

श्री भोला राजत (बैंगहा) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैंने कालिग अटेंडेंशन का नोटिस दिया था लेकिन मेरा नाम वैंलट में नहीं आ सका है। नक्सलाईट कह कर इस बात का बिहार सरकार छिपा रही है, मैं सही बात आपके सामने रखना चाहता हूँ इसलिए आप मुझे भी कहने का मौका दे दीजिए।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आपको मैंने नहीं बुलाया है। आपका इसमें नाम नहीं है। क्लम के खिलाफ हम कैसे जा सकते हैं।

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Alipore) : Only two of the members whose names were listed here were present. Further it is the last day. So, kindly be a little indulgent.

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप जानते हैं कि क्लज क्या है। जिनके नाम वैंलट में आये हैं, मित्र वही बोल सकते हैं। अगर मैं आज यह ब्रान मान लेता हूँ, तो फिर वह रोज चलेगी। तब माननीय सदस्य ही एतराज करेगे।

(व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप का नाम वैंलट में नहीं आया है।

I am sorry, I am not allowing it.... (Interruptions) Please sit down now. I am sorry. I very much wish I would have allowed it, but the rules come in the way.

11.32 Hrs.

QUESTIONS OF PRIVILEGE—Contd.

(i) NEWS REPORT PUBLISHED IN INDIAN EXPRESS, BOMBAY EDITION, DATED 30TH APRIL, 1973 ALLEGEDLY CASTING REFLECTIONS ON MEMBERS

MR. SPEAKER : I have to refer to certain privilege motions because the House adjourns *sine die* today.

First I will refer to the one about the use of the words "goonda" and "goondai". On the 3rd May, 1973, Shri K. P. Unnikrishnan sought to raise a question of privilege in the House in respect of the

following news report published in the *Indian Express*, Bombay Edition, dated the 30th April, 1973. Before taking any action in the matter, we called for their explanation. The news item reads :

"Mr. Limaye said (in a public meeting at Bombay) the Prime Minister had a 'ring of goondas' among the MPs who shouted down the Opposition Members whenever they rose to speak. This happened even when the Prime Minister herself remained present in the House, he added."

I am sorry the words "goonda" and "goondai" are finding their place in the parliamentary proceedings through some source or other. I cannot help it.

Shri Madhu Limaye had then denied having used the word "goondas" as reported in the above news report.

I had then said that the concerned newspaper would be asked to state what it had to say in the matter, as the convention goes. The Editor of the *Indian Express*, in his letter dated the 7th May, 1973, has stated as follows :—

"At the outset I take the full legal and moral responsibility for what has appeared in the Bombay edition of the *Indian Express*, dated 30th April, 1973 regarding the speech of Shri Madhu Limaye at Bombay.

Our staff reporter maintains that the report which he has given is a correct translation of what he heard Mr. Madhu Limaye say at the meeting in question.

It is just possible that our reporter misheard what Mr. Madhu Limaye said. Such misreporting does sometimes occur having regard to the conditions under which reporters work".

It is very meaningful and interesting. Further, he says :

"I may assure you that there was no intention on the part of either the reporter or the sub-editor who handled the report to commit any breach of privilege of the Member of the House. I may also mention that in view of Mr. Limaye's attitude to the ruling party and the strong language he had used against the Government and the Prime Minister in some of his other statements, no one in the editorial department had any

reason to feel that Mr. Madhu Limaye was unlikely to make such a statement.

In view of this explanation, I request that the lapse, if any, on the part of the *Indian Express*, Bombay, in publishing the passage to which objection has been taken, may be condoned by the Speaker."

The Editor-in-Chief of the *Indian Express*, in his letter dated the 10th May, 1973, has stated as follows :—

"I acknowledge responsibility for the error complained of in reporting Mr. Madhu Limaye's speech at Bombay and offer my regret for the lapse.

May I say in explanation that the reporter responsible for the coverage maintains that what he wrote represents a faithful translation of Mr. Limaye's speech on this particular point. I am, however, mindful of the possibility that there was misreporting having regard to the difficult conditions in which reporters work and the difficulty of conveying in English the flavour of what is said in another language..."

In the beauty of the language, we are forgetting what Mr. Limaye said or what we have to say. He goes on to say :

"I trust the Speaker will accept my assurance that there was no intention on the part of those who handled Mr. Limaye's speech on the *Indian Express* to breach the privilege of Members of Parliament."

The Printer & Publisher and the concerned Staff Reporter of the *Indian Express*, in their letters dated the 10th May, 1973, have stated that they have nothing more to add to the explanation given by their Editor in the matter.

Now, in view of the above explanation and regret offered by the Editor, Editor-in-Chief, Printer & Publisher and the Staff Reporter of the *Indian Express*, if the House agrees, the matter may be treated as closed.

I hope, the House agree.

HON. MEMBERS: Yes.

MR. SPEAKER: You all agree.

As far as the words, *Goonda*, *Goondai* and *Goondagi* are concerned, I had a good

research work done on it. That is beside the privilege motion. Don't add it to the privilege motion.

The office has done some research work in the matter and have prepared a statement showing the meaning of the words, *Goonda*, *Goondai* and *Goondagi* as given in the English, Hindi and Marathi dictionaries.

Do you want me to read that or should it be laid on the Table of the House? I very much wish my Marathi friends were assembled together.

