

(2) Annual Report of the Export Credit and Guarantee Corporation Limited, Bombay, for the period 1st January, 1968 to 31st December, 1968, along with the Audited Accounts and the comments of the Comptroller and Auditor General thereon.

[*Placed in Library See. No. LT—2194/69*]

COIR RETTING (LICENSING) AMENDMENT ORDER, 1969

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF FOREIGN TRADE (SHRI RAM SEWAK) : I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the Coir Retting (Licensing) Amendment Order, 1969, (Hindi and English versions) published in Notification No. S. O. 3919 in Gazette of India dated the 27th September, 1969, under sub-section (6) of section 3 of the Essential Commodities Act, 1955. [*Placed in Library. See No. LT—2195/69*].

SHRI M. L. SONDHI (New Delhi) : It is a very important matter. I appeal to your wisdom. The Home Minister is here. It is difficult to get in touch with him these days. Formerly it was very easy to see him.

MR. SPEAKER : No. please. After all there is a procedure.

12.49 hrs.

DEMANDS FOR SUPPLEMENTARY GRANTS (RAILWAYS) 1969-70

THE MINISTER OF LAW AND SOCIAL WELFARE AND RAILWAYS (SHRI GOVINDA MENON) : I beg to present a statement showing Supplementary Demands for Grants in respect of the Budget (Railways) for 1969-70.

RULES COMMITTEE MINUTES

SHRI S. KANDAPPAN (Mettur) : I beg to lay on the Table the Minutes of

the sitting of the Rules Committee held on the 27th November, 1969.

MR. SPEAKER : Item No. 9.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE (Kanpur) : I rise on a point of order, Sir. Let me conclude the point of order.

MR. SPEAKER : You have already concluded.

12.49-1/2 hrs.

RE: MEETING OF CERTAIN OFFICERS WITH SHRI T. T. KRISHNAMACHARI

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDY (Kendrapara) : Before you go to the next item of personal explanation, I want to raise one thing. Yesterday when we adjourned, the Chair ruled that on the question of Mr. T. T. Krishnamachari meeting the officials of the Finance Ministry, the Prime Minister will make a statement to-day. This is the ruling of the Chair. I have that with me. I want to know whether the Prime Minister is going to make a statement to-day, if so, at what time and when are we talking up the resolution. I have the ruling of the Chair with me. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE (Kanpur) : I rise on a point of order, Sir.

MR. SPEAKER : Point of order on what ?

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : On item No. 9.

MR. SPEAKER : Please resume your seat. Yesterday when Dr. Ram Subhag Singh made certain allegations, I asked whether the Minister would make a statement. I left it to his option. The Minister made a statement in the evening and the Chairman allowed further questions. After the Minister's statement, there should have been no questions, no debate discussion. I am so sorry, but, anyway, that was allowed and that took the shape of almost

[Mr. Speaker]

a debate. Enough was said on that side (*Interruptions*). They have categorically stated that they have nothing to do about that. On what should I ask the Prime Minister ?

श्री रवि राय (पुरी) : प्रधान मंत्री को इस्तीफा देना चाहिये ;

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDY: When you said this, that the Prime Minister should be truthful and tell us the real facts. I have in my possession facts that Mr. Bakshi has left a note in his file which is still there and will the Prime Minister go and take hold of that file in which he has given a note about the discussions he had with Mr. T. T. Krishnamachari ? He has stated (1)... (*Interruptions*) Please listen to me. This is a specific question which I want to put. You observed that they have said nothing. I made this charge and I stand by it. There is a note of Mr. Bakshi in which it has been mentioned what taxation proposals would be coming up in the 1970 budget. (*Interruptions*) They have discussed this with T. T. K... (*Interruptions*). In that note what would follow after the judgment of the Supreme Court on nationalisation of Banks and what suggestions Mr. T. T. K. has given, have also been in great detail kept. We are making this proposal because the secrets of Government about tax proposals in the budget which are completely secret have been discussed; let her get hold that file and let us know whether this has not been so. Let the Prime Minister contradict that there is no such file and no such note by Mr. Bakshi who met him. He was in the Supreme Court. Later he met him after Shri Govindan Nair had come. Later on he come to the office and dictated a note. That is in that file. I challenge this.

