, only when you find that without the necessary consequential and incidental orders, the purpose for which

the original order is passed will become incomplete, only then, you can do this. This is my respectful submission. I feel, Sir, suspension of these things is not incidental or consequential. What does the latest order say? I mean, the latest proclamation of Presidential rule. It is the latest cne, it is not the last one. That was done in the case of Pondicherry on 26-3-74. In that one, when they passed that order, what did they do? It is pertinent to quote that one. Corresponding to this was, as you know, there are provisions under the Goyernment of Union Territories Act. 1963 which relates to Pondicherry. There is specific item relating to audit which is found here in Section 49. If I read this, what I say will become clear. I quote;

Section 49 of the Government of Union Territories Act, 1963:--

The reports of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India relating to the accounts of a Union territory for any period subsequent to the date referred to in sub-section (1) of section 47 shall be submitted to the Administrator who shall cause them to be laid before the Legislative Assembly of the Union Territory."

When this Presidential Order Was issued on 28th March, 1974, it says Whereas the President has assumed the power of the Administrator' etc. Section 49 was not suspended. Rather, Sir, they put it rather bluntly; they said, in relation to the said Union Territory, less the context otherwise requires, any reference in section 6, 23. 27. 28, 40, etc. of the Act to the Administrator shall be construed as reference to the President and any reference in section 49 to the legisla. tive assembly of the Union Territory, in whatever form, shall, in so far as it relates to the functioning, be construed as reference to this Parliament. Now, the latest order has been issued bringing States and Union Territories in this one. Now, instead of placing it on the Table of the Union Territory legislature, it should be placed on the

241 St. Re. re. Proclamation CHAITRA 4, 1897 (SAKA) in relation to 242 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G.

Table of our House. But they have given this to the Union Territory of Pondicherry. Then why they have taken recourse to this thing? Therefore, I am on this point. Therefore, so far as the Presidential Order dated the 22nd March, in so far as it suspends these two rules, one prohibiting of report to be placed of the Comptroller and Auditor General and the other one relating to Public Service Commission (with reference to subclause 2 of article 151 and sub-clause 2 of Article 323), to that extent. this is certainly violative of the provisions and is invalid and also it goes against the powers of this House, because, this cuts at the very root of this functioning by the only watchdog function which is available to the House and by preventing this exercise of control over finances, this is something which is against Parliamentary Democracy and Constitution and therefore it is my submission that its validity is in question. This is my respectful submission. Thank you.

SHRI A. KEVICHUSA (Nagaland): Mr, Speaker. Sir, the recent defections and re-defection in Nagaland have tarnished the image of the State and the Nagaland Assembly.

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Kevichusa. you will get an opportunity when the matter is taken up for discussion later. These are some constitutional objections that are being made which you must also hear. When discussion is started, at that time I shall see that you get the opportunity to speak.

Shri Banerjee and Shri Patel are not here. Prof. Dandavate.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur): I shall briefly mention one point. That is, we must read Art. 356 in conjunction with Art. 151. Sir, the legality and the constitutionality of this particular issue is more important because it is the rights of Parliament and obligations to Parliament that have edge into difficulty.

(Nagaland) It is true that Art. 356(1)(c) categorically says:

"make such incidental and consequential provisions as appear to the President to be necessary or desirable for giving effect to the objects of the Proclamation, including provisions for suspending in whole or in part the operation of any provisions of this Constitution relating to any body or authority in the State."

This has great relevance because the words 'incidental and consequential' are of great significance. Some thing is treated as incidental and consequential' which ultimately results in curtailing the power and obligations of Parliament. In that case, the real difficulty is created, as rightly pointed out by my colleague. For instance, earlier clause (2) of Art, 151 relates to lay before the Legislature of a State the reports submitted to the Governor by the Comptroller and Auditor General of India. Now, the effect of this particular suspension will only mean that these reports which could have normally gone before the Legislature would have come before Parliament. Now, you can imagine the situation uecause of the suspension of this particular provision. You will find that these particular reports which will be prepared by the Comptroller and Auditor-General will not come before Parliament at all. There is no State Legislature before which they will be placed. And, as a result of that, there would be normally powers residing in the hands of the Auditor-General. If there are certain lacunae in the reports. they will never see the light of the day and Parliament will not be able to scrutinise them. As a result of that, it will not serve the public interest at all. Therefore, it is very necessary that under the cloak of Art. 356(c), we should not allow this particular aspect to be treated as incidental and consequential. Of course, that will mean the erosion of the rights of Parliament and, to that extent, to challeng. ing the Constitutionality and legality of this particular provision.

243 St. Res. re Proclamation MANCH 25, 1975 in relation to Nagitavit 224 and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

SHRI H. N. MUKERJEE (Calcutta-North-East): Sir, may I make my submission^{*}

MR. SPEAKER: I only call the Members who have given their names. Mr. Chatterjee.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: Mr. Speaker: Sir, in this country we have seen that on many occasions recourse is taken to Art. 356. It is very necessary, in my opinion, that Parliament should know what is the real content of the powers of the President. Kindly see that after the *Piesident* assumes to himself the power of the executive autilority, this Parliament assumes the powers of the State Legislature.

Sir, there is a provision here which is very significant. It says:

"The President may make such incidental and consequential provisions as appear to him to be necessary or desirable for giving effect to the objects of the Proclamation, including provisions for suspending in whole or in part the operation of any provisions of the Constitution relating to any body or authority in the State."

Therefore, the President has not been given the power here to suspend any other provision of the Constitution. Such a suspension must be incidental to or consequential for the purpose of this Proclamation. Here, the objective of the Proclamation has been to run the administration of the State of Nagaland because the Government of that State cannot be carried on in accordance with the provisions of the Constitution. Therefore, since the Assembly cannot be run according to the Constitution and since the Ministry cannot be formed or since the Legislature cannot function there, the primary object-the only object is to run the administration in the State of Nagaland by the Presidential Proclamation. You would be prod enough to see all the provisions

that have been mentioned excepting the two which are not mentioned relate either to the power of the State Legislature directly or the Council of the Ministers functioning there or functioning of the Chief Minister and so on and so forth. Now, Sir, what is the scope of this provision, namely, incidental and consequential provision for the purpose of giving effect to two objects. Under that each and every provision of the Constitution cannot be suspended. President cannot suspend Article 311 which deals with the rights of Government servants. Article 19 cannot be suspended under Article 356. Incidental and consequential provisions must be such as are necessary concomitant of the object of Proclamation. It has been defined in the Oxford dictionary that 'incidental' means 'occurring or liable to occur in subordinate conjunction with something else'. How is the object of running the administration of the State of Nagaland, because Assembly cannot function. being necessarily fulfilled by disallowing or making a provision that the audit report will not see the light of the day? In the name of incidental and consequential provision the net is sought to be thrown wider. Two very important items of State activity which have nothing to do with the day-to-day activities of the State. namely, public employment for which the Public Service Commission is intended to be one of the watch-dogs and Comptroller and Auditor General's report which is essential to look into the public expenditure are sought to be kept out of the purview of the legislatures. Therefore, we say this Proclamation in so far as those two provisions are sought to be suspended is not a valid Proclamation.

SHRI H. N. MUKERJEE: Sir, I shall not be going into the pure technical aspect of the matter but one moment in this business which intrigues me and makes me very susploious and indignant is the Government way of proceeding. As Mr.

245 St. Res. re Proclamation CHATTER 4, 1897 (SAKA) in relation to 246 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G.

Sezhiyan has pointed out under the name of having incidental and consequential provision in the Proclamation certain suspensions have been ordered. We do not object to that. But if we compare the Nagaland Order of the President with the President's order in regard to Pondicherry, in that case the Presidential Order did not include suspension of that provision which would have made presentation of the Comptroller and Auditor General's report obligatory before Parliament. On this occasion a very definite distinction has been incorporated. There is no intention on our part to put any hurdle in the way of Government particularly on the issue of Nagaland. Let the Minister explain that contrary to provisions in the Pondicherry Proclamation a special exclusion has been included in the Nagaland Proclamation.

SHRI K. BRAHMANANDA REDDY: Sir, hon. Mr. Sezhiyan has read this relevent portion of Article 356, Article 356 (1) (c) says:

"make such incidental and consquential provisions as appear to the President to be necessary or desirable for giving effect to the objects of the Proclamation. including provisions for suspending in whole or in part the operation of any provisions of this Constitution relating to any body or authority in the State:

Now, we will come to Article 151 (2). It says:

"The reports of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India relating to the accounts of a State shall be submitted to the Governor of the State, who shall cause them to be laid before the Legislature of the State."

My submission is, what is suspended according to the Proclamation is only this. You may kindly see

"so much of clause (2) of Article 151 as relates to the laying before the Legislature of the State of

(Nagaland)

Report · submitted to the the Governor by the Comptroller and Auditor General of India:

Secondly, in regard to Article 323, it says:

"so much of clause (2) of Article 323 as relates to the laying of the report with a memorandum before the legislature of the State."

Therefore, what is suspended is only this portion "who shall cause them to be laid before the Legislature of the State." The entire thing is not suspended. Now, in many of these proclamations, this has been done and we are advised by the Law Department that this is perfectly legal and valid. Apart from that, Sir, as you know, this Assembly has been suspended. This has not been dissolved. Therefore. Sir, the duration of the suspension....

SHRI DINEN BHATTACHARYYA (Serampore). Suspicion out of suspension.

SHRI K. BRAHMANANDA RED-DY: You suspect everything. In regard to the duration of the suspension, we cannot just now say, now long it will be. It may be for some time or more time. Therefore, Sir, as the duration of the suspension cannot be envisaged just now, depending upon the situation prevailing in the State, it has not become neces sary to lay these reports on the floor of the House. Supposing, at some other time, if it becomes necessary to come before the House again for extention, we will certainly consider this matter whether these reports cannot be laid

SHRI SEZHIYAN: Just now, ine Minister has said that this Legislative Assembly has not been dissolved. that this has only been suspended. ard therefore, they have put this The Minister has also said that he does not know how long it will remain suspended, and that therefore, they have put this. Sir, I can give one instance which will prove this.

.247 St. Res. re Proclamation MARCH 25, 1975 in relation to Nagaland 248 and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

In regard to Uttar Pradesh, on 22nd February 1968, the Governor sent a note. In the end, he said:

,

"I do not think it is desirable to dissolve the Legislative Assembly at this juncture but feel that it will be in the best interests of the State if the functioning of the State Legislature is merely suspended."

Without suspending the Legislature, without dissolving the Legislature, the Legislature was put in animated suspension and Article 356 was clamped in regard to the State of UP on 22nd February, 1968. On that date, the proclamation was issued without dissolving the Assembly. The Assembly was only suspended but they have not suspended this rule under 131(2). The UP Assembly Article was not dissolved, but, it was only suspended. This was issued on 22nd February 1968.

SHRI K. BRAHMANANDA RED-DY: May be so.

SHRI SEZHIYAN He has said that the Assembly has not been dissolved and that it has only been suspended. I can quote a case where the Assembly was not dissolved, but only suspended, and there, this rule was not suspended. Why are they going back?

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE:

The Proclamation itself says that any reference in the Constitution to the Governor would mean the President and any reference to the legislature would mean reference to Parliament. Article 151(2) has to be retained. What has the duration of the suspension to do with it, because automatically the matter will come before Parliament? They have consciously made a departure without any explanation.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE: There is a common point raised by all the members which has not been replied to. Incidental and consequential provisions have to be consistent and should have effect so far as the objectives of the Proclamation are concerned. He has not explained it.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA (Begusarai): The point is one of substance and it should receive your most serious consideration whether Parliament can or should accept 8 truncation of its responsibilities in matter. The very essence of this parliamentary system is financial control. If financial control goes, there is no sense in transferring any responsibility to Parliament. If the Auditor-General is not under an obligation to submit a report to the President to be caused to be laid on the Table, the financial control does not pass to the Parliament of India. It is for your serious consideration whether the Government should be allowed to suspend this power also, which essentially is the very basis of financial control. If the purpose of this is to run the government there, if the Assembly is suspended, with the help of Parliament with the same powers, then this does not seem to be incidental or consequential to the powers that have been acquired by the President

SHRI K BRAHMANANDA RED-DY: The report of the Auditor General for 1972-73 relating to the State of Nagaland has been placed before the Nagaland Assembly but the report for 1973-74 is not yet due.

SPEAKER: I see a disparity MR between the notifications issued in the case of Pondicherry, U. P and Nagaland. I made an observation lo while addressing the Conference Chairman of Subordinate Legislation Committees that in case there is President's rule, and the Assembly is not functioning, some way should be found whereby the rules which normally should have been laid before the Assembly are not left unscrutinised. They should either be scrutinised by the parliamentary committee or when the proclamation is revoked and normal conditions are restored, the subordinate legislation committee of that State must scrutinise it. In this case, if there is any Auditor General's report or Public Service Commission's report, the normal course would have been that they are laid on the Table of that Legislative Assembly. When there is no Legislative Assembly, the analogy goes to the corresponding Legislative body. I think there is no harm if even in your consequential or incidental matters, you bring this before the House, if it relates to that period. The question of deletion would not solve any problem. Some way should be found. It is in the interests of Parliament and Nagaland also that there is some substitute where they are laid when there is no Assembly functioning there. I hope there will be ample scope in the interpretation of your incidental and consequential matters so that some way could be found whereby this House should be aware of these things. I have given the Government a hint. The Speaker cannot give a direction saying you must rut the proclamation this way or that way. I have given them a hint and I thick it is an acceptable hint.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU: Why are these two controversial provisions in the Presidential Proclamation not deleted by the Government?

MR. SPEAKER: We shall resume the debate. Shri Dasaratha Deb.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU: I have given an amendment.

MR. SPEAKER: That is not in order. I have not permitted it.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU: But that was not conveyed to me.

MR. SPEAKER: Yesterday itself I have written that I cannot permit it because Proclamation cannot be amended. You can either reject it or accept it.

SHRI JOTIRMOY BOSU: This is a motion before the House and I have given the amendment well in time.

250 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

Under what rule have you not permitted it?

MR. SPEAKER: **Proclamation** is not a motion. I am sorry I cannot allow any amendment to it. Resolution moved:

"That this House approves the Proclamation issued by the Presi-dent on the 22nd March, 1975 under article 356 of the Constitution in relation to the State of Nagaland."

DEMAND NO. 1-STATE LEGISLATURE

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 5.75,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account. out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976. in respect of 'State Legislature'."

DEMAND NO. 3-COUNCIL OF MINISTERS

MR. SPEAKER · Motion moved ·

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 12.50.000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account. out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Council of Ministers'."

DEMAND NO. 4- ADMINISTRATION OF JUSTICE

MR SPEAKER · Motion moved:

exceeding "That a sum not Rs. 3.37,500 on Revenue Account begranted to the President on account. out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to

251 St. Res. ne Proclamation MARCH 35, 1975 in relation to Nagalinal 352 and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagalanda

defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Administration of Justice'."

DEMAND NO 5-ELECTION

MR SPEAKER Motion moved

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 4,88,700 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account. out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976 in respect of 'Election'

DEMAND NO. 6-LAND REVENUE, STAMPS

AND REGISTRATION

MR SPEAKER Motion moved

"That a sum not exceeding Rs 4,26.500 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come m course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976 in respect of 'Lind Revenue, Stamps and Registration'"

DEMAND NO. 7-STATE EXCISE

MR SPEAKER Motion moved

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1,87,500 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'State Excise'"

DEMAND NO. 8-SALFS TAX

MR. SPEAKER Motion moved

"That a sum not exceeding "Rs. 1,50,000 on Revenue Account be

and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagalanda granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to

State of Negaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Sales Tax'."

DEMAND NO. 9-TAKES ON VEHICLES

MR. SPEAKER Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1,15,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976. in respect of "Taxes on Vehicles""

DFMAND NO 12-CIVII SECRETARIAT

MR SPEAKER Motion moved

"That a sum not exceeding Rs 1.3.75 000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, m respect of 'Civil Secretariat'"

DEMAND NO. 13-DISTRICT ADMINISTRA-TION SPECIAL WELFARE SCHEME AND TRIBAL COUNCIL

MR SPEAKER Motion moved

"That a sum not exceeding Rs 42 00,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of "District administration special welfare scheme and Tribal Council',"

DEMAND NO. 14-TREASURY AND ACCOUNTS ADMINISTRATION

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 3,87,500 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account. out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Treasury and Accounts Administration'."

