

[Shri F. A. Ahmed]  
leakage. About my Ministry, I have made an inquiry and so far as my Ministry is concerned, the leakage has not taken place there and if necessary, I will make a further inquiry in order to satisfy myself whether what has been stated by the hon. Member is a fact.

So far as many other matters are concerned, I have already told the Members that it will be helpful to discuss all these after the report has been read by the hon. Members and after they have taken a decision one way or the other.

He has made a reference particularly. . . (Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER: Have the patience to keep sitting, Mr. Samar Guha.

SHRI F. A. AHMED: He has particularly made a reference with regard to the appointment of Dr. Dey. May I tell him that so far as the recommendation of the committee is concerned, that appointment was held by the committee as irregular. He was appointed in the year 1971 before the committee was instituted. We are consulting the Law Ministry as to how to overcome the difficulty of appointment which was made in 1971 and how to implement the recommendation of the committee.

SHRI SAMAR GUHA: A point of order, Sir. In his reply just now the hon. Minister said that after laying the report on the Table of the House the whole matter can be discussed and nothing can be discussed just now. On what right he has disclosed that the committee considered Dr. Dey's appointment as irregular and that they were considering as to what to do now? What right has he got, to disclose this information? Is there not a contradiction in his statement? The hon. Minister is withholding all the information regarding the recommendations of the committee. . . (Interruptions) I want to know from you. . .

MR. SPEAKER: I have nothing to tell you.

SHRI SAMAR GUHA: It is a point of order. I want to know. . . (Interruptions) I am a student of science. Therefore, I consider it my sacred duty to place the position of the scientist in the Country to-day before the House. He has come out with some fresh information which was not incorporated in the report.

MR. SPEAKER: It was identical question and he gave the same reply. What is the harm? Why not take it up, as he himself said, when the report is laid on the Table of the House? All the matters should be raised there.

13.05 hrs

#### RE. QUESTION OF PRIVILEGE

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU (Diamond Harbour): We have given notice of a Privilege Motion. Will you be kind enough to allow us to make a submission?

This happened within the precincts of Parliament. . .

MR. SPEAKER: How can bring it up as a Privilege Motion? If something happened inside the party executive meeting, it is a party affair. I am sorry. I do not allow it.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA (Begusarai) I am on a point of order. This arises out of your own ruling on this. . . (Interruptions).

Mr. SPEAKER: Order please. That is not a Privilege Motion at all.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: The party is competent to discuss anything in the party meeting in the manner it likes, but the moment the party briefs the Press, it is published

in the Press, it becomes the property of the entire country

MR SPEAKER It is given to Congress Members, not to all Every party has a right to issue direction to its Members.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA  
It is given to the Press

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यह हर पार्टी के अपने मसले होते हैं, इस में मेरी रूलिंग की क्या जरूरत है ? ऐसी बातें यहाँ क्यों उठाते हैं ? हर पार्टी के वर्कर्स होते हैं, उन के अपने डायरेक्शंस होते हैं ।

श्री श्यामनन्दन मिश्र यदि ऐसा है तो प्राइम मिनिस्टर साहिब क्यों हम लोगों का कोआपरेशन चाहती है ? अगर हम पोलिटिकल अनटचेबल है तो हम लोग का कोआपरेशन क्या चाहती है ?

(Interruptions)

अध्यक्ष महोदय मिश्रा जी, यह तो बड़ा मुश्किल काम आप ने ले लिया अपने जिम्मे ।

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA  
I am asking you to consider your own direction This is No 124A(2) (viii) It says

'In order to keep the area and passages within the Parliament House Estate free and when for Members of Parliament without any obstruction or hindrance, the following activities are prohibited within the area of Parliament House Estate —

(viii) any other activity or conduct which may cause or tend to cause obstruction or hindrance to Members of Parliament"

Now this causes hindrance to Members of Parliament.