SHRI KANWAR LAL GUPTA (Delhi Sadar) : The Prime Minister's Personal Assistant has gone to his office to remove the papers. You should stop it, Sir. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PILOO MODY (Godhra) : Rald the Prime Minister's office.

DR. RAM SUBHAG SINGH (Buxar)

I do not know whether you have got it in record. Shri Sethi has pointed out that the matters discussed were about employment, housing, banking accelerated rural development, etc. But the Secretary connected with this Department or the Planning Commission officer were not at all invited to that meeting, but the Prime Minister purposely chose to send the Finance Ministry officials and I support what Mr. Dwivedy has just now pointed out. I apprehend that the file may be destroyed unless and until you direct the Prime Minister to take possession of that file and appoint a Parliamentary Committee to investigate it.

श्री मधु लिमये (मुंजर) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरा प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर है। जहां तक मुझे याद है, कल जो सभापति कुर्सी पर बैठे थे उन्होंने यह निर्देश दिया था कि प्रधान मंत्री स्वयं इन बातों का खुलासा करें। मैं सुना रहा हूं।

सभापति महोदय : माननीय सदस्य कृपया अपना स्थान ग्रहण करें। क्योंकि यह प्रस्ताव अचानक ही आ गया है इसलिए इस समय मैं केवल इतना ही कहूंगा कि प्रधान मंत्री कल इस विषय पर एक वक्तव्य दें ताकि इस बारे में और स्पष्टीकरण हो जाये।

अब सरकार का कहना है कि सेडी साहब ने जो कहा है उससे अधिक प्रधान मंत्री को कुछ नहीं कहना है। लेकिन द्विवेदी जी ने एक स्पष्ट आरोप लगाया है और कल की बहस के दौरान यह आरोप किया गया कि बजट संबंधी बातों की चर्चा हुई और मैंने कहा था कि बजट की बातों को गुप्त नहीं रखा जायेगा तो उसके ऊपर लाखों करोड़ों रुपया स्टॉक एक्सचेंज पर कमाया जाता है। साथ-साथ मैंने यह भी कहा था कि श्री कृष्णामाचारी ने इसके बारे में कोई शपथ नहीं ली है कि गुप्तता रखेंगे। इसलिए किसी गैर-सरकारी व्यक्ति से टैक्सेशन के बारे में, कर योजना के बारे में आप चर्चा करेंगे तो वह बहुत गम्भीर अपराध हो जाता है। इस लिए मेरी आप से प्रार्थना है कि नियम 389

के मातहत आपको पूरा अधिकार है और कई दफा अध्यक्ष के द्वारा इस तरह की संसदीय समितियां नियुक्त की गई हैं, अगर आप भी इस तरह की समिति नियुक्त करेंगे तो समिति को पूरा अधिकार होता है, वह सारी फाइलों को मंगा सकती है और जब तक समिति का काम काज शुरू नहीं हो जाता है आप हुक्म जारी कर दीजिए, आप के हुक्म का कोई भी अपमान नहीं कर सकता है, आप उन फाइलों को अपने कब्जे में ले लीजिए जब तक कि इसके बारे में कोड फंसला नहीं हो जाता है। आपको पूरा अधिकार है।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी (बलरामपुर) :