DEMAND NO. 15-SPECIAL EXPENDITURE ON MAINTENANCE OF LAW AND ORDER INCLUDING CONTRIBUTION FOR PENSIONS AND GRATUITIES

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs 17.00,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account. out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976. in respect of 'Special expenditure on maintenance of law and order including contribution for Pensions and Gratuities'."

DEMAND NO 16-VILLAGE GUARDS

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 9,37.500 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account. out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Village Guards'."

DEMAND NO. 17-CIVIL POLICE AND FIRE SERVICE UNIT

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1,39,75,900 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the

Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of Civil Police and Fire Service Unit'."

DEMAND NO. 18-JAILS

MR SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 9.55,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account. out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Jails'."

DEMAND NO. 19-STATIONERY AND PRINTING

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved .

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 6.62,500 on Revenue Account be gran'ed to the President on account out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Stationery and Printing',"

DEMAND NO. 20-VIGILANCE COMMISSION

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

exceeding "That a sum not Rs. 25 000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Vigilance Commission'."

DEMAND NO. 21-WORKSHOP ORGANISA-TION

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

exceeding not "That a sum Rs. 4,12,500 on Revenue Account be

255 St. Res. ne Proclamation MARCH 25, 1975 in relation to Nagaland 255 and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Workshop Organisation'."

DEMAND NO. 22-NAGALAND HOUSES

MR SPEAKER · Motion moved ·

"That a sum not exceeding Rs 1.55,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Nagaland Houses'."

DFMAND NO 23-ADMINISTRATIVE TRAINING INSTITUTE

MR. SPEAKER Motion moved

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1,37,500 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Administrative Training Institute'"

DEMAND NO. 24-STATE LOTTERIES

MR SPEAKER · Motion moved ·

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 2.26,200 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'State Lotteries'."

and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

DEMAND NO. 25-PENSIONS AND OTHER RETIREMENT BENEFITS

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1.41,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the Sist day of March, 1976, in respect of Pensions and other retirement benefits'."

DEMAND NO. 26-EDUCATION

MR SPEAKER · Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs, 1.32.94,500 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Education'"

DEMAND NO 27-ART & CULTURF AND GAZETTEFRS UNIT

MR SPEAKER Motion moved ·

"That a sum not exceeding Rs 2.71,300 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Art and Culture and Gazetteers Unit'."

DEMAND NO. 28-MEDICAL, PUBLIC HEALTH AND FAMILY PLANNING

MR SPEAKER · Motion moved ·

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 76,71,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on, account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come

257 St. Re. re. Proclamation CHAITRA 4, 1897 (SAKA) in relation to 258 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G.

in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Medical, Public Health and Family Planning'."

DEMAND NO. 29-URBAN DEVELOPMENT

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 3.62,500 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account. out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Urban Development'."

DEMAND NO. 30-INFORMATION. PUBLI-CITY, AND TOURISM

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved ·

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 8.20,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account. out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976. in respect of 'Information, Publicity and Tourism',"

DEMAND NO. 31-EMPLOYMENT EX-CRANGE

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 53,700 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March. 1976, in respect of 'Employment Exchange'"

DEMAND NO. 32-LABOUR

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved.

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 32,700 on Revenue Account be 328 L.S.--9

(Nagaland)

granted to the President on account. out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Labour',"

DEMAND NO. 33-TRIBAL DEVELOPMENT BLOCKS, COMMUNITY PROJECT ETC.

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That . sum not exceeding Rs. 20.95.000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account. out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March. 1976. in respect of 'Tribal Development Blocks, Community Project etc.' "

DEMAND NO. 34-SOCIAL WELFARE

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

exceeding "That a sum not Rs. 8.8'.200 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March. 1976, in respect of 'Social Welfare'."

DEMAND NO. 35-SOLDIERS, SAILORS & AIRMENS BOARD

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 16,200 cn Revenue Account be granted to the President on account. out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976. in respect of 'Soldiers, Sailors & Airmens Board'."

459 St. Rev. no Proclamation MARCH 25, 1975 in relation to Nagaland 160 and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

DEMAND NO. 36-SOCIAL SECURITY, WELFARE AND COMMUNITY SERVICES

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 2.75,700 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Social Security, Welfare and Community Services."

DEMAND NO 37-EVALUATION UNIT

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved.

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 40,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Evaluation Unit'"

DEMAND NO. 38-COOPERATION

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 6,20,000 on Revenue Account and not exceeding Rs. 3,17,500 on Capital Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the Sist day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Cooperation'."

DEMAND NO. 39-STATISTICS

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved.

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 3.62,500 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Statistics'.

DEMAND NO, 40-WEIGHTS & MEASURES

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 92,700 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Weights and Measures'."

DEMAND NO 41-SUPPLY OFFICE AT CALCUITA

MR SPEAKER. Motion moved.

"That a sum not exceeding Rs 44,200 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Supply Office at Calcutta'"

DEMAND NO. 42-AGRICULTURE, MINOR IRRIGATION, FISHERIES ETC.

MR. SPEAKER · Motion moved ·

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 56,08,700 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Agriculture, Minor Irrigation, Fisheries etc."

DEMAND NO. 43-SOIL CONSERVATION

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 10,12,500 on Revenue Account be

151 St. Res. re Proclamation CHAFFRA 4, 1897 (BAKA) in relation to 262 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G.

granted to the President on account. out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Soil Conservation'."

DEMAND NO. 44,---GRAIN SUPPLY SCHEME

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 13,37,500 on Revenue Account and not exceeding Rs. 75,00,000 on Capital Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Negaland, for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Grain Supply Scheme'."

DEMAND NO. 45-ANIMAL HUSBANDRY & DAIRY DEVELOPMENT

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 26,83,200 on Revenue Account and not exceeding Rs. 35,000 on Capital Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of Animal Husbandry & Dairy Development'."

DEMAND No. 46-FOREST

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 19.97,500 on Revnue Account be granted to the President on ac--count out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on

(Nagaland)

the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Forest'."

DEMAND NO. 47-INDUSTRIES

MR SPEAKER. Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 13,67,500 on Revenue Account and not exceeding Rs. 55,62,500 on Capital Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Industries',"

DEMAND NO. 48-MINERAL **DEVELOPMENT**

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 6,31,200 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Mineral Development'."

DEMAND No. 49-POWER PROJECTS

MR SPEAKER: Motion moved.

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 71,07,800 on Revenue Account and not exceeding Rs. 39,81,600 on Capital Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Power Projects'."

DEMAND NO 50-ROAD TRANSPORT

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 15,75,000 on Revenue Account and not exceeding Rs. 8,75,000 on Capital Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Road Transport'."

DEMAND NO. 51—FINANCIAL CORPRATION CELL

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 1,25,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976. In respect of 'Financial Corporation Cell'."

DEMAND NO. 52-HOUSING LOANS & LOANS TO GOVERNMENT SERVANTS

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 19,50,000 on Capital Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March. 1976, in respect of 'Housing Loans and Loans to Government Servants'."

DFMAND No. 53-PUBLIC WORKS, HOUSING, ROADS AND BRIDGES

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved;

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 4,51,29,500 on Revenue Account and not exceeding Rs. 1,10,66,200 on Capital Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Public Works, Housing, Roads and Bridges'."

DEMAND No. 54-FUNCTIONAL BUILDINGS. AND OTHER DEVELOPMENTAL SCHEMES

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved;

"That a sum not exceeding: Rs. 39,08,300 on Capital Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 3slt day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Functional Buildings and other Developmental Schemes'."

DEMAND NO. 55-WATER SUPPLY SCHEMES

MR. SPEAKER; Motion moved:

"That a sum not exceeding Rs. 25,32,900 on Revenue Account and not exceeding Rs. 26,25,000 on Capital Account be granted to the President on account, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, for or towards to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of 'Water Supply Schemes'"

DEMAND NO. 1-STATE LEGISLATURE

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 12,14,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of 'State Legislature'."

DEMAND NO. 3-COUNCIL OF MINISTERS

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 26,62,000 on Revenue

St. Res. re Proclamation CHAITRA 4, 1897 (SAKA) in relation to 265 266 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G.

Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975 in respect of 'Council of Ministers'."

DEMAND NO. 5-ELECTIONS

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 2,51,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975 in respect of 'Elections'."

DEMAND NO. 7-STATE EXCISE

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 20,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of 'State Excise'."

DEMAND NO. 9-TAXES ON VEHICLES

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 65,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975 in respect of "Taxes on Vehicles'."

DEMAND NO. 12-CIVIL SECRETARIAT

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 7,58,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President,

(Nagaland)

out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975 in respect of 'Civil Secretariat'."

DEMAND NO. 15-SPECIAL EXPENDITURE. ON MAINTENANCE OF LAW AND ORDER INCLUDING CONTRIBUTION FOR PENSION AND GRATUITIES.

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 46,32,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March. 1975, in respect of 'Special expenditure on maintenance of law and order including contribution for pension and gratuities'."

DEMAND NO. 16-VILLAGE GUARDS

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 3,00,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of 'Village guards'."

DEMAND NO. 17-CIVIL POLICE AND FIRE SERVICE UNIT

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 95,00,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of 'Civil Police and Fire Service Unit'."

267 St. Res. re Proclamation MARCH 25, 1975 in relation to Magdiand 268 and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

DEMAND NO. 18-JAILS

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved;

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 5,80,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of 'Jails'."

DEMAND NO. 20-PUBLIC WORKS, HOUSING, ROADS AND BRIDGES

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. \$,50,58,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of 'Public Works, Housing, Roads and Bridges'."

DEMAND NO. 22-WORKSHOP ORGANISA-TION

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 5,00,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of Workshop Organisation'."

DEMAND NO. 23-NAGALAND HOUSES

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 50,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of 'Nagaland Houses'."

DEMAND NO. 24-ADMINISTRATIVE TRAINING INSTITUTE

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 1,31,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of 'Administrative Training Institute'."

DEMAND NO. 27-EDUCATION

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 6,71,000 on Revenue, Account be granted to the President, out of the Compolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of "Education"."

DEMAND NO. 29-MEDICAL AND PUBLIC HEALTH

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 51,83,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of Medical and Public Health'."

DFMAND NO. 30-WATER SUPPLY SCHEMES

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved; '

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 38,50,600 on Revenue 369 St. Res. re Proclamation CHAITRA 4, 1897 (SAKA) in relation to 2 :0 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G.

· Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of 'Water Supply Schemes'."

DEMAND NO. 31-URBAN DEVELOPMENT

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 50,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund, of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of 'Urban Development'."

DEMAND NO. 37-RELIEF, SOCIAL SECU-RITY AND WELFARE SERVICES

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 17,18,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of Relief, Social Security and Welfare Services.."

DEMAND NO. 45-SOIL CONSERVATION

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 70,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of 'Soil Conservation'." أه مد

(Nagaland)

DEMAND NO. 46-GRAIN SUPPLY SCHEME

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 1,50,40,000 on Capital Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of 'Grain Supply Scheme'."

DEMAND NO. 49-INDUSTRIES

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 1,50,40,000 on Capital Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of 'Industries'."

DEMAND NO. 51-POWER PROJECTS

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 1,07,50,000 on Revenue Account and not exceeding Rs. 92,80,000 on Capital Account be granted to the President. out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of 'Power Projects'."

DEMAND No. 52-ROAD TRANSPORT SCHEMES

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 12,00,000 on Revenue Account be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year . . .,

DEMAND NO. 54-HOUSING LOANS AND LOANS TO GOVERNMENT SERVANTS

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That a Supplementary sum not exceeding Rs. 2,77,000 on Capital Account be granted to the Prestdent, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending on the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of Housing Loans and Loans to Government Servants'."

The Statutory Resolution, the Nagaland Budget, the Demands for Grants on Account and Supplementary Demands for Grants are before the House.

SHRI DASARATHA DEB (Tripura East): Mr. Speaker, Sir. the President's Rule imposed in Nagaland by the ruling party is deliberately an attempt to over-throw the non-Congress Government in the State. Wherever it is possible, they make an attempt to overthrow the non-Congress Government and. to achieve that objective, the Congress Government at the Centre did never hesitate to take any unscrpulous and illegal method to topple the non-Congress Government.

13.35 hrs.

[MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER in the Chair]

The UDF Ministry in Nagaland led by Mr. Vizol has been forcibly toppled by the Naga National Organisation, the NNO, which is known to all is linked up with the Congress. In his statement. Mr. Vizol complained that 5 MLAs of his party were kidnapped by the NNO with the help of the security forces. In this way, the NNO Ministry in Nagaland led by Mr. Jasokie has been installed.

Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G. 272 (Nagaland)

Since coming into office, the dissolved Ministry was trying to open a dialogue with the underground Federal Government of Nagaland in order to settle the 27-years old problem which is disturbing peace in this region. But it seems and it is evidently clear that the Central Government is not in favour of this peace effort. That is why they were trying to over-throw the UDF Ministry and they have succeeded in their objective.

Now, this Government which had been forcibly installed by the Congress Government at the Centre could not remain in office for more than 11 days. It had to collapse. Even before that, we know, how the Government's mind was working. As soon as the Assembly met, they told the Speaker that 10 Members of the NNO. including 3 Ministers, were being held under duress and said that the House could not transact any business under such circumstances. But the Times of India report say that 10 Members, however, informed the speaker m writing that they had crossed the floor and joined the UDF. There were 33 Members on the Opposition Benches and 27 Members on the Treasury Benches in a House of 60 Members. It was not possuble for the Government to run the Assembly. Their function is to run the Assembly. That does not mean that immediately the President's Rule should be imposed.

This Government did not allow other party to form the Ministry. At least, they should have allowed some time to see if there was any group that could form the Ministry. But that was not done. In the case of Mr. Jasokie, they immediately installed the Government and allowed him to form the Ministry. There was no delay at all. But in the case of others, they are in such a hurry to impose the President's Rule. Even the Report says that there was growing impression in Nagaland that it was drifting towards the President's Rule. That is the impression that was going on in Delhi itself.

St. Res. re Proclamation CHAITRA 4 1897 (SAKA) in relation to 273 274 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G.

That is why it is clearly known that this Government tries to topple the non-Congress Government in the State. We have seen a series of Governments formed by defections and other things, They say that their Members were held under duress. It cannot be "under duress" because these Members were present in the Assembly. How can it be "under duress". How can we take the word of the Chief Minister? The defection is there. But who initiated the defection. It is the ruling party everywhere that is trying to have defections somehow or other to topple the non-Congress Ministry and somehow or other, to instal their yes-man Ministry. That is what is going on. In this way, you are not going to help to improve the functioning of democracy in our country.

I want to point out one thing more. The people say that this area is a very sensitive area. Even yesterday, Mr. Mukherjee said that this particular tribal area of Nagaland and other such areas are sensitive. We should not talk in such a way which creates complications. Don't say, it is a sensitive area. Why have these people become sensitive? They have got their rights; they have got their certain demands; they have got their aspirations; they want to have proper development there. I want to know whether all the rights are being given to the people living in the tribal areas. Whether it is Nagaland or Arunachal Pradesh or Mizoram or Bodo tribes or Tripura tribes, are they getting proper treatment from this Government? Have they no right to build up their own nationalities, to develop their own nationalities? That is not being given to them. They are being deprived of all these rights ...

SHRI VAYALAR (Chirayınkil): How? You prove it.

SHRI DASARATHA DEB: What business have you to impose on the tribal people in Tripura the script which they do not like? They should have their own choice in respect of script (Interruptions). Civilian routes

(Nagaland)

were constructed in Arunachal Pradesh and Nagaland, but those routes are banned for the civilians; they are being used only by the military people. What business have you got to prevent the civilian people from using those routes?