MR SPEAKER You are really giving a different meaning to it

श्री कडल बिहारी बाजुवैथी (ग्वालियर) :  
अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप श्रीरो को भी सुन लीजिए। यह मामला केवल कांग्रेस पार्टी का नहीं है। हम भी उस से जुड़े हुए हैं। हममें कहा गया है कि हमारे साथ सम्पर्क न रखें ।

श्री श्यामनन्दन मिश्र : अभी हम को पूरा वर लन दीजिए ।

MR SPEAKER I am not allowing speeches Only point of order

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA  
This ought to be taken up as motion of privilege Any Member has a right to come before this House on the question of breach of privilege If he feels injured if the House collectively feels injured he can bring it up because that is the basic right of every Member

SHRI R S PANDEY (Rajnandgaon) Sir I would like to raise a point of order (Interruptions)

MR SPEAKER. इस तरह में कैसे चलेगा।

In the list I find Shri Bosu's name first Then comes the names of Shri Mishra and Shri Madhu Limaye I am sorry it has taken a long time The next moment you will see Shri Bosu getting up

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA  
I do not know if he has got precedence

MR SPEAKER You will please take one more minute

श्री श्यामनन्दन मिश्र : हम तो बिलकुल जल्दी कर देनेवाले हैं—हम कभी ज्यादा बक्त नहीं लेते हैं ।

So, Sir, my submission is that the hon'ble Members are guaranteed complete freedom of movement, speech

[Shri Shyamnandan Mishra]

and as a suggestion within the Parliament House Estate and, according to your Direction No. 1(a) (viii), that is absolutely clear. But, in view of the warnings issued by the Executive Committee of the Ruling Party, this movement.... (Interruptions).

SHRI R. S. PANDEY: On a point of order. Will you please permit me to raise my point of order so that every thing will be clear? I would like to quote Rule 223 regarding Privilege Motion. Under Rule 223 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, a Member wishing to raise a question of privilege shall give notice in writing to the Secretary....

MR. SPEAKER I have not admitted it.

SHRI R. S. PANDEY: It further

"If the question raised is based on a document, the notice shall be accompanied by the document."

अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप को यह निर्णय करना है—सब से पहली बात—समाचार पत्रों में हमारी एक्जीक्यूटिव कमेटी की जो प्रोसीडिंज छपी हैं—क्या समाचार पत्रों को आप भ्रयागइज्ड डाक्यूमेन्ट मानते हैं ? दूसरे—उस का आर्थेन्टिक वर्शन क्या है ? किसी भी दल को यह स्वतन्त्रता है कि वह अपने दल के सदस्यों को निर्देश दे....

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : क्या निर्देश दे ।

श्री राम सहाय पांडे : जिस सन्दर्भ में यह प्रश्न उठाया जा रहा है—अगर हमारे दल की नेता यह आदेश दें कि हम जनसभ की सभा में जा कर बैठें या कम्यूनिस्ट पार्टी की सभा में जा कर बैठें या स्वतन्त्र पार्टी के श्री पीलू मोदी की सभा में जा कर बैठें—तो यह अधिकार हमारे दल की नेता को है, कि वह अपनी पार्टी के सदस्यों को निर्देशन दें...

..... (अव्यवधान)..... इन को इस में कोई आपत्ति नहीं हो सकती । इसलिये इस सम्बन्ध में कोई त्रिबलेंज मोशन नहीं उठाया जा सकता ।

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: They way in which we are being interrupted shows that we are not allowed to proceed.

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप ने खुद ईन्ट्र किया था, मैंने नहीं कहा था ।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : अगर उन का निर्देश आता है कि हमारा गला काटो, तो क्या ये गला काटेंगे ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप का गला कैसे काटा जा सकता है ।

श्री राम सहाय पांडे : अगर ये गला काटना चाहें, तो क्या हम यह कहें कि आइये, गला काटिये ।

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: So, Sir, I was submitting that in spite of this clear unequivocal direction of the Chair, the warnings have been issued by the ruling party. I have quoted your Direction. The Executive Committee of the Ruling Party have warned that if the Members of their party hobnob with the Members of the Opposition, they will do so at their own risk.

