

## LOK SABHA DEBATES

### LOK SABHA

Tuesday, September 3, 1974 (Bhadra)  
12, 1896 (Saka)

The Lok Sabha met at Eleven of the  
Clock

[MR. SPEAKER in the Chair]

### MOTION FOR ADJOURNMENT

ALLEGED STARVATION DEATHS IN BIHAR

SOME HON. MEMBERS rose—

SHRI SAMAR GUHA (Contai):  
Sir, I have given notice of an adjournment motion... (Interruptions)

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी (भालियर) :  
अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैंने एक काम रोको प्रस्ताव दिया है जो कि बिहार के बारे में है। मैं अभी बिहार का दौरा कर के आया हूँ। बिहार में सूखे के कारण और बाढ़ के कारण विनाश की स्थिति है। केन्द्र सरकार ने 35 हजार टन अनाज प्रति मास वहाँ पर देने का वादा किया था लेकिन केवल 10 हजार टन अनाज दिया जा रहा है। नतीजा यह हो रहा है कि बिहार में लाखों लोग भूख से मर रहे हैं। मैं आपके सामने यह अखबार की खबर रख रहा हूँ: “मुजफ्फरपुर जिले के अन्तर्गत कुड़नी प्रखण्ड में बाढ़ एवं अनिवृष्टि के कारण 70 फीसदी तबाह और भुखमरी के कगार पर हैं। गत 13 अगस्त को छाजन संग्राम की ए. ए. हरिजन महिला, श्री ढोढ़ा पासवान की पत्नी की मृत्यु अन्न-भाव से हो गई। इसी तरह उक्त गांव के ही दरघा टोले के किमुनी मांझी की मृत्यु अन्न के बिना गत 16 अगस्त को हो गई।”

अध्यक्ष महोदय केवल विरोधी दल वाले ही नहीं बल्कि तारुण्य दल के सदस्य भी भुखमरी के मामलों को प्रकाश में ला रहे हैं

जैसा कि अखबार में निकला है; इस में लिखा है “बिहार प्रदेश युवा कांग्रेस के श्री रोशन लाल भाटिया ” अनुसार पिछले कई महोनों से इस जिले में सुखाड की स्थिति के फलस्वरूप लगभग पन्द्रह व्यक्ति भूख से मर गये हैं। उन्होंने न केवल यहां एक वक्तव्य जारी कर जिले में बड़े पैमाने पर भुखमरी को रोकने के लिये सरकार से अविलम्ब राहत की व्यवस्था करने की अपील की।”

इतना ही नहीं बाढ़ पोंडिन मुखड अन्न लूटमार पर उतारू हो गये हैं अपने पापी पेट को भरने के लिए।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : वाजपेयी जी, कल भी यह मामला आया था और इस पर कवेष्वच भी पूछे जा चुके हैं और वहम भी इस पर हा चुकी है। यह तो एक कांस्टिन्चूइंग मेटर है और इस पर एडजोर्नमेंट मोशन कैम एडमिट होगा, लेकिन मैं ने कल इन से कहा था कि यह एक स्टेटमेंट दें। तो जो वे स्टेटमेंट देंगे उस में यह बात भी आ जाएगी। कल भी यह आया था और इस के बारे में मैं ने कह दिया था कि वे लेटेस्ट पोजीशन दें। 26 तक की तो वे बना चुके हैं और उस के बाद की जो पोजीशन है, वह ये बता देंगे।

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur): Sir, is it your ruling that starvation deaths in the present regime is a continuing phenomenon? (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: It is not a question of ruling. After all, we have the rules about it. That was done yesterday. They will let us know the position about this matter also that you have raised today.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : जितना प्रनाज केन्द्र ने देने का वायदा किया था, उतना प्रनाज दिया नहीं है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इस के बारे में भी उन से पूछेंगे कि क्या बात है ?

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : बिहार सरकार के जो मंत्री हैं वे तो परिक्रमा करने में लगे हैं कि कुर्सी बचाओ और कुर्सी हटाओ। फिर भुखमरी को रोकने के लिए कौन प्रयत्न करेगा।

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA (Begusarai): May I make a submission with regard to the flood situation in Bihar? We have been discussing the flood situation for the country as a whole, but the Bihar situation was sought to be highlighted in a special manner by many hon'ble Members of this House. Later also, the gravity of the Bihar flood situation was impressed upon the House and upon the Government. But Government never thought it fit to come to the House with a full statement on the subject. Now you say that you have asked the Government to make a statement. It may well be that they would come up with a statement on the last day when we will be left with no remedy. (Interruptions.) We come from that State. The situation there is very grave. The unprecedented floods have affected the various parts of Bihar. The most serious aspect of it is that the Bihar Government is not functioning at all. There is no Government worth the name to come to the rescue and relief of the people. (Interruptions).