Now, I want to point out that there are three Governments there: one is the civilian Ministry formed on the basis of elections; another is the military Government who, under the nose of the elected government, are doing anything they like; they rape women, they torture and butcher the people; all these things have appeared in the newspapers also. Why are people being subjected to that kind of repression? Apart from the civil and military administrations, there is the underground Government. So, three governments are functioning there. Why?

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI: What is the solution (Interruptions).

SHRI DASARATHA DEB: The solution is to leave it for the people to decide. You are not allowing the people to come to some settlement for the benefit of that part of the country and also for India.

The Government must realise that every linguistic group or tribe, whether it is small or big, whether they are developed or undeveloped. has got every right to have their national aspirations and to enjoy rights and privileges to develop themselves as any other people do. When the fundamental human rights are denied, people become very sensitive and they take recourse even to revolt. Now, what has happened in my State?

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Do not go to your State. Confine yourself to Nagaland.

SHRI DASARATHA DEB: I can refer to other States also. The same thing happened in the Tripura Assembly ...

[Shri P. G. Mavalankar]

that when that resolution comes before the House.

The President's Address, unfortunately, mentions practically nothing about labour, except merely one or two words, patting labour on the back, But what about the comprehensive Industrial Relations Bill? When I asked this question three times, the first time I was told that "it is under consideration" the second time "It is under active consideration" and the third time "it is under very factive consideration". They have not gone beyond that.

I will give only one example. The provident fund of the labour carries only an interest of 6 per cent, while the Unit Trust gives 7 per cent, banks 8 or 10 per cent and fixed deposit with companies 12 per cent. The labour is demanding a higher rate of interest on their provident fund account. Moreover, they want that they should be permitted to withdraw the P.F. amount as loan after 20 years of service. But that is also refused.

(So/I would say in conclusion that the national climate is depressing and deteriorating. There is lack of sincerity of purpose and absence of earnestness, particularly on the government side; not only on the government side, but all around. None of us, it seems to me, is in earnest about delivering the goods. If we do not do it, and if the youth of this country and the poor people of this country are not given an opportunity to blossom, an opportunity to develop their personality, first of all, to live and to become themselves by developing their personality, they will not remain silent spectators. So, I will conclude by saying that all is not well with the State of this country.

SHRI TARUN GOGOI (Jorhat): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, while participating in this discussion on the President's Address, I would like to take the opportunity to extend my conon President's Address gratulations to the Prime Minister for taking a bold step of arriving at a settlement with Sheikh Abdullah within the framework of our Constitution and thereby making a major break-through in the direction of the solution of the most complicated problem of Jammu and Kashmir. This accord is of great significance. This accord not only brings a bulk of the population of Jammu and Kashmir within the mainstream of national life of this country, but it will contribute to the unity and integrity of the country and will strengthen

of the country and will strengthen the forces of democracy, secularism and socialism. Since 1953 various changes have taken place in the State of Jammu and Kashmir, and what is heartening to know is that there is realisation and acceptance on the part of Sheikh Abdullah of the change in the situation.

15.50 hrs.

[SHRI NAWAL KISHORE SINHA in the Chair.]

We welcome Sheikh Abdullah's decision to join in the national political life of the country and to lead the State of Jammu and Kashmir. We hope that under his able and dynamic leadership there will be all round/development and progress of the State of Jammu and Kashmir.

The reaffirmation of Sheikh Abdulah that the accession of Jammu and Kashmir to India is final and irrevocable, that in view of this accord plebiscite has become irrelevant and that in the national crisis the hands of the Prime Minister should be strengthened, for the purpose of secularism, socialism and democracy, is a statement of great significance.

I would also like to take the opportunity of expressing my strong resentment and protest at the decision of the American Government to lift the arms embargo on Pakistan. This is a matter of serious and the most disturbing concern not only for India but for the whole sub-continent. It

Motion of Thanks PHALGUNA 6, 1896 (SAKA) Motion of Thanks 278 on President's Address on President's Address

mill not only hinder the process of cormalisation of relations between india and Pakistan, it will not only train Indo-American relations, but it mill also disturb peace and stability and shake the economic development of the whole of the sub-continent. It will create unnecessary tension, un-

This decision betrays the assurance of Dr. Kissinger, who made a statement during his last visit to India that America was keen on the normalisation of relations between India and Pakistan and that America did not encourage an arms race in the subcontinent. This is the real attitude of America tawards India. America's real policy is of maintaining the balance of power and of maintaining arity between India and Pakistan.

Never before, since we attained independence, has the country been confronted with such a serious crisis, conomic and political. In the last two years, 1973 and 1974. we faced an unprecedented rise in prices of every commodity and a high inflationary trend. Thereby, everyone of us has been badly hit. You could realise human suffering and the difficulties of the poor people. Nobody could deny that even after 27 years of independence there are lakhs or millions/ of people who do not have two souare meals a day, who do not have shelter to live in, who do not have the bare necessity of clothing to wear, not to speak of the bare minimum needs of modern life. It is also very pathetic to see that lakhs and lakhs of youth, who are full of vigour and energy, are without any employment and are every morning knocking at the doors of Government offices, private firms and industry and trade. Whenever we go to our constituencies, we find lots of young people do come and approach us for employment.

These two, unemployment and poverty, are the two greatest challenges of the country and it is for us to meet these challenges. It is not correct to say that the Government is not conscious of it. Government is conscious of it; Government is alert to the situation and Government has taken bold and revolutionary steps in the direction to see that these problems are solved.

As regards high prices and the inflationary trend, India is not an exception. Even in the advanced countries these problems are there. When the more advanced countries, countries which are much more progressive, have not been able to solve it, how do we expect a poor country like India to meet the challenge adequately? On the other hand, the Government of India has taken certain unpopular and bold decisions. Government has taken various steps against smugglers, hoarders and blackmarketeers. Other monetary steps have also been taken which have yielded good results. There has not only been stabilisation of prices but there has also been a downward trend in prices. We hope that Government will take various other steps so that there is an improvement in the economic situation in the country.

There might be some lapses on the part of Government. That does not justify that the Opposition should criticize whatever the Government does. The Opposition has failed to discharge its duties by not contributing constructive suggestions. What is the role of the Opposition parties? As we have got responsibility to the people, they have also got responsibility to the people. They are contented or satisfied merely with criticizing; they are bent on criticizing the Government.

It is a matter of great concern to the country that certain groups of people have combined together to weaken democracy. They are attacking democratic institutions and functions. There is nothing wrong with/ democracy; there might be changes in procedures. These are the people who sometimes claim that they arc strengthening democracy. These are the people who, whenever they are elected, say that the election is fair,

279 St. Res. r. Proclamation MARCH 25, 1975 in relation to Nagaland 280 and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

and peace is restored there, at the same time under President's Rule. I request that some elected Government comes to power there as President's Rule could not remain there for long With these words, I oppose the President's Rule.

SHRI D. BASUMATARI (Kokrajhar). Sir, I rise to support the Proclamation placed on the Table by the Home Minister I have gone through the Presidential Proclamation and the Supplementary Demands etc etc, that are presented before the House My friends Opposite spoke emotional'y They have every right to speak in an emotional way There is no way out except to impose the President's Rule

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER Mr Basumatarı, you are not audıble to the Reporters. Please speak up like a tribal I do not know if I have to go to the school again m order to teach myself how to pronounce words correctly.

SHRI D BASUMATARI Sir, I support whole heartedly this Proclamation though I cannot support every thing there I do know very well the history of Nagaland You will now know that since the inception of Nagaland and Meghalaya, I oppased very much creation of Statehood in this House itself on the plea that the consequence of that would have been the same as you have now seen Our great leader, Pandit Nehru thought that Nagaland should develop in their own genius. Then that Statehood was granted You know it very well that it was Pandit Nehru who told in that Executive Committee that there would be no more bifurcation there in Assam. That was the situation then as you see to day

Now, Sir, I am coming to the history of Nagaland and my State In those days, before the British Rule, there was a Feudal system in my State In those days, the people of Nagaland had cordial relations with the plams people. You know it very well that there was cordial relation with the other people in your area now, Meghalaya There were cordial relations with the people of Mizoram, too. Therefore, there must be something as to why people of these areas are not co-operating with the Government even though so many developmental activities have been taken up by the Government over there.

Before Independence some of these parts were kept excluded The people of those areas were not allowed to come to plains and the people from the plains were not allowed to go there during British rule for 150 years They were kept separately and therefore suspicions arose in the minds of the people

At the time of Independence Naga people came under the leadership of Rano Erake, now Salza She came along with 12 Naga chiefs here to know what will be the position of Nagaland after the Independence of India The Administration did not understand the purpose of the r visit and they were not treated well They were treated shabbily I had to invite them and keep them at my place for some days and provide food to them. When they found that they were not being allowed to discuss with the Administration then they thought it better to discuss with the Organisation

Then Mr Deputy Speaker Shri Dhebar Bhai came with an open mmd to Kohama to discuss with Phizo but when the taks were going to be held an order came from Delhi-without the knowledge of the Prime Minister and the Defence Minister—that Dhebar Bhai should not be allowed to talk with Phizo That is the crux of the whole matter From that time onward **a** suspicion developed and then you had to grant them a separate State to Naga people now Nagaland in the map

Now, there are two groups—one is NNO and the other is UDF. What is UDF? It is a party of the underground They came out and ruled for some time When they could not rule the NNO party came When the NNO party could not maintain majority then the Speaker had to adjourn the House and now a Proclamation has come. Sir

281 St. Re. re. Proclamation CHAITRA 4, 1897 (SAKA) in relation to 282 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G.

it is not only the question of administration there but it is also a question of as to how to deal with the tribal people of eastern zone. You cannot control the tribals by rules and military force. You have to win their hearts. It is to be ruled by treating them as friends. My friends are opposing. My friend. Mr. Deb. just now spoke. This is not in good spirit. Let him speak, what is in their heart. I am a tribal, you are a tribal and you know very well how they are treated.

. . .

, - - - -

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: This is the day of tribals.

SHRI D. BASUMATARI: You know my heart and I know your heart. I am speaking from my heart because ...

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Let us not conduct it in a tribal manner.

SHRI BASUMATARI: I would request the Home Minister to see, what is wrong there. Mr. Deb said that there are two different administrations, one is military and the other is the civilian administration. That is true. When the Government found that law and order is not being maintained by this UDF, what prevented the Government of India from taking over law and order in their hands? Sir. I visited Nagaland some months back and I stayed there for ten days. People from every walk of life and from every group came to see me. They exchanged ideas with me and they asked me 'why so much military personnel are there?; Why don't you remove the Army people and why don't you allow us to lead our way of life?' Since the time of Independence, they have been saying this. You cannot denv it. Only with the help of administration. only with the help of army personnel and civilians. if you want to rule these people, then, I do not think, Mr. Mohsin, it will be good for you. You will not be able to tackle the problems. I would request the administration and the Home Minister to see this in the proper perspective. It is not possible for you to judge the thing from Delhi.

(Nagaland) sitting in an ivory tower. You should go there and see what is the position.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: That hand will need medical attention after your speech.

SHRI D. BASUMATARI: I leave it to you to see to my hand. Therefore, Sir, I would request the Home Minister to see for himself what is the position there. Sir, when I visited Nagaland, this was the complaint. Not only that. Sir, you know. Mr. Nicholas Roy who has been there ...

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Why bring him here?

SHRI D. BASUMATARI: He used to say 'Mr. Basumatari. I have been a Minister here for so many years; I go to the houses of my friends, as a friend and not as Minister, but, no non-tribal Minister comes to me;'. This is the relationship between the tribals and the non-tribals. There is something wrong some-where. That is why you carnot win the heart, Mr. Mohsin....

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER I tell you, if people leave me alone, I am happy. It is only when they do not leave me alone that I feel inconvenient.

SHRI D. BASU'MATARI: If you interrupt, I forget what I want to say.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I was referring to what you were saying.

SHRI D. BASUMATARI The Naga people, compared to other tribals, are heroes. They have got their own culture. They have got their own systems They have got everything in their side. We talk of culture. What is culture? If you talk of culture and tradition, it is the Naga people who have maintained the culture very nicely and traditionally they have kept it. Sir, the Naga people give their assistance in war times. You will see in the Army that they are the best You will see in the armymen. that they are the best hospitals This is not the same nurses. in other areas. They are active and at the same time sincere. But since-

St. Res. re Proclamation MARCH 25, 1975 in relation to Nageland' 283 281 and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

they are treated as naked tribals. They are not naked. Compared to the non-tribals, educationally, they have come up very much. In regard to literscy yours is the second high Mizoram is the highest with 53.47 per cent and Nagaland is the third. But still we talk of tribals as uncivilised.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I wonder whether even the Nagas would like ihat.

SHRI D. BASUMATARI: They sre not uncivilised If you talk loosely about tribals and all that, they lose faith and they do whatever they like I only say that the Home Minister should not only rule through the administration, the military, the army and the officers, but should take the responsibility to see that the Nagaland people are not exploited by others and that they are enabled to lead a peaceful life.

SHRI A. KEVICHUSA (Nagaland) Sir, the recent defection and redefections in Nagaland have tarnished the face of the State. The Nagaland Assembly is dead, at least for the time being. The Legislature Party of UDF is burried alive. It is not my intention to make a futile attempt to bring about a resurrection. I only want to present a brief post-mortem report on the cause of death.

When occasion came for a trial of strength on the floor of the House, 33 members in a House of 60 were found sitting opposite the Treasury Bench. The Speaker, who had but a few days earlier, defected from UDF, adje irned the House sine die. thus creating a precedent, posing grave danger to parliamentary democracy.

The events preceding the defections lead one to believe that the initial defections received help from outside sources. In the first week of March, 5 MLAs belonging to UDF from farflung parts of Nagaland were brought to Dimapur to join one Tokheho Sema, a Cabinet Minister in the erstwhile UDF Ministry. Tokheho Sema's in-

tention to defect had been an open secret since the last week of January. One of the five to join Tokheho Sema was from Meluri, the eastern-most constituency. two were from Tuensang district in the farthest Northeast and two from Mon district of the farthest north. One of the five compared his experience of being whisked away to Dimapur to that of a chic carried away by a hawk. The party of 1+5 moved from Dimapur in Bokajan, about 11 miles away, and the next day to Arunachal Circuit House in Jorhat. On the 6th or 7th the party returned to Dimapur, but were hosted in the Army Cantonment at Rangapahar a few miles from Dimapur. On the intervention of the Governor, these six men were taken to a BSF camp near Kohima and then to the bouse of Jasokie, who reaped the harvest of the defections by becoming the Chief Minister in succession to Vizol.

Now we have the President's Rule in Nagaland. I only want the House to know that on the fall of UDF Government certain officers were credited as King-makers and were congratulated. I wish also to make it known that on the eve of the 1974 general election, certain officers declared that the UDF would not be allowed to form Government, even if the party turned out to be in the majority. If, during President's Rule, these officers continue to work on partisan lines, the administration will lose the confidence of the bulk of the people and parliamentary democracy will become farce in Nagaland.

I can only trust that the President's Rule will show the people of Nagaland that there can be fairness, equity and justice under the Constitution of India and that there can be a fair and free election without interference by armed personnel and busy-body officials, as bitterly experienced bу us in the past.

MR. DEPUTY_SPEAKER: Shri N. Tombi Singh: May I repeat that the request from your party whip is that

285 St. Rev. re Proclamation CHAITBA 4, 1897 (SAKA) in relation to 286 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

you should conclude your remarks within seven minutes.

SHRI N. TOMBI SINGH (Inner Manipur): Sir, am I to understand that we are discussing items 14, 15, 16 and 17 together?

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Yes.

SHRI N. TOMBI SINGH; At the outset, I would like to support the Proclamation of the President to impose President's Rule in Nagaland. It is not because I am in favour of on President's Rule being imposed Nagaland, or on any State for that matter, but because of the special circumstances that were prevailing there. Having gone through the details given by the Governor in his report, I think he had no other alternative but to recommend either suspension or dissolution of the Assembly and imposition of President's Rule in the State. The Government of India in their wisdom decided to suspend the Assembly and impose Presidential Rule there to solve the urgent political situation, which was complicated with some constitutional issues which have been very elaborately discussed here.