The meaning of 'Goonda' given in the Webster's (Third International Edition) is "professional terrorist, Hooligan, Goon, Thug". The words 'Goondai' and 'Goondagi' are not given in Webster. In Chambers' 20th Century and Oxford English Dictionaries the word 'Goonda', 'Goondai' and 'Goondagi' are not given. They have not spoiled their books. Coming to the Hindi Dictionaries, the Hindi-English Dictionary by Chaturvedi & Tiwari gives the meaning of 'Goonda' as "Rogue, scoundrel, hoodlum, hooligan", and of 'Goondai' as "Scoundrelism, rascal, reguery, hooliganism". Bhargava's Hindi-English Dictionary gives the meaning of 'Goonda' as "A rogue, a hooligan, a scoundrel, a disolute fellow, wicked, knavish" and of 'Goondai' as "Knaveishness, rascal, bullyism, scoundrelism". Gyan Shabd Kosh, Hindi-Hindi Dictionary, gives the meaning of 'Goonda', as "Bhadmash, Duryant, Khote Chal Chalan Wala". 'Khote' in Punjabi means 'Gadha'. I think, it is 'Khote' and not the Punjabi 'Khota'. Gyan Shabd Kosh gives the meaning of 'Goonda' as "Goondapan, Dushtata". The word 'Goondagi' has not been given in any of the above-noted four Hindi Dictionaries. In Prof. M. K. Deshpande's Marathi-English Dictionary, the words 'Goondai' and 'Goondagi' are not given.

So, I do not want to pursue it further. From what I see from the available Hindi dictionaries where this word is mentioned, it is not in good sense, it is in very bad taste. In Marathi dictionary, it is not even mentioned.

श्री मधु लिमये (वांवा) : मराठी शब्दिका जो मीने उद्धरण दिया था उसका क्या होया ?

MR. SPEAKER : I think, it is not proper to the dignity of either Mr. Madhu Limaye or any member who wants to defend it. This word is never used and understood in good sense, and I very much hope that Mr. Madhu Limaye will avoid it in future.

श्री मधु लिमये : "आप गुडई मत करिए"
यह आपका वाक्य रिकार्ड पर है।

SHRI PILOO MODY (Godhra) : I hope, this is a restriction only on Mr. Madhu Limaye.

MR. SPEAKER : No; on everybody.

(ii) ALLEGED MAL-TREATMENT AND OBSTRUCTION CAUSED TO SHRI LALJI BHAI, M.P. BY RAILWAY STAFF

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Lalji Bhai has raised a question of privilege. We had sent his complaint to the Railway authorities and he is not satisfied with the report. He says that he was mal-treated, there was some misbehaviour. He is not satisfied with the explanation given by the Railway authorities.

I send it to the Privileges Committee—do you agree ?

HON. MEMBERS : Yes.

MR. SPEAKER : With regard to the privilege matter raised by Shri Phool Chand Verma, I had sent for a report by the Ministry, and they are collecting the facts. So, it is pending and I am not dropping it. Now, Papers to be Laid.

श्री भान सिंह भौरा (भटिंडा) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, पंजाब में आपको पता है वसें जलाई जा रही हैं... (व्यवधान)...

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इस तरह नहीं, जब मैं आपको बुलाऊंगा तब आप बोलियेगा।

श्री फूलचन्द वर्मा : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं एक निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ आपने विशेषाधिकार के सम्बन्ध में...

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अभी मैंने उसको रखा है। अभी मैंने उसे ड्राप नहीं किया है।

श्री फूलचन्द वर्मा : उसमें मैं एक सव-मिशन करना चाहता हूँ। जरा एक मिनट

सुन लीजिए। मैं आपके सामने एक अखबार की कटिंग रखना चाहता हूँ। वहाँ पर कलैक्टर महोदय एम्बवायरी के लिए गए थे...

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इसीलिए मैंने कमेटी को भेजा है। जो आपने मुझे मिलकर बताया इसीलिये मैंने भेज दिया।

श्री फूलचन्द वर्मा : वहाँ पर गवाहों को पुलिस आतंकित कर रही है, बयान बदलवाने के लिए दवाव डाला जा रहा है। रात-रात भर उन को थाने में ले जा कर बन्द किया जाता है। यह अखबार में छपा है। इसलिए मेरा निवेदन है कि यह दूसरा विशेषाधिकार का मामला पुलिस के ऊपर बनता है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यह मैं देखूंगा। यह अभी आफ ड्रैंड में क्या कहें? आप लिखकर भेज दीजिए मुझे।

श्री फूलचन्द वर्मा : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप एक मिनट सुन लीजिए मुझे।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : दो दफा कैसे होगा? जब यह आएगा तो मैं आपको फिर खड़ा करूंगा, दूसरे सेशन में।

श्री फूलचन्द वर्मा : पुलिस गवाहों को तोड़ रही है। गवाहों को आतंकित कर रही है। तैयारी कर रही है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मुझे आप लिख कर दें। वह जता जायगा।

श्री फूलचन्द वर्मा : मेरा एक निवेदन सुन लीजिए :

अध्यक्ष महोदय, वह 3 मई, 1973 के दैनिक स्वदेश में समाचार छपा है कि जिलाधीश महोदय जांच करने घटनास्थल पर गए थे। उनके सामने जो बयान हुए उसमें पुलिस के दुर्व्यवहार को सहिं बनाया गया और पुलिस के समर्थन में किसी ने भी बयान नहीं दिया। पता चला है कि इससे घबराकर रात को ही जीप में पुलिस