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप अब बैठिए ।

श्री श्यामनन्दन मिश्र : हम तो बिल्कुल आप की क्लियर के मुताबिक, डायरेक्शन के मुताबिक सारी बातें कर रहे हैं ।

The Party Members have been threatened with strong disciplinary action if they hobnob with the Members of the Opposition.

**श्री ज्योतिरमोय बोस :** इस तरह से चीजे बरती रहती हैं, इस में बहुत टाइन चाया होता रहता है ।

**श्री श्यामनन्दन मिश्र :** हूल्दी कन्वेन्शन के लिये ये बातें उठाई जाती हैं । हम लोग अपनी बचटी जानते हैं ।

This also casts a reflection on the Opposition. I take serious objection to this. The Opposition does not behave in that manner and indulge in petty intrigues like the Members of the Ruling Party. Therefore, this is a matter which must receive your serious attention. At every step, in the Central Hall, we are confronted with a network of spies. Some time we shall have to mount an agitation against these spies in the Central Hall so that they might be ousted from the Central Hall. We are feeling constricted and confined at every step. Further, these warnings have been given which would come in the way of free association of Members. It casts a slur on the Opposition. It is a restriction on the movement of Members, and this restriction is a breach of privilege. You can imagine, Sir, that if this is their attitude with regard to the informal mixing of Members in the Central Hall what would be the attitude of the Administration at various levels be to the Opposition. At every step, we find that they are full of prejudices against the Opposition.

So, my submission is that we find that we are living in a free society. We now seem to be living in the Stalinist era ..

**MR. SPEAKER :** Order, order. Is he raising a point of order or making a speech? He is making a speech.  
(*Interruptions*)

I do not allow it. He has raised the point of order and that was enough. I

*\*\*Not recorded.*

had allowed him two minutes for raising the point of order. I am not going to allow any privilege motion.

**SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA :** I have made my submission that this constitutes a breach of privilege, and we want your ruling on the point. The hon'ble Prime Minister cannot go about seeking co-operation and at the same time having this kind of warning issued. This shows that she is completely in sincere. Please give your ruling on this point whether this does not constitute a breach of privilege, a breach of your directions which allow freedom of movement and association to Members.

**SHRI R K SINHA (Faizabad) :** I want to reply to Shri Shyamnandan Mishra's contention. ....  
(*Interruptions*)\*\*

**MR. SPEAKER :** I am not permitting anybody. Let all hon. Members please sit down.

**SHRI R. K. SINHA :** I want to reply to Shri Shyamnandan Mishra's contention. Sir, you are the custodian of Parliament and you are the protector of our rights. Who are the people allowed in the Central Hall? They are accredited journalists, Members of Parliament, Ex-MPs, MLAs, and Members of Parliament and their wives. Where do the spies come in? Where are the spies in the Central Hall of Parliament? Shri Mishra is saying all this just to decry us before the nation and the whole world. So, I want a ruling from you on this. I want this clarification from you.

**SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU :** What are the facts of the case? The Congress Parliamentary Party Executive Committee.... (*Interruptions*).

**SHRI R. K. SINHA :** Are spies allowed in the Central Halls. I want to know because Shri Shyamnandan Mishra has gone on record to that effect.

**SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA :** This is a question of breach of privilege against the hon'ble Prime Minister. The hon'ble Prime Minister does

[Shri Shyamnandan Mishra]

The Hon'ble Prime Minister does not have to be present in the House...

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU: The facts of the case are as follows: The Congress Parliamentary Party Executive Committee holding its meeting within the precincts of Parliament has expressed certain....

SHRI VAYALAR RAVI (Chirayinkil): He cannot discuss party matters here, Mr. Basu may have some discussions in his party. Can that matter be brought up here (*Interruptions*).

MR. SPEAKER: I cannot listen to any of you. You are all talking.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU: What happened in the meeting. According to the press, they had criticised certain members of the party....