श्री हुकम चन्द कल्लूबाब (मुनेरा) : बिहार सरकार के पास पैसा नहीं है प्रनाज खरीदने के लिये और जो प्रनाज देने का वचन उन्होंने दिया था, वह भी उनका नहीं भिन्न। आप खाद्य मंत्री को यहाँ बुलवाइये। . . . (व्यवधान) . . .

MR. SPEAKER: Unless all of you sit down, I would not call any one.

घ्राप बैठ जाएं।

अब तो यह हाल हो गया है कि रोज घ्राते ही यह चीज शुरू हो जाती है। मुझे तो ख्वाब में भी इस तरह घ्राप खड़े हुए नजर आते हैं। घ्राप को थोड़ा शान्ति में शुरू करना चाहिए। यह जो बिहार के बारे में सवाल है, इस पर 26 तारीख को बहस हो चुकी है। इन के पहले भी स्वेचम में यह सवाल आ चुका है। यह एक आइडेंटिकल सबजेक्ट है और एक कटिप्पड़िंग मैटर है और कल्लू के तहत कोई रास्ता नजर नहीं आता। इसलिए मैंने कहा है कि इस घ्रासे के दौरान में जो कुछ हुआ है उस के बारे में यह एक स्टेटमेंट दें। इस में और क्या करें।

श्री श्यामनन्दन मिश्र : अभी तक कोई नतीजा नहीं निकला है और लोग भुख में मर रहे हैं। . . . (व्यवधान)

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : चर्चा तो हुई थी लेकिन उस चर्चा के बाद जो घटनाएँ घटी हैं और जो परिस्थिति बिगड़ी है, उस को बिहार की सरकार संभालने में विफल रही है और केन्द्रीय सरकार को जितनी मदद देनी चाहिए थी वह नहीं दे रही है।

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA A<sup>m</sup> (Bhagalpur): We agree with friends that we have floods in B<sup>i</sup> and that people are in difficulties. The point is that we want more grains. The Bihar Government has asked for 38,000 tonnes per month plus Rs. 20 crores for immediate relief plus Rs. 10 crores for repair of roads damaged by the floods. The 22,000 tonnes of foodgrains distributed by the Bihar Government are not enough. Mr. Ghafoor and his administration are serious, but the problem is that we have no grains, we have no money. (Interruptions) The question is one of paucity of funds. They want to make political blackmail of the situation... (Interruptions) We want more foodgrains, more money. This is simply political black-mailing.

SHRI A. P. SHARMA (Buxar): They want to exploit politically the difficulties of the people

SHRI P. M. SAYEED (Laccadive, Minicoy and Amindivi Islands): In Kerala unprecedented havoc has been caused by floods.

SHRI H. N. MUKEREE (Calcutta-North-East): You have very generously permitted me. I feel I would like to have your guidance whether the House should proceed with this matter when you say that this is a continuing matter and has been discussed earlier. My difficulty is that in Bihar as well as in West Bengal and so many other States, a situation has been created where in addition to the natural calamities and floods about which the Government may not be in a position to do any thing material, there is shortage of food supply and starvation deaths happening in West Bengal and the West Bengal Government had the gumption to put out a statement that deaths have taken place not on account of starvation but on account of malnutrition. This kind of statement coming in the year of grace, 1974 is a slander on humanity. This kind of things goes on and the Parliament is at the far end of the session and we do not get an opportunity of discussing this motion even to the point of censuring the Government because they are chary of coming out with a statement regarding the position and you are in a predicament having to ask over and over again for a statement which they do not do on their own, that being so, it surely becomes incumbent on the Parliament. I came back from Calcutta only last night and I do realise the kind of feeling prevailing in that part of the country. I think the Government should beware of this spirit prevailing in large parts of the country before it takes all kinds of stratagems. Therefore, I feel that what Mr Vajpayee has sought to bring in is a real opportunity for the Parliament to discuss a matter of national importance involving a lot of censure of the

Government that is incidental and which is something which we cannot avoid.

Therefore, I would like your guidance. I came from Calcutta only last night and that is why I feel even more concerned than I would have been otherwise about the essentiality of this matter

श्री मधु लिमये (बाका) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर पर खड़ा हूँ, क्या दूसरों की तरह गान्धी-मनोज के बिना नहीं मुनेंगे ? मैं व्यवस्था के मवाल पर पहले से खड़ा हूँ ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय यह बोलने का क्या तरीका है ?

