

(Mr Deputy Speaker.)

not in the Order Paper. Even so, I have allowed you to mention this. If the Government has anything to say, it is up to them. (*Interruption*) I have not finished. I think you do not want me to violate the conventions and the rules or to depart from the Order Paper. If hon Members feel strongly about it, they could send a regular notice for some discussion, they could send a regular Motion for that. But I cannot allow a discussion just now.

SHRI S M BANERJEE: I am not raising a discussion.

MR DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please sit down. You have made your point.

SHRI S M BANERJEE: Let Dr Rao be summoned to the House. Let him be asked to make a statement, Sir. (*Interruption*)

MR DEPUTY-SPEAKER: You have made your point. (*Interruption*) Order please.

SHRI MADHU LIMAYE (Banka): I rise on a point of order or point of propriety.

MR DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I will hear your point of order, not point of propriety.

श्री मधु लिमये: जब केन्द्र का मंत्री राज्य में जा कर इस तरह का काम करता है तो क्या लोक सभा का यह अधिकार नहीं है कि मंत्री महोदय से उन के आचरण का स्पष्टीकरण मांगे। इन लोगों का मारा काम ऐसा चल रहा है जिस से पब्लिक सैक्टर का दिवाला निकल रहा है और पब्लिक सैक्टर बदनाम हो रहा है। जब लोक सभा का सत्र चल रहा हो तो क्या मंत्री महोदय बिना इस सभा को जानकारी या इतिला दिये हम तरह का काम कर सकते हैं ?

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I have heard you. It is not a point of order because there is no such item in the Order Paper. If I allowed you, then, that would have been a point of order. I cannot say of hand what is the truth behind it, what is correct, what is not correct, etc. but if you feel so strongly about it, then, come before the House with a regular Motion.

SHRI S M BANERJEE: We have done that. (*Interruption*).

MR DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I cannot take up your motion here. Kindly cooperate. (*Interruptions*)*

MR DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Order please. All this will not go on record."

RE QUESTION OF PRIVILEGE—
Contd

MR DEPUTY-SPEAKER: This morning, during a discussion on the privilege question, Shri Vajpayee made a certain statement relating to Shri A P Sharma. Now, Shri Sharma has written to me that he would like to clarify the position.

I would request Shri Sharma to confine himself to Shri Vajpayee's statement only and not to enter into an argument at this stage.

SHRI A P SHARMA (Buxar): Sir, this morning, at about 11 O'clock, before the House had started its discussion, I was going out of the Central Hall and Shri Vajpayee naming me, wanted to indicate that he wanted to talk to me. Sir, I was going for a meeting and so I did not speak anything. I simply waved my hand and went away to attend that meeting. Later on, I came to know that he had stated that I refused to talk to him. I want to tell you that there is no truth in it. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI P. G. MAVALANKAR (Ahmedabad): Sir, I rise on a point of order.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I would listen to all of you.

SHRI A. P. SHARMA: There is no truth that Shri Vajpayee wanted to talk to me and I refused to talk to him. It is only a distortion of the fact. I simply went away to attend the meeting. (Interruptions).

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Just a minute. I shall hear all points of orders on this point. Will you kindly sit down? I have to hear Shri Banerjee on his point of order.

श्री एस० एम० बनर्जी (कानपुर) मेरा पीइट आफ आर्डर यह है कि श्री जो स्पष्टीकरण किया है उस से मालूम होता है कि पार्लियामेन्टी रेकार्ड उन्होंने पढा नहीं। सुना है। उन्होंने कहा कि माननीय अटल जी ने यहा पर कहा 11 बजे जब उन्होंने उनको बुलाने या छेड छान करने की कोशिश की तो इन्होंने कहा कि हम बात नहीं करेगे। तो बिना रेकार्ड पढे हुए इन को स्पष्टीकरण नहीं देना चाहिये। क्या यह जायज है।

दूसरी बात यह है कि मैं देख रहा था जब श्री हम लोग उन से बात करने की कोशिश कर रहे थे, आप लोगों से सेन्ट्रल हाल में बात करने की कोशिश कर रहे थे तो जिस तरीके से नहीं दुल्हन अपने जंठ को देख कर भलग हो जाती है उसी तरह से यह बिहेव कर रहे थे।

श्री फूल चन्द वर्मा (उज्जैन) माननीय शर्मा जी ने जो स्पष्टीकरण दिया है उस को सुन कर ऐसा लग रहा है कि वह मदन में उपस्थित नहीं थे और प्रोसीडिंग्स देखी भी नहीं। अटल जी के साथ जब उन की मुलाकात हुई तो उन्होंने स्पष्ट रूप से कहा था कि अटल जी आई एम बी। सी, और हाथ हिला कर चले गये।

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Instead of making your point of order, you are making some statements. Now, Shri Mehta.