MR. SPEAKER: They have a right to do that.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU: If you keep on talking like that, what can I do? You allow me two minutes and then you go on talking.

SHRI VASANT SATHE (Akola): Is he speaking to a point of order?

MR. SPEAKER: May I request you to allow me to listen to him for a minute?

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU: They won't allow me to speak. We can do the same. Shri Raghu Ramaiah will kindly ask them to come to order or else quorum will be challenged five minutes hereafter.

MR. SPEAKER: I am listening to his point of order.

SHRI VASANT SATHE Under what rule is he speaking? Is he speaking to a point of order? A point of privilege cannot be raised in a point of order.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU: What happened in the Executive Committee

meeting? They criticised and threatened to punish some members of their party, one of them Shri Dinesh Singh, for mixing with the Opposition members. Now in the Parliament the Central Hall and the Lobbies are meant for free exchange of ideas and dialogues. The Prime Minister is calling an Opposition members to hold dialogues. The Prime Minister is calling Shri Raghu Ramaiah comes over to the Opposition side to hobnob with us, of course to further their interests.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: We will not talk to Shri Raghu Ramaiah in future.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU: All this is part of parliamentary work. If any hindrance is put on that, that will be curtailing the rights and privileges of members. That is exactly what they have done. It is a fit case for a privilege motion. Therefore, I request you to admit it.

SHRI A. K. M ISHAQUE (Basirhat): On a point of order

श्री सच्च लिनये (बाका) अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरा प्वाइंट ऑफ़ आर्डर है। मैंने नोटिस दिया है, दो मिनट का समय मुझे दीजिये।

MR. SPEAKER: I am only listening to them. I did not give my consent to it. They have raised points of order.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU: By their threat, they are curtailing our rights as members. Therefore, it is a clear case of breach of privilege and should be admitted.

श्री सच्च लिनये: अध्यक्ष जी, सभापति जी ने इस सदन में एक बार नहीं, दसियों बार यह क़ैसला दिया है कि सेन्ट्रल हाल और लौबी इसी सदन का ऐक्सटेंशन है, और इसलिये

पार्लियामेंट में सभी सदस्यों को जो भाषण की स्वतंत्रता है उस पर रोक केवल नियमों का है और आप के निर्णयों का। अगर कांग्रेस पार्टी का नेता, उप-नेता और सेक्रेटरी सदस्यों की स्वतंत्रता पर रोक लगाने का प्रयास करेगा तो यह सदन की मानहानि का सवाल होता है, विशेषाधिकार उल्लंघन का सवाल होता है। हमारी जो भाषण स्वतंत्रता है वह जो हमारे नियम हैं, संविधान है और आप के जो फसले हैं उनके द्वारा ही नियंत्रित की जा सकती है। और चूंकि इन लोगों ने सदस्यों की स्वतंत्रता को छीनने का प्रयास किया है, नाजायज़ प्रयास किया है इसलिए सदन की मानहानि का हमारा प्रस्ताव आप ले ले और नियम 225 के तहत सदन से इजाजत मागने की अनुमति आप मुझको दीजिये। मैं लीव मागना चाहता हूँ।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : अध्यक्ष जी, मैं एक अचिंत्य का प्रश्न उठाना चाहता हूँ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय मैंने तीनो सदस्यों को सुन लिया जिनके नाम थे।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी आप एक मिनट मुझे सुन लें। आज सबने जब मैं सेंट्रल हाल में आया और मैं कांग्रेस पार्टी के डिप्टी लीडर, श्री ए० पी० शर्मा ने किसी राष्ट्रीय महत्व के प्रश्न पर चर्चा करना चाहता था, जिस का सम्बन्ध पार्लियामेंट के कार्य से है तो उन्होंने कहा आई एम सोरी, फॉर्मला हो गया है, अब हम आप से बात नहीं कर सकते। अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं पार्लियामेंट के मेम्बर के नाते अपना काम कैसे कर सकता हूँ अगर मुझे मिलने जुलने की, बातचीत करने की आजादी नहीं होगी? अध्यक्ष जी इन के सर पर तलवार लटकायी जा रही है अगर हमारे साथ मिलेंगे तो इन के खिलाफ कार्यवाही की जायेगी। यह मामला हसी का नहीं है।  
(व्यवधान)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI K C PANT) Sir, I am only trying to be helpful I have listened to all the hon Members opposite Their mam objection seems to be that the Opposition Members are prevented from hobnobbing with us (Interruption) They seem to think that it is their fundamental right to hobnob with us (Interruption)