Nagaland forms one of the units of the very sensitive and strategic north eastern area. Therefore, what happens to Nagaland has got its repercussions on the other neighbouring States. It was very understandable from your point of view, as well as from the general point of view, as was rightly pointed out when some other hon. Members mentioned proplems in the other States comprising the north-eastern area, that we should confine our discussion to Nagaland. But I belong to a State, which is leighbouring Nagaland, which also las got certain common issues. Nagaand is also our gateway. We have n our area a big block of Naga peoıle. Naturally, we cannot consider lagaland in exclusion from our own roblems. Therefore, I would seek he indulgence to examine hurriedly he problem that is obtaining in Naga and, not in isolation, but in the broad-'r context of the entire north-eastern Irea.

Referring to Nagaland, it has one advantage and also Meghalaya which is your State, Sir, and Mizoram which is a Umon Territory. These three units of our country are cent per cent tribal areas. The difference in the case of Assam, Manipur-which is my State-and Tripura is that these areas are partly tribal and partly nontribal. Assam, of course, is now substantially a non-tribal area although some tribal population is there. When we discuss the tribal welfare, the protection of tribals, their interests in various ways in these three States, particularly, Nagaland, Meghalaya and

particularly, Nagaland, Megnalaya and Mizoram and also Arunachal to a certain extent, we can experiment with the working of a certain train of thought which, I think, our Ministry is very competent to do and it should see all possible ways to bring a new train of thought to be exercised and implemented in these tribal States.

As regards Nagaland, it is a fact which you cannot ignore and the question is, whether the mainstream of Indian politics has been introduced or not after so many years of Independence after Nagaland became a State in 1964, and we have to see that the mainstream has been introduced there. We have allowed the mainstream to enter into the tribal area, a very sensitive area. Of course, it will not be an easy thing to transport every thing, what happens in the broader context of the country, to small areas.

It has been pointed out in the speech of the Home Minister in the other House that sizable allocations-I am giving an instance-have been made in various Plans, particularly in the Fifth Plan, and it has been pointed out by the Home Minister in his speech that the expenditures were not made properly and it has also been pointed out that the money so sizable and liberally allocated for these areas has not been spent for the benefit of the common people. Now, the question arises whether in the normal context of the Centre-State relationship, in these small and difficult areas, the

St. Res. re Proclamation MARCH 25, 1975 in relation to Nagiland 287 288

Centre should merely allocate certain amounts and, afterwards, say that these amounts were not properly spent or they did not reach the common people.

What I would suggest in this connection is that the Home Ministry should have a permanent machinery not only for Nagaland put also for all the tribal and smaller States which are not cent per cent unbal States. Of course. Manipur. Tripura and Assam, all these States, have nore or less common problem of establishing better relation between the tribals and nationals. For all these States, we have already agreed, the nation through this Parliament has agreed to depart from the normal yardsticks not only in the financial allocations but also in the promotion of special political status in these States.

MR. DEPUTY_SPEAKER: Your time has run out. But I will give you three or four minutes more. Please try to conclude.

SHRI N. TOMBI SINGH. Yes, Sir. I suggest that a permanent machinery should be evolved by which we can see that the allocations made for the smaller areas are properly spent. and also that these allocations go to the strengthening of the relations between the mainstream of the country and the common people of these areas who are also interested, as the Home Minister has very rightly pointed out, in peace, progress and development. But now who handles this situation? The question is not particularly for Nagaland only. We have to see that, in the name of hostilities, in the name of insurgents; in the name of certain underground elements, whether the special allocations, money and other facilities, that have been given liberally from the national exchequer have been allowed to flow out in the interest of those who go against the nation, in the interest of those who are insurgents. This machinery has to be set up.

It has been very rightly pointed out that the expenditure on police is on

and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

the increase. It is not only in fbe case of Nagaland, but it is true more or less of the whole country. Particularly confining succeives to the small areas, to the sensitive areas in the north-eastern region, we feel that the Home Ministry should take up measures to introduce a machinery through which we could spend on development, education culture and on measures for socio-economic consolidation of the people. By this way, we can reduce the expenditure on police and the military postings there We find that, so far, this aspect bas been taken up only casually, and as I have said earlier in a different context any casual approach has never paid. Therefore, I suggest that the Home Ministry should take this opportunity-confining itself for the time being to the present Nagaland problem-to introduce a machinery through which we can have a rethinking.

Now I come to certain things which we should have considered earlier. Our area belongs to the category of remote part of an audience during a stage performance: When we take the country as a whole, we are far away from the stage; and although we can see the stage-play very clearly, in the broader context of the country, the stage-players, the people in the Capital, even the leaders at the helm of affairs, do not see our geographical position, do not know where we stand. Many of our friends here ask me where is Manipur, what is its Capital. where 15 Nagaland and 50 on. Some of them, of course, may ask very in-But when this nocent questions. amounts to ignorance of facts, a psychological distance is created and this may lead to anything. We have no complaint about the political attention that the Government of India has so far given to us. We are small Nagaland is a small State. States. The Minister took pains to point out Nagaland has only about five that lakhs of people. Many of our friends have mentioned this, although it is a fact, when members mention that it is a tiny State which gets so much

299 St. Res. re Proclamation CEANERA 4, 1897 (SAKA) in relation to 290 Negaland and D.G. & S.D.G.

stightion, comptimes it thurs our sen timents. After all, we have proved that, whatever special attention politically has been given, has been given because of our special problems. If we stop with the political attention and do not undertake follow-up programmes for socio-soonomic and cultural consolidction of these areas, that will not help: more upgradation of the units politically will not lead to anything. Coming to the present Nagaland problem, defections and redefections have been happening. For a few months we are not in the n'ews. . .

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: There is keen competition in the country to be in the news!

SHRI N. TOMBI SINGH: Yes, Sir. Stability is needed in every State. It is to be much more so in areas like Nagaland, Manipur, Tripura etc. These are strategic and sensitive areas. It is the concern of all of us. Everybody should share this concern. There have been various remarks against the Governor's action. In the circumstances the Governor has done the right thing and he has no alternative.

SHRI P. K. DEO (Kalahandi). You are pleading a lost cause ...

DEPUTY-SPEAKER · I think MR. you have said enough to justify that. Kindly conclude.

SHRI N. TOMBI SINGH; I conclude by saying this: that Nagaland should have a stable Government and if at all there should be President's Rule, for some time, it should be for the minimum time possible. Here I want to give one warning to the politicians and the officers who are working there. There should be complete isolation of space between the politicians and the officers and the bureaucrats should not be allowed to have their own Way.

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: There is a tendency in this House to upgrade

(Nagaland)

these officers too much and that is the sign of the failure of the leadership. We should not bring the officers here. It is the leadership which is responsible, why bring in the officers here? I cannot understand this.

SHRI N. TOMBI SINGH: I abide by your ruling. I have, however, come across reports about officerseven criticisms of the Governor-and in the proceedings of the other House ...

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please don't take notice of the proceedings of the other House.

SHRI N. TOMBI SINGH; Unfortunately it is our experience that in small States, the officers play a big role. My only appeal is this, They should do their duty and not moddle in politics. They should be free from politics. This is my request. With these words I support the Motion for imposition of President's rule in Nagaland.

SHRI H. N. MUKHERJEE (Calcutta-North-East): You will forgive me. Mr. Deputy-Speaker, if I recall, that when Jawaharlal Nehru was here, there was no discussion on Nagaland, not even a single question, in which he did not himself take part. But today I find that 30 odd number of us are having a listless debate and I am trying to imagine, if I were a Naga, having come to attend the session of Parliament, from the visitors' gallery, I would have hardly felt myself encouraged to feel myself a national of this country ...

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER This thing has again and again taken place We have the tendency to refer to the gallery. I say, this is a very wrong practice Order please. I don't think this should go on record.

SHRJ H. N. MUKHERJEE; Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, I am sadder Mr. still to note that this is the Thirtyseventh time since 1950 that state of the Indian Union has been taken over by the President and, in a short

291 St. Res. re Proclamation MARCH 25, 1975 in relation to Nagaland 393 and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

period, the State of Nagaland, the fifteenth Indian State, has to be taken over and it has now this distinction of being taken over by the President.

I was sorry to note from the Governor's letter to the President which incidentally has an elegance as compared to some other communications from the Government to the President. This is a very decent performance. It is sickening to discover that Nagas, whom I personally had the privilege of getting to know at close quarter since 1965, and who are celebrated all over the country for truthtelling and for being straightforward, are obviously being very badly contaminated by the political atmosphere which we seem to have acquired in this country.

The Governor reported, for example, that since the new U.D.F. Ministry assumed office about a year ago, many defections have taken place. I quote from his letter:

"Eight Members have defected once; another 8 have defected twice; and two have defected three times."

And in the recent operations, Mr. Vizol's ministry and Mr. Jasokie's ministry present another spectacle which does not speak well. I would not like to say anything on this. I am trying to find one thing. There is one Deputy-Speaker in the Vizol Ministry who went over to become a Minister in the N. N. O. Ministry-one group loses and another group winsall of them are the bird's of the same feather People perhaps say that they damn the ins and damn the outs and I damn them all together. I have no sympathy for these chaps, for these ayaram and gayaram. Even in Nagaland. in Mr. Deputy-Speaker's Office, . . .

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: A very exciting precedent, I think!

SHRI H. N. MUKHERJEE: I also saw in the paper a very disconcerting report of which we cannot take any notice in order to be able to control it. It is a very disconcerting report For example, the report is. I am quoting from the Governor's letter;

"When the Legislature met this morning, the Speaker Shri Keditsu, adjourned it sine die, Shri Keditsu had been a member of the UDF, and had been elected Speaker with support of that party. He had, however, declared his preference for the NNO on 9th March."

The Governor writes this letter to the President which Mr. Brahmananda Reddy has the right to present it here in a spirit of detachment, as if the Speaker, in a Legislature from one party has gone over to the other party.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: This 18 the case of whatever you can do we can do it better.

SHRI H. N. MUKHERJEE: I cannot understand how these goings on would continue in this country in cur Parliamentary system, For instance a situation is created where the Speaker adjourned the House sine die May be, the Speaker was right ín saving when he did that that his own life was in denger and that some other Members were in duress confined somewhere against their will. If this is the way in which a Parliamentary Government has to run, then Heaven knows what would happen to the people of Nagaland in particular and to the rest of us in this country.

I find from the budget also which is presented that the way in which Government proceeds, it does not appear to be inclined to relieve the anxiety and the miseries and the sufferings of the people of Nagaland. I made a rough calculation and I discovered a few items. Under 'Civil Police and Fire Service Unit' Rs. 5.23 crores are allocated in the budget while, under Tribal Development Blocks and Community Projects' lakhs have been allocated. Rs. 83 Under 'Forests'-I have seen the Nagaland forests, how rich they are-

293 St. Res. re Proclamation CHAITRA 4, 1897 (SAKA) in relation to 294 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

Rs. 79.90 lakhs have been allocated Industries Rs. 54.70 lakhs; power projects Rs. 2.84 crores; social welfare Rs. 35.85 lakhs, etc. Altogether it comes to a little over Rs. 5 crores while on Police alone there is a provision of Rs. 5 crores apart from the Army which is looking after the major part of the law and order problem there. This is not the way to run Nagaland. This is not the way in which we can win the affections of people whose problems are so crucial to the future of the entire country of ours. That is why this discussion today is important. Because of the insensitivity which Parliament has developed we do not seem to hear what is happening in Nagaland and in this country.

I do not understand how is it that these goings on continue in Nagaland and Government has never the idea of taking Parliament into confidence. In the earlier days whenever avestions relating to Nagaland were likely to be propounded before the House there would be preliminary discussion with the Prime Minister. He used to take the Opposition into confidence Why is it if there are any defaults in administration of Nagaland vour which has enabled the continuance of discontent in that crucial region we are not told about it. Why are we suddenly surprised with this kind of thing and then we are told to legalise this matter before 31st March. Has Government no responsibility to see that budget papers are prepared with at least minimum decencies of Parliamentary etiquette? This is the position to which we have been reduced and which makes impossible for us to function.

May I ask Government if defection which was so alien to Nagaland has become so chronic how is it that the anti-defection Bill has been hanging fire for so long? This defection no our political atmosphere is something which has got to be cured.

Sir, I do not hold any brief to condemn anybody but there is no doubt from the way events have been re-

ported by the Governor of Nagaland that the ruling party had a very big .hand in promoting defections one way or the other. Let the Home Minister repudiate what I say with hand on his heart. Let him tell me and I am ready to believe him. Sir. As far as produced before the records so far the House are concerned, nothing to show that Government did not have a hand in this game of defection. Otherwise, it would not have happened. Sir, if Speakers do not behave, if Speakers wish to become Ministers and all that sort of thing, we konw that kind of thing has happened in other parts of India...

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I hope it will never happen here.

SHRI H. N. MUKHERJEE: Well, Sir, in other parts of India....

MR. DEPUTY_SPEAKER: I am talking about us.

SHRI H. N. MUKHERJEE. Ministers have become Speakers. The next metamorphosis is still to come.

MR. DEPUTY_SPEAKER: I am talking about ourselves.

SHRI H. N. MUKHERJEE: Would you please do not provoke me into prognostications which are perhange warranted by certain happenings. But, what I mean to tell very seriously to this House is that parliamentary life would lose in its character and its ethos. Do not behave in this way. If the salt losses it savour, where will it be salted? We are told that there was police cordoning of the Assembly. I do not know if it was true. He may repudiate it. If it is true that Pressmen were kept out of altogether. without the Assembly anybody's special dispensation, from the Legislature itself, then, surely that kind of thing is derogatory to the very basic existence of parliamentary life. I do not support the kind of thing which my friend Mr. Deb said. I can understand his anger. I can sympathise with the kind of feelings that he has got. But, I do not support many of the formulations which he made. But, if in Tripura, for instance,

295 St. Res. rs Proclamation MARCH 25, 1975 in relation to Nagaland 296 and D.G. & B.D.G. (Nagaland)

inside the presincts of the Assembly, the Leader of the Opposition happens to be arrested, then surely that kind of thing is never going to make any kind of contribution to the stabilisation of parliamentary life in this country.

Sir in Nagaland, as you know very well, there is perhaps, as yet, no real communication between the Centre and the Naga people. I say this because in 1963 I had the privilege as a Member of the Parliamentary delegation to go to Kohima and to go to other parts of Nagaland. I remember, Sir, by helicopter, I went to a place which was supposed to be entirely anti India, so to speak and I was given the job of addressing a very hostile audience. Sir-if you do not mind my dragging a little-I was the only person in the delegation who succeeded in extracting an applause from the Naga audience and I did that not because of any magic formula which I could utter, but because, I told them that if the Indian Army, this was in 1965, in the years before had comitted any atrocities, they remain to be proved and they would certainly be court martialled or otherwise brought to trial, but that in the meantime, I am ready and willing, if the Naga people have got that impression, if that kind of thing is in their mind. I am ready and willing on behalf of my country to apologise to them and to ask them for assistance in building a new India of which Nagaland would be a willing part. They applauded only when they found that someone from India was trying to show a sympathetic spirit. That is why, they looked up to Jawaharlal Nehru in the way they did. That is why, perhaps, even todaymy friend from Nagaland has gone away after having spoken-they naturally expect India to behave in a manner which is important.

That reminds me of my last point which I wish to make, and that will be in continuation of what I have said yesterday. I do feel that whatever our grouse against the Government, and the grouse is very strong, whatever our criticians of Government's handling of the Nagaland problem recently, we should discuss these matters in a manner which should not assist the enemies of our country. Nagaland is an area where advantage is being sought to be taken by hostile forces, national as well as integnational. I beard yesterday some references to a paper called Motherland which I never read carrying some kind of an article in the early days of March about Indira Gandhi, whom I never hesitated to criticise when I thought she should be criticised. But, at the same time, I was told about this Motherland article where she is described as the red queen supporting communists etc etc and she was given an idea that regicide was a legitimate practice which the people could take recourse to. I remembered Sir, that this is an example of an attempt at de-stabilising this country at a moment of time when all sorts of things are happening. In Nagaland in 1965 we met three people who were running a peace mission. One was the philosophically-minded Bimal Prasad Chaliha. The second was Rev. MichaelScott whose sanctimonious mask of charity-mongering Christian hypocrisy was torn off quite soon. The third person is now carrying on a total revolution in this country! When I think of these destabilising processes in this country, 1 am very chary as to what should be done or said in this House. That is why I insist, particularly with my friends to my right the CPM members, that we should criticise Government's failings strongly and in a principled manner, but we should do so in a manner, specially in relation to a region like Nagaland, which would never in any way assist the enemies.