अध्यक्ष महोदय, ऐसा प्रतीत होता है कि इस मामले में सदन को गुमराह करने की कोशिश की जा रही है। कोई भी तथ्य सदन से छिपाये न जायं क्योंकि यह मामला मंत्रियों का नहीं है, सरकारी अधिकारी भी इसमें संलग्न है। जब तक उन अधिकारियों को क्रास-एग्जामिन न किया जाये, किसी समिति के सामने उनको बुलाया न जाये, उनसे जिरह न की जाये, तब तक इस मामले के तथ्य पर प्रकाश नहीं पड़ सकता। प्रधान मंत्री यहां पर खड़ी होकर खण्डन कर देंगी लेकिन उससे सदन को संतोष नहीं होगा। इसलिए मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि यह सदन की मर्यादा का प्रश्न है। कल यहां पर राज्य मंत्री महोदय ने सूचना दी लेकिन श्री द्विवेदी ने जो आज आरोप लगाये हैं उनके प्रकाश में एक संसदीय समिति बनाई जाये जो कि सारे मामले की जांच करके अपनी रिपोर्ट दे।

SHRI DHIRESWAR KALITA (Gauhati) : Sir, I rise on a point of order. When the Syndicate, Swatantra and Jan Sangh Members raised a hullabaloo you allowed them to raise the matter in the House even though it was not there in the agenda paper. How it was allowed ?

SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK (South Delhi) : These are naming the parties; you have ruled, Sir, that other parties should not be named in the House. If they go on like this, they will get it back. (Interruptions)

SOME HON. MEMBERS rose—

श्री कंबर लाल गुप्त : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरा प्वाइन्ट आफ आर्डर है।... (व्यवधान)...

अध्यक्ष महोदय : एक मिनट के बाद दूसरे माननीय सदस्य खड़े हो जाते हैं। इस तरह से कैसे काम चलेगा।... (व्यवधान) ... मैं जब खड़ा हूं तो आप क्यों खड़े हैं ? आप बैठते क्यों नहीं ?... (व्यवधान)...

I request Hon. Members to please resume their seats. Nobody should mention something which will annoy others.

श्री अब्दुल गनी डार (गुडगांव) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं केवल दो बातों पर आपका हुक्म लेना चाहता हूँ। पहली बात तो यह कि आप की गैर हाजिरी में जो भी यहां पर सभापति बैठें और वह जो अपना फंसला दें, आप उसका कोई आदर करेंगे या नहीं ?

दूसरी बात यह कि जब जनाब की नोटिस में यह आ गया कि इस तरह के आरोप लगाये गए और आज द्विवेदी जी ने एक बड़ा आरोप लगाया तो क्या इसके बाद आप मुनासिब समझेंगे कि एक पार्लियामेंट्री कमेटी बिठाये जो कि जांच करके सारा मामला आपके सामने रखे ?

شری عبدالغنی ڈار : گورنر کا دل میں کیوں دو باتوں پر آپ کا حکم لینا چاہتا ہوں۔ پہلی بات تو یہ ہے کہ آپ کی غیرحاضری میں جو بھی یہاں پر سبجائی بیٹھیں اور وہ جوتے بیٹھا فیصلہ نہیں آپ اس کا کوئی اور کریں گے یا نہیں۔ دو سری بات یہ ہے کہ جناب کی نوٹس میں یہ آ گیا کہ

اس طرح کے آرڈر پکے لئے اور ڈیویڈی جی نے ایک
 بڑا آرڈر لگایا تو کیا اس کے بعد آپ مناسب سمجھیں گے
 کہ ایک بار لیا میٹری کمیٹی سمٹا بین جو کہ چارج کر کے سارا
 معاملہ آپ کے سامنے رکھے۔

श्री कंबरलाल गुप्त : अध्यक्ष महोदय,
 जिस समय श्री सुरेन्द्रनाथ द्विवेदी जी ने चार्ज
 लगाया कि फाइल के ऊपर कागज हैं जिनमें
 बजट डिस्कस किया गया है तो उसी समय
 प्राइम मिनिस्टर के पी० ए० श्री टंडन आफि-
 शियल गैलरी से उठकर चले गये। मुझे डर है
 कि कहीं वह कागज उसमें से निकाल न दिये
 जायें। इसलिए मेरी आपसे प्रार्थना है कि आप
 उस फाइल को अपने कब्जे में ले लीजिए और
 देखिए कि जो बात कही गई है वह उस तरह
 से है या नहीं ?