श्री मधु लिमये : जब कोई सदस्य प्वाइन्ट ऑफ ऑर्डर पर खड़ा होता है तो आप को तत्काल मुनना चाहिए । अगर आप की राय में बोयस प्वाइन्ट ऑफ ऑर्डर है तो आप कह सकते हैं कि बोयस प्वाइन्ट ऑफ ऑर्डर है । लेकिन यह क्या तरीका है इस तरह आप सदस्यों को दुर्व्यवहार करने के लिये उकसा रहे हैं ।

(व्यवधान)

SHRI B K DASCHOWDHURY (Cooch-Bihar): The situation in North Bengal which I raised yesterday and day before yesterday .. (Interruptions)

PROF MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur): Mr. Madhu Limaye has already started his point of order. Always a point of order should have precedence.

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Ramachandran Kadannappalli, why are you getting up every time? I am not able to listen to anybody. Order please. If you are on a point of order you are welcome to say about it. But it must be strictly point of order. If you are on some submission I will listen to you later on.

**SHRI MADHU LIMAYE:** I have a point of order.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Why are you interrupting me like this, Mr. Madhu Limaye? You want to submit something else.

**PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE:** The hon. Member over there wants to submit something. He said that.

**MR. SPEAKER:** I am not only bound to this side; I have to listen to that side too.

**PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE:** You can, Sir.

**MR. SPEAKER:** How can I ignore them? Why are you standing up every time? Mr. Ramachandran Kadannappalli, why don't you tell me what you want?

**SHRI RAMACHANDRAN KADANNAPPALLI (Kasergod):** There is the serious situation which has arisen in Kerala, Sir.

**MR. SPEAKER:** It is not a point of order.

**SHRI P. M. SAYEED:** Many people are dying of starvation.

**MR. SPEAKER:** All of you may please sit down. Everytime I saw you getting up. In spite of Mr. Madhu Limaye's protest I called you. I gave you notice that if it is a point of order you are welcome. Please don't get up everytime.

**SHRI P. M. SAYEED:** We gave notice under Rule 377. It is a serious situation about food supply.

**MR. SPEAKER:** This is not a discussion under Rule 377. Order please.

**SHRI PRIYA RANJAN DAS MUNSII (Calcutta South):** You allow Jyotirmoy Bosu to say without point of order. You allowed Mr. Hiren Mukerjee. You allow them. When it

comes to our side you are not allowing. We protest. It is not justice, Sir. They are shouting without point of order. When it comes to congress members, you say, strictly point of order. Why it is so? Why it is so?

**SHRI PILOO MODY (Godhra):** You go and cry on somebody's lap, not here.

**MR. SPEAKER:** Mr. Naik, why don't you sit down?

**SHRI B. V. NAIK (Kanara):** I will make a submission.

**PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE:** Not submission, point of order

**MR. SPEAKER:** I welcome you to make that, if you are on a point of order. Don't defy me when I say that I will allow you later.

श्री मधु लिमये अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न अजournमेंट आफ बिजनेस से सम्बन्धित है . . (स्ववचन) .  
आप मुझे सुनने तो बोलेंगा, अगर नहीं सुनना चाहते तो बैठ जाऊंगा ।

**MR. SPEAKER:** You cannot go on like this. Order please. All of you may please sit down. The question was about Adjournment Motion. I have made certain observations over which Prof. Hiren Mukerjee made some submission. In between this discussion has started. The hon. Member here gets up, the hon. Member there gets up, you get up.

श्री मधु लिमये : मैं जब से पहले से कहा हुआ हूँ । आप सुनना नहीं चाहते हैं तो मत सुनिये ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : ऐसा मत कीजिये. यह आप को अच्छा मान्य नहीं देता ।

आप का प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर एडजournमेंट मोशन पर है या किसी और बात पर ?

श्री जयु शिखरी : कार्य सूची के अनुसार सब से पहले एडजर्नमेंट मोशन आणी । आपने कॉलिंग एटेशन, शार्ट नोटिस क्वेश्चन हाफ एन आयर डिसकशन सब बन्द कर दिया है । अब और कोई रास्ता नहीं रह गया है अबिलम्बनाय लोक महत्व के सबालों को उठाने का । आप कहते हैं कि कन्टिन्यूइंग मैटर है । मेरी प्रार्थना यह है कि स्टारवेशन बैथ्स का सबाल क्या केन्द्र के द्वारा अनाज की सप्लाई से सम्बन्ध नहीं रखता है ? यह उस दिन चर्चा का विषय नहीं था । घटल जॉ ने जो विषय रखा है वह बिल्कुल अलग है । उम मा सम्बन्ध सरकार की बिकलता से है । अनाज की सप्लाई और एडजर्नमेंट मोशन इन पर आप तत्काल चर्चा कराए । और कोई रास्ता नहीं है ।

SHRI P. M. SAYEED: Is this the point of order? (Interruptions)

SHRI DINESH CHANDRA GO-SWAMI (Gauhati): The point of order I am making is that the Opposition has come forward with an adjournment motion. As you have rightly pointed out this is a continuing matter in the sense (Interruptions) that earlier, the other day, when we discussed the floods and drought situation, we pointed out to the Government about the series of news items that appeared in the papers. Therefore, in my respectful submission, it is a continuing subject and I feel when this is a matter which concerns all of us deeply let us not make a political capital out of it. My submission will be that in order to make your observation fruitful you should immediately give an opportunity of continuing with the discussion on floods. If you will give us the opportunity of discussing this, the Minister will be able to express his views. After all a series of serious news item has appeared in the papers. It would be better if you could give us some time for discussion of this continuing matter.