SHRI TARUN GOGOI (Jorhat): Sir, though I am not a champion of President's rule, I think all of us should agree that there are certain circumstances in which President's rule has to be resorted to. It is in this context that we have to consider the President's rule that has been imposed in Nagaland. I support the Resolution moved by the Home Minister in this regard. Never before

St. Res. re Proclamation CHAITRA 4, 1897 (SAKA) in relation to 298 297 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G.

have I seen the President's rule being welcomed by all sections of the people and by all political parties in the State. There are mainly two parties in Nagaland-the UDF and the NNO and both of them have welcomed the imposition of President's rule. It has been welcomed by Mr. Vizol. It has also been welcomed by Mrs. Shaiza, the chief of the UDF, and by Mr. Jasokie, the new ex-Chief Minister.

In the last elections, both the parties failed to get a majority. Out of 60 members, one got 25, the other 23 and the remaining 12 were independents. The independent members are responsible for the defections. Mr. Deb criticised the Congress for overthrowing the Government and the Deputy Speaker rightly stated that in Nagaland, there is no Congress Party. We are not interested in overthrowing either the UDF or the NNO Government. We have got no link with the NNO. Mr. Deb found fault with the Congress for being the initiators of defections in Nagaland. It is not correct. Defections in Nagaland started just after the elections when 3 members of NNO defected to the UDF. The fact remains that both the NNO and UDF are responsible for the decondemn defections, factions. We unhealthy practice. which is a very When there is defection and mstability the of Government, the progress of State suffers. In Nagaland when no party is able to form a stable government, it is the people who are the sufferers. It is a most sensitive and strategic area, which was neglected during the British rule. Even after independence, this area never received as much attention as it deserved till Nagaland became a State in 1964. Before that this area was lagging far behind and that was the main reason for the dissatisfaction among the Naga people. Though it has been the aim of the Centre to bring the Naga people into the mainstream of national life. up till now this has not been possible. Initially the demand of the Naga people was an independent Nagaland. After a long period, they have realised

(Nagaland)

the futility of this demand and a majority of them have now given up that demand. They have a desire to come into the mainstream of national life, but this can be done only by rapid progress in agriculture, communications and industrialisation. Railways and other communication facilities are totally inadequate in Nagaland. Because of the lack of facilities for development, this area is lagging far behind and it has not been possible to bring the people into the mainstream of national life. I nope the Minister will look into this matter

It is a matter of great concern to all of us that there has been an increase in unlawful and violent activities. There is a foreign hand behind all this. It has also been confirmed by the Prime Minister herself that in the north-eastern areas a foreign hand is behind all these violent activities. This is a matter of great concern for the whole country that there is a systematic plan and a foreign hand is trying to create chaos not only in the north-eastern areas but in the whole country. Thereby the whole country's security is threatened. This should be taken care of.

With these words, I support the Resolution moved by the hon. Home Minister.

भी जमन्नाय राव जोशो (शाजापूर) : उपाष्यक्ष महोदय, पांडिचेरी झौर गुजरात के बजट के बाद मब राष्ट्र ति शासन नागालैंड में लागू करने जा रहे हैं या किया है, जिसकी वजह से वहां के बजट पर भी हम लोगों को चर्चा करनी है। इसका कारण यह है कि नागालैंड में जो यू ०डी ० एफ० की सरकार थी उसमें दलबदल की वजह से उनकी शक्ति चली गई, उनका बहमत चला गया किन्त नागा नेशनेलिस्ट मार्गेनाइजशन, इनकी शक्ति या इनका समर्थन या इनका बहुमत भी ज्यादा दिन रहा नहीं, जिसकी वजह से यह एक अस्पिरता का वातावरण पैदा हुआ। भव यह जो मस्यिरता का वातावरण देश के ग्रन्दर पैदा हुआ है, इसके लिए हमारे मिंत्र श्री हीरेन मुकर्जी ने जिम्मेदार कुछ बातों को

ठहराया है किन्त शास्त्रों ने इस बात की स्वीकृति दी है कि जो भी देश के भन्दर होता है, उसके लिए जिम्मेदार राजा है भौर मैंने कई बार कहा है कि देश के भ्रन्दर जो स्वस्थ परम्परा पैदा होती है, वह सिर्फ नीति से ही नहीं बल्कि नियत से होती है मौर मापकी नियत पर लोग शक करें ऐसी स्थिति अनभव से सिद्ध हई है लेकिन मब केवल शक शक नहीं रहा क्योंकि माज सुबह ही एक प्रश्न श्री मध् दंडवते उठाना चाहते थे कि दिल्ली में महानगर पालिका जनसंघ के हाथ में काफी साल तक रही किन्तु पिछल कुछ दिनों से यह हवा में म्राने लगा था कि यह सरकार उसको ग्रपने हाथ में लेने जा रही है झौर उसके निए तरीका बिल्कूल निश्चित है कि लोगों को पार्टी में से तोड़ दो भौर दो लोगों को तोड़ दिया गया किन्तु जब 23 मार्च को नये मेयर का चनाव होने जा रहा था, तो भ्राप ने होने नहीं दिया। म्राप शक्ति परीक्षण से डरते क्यों हैं यह बात समझ में नही झाती है। बैसी ही चीज नागालैंड में हुई। ग्रब श्रष्यक्ष के म्राचरण के बारे में तो हम यहां कुछ कह नहीं सकते लेकिन म्राच्यका ने म्रानिश्चित काल के लिए एक दम सदन को स्थगित कर दिया श्रौर विरोधी दल के नेता श्री जमीर साहब ने इस बात को चुनौती देकर कहा था कि शक्ति परोक्षण हाने दोजिए मैंने मविश्वास का प्रस्ताव दिया है। जब स्पीकर्ज कान्फ्रेंस म यह बात तय हो गई थी कि किस दल का बहमत है इसका निर्णय सदन में होना चाहिए भ्रौर राज्यपाल राज भवन में बैठ कर यह निर्णय न करे तो इसका यहां पालन क्यो नही किया गया ? सदन मे ही इस बात का पता क्यों नहीं लगाया गया कि एन०एन०ग्रो० के साथ बहुमत है या यू बी बएफव के माथ है ? यदि जमीर साहब को सदन के अन्दर ग्रविश्वास का प्रस्ताब लाने की इजाजत दे देते तो पता चल जाता कि किसके साथ बहुमत है। किन्तु शायद भाप यह चाहते महीं ये। इसलिए जब अनिश्चित काल के लिए सबन को स्थगित कर दिया गया तो आपने

Laws (Amdt.) Ord. and Bill उसको निलम्बित कर दिया वह कब तक निलम्बित रहेगा इसका कुछ पता नहीं। मार्च के महीने में यह हवा क्यों बहने लगती 🕏 समझ में नहीं आता है। पांडीचेरी में यही कुछ मार्च में किया गया, दिल्ली में मार्च में किया गया, यहां मार्च में किया गया। जिस तरह से मार्च में वसन्त ऋतु माते ही नए नए मंकुर फूटने लगते है उसी तरह से मार्च में राष्ट्रपति को भी नए नए मंकुर माने लगते हैं, ऐसा क्यों समझ में नही त्राता है। इसी महीने में उनका शासन इघर उघर फैलने लगता है। मार्च का ही महीना होता है जबकि बजट पास करना होता है। दो तीन दिन पहले यह काम हो जाता है भौर उसका नतीजा यह होता है कि गड़-बड़ पैदा होती है झौर एक माकवर्ड सिचुएशन पैदा हो जाती है हमारे लिए भी।

15 hrs.

नागालैंड के साथ बहुत से प्रश्न जुड़े हुए हैं। लेकिन एक प्रश्न है जो लोगों की जबान है कि राष्ट्रीय जीवन प्रवाह के साथ उसको लाने में वह सरकार बिल्कुल असफल रही है। मैं इसमें सरकार को बोष नहीं देता हूं। जो सरकार खुद राष्ट्री र प्रवाह क्या चीफ है इसको समझी ही नही है वह दूसरों को उस प्रवाह में ला नही सकती है। नागालैंड, मिजोराम ग्रहणाचल प्रदेश, मेघालय. मणिपुर झादि सब जगह मैं घुमा हूं। ऐसा नही है कि बिना धूमे हुए भौर बिना स्थिति का ग्रध्ययन किए हुए ही यहां खडा होकर मैं बोल रहा हूं। हिन्दुस्तान का जियाको नन्दनवन कहते है उस काश्मीर की जनता को राष्ट्रीय प्रवाह में भाप भपने साथ नहीं ला सके हैं। इसीलिए किसी एक व्यक्ति के भरोमे काश्मीर की जनता का भविष्य बनाने की झाप बास करते हैं। इतने नालायक लोग मैंने धुनिया में नहीं देखे हैं जो इस तरह की बात

301 St. Res. re Proclamation CHAITRA 4, 1697 (BAKA) in relation to 302 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

करते हैं। बहाँ मागालड के सदस्य बोलने के लिए उठे ये और बोलने लगे ये। उनकी झावाख झापको सुनाई नहीं दी। इसलिए उनको झापने सामने बुसाया। सदन में जो पोछे बैठता है उसकी झावाज मुनाई झापको नहीं देती है तो जो देश के कोने में रहना है उसकी झावाज झापको कैसे सुनाई देगी?

मैं सणिपुर में गया था। वहां लोगों ने मुझ से शिकायत की और हमारे एक झफसर से तो जो कुछ कहा उसको सुन कर मैं हैरान रष्ठ गया। उन्होंने कहा:

This area has been completely cut off for the last so many centuries.

मैंने कहा झाप क्या बोल रहे हैं? क्या झाप संग्रेजी इतिहास पढ़ कर बोल रहे हैं? जिस मणिपुर में चैतन्य महाप्रभु का सम्प्रदाय इस जोरकोर से झाया वहां के लिए झाप ऐसी बात कैसे कह रहे हैं। वह जम्बू-जेट से नहीं झाया। इस देश में एक दूसरे के पास पहुंचने का साधन पद याला ही हुझा करता या। इसमें उनको कोई तकलीफ नहीं यी। केरल के शंकराचार्य बद्रीनाथ तक पहुंच जाते थे, मनिपुर तक पहुच जाते थे।

They never depended on any other vehicle except No. 11.

म्यारह नम्बर के दो पांव पर निर्भर होने की वजह से वे कहीं भी जा सकते थे, वहा लोगों से संबंध रख सकते थे भौर रखते थे। किन्त माज (स्वयुवक्रमात) यह माज जो हो रहा है यह यही सिख करता है कि हमारी मांखें विस्तृत नहीं हैं, विशाल बही हैं, व्याप क नहीं हैं। दिल्ली में बैठने के बाद यदि हमारी माखें देश की माखिरी सीमा तक चली जाती तो यह स्थिति पैदा नहीं होती, यह नौबत नहीं माती ।

मैं नागालैंड में घुमा हूं। नागालैंड की ग्रसल समस्या भी यही है। मैं उनको बिल्कुल दोष नहीं देता हूं। यह सब भी भव दूर हो रहा है। दिल्ली तक में लोग यह महसुस कर रहे हैं कि उनको लैट डाउन किया जा रहा है। उनसे उनके नागकि प्रधिकार छीन लिए गए हैं। इस वास्ते नागालैंड में भी जो राष्ट-पति शासन स्थापित किया गया है यदि इससे उनको लगता है कि सत्ता न यू डी एफ के हाथ में है और न एन० एन० ओ० के हाय में हैं झौर राष्ट्रपति के हाय में सब भधिकार भा गए हैं तो उनको यदि यह फीलिंग होता है कि यह कोई पराया है, दूसरा कपर बैठ कर कुछ कर हा है तो यह स्वा-भाविक ही है। उनको लगता कि उन में प्रयने प्रति माप मात्मीयता की भावना पैदा नहीं कर सके हैं। आपको अपनी इस 28 साल की ग्रसफलता को समझ लेना चाहिये। नागालैंड में विचार वाहिनी का काम सिनेमा करता है। कोहिमा में सिर्फ एक सिनेमा है छोटा सा। सिनेमा अगर किसी को देखना होता है तो मिलिटरी की परमीशन लोगों को लेनी पड़ती है रात पड़ने से पहले देख लेना होता है। मनोरंजन के माध्यम से कुछ ज्ञ.न, या कुछ विचार देने का काम भी सिनेमा कर सकता है लेकिन सारे नागालैंड में केवल मात एक ही सिनेमा घर कोहिमा मे है और शाम छः बजे के पहले, गत और अंधेरा होने के पहले हः भीः वह भी मिलिटरी कं इजाजत लेने के बाद वे देख सकते हैं। ऐसी स्थिति जो वहां पैदा हुई है मैं जानता हूं कि इस सबकी वजह से वहां के लोग नाराज

We are in a jet age and, therefore we feel that it has been completely isolated and the people have been neglected.

303 St. Resume Disapproval MARGE 28, 2015 of Mr Portle & Aring 304 Laws (Amdt.) Ord, and Bill

हैं। मिजोराम में भी में गया है। वहां के प्रवद-लैम को मैंने देखा है। वहां के प्रावलैम को मगर आप समझते हैं कि कोई मिलिटरी सोस्पूमन है तो यह मापकी मूल है। हमको बाहिय कि हम उनको समझने की कोशिश करें, उनका दिल जीतने की कोशिश करें। माप बोलते बहुत कुछ हैं लेकिन क'ते कुछ नहीं हैं। ऐसे लोगों को माप वहां मेज देते हैं जिनको मेजना नहीं चाहिये। मैं उनकी वर्चा यहां नहीं करना चाहता हूं।

की एम॰ राम गौपाल रेड्डी (निजामा-बाद) : बहां साखा खोलो।

को जगम्माब राव जोशी ' झापको पता चलेगा कि क्या क्या हो रहा है। मैं वहां गया था। राजनीति स ही देश चल सकता है एसा आप न समझें। इस रांग इम्ब्रैशन में झाप न रहे। अरुणाचल प्रदेश के विद्यार्थी बम्बई, पूमा झादि मे झा कर रहे है, इंटर स्टेट यूनियन का कार्यक्रम विद्यार्थी परिषद् ने हाम में लिया था, विद्यार्थी वहां से घा कर रहे हैं। नजबीक से जीवन को देखने की बात वे कर रहे हैं। राजनीति से सब कूछ नही होता है। यह हमारी लाइफ का बहुत ही छोटा पोर्शन है। जीवन का मतलब केवन राजनीति नहीं है जिसकी वजह से सारा जीवन विगड गया है। नागालैंड में तथा दूसरी जगहों में जो ग्राधिकार आप ग्रंपने हाब मे लेने की कोशिश करते हैं यह ठीक नही है। पंजाब में क्या हुआ ? जनसंघ झौर झकालियों दोनों के जिलाफ झापने क्या किया जब इनका बहुमत था? लखमन सिंह गिल को लेकर 19 लोगों की मदब बाहर रह कर झापने की, विहार में विदम्बरी मंडल को लेकर क्या किया, केरल में पट्टम थानू पिल्ले को बाहर से मबद दी। जब जब विरोधियों के हाब में मविकार झाते हैं तब तक आप उनको तौडने की कोसिस करते हैं। यब भी में मांग करता हं कि राष्ट्रपति सासन जो सरपने लागू किया

है इसको धाप जल्दी से जल्दी समाप्त करें, जल्दी से जल्दी नहीं विधान सना नुना कर शक्ति परीक्षण धाप होने दें, इस बात का भाप पता जगने दें कि किनके साथ बहुमंत हैं मौर जिनको वहां बहुमत प्राप्त है उनके हाय में भाप मधिकार दे दें।

इन शक्यों के साथ मैं इतका विरोध करता हं।

SHRI DINESH CHANDRA GO-SWAMI (Gauhati): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, while I support this Proclamation, I want to make it clear that, normally I do not favour President's rule in any State, more particularly in the sensitive regions, where, I feel, the people should exercise their democratic rights. But if we look to the situation of Nagaland, it will be clear that there was no alternative but to impose President's rule there. In fact, the voting pattern itself, the voting pattern in the last elections in Nagaland, indicated that instability was ingrained in the result of the elections, because the UDF which got 25 seats in the last election had secured 86,739 votes which constituted 30.13 per cent of the total votes polled. I do not say, for a moment, that absolute majority is necessary for a party to run a democratic government, but if we look to the picture, we will find that there were only two parties and out of those two parties, the ruling party had much less than the other Opposition party and also the independents. The NNO had secured 35.79 per cent claiming the support of 1,03,083 votes, and the independents, twelve of whom came to the Assembly, had secured 34.08 per cent having the support of 98,106 people. Therefore, the voting pattern itself-the ruling party securing 30.13 per cent, minority party securing 35.79 per cent and the independents getting 34 per cent-indicated that instability was writ large. Immediately, we saw defection in the sense that the 12 independents

AN HON. MEMBER, What is your majority here? It is only 42 per cust.