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA It is their fundamental right to be pardah nashin

SHRI PILOO MODY (Godhra) Sir, on a point of order

MR SPEAKER The Minister is already on his legs

SHRI PILOO MODY I am sorry, I am on a point of order He is not on a point of order

MR SPEAKER Kindly wait please Wait for some time

SHRI PILOO MODY I am on a point of order Is he on a point of order? If he is not on a point of order, I am on a point of order

SHRI K C PANT I am trying to help you

SHRI PILOO MODY I am on a point of order I am with my rights

MR SPEAKER You are forcing yourself upon me

SHRI PILOO MODY No, Sir I am on a point of order The Minister himself has agreed that he is not on a point of order Therefore, I must have my point of order just now I am waiting for you to recogmse me I would like to know, on a point of order, whether the Minister has had the courtesy to write to you this morning in order to be heard on this particular point Otherwise, he can only be allowed on a point of order himself Thank you

MR. SPEAKER: You are directing all that against them. I have allowed him.

SHRI K. C. PANT: At this stage I should like the House to understand what hobnob means because everything hangs on the meaning of 'hobnob'. I have with me Champers's Twentieth Century Dictionary.

श्री कदल बिहारी बाजपेयी : हिन्दी शब्दकारों में हॉबनॉब नहीं छपा है ।

SHRI PILOO MODY: On a point of order. In the Congress Parliamentary Party, the word 'hobnob' was never mentioned; it was hobbing and nobbing. Let him find them in his dictionary.

SHRI K. C. PANT: Hobnob means, 'to associate or drink together familiarly', hobnobbing means 'a sentiment in drinking: mutual health-drinking:' etc.... (Interruptions).

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: This is the important contribution that the hon. Minister wanted to make. How can you permit the Minister to be that frivolous? Is that the connotation of that word here? He has wasted valuable time of the House by making these frivolous remarks.... (Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER: Order, order. How can one compose himself after hearing all this noise and distraction? I need half a minute to compose myself. It is a difficult task that the Speaker has to perform sometimes. These offices are in the Parliament premises; everywhere they are, in the world. They hold their meetings. Their proceedings leak out; so much happens.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: It is regular press briefing.

MR. SPEAKER: Will you please keep silent? Even if the statement is given, I think the idea of bringing a privilege motion should not arise

unless a Member comes to me and says to me that due to this statement or party direction he is obstructed from the discharge of his duties. That direction is meant only for Congress Members; that is not meant for Mr. Vajpayee. If any Congress Members comes to me and says that he is obstructed, if, for example, Shri Dinesh Singh who is the subject-matter of this, or if anybody else comes to me and says that this statement is causing obstruction in the performance of his duties as a Member of Parliament, that is understandable. Why should you worry? It is another party. They have a right to discuss everything in their party meetings, in their party executive committee meetings and they have the right to issue directions to their partymen. If any of their partymen resents it and comes to me and says: this is not a mere direction, it is an obstruction in the performance of my duties as a Member, then I shall consider it. So far there is no such thing. I disallow the motion.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: Under your direction No. 124 ...

MR. SPEAKER: I know my direction.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: Whatever you know is not enough ... (Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER: Papers to be laid. I am not allowing anything else now.

13.35 hrs.

#### PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

##### NOTIFICATIONS UNDER ACT INDIA SERVICES ACT

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS AND IN THE DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL (SHRI RAM NIWAS MIRDHA): I beg to lay on the Table