SHRI N. DANDEKER (Jamnagar) : I
 want to support very strongly the suggestion
 and the points made by Mr. Dwivedy and
 Mr. Vajpayee that this matter really requires
 very careful investigation by a Parliamentary
 Committee. Sir, I will give only two reasons
 at this juncture, although I have several.
 First, the Minister of State, while making
 a statement in the House yesterday, made
 two extremely ambiguous statements. One
 was, that the officers were 'allowed' to see
 Mr. T.T. Krishnamachari. This is a most
 remarkable proposition. It is important
 and I am asking this for the protection of
 the officers themselves. I want to know
 whether they were 'allowed' to see Mr. T.T.
 Krishnamachari, in the sense that they
 desired to see him or they were directed to
 see him. Secondly, the hon. Minister of
 State had said that no files were shown to
 Shri T.T. Krishnamachari. He has not
 said that no files were taken there at the
 time of these discussions. These and various
 other aspects of this matter do require
 careful consideration and require probing and
 careful investigations. Therefore, it is very
 urgently necessary that a Committee should
 be appointed.

13 hrs.

SHRI H. N. MUKERJEE : (Calcutta
 North East) : I want to know why it is
 that in view of the chairman's specific

direction yesterday which till you spoke
 certainly stood, Government does not seem
 to be ready to come out with a statement.
 I want to know also why it is that in spite
 of certain very serious allegations which are
 being made and which are being publicised,
 Government keeps mum and the Prime
 Minister does not make a statement? I
 would like you to have a statement from
 the Prime Minister and then take whatever
 action is to be taken...

THE PRIME MINISTER, MINISTER
 OF FINANCE, MINISTER OF ATOMIC
 ENERGY AND MINISTER OF PLANNING
 (SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI) :
 You have not looked in this direction.
 Otherwise, if you had called me, I would
 have made a statement.

SHRI VIRENDRAKUMAR SHAH
 (Junagadh) : On a point of order. Rule 10
 specifically says that the Deputy-Speaker
 or any other person competent to preside
 over a sitting of the House, under the
 Constitution, will have the same powers as
 the Speaker...

MR SPEAKER : The hon. Member
 may please sit down. I know that. I am
 expected to know it.

SHRI S.K. TAPURIAH (Pali) : The
 ruling of the Chairman must be respected.

MR. SPEAKER : Yesterday, Mr. Ram
 Subhag Singh suddenly got up without
 anything before the House, and the hon.
 Minister volunteered to make a statement.
 After the Minister's statement, my view is
 —anyway, I am not going to question it—
 the usual procedure is that there are no
 questions and no discussions...

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDY :
 It is not correct to say that.

SHRI RABI RAY : It is not correct.

MR SPEAKER : But the proper proce-
 dure should have been, if there was any-
 thing else, that there could have been...

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDY :
 You are casting a reflection on the Chair
 and on the ruling of the Chairman.

श्री रवि राय : यह बड़े दुख की बात है
अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप रिफ्लेक्शन कर रहे हैं ।

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDY :
If two persons presiding over the House
are going to contradict each other in this
manner, then where will it end ? How can
proceed and how can we function ?

SHRI PILOO MODY : The chairman
in his wisdom had permitted certain things,
and that is the rule of the House.

SHRI S. KUNDU (Balasore) : I would
plead with you that the ruling of the Chair-
man must be respected...

MR. SPEAKER : The hon. Member
may resume his seat. Nothing that he says
will be recorded.

SHRI S. KUNDU , **

MR. SPEAKER : But that took the
shape of questions and debate. I do not
know exactly what the background is.
After that, the Chairman seems to have
made certain observations. Since the Chair-
man could not be contacted by me before I
came this morning, I would discuss it with
him as to what the position is and what the
background is. Also, some allegations
have been made by Shri Surendranath
Dwivedy ..