St. Res. re Proclamation CHAITRA 4, 1897 (SAKA) in relation to 305 306 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G.

SHRI DINESH CHANDRA GO-SWAMI: I am not saying that an absolute majority is necessary. But the ruling party must have some sort of a majority vis-a-vis the other party or parties.

As I was saying, immediately after the elections, the twelve independents who could have really played a part in maintaining the balance immediately shifted to one party or the other; seven independents joined the UDF and five joined the NNO. Then the defection started; there were defections, re-defections and counterdefections. On 9-3-1975 the dramatic development started when 13 UDF members joined the NNO, and the NNO Government came into being. On the 10th, the Vizol Ministry resigned and the NNO Ministry came into being. But within eight days, some of the persons who came to the NNO-some of them who became Ministers-re-defected to the even original Party the UDF, and thereafter the whole thing has started. Obviously, Mr. Jamir, as the leader of the UDF, claimed that he had the support of 33 and should be permitted to form the Government. If the Governor at that stage had given a report to the President that the Government of the State cannot be carried on in accordance with the provisions of the Constitution, there could not have been much of an objection, but some criticism would have been levelled that, instead of permitting the Legislature to decide whether there was majority or not, the Governor was taking upon himself the right to decide that. The Governor in this particular case took the correct decision. In spite of this instability," he did not decide for himself. He said that it would not be tair on his part to count the heads in Raj Bhevan: let the Legislature decide whether a party has a majority or not. And therefore, he asked the legislature to weigh its strength. He asked this question to be decided in the assembly itself. Assembly was convened on 20-3-76. How know about the dramatic Incident when the

(Nagaland)

Speaker adjourned the Assembly sine die. An even then the Governor did not report for proclamation under Article 356. He told the Speaker that it is very important to pass the financial bills and provisions and requested him to convene the Assembly and try to pass them. The Speaker said that he cannot do it as his life was in danger; the lives of other Members were in danger and he expressed his inability and even then the Governor did not take recourse to this step. He requested both Mr. Jamir and Mr. Jesokie to sit together and evolve some concensus if possible and when they said this is not possible he has made this report. This is the position. In view of all these things, I do not know why any criticism could be levelled against the Governor, saying, what he has done is something wrong and all they. It has been stated that the Speaker had been directed by the Home Minister. who seems to have been termed as villain of the peace, and then the Central Government was the main force behind this development which led to the President's rule in the State. But, may I remind my friends that in Nagaland it is not a congress Government as such. The Speaker's adjournment of the Assembly has been criticised. Left to individual judgment, one may reasonably say the Speaker ought not to have adjourned the Assembly like this. But the difficulty is this. He is the Speaker of a sovereign assembly. It is not fair on our part to criticise his activities. If Nagaland Assembly is re-convened, that Assembly will decide or enter into a debate whether anything that was done by him was just and proper. It should be left to you or to the Speaker to decide at the meeting of the Speakers or Deputy Speakers as to how we can ...

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: That was given a decent burial in Shillong!

SHRI DINESH CHANDRA GO-SWAMI: After all, Speakers' meeting takes place, Sir. I feel that this question should also be tackled, because Article 202 to 206 and onwards.

307 St. Resume Disapproval MARCH 25, 1875 of Air Force & Army 308-Laws (Amdt.) Ord. and Bill

requires that the Constitutional obligation upon the Government to pass the financial statement and these provisions should be complied with within a prescribed time. Obviously no other course was left to the Government except to report that the Constitutional machinery has failed, in the sense that these obligations cannot be fulfilled, the financial statement cannot be passed and it is only in this situation that he made this very exhaustive report which has been placed before the House and in pursuance of that report, the Presidential proclamation had come. I support this proclamation, as in view of the development it has become unavoidable and inevitable.

There is another point of view also which I wish to point out and it is this. Instability in this region cannot be permitted at all. This area is a very strategic one. It is a very sensitive area. There is continuous attempt by certain section of people to gubvert established order; disgruntled elements do try to exploit the situation and as you know, stability is the essence of the day and Presidential action establishes some sort of stability in that region.

And here, I do not want to repeat what has been said by other Members. But I want to raise two points. A lot was said about the Defection Bill. In principle, my view is that this Defection Bill alone will not solve this problem at all, Actually by law alone you cannot solve the problem at all. It has to be done by consensus. It is by convention among the parties that you can solve such problems Legislative methods like Defection Bill etc.-I do not think,will offer the real solution to this problem.

Finally, I want to reiterate the points raised by other hon Members. There is some lack of communication both in the literal sense and in the real sense in respect of Nagaland and the entire north-eastern region. The infra-structure go necessary for deve-

lopment is just not there. Communication between these people and the people of the rest of the country is not there. It is the duty of the Home Minister to attend to these matters. We should see that this region prospers. We should see that the present atmosphere of insurgency should not develop, on the other hand, it should be done away with. We should try to develop this sense of communication in that region both in literal sense of the word and otherwise. I request the Home Minister to see that all activities are directed towards this end if that is done many of the ills which pledge this region will be

With these words, I support the Presidential Proclamation.

done away with.

SHRI SEZHIYAN (Kumbakonam): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, I am sorry that I have to express my concern about the unfortunate happenings that had taken place in Nagaland.

I agree with Mr. Goswami that we are not here to pass any judgment on a decision taken by the Speaker of the Assembly, whatever may be the consequence and whatever may be the background.

The Governor's report gives a very sad picture when he says that he had to face the claims and counterclaims. He therefore advised the leaders of both the parties to have a trial of strength in the Legislature which is in session. And both accepted that this would be fair and proper. Why this sound and sober advice of the Governor could not be implemented is a thing to be decided. But, Sir, I feel there is a basic issue which we should bear in mind here. What will happen when the Speaker of an Assembly of any State, not to speak of this State, takes into his head to adjourn sine die? What will happen in that event? This raises basic constitutional problems which should not be left to the rules of a particular Legislature or to the whims and fancies of particular persons at the time

309 St. Res. re Proclamation CHAITRA 4, 1897 (SAKA) in relation to 310 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G.

occupying the Chair. Therefore, there is a basic issue. After 1958 Speakers' Conference, some of the State Assemblies had their rules amended to make it imperative on the part of the Assembly that when they want to adjourn the Assembly sine die, that should be done on a motion being moved in the House and passed by the House. Because, not only the no-confidence is against the Ministry but it is against the Speaker of any party. If he takes it to his head to adjourn the Assembly sine die, no court can go into it. Nobody outside the House can discuss this. Therefore this aspect raises a basic issue which should be borne in mind by us.

I agree with others also that what we can do in this respect from the report of the Governor is this. It looks a fair reading. There is nothing else left but to proclaim this. It is not only an administrative decision but it has got a political background behind it. Because it is like a Grecian orama that the tragic end comes at the end of the drama. The end becomes inevitable. The tragedy that is to happen becomes inevitable as the drama proceeds.

In the past, the Congress Party and those belonging to that did not take any decision earlier on defection whether it is for or against it. But from 1952-53 onwards these things have been going on. This is only a symptom of a deeper malady. That has been affecting the entire political structure in our country. I join with others in expressing my sympathy and appreciation to the difficult problems that are being faced by the people of Nagaland. Of course they belong to particular tribes. By just saying that they are tribal people I do not say they are not facing any difficulties. Probably among the tribal people literacy is much higher than among the people of any other part of this country. They have got better background and training than those of any other part of this country. What has happened in the main parts of the country affects the fringes also.

(Nagaland)

Therefore, as a major party, the Congress Party has got a more responsible and more effective role to play in this one and the other parties may follow them if they set a better example in this respect.

Only by this symptom of defection, the ministry is being toppled down. I am glad that Mr. Goswami, at last,--the persons like him,-nowadays is also quoting some figures on how much of the percentage of the votes is polled by a particular party and how many seats were gained by them. There should be a correlation and there should be a proportional representation-either a person who gets over 33 per cent votes should not get seat or if that person gets more than 66 per cent votes he gets a seat. Of course he did not mean that. Take the case of Nagaland. There the UDF got twentyfive seats which has got 35 per cent of votes polled whereas the NNO got 23 seats with more than 33 per cent votes polled. It shows....

SHRI DINESH CHANDRA GO-SWAMI: I do not mind your taking advantage of what I said.

SHRI SEZHIYAN: I only say that that kind of wisdom has now dawned on their party. I welcome it. It should be pushed to the logical extent to see that this is done. As I said, earlier when I made some objections to the Proclamation, it was not with a view to stall or to bring the administration of Nagaland under the Presidential Rule. Because, yesterday, Professor Mukherjee saidhe is not here now-that we should viewed with some concern this very delicate situation but let us not aggra-Whenever we raise this vate this issue, it is not with a view to aggravating the difficulty or to embarrass the Government. What we want is this that whenever we make rules with regard to financial discipline etc., let us follow that one. That is the only way to help functioning in a healthy Parliamentary democracy not only here but even in the States also. That is why when we raised

311 St. Resume Disapprovel MARCH 25, 1975 of Air Force & Army 312 Laws (Amat.) Ord. and Bill

the objection this morning it was not with a view to stall it.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I am happy as a result of this discussion a new Committee is being set-up which will look into all the papers that are laid on the Table of the House.

SHRI SEZHIYAN: Sir, only yesterday we received these accounts papers and I wrote this morning seeking cerain clarifications. He has been kind enough to give the reply stating that he is looking into the matter. But my trouble is suppose there are some patent errors and pass these demands what is going to happen and how will we rectify the defect when found later on. I will only cite two items.

Take, for example, item No. 1 on the opening page of the Supplementary Demands. There you see the amount already approved by the Assembily--charged Rs. 90,000 and the supplementary amount now required is Rs. 3 80 lakhs That means as per the spirit of the Supplementary Demands Rs. 3 80 lakhs should be there for them after passing and before 31st March. In the explanation it is given mainly for meeting the increased demand for medical reimbursement, travel expenses, repairs to vehicles, hospitality expenses, etc.

My assumption is much of the amount now required has already been spent. If that is so, it goes against the Supplementary demands which are for amounts to be spent and not for amounts already spent.

Then take the second Demand. The amount already approved by the Assembly, that is, charged is Rs. 4 lakhs and now they want Rs. 5 45 lakhs. The explanation given is increased expenditure on office expenses of the Secretariat of the Governor as well as charges payable to the Indian Air Force for services rendered in earlier years. I do not know how much amount is going to be spent for using the services of the Indian Air Force in the five days left. MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Informally we have decided to overlook many of them. It is good you have brought the to the notice of the House. May be good for future guidance of that State.

SHRI SEZHIYAN: Sir, whatever the House or you may decide, these are the things that I wanted to bring to the notice of the House. I hope they will take this into consideration for future guidance as well as for future action.

भी झंक देव (बीदर) : उपाध्यक महोदय, नागासैंड में जो प्रेजियेंट का झासम लागू किया गया है, मैं उसको सपोर्ट करते हुए बताना चाहता हूं कि झाज देश मे हर जगह जो झनुसासनहीनता झौर हिमा का वातावरण फैस रहा है, जब तक हम उसको कंट्रोल नही करेंगे तब तक देश मे झान्ति भी नही हो सकती है और प्रजातव की स्थापना भी नहीं हो सकती है । इसी को दृष्टि मे रखने हुए जैसा कि महात्मा गांधी ने कहा या हमे झपने देश मे पालिटिक्स का झाध्या-त्मीकरण करना पडेगा।

इ.ी लिए पिछले बीस साल से पुज्य विनोबा जी ने जो काम किया है वह बहत महत्वपूर्ण है। पालिटिक्स के झाध्यात्मीकरण के लिए विनोबा जी ने देश में सर्वसेवा संब की स्थापना की थी और इस संस्था के रचनात्मक कार्यों के द्वारा देश के नैतिक उत्यान के लिए कोशिश की जा रही थी। लेकिन अफसोस है कि कुछ लोगों ने मिल कर जिस तरह पोलीटिकल पार्टीच को तोडा है उसी तरह उन्होंने सर्वसेवा संघ को भीं दो टुकड़ी में तोड़ कर उसको सत्म करने की कोशिश की है। देश में तब तक शॉन्ति नहीं हों सकती है जब तक कि हम पालिटिक्स को स्पर्भुसाइव न करे, उसका धाड्यात्मीकरण न करें। इसीं दुष्टिं से मैं प्रबर्ग'र गया' था. जहां सर्वसेवा संच की मीटिंग हो रही थी।

313 St. Ras. re Proclamation CHAITBA 4, 1897 (SAKA) in relation to 314 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G.

हपाध्यम महीयम : नामानैंड के बारे में बोर्से ।

भी शंकर देव : में मावालैंड के बारे में कह रहा हं। जब तक हम राजनीति को स्पिर्मुलाइव महीं करेंगे तब तक नामालैंड ही बना वेश में कहीं भी शान्ति की स्थापना नहीं हो सकेनी घौर न ही डेमोकेसी कायम रह सकेगी।

मैं बहां पर बया झौर मैंने विनोवा जी के उपदेशों पर भाधारित एक छोटा सा पैम्फलेट बहां पर बांटा। मैंने देखा कि कुछ बेरोजगार नौजनान जिनका न सबंसेवा संघ के साथ कोई ताल्मुक है धौर न विनोबा जी के सिद्धान्तों के साथ कोई तालुक है वहा पर यये हुए थे।

उपाम्धवा महोदयः कहां गये थे? सर्वसेवा संघ या नाग.लैड गये थे?

भी शंकर देव : नागालैंड में जो स्थिति पैदा हुई है वही स्थिति पूरे देश में है भौर जब तक हम पूरे देश की स्थिति को न बदलें, तब तक नागालैंड में भी शान्ति नहीं हो सकती है भौर प्रजातंत्र भी नही टिक सकता 81

विनोवा जी ने सर्व-सेवा संघ की स्थापना की ताकि पूरे देश का माध्यात्मीकरण किया जाये। उस प्लान को सात्म करने के लिए जो फोर्सिज काम कर रही हैं उन्हीं की बजह से नागानैंड में भनुशासनहीनता भौर हिंसा का वातावरण फ़ैलाया जा रहा है भौर उसी का यह परिणाम है कि भारत सरकार को बहां पर राष्ट्रपति शासन लागू करना पड़ा है। श्री जयप्रकास नारायण ने जो हिंसा का मादाबरण फ्रैलाने की कोशिश की है उसके बारे में बिनोबा जी ने क्लीयरली कहा है कि हिन्दुस्तान . . . (क्वबान) . . .

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Order please. What is all this? There

(Nagaland)

should be a limit to all this. You have not come to the subject. Youwere talking of something else. I cantolerate irrelevancy up to a certain extent. But, where your irrelevancy comes to a point, where you are going to create an explosion in the-House, it is my duty to stop that. Please come to Nagaland.