SHRI P. M. MEHTA (Bhavnagar): Sir, Shri A P Sharma, I think, has not informed the Chair on what ground or on what point he is making his statement.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: He has already informed me.

SHRI A P. SHARMA: I sought only to make a clarification.

SHRI P M. MEHTA: On what point? He has not mentioned as to what Shri Vajpayee has stated in the House.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Mr. Mehta, if you had listened to me, you would not have put this question.

I had made it very clear at the very beginning that this was what he had told me and he had written to me, and that was why I had allowed him.

SHRI P M. MEHTA: He simply said that for purposes of clarification he wanted to make a statement. He simply mentioned that he wanted to make a personal explanation or a statement by way of personal explanation.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Clarification only.

SHRI P M MEHTA: But he has not furnished the issues.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: He had told me in his statement what statement he wanted to make. I think the hon. Member has heard what he said just now.

SHRI P M MEHTA: He has not stated what statement he wanted to make, and on what. So, his statement is only on something hearsay.

श्री मधु शिवधरे : (बाका) महोदय, अप्रतिगत स्पष्टीकरण का अधिकार बहुत पवित्र अधिकार है। यह किस बात का स्पष्टीकरण कर रहे थे जब इन को इस बात का ही पता नहीं कि बाजपेयी जी ने यहां क्या कहा? आज सबेरे मैं भी मौजूद था। आज कांग्रेस संसदीय दल की बैठक थी, जैसे ही मैं सैन्ट्रल हाल में पहुंचा तो मुझे देखते ही यह सब लोग भागने लगे। मैं ने कहा क्या हुआ? घंटों तब मेरे साथ बैठ कर बात करते हैं, काफ़ी पीते हैं लेकिन आज क्या बात है? बोले आप से बात नहीं कर सकते। इसलिये यह जो मनाही का हुक्म है इस को सदन की मानहानि के रूप में मान लिया जाय और इन को आदेश दिया जाय कि इस तरह के मूर्खतापूर्ण आदेश जारी न करे।

SHRI P. G. MAVALANKAR: I want to ask, in all earnestness what the purpose of a personal statement or clarification is. When an hon. Member of this House asked the permission of the Chair for making a statement, surely, he wanted to make a statement either to clarify or contradict or deny a specific allegation or an untruth which had been uttered here wittingly or unwittingly by a particular Member against him. We are told by Shri A. P. Sharma that it was only on the basis of what he had been told or what he had heard that he wanted to make the statement. I suggest that he better verify the facts first. I want to find out one thing from you, Sir. Can such a personal statement or a statement by way of personal clarification or the right to make such a statement be abused by a Member of Parliament merely on the ground that he had been told that something had been said about him and therefore, he wanted to make it?....

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I shall give my ruling....

SHRI P. G. MAVALANKAR: My point is that Shri Sharma may make

the statement later; let him first go through the records and then come forward with a personal explanation, if he finds it necessary tomorrow but not today.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur): My point of order is this. Can a sense of humour violate any rules of procedure of this House? These matters should be treated with a sense of humour which they deserve and finished off.

SHRI SHASHI BHUSHAN (South Delhi): On a point of order....

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Is he on the same point of order or on another one? If it is another one, I shall hear him later. Let me first dispose of the other point of order...

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE: I have withdrawn my point of order..

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Whenever I get up, Shri Banerjee will not allow me even to finish the sentence.

SHRI PILOO MODY (Godhra): I have also the same experience.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I would only say that these are no points of order. They are only counter-statements and they are all there on record.

श्री शशि भूषण : उपाध्यक्ष जी, हमारे दल के नेता नम्बर दो ने जो ऐक्सप्लेनेशन दिया वह सुबह माननीय ग्रटल बिहारी बाजपेयी जी ने एक चुटकी ली थी कि कल की चर्चा का क्या हुआ कि उन्होंने रास्ते में उन को मना कर दिया कि हम आप से बात नहीं करेंगे। वह उन्होंने ऐक्सप्लेन कर दिया। लेकिन हमारे दल की तरफ से ऐसा कोई निर्णय नहीं है। हम अपोजीशन के साथ कोर्टशिप कर सकते हैं, परस्पर होबनाब कर सकते हैं, और अगर आप हमारे यहां पार्टी में आना चाहें तो उस का भी हम स्वागत करते हैं।