श्री रवि राय : कल जो सभापति की
कुर्सी पर बैठे थे वह मौजूद हैं, वह बोल सकते
हैं । आप उन्हें बुला सकते हैं ।

MR. SPEAKER : I am going to call
him to my Chamber ; and after that, I
shall see what the position is.

श्री रवि राय : आप माननीय प्रकाशवीर
शास्त्री जी को बुलावाइये ।

MR. SPEAKER : I am going to ask him
to come to my Chamber.

SHRI HEM BARUA (Mangaldaj) :
The matter has been unnecessarily compli-

cated by you. You should not cast asper-
sions on the Chairman.

SHRI SHEO NARAIN (Basti) : The
House was demanding that the Prime Minis-
ter should make a statement. So, you
should ask the Prime Minister to make a
statement.

THE PRIME MINISTER, MINISTER
OF FINANCE, MINISTER OF ATOMIC
ENERGY AND MINISTER OF PLANN-
ING (SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI) :
I want to say that ever since Shri Surendra-
nath Dwivedy got up, I have been trying
to catch your eye, because naturally I
wanted to reply to what he said. But one
Member after another got up and was
speaking and you had allowed them. I
am not protesting against it. I am merely
making a statement of fact. That was why
I could not get up earlier.

Yesterday, Shri P. C. Sethi did
say that he had come here with full
authority because this matter had come
up suddenly and I had a previous
engagement which I could not get out of,
and, therefore, I posted him with the full
picture and he made a statement. He said
I do not remember his exact words—that
'the Prime Minister will not be able to add
to what I have said'. I have nothing to
add to what he has said in that context.

SHRI KANWARLAL GUPTA : What
about the talks ?

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : I
would request Shri Kanwarlal Gupta to let
me be heard patiently. Also I am talking
as fast as I can; I am not going slow.

Shri Dwivedy has now mentioned an
officer by name. Another hon. Member
also talked about files being taken. I can
assure hon. members that almost every day
many people, and amongst them MPs, inclu-
ding members from the Opposition—those
sitting on this side also—of the Swatantra
Party and others quite often come to give
their suggestions as to what they think
should be done, not with regard to the bud-
get, but general suggestions with regard to
the economy and so on.

Now Shri T. T. Krishnamachari also

[Shrimati Indira Gandhi]

mentioned certain things saying that he would like to give some ideas. Some illustrative examples were given; there was also follow-up of the nationalisation of banks and so on. Shri Dwivedy should know that Shri Bakshi has nothing to do with budget-making. He is there purely to see to the follow-up of the nationalisation of banks (*Interruptions*). I am coming to every single point, if only they will just sit and listen.

AN HON. MEMBER : He must express regret (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDY : I stand by what I said. If they keep silent, I also keep silent, If they shout, I shout, Let them be silent and respect their leader.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : I would request SHRI Dwivedy to sit down. I will answer every point. If I do not, he can ask me at the end.

Shri Dwivedy said that Shri Bakshi made some notes on a file. I do not know if he kept a record of what Shri T. T. Krishnamachari said. But I am assured by all these officers that they did not say anything, they just listened to the suggestions which Shri T. T. K. made.

AN HON. MEMBER : Was it a monologue ?

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : Some of the suggestions that he made were a little complicated which had naturally to be looked into to see whether they could be worked. This had nothing to do with the budget—on that I can assure you. But I will certainly look into the fact whether any notes were kept. If so, I am prepared, Sir, to show them to you.

SHRI MADHU LIMAYE : And punish them for keeping notes.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : No, we cannot.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Who directed the officers to meet Shri T. T. K. ?

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : I did not direct anybody to meet Shri T. T. K.

DR. RAM SUBHAG SINGH : But that was what Shri Sethi said yesterday that she asked them to go and see him (*Interruption*).

SHRI RABI RAY : She is contradicting herself (*Interruptions*).

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : If they ask me 'Can I go and meet so and so ? I have said 'yes'. But I did not say, 'You have to go and meet him'. I did not direct them to do so (*Interruptions*).