SHRI SHANKAR DEV: Without creating any explosion, I come to-Nagaland.

नागालैंड मे जो भनुशासनहीनता भौर हिसा फ़ैलाई जा रही है उसी की बजह से वहा राष्ट्रपति शासन लागू करना पड़ा है। मैं उस फ़ंडामेंटल क्वेश्वन, उस मौलिक प्रज्ञ, को ले कर चल रहा हूं। मैं डिपुटी स्पीकर से प्रार्थना करूंगा कि वह मुझे समय दें। मैं कोई समय बेस्ट नही कर रहा हं। दूसरे लोग जैसे बोले हैं, अभी-मभी जोशी साहब ने भी बहत सारी बाते कही. . .

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I am talking about the relevancy of what you say. I am not saying that you do not have the right to speak. But is it relevant?

श्री शंकर देव : रेलीवेट बोल रहा हं। इर्रेलिवेट बिलकूल नही है।

उपाध्यक्ष महोबय : कहा रेलिवेंट है ?

भी शंकर देवः मैं जो कुछ हो रहा है उसके फ़डामेटल्स मे जा कर बताना चाहता हं कि बहा पर क्या चीज हो रही है। पूरे हिन्दुम्तान में घाज जो अनुशासनहीनता चल रही हैं लालेमनेम चल रही है हिसा चल रही है. उमी के कारण नागालैंड में यह सब हो रहा है। नागालैड हिन्दुस्तान के भ्रन्दर है। हिन्दुस्तान की हर चीज का रेफ्लेक्शन नागालैंड पर पडता है। इसलिए बह मेरा अधिकार है कि मैं अनुसासनहीनता पर झीर वायलेस पर बोलुं, मुझे बोलने दिया जायें...

315 St. Res. re Proclamation MARCH 25, 1975 in relation to Nagaland 315 and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: It is not incumbent upon me to allow him to say anything he likes. It is my right to decide what is relevant and what is not relevant. Now I tell you not to speak about these things, because they are not relevant to the subject.

SHRI SHANKAR DEV: But I have a right to explain.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: You cannot explain.

SHRI M. RAM GOPAL REDDY: He was explaining so many murders are taking place.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I do not want any explanation. He can explain his own position

SHRI RAM GOPAL REDDY: Sir, he was trying to say....

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Mr. Reddy, I do not want two many advocates to explain his point. I can understand him all right

भी शंकर देव में यह बताना चाहता हूं कि यह साईलेसनेस जब तक नही जायेगी यह अनुशासनहीनता, लैक आफ़ डिसिप्लिन जब तक नहीं जायेगी तब तक नागालैंड की समस्या हल नही होगी। जब तक पालिटिक्स को स्पिरिचुम्रलाइज न किया जाये तब तक यह डिफ़ेक्शन, दल-बदल, अनुशासनहीनता स्वार्थ और पद-लोलुपता ये सारी चीजे कैसे खत्म होगी? इसीलिए मै स्पिरिचुम्रलाइजेशन माफ़ पालिटिक्स की बात कर रहा हू। जब तक राजनीनि का म्राघ्यात्मिकरण नही करेंगे तब तक ये चीजें समाप्त नही होगी।

उपाध्यक्ष महीवयः आप नागालैड जाइए भौर नागा लोगो को स्पिरिख्मलाइज कीजिए।

क्यो झंकर देव नागा लोगों को भी करेंगे धौर पूरे हिन्दुस्तान को भी करेंगे। उसके साथ ही सब का होगा। मैं यह कह रहा था कि वहां पर आहां कि शांति का संवेश लाने वाले विनोबा जी वर्धा के मंदर बैठ कर शांति की स्थापना करना चाहते ये वहां माज के हिंसक लोग मनुसासन को खत्म करने वाले लोध पहूंच गये मौर इन लोगों ने उस पबिन्न वातावरण को किस तरह से भ्रपविन्न कर दिया यह मैं बता रहा हूं। मैं वहां पर गरा था . . .

उपाञ्यक्ष महीवगः झापका टाइम खत्म हो गया।

भी शैंकर बेंब : मैं वहां पर गया था तो मेरे जैसे मादमी जिसने कि परचे भी नहीं बांटे उसका घैराव कर दिया गया, चारो तरफ़ से भौर मुझे उठा कर बाहर फैक दिया गया। मुझे मफ़सोस है कि उस पवित्न वातावरण के मदर भी इस तरह से हो रहा है।... (ख्यवधान)...

उपाध्यक्ष महोदयः झापकाटाइम खन्म हो गना। श्रीपी० के० देव।

SHRI P K. DEO (Kalahundi); Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, it is our painful duty that we have to arrogate to ourselves the powers of the Legislative Assembly of Nagaland and pass the budget of Nagaland. I am here since the second Lok Sabha, and I can say that this House has been seized with the problem of Nagaland right from the second Lok Sabha. I recollect how Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru used to be very compassionate and how he viewed the Naga problem from a very sympathetic angle, because he knew the problems were genuine, because he knew that they are a brave people, they are a courageous people, who want to decide their own destiny according to their aspirations. That is why in 1962 Nagaland became a Union Territory and in 1964 it was made into a fullfiedged State.

· Since that time we have been expecting all round progress in Nagaland in the proper functioning of all democratic institutions in that part of the country. But, it is the misfortune of this country, as has been rightly pointed out by Professor Hiren Mukherjee, that defections are being engineered from Delhi, the institution of Governor is being used to topple the non-Congress Governments, or such Governments which are not according to the liking of the Centre. , This is the 37th time that this has happened. We all want that the Nagaland Government should be of a representative character, should be of a democratic character and that it should function properly.

In the last general elections no party in Nagaland had an absolute majority. So, the single largest party which came with 25 MLAs in a House of 60 was asked to shoulder the responsibility of governing Nagaland. After that, the usual horse trading, defections, aya-ram and gaya-ram came into play and we are now facing a situation at the moment where no party is in a position to form a stable government, according to the report of the Governor. Shri Jamir was a responsible member of this House and for some time a Deputy Minister and he discharged his responsibilities with distinction. When a member of the State Assembly of the calibre of Shri Jamir claims that he has got the following of 33 members in a House of 60, he should have been given full scope to try his strength and to establish that he carries the majority with him. But it is our misfortune that Shri Jamir was denied the privilege of trying his strength on the floor of the Nagaland Assembly.

Here I would like to say that Raj Bhavan should not be the proper place for counting the heads of the various MLAs according to their party affiliation. The proper forum should be the Legislative Assembly, according to established democratic convention the decision of the Spea-

(Nagaland)

kers' Conference. I am surprised to find that the Speaker of the Nagaland Assembly is a party to the decision for the imposition of President's Rule in the State of Nagaland. He has given various reasons for it. "He says that he could not properly conduct the proceedings of the Nagaland Legislative Assembly there was acute tension, there was a likely attempt on his life and so he felt that the House should be adjourned for a month till normalcy could be restored, by which time the tension may die out and normal atmosphere would be created. But it should not be forgotten that this is the very same changed his political Speaker who colour so many times. So, it cannot be assumed that he will be holding an independent view, because his credibility is a big question mark.

The Advocate-General of Nagaland has dittoed the recommendation of the Governor, so far as the imposition of President's Rule is concerned. In this connection, I would be failing in my duty if I do not charge the Government of dereliction of duty by keeping in cold storage the Anti-Defection Bill, as has been rightly pointed out by Shri Hiren Mukerjee, because of which defection has become the rule of the day. As was rightly mentioned, the Orissa High Court passed a stricture against the then Governor of Orissa, Shri B. D. Jatti, for not having allowed the opposition to form the Government by not giving them an opportunity to prove their strength on the floor of the Orissa Assembly. Yet. immediately thereafter, he was elevated to the position of Vice-President

Secondly, I must express my indignation at the way in which the institution of the Governor is being used to topple the various opposition governments.

The Governor holds such a position that he is not impeachable like the President of India. He holds office at the pleasure of the Home Ministry. He is being guided by the Home

319 St. Rasume Disapprovel MARCH 25, 1975

Ministry. Most probably, this Report has been dictated on telephone from the Home Ministry to him to submit a report according to their liking so that they could make out a case to topple the established Government of Nagaland and to frustrate the aspirations of the Naga people to have their own Government and to have their own say in deciding their future and destiny.

Taking into consideration all these facts, I feel, this Report is not even worth the paper on which it has been written. No credibility or no importance should be given to it. The Nagaland Assembly should be called as soon as possible and Mr. Jamir should be given a chance to prove his strength. If he has got the majority following, he should be asked to form the Government.

With these words, I oppose the imposition of the President's Rule.

So far as the Budget is concerned, I feel that it is a most painful duty that we are supposed to pass a Budget about which we know so little. It will be much better that this Budget is again represented to the Nagaland Assembly so that they can decide their programme for the next year according to their liking.

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Shri B. V. Naik.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE (Kanpur): He speaks on all matters!

SHRI B. V. NAIK (Kanara): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, it is because I am concerned with all our people. Unlike the hon. Member from Lucknow, I come from a hilly, remote, distant backward area in the State of Karnataka which is very similar to this area. So, I think, there is a justification for making a common cause of all such areas.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE: Don't change my place. I am from Kanpur, not from Lucknow.

76 of Air Lonce & Army 320 Laive (Amilt.) Ord. and Bill

SHRI B. V. NAIK: Sir, in pursuance of the recommendation of the Governor of Negaland, Mr. L. P. Singh, the Assembly has been kept under suspension for some time. I have had the good fortune to go through the entire Report of the Governor. It looks administratively consistent and, logically, covert. But what he has stated here is:

"In fact, hardly any of the defections from either side appear to have been prompted by any ideological reasons or the concern with the public interest."

Here, I think, Mr Singh would have been more political in passing a stricture upon a people like Nagas because when we look at the facts of the case, the UDF had 25 legislators' the NNO had 23 Members and there were 12 Independents. Right at the time when the Assembly was formed in February, 1974, in a total composition of 60 Members of the House, as much as 20 per cent or 12 Members were Independents. Let us imagine if that happens in the Lok Sabha with 535 and odd Members out of which one-fifth membership is composed of Independents, the bright young people like Mr. Mavalankar. Do we underline the stability with 105 Members in the Lok Sabha belonging to the Independents Group, and that a with 105 Independents, Government will survive for even more than a month? I think, it stands to reasons that, in the election rethemselves, the fate of the sults Nagaland Assembly was writ large. Under the circumstances, to pass strictures on the democratic character of the tribals is not correct. As far as I know, the non-tribals, the people from the plains, the people who are called civilized, are more prone to this avarice or greed for power than the tribals. I would, therefore. say that the Nagaland Assembly and the Government of Nagaland are more a victim of political elecumstances than any specific design of its leaders, be it Mr. Vizel or Mr. Jasokie or Mr. Jamir. At least one of them,

**

CHAITRA 4, 1897 (SAKA) in relation to St. Res. re Proclamation 322 321 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G.

Mr. Jamir, is known to us personnally.

. 1

Another point that I would like to impress at this stage as a sort of logical corollary is that, in building up a political system or political institution, with due deference to the great contribution made in this House by the independent members like Shri Rana Bahadur Singh and Professor Mavalainkar I would still prefer a mandate of a party for the minimal equirements of political discipline....

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: You are quite free to do that. But come to Nagaland.

SHRI B. V. NAIK: Another point that I would like to suggest here is that the question of restarting the democratic life in Nagaland after a period of time seems to be a distinct possibility. I think, the Government of India, without leaving it only to the Governor of the State of Nagaland because he becomes a local, he will be virtually administering it on behalf of the President, the Ministry of Home Affairs should invite the members of the now suspended Legislature and try to thrash out the whole thing. Or else, as has been properly suggested by the very senior Member. Shri Basumatari, one of the senior members of the Council of Ministers from New Delhi should be able to sit together with the representatives of the people there, who do not cease to be representatives, and iron out their differences, so that the democratic functioning of the State of Nagaland is made possible

Another point which I want to make is this. Right in the month of March of any year we have seen a crop of suspensions coming up. One of the reasons which was seen quoted in the letter is that the entire functioning of the governmental machinery will come to a halt because the Appropriation Bill will not be passed Though I appreciate the sanctity of 31st March, that the time of final 328 L.S.-11

(Nagaland)

reckoning for the year is most essential, I think it is a matter for consideration. The Governor asked for one month's time and that one month could have been given if it were not at this critical juncture, at the end of March. The unhappy fate of the Nagaland Assembly could have been solved if this crisis had developed, say, in the month of December 1974 or January 1975. there would have been still time to keep the Assembly adjourned sine die for a period of one month or so and in between solve the problem. But now we are faced with the arrival of 31st March....

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: May be we should tell Members of Legislatures not to defect in March but in some other month-any month except March.

SHRI B. V. NAIK: I am only suggesting that some constitutional remedies can be thought of without lowering the power of this House.

MR DEPUTY-SPEAKER: We can write that in the Constitution-defections except in the month of March.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE: You have answered my question. Defectionshow can you avoid it in this country? Even during the Ramayana age it was there You know Vibishana. He was the first defector.

SHRI B. V. NAIK: No. It was Sugriva.

SHRI S. M BANERJEE: He was not a human-being.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER. Mr Mavalankar.

SHRI P. G. MAVALANKAR (Ahmedabad): Any imposition of President's rule must be considered a retrograde step because it puts the clock back. Already democracies all over the world and particularly in the developing countries like ours, seem to be perennially in crisis and

323 St. Resume Disapproval MARCH 25, 1975 of Air Force & Army 324 Laws (Amdt.) Ord. and Bill

the happenings like the on's in Nagaland make democracy set not only to be continuously in crisis but also on the defensive. Therefore, I feel that the imposition of President's rule is a very unwelcome phenomenon. But, it seems judging from thereport of the Governor and from other reports that have come from Nagaland through the Press that perhaps this was the only thing left for the Governmen of India to do.

It is very sad that from 1950 to 1975. these 25 years and 2 months that we have implemented our Constitution, we should have had 37 occasion3 in one form or other for imposing President's rule in this State or that State in the Indian Union. That perhaps speaks not very well about our political maturity or political morality. Now, if President's rule had to be imposed in Nagaland as the only effective and last remedy available, I can only hope that it will work and work in terms of clearing the polluted air of political defections and political immorality

If you look at the problems of our polity and of Nagaland in particular, then it should not be forgotten that the elections there took place only last year, to be precise, in February 1974. It is thus hardly one year, and the fact tht within one year or so such an important border area of our country should be faced with such unfortunate and divisive political affairs, I must consider, it is a very great calamity.

I am quite sure that we must look at this problem not from the point of view of this party or that party going out of power or this party or that party coming into power, but from the angle of the kind of repurcussion it has on the sensitive border area which in turn brings unnecessary and avoidable problems in its wake for the entire country. Because of this one year's rule in Nagaland by the UDF Ministry there was at least a semblance of stability, but that semblance of stability also has melted away and it has brought a setback to the stability, which I do not know how long we will take to repair.

Now, as I was saying, Nagaland is a special security area because of the problems of insurgency. It is also a highly sensitive area in more than one sense. The people of Nagaland, sensitive, simple and sincere, have been put to all kindsof distress and difficulty over a period of time. There was a time when the quality of the people of Nagaland was very special. They had a certain choim of simplicity and spontaneity and their honesty and simplicity both of which seemed at one time the special characteristics of the Naga people are no longer true to-lay of these very people. This is a decline which has to be regretted by all of us who believe in the virtues of simplicity and honesty I am told that in 1944 when the War-the Second World War I am talking of-touched the area of Napaland, what was then called the Naga Hills, at that time there was one British Deputy Commissioner-I think he was the last British Deputy Commissioner, for the Naga Hills-Sir Charles Pawsey....

MR DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Why go into all that?

SHRI P. G. MAVALANKAR. When the War rame, he said that the first casualty was honesty.'