MR. SPEAKER: The Central Government provided to Bihar Govern-

ment foodgrains of the order of 10,000 tonnes as against 35,000 tonnes of foodgrains. With the acute shortage of foodgrains, the famine conditions have developed in the State, particularly, in the flood affected areas where 10 persons are reported to have died of starvation. Everything was discussed at that time.

SHRI SHYAMANANDAN MISHRA: This shows that this is a failure exactly of this Government. That is what we are seeking to discuss. (Interruptions).

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU (Diamond Harbour): Sir, I gave you a document about the starvation deaths in Bankura, Purulia, Burdwan, Cooch-Bihar and Bihar. (Interruptions).

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI K. RAGHU RAMAIAH): So far as it relates to floods there was incomplete discussion. This side of the House is anxious to continue with the discussion. As soon as urgent Government work is complete we will take it up.

MR. SPEAKER: Are you pressing for your adjournment motion, Mr. Vajpayee?

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: I am pressing for it.

मैं सदन की अनुमति चाहता हूँ और मांग करता हूँ कि सदन को स्थगित कर दिया जाए ।

यह कहना ठीक नहीं है कि बिहार में जो परिस्थिति उत्पन्न हुई है उस पर चर्चा हो चुकी है । जिस समय चर्चा हुई थी उस समय बिहार में परिस्थिति भयंकर नहीं थी . . . (इंटरप्शन)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप इसको पुट करिये ।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : मैं प्रस्ताव करता हूँ कि सदन की कोई-बाही स्थगित की जाए ।

**SHRI K. RAGHU RAMAIAH**, I object to it. It amounts to a censure motion

**MR. SPEAKER** Those who are in favour of the adjournment motion may please rise in their seats

I find the number is more than 50. The motion is admitted. We will take it up at 4 O'clock.

11 30 hrs

### PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

REPORT OF ELECTION COMMISSION OF INDIA ON FIFTH GENERAL ELECTIONS IN 1971-72 AND DELIMITATION COMMISSION ORDERS RE PARLIAMENTARY AND ASSEMBLY CONSTITUENCIES OF KERALA HIMACHAL PRADESH AND KARNATAKA

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF LAW, JUSTICE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS (SHRI NITRAJ SINGH CHAUDHARY)** I beg to lay on the Table—

(1) A copy of the Report (Hindi version) of the Election Commission of India on the Fifth General Elections in India 1971-72 Narrative and Receptive Part [Placed in Library See No LT-8370/74]

(2) A copy each of the following Orders (Hindi and English versions) of the Delimitation Commission under sub-section (3) of section 10 of the Delimitation Act, 1972

(i) Order No. 18 of the Delimitation Commission in respect of the delimitation of parliamentary and assembly constituencies in the State of Kerala, published in Notification No SO 456(E) in Gazette of India dated the 27th July, 1974

(ii) Order No. 19 of the Delimitation Commission in respect of the delimitation

of parliamentary, and assembly constituencies in State of Himachal Pradesh, published in Notifications No. SO 461(E) in Gazette of India dated the 31st July, 1974.

(iii) Order No. 20 of the Delimitation Commission in respect of the delimitation of parliamentary and assembly constituencies in the State of Karnataka, published in Notification No SO 479(E) in Gazette of India dated the 5th August, 1974 [Placed in Library See No LT-8371/74]

### NOTIFICATIONS UNDER CUSTOMS ACT, 1962

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE (SHRI K R GANESH)** I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the following Notification (Hindi and English versions) under section 159 of the Customs Act, 1962 —

(1) G S R 379(E) published in Gazette of India dated the 29th August, 1974 together with an explanatory memorandum

(2) G S R 380(E) published in Gazette of India dated the 29th August, 1974 together with an explanatory memorandum [Placed in Library see No LT-8372/74]

REPORT OF COMMISSION OF INQUIRY INTO DISAPPEARANCE OF NETAJI SUBHAS CHANDRA BOSE AND REPORT ON POLICE FIRING AT LIMBDI IN SURENDRA NAGAR, DISTRICT

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IN THE DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL (SHRI RAM NIWAS MISHRA)**: I beg to lay on the Table—