Mention was made of a specific name. He is an officer whom Shri T. T. Krishnamachari had known before. That officer also paid a courtesy call on him (*Interruptions*). Courtesy calls have been paid on many members.

श्री रवि राय : आप असत्त बोल रही हैं। सदन को गुमराह कर रही हैं प्रधान मंत्री।

श्री राम सेवक यादव (वाराणसी) : क्या इन अधिकारियों ने प्रधान मंत्री से आज्ञा मांगी थी जाने के लिए ? यह भी तो बतायें।

श्रीमती इन्दिरा गांधी : कर्टसी काल के लिए किसी ने आज्ञा नहीं मांगी।

When Shri T. T. K. asked for an appointment with me, he asked if I could call such and such official because he had left notes and so on previously about one or two of these matters and he would like them to be there. I saw no objection to it.

Therefore, it is true that on that occasion when Shri T. T. Krishnamachari came to see me, I did ask these officers whether they would be present.

I have assured the House that it had absolutely nothing to do with the budget; it was not mentioned either by Shri T. T. K. or by any of the officials.

Shri Sethi mentioned yesterday by way of illustration the sort of things that was discussed. As I said, some of these officials may have kept notes about these matters or anything that was discussed. These I am

prepared to show you. There is no question of anybody removing any file or any paper from any file. There was no question of taking any file. I would like to assure hon. members about this matter because I can fully understand members' great concern if official files and secrets are discussed with people who are not authorised. Shri T.T.K. himself has made a statement on this matter that he has not discussed this question.

Shri Kanwarlal Gupta made the point that some official got up from the gallery here. He might have, but I do not think it is right to link this or connect this with that. I must say that I was unaware of this particular visit till it was mentioned here. It was only when it was mentioned here that Mr. Bakshi had met him, it was told and I enquired he said: yes. I was because he had some ideas and TTK wanted to discuss about the follow up measures... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDY: I have to ask two questions. She has contradicted me and it is unfair if I am not given an opportunity... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: No questions.

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDY: She has replied to my questions. She has not clarified my specific allegations... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI ASOKA MEHTH (Bhandara): I want to ask a simple question: why was Mr. Shirali who was in charge of the Budget sent there if Budget was not discussed?

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI: As far as I know Mr. Shirali has not met Shri TTK.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF FINANCE (SHRI P. C. SETHI): I said Shiralkar.

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDY: I am glad that the Prime Minister has promised to look into the papers and I hope that the papers will be in tact. I shall also like her to find out whether the note that had been left by Mr. Bakshi contained any taxation proposals in the impending budget

which had been discussed with Mr. TTK. If the papers are in tact let her find out.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI: Mr. Bakshi has nothing to do with the budget.

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDY: Secondly, she has contradicted her Minister when she says that no such thing was there. But the Minister while making a statement yesterday made it very clear that it was with the approval of the Prime Minister that some of her senior officers of the Finance Ministry had met TTK. The other portion is very important—for what purpose? To seek clarifications and enlightenment in respect of these issues. What is the clarification? It is not a courtesy call.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI: Let us not mix up.

AN HON. MEMBER: You are mixing up things.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI: I am not; I am saying that some officers paid a courtesy call on his birthday. After that he made certain suggestions. Then when they asked me whether they could seek clarification on those suggestions I did say that they could do so. (*Interruptions*.)

MR. SPEAKER: No more questions. Shri S.M. Banerjee.

SHRI ABDUL GHANI DAR (Gurgaon): I rise on a point of order. There is an important question.

MR. SPEAKER: I have called the next item.

13.15 hrs.

RE: PERSONAL EXPLANATION
BY SHRI R. K. BIRLA

SHRI S.M. BANERJEE (Kanpur): I rise on a point of order on Item No. 9, Shri R.K. Birla to make a personal explanation regarding certain allegations made by Shri Madhu Limaye against the Wool Purchase Mission headed by Shri R.K. Birla.

Yesterday I mentioned rule No. 357 which reads as under:

"A member may, with the permission of the Speaker, make a personal