The first causualty in war, generally, is truth.' When war came to those arctas, people, who used to be iriendly, full of honesty, etc. lost • on • of those qualities of life. Nagas were known for a certain code of conduct, a certain individual and social morality, not bothering themselves about selfishness, and if somebody overtook them and went ahead, they used to say, all right brother, be happy go ahead. That fine quality has gone because, I am sorry to say, politicians have gone into Nagaland or rather have grown into Nagaland, those who have become ambitious, greedy, power-minded and so on. Defection have has made an acute situation, a sort of acute tension And, in this connection. I would like to quote a line from the report of the Governor where it says as follows:

"The fact that six members, including some Ministers had defected twice within ten days can only be regarded as a case of totally unprincipled and unabashed behoviour."

One really feels sorry that the episodes of "Aya Ram" and "Gaya Ram" of Haryana should have gone on to a far off place like Nagaland' What is the remedy? There is already before our Parliament, before the Joint Select Committee, a Bill supportedly for removal of defections But that Bill is not striking at the root of the problem. After reading all the reports about the present crisis in Nagaland, I wonder whether we should not go ahead with one simple provisionthat no defector will be made a Minister and that the size of the Cabinet should be restricted to not more than a cretain percentage of the total membership of that particular House. Having 18 or 19 or 20 Ministers in a House of sixty, make, 16ally a mockery of everything. Therefore, what I would have thought should happen is that this sort of action which happened in Nagaland should in turn give us a fresh stimulus to think concretely in terms of restricing the size of ministries so that the lure of office does not touch the people there.

I wll not go into the question of party politics, UDF and NNO, United Democratic Front and Naga Nationalist Organisation, in Nagaland. But I would say, this game of defection in Nagaland once again has proved how such a game is dirty and devilish and how it can be destructive to the healthy growth of parliamentary democracy.

(Nagaland)

I would have liked to sit down at this point, but my good friend Mr. Naik made a reference wittingly or unwittingly to the role of independents in the Nagaland Assembly and said, there are 12 independents and because of their defection the problem started and he tried to make out as if that was the whole reason for this. To call such people as independents would also be wrong in the sense that they were only waiting for some chance! A real independent is one who is not dependent, but who is always dependable for his integrity, for his opinion, for his character. This is the main thing.

In the end, before I conclude, I wish to quote again from the Governer's report. He says:

"It is only a fresh election, at which the electors may withhold their support from defectors that holds out the prospect of a fully stable Ministry."

Although this is a fond hope, I also hope like the Governor, that after some period of time, Nagaland will be given a chance of a fresh election, a fresh Assembly, a fresh Government, which will free the State from this disease and defect of defections. With these words I conclude.

16.00 hrs.

SHRI PAOKAI HAOKIP (OUTER MANIPUR): At the very outset I would like to thank the Minister for presenting this budget for the State of Nagaland. I am sorry to say that it is very unfortunate on the part of the people of Nagaland at this juncture to have the State of Nagaland under President's Rule. This has to be done under the circumstances which could not be avoided.

As a layman I would like to touch only one point. On the front page of the Report of the governor, para 3, says:

327 St. Resume Disapproval MARCH 25, 1975 of Air Force & Army 328

"Shri Jamir now claims to have 33 members in the UDF, and has sent me letters signed by each of the 33 promising, in the name of God, their unchanging loyalty to the UDF."

This is very surprising to hear this in the matter of defection. How they take the name of God is a surprising thing to me. Why could not this matber be considered seriously?

Another thing that I would like to refer to is this. Some Members from the Opposition side have the tendency zo criticise the Central Government for the imposition of President's Rule in the State of Nagaland. For the first time in the history of India, in that State. President's rule has been im-Dosed not by the Centre but by the representatives of the people of Nagaland themselves. There are no parties there in Nagaland Legislature. There are some local organisations called N.N.O. and U.D.F: No ideological parties. The Speaker of the Legislature tried to do something against a democratic spirit. My information is that on that very day when the Speaker decided to adjourn the House sine die, there were Members who had collected themselves inside the House. They were physically present-one side led by Shri Jamir with 33 Members and the other side with less than this number. When they were physically present here. one is surprised how the Speaker had not decided as to who commanded the majority in a House. Why did he decide to adjourn the House sine die? What is the point in this? I would like the action to be considered seriously in the best interests of a Parliamentary democracy if at all it has to function. I am not here talking from the point of view of any party. I am speaking from the point of view of parliamentary democracy. It is very unfortunate on the part of Nagaland people that they have to be brought under President's rule They should continue to enjoy whatever they are enjoying socially, politically and administratively and should be

1975 of Air Force & Army 328 Laws (Amåt.) Ord. and Bill

into the national drawn main-They have to function stream. smoothly I do not know why the elected people themselves brought about the imposition of President's rule in the State of Nagaland. It is for the people of Nagaland to decide it. I hope this President's rule will be as brief as possible and the elected representatives will have the earliest opportunity to decide for themselves. Being a Member from Manipur, we have the experience of President's rule for a number of times and we know how under the President's rule the officials behave and what the sufferings of the people are.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: As we are having a nomnibus discussion on many issues together, I will first call the Home Minister and then the Finance Minister.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AF-FAIRS (SHRI K. BRAHMANANDA REDDY): Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, I have heard with as much attention as possible the several speeches made by the hon. Members who participated in this debate In the end I feel that it may not be necessary to waste the time of the House with a lengthy reply. You are aware and the hon. Members are aware that after a good deal of consultations with Naga leaders and others a 16point agreement emerged. State-hood to Nagaland was given and Article 371A prior to the State-hood was introduced in Parliament which governed the reltions between the Centre and the State of Nagaland.

After that several years have passed in which responsible governments have functioned and I must also say to the credit of those governments that a reasonable effort has been made to improve and develop the area, to improve the communications, etc. etc. though one might wish that a good deal more could have been done.

Now. Sir, so far as the situation there is concerned, oftentimes it has

329 St. Res, re Proclamation CHAITRA 4, 1897 (SAKA) in relation to 330 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

some during Question Hour and on several other occasions that after the State-hood and the responsible Government coming, in many of the undergrounds have come over-ground and in accordance with the promises given they have been sufficiently rehabilitated. But it is unfortunate that now and before, a few hundreds of insurgents, a few hundred of under-grounds have been trying to have contacts with the foreign powers and get possible inspiration as well as arms etc. and it becomes necessary for the police and the security forces to deal effectively with that insurgence.

Sir, when the 16-point agreement emerged...and Nagaland became a full fledged State, so far as the Constitutional position is concerned, there is a finality and there is no question of any political problems still remaining. But, obviously, the House does not expect the Central Government to be soft to these undergrounds who have been attempting to speak out and get arms and ammunition etc. from a foreign power. Sir, as has been rightly remarked by Prof. Mukherjee, a very lengthy and argumentative report has been given by the Governor which I have placed on the Table of the House. From a reading of the Report, it is clear to anybody that in spite of his attempts to get the relative strength of the parties tested on the floor of the House, it was not possible and how, in a situation like that, specially, when the Budget had to be passed and the Appropriation Bill had to be passed, he was compelled to recommend the imposition of President's Rule. I do not want to go into the lengthy report of the Governor, Sir, because, hon Members would have read it. Now, I am very sorry that an unfortunate and, I should say, an uncharitable remark has been made by Prof. Mukherjee and Mr. Deo as well and possibly during my absence, by some friends from the Opposition that this was toppled because of Central Government's intervention. I want to tell

the House in confidence and absolute sincerity, Sir, that there has been absolutely no kind of interference from the Central Government. The events took place in such a quick succession and until the Government's report came, we were not aware that Jasokie lost his majority or even Vizol lost his majority. Of course, it was claimed by Jasokie that but for the duress and the threat etc. he would not have lost his majority in the House. In this connection, it may be useful to point out to the House what the leader of the UDF Party, Mrs. Rano Shaiza has said and what Mr. Jamir, leader of the UDF party in the legislature has said. This is for your information, This is what Mrs. Shaiza has Sir. said:

"Although the UDF commands a clear majority at the time of the Proclamation, the party considers the action of the Governor suspending the Assembly to give respite for forming a more stable future Government fully justified."

I may also read a line or two from the letter written by Mr. Jamir, leader of the UDF party in the legislature,--who claims major:ty--to the Governor.

"Respected Governor,

I on behalf of my party, express our.

"appreciation for the right decision you have taken to keep the Nagaland Legislative Assembly in suspended animation. You have been very frank to us all through this crisis and I believe that under your guidance, a stable government will be formed without delay....

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: How can animation be suspended? How can you suspend animation? If you suspend animation, there is death.

SHRI K. BRAHMANANDA REDDY Sir, this is what he said. I quote two sentences from the letter written by Mr. Jamir.

331 St. Resume Disapproval MARCH 25, 1975 of Air Force & Army 332. Laws (Amdt.) Ord. and Bill

Now, Sir, one other remark has been made, namely, that the Nagaland budget shows an extraordinary item of expenditure on the State police. But, if you go through the budget, in regard to some items---I do not want to go into the entire thing, for instance, in public work housing, roads and bridges, you find that the amount is Rs. 22,47,000 and odd. Power projects Rs. 4.43 crores, water supply Rs. 2 crores, agriculture and minor irrigation Rs. 2.24 crores, industries Rs. 2.27 lakhs, etc. The expenditure on State police comes to onethirteenth of the total expenditure. I do not say for a State like Nagaland it is small, but all the same it is not a very extraordinary item of expenditure; considering the circumstances prevailing in that State.

Naturally, the Governor will not only run the day-to-day administration of the State but also take steps to see that the developmental effort is not neglected and concentrate his attention on development. You are also aware that the Nagaland area had recently a sugar factory. In fact, as Chairman of the Finance Commission, I had an opportunity to visit Nagaland, and I saw the Sema area, the Angami area and other areas. It was kind on the part of the men, women and children that they greeted us and welcomed us. We found that there is great scope for Nagaland to develop provided the activities of the insurgents are reduced. I can say from the feelings I got that the Naga people are vary anxious to develop their area. Of course, as compared to the rest of the country, education is more. All the same, the area requires deve-More and more people lopment should get into the mainstream of national life, go to other parts of the country and serve in their respective fields. It is quite in evidence that many young people from this area are coming into the IAS, IPS etc. and serving in other areas very well. We want more and more of them to do so. Unfortunately, because of the activities of a few hundreds of insurgents the tranquillity and peace of the area

is being disturbed. The sooner all of us make an effort to see that this goes down and they are attracted towards national activities, the better it would be not only for the country but for Nagaland as well.

I have nothing more to say except that the Anti-defections Bill is before the Joint Committee of Parliament. It has had several sittings and I hope the deliberations of the committee will be concluded shortly and the report presented to Parliament for consideration.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE (SHRI PRANAB KUMAR MUKHERJEE): Sir, at the outset let me express my gratitude to the hon, members for allowing me to present a budget document though it was not in its proper form and for allowing the budget to be considered by the House by suspending a rule, which we were not in a position to comply with, Most of the members who have taken part in the discussion have concentrated on the political aspects and these points have been answered by my senior colleague, the Home Minister.

Two or three points were mentioned by the hon. Members during the course of their observations I would first take up the point raised by Shri Sezhiyan. I have received his letter today and I have replied to it where I have explained the situation in which we had to bring this budget. Here I would like to mention that we do also feel that some sort of guidelines should be framed and issued to the various State Governments in order to meet the contingencies which are occurring nowadays. It would be better if one uniform pattern of financial adminitration could be evolved in various parts of the country, of course keeping in view scope for accommodation to meet the particular demands and requirements of the individual States. Had it been there, perhaps, it would have avoided a situation like the present one. Regarding the points

CHAITRA 4, 1897 (SAKA) in relation to 334 Nagaland and D.G. & S.D.G. (Nagaland)

mentioned by him in his letter and in his observations on the floor of the House, I will collect information from the State administration and pass them on to him.

While making my observations on the budget I have tried to highlight some of the salient features of the budget, particularly financial assistance and a few other points. It has been possible in the current year to increase the Plan allocation to some extent, though not to a substantial extent. While last year the Plan allocation was Rs. 14 crores, this year it is of the order of Rs. 15.24 crores. While Central assistance last year was Rs. 7.12 crores, this year it is of the order of Rs. 9.12 crores. Therefore, it is not correct to say that the Centre is administering Nagaland only through police and military, without taking care of the economic development of the area. Some of the major projects, including the paper project, have been taken up at the initiative of the Centre, and some more projects are coming up.

One of the points raised by Professor Hiren Mukerjee has been replied to by the hon. Home Minister, by quoting certain figures to show that it is not a fact that the bulk of the expenditure in the budget has been earmarked for police administration. For instance, even in a small State like Nagaland the allocation for power projects this year is Rs. 4,43,57,600. Another important feature of this budget is the provision for grids. While many of the developed States have not been able to take care of their particular areas, specially in the matter of grids, in the case of Nagaland the allocation this year for that is Rs. 3,53,60,000 Certain other development projects have also been mentioned in the hudget to take care of that area.

A reference was made to literacy in Nagaland. The percentage of literacy is not bad as compared to many other developed States. Some of them are still far behind Nagaland. The allocation for education is Rs. 5,31,78,000 in a budget of about Rs. 56 crores. So, the percentage of allocation for education is not bad in comparison with many other States.

I agree with many of the hon. Members who have expressed the hope that the spell of President's Rule should be as brief as possible and it should be possible for the people of Nagaland to arrive at a decision about having a Government of their own for sorting out their problems so that they can transact their business on the floor of their Assembly, which incidentally would be a relief to us to some extent, so that it would be possible for them to take care of all the developmental aspects of their area.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I will now put the Resolution to the vote of the House.

The question is;

"That this House approves the Proclamation issued by the President on the 22nd March, 1975 under article 356 of the Constitution in relation to the State of Nagaland."

The Resolution was adopted.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I will first put the Demands for Grants on Account to the vote of the House.

The question is:

"That the respective sums not exceeding the amounts on Revenu-Account and Capital Account shown in the third column of the order paper, be granted to the President, out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland, on account, for or towards defraving the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending the 31st day of March, 1976, in respect of the heads of demands entered in the second column thereof—

Demands Nos. 1, 3, 4 to 9 and 12 to 55."

335 St. Resume Disapproval MARCH 25, 1975 of Air Force & Army 336 Laws (Amdt.) Ord. and Bill

The motion was adopted.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Now, I put the Supplementary Demands for Grants to vote.

The question is:

"That the respective Supplementary sums not exceeding the amounts shown in the third column of the order paper be granted to the President out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland to defray the charges which will come in course of payment during the year ending the 31st day of March, 1975, in respect of the following demands entered in the second column thereof—

Demand Nos. 1, 3, 5, 7, 9, 12, 15 to 18, 20, 22 to 24, 27, 29 to 31, 37. 45, 46, 49, 51, 52 and 54."

The motion was adopted

16 27 hrs.

NAGALAND APPROPRIATION (VOTE ON ACCOUNT) BILL[•], 1975

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE (SHRI PRANAB KUMAR MUKHERJEE): Sir, I beg to move for leave to introduce a Bill to provide for the withdrawal of certain sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for the services of a part of the financial year 1975-76.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: The question is:

"That leave be granted to introduce a Bill to provide for the withdrawal of certain sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for the services of a part of the financial year 1975-76."

The motion was adopted.

SHRI PRANAB KUMAR MUK-

HERJEE: I introducet the Bill. I beg to move:

"That the Bill to provide for the withdrawal of certain sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for the services of a part of the financial year 1975-76, be taken into consideration."

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: The question is:

"That the Bill to provide for the withdrawal of certain sums from and out of the Consolidated Fund of the State of Nagaland for the services of a part of the financial year 1975-76, be taken into consideration."

The motion was adopted.

MR DEPUTY-SPEAKER: We now take up the clause-by-clause consideration of the Bill. I put the clauses to vote.

The question is:

"That Clauses 2 and 3, the Schedule, Clause 1, the Enacting Formula and the Title stand part of the Bill."

The motion was adopted. Clauses 2 and 3, the Schedule, Clause 1, the Enacting Formula and the Title were added to the Bill.

SHRI PRANAB KUMAR MUK-HERJEE: I move:

"That the Bill be passed"

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: The question is:

"That the Bill be passed"

The motion was adopted.

*Published in Gazette of India Extraordinary Part II, Section 2, dated 25-3-75. †Introduced/Moved with the recommendation of the President.